



1295th meeting, 27 September 2017

10 Legal questions

10.4 European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

b. Third report of the Committee of Experts in respect of Ukraine

Item to be considered by the GR-J at its meeting on 14 September 2017

In accordance with Article 16 paragraph 3 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages submits its third report on the application of the Charter in Ukraine to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe. The report contains proposals for recommendations to be addressed by the Committee of Ministers to Ukraine. The Ukrainian Government has been given the opportunity to comment on the content, in accordance with Article 16 paragraph 3 of the Charter.

¹ This document has been classified restricted at the date of issue. In accordance with the Deputies' decision (CM/Del/Dec(2001)765/10.4), it will be declassified after examination by the Committee of Ministers.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving their legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the State and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the State in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the State in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the State concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective State Party for possible comments within a given deadline. Subsequently, the evaluation report is submitted to the Committee of Ministers, together with suggestions for recommendations that, once adopted by the latter, will be addressed to the State Party. The full report also contains the comments which the authorities of the State Party may have made.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	5
Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Ukraine – Recent developments and trends	6
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Ukraine	6
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Ukraine	11
Chapter 2 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations	15
2.1 Belarusian	15
2.1.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Belarusian	15
2.1.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Belarusian in Ukraine	19
2.2 Bulgarian	21
2.2.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Bulgarian	21
2.2.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Bulgarian in Ukraine	25
2.3 Crimean Tatar	27
2.3.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Crimean Tatar	27
2.3.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Crimean Tatar in Ukraine	31
2.4 Gagauz	33
2.4.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Gagauz	33
2.4.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Gagauz in Ukraine	37
2.5 German	39
2.5.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German	39
2.5.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Ukraine	43
2.6 Greek	45
2.6.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Greek	45
2.6.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Greek in Ukraine	49
2.7 Hungarian	51
2.7.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian	51
2.7.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Ukraine	55
2.8 Karaim	57
2.8.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Karaim.....	57
2.8.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Karaim in Ukraine	58

2.9	Krimchak.....	59
2.9.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Krimchak	59
2.9.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Krimchak in Ukraine.....	60
2.10	Moldovan	61
2.10.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Moldovan	61
2.10.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Moldovan in Ukraine	65
2.11	Polish	67
2.11.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Polish	67
2.11.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Polish in Ukraine	71
2.12	Romani.....	73
2.12.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani.....	73
2.12.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Ukraine	74
2.13	Romanian.....	75
2.13.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romanian.....	75
2.13.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romanian in Ukraine	79
2.14	Russian	81
2.14.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian	81
2.14.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Ukraine.....	85
2.15	Ruthenian	86
2.15.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ruthenian.....	86
2.15.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ruthenian in Ukraine	87
2.16	Slovak	88
2.16.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak	88
2.16.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Ukraine	92
2.17	Yiddish	94
2.17.1	Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yiddish	94
2.17.2	Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yiddish in Ukraine	98
Chapter 3	[Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe	99
Appendix I:	Instrument of Ratification	100
Appendix II:	Comments from the Ukrainian authorities	101

Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Ukraine in 2006 and applies to the following languages: Belarusian, Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, Gagauz, German, Greek, Hungarian, Karaim, Krimchak, Moldovan, Polish, Romani, Romanian, Russian, Ruthenian, Slovak and Yiddish.

Due to the illegal annexation by the Russian Federation of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sebastopol, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to monitor the application of the Charter to the Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, German, Greek, Karaim and Krimchak languages in Crimea. This applies similarly to the minority languages used in those parts of the Donbas region which remain outside the effective control of the Ukrainian authorities. Referring to its Statement on the Situation in Ukraine of 16 May 2014, the Committee of Experts expresses its deep concern for the situation of the minority language users in these territories in which the Charter is *de facto* not applied at present.

The 2012 Law of Ukraine “On the Principles of State Language Policy” concerns the implementation of several Charter undertakings by Ukraine under the Charter. So far, this Language Law has been brought into application for Crimean Tatar, Bulgarian, Gagauz, Hungarian, Polish, Romanian, Russian and Slovak. The Committee of Experts reiterates its recommendation to the Ukrainian authorities to also apply the Language Law to Belarusian, German, Greek and Moldovan.

