



Addressing hate speech in the media:

the role of regulatory
authorities and
the judiciary



INTERNATIONAL
CONFERENCE

Organised by the Council of Europe in
partnership with the Croatian Agency for
Electronic Media

6-7 November 2018
Zagreb, Croatia
Hotel Westin

www.coe.int/freedomofexpression/Zagreb2018

Information Society Group Facebook Page



CHAIRMANSHIP OF CROATIA
Council of Europe
May - November 2018
PRÉSIDENCE DE LA CROATIE
Conseil de l'Europe
Mai - Novembre 2018



Agencija za elektroničke medije
Agency for Electronic Media



SPEAKERS' PROFILES



Sejal PARMAR is Assistant Professor of Law at the Department of Legal Studies and a core faculty member of the Center for Media, Data and Society (CMDS) at the School of Public Policy at CEU. Her main field of expertise and research is international and European human rights law, particularly on freedom of expression. Parmar previously served as Senior Adviser to the Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) Representative on Freedom of the Media and Senior Legal Officer at ARTICLE 19, the leading international human rights NGO on freedom of expression. She continues to act as an expert for intergovernmental organisations and as a consultant for NGOs.

Patrick PENNINGCKX is currently heading the Information Society Department under the Directorate General Human Rights and the Rule of Law, Patrick coordinates standard setting and cooperation activities in the fields of media, internet governance, data protection and cybercrime. His professional focus encompasses areas such as freedom of expression, safety of journalists, human rights on the internet and sound internet governance, international standards in the data protection and cybercrime fields and their implementation. An outspoken public speaker promoting the Council of Europe values and achievements, he holds Political Science and Educational degrees from the University of Leuven. Previously, Patrick was in charge of Human Resources policy development, transforming the administrative management of personnel into a competency based human resource policy. He also led the Pompidou Group of the Council of Europe through major changes in membership profile, implementing flexible working methods and innovative human and financial resources management.



Before starting her independent career as an international adviser and lately joining a Brussels based consultancy, **Tanja KERŠEVAN SMOKVINA** spent most of her career at Slovenian media and communications regulatory authorities and participated in the work of EPRA and ERGA. Tanja has served two mandates at the Council of Europe CDMSI sub-committees, in 2016-2017 as Member of the Committee of Experts on Internet Intermediaries (MSI-NET) and in 2018-2019 as Member of the Committee of Experts on Artificial Intelligence (MSI-AUT). She holds a PhD in Communication Science from University of Ljubljana and teaches media related subjects at University of Maribor.



Gabriella CSEH is the Head of Public Policy for Russia and Central and Eastern Europe for Facebook; a lawyer. Currently, Gabriella focuses on issues related to data protection, privacy, human rights and Internet, freedom of speech and hate speech related issues, digital market, internet safety, the open Internet, and more broadly the social value generated by Internet-related services. Prior to joining Facebook, she was the executive director of Hungarian Public Service Radio for four years and the external relations director for PanTel telecommunications Ltd for seven years. Gabriella has also served as a diplomat and a civil servant.

Stanislav BENDER is Head of Monitoring Department in Agency for Electronic Media of the Republic of Croatia. Monitoring department supports the Electronic Media Council to fulfill his role and undertakes other statutory functions such as handling complaints, supervision of private and public broadcasters, conducting analysis and research, resolving market competition and other issues in the media industry. From 2007 onward he is Lecturer of New Media in the Department of Journalism at University of Applied Sciences - Vern. His research focuses on the uses, cultures and politics of digital media technologies, as well as online journalism, social media, media literacy, visual culture, popular culture, media law and public policy. He is also the Council of Europe expert, involved as an editor and author in the preparation of publication "Media regulatory authorities and hate speech". Prior to position in Agency for Electronic Media, he has worked successfully with a range of industry, government and not-profit organisations to address the practical challenges and opportunities posed by digital media.



