

□□□□□

limbă

# SIXTH EVALUATION REPORT ON THE UNITED KINGDOM AND THE ISLE OF MAN

nyelv

γλώσσα

Committee of Experts of  
the European Charter  
for Regional or  
Minority Languages

ЯЗИК

cànan

ġiöll

språk

Adopted on 19 June 2024

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a state party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the state and, where appropriate, to encourage the party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the state to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the state concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the state in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each state for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the state, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the state in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the state concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective state party for possible comments within a given deadline. A confidential dialogue may, at this stage, be requested by this state party. The final evaluation report is made public, together with the comments, if any, which the authorities of the state party may have made. This document is then transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for the adoption of its recommendations to the state party, on the basis of the proposals for recommendations contained in the evaluation report.

MIN-LANG(2024)9

Published on 19 September 2024

Secretariat of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages  
Council of Europe  
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex  
France

[www.coe.int/minlang](http://www.coe.int/minlang)

## CONTENTS

<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man – Recent developments and trends .....</b>	<b>6</b>
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man .....	7
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man.....	20
<b>Chapter 2 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations.....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>2.1 Cornish.....</b>	<b>27</b>
2.1.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Cornish.....	27
2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Cornish in the United Kingdom .....	28
<b>2.2 Irish.....</b>	<b>29</b>
2.2.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Irish .....	29
2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Irish in the United Kingdom.....	32
<b>2.3 Scots .....</b>	<b>33</b>
2.3.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scots .....	33
2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scots in the United Kingdom .....	35
<b>2.4 Scottish Gaelic .....</b>	<b>36</b>
2.4.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic .....	36
2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic in the United Kingdom .....	39
<b>2.5 Ulster Scots .....</b>	<b>40</b>
2.5.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots 40	
2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots in the United Kingdom .....	41
<b>2.6 Welsh.....</b>	<b>42</b>
2.6.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Welsh .....	42
2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Welsh in the United Kingdom .....	45
<b>2.7 Manx Gaelic .....</b>	<b>46</b>

2.7.1	Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic	46
2.7.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic in the Isle of Man .....	49
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>[Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.....</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>Appendix I:</b>	<b>Instrument of Ratification.....</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>Appendix II:</b>	<b>Comments from the United Kingdom authorities.....</b>	<b>56</b>

## Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in the United Kingdom in 2001 and applies to the following languages: Cornish, Irish, Scots, Scottish Gaelic, Ulster Scots, Welsh and Manx Gaelic.

Due to the devolution system in the United Kingdom, regional and local authorities play a key role in the protection and promotion of regional or minority languages. Scotland, Wales and the Isle of Man have dedicated language plans and strategies for Scottish Gaelic, Welsh and Manx Gaelic. In addition, new legislation is being put forward for Scottish Gaelic, Scots and Welsh, and the Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act 2022 was adopted to further promote Irish and Ulster Scots. The Devolution Deal with Cornwall was finalised in December 2023, thus granting Cornwall Council further oversight and funding for the promotion of Cornish. Manx Gaelic is now also covered under Part III of the Charter. Overall, the regional or minority language protection framework is good, but for some of these languages, there is an overreliance on volunteers for their development and lack of adequate and systematic funding. In this sense, further resolute action is required to promote Cornish, Scots and Ulster Scots.

Despite new legislation enacted in Northern Ireland, language issues remain politicised, and efforts should be made in order to further promote both Irish and Ulster Scots despite political tensions.

The promotion and offer of minority language education is the remit of the local authorities, who have largely the responsibility for planning the delivery of minority language education and stimulating demand for it. In practice, this leads to a very uneven situation across regional or minority languages. Nevertheless, Irish, Scottish Gaelic, Welsh and Manx Gaelic are used as medium of instruction from pre-school up to secondary level, to a varying degree, and Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Welsh are also used in vocational and technical education. Scots can also be studied as a subject up to higher level (advanced secondary level). Scots has a limited presence in schools, while Cornish and Ulster Scots are in a very weak position, with mostly the history and culture linked to the language being available, alongside the teaching of some vocabulary. All languages can be studied as a subject of adult and continuing education, except for Ulster Scots. Ulster Scots and Manx Gaelic are not available at university level and very little research is done on the latter. Availability of regional or minority languages teachers in the short to medium-term remains an issue of concern for all languages. The teaching of the history and the culture reflected by regional and minority languages is often left to the discretion of schools or local authorities and is therefore not guaranteed. Efforts are required in this regard.

A lot of discretion is left to regional and local authorities regarding the use of regional or minority languages within public administration, leading to a very varied situation. Welsh communication is guaranteed in all local councils, but this is not systematic for Scottish Gaelic, Scots, Irish, Ulster Scots and Manx Gaelic, and not possible for Cornish.

Upcoming changes in media legislation point towards an explicit inclusion of all regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom. However, representatives of speakers of all languages raised concerns about weak wording and lack of specific guidance over implementation. At the same time, this also represents an opportunity for regional or minority languages to be better embedded in the legislation, as well as to secure funding, which has suffered many cuts over the past years and that has left media in regional or minority languages in a weaker situation. Statutory inclusion of regional or minority languages would ensure long-term and sustainable funding, but it is not foreseen at present.

This sixth evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to the United Kingdom in February 2024.

## Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its states parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. The Charter entered into force in the United Kingdom on 1 July 2001 and applies to the following languages: Cornish, Irish, Scots, Scottish Gaelic, Ulster Scots, Welsh and Manx Gaelic. The Cornish, Scots and Ulster Scots languages are covered by Part II (Article 7) only, whereas Irish, Scottish Gaelic, Welsh and Manx Gaelic (in respect of the territory of the Isle of Man) receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).

2. States parties are required to submit reports every five years<sup>1</sup> on the implementation of the Charter. On 3 August 2023, the authorities of the United Kingdom submitted their sixth periodical report.<sup>2</sup> However, the report contained no information on the application of the Charter with regards to Irish and Ulster Scots in Northern Ireland. The Committee of Experts highlights that the lack of information with regards to these languages seriously hampers the monitoring process. This sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report, additional information received from the authorities and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the regional or minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (19-23 February 2024) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16.2 of the Charter. As in previous monitoring rounds, the Committee of Experts received a considerable number of statements from bodies and associations representing speakers and wishes to reiterate their valuable contribution to the evaluation of the implementation of the Charter in the UK and the Isle of Man, as well as to express its appreciation.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man and the situation of these languages. It examines, in particular, the measures taken by the United Kingdom authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the fifth monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of the United Kingdom in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the United Kingdom authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of the United Kingdom, as provided in Article 16.4 of the Charter. The Committee of Experts encourages the United Kingdom authorities to translate this report into the regional or minority languages with a view to supporting the authorities, organisations, advisory bodies and persons concerned in the process of fully implementing the Charter, in accordance with Articles 6 and 7.4.

4. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to the United Kingdom in February 2024. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 19 June 2024.

---

<sup>1</sup> Article 15.1 of the Charter provides that states parties submit periodical reports every three years. However, following the entry into force of the reform of the monitoring mechanism of the ECRML on 1 July 2019, states parties are now to submit their reports every five years instead of every three years. See Committee of Ministers Decisions “Strengthening the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages”. [CM/Del/Dec\(2018\)1330/10.4e, para. 1.a.](#)

<sup>2</sup> United Kingdom’s [Sixth periodical report presented to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in accordance with Article 15 of the Charter on European Regional and Minority Languages](#), 3 August 2023.

## 1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man

### General issues

5. As highlighted in previous monitoring cycles, as a party to the Charter, the United Kingdom (UK) central authorities are responsible for the implementation of the convention as a whole. Many competences are devolved to the administrations of Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland, which in practice means that the implementation of most undertakings of the Charter lies with them. However, undertakings in respect of Cornish, as well as some Charter undertakings relevant to all UK's regional or minority languages, such as broadcasting and transfrontier exchanges, remain the direct responsibility of the Westminster government. The Isle of Man is a self-governing entity, depending on the UK only for defence and international relations and therefore implementation of the Charter for Manx Gaelic falls under its responsibility.

6. On 23 December 2020, the United Kingdom notified the Council of Europe that it accepted to apply Part III undertakings to Manx Gaelic in respect of the territory of the Isle of Man. The Committee of Experts welcomes the ambitious goals for the language under Part III, reflecting on the good will of the authorities to transform grassroots initiatives into policy leading to the long-term development of Manx Gaelic and congratulates them for their efforts. In addition, it highlights that it considers it to be good practice that states parties regularly review their commitments under the Charter in order to reflect developments in the situation of the regional or minority languages and to set medium- and long-term improvement targets.

7. As in the previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts regrets that neither the United Kingdom central authorities nor the devolved administration concerned has included information about the application of the Charter with regard to Irish and Ulster Scots in the sixth periodical report. Although the Northern Ireland Assembly had been suspended twice between 2017 and 2024 and therefore no agreed contribution could be sent to the United Kingdom central authorities, the Committee of Experts reminds the UK government that it has the final responsibility under international law for the implementation of the Charter and that it is its treaty obligation to submit a complete report in full compliance with Article 15 of the Charter. In addition, co-operation with the Committee of Experts during the on-the-spot visit is important in the monitoring process, and therefore the Committee of Experts encourages the central authorities to play a more active role in the entire monitoring process.

### *Legislation on regional or minority languages*

8. In the fifth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the authorities “**adopt a comprehensive law and strategy on the promotion of Irish in Northern Ireland**”. In 2022, in light of the lack of government in Northern Ireland, the British Parliament enacted the Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act, which provided official recognition of the status of the Irish language in Northern Ireland alongside English. In its Evaluation of the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action contained in the Committee of Experts' fifth evaluation report on the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man,<sup>3</sup> the Committee of Experts asked the authorities “that further consideration be given (...) to making express provision for specific language rights, such as in the fields of education, access to public services, public signage and cultural activities” when adopting amendments to the draft legislation. According to the speakers, this did not occur.

9. The Act also establishes the Irish Language Commissioner, as well as the Commissioner for the Ulster Scots and the Ulster British tradition, to be appointed jointly by the First Minister and the Deputy First Minister of the Northern Ireland Executive. The role of the former commissioner is to “enhance and protect the use of the Irish language by public authorities”<sup>4</sup> and the role of the latter, “to enhance and develop the

<sup>3</sup> Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, “[Evaluation by the Committee of Experts of the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action contained in the Committee of Experts' fifth evaluation report on the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man](#)” (MIN-LANG (2021)3), 22 March 2021, para. 28.

<sup>4</sup> Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act 2022, Part 1, Section 2, 78L.1.

language, arts and literature associated with the Ulster Scots and the Ulster British tradition”.<sup>5</sup> The Committee of Experts welcomes the establishment of the commissioners. However, due to the lack of a government in Northern Ireland until February 2024, the commissioners have not yet been appointed.

10. According to the speakers, some shortcomings exist in the role of the Irish Language Commissioner: first, opinions issued will have to be taken into account by the authorities, but not necessarily followed, as the commissioner has no power of enforcement, such as imposing penalties; second, many services currently falling within the competences of the UK, rather than to the devolved Northern Ireland administration, are excluded from the remit of the commissioner. In practice, the latter means that issues related to taxes, public benefits (including childcare benefits), among others, are not under the supervision of the commissioner and therefore language-related problems in those sectors will fall outside the commissioner’s oversight. In addition, the Northern Ireland Office and its Arm’s length Bodies, the Electoral Office, and other important public bodies are not subject to the commissioner’s provisions either.<sup>6</sup>

11. As regards the Commissioner for the Ulster Scots and the Ulster British tradition, doubts remain as to whether it will be required that the commissioner is an Ulster Scots speaker. Concerns have also been raised as regards the title, since speakers consider it might lead to a politicisation of the role by focusing it on “the British tradition” and therefore detract attention from language issues per se. Considering the appointment procedure of the two commissioners, another concern expressed by the speakers relates to their ability to exercise their mandates in full independence. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to address the concerns of speakers especially given the risks of political tension around language and identity in Northern Ireland. It reiterates that efforts should be made to ensure that language promotion is, as far as possible, depoliticised. The Committee of Experts considers it essential that the commissioners speak the language of their mandate and therefore asks the authorities to ensure the Commissioner for the Ulster Scots and the Ulster British tradition is required to speak Ulster Scots. It also looks forwards to receiving further information on how the abovementioned shortcomings are being addressed in the next monitoring round.

12. In addition, in 2020 an Irish Language Expert Advisory Panel with Irish language experts was appointed by the Department of Communities, which delivered a blueprint for an Irish Language Strategy in March 2022. However, the strategy has not yet been adopted. The Committee of Experts welcomes the consultation process undertaken by the Northern Ireland authorities to develop an Irish Language Strategy and reiterates its position, as in previous monitoring cycles, that adequate legislation for the Irish language alongside a strategy are integral to the protection and promotion of Irish in Northern Ireland and encourages them to swiftly adopt it. It also encourages the authorities to take the needs and wishes of the representatives of speakers into account for adopting the strategy. Another Expert Advisory Panel was also convened to develop a strategy for the promotion of Ulster Scots, which has not yet been adopted either (see also below, para. 19).

13. The Scottish government introduced the “Scottish Languages Bill” in November 2023. If adopted by the Scottish Parliament, the bill would also give official status to both Scottish Gaelic and Scots.<sup>7</sup> The introduction of the bill is a positive move, but its impact remains to be seen based on its ultimate formulation. In Wales, the government held a consultation which resulted in the White Paper for a Welsh Language Education Bill in the context of the on-going strategy “Cymraeg 2050: A million Welsh speakers”. The bill aims to further promote the Welsh language through education to support the achievement of the targets set out in the Strategy.<sup>8</sup> The Committee of Experts looks forward to receiving further information on the outcome of these bills in the next monitoring round.

14. In the fifth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the authorities “**devolve the necessary responsibilities to Cornwall County Council enabling it to effectively promote**

---

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid*, Part 1, Section 3, 78S.1.

<sup>6</sup> Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission, “[Submission to the Council of Europe Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. Parallel Report for the Sixth Periodic Report of the UK and NI](#)”, February 2024, p. 11.

<sup>7</sup> The Scottish Parliament, “[Scottish Languages Bill](#)”.

<sup>8</sup> Welsh Government, “[Proposals for a Welsh Language Education Bill](#)”, March 2023.



**Cornish**". In November 2023, the Level 2 Cornwall Devolution Deal was agreed.<sup>9</sup> The deal secured £500 000 (approx. €585 000) "to support Cornish distinctiveness and the Cornish language". In addition, the deal set forth the possibility for Cornwall Council to attend meetings of the British-Irish Council,<sup>10</sup> alongside representatives of administrations responsible for promoting other regional or minority languages.<sup>11</sup> The Committee of Experts commends the authorities for this deal and looks forward to receiving further information on its implementation in the next monitoring round.

15. Additional efforts by the devolved administrations to further promote regional or minority languages through language strategies were commended by the Committee of Experts in the fifth monitoring cycle. Since then, the authorities of the Isle of Man launched the Manx Gaelic Strategy for 2022-2032, which sets the target of 5,000 speakers by 2032. The Scottish authorities launched the Scottish Government's Gaelic Language Plan 2022-2027, as well as *Bòrd na Gàidhlig's* National Gaelic Language Plan 2023-2028. In addition, Cornwall Council published its Cornish Language Policy (as part of its Cornish Language Strategy 2015-2025) in 2019. The Committee of Experts welcomes these developments and encourages the authorities to continue developing, implementing and evaluating language strategies, and to develop strategies for the other regional or minority languages which do not have them at present.

### ***Resolute action to promote regional or minority languages***

16. The UK and the Isle of Man have, in general, established systems to protect and promote their regional or minority languages. Much progress has been achieved in the recognition of most regional or minority languages and a large number of language strategies and policies, as well as initiatives have been contributing to the development of regional or minority languages. Nevertheless, there seems to be at times an overreliance on voluntary sectors and motivated individuals dedicated to the specific language to promote it. This is the case in particular for Cornish and Manx Gaelic. Embedding language protection within institutions is needed for the long-term development of regional or minority languages. The authorities should avoid excessively outsourcing language promotion and protection to organisations on the ground without providing adequate resources. The responsibility for the adequate implementation of the Charter lies with the authorities, not with organisations representing speakers.

17. Legal provisions protecting these languages or foreseeing their use in the public domain, alongside more and dedicated funding, and a structured approach to language development are required for ensuring the long-term development of regional or minority languages for raising their prestige and visibility. Language strategies should set clear and realistic targets with measurable indicators, based on the specific context of each language and the needs and wishes of speakers. Speakers of Scottish Gaelic raised concerns over the fact that, although a number of policy documents exist seeking to further protect and promote the language, the lack of measurable indicators to evaluate the success of the actions set forth do not show sufficiently resolute action from the authorities. This is the case, for example, in relation to the Gaelic Language Plan for 2023-2028, where the vague wording of "a measurable increase" in the number of speakers as a target does not provide for an adequate and realistic possibility to monitor nor evaluate the success rate of the actions designed.

18. The lack of statutory bodies dealing with Cornish, Scots, Manx Gaelic and Ulster Scots, alongside the lack of official status, constitutes yet another barrier hampering the adequate development of these languages. In addition, the Scots language would also benefit from a more structured and strategic approach, as well as adequate funding, especially in light of the high percentage of the Scottish population speaking the language (see also below, para. 23), and of the steady increase in interest in this language in public life. Representatives of speakers of Scottish Gaelic highlighted that the creation of an independent

<sup>9</sup> There exist three possible levels or type of governance models. Level 2 corresponds to a single institution or Unitary/County Council without a directly elected leader, across a whole county area. Available at: <https://www.cornwall.gov.uk/people-and-communities/cornwall-devolution-deal/>.

<sup>10</sup> The [British-Irish Council](#) is an intergovernmental organisation established in 1998, aiming at increasing co-operation in a number of sectors, including "Indigenous, Minority and Lesser-Used Languages". Members to the Council include the Irish Government, the UK Government, the Scottish Government, the Northern Ireland Executive, the Welsh Government, the Isle of Man Government, the Government of Jersey, and the Government of Guernsey.

<sup>11</sup> Cornwall Council, "[Cornwall Devolution Deal](#)".

body overseeing the development of Scottish Gaelic, for example, in the form of a language commissioner, would be highly beneficial for the protection of the language. According to them, this would help ensure accountability for those responsible for language promotion, whilst demonstrating resolute action for the development of Scottish Gaelic as a language in public life. In the case of Manx Gaelic, the additional commitments undertaken by the authorities of the Isle of Man to apply Part III of the Charter to it, will require additional investment in the language.

19. There continues to be no strategy adopted for Ulster Scots, as required under the (UK-Ireland) 2006 St Andrews Agreement and as raised by the Committee of Experts in previous monitoring rounds.<sup>12</sup> In 2022, an expert advisory panel report was produced on the Ulster Scots strategy following a very short consultation period.<sup>13</sup> Only two of its 74 pages focus on language-related issues.<sup>14</sup> Information received by the Committee of Experts highlighted concerns from speakers as regards the participation of Ulster Scots speakers in the panel. Although the authorities were asked about this issue, they did not clarify the matter, stating that they did not have any information to provide. Speakers also highlighted how in recent years there has been a shift in focus from language to culture and identity issues, thus putting aside language protection and promotion. The Committee of Experts highlights that despite the relatively high numbers of speakers (see also below, para. 24), there is almost no presence of Ulster Scots in public life. This is also an indication of insufficiently resolute action. It urges the authorities to depoliticise language and identity issues, especially considering the context in Northern Ireland.

20. A new inquiry initiated by the Department for Culture, Media and Sports looking into minority languages in the UK is on-going at the British Parliament. The purpose of the inquiry is to find ways for the Government to support and develop Cornish, Scottish Gaelic, Irish, Scots, Ulster Scots and Welsh. Written evidence was collected until March 2023 and oral evidence by different actors was given in March and May 2024, in order to determine the factors which make a minority language thrive, the criteria to determine official status, and best practice from other countries.<sup>15</sup> The Committee of Experts looks forward to receiving information on the outcomes of the inquiry and how the results are being used to take resolute action to promote regional or minority languages.

## **Census**

21. A population census was conducted in 2021; however, due to the devolution system in the United Kingdom, the different devolved administrations dealt with the census in slightly different manners and Scotland held its own in 2022. The Isle of Man also held a census in 2021. The Committee of Experts notes that the figures are based on self-reporting. In England and Wales, the census included the question “what is your main language”. For Wales only, the answers included “English or Welsh” or “other”. As result of this joint formulation, it was not possible to determine how many people in Wales consider Welsh to be their main language. However, a separate question targeting people aged three or above aimed to shine a light on their Welsh language ability.<sup>16</sup> The results showed that there are 538 300 Welsh speakers (a 17.8% of the Welsh population), which represents a decrease of 1.2% since the 2011 census, the lowest percentage ever recorded.<sup>17</sup> According to the speakers, the decrease in the census might be related to the fact that it was conducted during the Covid-19 pandemic when remote learning was the norm, which might have had an impact of people’s perception of their Welsh language ability, especially when answering on behalf of children who had a much lower exposure to Welsh during lockdowns. Alternative sources such as the Annual Population Survey published in March 2021, however, pointed to a total of 883 300 people being able to speak Welsh (around 29.1% of the population).<sup>18</sup>

<sup>12</sup> Committee of Experts, [Third](#) and [Fourth](#) Evaluation Reports on the United Kingdom.

<sup>13</sup> Department for Communities, [“Consultation on the Expert Advisory Panel’s Recommendations Report for an Ulster-Scots Language, Heritage and Culture Strategy”](#), March-April 2022.

<sup>14</sup> Department for Communities, [“Ulster-Scots Language, Heritage and Culture Strategy Expert Advisory Panel Recommendation Report”](#), May 2022.

<sup>15</sup> UK Parliament, [“Minority Languages Inquiry”](#).

<sup>16</sup> Office for National Statistics, [“Language, England and Wales: Census 2021”](#).

<sup>17</sup> Welsh Government, [“Welsh Language in Wales \(Census 2021\)”](#), December 2022.

<sup>18</sup> Welsh Government, [“Welsh language data from the Annual Population Survey: April 202 to March 2021”](#).

22. There was no tick box for Cornish language in the census as a main language, only “English” or “other”. It was only possible to specify Cornish by writing it in a dedicated box. According to the speakers, having to select between “English” or “other” may have had an impact on the answers, resulting in people with some command of Cornish not declaring it.<sup>19</sup> A total of 567 people declared Cornish to be their main language by declaring “other” and using the additional box provided to specify it.

23. In Scotland, the census also asked about skills in English, Scots and Scottish Gaelic for its population of three or above. 1 537 626 people reported speaking Scots (30% of the total population of Scotland).<sup>20</sup> For Scottish Gaelic, 69 701 reported speaking the language (around 1.36% of the population).<sup>21</sup> Numbers have increased since the 2011 census, when only 1.5% reported some knowledge of Scottish Gaelic and when only 1.1% reported the ability to speak it.<sup>22</sup>

24. In Northern Ireland, the census also asked about language ability in Irish and Ulster Scots. Irish is claimed to be spoken by 228 600 people (12.4% of the population), an increase of 10.7% since 2011. Ulster Scots is claimed to be spoken by 190 600 people (10.4% of the population), an increase of 10.7% since the previous census.<sup>23</sup> For the first time, online forms in Irish and Ulster Scots were available to respondents – around 1,300 households used Irish forms and around 800, Ulster Scots.<sup>24</sup>

25. The census in the Isle of Man included the question “Can you speak, read or write Manx Gaelic?” with the possibility to specify which option.<sup>25</sup> Results showed a total of 2 223 individuals having some ability in the language (around 2.6% of the total population of the island),<sup>26</sup> an increase of 34.7% since the previous census in 2011, according to the periodical report.

26. The Committee of Experts highlights that all recognised regional or minority languages should appear in the list of languages spoken in national censuses. It also underlines that census results should be complemented by sociolinguistic surveys or by collecting, in co-operation with the speakers, data concerning the number of users of regional or minority languages and their geographic distribution, and therefore encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man not to overly rely on the census data alone when planning their actions concerning regional or minority languages.

### ***Raising awareness and tolerance of regional and minority languages and their cultures***

27. Overall, there appears to be a general lack of knowledge of the value and contribution of regional or minority languages and the cultures they represent across the UK and the Isle of Man within the English-speaking majority population, a matter of relevance in the context of Article 7.3 of the Charter. Although regional or minority languages generally enjoy good institutional support from regional and central authorities and many policies and legislative efforts have been made to protect and promote them, there is still a need to raise awareness in the society as a whole of the value of regional or minority languages as an integral part of the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man, and to increase efforts to tackle intolerance against speakers of regional or minority languages. Education and media should play a bigger role in this regard. The Committee of Experts highlights the importance of media in promoting respect and tolerance for regional or minority languages and the cultures associated with them. Reporting about regional or minority languages and cultures should therefore be part of the mainstream media. In the case of education,

<sup>19</sup> The Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities in its 5<sup>th</sup> Opinion on the United Kingdom highlighted the following: “There was no specific tick-box for Cornish ethnicity or language as the Office for National Statistics (ONS) has judged this demand to be too localised to be included in the national census; those wishing to self-identify as such had to write it in” (para. 42).

<sup>20</sup> [Scotland’s Census, 2022 – Ethnic group, national identity, language and religion](#).

<sup>21</sup> Ibid.

<sup>22</sup> Scottish Government, “[Policy, Languages](#)”.

<sup>23</sup> Northern Ireland Statistics and Research Agency, “[Census 2021 main statistics language tables](#)”, September 2022.

<sup>24</sup> Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission, “[Submission to the Council of Europe Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. Parallel Report for the Sixth Periodic Report of the UK and NI](#)”, February 2024.

<sup>25</sup> [2021 Isle of Man Census Report, Part II](#), April 2022.

<sup>26</sup> Lewin, Christopher, “Revived Manx”; In: Joe Eska, Paul Russell, Silva Nurmio & Peadar Ó Muirheartaigh (eds.), *Palgrave Handbook of Celtic Languages and Linguistics* (forthcoming).

teaching of the history of regional or minority languages can play a key role in increasing tolerance in the society as a whole and promote intercultural dialogue and, at present, it is only systematically done for Welsh, and even then only in Wales.

28. In addition, history of minority cultures and languages should be taught and target all pupils living in the area where these are traditionally spoken as required by Article 8.1.g of the Charter (for Part III languages), and not only to regional or minority languages speakers. Curricula should therefore include the contributions of the cultures linked to Irish, Scottish Gaelic, Welsh and Manx Gaelic, and this should be reflected in teaching materials as well as in the training of teachers. In line with this, the Committee of Experts invites the authorities to consider the possibility of joining the Observatory on History Teaching in Europe of the Council of Europe.<sup>27</sup>

29. In some cases, awareness-raising initiatives to highlight the value of regional or minority languages alongside the benefits of multilingualism would also benefit speakers of regional or minority languages themselves. Information received during the on-the-spot visit points to the fact that, at times, pupils, students and parents, speakers of regional or minority languages, might be reticent to formally study these languages for fear of potential disadvantages and/or discrimination. Awareness-raising activities need to be continued and enhanced in order to raise the prestige of regional or minority languages.

30. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers of Scots raised concerns that there are many instances of intolerance, threats and hate speech linked to the use of Scots in public life. Such instances have happened mostly online, and women appear to be a particular target. According to representatives of speakers, such instances have been reported to the police without any action being taken. The Committee of Experts notes that the Equality Act 2010<sup>28</sup> does not include “language” as a ground for discrimination and calls on the authorities to ensure it does in order to protect victims of language-based hatred from discrimination and intolerance.

31. In addition, following the 2014 independence referendum in Scotland, there has been a politicisation of language issues. Speakers informed the Committee of Experts that in public discourse, there have been some attempts to link Scottish Gaelic or Scots language promotion or speakers of those languages with the independence movement.<sup>29</sup> According to information provided during the on-the-spot visit by speakers of both regional or minority languages, there is no such link, as speakers hold a range of views on the question of independence and support a range of political parties. They were all adamant on the need to decouple politics from language issues and treat language protection as a non-partisan issue. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to continue and enhance efforts to depoliticise regional and minority languages and to promote non-discrimination.