Asja ROKŠA-ZUBČEVIĆ has worked at the Communications Regulatory Agency of Bosnia and Herzegovina for a number of years, dealing with all aspects of regulatory issues for audiovisual media sector. She was involved in the defense of freedom of expression case before the human rights court. She also performed as a judge at the Monroe E. Price Media Law Moot Court, annual South East Europe Rounds organized by University of Belgrade, in cooperation with the Oxford University, as part of the Programme in Comparative Media Law and Policy. She is the Council of Europe expert, involved in preparation of studies and research documents, including co-authoring publication "Media regulatory authorities and hate speech". Her article is also published in the book under the title: "Business and Government in the information society – The communication of digital video broadcasting policy in South East Europe", London 2015. She regularly contributes to preparation of documents, studies and panels of European Platform of Regulatory Authorities (EPRA). She holds M.A. in human rights and democracy (University of Bologna and University of Sarajevo), and a bachelor's degree in political science from the University of Illinois at Chicago, USA.



Rosa CAVALLARO began to work for Italian Regulatory Authority for communication sector in the 2000. She is an officer of Audiovisual Content Directorate. She is an expert in monitoring political and social pluralism in radio and television programs; her job is also related to the verification of compliance with the laws on the protection of minors and on the fundamental rights of the person by broadcasters. She participated in the working group for the drafting of two editions (2014 and 2017) of a "White Paper on the relationship between the media and children. Currently she is also following the works of the "Technical

Table for Ensuring Pluralism and Correct information on Digital Platforms", established by Italian Authority to promote self-regulation of platforms and the exchange of best practices for the use of digital platforms. She is also participating as a drafter in the working group for writing the "Agcom White Paper on the digital contents" and in the working group of Erga (European Regulators Group for Audiovisual Media Services) "Subgroup SG 1 - Internal and External Plurality". Furthermore she is following for Agcom, as observer, the meetings of "Committee of experts on quality journalism in the digital age (MSI-JOQ)" - Council of Europe, Strasbourg (2018-2019). In the past she also worked as a journalist and author of television programs.

Elfa Ýr GYLFADÓTTIR is the Director of the Media Commission, the independent regulator for media in Iceland. Prior to that she was the Head of Division of Media at the Ministry of Education, Science and Culture. Ms. Gylfadóttir was one of the main authors of the Act on the National Broadcasting Service No. 23/2013 and the Icelandic Media Law No. 38/2011, transposing the AVMS Directive. Ms. Gylfadóttir has been a lecturer at the University of Iceland for 15 years. She is the author and co-author of several peer reviewed articles on media policy and media law. Ms. Gylfadóttir is the Vice-Chair of the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) at the Council of Europe. She was the Chair of the CDMSI in 2016-2017.



Bissera ZANKOVA has studied law and has specialized in editing and publishing at the Sofia University "St.Kliment Ohridsky", Bulgaria. She holds a Master (1999) and a Doctorate (2005) of Comparative Constitutional Law from the Central European University, Budapest. For many years Ms. Zankova has been a Council of Europe expert in the field of freedom of expression and media, a member of CDMSI and its Bureau. She has taken part in the Council of Europe missions in various European countries. Currently she is independent researcher and consultant as president of "Media 21" Foundation registered in Bulgaria. The foundation pursues projects and partnerships in new media and journalism. Mrs. Zankova has been also a member of the Bulgarian

Commission on Media Ethics during 2015 - 2017. She is particularly interested in media policy and media regulation and self-regulation.



Adam BAXTER is a Principal in Ofcom’s Standards and Audience and Protection Team, helping to lead regulation of broadcast and on-demand content standards in the areas of protection of minors, harm and offence, incitement, due impartiality and elections/referendums. He has particular responsibility for overseeing issues relating to due impartiality and elections/referendums and has extensive experience in taking enforcement action against broadcasters in the area of hate speech and incitement. Prior to joining Ofcom in 2008, Adam has had a range of policy and related roles across the media and entertainment industry. He has Masters degrees from both Cambridge University and the University of Oxford. Whilst at Oxford he completed a thesis looking at the role of television in UK General Elections.