### ***Romani languages***

32. The Committee of Experts has been informed by Romani speakers that they would like to have their languages recognised as regional or minority languages under the Charter. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities to provide information about the situation of Romani traditionally present in the UK in the next periodical report.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in education***

33. Teaching in regional or minority languages continues to be available for Irish, Scottish Gaelic, Welsh and Manx Gaelic. This is the case at pre-school, primary and secondary levels, although some shortcomings exist as availability is not even across all areas. In addition, students in Irish-medium education with special needs cannot access support services in Irish as these are only available in

---

<sup>27</sup> [The Observatory on History Teaching in Europe - Observatory on History Teaching in Europe \(coe.int\)](https://www.coe.int/en/web/observatory-on-history-teaching).

<sup>28</sup> [UK Equality Act 2010](#).

<sup>29</sup> Medium, “[Scots and Gaelic aren't Yes languages – here's why](#)”, 4 April 2021.

English.<sup>30</sup> During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of speakers of Irish and Scottish Gaelic raised concerns over the fact that curricula used in minority language medium schools is a translation of the English curriculum, rather than targeted curricula for the respective regional or minority languages. The Committee of Experts highlights the importance of having targeted curricula which meet the needs of minority language medium education. This could be done by contextualising the regional or minority language setting, the specific history and challenges, or also using different teaching methodologies, as the linguistic and cultural background of children may differ from those in English-medium education. It should also be noted that English might not be the first language of pupils or not be the language spoken at home, and therefore their language needs may differ.

34. In March 2024, the Welsh Government published its High-level Plan “Early Childhood Play, Learning and Care”, which includes among its actions the expansion of Welsh medium early years provision and the support for families to introduce Welsh at home.<sup>31</sup>

35. The longest running Manx Gaelic nursery closed in 2022,<sup>32</sup> reducing the number of nurseries to one in the whole island, despite an increase in demand as noted by representatives of speakers. In 2020, the authorities of the Isle of Man took full control of the Bunscoill Ghaelgagh, the only Manx Gaelic-medium primary school in the island. This step shows commitment from the authorities towards ensuring public Manx Gaelic education and therefore the Committee of Experts welcomes it. It nevertheless encourages the authorities to expand Manx Gaelic-medium education in view to meeting the targets set in the Manx Gaelic Strategy for 2022-2032, which seeks to increase the number of speakers but also of offer across the island, as at present it is only available in Saint John’s/Balley Keeill Eoin.

36. Cornish is promoted in primary education through a voluntary scheme, which schools can join to promote language exposure. Scots can be learned from pre-school to secondary level. Information received by the Committee of Experts shows that the teaching of Scots depends on the decision of the local authorities, the schools or the teachers themselves, based on the context-specific situation and the first language of pupils. The Committee of Experts is concerned that this approach, which in practice leaves a large degree of discretion to individuals does not always ensure the provision of Scots language teaching. In addition, although the new legislation in Northern Ireland sets “the legal duty on the Department of Education to encourage and facilitate the use and understanding of Ulster Scots in the education system”,<sup>33</sup> at present Ulster Scots can only be learned in after school clubs and is not available through mainstream education.

37. The offer of education in regional or minority languages changes in post-secondary and higher education. Vocational education and training in regional or minority languages is available only in Welsh and, to a limited degree, in Scottish Gaelic and Irish. In 2020, Qualifications Wales, the independent regulator of non-degree qualifications in Wales, published the strategy “Choice for All” putting forward strategic areas to increase the availability of Welsh-medium qualifications, including in post-16 settings.<sup>34</sup> According to the representatives of speakers, the post-16 Welsh-medium education sector is particularly weak, with little offer. The Committee of Experts welcomes this strategy with a view to remedying this shortcoming in Welsh-medium education and looks forward to receiving information on its outcomes in the next monitoring round.

38. Cornish, Irish, Scottish Gaelic, Scots, Welsh and Manx Gaelic can be learned through adult and continuing education in cultural institutions, community-based offer or other means. Dedicated undergraduate language degrees are available for Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Welsh. All languages but Manx

---

<sup>30</sup> According to information provided by the Department of Education in Northern Ireland, in the school year 2022-2023 there were 1,586 children and young people (CYP) with Special Educational Needs (SEN) in Irish medium education. These students have to access the Education Authority pupil support services in the medium of English.

<sup>31</sup> Welsh Government, “[Early Childhood Play, Learning and Care. High level Plan](#)”, March 2024.

<sup>32</sup> Isle of Man Today, “[End for Manx Nursery](#)”, 31 July 2022.

<sup>33</sup> [Identity and Language \(Northern Ireland\) Act 2022](#), Chapter 45, 6 December 2022, Section 5.

<sup>34</sup> In the UK, full time school attendance is compulsory until the age of 16. See Qualifications Wales, “[Choice for All Strategy](#)”, January 2020.

Gaelic can be studied at university level either as part of a programme or as a course of its own. This seriously hampers the availability of future teachers and the survival of Manx Gaelic medium education in a long run. Welsh is also used as a medium of instruction for other university degrees, with a limited presence.

39. In the fifth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the authorities “**continue taking measures to strengthen Scottish Gaelic education, especially through the training of teachers and the production of teaching and learning materials.**” In 2022, the University of Strathclyde, in partnership with *Bòrd na Gàidhlig* launched the Additional Teaching Qualification, enabling “Secondary Modern Languages teachers to provide courses for Gaelic learners as part of the modern languages curriculum on offer in their schools”.<sup>35</sup> According to Scottish Gaelic speakers, further measures are required to attract new teachers to work in Scottish Gaelic education, whilst at the same time ensuring teacher retention, including through financial incentives, further support to teachers and confidence-building initiatives. In 2021, the multiplatform learning tool *SpeakGaelic*<sup>36</sup> was launched providing media and classroom resources for learning Gaelic. This tool was created in partnership between MG Alba, Sabhal Mòr Ostaig (the National Centre for Gaelic Language and Culture) and the British Broadcasting Company (BBC). It provides an integrated and modern approach to learning Scottish Gaelic through courses or self-learning.

40. Training and recruitment of teachers remains problematic for all regional or minority languages. In Wales, in order to tackle the increase in demand for Welsh-medium education, the Welsh Government launched the “Welsh in education workforce plan” in 2022, a 10-year plan to meet the objectives set in *Cymraeg 2050*.<sup>37</sup> In Northern Ireland, the lack of availability of teachers for Irish-medium education at secondary level is of particular concern. Although the situation seems better in theory concerning teachers for primary education, representatives of speakers pointed out that many newly qualified teachers leave the minority language education, resulting in shortages of teachers in the near future, especially in the context of a high increase in demand for Irish-medium education. In Scotland, an in-service teacher professional learner programme for Scots targeting primary and secondary teachers was launched in 2024, with 120 registrations for its first edition. This course helps support teachers wishing to teach through the medium of Scots. According to speakers, the high demand for this training points to a shift in mindset towards Scots and an increasing interest by pupils, students, and parents for Scots language learning. The Committee of Experts welcomes this development, given the high number of Scots speakers as shown by the latest census, and in the context of first language acquisition and the role this can have on literacy skills of pupils, especially at primary school level. In light of this, it looks forward to receiving further information on the outcomes of the programme and whether it becomes systematised in the next monitoring round.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities***

41. The Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act 2022 (see also above, para. 8) contains provisions in its section 4 to repeal the Administration of Justice (Language) Act (Ireland) 1737, which does not allow the use of Irish as well as Ulster Scots in courts.<sup>38</sup> The Committee of Experts has since the second monitoring round been concerned about the lack of progress in repealing the 1737 Act and urges the authorities to act swiftly to ensure the possibility of using Irish and Ulster Scots in courts in Northern Ireland.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities***

42. The use of regional or minority languages by administrative authorities is uneven. Availability of communications in regional or minority languages varies, depending, on the one hand, on the undertakings chosen for each language, and on the other, on whether services concern national, regional or local authorities. As a result of devolution in the UK, many competences lie with the devolved administrations. In

<sup>35</sup> *Bòrd na Gàidhlig*, “[Bòrd na Gàidhlig and University of Strathclyde launch the first-ever accredited Gaelic as a Modern Language teaching qualification](#)”.

<sup>36</sup> [SpeakGaelic](#).

<sup>37</sup> Welsh Government, “[Welsh in education workforce plan](#)”, May 2022.

<sup>38</sup> The Belfast Telegraph, “[Anger over delay in lifting 300-year-old ban on Irish and Ulster-Scots in court](#)”, 15 January 2024.

this context, during the on-the-spot visit, speakers of Irish and Scottish Gaelic highlighted that branches of central authorities in Northern Ireland and Scotland do not guarantee that communication of their services offered both online and in person are available in regional or minority languages. In addition, speakers of Scottish Gaelic highlighted such branches are also not required to produce and deliver Gaelic Language Plans as they fall outside the scope of the Gaelic Language (Scotland) Act 2005.

43. Regional or minority languages can generally be used orally in communication with local authorities in regions with high numbers of speakers, although this is not systematic. The use of regional or minority languages by the authorities, including for drafting and translating official documents, is uneven and remains haphazard. Local authorities are key players in the promotion of regional or minority languages. In Wales, local authorities are regulated by language standards under the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011, which require the use of Welsh in a variety of contexts. In Scotland, local authorities (and other public bodies) can be required by *Bòrd na Gàidhlig* to draw up language plans to promote Scottish Gaelic in public life. Such plans can make provision for the language in public administration. In Northern Ireland, local authorities are also encouraged to draw up such plans for Irish and Ulster Scots. However, representatives of Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Welsh speakers raised concerns over the disparity in the level of support for the languages by different public bodies. Furthermore, the lack of mechanisms from regional or central authorities to develop and enforce these plans was raised by speakers, particularly in Scotland, as a barrier to language promotion and development. In addition, Irish speakers raised concerns over the difficulty in accessing bilingual services and, at times, the lack of respect for or patience with Irish speakers. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to have a proactive and welcoming approach, showing that they are prepared for the use of the regional or minority languages.

44. Much discretion and initiative are thus left to local authorities, and, to a variety of degree, these have developed language plans which set forth how they commit to promote regional or minority languages, including through offering the possibility to communicate in them. Five out of the 11 Northern Ireland councils have policies providing guidance on the use of Irish in different sectors of public life (signage, communications, etc.), accept written and oral communications in Irish and publish documents in Irish. Only four of them offer an Irish version of forms and allow Irish to be used in internal meetings with interpretation on request.<sup>39</sup> Three councils have policies committing to promote Ulster Scots and allow for communication in it, where possible. In Scotland, 26 out of the 32 councils have Gaelic Language Plans but the possibility to use Scottish Gaelic in communications with them and to provide translations of documents differs greatly across them.<sup>40</sup> In Wales, since all local councils are subject to Welsh language standards. Communication in Welsh is ensured throughout.

45. In 2021, the Department for Communities in Northern Ireland established a central translation hub for Irish and Ulster Scots available for the public sector.<sup>41</sup> Consequently, all devolved authorities have translation services available free of charge for translating documents into/from all regional or minority languages. In the case of Scotland, translation services for Scots and Scottish Gaelic are only offered within government departments and these are not available for other public bodies nor the public.

46. In addition, members of the Northern Ireland Assembly passed a motion to introduce simultaneous interpretation services in Irish and Ulster Scots in the Northern Ireland Assembly, something set out in the “New Decade, New Approach (NDNA)”.<sup>42</sup> The first speech exclusively in Irish was delivered in 2022.<sup>43</sup> The Committee of Experts welcomes this as an important means of facilitating the use of regional or minority languages in public life and to move forward, especially given the highly politicised context in Northern Ireland.

---

<sup>39</sup> Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission, “[Submission to the Council of Europe Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. Parallel Report for the Sixth Periodic Report of the UK and NI](#)”, February 2024, p. 22.

<sup>40</sup> *Bòrd na Gàidhlig*, “[Approved Gaelic Language Plans](#)”.

<sup>41</sup> Department for Communities, “[Irish and Ulster-Scots central translation hub for the public sector](#)”.

<sup>42</sup> BBC News, “[NI Assembly approves Irish/Ulster-Scots translation plans](#)”, 15 June 2021.

<sup>43</sup> The Belfast Telegraph, “[Full speech in Irish given to Stormont Assembly for the first time](#)”, 13 May 2022.

47. Road and other bilingual signage exists to some degree for all languages. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers of Cornish, Scots and Manx Gaelic raised concerns about the poor quality of signage in regional or minority languages and how this negatively affects the visibility and prestige of the language. Whilst welcoming the increase of bilingual signage in public buildings and private businesses as a sign of increased interest in the language, speakers of Cornish highlighted that often signs are a literal translation of English, rather than accurate or historical versions and therefore incorrect Cornish. Scots speakers showed concern over the number of anglicised names of places and highlighted that some work is being done in co-operation with the Open University to find consensus over the versions of names. Speakers of Manx Gaelic wondered why the Manx Gaelic version of names appear in a much smaller font, as they consider this implies a hierarchisation of languages where Manx Gaelic is less important than English. The Committee of Experts recalls that the name in the regional or minority language should not be in a smaller size than the name in English,<sup>44</sup> as signage is an important measure which can increase the visibility and prestige of a regional or minority language, thereby raising awareness among the majority population and maintaining the linguistic heritage.

48. In Northern Ireland street signs remain a highly contentious topic and discretion is left to local authorities as regards the criteria and methods of consultation in order to approve bilingual signage. The existence of high thresholds limiting the possibility to put up bilingual signs are incompatible with the Charter, as already highlighted by the Committee of Experts in the previous monitoring round. In addition, the fact that in some councils the Irish version has to be a translation of the English one leads at times to artificial and non-traditional Irish-language street names. The Committee of Experts urges the authorities to ensure councils in Northern Ireland to set policies for bilingual street signage that are compatible with UK's undertaking under Article 10.2.g of the Charter.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in the media***

49. The UK's public broadcast service, the BBC, continues to make available television content in Irish through BBC Northern Ireland (although this is very limited), Scottish Gaelic through BBC Alba (delivered in conjunction with MG Alba), which broadcasts wholly in Scottish Gaelic, and Welsh through S4C (Sianel Pedwar Cymru - Channel Four Wales) broadcasting wholly in Welsh. MG Alba published a "Lèirsinn: a route map for Gaelic Media" in 2021, seeking to further digitalise media offer and aiming to reach 1 million people a week by 2027.<sup>45</sup> Speakers of both Scottish Gaelic and Welsh shared their frustration over the very high percentage of repeat programmes and how this is adversely affecting viewers. In 2023, an Expert Panel was set up by the Welsh government to explore the potential creation of a Shadow Broadcasting and Communications Authority for Wales and concluded that this approach would "give the sector the support it deserves" and put forward recommendations to do so.<sup>46</sup> During the on-the-stop visit, representatives of Welsh speakers highlighted the need for increased digitalisation, in line with the conclusions of the Expert Panel report. Cornish, Scots and Ulster Scots have a negligible presence on TV. No TV channel nor programmes exist for Manx Gaelic.

50. Public radio stations broadcasting exclusively in regional or minority languages are available for Welsh (BBC Radio Cymru) and Scottish Gaelic (BBC Radio nan Gàidheal), under the BBC's regional radio branches, as well as through some additional private offer for Welsh. Ráidíó Fáilte, a private station, broadcasts exclusively in Irish, but due to licensing issues as "community of interest" type of radio, its radius is very restricted and its geographical outreach is limited to Belfast. Although in 2021 Ofcom, the UK's communications services and media regulator, granted an upgrade allowing them to broadcast beyond its initial 5km radius, it remains under 10km, and is therefore not available to all Irish speakers across Northern Ireland. As the only Irish-language radio station in Northern Ireland, the Committee of Experts asks Ofcom to apply the rule on community radios outreach in a flexible manner. Manx Gaelic and Cornish have some very limited offer on public radio, and no public offer exists for Scots and Ulster Scots.

<sup>44</sup> See for example, the Fifth Evaluation Report of the Committee of Experts in respect of the Slovak Republic, CM(2019)126, para. 33 and the Seventh Evaluation Report on of the Committee of Experts in respect of Germany, CM(2022)170, para. 30.

<sup>45</sup> MG Alba, "[Lèirsinn: a route map for Gaelic Media 2022-2027](#)".

<sup>46</sup> Welsh Government, "[A new future for broadcasting and communications in Wales](#)", August 2023, p. 5.



51. Regular newspapers exist only in Welsh. In addition, some articles in Irish and Scottish Gaelic are published regularly in print newspapers. Some online newspapers are also available for Irish, Scottish Gaelic and Welsh.

52. New media legislation is underway with the aim of reforming the regulation of public service broadcasting in the UK. The draft law explicitly mentions the use of recognised regional or minority languages, including Welsh, Scottish Gaelic, Irish, Scots, Ulster Scots and Cornish. This also follows the above-mentioned Cornwall Devolution Deal, which set forth “to include Cornish in the list of regional and minority languages in the draft Media Bill”. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers of regional or minority languages emphasised that generally the inclusion of regional or minority languages in the bill is a good development with the potential to improve the presence of UK’s regional or minority languages in the media. However, they also raised concerns over the text, which remains very general, provides no specific guidance or standards, and leaves it to the discretion of Ofcom to decide what is appropriate in terms of quantity and type of programmes. In particular, speakers of Scottish Gaelic shared their fear that Scottish Gaelic will continue to have an unclear status and therefore uncertain funding, as a separate language service is not recognised in the legislation.

53. In this context, during the on-the-spot visit, the UK authorities informed the Committee of Experts that the BBC is at the very early stages of planning a new review of its Royal Charter (expected for 2028).<sup>47</sup> The current charter includes the obligation to “support the regional and minority languages of the United Kingdom through its output and services and through partnerships with other organisations”, which include “Welsh, Scottish Gaelic, Irish and Ulster Scots”.<sup>48</sup> This could provide the opportunity to potentially embed the remaining regional or minority languages, as well as aspects to further promote them in it. In particular, representatives of speakers raised concerns that, unlike for Welsh, there is not yet any statutory recognition of a Scottish Gaelic television service. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to look into possibilities to embed the promotion of regional or minority languages in the BBC’s Royal Charter and looks forward to receiving information in the next monitoring round.

54. The Committee of Experts notes with interest the increased use of the BBC’s online platform iPlayer,<sup>49</sup> which contains material developed and broadcast by BBC for on-demand viewing and the increased overall digitalisation of media in the UK and the Isle of Man, as reflected by the current media reform. iPlayer also provides a platform to further promote the presence and visibility of regional or minority languages by making resources available to all. Irish speakers argued that a lot of the material that had been developed in the past years in Irish should also be made available on it. No information was provided on other streaming platforms that could also be used for the promotion of regional or minority languages. The Committee of Experts asks the authorities to provide information on this issue in the next monitoring round.

55. According to the speakers, as a result of the Covid-19 pandemic, the BBC updated its media content available and teaching resources online. Representatives of Irish speakers showed discontent over the fact that no resources were provided for Irish medium education.

56. The 2021 Communications Act introduced in the Isle of Man brought a requirement to include a proportion of programmes in Manx Gaelic and mandatory consultation by the regulatory authority with Manx National Heritage and the public service broadcaster in including programmes in Manx Gaelic. In addition, to further support broadcasting in Manx Gaelic, in 2022 the Manx Gaelic Broadcasting Committee became a sub-committee of Culture Vannin,<sup>50</sup> thus offering the possibility to be more engaged in the promotion of Manx Gaelic language and culture.

---

<sup>47</sup> BBC, “[Charter and agreement](#)”.

<sup>48</sup> BBC, “Broadcasting. Copy of Royal Charter for the continuance of the British Broadcasting Corporation”, paras. 14.5 and 63.

<sup>49</sup> BBC, “[iPlayer](#)”.

<sup>50</sup> [Culture Vannin](#) is the trading name used for the Manx Heritage Foundation, which was established in 1982 to support and promote Manx culture, including language, through development, education and grants.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities***

57. There is a wide variety of cultural activities promoting regional or minority languages, usually organised by representatives of the regional or minority languages. Some of them also promote all Celtic languages, like the annual Lorient Interceltic music festival in Brittany (France).

58. The Committee of Experts was made aware of the fact that no dedicated funding exists for cultural activities promoting Cornish or the culture linked to it. Organisations are therefore required to compete for grants with other organisations promoting any other cultural events across England, without Cornish promotion being considered an added value for proposals.

59. Cultural activities promoting Irish take place through cultural centres, generally based in urban areas, and provide a variety of cultural activities, including music, dance, book clubs and book launches, poetry readings, and drama. In Scotland, Creative Scotland is the public body responsible for funding cultural activities across Scotland. In addition, the Fèis movement has a leading role in promoting music, culture and traditions, and Scottish Gaelic language acquisition through the arts. According to representatives of speakers, challenges have increased in recent years concerning funding for community-based cultural organisations and activities. In 2023, a new fund was launched by the Arts Council of Wales, *Llais y Lle* (the voice of place), supporting individuals to work with specific communities to promote the use of Welsh through creative and innovative ways.<sup>51</sup> Manx National Heritage adopted its Manx Language Policy and Plan in 2019, setting commitments for the first time to promote Manx Gaelic as part of the national cultural heritage.

### ***Use of regional or minority languages in economic and social life***

60. The use of regional or minority languages in economic and social life is uneven, but several initiatives have taken place to further promote them. In 2019, Brand Guidelines were put forward by the Cornwall Council to increase language visibility, which has led to the further promotion of Cornish. Visit Scotland has launched the Gaelic Tourism Strategy for Scotland 2024-2029, responding to an increasing interest in the Scottish Gaelic language in the tourism sector, as a unique selling point of the experience of visiting Scotland and setting ways to create experiences that celebrate Gaelic culture, heritage, and language.<sup>52</sup>

61. In addition, Police Scotland<sup>53</sup> and the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service<sup>54</sup> both launched Gaelic Language Plans for the periods 2021-2026 and 2023-2026, respectively, to contribute to the promotion and visibility of Scottish Gaelic. Measures in both plans include the availability of key strategic and other documents in Scottish Gaelic, and bilingual signage, including logos. In addition, these plans follow the key principles of mainstreaming language issues and active offer,<sup>55</sup> among others.

62. In June 2020, the Welsh Language Commissioner launched the scheme *Cynnig Cymraeg* (Welsh Offer) aiming to promote the use of Welsh in businesses and charities, with around 100 of them having their Welsh offer recognised.<sup>56</sup> In addition, the National Events Strategy for Wales 2022-2030 seeks to promote, among its main objectives, that all events that deliver economic benefits showcase a distinct “Welshness”, including through the promotion of the Welsh language.<sup>57</sup> Representatives of speakers raised concerns over the lack of adequate provision of Welsh in healthcare services, in particular, in the mental health sector, including in prisons. As reported by the Welsh Language Commissioner, Welsh language is not considered when deciding where prisoners are placed.<sup>58</sup> The Welsh Affairs Committee asked the UK

<sup>51</sup> Arts Council of Wales, “[Llais y Lle](#)”.

<sup>52</sup> Visit Scotland, “[Gaelic Tourism Strategy for Scotland launched](#)”, 20 February 2024.

<sup>53</sup> Police Scotland, “[Police Scotland’s Gaelic Language Plan](#)”.

<sup>54</sup> Scottish Fire and Rescue Service, “[Gaelic Language Plan 2023-2026](#)”.

<sup>55</sup> Active offer is a concept of proactively informing the public that communication in regional or minority languages is possible and welcome.

<sup>56</sup> Nation Cymru, “[Aldi achieves Welsh language certification](#)”.

<sup>57</sup> Welsh Government, “[The National Events Strategy for Wales 2022 to 2030](#)”, 30 June 2022.

<sup>58</sup> Welsh Language Commissioner, “[The Welsh language in prisons](#)”, May 2022.

government to assess the situation through accurate data collection in view to redress it.<sup>59</sup> Under the “More than just words” strategic framework for improving healthcare service provision in Welsh, a new five-year plan for 2022-2027 was launched by the Welsh government in the context of the post-Covid-19 pandemic.<sup>60</sup>

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges***

63. The British-Irish Council continues to provide the platform for exchanges across regional or minority languages in the British Isles. As part of the Cornwall Devolution Deal in late 2023, the Cornwall Council leader can now attend the meetings as an adviser to the central government representatives. The Committee of Experts welcomes this development. The Committee of Experts is aware of other on-going transfrontier activities; however, no other new relevant information was provided by the authorities.

---

<sup>59</sup> UK Parliament, “[Prison provision in Wales](#)”, fourth report of session 2017-2019, May 2019.

<sup>60</sup> Welsh Government, “[More than just words: Welsh language plan in health and social care](#)”, August 2022.

## 1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man

### Cornish – Part II language

64. There is no dedicated legislation to protect and promote **Cornish**. Nevertheless, some policies exist, such as the on-going Cornish Language Strategy 2015-2025, with its operational plans, the last one being for the period 2023-2024. In addition, in 2019 the Cornwall Council adopted a policy recognising the importance of Cornish as being central to Cornwall's cultural heritage as well as contemporary culture. Alongside the policy, a one-off 200,000 GBP<sup>61</sup> award was made in 2019 for the promotion of Cornish language and culture. An additional 500,000 GBP was granted to the Cornwall Council in 2024 as part of the Devolution Deal agreed in late 2023. According to the speakers, organisations representing Cornish were requested by the authorities to use the funding received in January 2024 before the end of March 2024, although the period was slightly extended. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers showed their discontent with this ad hoc approach, as they consider it is not sustainable and strategic enough to lead to adequate language protection and promotion. Lack of appropriate and sustainable funding acts as a barrier to the adequate development of Cornish as a modern language and to meet the demand for learning it.

65. The Cornish Language Office within the Cornwall Council is responsible for co-ordinating Cornish promotion activities, but these are often carried out by volunteer organisations and individuals. This includes development of teaching resources at all levels and language teaching itself. As of May 2023, 53 primary schools were registered under the programme "Go Cornish" promoting Cornish language learning,<sup>62</sup> but representatives of speakers highlighted that there is unmet demand. In secondary education, the Cornish language cannot be studied because it does not fit under any of the current categories available in the English National curriculum of either "modern foreign language" nor as an "ancient language".<sup>63</sup> Furthermore, there is no possibility to take Cornish as part of the General Certificate for Secondary Education (GCSE)<sup>64</sup> exams nor of the Advanced level qualification ones (A-levels).<sup>65</sup> In recent years, Cornwall Council introduced the accredited WJEC Entry Level Cornish assessment. Although initially developed to target secondary schools, at present it is only used for adult courses.<sup>66</sup> During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of speakers showed concerns over the lack of trained teachers for Cornish, which currently acts as a barrier to further promoting the language. Adult courses and conversational groups do exist but are mainly delivered by voluntary community groups, although the Institute of Cornish Studies at the University of Exeter delivers some beginner courses,<sup>67</sup> as well as research on the language and culture.<sup>68</sup>

66. The presence of the Cornish language in media is very limited, with only a 5-minute weekly news summary on BBC Radio Cornwall in Cornish.<sup>69</sup> Additional private programmes (TV and radio) do exist but are run and funded by volunteers.<sup>70</sup> The Committee of Experts was informed during the on-the-spot visit that four Cornish language films are available on the BBC online platform iPlayer, following the FyImK open

---

<sup>61</sup> GBP 1 is approximately EUR 1.16.

<sup>62</sup> United Kingdom's [Sixth periodical report presented to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in accordance with Article 15 of the Charter on European Regional and Minority Languages](#), 3 August 2023.

<sup>63</sup> UK Government, "[The National Curriculum](#)".

<sup>64</sup> The General Certificate for Secondary Education (GCSE) is used in Wales, Northern Ireland and also in the Isle of Man. In Scotland, the equivalent is the Scottish Qualification Certificate (SQC).

<sup>65</sup> Although Kesva an Taves Kernewek (the Cornish Language Board) delivers examinations in Cornish at all levels, including A-level, these are not nationally recognised.

<sup>66</sup> United Kingdom's [Sixth periodical report presented to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in accordance with Article 15 of the Charter on European Regional and Minority Languages](#), 3 August 2023.

<sup>67</sup> GoCornish, "[Find a class](#)".

<sup>68</sup> United Kingdom's [Sixth periodical report presented to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in accordance with Article 15 of the Charter on European Regional and Minority Languages](#), 3 August 2023. See also University of Exeter, "[Institute of Cornish Studies](#)".

<sup>69</sup> BBC Radio Cornwall, "[An Nowodhow, the news in Cornish](#)".

<sup>70</sup> Radyo an Gernewegva (online) and An Mis – is the half hour monthly Cornish Language TV and the only media services entirely in Cornish – via the privately run primarily by volunteer effort Radyo An Gernwegva, which hosts both TV and radio in Cornish. Radyo An Gernewegva. Available at: <https://anradyo.com/>.

competition for contemporary films. Nevertheless, speakers raised concerns over the small number of programmes devoted to Cornish culture, including language and sports.