Pavlo PUSHKAR is a head of division at the Department for the Execution of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights of the Directorate General of Human Rights and the Rule of Law of the Council of Europe. He is an expert of the Council of Europe on notably freedom of expression and journalists’ safety, media, sports conventions, migration and internal displacement, procedural law, mediation and arbitration, etc. He has worked at the Registry of the European Court of Human Rights from 2002 to 2016 as a senior lawyer and a non-judicial rapporteur. Before joining the Council of Europe, he worked as an advocate in the areas of international litigation and arbitration and as a public servant at the Supreme Court of Ukraine. Mr Pushkar has a PhD in criminal justice. He is a graduate of Kyiv Taras Shevchenko University Law Faculty (BA and MA in Laws, with honours); the Nottingham University School of Law (LLM in International Law); Queens Mary College University of London (International Arbitration). He is currently pursuing his research in the area of international law compliance with the Max Planck Institute of European Procedural Law in Luxembourg.



Kirill BELOGUBETS, Magister Juris in European and comparative law, Oxford University; case-lawyer at the Registry of the European Court of Human Rights since 2004, non-judicial rapporteur at the Registry of the Court for applications in respect of Russia in 2014.



Khagani GULIYEV has worked as a lawyer at the Registry of the European Court of Human Rights since 2007. He also holds a Ph.D in public international law from the University of Strasbourg and has worked as a lecturer in constitutional law at the same university since 2013.



Alexandru TANASE is Partner Lawyer at “Hanganu, Tănase and Partners” Law Firm, Chişinău, Moldova. He is also a Member European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission) of the Council of Europe and Lecturer in constitutional law at Moldova State University, Chişinău. He has previously served as the President of the Moldovan Constitutional Court and the Minister of Justice.

Tomas ÅBERG has worked as a police officer for 9 years, mostly as an investigator. Both before and after his police career he was living in East Africa working with security for company’s but also with wildlife management. He is currently affiliated with Nätthatsgranskaren, a social media hate crime examiner. He has experience in searching for and identification of criminal hate speech according to the Swedish law, collecting evidence and ID and reporting to the police.



Eva STEINBERGER has studied law at the University of Passau, Germany and the University of Edinburgh, Great Britain from 1998 until 2005. From 2005 until 2008 she successfully completed her legal traineeship in Bavaria, Germany, which included working at the civil court, the prosecutor’s office, the district administration, a law firm and at the European Commission for Competition in Brussels. After her final legal exams in 2008 she joined the Bavarian Ministry of Economics, Infrastructure, Traffic and Technology as a civil servant and worked as a legal advisor in the area of land planning law. In 2010 she became a Bavarian magistrate. Since then she has held different positions as a prosecutor and as a judge for civil law and for criminal law at the district court level and the regional court level. From 2013 to 2014 Eva Steinberger was seconded to the European Court of Human Rights in Strasbourg, where she worked as a legal assistant for the German division of the Court’s registry. Currently Eva Steinberger works as a judge for criminal law at the Regional Court of Munich I.



Ivan GLAVIĆ, Ph.D., graduated from the Faculty of Law in Zagreb in 2001, where obtained a Master of Laws in 2008 and defended doctoral dissertation in 2011. Elected to the scientific title Research Associate, National Council on Science and Technology, in 2013. Since 2007 have held the position of deputy state attorney; currently works as a deputy state attorney at the County State Attorney's Office in Zagreb. Since 2009 have been professional teaching assistant at the Faculty of Law in Zagreb, Department of Criminal Law. Have been trainer at the Judicial Academy of Croatia, have held presentations at several national and international conferences on criminal law issues. In 2018 appointed as a Head of Delegation of the Republic of Croatia to the Cybercrime Convention Committee (T-CY).



Alf Bjarne JOHNSEN has chaired the Norwegian press complaints Commission in the Norwegian self-regulated Press Council, Pressens Faglige Utvalg, since 2014. He has more than 40 years' experience in journalism. Mr Johnsen is currently a Senior political reporter at Oslo-based Verdens Gang (VG) Media House, covering the executive and legislative bodies in Norway, and doing in-depth reporting on domestic and international security policy.

Daphne KOENE is the secretary of the Netherlands Press Council (Raad voor de Journalistiek) since 2001. After studying law at the University of Amsterdam – with specialisms Intellectual Property Law, Media Law and Information Law – she was a lawyer at the Intellectual Property Law department of the law firm Ekelmans Den Hollander in Amsterdam. In 1996 she continued her career at the Netherlands Union of Journalists (Nederlandse Vereniging van Journalisten) with specialisms Labour Law, Social Security Law and Copyright Law. In addition she was part time assisting secretary of the Press Council since 1999. She has been a speaker at various national and international conferences. Further she carried out a comparative research among several European countries – the Netherlands, Belgium, Great Britain, Germany, Denmark and Sweden – and is the author of the report “Press Councils in Western Europe”.



Ljiljana ZUROVAC, the Program Director of the Press Council in Bosnia and Herzegovina, holds a bachelor degree in Dramaturgy and Theatrology, and a bachelor degree in Comparative Literature. Apart from her journalistic career, she also works as a theatre play-writer and a TV screenwriter. She is also a lecturer and regularly teaches in the fields of Media Ethics and Self-regulation, Media Literacy, Conflict Resolution, Radio journalism, and Communications. She worked in Mongolia, Myanmar, Serbia, Montenegro, Albania, Macedonia, Moldova, Georgia, and Hungary, and she regularly participates in the local and international conferences as a panellist. Within the Press Council, she established educational programs for media ethics in the Media Ethics School for students of journalism. Also, she created a special range of Media Literacy workshop-programs. She is the founder

and producer of the radio show named “Your Voice in Media – ZOOM”. Prior to her current position in The Press Council in B&H, Ms Zurovac worked in the period from 1980 until 2009 as an active Radio and TV journalist, and as an editor and host of live Radio and TV programs at JRT – RTV Sarajevo, PBS B&H, and Radio FERN. She was a Member of the UNESCO/Guillermo Cano World Press Freedom Price Jury and a President of this Jury in 2016. She is a member of IFJ and BHN Journalists' Association; Member of Article 10 ECHR Task Group of the European University Viadrina Frankfurt/Oder; Member of AIPCE – Alliance of Independent Press Councils in Europe.



Menno ETTEMA is No Hate Speech and Cooperation Programmes Manager at the Anti-Discrimination Department of the Council of Europe. In his function he brings together the organisations work on combatting hate through standards setting, monitoring and capacity building programme in cooperation with European partners and member states. Mr Ettema has previously worked as the European coordinator of the No Hate Speech Movement, a youth campaign of the Council of Europe to mobilise young people for human rights and against hate speech online (2016-17) and as an educational advisor (2010-2015) for the Youth Department of the Council of Europe. Before that he worked with youth peace organisations in the Middle East and coordinated the international secretariat of the United Network of Youth Peacebuilders. Mr Ettema studied Psychology of Culture and Religion at the University of Nijmegen, the Netherlands.

Mikko SALO is Faktabaari (FactBar) Founder, Finnish transparency NGO chair and LUT University EU Advisor. In 2014 he founded the fact-checking service bringing accuracy to European election debate. Since he has worked with (journalism) schools, media educators, scientists and voluntary crowds for a pedagogical, secure and engaging online fact-checking and debate focused new media concepts. Mikko is a member of the EU's High-Level Expert Group on Fake News and online disinformation whose report "Multi-dimensional approach to online disinformation" triggered also the first online platform code of practice on disinformation. His current fact-checking and digital media literacy efforts link to forthcoming European elections and ways to tackle "information disorders" such as 1) building FactBar EDU to empower educators in voter literacy, while involved in 2) promising European fact-checking efforts like #Femfacts -project debunking damaging misrepresentations of women in European news media and 3) several technology solutions. He has a versatile experience on European Affairs in member state and EU-level having served also four EU institutions. He has an interdisciplinary educational background majoring in political sciences. www.linkedin.com/in/mvsalo



Since 2005 **Marius LUKOŠIŪNAS** works for UNESCO. He worked as an Advisor for Communication and Information Program at UNESCO Moscow (2005-2010) and Cairo offices (2010-2014). As of mid-2014 Marius Lukošiusas works for the Division of Freedom of Expression and Media Development at the Organization's headquarters in Paris. Before joining UNESCO Marius Lukošiusas served as the Head of the Press Service and Advisor to the President of the Republic of Lithuania in 2004-2005. In 1997 & 2000-2004 he worked as media and political affairs officer in two peacekeeping missions – the OSCE Mission in Bosnia & Herzegovina and the UN Mission in Kosovo. In between the two peacekeeping jobs in the Balkans Marius Lukošiusas for three years (1997-2000) managed EU enlargement related media projects at the European Journalism Center based in Maastricht, the Netherlands.