67. Cornwall Council has included bilingual signage in its brand guidelines for site entrances, and bilingual signage is increasing in public buildings such as Kresen Kernow, Hall for Cornwall, Tintagel Castle and Camborne Town Council;<sup>71</sup> nevertheless, speakers raised concerns over their quality. Beyond this, the visibility of Cornish language remains low. The Committee of Experts was informed that Brexit has had a negative impact on accessing EU funds to organise youth exchanges in Brittany (France).

### **Irish – Part II and Part III language**

68. The use of **Irish** in public life remains a contentious and highly politicised topic in Northern Ireland. According to representatives of speakers, because of fear of controversy, authorities are reluctant to take steps forward in the promotion of Irish in many fields of public life. The Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act 2022 was passed by Westminster in the absence of a functioning Northern Ireland Assembly and Executive. This legislation is a step in the right direction for the promotion and protection of Irish in Northern Ireland, but the Irish Language Strategy has not yet been adopted, despite repeated commitments to do so.

69. In the past ten years, there has been a 57.8% increase in demand for Irish Medium Education (IME),<sup>72</sup> and according to speakers, it continues to rise. There are currently 7,310 pupils in IME across pre-school, primary and secondary.<sup>73</sup> However, IME is not available evenly across areas. Although more people are going through IME, there is an insufficient number of Irish-medium teachers across levels and no long-term plan to redress this problem.<sup>74</sup> There are courses available for non-speakers, and Queen's University Belfast and the University of Ulster offer undergraduate degrees in Irish, and produce academic research on the language on a regular basis.<sup>75</sup>

70. The Administration of Justice (Language) Act (Ireland) 1737, which does not allow the use of Irish in courts has not yet been repealed, despite the fact that the Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act 2022 provides for it. The 2022 Identity and Language Act does not provide for the production of important statutory texts in Irish. There are currently no main statutory texts in Irish at all.

71. Only five of the 11 Northern Ireland councils have language policies actively promoting the use of Irish in public life. These are Belfast City Council, Derry and Strabane District Council, Fermanagh and Omagh District Council, Mid Ulster District Council, and Newry, Mourne and Down District Council. Since 2022, Irish can be used in the Northern Ireland Assembly. The Department for Communities has established a translation hub where requests can be made for translation and proofreading of Irish by public bodies.<sup>76</sup> The use of traditional Irish place names remains contentious and highly politicised and there is an inconsistent approach to bilingual signage requests. Some councils continue to set high thresholds (of up to 50% of residents), which is incompatible with the Charter as ratified by the UK. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers highlighted the controversies around bilingual signage and also that at times, litigation has been used by local councils to block such signage.

72. Representatives of speakers highlighted the very limited availability of Irish media due to the lack of adequate provision by the UK. Irish language TV broadcasting is irregular and limited to occasional programmes through BBC Northern Ireland. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers pointed to the UK Media Bill<sup>77</sup> as an opportunity for redressing the current situation. Regarding radio offer in Irish, BBC Radio Ulster

<sup>71</sup> United Kingdom's [Sixth periodical report presented to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe in accordance with Article 15 of the Charter on European Regional and Minority Languages](#), 3 August 2023.

<sup>72</sup> Comhairle Na Gaelscolaíochta, "Annual Report and Accounts for the year ended 31 March 2023", 2023, p. 23.

<sup>73</sup> Northern Ireland Statistic and Research Agency, "Education Data Infographics 2022/2023: Irish Medium Education", 2023."

<sup>74</sup> Independent review of Education, "Investing in a Better Future: the Independent Review of Education in Northern Ireland – Volume 2", 2023, paras. 7.54 and 7.55.

<sup>75</sup> Queen's University Belfast, [Irish](#); University of Ulster, [Irish Language and Literature](#).

<sup>76</sup> Department for Communities, "[Hargey launches Translation Hub](#)", 19 April 2021.

<sup>77</sup> The Media Bill became the Media Act in May 2024.

continues to broadcast around five hours of radio programmes per week. The only 24-hour programme in Irish is offered by the community (private) *Raidió Fáilte*, which has a license to broadcast within a limited radius within Belfast, seriously restricting its outreach across Northern Ireland. There are no other private TV or radio broadcasts in Irish. Three pages in Irish are published three times a week on *The Irish News* newspaper, and some additional Irish language content is available through online media. Some initiatives exist to train Irish language journalists and are run by the Irish Language Media Broadcast on an annual basis.

73. According to the speakers, the Arts Council does not actively promote Irish and often the onus is put on artists using Irish to find funding for their art, especially for literature. In addition, accessibility of books in Irish remains problematic and the Northern Ireland libraries have a very limited number of books in Irish. Online availability of Irish books would greatly increase the visibility, the learning of, and literacy in Irish. Information received by the Committee of Experts points to most cultural activities being made available or funded mostly from the Republic of Ireland and to the lack of dedicated funding for Irish cultural initiatives in the UK.

### Scots – Part II language

74. **Scots** continues to enjoy a degree of commitment from the Scottish government but further resolute action to promote Scots is needed. A more structured policy and adequate funding especially in light of the increasing interest in Scots and the high number of people speaking the language (30% of the Scottish population) would allow for the language to develop further. Broadcasting in Scots is limited to some online short clips,<sup>78</sup> and a monthly private online radio programme.<sup>79</sup> The Scots Scriever post within the National Library of Scotland was extended and continues to develop creative work in Scots. Communication with the Scottish Government and Education Scotland can be done in Scots, but this is not based on a formal policy. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers highlighted that the use of Scots in public life is patchy. Some public signage in Scots exists, but speakers complain about its quality. Exchanges with other linguistic groups of the country seldom take place on a formal basis.

75. The Scots language can be learned from pre-school level to university; however, the possibility to do so is left to the discretion of teachers and individual schools, which leads to significant inconsistencies in provision. According to data provided by Education Scotland, there were 184 pupils learning Scots in primary education in 2022-2023, whereas only 5 pupils in secondary education were doing so. Educational materials are produced for all levels of education; in addition, in 2022, a new publisher was set up with public funding dedicated to the production and distribution of free Scots language books for schools and libraries. In 2019, the Open University launched an open course on “Scots language and culture”. The University of Glasgow, the University of Aberdeen and the University of Edinburgh are undertaking research into Scots. An in-service teacher programme for primary and secondary teachers was launched in 2024, with 120 registrations for its first edition. This would allow teachers to be qualified to use Scots also as a medium of instruction in their subjects. Education Scotland recommends having the history of Scots in its guidelines for schools on content to be taught, but discretion is left to schools as to whether it is taught.

76. Representatives of speakers emphasise how the existence of negative attitudes towards speakers of Scots and Scots as a language in public life seriously hamper its protection and promotion. In addition, questions relating to the language continue to be highly politicised. The cross-party group on Scots at the Scottish parliament, providing a platform for exchanges on issues relating to the promotion and protection of Scots, was reformed and now facilitates wider participation.

### Scottish Gaelic – Part II and Part III language

77. According to the 2022 census and information received by the Committee of Experts, the numbers and percentages of speakers of **Scottish Gaelic** in areas of the Highlands and Islands in which they are most concentrated at local level continue to decrease. On the other hand, numbers of speakers in other

<sup>78</sup> BBC Scotland, “[Stories in Scots](#)” and “[Rebel Tongue](#)”.

<sup>79</sup> [Scots Radio](#).

parts of Scotland, particularly in urban areas, continue to grow, although they represent very small percentages of the population in those areas. Gaelic-medium education is available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels in some areas of Scotland.<sup>80</sup> In primary and secondary education, the number of pupils continues to increase in both rural and urban areas. However, many pupils do not or cannot continue to study through the medium of Scottish Gaelic at secondary level, particularly after the second year, and this remains a significant challenge. Provision of Gaelic-medium education depends on policies of the local authorities but is also affected by availability of teachers. In addition, Scottish Gaelic can be studied as a subject at primary and secondary schools in certain council areas. Adult classes are also available, including through the recently developed *SpeakGaelic* multi-platform initiative launched in 2021 as well as through university courses in the language, which are available at graduate and postgraduate level. It is possible to gain a degree in Scottish Gaelic in four universities.<sup>81</sup> Research into Scottish Gaelic is done in different academic institutions and linguistic resources are well developed. The Additional Teaching Qualification for Gaelic as a Modern Language was piloted, as a follow up to the already existing Initial Teacher Education for Gaelic. Although some grant schemes and other initiatives exist to train new Gaelic teachers or to encourage the transition from English medium into Gaelic medium, retention and recruitment of teachers remains a problem. Education Scotland has developed several learning tools for different levels of education. During the on-the-spot visit, some speakers raised concerns over the fact that Education Scotland and His Majesty's Inspectors focus on educational attainment and not on practical communicative competence in Scottish Gaelic when assessing school performance. According to them, this provides an inaccurate picture on students' level of competence in Scottish Gaelic.

78. Local authorities also have discretion as to the teaching of the history and culture related to Scottish Gaelic and, in practice, such teaching is not always ensured. Scottish Gaelic language plans created by local authorities set the standards and the degree to which Scottish Gaelic is promoted at local level and, although many local authorities have plans, they differ greatly in content and some still do not have them. Members of the Scottish Parliament may use Scottish Gaelic in assemblies and members and witnesses appearing before committees can use the language in such committees with prior notification, but the use of Gaelic in local council meetings is not widely available.

79. MG Alba continues to deliver the Gaelic-language television channel *BBC Alba*. *BBC Radio nan Gàidheal* offers over 90 hours per week of programmes in Scottish Gaelic.<sup>82</sup> The high percentage of repeat programmes and the limited range of genres available on BBC Alba are significant problems. Speakers indicated that this would have negative implications for viewership, and they would benefit from an increase in new content and greater variety in Scottish Gaelic, including through private media. An increase in production of audiovisual works was seen in 2023 through the short film competition *FilmG* for schools and young people. A Culture Strategy for Scotland was launched in 2020, which includes language as part of its principles.

80. During the on-the-spot visit, speakers raised concerns over the uncertainty of funding for Scottish Gaelic development. Budgetary allocation to *Bòrd na Gàidhlig* and MG Alba has for many years not kept pace with inflation. This has had negative consequences in particular with regards to media. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities to address this situation and report in the next periodical report on measures taken.

### **Ulster Scots – Part II language**

81. No progress has been made in the protection and promotion of **Ulster Scots** since the previous monitoring cycle. Despite the introduction of the Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act 2022, no

<sup>80</sup> Gaelic-medium education in 2022-2023 is available in primary schools in 16 of 32 local authority areas: Angus, Edinburgh, Argyll & Bute, Western Isles, Highland, Glasgow, Inverclyde, Aberdeen City, Perth & Kinross, North Ayrshire, East Ayrshire, East Dunbartonshire, South Lanarkshire, North Lanarkshire, Renfrewshire, Stirling. In secondary schools, in 2022-2023 is available in 11 of 32 local authority areas, as follows: Edinburgh, Argyll & Bute, Western Isles, Highland, Glasgow, Perth & Kinross, East Ayrshire, East Dunbartonshire, South Lanarkshire, North Lanarkshire, Stirling.

<sup>81</sup> Universities of Aberdeen, Edinburgh, Glasgow, and the Highlands and Islands.

<sup>82</sup> Radio nan Gàidheal, "[Mu Radio nan Gàidheal](#)".

measures have been taken to promote Ulster Scots, beyond the setup of its language commissioner, although the commissioner has not yet been appointed. Language issues continue to be highly politicised.<sup>83</sup>

82. According to the representatives of the speakers, actions undertaken by the authorities follow a top-down approach and often without consultation with speaker communities on their needs and wishes. There is still no strategy for the language and therefore no coherent action to support language development. According to the speakers, presence of the language in the media is very weak, and the media focuses mainly on the promotion of culture, with some Ulster Scots language used. There are several cultural activities in schools and there are community-based initiatives to promote the culture and heritage linked to Ulster Scots, including dance and music. Three of the eleven Northern Ireland local councils have policies to promote Ulster Scots. In these three councils, written communication can be done through the medium of Ulster Scots. Ulster Scots is not taught in mainstream education and there are no trained teachers nor training possibilities. Limited teaching of the language is available through after school clubs. Although some resources are available for language taster workshops in primary schools,<sup>84</sup> the presence of Ulster Scots is largely limited to the promotion of its culture and cultural heritage.<sup>85</sup> There are several resources for adult learning, but no organised courses are available. Some research is done on Ulster Scots, for example at the University of Ulster in Belfast.

### Welsh – Part II and Part III language

83. Local authorities play a key role in the promotion of the **Welsh** language in public life, including through the promotion of Welsh-medium education. It is available at all levels of education to varying degrees from pre-school to university, depending on the county.<sup>86</sup> Although technical and vocational education in Welsh is available to some degree, representatives of the speakers highlighted that this sector remains challenging as the offer is very limited. The new plan “Choice for all” launched in 2020, seeks to redress this shortage in offer.<sup>87</sup> Welsh can be studied at several universities and some university courses are available through the medium of the language. There is some offer of undergraduate degrees in Welsh in several universities across Wales under the auspices of the *Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol* (Welsh National College). The National Centre for Learning Welsh provides a mix of online and in person Welsh language courses. Although teacher training in Welsh is available, speakers raised concerns in light of the increase in demand for Welsh-medium education and how a lack of increase in teachers might negatively impact access to it and therefore leave demand unmet. The 10-year “Welsh in education workforce plan” launched in 2022 seeks to address this issue.

84. The latest Welsh Language Scheme for 2023-2026 for His Majesty’s Courts and Tribunals Service sets forth ways in which the infrastructure supporting the use of Welsh in courts and tribunals is enhanced.<sup>88</sup> Many public bodies are subject to Welsh language standards and therefore are required to provide services in Welsh. Nevertheless, the current devolution system limits the powers of the Welsh Language Commissioner when assessing Welsh language standards and service provision by certain public authorities, as many Crown bodies fall outside its remit. All local councils are subject to Welsh language standards.

85. S4C broadcasts over 115 hours of programmes a week in Welsh,<sup>89</sup> and BBC Radio Cymru offers over 18 hours a day of general entertainment and factual programmes on radio in Welsh. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts learned that due to funding cuts, the number of repeat broadcasts on S4C reached 67.6% for 2020-2021 and continues to increase, therefore not providing enough varied media programmes through public TV and leading many speakers to rely on Welsh digital media, which

<sup>83</sup> See also Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, “[Fifth Opinion on the United Kingdom](#)”, para. 158.

<sup>84</sup> Discover Ulster-Scots, “[Primary Curriculum Resources](#)”.

<sup>85</sup> Discover Ulster-Scots, “[Education – School-based learning](#)”.

<sup>86</sup> For specific details on Welsh-medium education provision per county, see Welsh Government, “[Welsh in Education Strategic Plans 2022-2032](#)”.

<sup>87</sup> Qualifications Wales, “[Choice for All Strategy](#)”, January 2020.

<sup>88</sup> Gov.uk, “[Welsh language scheme](#)”, March 2023.

<sup>89</sup> S4C, “[Introducing S4C](#)”.



remains weak. In addition, representatives of speakers raised concerns over the fact that private radio stations have cut down on Welsh language provision since the previous monitoring round. An Expert Panel convened by the Welsh Government published a report in 2023 recommending further devolution of broadcasting in order to better meet the needs of Welsh speakers.

86. The National Events Strategy for Wales 2022-2030 seeks to mainstream the promotion of Welsh across cultural events. Around 100 business and charities are now part of the *Cynnig Cymraeg* scheme promoting the use of Welsh. According to the speakers, although several steps have been taken to improve the Welsh service provision in the healthcare sector, a large proportion of the workforce does not speak Welsh, which is particularly problematic in the elderly and mental health sector.

### **Manx Gaelic – Part II and Part III language**

87. Revitalisation of **Manx Gaelic** continues to enjoy political and public support in the Isle of Man. In December 2020, the authorities extended the application of the Charter under Part III to Manx Gaelic, therefore further emphasising this commitment to protect and promote the language. However, only limited legislation exists regarding Manx Gaelic, relating to education and broadcasting. There are three pre-school playgroups providing exposure to Manx Gaelic through music, stories, songs, etc. across the Isle of Man, which is raising the interest of families in Manx Gaelic. Nevertheless, there only exists one nursery using Manx Gaelic, since the other one closed down in 2022. All nurseries are private in the Isle of Man, so the costs need to be borne by the organisations running them, although parents are entitled to receive financial support from the government. There is unmet demand for Manx Gaelic nurseries, due to problems linked to logistics and capacity. The Bunscoil Ghaelgagh school in St John's/Balley Keeill Eoin continues to provide primary education (4-11 years-old) through the medium of Manx Gaelic, with a total of 54 pupils in 2022. The mainstream curriculum for English medium schools does not include teaching of Manx Gaelic between the ages of 4-7 (early primary level). There are non-governmental organisations promoting some exposure to Manx Gaelic in schools through arts and culture, but not through the teaching the language itself. As of the age of 7, schools have the possibility to offer Manx Gaelic as a subject for two school terms and at present, around 30 pupils do. However, since it is a voluntary subject, many students drop out in the second year, and most have done so by the time they reach secondary education. Manx Gaelic is offered at GCSE and A-level (16-18 years-old), but there is currently no offer beyond that. Some research exists on the language. It is either done at institutions outside of the Isle of Man or by independent scholars, with little or no public funding from sources in the Isle of Man. Culture Vannin organises nine weekly adult classes, as well as taster and intensive weekend courses, both online and in person. In 2023, Culture Vannin launched a Manx Gaelic Summer School which also attracted students from abroad and it is to become an annual event.<sup>90</sup> No specific targeted teacher training for teaching in or of Manx Gaelic exists at present.

88. As far as the official use of Manx Gaelic is concerned, the *Tynwald* (Parliament of the Isle of Man) reads out in public, in English and in Manx Gaelic, summaries of new laws at Tynwald Hill once per year, and some laws have been translated into Manx Gaelic. However, according to information received by the Committee of Experts, the main national statutory texts have not yet been translated into Manx Gaelic. There is no policy for the use of Manx Gaelic in public administration. There is a translation service available free of charge for those wishing to submit their documents in Manx Gaelic to the administration. Where there is a Manx Gaelic speaker in an office, it may be possible to use the language. However, there is no legal basis ensuring the right to submit documents in Manx Gaelic. Manx Gaelic is not considered a requirement or an asset for the recruitment of employees in the public administration, except for the position of Manx Language Officer. Although there is some bilingual public signage, including road signs and at heritage sites, there is no legislation on its use. Furthermore, according to speakers, the standard of Manx used in such signage is inconsistent, and they have raised concerns over the fact that the font in Manx Gaelic is often much smaller.

89. There are no newspapers or magazines in Manx Gaelic, and there is no longer a newspaper article published once a month as was the case in the previous monitoring round. Manx Radio continues to use

<sup>90</sup> Jeebin (Manx Language Network), "Manx Language Strategy. Year 1 Report. 2022-2032", p. 7.

some greetings and short phrases throughout the programme, and the one-hour weekly programme *Kiaull as Cooish* remains the only programme delivered entirely in Manx Gaelic. Other programmes, such as the 30-min *Shiaght Laa* aired around 26 times a year, which explores all aspects of Manx cultural life and the weekly 50-minute *Claare ny Gael*, which explores different themes are broadcast in both Manx Gaelic and English.<sup>91</sup> No dedicated training of journalists exists to promote the use of Manx Gaelic. Under the Manx Language Strategy 2022-2032, many resources for learners of all ages have been developed, alongside translations of books and manuscripts. Several cultural activities are organised every year to raise the visibility of the language across the Isle of Man, such as the *Cooish Festival*, as well as social media actions. In addition, a total of 31 grants were awarded amounting to 59,000 IMP<sup>92</sup> for the period 2022-2023 to promote cultural events linked to the language and culture.<sup>93</sup> Manx Gaelic is actively present in Gaelic-wide events, including academic conferences and music festivals. There is a statutory requirement for banks to accept cheques written in Manx Gaelic, but there are no other specific obligations on the private sector regarding Manx Gaelic.<sup>94</sup> Manx Gaelic is further promoted in the framework of trans-frontier co-operation through the Isle of Man's membership to the British-Irish Council, among other activities.

---

<sup>91</sup> Culture Vannin (2023), "Annual Review 2022-2023", pp. 14-17.

<sup>92</sup> Isle of Man Pound (IMP); 1 IMP is equivalent to 1 GBP.

<sup>93</sup> Culture Vannin (2023), "Annual Review 2022-2023", p. 10.

<sup>94</sup> Lewin, Christopher (2024), "Language Revitalization in the Isle of Man: policies and institutions".

## Chapter 2 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

### 2.1 Cornish

#### 2.1.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Cornish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Cornish <sup>95</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Cornish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Cornish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Cornish		↘			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Cornish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Cornish</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Cornish at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Cornish to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Cornish at universities or equivalent institutions		↗			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Cornish		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Cornish				↘	
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Cornish among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Cornish among their objectives</li> </ul>				=	
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Cornish</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Cornish</li> </ul>		=			

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

<sup>95</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### **Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle**

90. Ad hoc funding and a lack of adequate planning for the long-term development of Cornish as a modern language are hampering its development. Further resolute action is needed from the authorities and therefore the Committee of Experts considers **Article 7.1.c** partly fulfilled. Information received by the Committee of Experts shows research on Cornish is possible at the University of Exeter, and there are some courses for non-speakers offered there, so the Committee of Experts considers **Article 7.1.h** partly fulfilled. The Committee of Experts was informed that Cornish is not recognised as either a “modern foreign language” nor an “ancient language” in the education system, which acts as a barrier to its teaching. In light of this, the Article 7.2. not fulfilled.

### **2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Cornish in the United Kingdom**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom<sup>96</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendation for immediate action**

**a. Promote the use of Cornish at all levels of education and ensure the long-term survival of the language.**

#### **II. Further recommendations**

- b. Ensure systematic and foreseeable earmarked funding for the promotion of Cornish, to ensure the long-term planning for its adequate protection and promotion.
- c. Take steps to develop a teacher training programme for teachers of Cornish.
- d. Provide for the teaching of Cornish as a subject in secondary education as part of the national curriculum, so that schools are able to provide it as a subject.
- e. Increase the presence of Cornish in broadcast media.
- f. Ensure that the Media Act and the future revision of the BBC Royal Charter include the adequate promotion of regional or minority languages, including Cornish.
- g. Extend the grounds set out in the Equality Act so as to explicitly cover discrimination based on language.

<sup>96</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)1](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)2](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)1](#).

## 2.2 Irish

### 2.2.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Irish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Irish <sup>97</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Irish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Irish	↗				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Irish				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Irish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Irish</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Irish at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Irish to learn it		↗			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Irish at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Irish	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Irish		=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Irish among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Irish among their objectives</li> </ul>				↘	
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Irish</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Irish</li> </ul>		↗			
<b>Part III of the Charter</b> <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Irish or a substantial part of pre-school education in Irish at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Irish, a substantial part of primary education in Irish or teaching of Irish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Irish, a substantial part of secondary education in Irish or teaching of Irish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			

<sup>97</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Irish<sup>97</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Irish, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Irish or teaching of Irish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		↗			
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Irish or of facilities for the study of Irish as a university or higher education subject	↗				
8.1.fii	offer Irish as a subject of adult and continuing education		↗			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Irish		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Irish		=			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Irish is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Irish at all the appropriate stages of education					=
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.3	make available in Irish the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Irish				=	
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that users of Irish may submit oral or written applications in Irish to local branches of the national authorities		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Irish		=			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Irish to submit oral or written applications in Irish to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Irish in debates in their assemblies	↗				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Irish in debates in their assemblies		↗			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Irish		=			
10.3.c	allow users of Irish to submit a request in Irish to public service providers		=			
10.4.a	translation or interpretation		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Irish	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Irish		=			
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Irish on a regular basis		=			
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Irish					=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Irish				=	
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Irish				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Irish		↗			
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Irish</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Irish</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Irish</li> </ul>		=			
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Irish		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Irish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				✓	
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Irish				✓	
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Irish in providing facilities and planning cultural activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Irish <sup>97</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Irish		↗			
12.2	In territories other than those in which Irish is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Irish				↙	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Irish and the culture it reflects				=	
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Irish by means other than those specified in the above sub-paragraphs					=
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Irish is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Irish in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Irish, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Irish is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

91. The Newry, Mourne and Down Council, formed by the merger of two separate councils in 2015, is one of the five councils with a plan for the promotion of Irish and therefore **Article 7.1.b** is now fulfilled. There are some courses of Irish available for non-speakers in Belfast, but the Committee of Experts is not aware of courses outside the capital and therefore considers **Articles 7.1.g** and **8.1.fii** partly fulfilled. At the same time, Queen's University Belfast and the University of Ulster offer bachelor's degrees in Irish and produce research on the language and therefore **Article 7.1.h** is fulfilled. Language issues remain highly politicised in Northern Ireland and representatives of speakers raised concerns as to whether the new legislation, when implemented, will contribute to the promotion of mutual understanding between linguistic groups and lessen the tensions that surround language issues in Northern Ireland. In view of this, **Article 7.3** is not fulfilled. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was told that the needs and wishes of speakers are not always taken into account in decision-making processes regarding language policy, so **Article 7.4** is partly fulfilled. Some vocational education courses are available in Irish and therefore **Article 8.1.div** is partly fulfilled. Queen's University Belfast and University of Ulster offer courses in Irish and therefore **Article 8.1.eiii** is now fulfilled. The use of Irish is now possible in meetings of the Northern Ireland Assembly, so **Article 10.2.e** is fulfilled. Four out of the 11 local councils allow for the use of Irish in their meetings, so **Article 10.2.f** is partly fulfilled. The Committee of Experts was informed that the Irish Language Broadcast Fund undertakes training of Irish-speaking journalists; however, only part of the funding is from the authorities and training remains limited. In light of this, **Article 11.1.g** is now partly fulfilled. According to the speakers, the Arts Council does not promote Irish in any way and does not actively

have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Irish, hence **Articles 12.1.d** and **12.1.e** are not fulfilled. **Article 12.1.h** is partly fulfilled as the Northern Ireland administration developed a translation service for Irish for public bodies. Cultural activities using Irish are not regularly promoted outside Northern Ireland and **Article 12.2** is therefore not fulfilled.

## **2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Irish in the United Kingdom**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom<sup>98</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. Adopt the Irish Language Strategy and allocate the adequate resources to fund its implementation.**
- b. Implement fully the Identity and Language (Northern Ireland) Act 2022 without further delay.**
- c. Develop and implement a strategy for the recruitment of teachers in co-operation with speakers, including the training of teachers for children with special needs within the Irish medium education sector.**

### **II. Further recommendations**

- d. Extend the number of public authorities falling within the remit of the Language and Identity (Northern Ireland) Act 2022, so as to cover all main public services, including those not devolved to the Northern Ireland administration.
- e. Adopt a long-term planning for Irish-medium education at all appropriate levels with a view to adequately meeting the increasing demand for it.
- f. Translate into Irish and make publicly available the most important national and Northern Irish statutory texts.
- g. Ensure that local authorities remove prohibitive thresholds for setting up bilingual signage, and that Irish traditional and correct forms of place names are used.
- h. Ensure that the Media Act and the future revision of the BBC Royal Charter include the adequate promotion of regional or minority languages, including Irish.
- i. Extend the offer of public radio and television broadcasts in Irish.
- j. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Irish on a regular basis and extend the broadcast radius of Raidió Fáilte.
- k. Adopt and implement a strategy on cultural production and activities in Irish.
- l. Extend the grounds set out in the Equality Act so as to explicitly cover discrimination based on language.

<sup>98</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)1](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)2](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)1](#).



## 2.3 Scots

### 2.3.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scots

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scots <sup>99</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Scots as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Scots	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Scots		↘			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Scots, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Scots</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Scots at all appropriate stages		↗			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Scots to learn it		↗			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Scots at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Scots					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Scots					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scots among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scots among their objectives</li> </ul>		↗			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Scots</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Scots</li> </ul>		↗			

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

<sup>99</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

92. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was made aware of an increased interest in and awareness of Scots across Scotland. The 2022 census shows a high proportion of Scotland's population speaking Scots (30%). In this context, further resolute action is required to promote the language, as there is inadequate funding and no structured strategy exists, and therefore **Article 7.1.c** is partly fulfilled. In addition, there has been an increase in provision of Scots in education, including for adults and through university courses, so **Articles 7.1.f** and **g** are now considered partly fulfilled. Academic research on Scots is carried out at several universities so **Article 7.1.h** is now considered fulfilled. The Committee of Experts was informed, that despite useful interventions by political leaders, further strategic and systematic efforts are required to protect Scots speakers from intolerance, especially in media and education. Therefore **Article 7.3** is considered partly fulfilled. The needs and wishes of speakers are taken into consideration by the authorities when putting forward legislation to further promote Scots, such as the Scottish Languages Bill, and for setting priorities for language promotion, including the education sector. There are various bodies that represent the interests of speakers and a cross-party group on Scots at the Scottish Parliament, but there is no structured platform for exchanges, which is why **Article 7.4** is considered partly fulfilled.