He also occupied a position of the Director of the Institute of Journalism of Vilnius University in 1992-1997 and holds PhD from Moscow State University (1990). Marius Lukošiusas started his career of a journalist in Lithuanian TV in 1987, reported from few hot spots during the break up on the Soviet Union in the early nineties, and moderated first presidential debates during the first Lithuanian presidential elections of 1992.



In January 2016, Ambassador **Tomáš BOČEK** was appointed Special Representative on Migration and Refugees of Council of Europe Secretary General Thorbjørn Jagland. His mandate is to gather information on the situation of migrants and refugees in the member States, and to develop proposals for action at national and European level. He also liaises with international partners, in particular the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, the European Union, the International Organisation for Migration and UNICEF. One of his priorities is to improve the situation of the high number of refugee and migrant children in Europe. He is responsible for the implementation of the Council of Europe's Action plan to this effect. He has also undertaken fact-finding missions to hotspots, camps and detention centres in several member States. A lawyer by training and a career

diplomat, Tomáš Boček studied at the University of Pilsen and has a degree in public international law from Paris I University – Panthéon Sorbonne. From 2004 to 2008, he was the Agent of the Czech Republic before the European Court of Justice and the Court of First Instance in Luxembourg. In 2007 and 2008, he was also Adviser to the Deputy Prime Minister for European Affairs and, from 2008 to 2009, Deputy Minister for International Relations and European Affairs at the Ministry of Justice of the Czech Republic. From 2010 until the end of January 2016, he was Ambassador and Permanent Representative of the Czech Republic to the Council of Europe and from 2013 to 2015 also Vice-Chair of the Governing Board of the Council of Europe Development Bank.



Martina CHAPMAN is an independent consultant specialising in the areas of digital media literacy. Originally from a broadcasting background, Martina has worked in media strategy and policy since 2008. Since establishing Mercury Insights in 2013, Martina has provided advice and support relating to media literacy policy, strategy, research and projects to a wide range international organisations and media regulators, including the Broadcasting Authority of Ireland, the Georgian National Communications Commission, the Council of Europe, the European Audiovisual Observatory, the European Platform of Regulatory Authorities, Ofcom, the UK communications regulator, The Eurovision Academy, the OSCE and the Irish Film Institute. Martina currently acts as

national coordinator for Media Literacy Ireland and is a member of the Council of Europe Committee of Experts on quality journalism in the digital age (MSI-JOQ). Prior to setting up her own business, she was the BBC's Editor for Media Literacy and she previously held the staff position of Media Literacy Policy Executive for Ofcom. Martina holds an MA in Film and Television Management and Policy. She has been member of a range of media-literacy related steering groups and working groups and she is a regular contributor to national and international conferences and seminars.



Kristine MEEK of the Norwegian Media Authority is responsible for the authority's insight and communications activities within the areas of media pluralism, media literacy, media ownership and media economy - as well as the EU safer internet program with special focus on social media and gaming. Meek is a sociologist and former journalist, who has a long track record from the media and the communications industry. Before joining the NMA she was head of communication in Telenor Norge, Norway's biggest telecom operator.

Saara SALOMAA (M.A.) is a senior advisor and media education team leader in KAVI, a Finnish governmental agency with a legal obligation to promote media literacy. Media education in Finnish National Audiovisual Institute, KAVI includes expert consulting, networking and strategic planning, lecturing for professionals, research and producing educational resources. KAVI also coordinates two significant awareness campaigns, Media Literacy Week and Game Week, and serves as the Finnish Safer Internet Centre.



Lana CIBOCI, PhD, is a vice dean for scientific affairs and quality management at Edward Bernays University College. She holds lectures at the Faculty of Teacher Education (University of Zagreb), Centre for Croatian Studies (University of Zagreb) and Edward Bernays University College. She is a vice president of the Association for Communication and Media Culture within which the Children of the Media project was implemented. The project won the Special Jury Prize as part of the Evens Foundation's 2017 Media Literacy Prize. She is a member of Croatian team of EU Kids Online. Lana is one of the authors of the first public opinion study on media literacy in Croatia and editor-in-chief of the scientific journal Communication Management Review. She is the author of several scientific papers about children and the media with an emphasis on media literacy. Scientific interests: children and media, media literacy, media and violence.