### **2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scots in the United Kingdom**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom<sup>100</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendation for immediate action**

<b>a. Develop an adequately funded strategy for the promotion of Scots in education, media and public life.</b>
---

#### **II. Further recommendations**

- b. Take appropriate measures to counter prejudice and intolerance in relation to Scots and its speakers.
- c. Raise awareness among parents of the value and benefits for children of learning Scots and the possibility of studying Scots at all appropriate stages of education.
- d. Encourage the use of Scots in media to give visibility to and raise the prestige of the language as a language of daily communication.
- e. Ensure that the Media Act and the future revision of the BBC Royal Charter include the adequate promotion of regional or minority languages, including Scots.
- f. Extend the grounds set out in the Equality Act so as to explicitly cover discrimination based on language.

---

<sup>100</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)1](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)2](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)1](#).

## 2.4 Scottish Gaelic

### 2.4.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scottish Gaelic <sup>101</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Scottish Gaelic as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Scottish Gaelic, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life	=				
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Scottish Gaelic</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Scottish Gaelic at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Scottish Gaelic to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Scottish Gaelic at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Scottish Gaelic	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scottish Gaelic among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Scottish Gaelic among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Scottish Gaelic</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Scottish Gaelic</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Scottish Gaelic		=			
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Scottish Gaelic		=			
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Scottish Gaelic		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Scottish Gaelic, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Scottish Gaelic or teaching of Scottish Gaelic as an		=			

<sup>101</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scottish Gaelic<sup>101</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
	integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient					
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Scottish Gaelic or of facilities for the study of Scottish Gaelic as a university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Scottish Gaelic as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Scottish Gaelic				=	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Scottish Gaelic		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Scottish Gaelic and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		✓			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Scottish Gaelic is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Scottish Gaelic at all the appropriate stages of education		=			
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Scottish Gaelic in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Scottish Gaelic		=			
10.2.a	use of Scottish Gaelic within the framework of the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Scottish Gaelic to submit oral or written applications in Scottish Gaelic to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Scottish Gaelic		=			
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Scottish Gaelic in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Scottish Gaelic in debates in their assemblies		=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Scottish Gaelic	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Scottish Gaelic	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.a.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Scottish Gaelic on a regular basis		↗			
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Scottish Gaelic on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Scottish Gaelic		=			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Scottish Gaelic	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Scottish Gaelic</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Scottish Gaelic</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Scottish Gaelic</li> </ul>					= 102
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Scottish Gaelic	=				

<sup>102</sup> not applicable

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Scottish Gaelic<sup>101</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Scottish Gaelic language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Scottish Gaelic in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Scottish Gaelic is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Scottish Gaelic	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Scottish Gaelic and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Scottish Gaelic in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Scottish Gaelic in connection with economic or social activities	=				
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Scottish Gaelic is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Scottish Gaelic in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Scottish Gaelic, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Scottish Gaelic is used in identical or similar form	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

93. His Majesty's Inspectors, alongside Education Scotland, supervise the quality of Gaelic-medium schools, although the focus is on school attainment, rather than the progress in Scottish Gaelic competence. Exam results, which provide some indication, are compiled by the Scottish Qualifications Authority. However, some representatives of speakers feel that greater attention should be paid to actual communicative competence; **Article 8.1.i** is therefore considered partly fulfilled. Some Scottish Gaelic programmes are available on local radio stations and therefore **Article 11.1.bii** is now partly fulfilled.

## 2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Scottish Gaelic in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom<sup>103</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. Continue to take measures to ensure continuity of Scottish Gaelic-medium education throughout pre-school, primary and secondary education across Scotland.**
- b. Take further measures to ensure recruitment and retention of Scottish Gaelic teachers.**

### II. Further recommendations

- c. Take measures to regularly monitor the progress achieved in pupil’s communicative competence in Scottish Gaelic.
- d. Develop and introduce a distinct curriculum appropriate for Gaelic-medium education, instead of a translation of the English curriculum.
- e. Further promote the use of Scottish Gaelic across local authorities to increase its use in public life.
- f. Ensure that the Media Act and the future revision of the BBC Royal Charter include the adequate promotion of regional or minority languages, including Scottish Gaelic.
- g. Extend the grounds set out in the Equality Act so as to explicitly cover discrimination based on language.

---

<sup>103</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)1](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)2](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)1](#).

## 2.5 Ulster Scots

### 2.5.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Ulster Scots <sup>104</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Ulster Scots as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ulster Scots					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ulster Scots				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ulster Scots, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Ulster Scots</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ulster Scots at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ulster Scots to learn it				↘	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ulster Scots at universities or equivalent institutions		↗			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ulster Scots					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ulster Scots					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ulster Scots among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ulster Scots among their objectives</li> </ul>				↘	
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ulster Scots</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ulster Scots</li> </ul>		↘			

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

<sup>104</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).



**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

94. Due to a lack of information in the state periodical report on the situation of Ulster Scots, the Committee of Experts was unfortunately not able to conclude on some undertakings. **Article 7.1.g** is not fulfilled as there are no facilities to learn the language for non-speakers. **Article 7.1.h** is partly fulfilled, as some research is done on Ulster Scots. **Article 7.3** is considered not fulfilled in light of the existing politicisation of the language, which is not conducive to mutual understanding across linguistic groups. The Committee of Experts was informed that the needs and wishes of speakers are not always taken into account when taking measures to promote the language and therefore **Article 7.4** is now considered partly fulfilled.

### 2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ulster Scots in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom<sup>105</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendation for immediate action

**a. Adopt a language strategy to promote Ulster Scots in education, media and other areas of public life.**

#### II. Further recommendations

- b. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Ulster Scots at all appropriate stages.
- c. Promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups in Northern Ireland.
- d. Ensure that the Media Act and the future revision of the BBC Royal Charter include the adequate promotion of regional or minority languages, including Ulster Scots.
- e. Extend the grounds set out in the Equality Act so as to explicitly cover discrimination based on language.

<sup>105</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)1](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)2](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)1](#).

## 2.6 Welsh

### 2.6.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Welsh

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Welsh<sup>106</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Welsh as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Welsh	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Welsh	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Welsh, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life	=				
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Welsh</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Welsh at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Welsh to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Welsh at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Welsh	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Welsh	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Welsh among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Welsh among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Welsh</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Welsh</li> </ul>	=				
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b><i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i></b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Welsh	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Welsh		=			
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Welsh		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Welsh, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Welsh or teaching of Welsh as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Welsh or of facilities for the study of Welsh as a university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Welsh as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				

<sup>106</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Welsh<sup>106</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Welsh	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Welsh	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Welsh and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	=				
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Welsh in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Welsh, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Welsh in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Welsh in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.c.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Welsh in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Welsh in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Welsh and the related use of documents and evidence in Welsh, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.b	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Welsh, and provide that they can be invoked against third parties who are not users of Welsh	=				
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Welsh		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Welsh or in bilingual versions	=				
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Welsh	=				
10.2.a	use of Welsh within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Welsh to submit oral or written applications in Welsh to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Welsh	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Welsh	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Welsh in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Welsh in debates in their assemblies	↗				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Welsh	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Welsh is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.4.a	translation or interpretation	=				
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Welsh	=				
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Welsh	=				
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Welsh	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Welsh	=				

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Welsh<sup>106</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Welsh	=				
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Welsh	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Welsh</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Welsh</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Welsh</li> </ul>					= <sup>107</sup>
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Welsh are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Welsh	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Welsh by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Welsh to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Welsh language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Welsh	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Welsh in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Welsh	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Welsh	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Welsh is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Welsh	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Welsh and the culture it reflects	=				
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Welsh in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Welsh in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Welsh in economic and social life	=				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Welsh		✓			
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Welsh	=				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

<sup>107</sup> Not applicable.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

## Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

95. Welsh language standards require that local authorities must ensure simultaneous interpretation in their meetings open to the public, and therefore **Article 10.2.f** is fulfilled. According to information received by the Committee of Experts, Welsh language service provision in healthcare facilities, and in particular, mental healthcare, as well as elderly care homes is limited. In light of this, **Article 13.2.c** is considered partly fulfilled.

### 2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Welsh in the United Kingdom

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom<sup>108</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### I. Recommendation for immediate action

a. **Ensure the long-term adequate training and recruitment of teachers, with a view to ensuring that the demand for Welsh-medium education is met.**

#### II. Further recommendations

- b. Take further steps to promote the use of Welsh in healthcare service provision, including mental health, and elderly care homes.
- c. Ensure that the Media Act and the future revision of the BBC Royal Charter include the adequate promotion of regional or minority languages, including Welsh.
- d. Extend the grounds set out in the Equality Act so as to explicitly cover discrimination based on language.

<sup>108</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)1](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)2](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)1](#).

## 2.7 Manx Gaelic

### 2.7.1 Compliance of the United Kingdom with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change  
x first evaluation

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Manx Gaelic<sup>109</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>						
<b>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</b>						
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>						
7.1.a	recognition of Manx Gaelic as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Manx Gaelic	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Manx Gaelic	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Manx Gaelic, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Manx Gaelic</li> <li>• establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups</li> </ul>	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Manx Gaelic at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Manx Gaelic to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Manx Gaelic at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Manx Gaelic	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Manx Gaelic	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country</li> <li>• promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Manx Gaelic among the objectives of education and training</li> <li>• encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Manx Gaelic among their objectives</li> </ul>	=				
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Manx Gaelic</li> <li>• establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Manx Gaelic</li> </ul>		↘			
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>						
<b>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</b>						
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>						
8.1.aiv	favour and/or encourage the provision of pre-school education in Manx Gaelic or a substantial part of pre-school education in Manx Gaelic		x			
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Manx Gaelic		x			
8.1.ciii	provide, within secondary education, for the teaching of Manx Gaelic as an integral part of the curriculum		x			

<sup>109</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

<b>The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:</b>						
<b>Article</b>	<b>Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Manx Gaelic<sup>109</sup></b>	<b>fulfilled</b>	<b>partly fulfilled</b>	<b>formally fulfilled</b>	<b>not fulfilled</b>	<b>no conclusion</b>
8.1.fii	offer Manx Gaelic as a subject of adult and continuing education	x				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Manx Gaelic		x			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Manx Gaelic				x	
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Manx Gaelic and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				x	
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>						
9.3	make available in Manx Gaelic the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Manx Gaelic				x	
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>						
10.1.av	ensure that users of Manx Gaelic may validly submit a document in Manx Gaelic to local branches of the national authorities				x	
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Manx Gaelic	x				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Manx Gaelic to submit oral or written applications in Manx Gaelic to the regional or local authority			x		
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Manx Gaelic		x			
10.4.a	provide translation or interpretation		x			
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Manx Gaelic				x	
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Manx Gaelic to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					x
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>						
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Manx Gaelic		x <sup>110</sup>		x <sup>111</sup>	
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Manx Gaelic on a regular basis	x				
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Manx Gaelic on a regular basis				x	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Manx Gaelic		x			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Manx Gaelic				x	
11.1.fi	cover the additional costs of those media which use Manx Gaelic					x
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Manx Gaelic				x	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Manx Gaelic</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Manx Gaelic</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Manx Gaelic</li> </ul>					x
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Manx Gaelic are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	x				
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Manx Gaelic	x				
12.1.c	foster access in Manx Gaelic to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	x				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Manx Gaelic language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	x				

<sup>110</sup> As far as public radio programmes is concerned.

<sup>111</sup> As far as public TV programmes is concerned.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of the United Kingdom concerning Manx Gaelic <sup>109</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Manx Gaelic in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	x				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Manx Gaelic	x				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Manx Gaelic		x			
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Manx Gaelic and the culture it reflects					x
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>						
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Manx Gaelic in connection with economic or social activities					x
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Manx Gaelic in economic and social life				x	
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Manx Gaelic in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents		x			
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Manx Gaelic in economic and social life					x
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Manx Gaelic is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Manx Gaelic in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	x				

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle (first evaluation of Part III)

96. Manx Gaelic was previously assessed under Part II only and therefore this section only features changes to Part II undertakings as Part III undertakings consist of new assessments. Although the authorities are dedicated to the promotion of Manx Gaelic, there is no structural platform for exchanges with speakers of Manx Gaelic on their needs and wishes; therefore **Article 7.4** is now considered partly fulfilled.



## 2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Manx Gaelic in the Isle of Man

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of the United Kingdom to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which the United Kingdom has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in the United Kingdom<sup>112</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. Extend the use of Manx Gaelic in pre-school and primary education.**
- b. Establish a teacher training programme to ensure the long-term availability of teachers to guarantee Manx Gaelic education.**

### II. Further recommendations

- c. Develop measurable indicators for the Manx Gaelic 2022-2032 strategy to ensure progress can be adequately assessed and actions modified accordingly, and ensure allocated funding to implement its actions.
- d. Set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress of Manx Gaelic education.
- e. Promote study of and research on Manx Gaelic in universities or equivalent institutions.
- f. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Manx Gaelic.
- g. Make provisions to facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Manx Gaelic.
- h. Take measures to encourage the publication of newspaper articles in Manx Gaelic.
- i. Support the training of Manx Gaelic journalists in order to ensure long-term media availability in the language.
- j. Put forward measures to facilitate and/or encourage the use of Manx Gaelic in economic and social life.

<sup>112</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)1](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)2](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)1](#).

### **Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe**

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the authorities of the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man have undertaken to protect their regional or minority languages, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to the United Kingdom.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Bearing in mind the instrument of ratification deposited by the United Kingdom on 27 March 2001;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by the United Kingdom in its sixth periodical report, supplementary information given by the authorities of the United Kingdom, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in the United Kingdom and the Isle of Man and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit,

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the authorities of the United Kingdom on the content of the Committee of Experts' report;

Recommends that the authorities of the United Kingdom take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. adopt language strategies for Irish and Ulster Scots without further delay;
2. take measures to strengthen the teaching and long-term recruitment of teachers for all regional or minority languages;
3. take measures to promote tolerance towards speakers and awareness of regional or minority languages to promote mutual understanding in society as a whole;
4. take measures to enhance support for minority language broadcasting and ensure an appropriate regulatory framework to guarantee its sustainability.

The Committee of Ministers invites the authorities of the United Kingdom to submit the information on the recommendations for immediate action by 1 January 2026 and the next periodic report by 1 July 2028.<sup>113</sup>

---

<sup>113</sup> See Committee of Ministers' Decisions [CM/Del/Dec\(2018\)1330/10.4e - CM-Public](#), and "Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties", [CM\(2019\)69 final](#).

## Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification



United Kingdom

**Declaration contained in Note verbale from the Permanent Representation of the United Kingdom, dated 23 December 2020, registered at the Secretariat General on 23 December 2020 – Or. Engl.**

With reference to Part III of the Charter, the Government of the United Kingdom declares in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, and Article 3, paragraph 1, of the Charter that it will apply the following provisions for the purposes of Part III of the Charter to the Manx Gaelic language, in respect of the territory of the Isle of Man for the international relations of which the United Kingdom is responsible:

### **Manx Gaelic language, in respect of the territory of the Isle of Man – 37 paragraphs**

#### Article 8: Education

Paragraphs 1a(iv); 1b(i); 1c(iii); 1f(ii); 1g; 1h; 1i.

Total: 7

#### Article 9: Judicial authorities

Paragraph 3.

Total: 1

#### Article 10: Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraphs 1a(v); 1c; 2b; 2g; 4a; 4b; 4c.

Total: 7

#### Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1a(iii); 1b(ii); 1c(ii); 1d; 1e(ii); 1f(i); 1g; 2; 3.

Total: 9

#### Article 12: Cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 1a; 1c; 1d; 1e; 1f; 1g; 1h; 3.

Total: 8

#### Article 13: Economic and social life

Paragraphs 1c; 1d; 2a; 2b.

Total: 4

#### Article 14: Transfrontier exchanges

Paragraph a.

Total: 1

**Period covered: 23/12/2020**

Articles concerned: 2 3

**Declaration contained in a letter from the Permanent Representative of the United Kingdom, dated 22 April 2003 and registered at the Secretariat General on 23 April 2003 - Or. Engl.**

The Government of the United Kingdom declares that the Charter should extend to the Isle of Man, being a territory for whose international relations the Government of the United Kingdom is responsible.

**Period covered: 23/04/2003**

Articles concerned: 1

**Declaration contained in a letter from the Permanent Representative of the United Kingdom, dated 22 April 2003 and registered at the Secretariat General on 23 April 2003 - Or. Engl.**

As a consequence of the extension of the Charter to the Isle of Man, the Manx Gaelic language will be a “regional or minority language” for the purposes of the Charter and accordingly Part II of the Charter will henceforth apply to the Manx Gaelic language.

**Period covered: 23/04/2003**

Articles concerned: 2

**Declaration contained in a letter from the Permanent Representative of the United Kingdom, dated 11 March 2003, registered at the Secretariat General on 18 March 2003 - Or. Engl.**

The United Kingdom declares, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 1, of the Charter that it recognises that Cornish meets the Charter’s definition of a regional or minority language for the purposes of Part II of the Charter.

**Period covered: 18/03/2003**

Articles concerned: 2

**Declaration contained in a Note Verbale from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office of the United Kingdom, handed at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification on 27 March 2001 - Or. Engl.**

The United Kingdom declares that the Charter applies to mainland Britain and Northern Ireland.

**Period covered: 01/07/2001**

Articles concerned: 1

**Declaration contained in a Note Verbale from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office of the United Kingdom, handed at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification on 27 March 2001 - Or. Engl.**

a) The United Kingdom declares, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2 and Article 3, paragraph 1, of the Charter that it will apply the following provisions for the purposes of Part III of the Charter to Welsh, Scottish-Gaelic and Irish.

**Welsh – 52 paragraphs.**

Article 8: Education

Paragraphs 1a(i); 1b(i); 1c(i); 1d(iv); 1e(iii); 1f(ii); 1g; 1h; 1i.

Total: 9

Article 9: Judicial authorities

Paragraphs 1a(ii); 1a(iii); 1b(ii); 1b(iii); 1c(ii); 1c(iii); 1d; 2b.

Total: 8

Article 10: Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraphs 1a(i); 1b; 1c; 2a; 2b; 2c; 2d; 2e; 2f; 2g; 3a; 4a; 4b; 5.

Total: 14

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1a(i); 1d; 1e(i); 1f(ii); 2; 3.

Total: 6

Article 12: Cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 1a; 1b; 1c; 1d; 1e; 1f; 1g; 1h; 2; 3.

Total: 10

Article 13: Economic and social life

Paragraphs 1a; 1c; 2b; 2c; 2e.

Total: 5

**Scottish-Gaelic – 39 paragraphs**

Article 8: Education

Paragraphs 1a(i); 1b(i); 1c(i); 1d(iv); 1e(iii); 1f(iii); 1g; 1h; 1i; 2.

Total: 10

Article 9: Judicial authorities

Paragraph 1b(iii).

Total: 1

Article 10: Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraphs 1c; 2a; 2b; 2d; 2e; 2f; 2g; 5.

Total: 8

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1a(ii); 1b(ii); 1c(ii); 1d; 1e(ii); 1f(ii); 1g; 2.

Total: 8

Article 12: Cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 1a; 1d; 1e; 1f; 1g; 1h; 2; 3.

Total: 8

Article 13: Economic and social life

Paragraphs 1a; 1c.

Total: 2

Article 14: Transfrontier exchanges

Paragraphs a; b.

Total: 2

**Irish – 30 paragraphs relating to matters which are the responsibility of the devolved administration in Northern Ireland**Article 8: Education

Paragraphs 1a(iii); 1b(iv); 1c(iv); 1d(iv); 1e(iii); 1f(ii); 1g; 1h.

Total: 8

Article 9: Judicial authorities

Paragraph 3.

Total: 1

Article 10: Administrative authorities and public services

Paragraphs 1a(iv); 1c; 2b; 2e; 2f; 2g; 3c; 4a; 5.

Total: 9

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1d; 1e(i); 1f(ii); 1g.

Total: 4

Article 12: Cultural activities and facilities

Paragraphs 1a; 1d; 1e; 1f; 1h; 2; 3.

Total: 7

Article 13: Economic and social life

Paragraph 1d.

Total: 1

**Irish – 6 paragraphs relating to matters which are the responsibility of the UK government in Northern Ireland**Article 8: Education

Paragraph 2.

Total: 1

Article 11: Media

Paragraphs 1a(iii); 1b(ii); 2.

Total: 3

Article 14: Transfrontier exchanges

Paragraphs a; b.

Total: 2

**(Total of 36 paragraphs overall)**

b) The United Kingdom declares, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 1 of the Charter that it recognises that Scots and Ulster Scots meet the Charter's definition of a regional or minority language for the purposes of Part II of the Charter.

**Period covered: 01/07/2001**

Articles concerned: 2 3

## Appendix II: Comments from the United Kingdom authorities

### Cornwall Council

A few points below for factual correction or clearer phrasing. The comment for para 63 may be seen as going beyond just factual correction but in the view of Cornwall Council is an oversight.

- **Para 14** refers to Cornwall County Council. All references should be to Cornwall Council – the legal title of the unitary authority since 2009.
- **Para 58**, last line states: “...without Cornish being considered an added value for proposals.” Suggest rewording for clarification: Organisations are therefore required to compete for grants with other organisations promoting any other cultural events across England, without promotion of Cornish language being considered as being of value in the assessment of proposals.
- **Para 60** – Brand Guidelines were put forward – change to Brand Guidelines were adopted
- **Para 63** - The Committee of Experts welcomes this development. Add to end of sentence, “but notes that Cornish remains the only language of the British Isles without direct representation at the British Irish Council”.

### Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government

#### British-Irish Council

Text states:

- **Para 63** – *The British-Irish Council continues to provide the platform for exchanges across regional or minority languages in the British Isles. As part of the Cornwall Devolution Deal in late 2023, the Cornwall Council leader can now attend the meetings as an adviser to the central government representatives. The Committee of Experts welcomes this development. The Committee of Experts is aware of other on-going transfrontier activities; however, no other new relevant information was provided by the authorities.*

This is not really correct as the agreement only relates to attendance at the Indigenous, Minority and Lesser-Used Languages work sector of the BIC. Suggested amend below which reflects the language used in the [Cornwall devo deal](#). The MOU has not yet been signed (v near to) so suggest still note MOU in line.

63. *The British-Irish Council continues to provide the platform for exchanges across regional or minority languages in the British Isles. As part of the Cornwall Devolution Deal in late 2023, **the government will agree a memorandum of understanding with Cornwall Council on the attendance of the Council leader or an appropriate deputy at meetings of the languages work sector, as an adviser to the government on matters pertaining to the Cornish language.** The Committee of Experts welcomes this development. The Committee of Experts is aware of other on-going transfrontier activities; however, no other new relevant information was provided by the authorities.*

### Northern Ireland Executive



Suggested change:

***Although the Northern Ireland Assembly had been suspended since May 2022....***

- **Page 31 para 91** – states that the Committee of Experts is not aware of Irish courses outside the capital. this is not correct, there are numerous courses outside of Belfast. Courses take place throughout Northern Ireland. Conradh na Gaeilge are an Irish language organisation and are responsible for running numerous Irish classes. Please see link below. The counties of interest for COMEX are Antrim, Armagh, Derry, Down and Tyrone.

### **Scottish Government**

- **Page 5, Para 4**, ‘Scots can also be studied as a subject up to higher level (advanced secondary level).’

Suggest: ‘There is presently no higher level in Scots language. Scots can be studied within Higher English, as well as other subject areas. There are two SQA Awards (Scottish Studies and Scots Language) which are studied within the Senior Phase of Scottish Education and these Awards are increasing in popularity every year since being made available.’

- **Page 14, Para, 40.** One small addition in red,

‘In Scotland, an in-service teacher professional learner programme for Scots targeting primary and secondary teachers was launched in 2024, with 120 registrations for its first edition, **funded by the Scottish Government**. This course helps support teachers wishing to teach through the medium of Scots. According to speakers, the high demand for this training points to a shift in mindset towards Scots and an increasing interest by pupils, students, and parents for Scots language learning. The Committee of Experts welcomes this development, given the high number of Scots speakers as shown by the latest census, and in the context of first language acquisition and the role this can have on literacy skills of pupils, especially at primary school level. In light of this, it looks forward to receiving further information on the outcomes of the programme and whether it becomes systematised in the next monitoring round.’

- **Page 16, para 47**, one small addition in red, ‘Scots speakers showed concern over the number of anglicised names of places and highlighted that some work is being done **by the Scots Language Centre**, in co-operation with the Open University to find consensus over the versions of names.’
- **Page 22, para 74**, ‘Broadcasting in Scots is limited to some online short clips, and a monthly private online radio programme.’

Suggest: ‘Broadcasting in Scots is limited, and the speaking community would like to see this increased’.

- **Page 22, para 74**, ‘Communication with the Scottish Government and Education Scotland can be done in Scots, but this is not based on a formal policy.’

Suggest the sentence above is replaced with, ‘Communication with the Scottish Government and Education Scotland can be done in Scots, and this is supported by the 2015 Scots language policy, [Scots language policy: English version - gov.scot \(www.gov.scot\)](http://www.gov.scot)

- **Page 22, para 75**, 'According to data provided by Education Scotland, there were 184 pupils learning Scots in primary education in 2022-2023, whereas only 5 pupils in secondary education were doing so.'

This needs to be amended. Suggest: 'According to data provided by Education Scotland, in 2022-23 there were 184 primary schools where pupils were learning Scots and 5 secondary schools. These were both part of the 1+2 language learning programme. At secondary level there is an increasing number of schools which also offer Scottish Studies and Scots Language Awards.'

- **Page 22, para 75**, 'An in-service teacher programme for primary and secondary teachers was launched in 2024, with 120 registrations for its first edition. This would allow teachers to be qualified to use Scots also as a medium of instruction in their subjects.'

Suggest,

'An in-service teacher programme for primary and secondary teachers was launched in 2024, with 120 registrations for its first edition. This course was developed and is delivered in partnership between the Open University and Education Scotland. It is for teachers to develop their use in Scots and knowledge of Scots for use in the classroom.'

- **Page 22, para 75**, 'Education Scotland recommends having the history of Scots in its guidelines for schools on content to be taught, but discretion is left to schools as to whether it is taught.'

Could this sentence be removed as it is not accurate. Education Scotland, however, does 'recommend that schools consider the role of Scots language in their settings and evaluate the extent to which the language should be used based on teacher judgement and the needs of the learners.'

- **Page 23, para 79**, small amendment in red, 'The high percentage of repeat programmes and the **limited funding** available on BBC ALBA are significant problems.'

### Welsh Government

- **Para 21** of the Report of the Committee of Experts, on the 9th line, "1.2%" should read "1.2 percentage points" to represent the decrease between 19.0% in 2011 and 17.8% in 2021.
- **Penultimate line**, "883,300" should read "884,000" and in the final line, "29.1%" should read "29.2%". This reflects the revisions to the data since it was originally published by the Office for National Statistics.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages is an independent body that evaluates the compliance of the States Parties with their undertakings and, where appropriate, encourages them to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on 25 June 1992 and entered into force on 1 March 1998, is the European convention for the protection and promotion of regional and minority languages. It is designed to enable speakers to use them both in private and public life and obliges the States Parties to actively promote the use of these languages in education, courts, administration, media, culture, economic and social life, and cross- border co-operation.

Regional or minority languages are part of Europe's cultural heritage and their protection and promotion contribute to the building of a Europe based on democracy and cultural diversity.

The text of the Charter is available in over 50 languages.

[www.coe.int/minlang](http://www.coe.int/minlang)

**www.coe.int**

The Council of Europe is the continent's leading human rights organisation. It comprises 46 member states, including all members of the European Union. All Council of Europe member states have signed up to the European Convention on Human Rights, a treaty designed to protect human rights, democracy and the rule of law. The European Court of Human Rights oversees the implementation of the Convention in the member states.