Gitte BANG STALD is an Associate Professor, ph.d. and head of network at the University of Copenhagen. Her primary research areas are digital media, democracy, citizenship, and participation; mobile media and social change; digital youth media cultures; digital media and globalisation. She participated in the European comparative project Children and Their Changing Media Environment 1995-1998; in the research programme Global Media Cultures 1999-2001; in research and development projects on mobile content for young Danes 2004-6; on mobile solutions for dyslexics 2006-7; in The MacArthur Foundation's series on Youth, Digital Media and Learning; in the project Mobity on user driven mobile media communities 2008-9. She participates in the two European networks/projects EU Kids Online 2006-2014 and in Net Children Go Mobile 2012-2014. She has

published articles on subjects such as media and cultural globalisation, adolescents' digital media cultures, and mobile media and communication. She is co-editor of *Global Encounters: Media and Cultural Transformation* (2002) and of *Digital Aesthetics and Communication, Northern Lights* vol 5, 2007. From 1994 to 2007 she worked at Film & Media Studies, Institute for Media, Cognition and Communication at the University of Copenhagen.

From 2001 until September 2018, **Lejla DERVIŠAGIĆ** worked at the Council of Europe, in Media and Internet Division. She was responsible for the cooperation programmes and activities related to freedom of expression and freedom of the media in Council of Europe member States. From October 2018 she works as an independent consultant.



Robert TOMLIJENVIĆ is the Vice President of the Electronic Media Council and Deputy Director of the Agency for Electronic Media, an independent regulatory body for the electronic media in the Republic of Croatia. Among other things, he is responsible for projects related to the protection of minors in electronic media and media literacy (eg. www.medijskapismenost.hr, Media Literacy Days...). Before joining the Agency (2013.), he spent his entire professional career in the electronic media and the audiovisual industry, working as a journalist, editor and television producer. Among other things, he worked as a reporter and news editor for Radio 101, acted as the editor in chief of the news program at Family Radio, and spent eight years as the Zagreb-based correspondent for the BBC World Service. He was also one of the founders and editor of the award-winning daily news show *News of the day* on CCN (a network of local TV stations), and the first Head of the news of RTL Televizija, where he set up the whole system and developed the concept of the news programme. He also worked as a television producer, producing documentaries and drama series.

Hate speech and other, less extreme forms of derogatory and offensive language targeting ethnic, religious, sexual and other minorities, migrants and refugees and many other groups and individuals, are a widespread phenomenon within Europe. The Council of Europe and its member states have over decades developed a comprehensive range of standards and measures to curb expression that spreads, incites, promotes or justifies hatred, intolerance, discrimination and hostility, while guaranteeing everyone the right to freedom of expression and information.

The international conference examines how hate speech is regulated in different member states of the Council of Europe, focusing on the specific roles of the judiciary, national media regulatory authorities and media self-regulatory bodies. It further explores how media literacy programmes can raise awareness about hate speech and the risks it poses for democracy, empowering citizens to critically analyse news and information and develop counter-speech and alternative narratives.



The Agency for Electronic Media (AEM) is an independent regulatory body for electronic media in Croatia. It grants concessions, issues licences, monitors the operations and programme contents and programme quotas of electronic media as prescribed by law, especially with a view to the protection of human rights as well as the rights of minors and consumers. The AEM passes secondary legislation acts, manages the Fund for the Promotion of Pluralism and Diversity of Electronic Media and organizes, inter alia, projects and campaigns related to media literacy and gender equality.

The Council of Europe is the continent's leading human rights organisation. It comprises 47 member states, 28 of which are members of the European Union. All Council of Europe member states have signed up to the European Convention on Human Rights, a treaty designed to protect human rights, democracy and the rule of law. The European Court of Human Rights oversees the implementation of the Convention in the member states.



Agencija za elektroničke medije
Agency for Electronic Media