The absence of information about the practical implementation of a considerable number of provisions indicates that no structured approach exists for the application of each of the undertakings entered into by Ukraine under the Charter. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the undertakings entered into by Ukraine under the Charter need to be implemented in practice. This requires that the Ukrainian authorities take positive measures, on their own initiative, to implement the Charter.

The situation of the minority languages in education does not paint a uniform picture. Russian, Hungarian and Romanian are used as a medium of instruction. Most other languages are only taught as a subject in primary and secondary education. For the majority of languages, there is only a very limited offer of pre-school education. Except for Russian, no minority language is used in technical and vocational education. Belarusian and Yiddish are not taught at primary and secondary levels of public education. Overall, there is a need to extend bilingual education and to train teachers who are able to teach subjects in minority languages.

In practice, Russian seems effectively to be used before judicial authorities. There also seems to be some use of Hungarian (Transcarpathia) and of Romanian (Chernivtsi region) in judicial proceedings. The Belarusian, Bulgarian, Gagauz, German, Greek, Polish, Slovak and Yiddish languages are still not used in judicial proceedings in conformity with Ukraine’s undertakings under the Charter.

Only Russian, Hungarian and Romanian (the latter two at local level and only to a certain extent) are effectively used by local and regional authorities. Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar (Kherson region), Gagauz and Polish have only an emblematic presence in local administration. The other minority languages are effectively not used by regional or local authorities.

During recent years, the duration of public broadcasting in minority languages has been increased in some cases, but it has been shortened in other cases. However, even for languages having benefitted from an extended offer of broadcasting, the daily or weekly duration of these programmes remains too short to supply speakers of these languages with a comprehensive offer of news and entertainment. There is a need to extend the duration of the existing radio and television programmes. The Ukrainian authorities need to apply incentives to private radio and television broadcasters so as to facilitate broadcasts in minority languages.

Newspapers are published in Bulgarian, Hungarian, Moldovan, Polish, Romanian and Russian. Ukraine should also take measures to facilitate the creation of at least one daily or weekly newspaper in Belarusian, Gagauz, German, Greek and Slovak.

The Ukrainian authorities have supported many cultural activities relating to minority languages. With regard to several languages, however, there is a need to diversify these cultural activities and to use the minority languages in different fields.

The Ukrainian authorities have produced teaching materials in Romani. However, Ukraine still has to introduce the teaching of Romani at all appropriate levels of education. There is also a public television programme using Romani. As Romani is not used in any other field of public life, Ukraine should adopt a structured approach to the implementation of the Charter to Romani, in co-operation with the speakers.

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Ukraine – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its States Parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. When acceding to the Council of Europe in 1995, Ukraine committed itself to ratifying the Charter by 9 November 1996. Ukraine signed the Charter on 2 May 1996 and ratified it on 19 September 2005. The Charter entered into force in Ukraine on 1 January 2006 and applies to the following languages: Belarusian, Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, Gagauz, German, Greek, Hungarian, Karaim, Krimchak, Moldovan, Polish, Romani, Romanian, Russian, Ruthenian, Slovak and Yiddish. The Karaim, Krimchak, Romani and Ruthenian languages are covered by Part II (Article 7) only, whereas the other languages receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).

2. Article 15 (1) of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports about the implementation of the Charter. The Ukrainian authorities submitted their third periodical report on 12 January 2016. This third evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (20-24 November 2016) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in Ukraine and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the Ukrainian authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the second monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of Ukraine in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the Ukrainian authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Ukraine, as provided in Article 16 (4) of the Charter.

4. As far as the detailed legal examination of each undertaking is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its **second evaluation report on the application of the Charter in Ukraine (ECRML (2014) 3²)** and to its **Report reviewing the current situation of national minority languages in Ukraine (MIN-LANG (2014) 13³)** of 25 March 2014.

5. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 24 March 2017.

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Ukraine

Application of the Charter in territories outside the effective control of the Ukrainian authorities

6. Due to the illegal annexation by the Russian Federation of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sebastopol, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to monitor the application of the Charter to the Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar, German, Greek, Karaim and Krimchak languages in Crimea. This applies similarly to the minority languages used in those parts of the Donbas region which remain outside the effective control of the Ukrainian authorities. Referring to its Statement on the Situation in Ukraine of 16 May 2014 (MIN-LANG (2014) 42), the Committee of Experts expresses its deep concern for the situation of the minority language users in these territories in which the Charter is *de facto* not applied at present. In light of the Secretary General’s report on the State of democracy, human rights and the rule of law in Europe (May 2014), the Committee of Experts offers its expertise on regional or minority languages and their users in Ukraine to the Committee of Ministers and the Secretary General of the Council of Europe.

² <https://rm.coe.int/CoERMPublicCommonSearchServices/DisplayDCTMContent?documentId=09000016806dc600>

³ <https://rm.coe.int/CoERMPublicCommonSearchServices/DisplayDCTMContent?documentId=09000016806d83e0>

Legal framework for the implementation of the Charter

7. The 2012 Law of Ukraine “On the Principles of State Language Policy” concerns the implementation of several Charter undertakings chosen by Ukraine in its instrument of ratification. In the second evaluation report, the Committee of Experts encouraged the Ukrainian authorities to take active steps ensuring the application of the Language Law to all Part III languages in a way which implements the Charter in practice.

8. So far, the Language Law has been brought into application for Crimean Tatar, Bulgarian, Gagauz, Hungarian, Polish, Romanian, Russian and Slovak, in other words these languages have been granted the status of “regional language”. The application of the Language Law to the other Part III languages is pending. The law’s provisions apply to a minority language provided that its speakers constitute at least 10% of the population in a territorial administrative unit (which can be a village, the smallest territorial administrative unit). In order to initiate the application of the Language Law to a language, at least 10% of the residents of a given territorial administrative unit must sign a petition to that effect on whose basis the local council will decide.

9. As the Committee of Experts pointed out in its second evaluation report, the procedure of 10% of the residents signing a petition is not appropriate for languages with a relatively low number of speakers. Most speakers of several Part III languages are to a considerable extent linguistically assimilated and use the minority language only in some limited domains; they are not used to invoke their language rights in public. It is therefore unlikely that speakers of such languages would initiate a petition and/or be able to mobilise sufficient support to meet the 10% threshold. An additional obstacle is that, for reasons of historical experience, many minority language speakers might feel uncomfortable revealing their linguistic and ethnic background by signing the required petition.

10. However, local councils can also voluntarily decide to apply the Language Law to languages whose speakers make up less than 10% of the local population. In the view of the Committee of Experts, the possibilities to apply the law at the level of a village and to voluntarily grant a language the status of “regional language” even if the 10% threshold is not met are essential to ensure that languages with a relatively low number of speakers and/or low degree of local concentration also benefit from the Language Law.

11. It is important that the Ukrainian authorities take active steps so as to ensure the application of the Language Law to all Part III languages. The Ukrainian authorities should identify with regard to all relevant Part III languages the relevant territorial administrative units and then carry out information activities to initiate the procedure with a view to extending the application of the Charter to all areas where the speakers represent a sufficient number for the purpose of the undertaking concerned.

12. Furthermore, the legal problems created by the ratification instrument on the Charter have so far not been solved. In the first monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts underlined that, pursuant to Article 4 (2), the level of protection granted by any instrument of ratification should reflect at least the level of protection that a given minority language already enjoys in accordance with national legislation, policies and practice. In the case of Ukraine, however, the Committee of Experts noted that the level of protection granted by the ratification instrument was below the existing level of protection applied in Ukraine. At that time, Ukraine was considering amendments to the Law of Ukraine “On Ratification of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages”, *inter alia* with a view to upgrading the level of protection. The Committee of Experts encouraged the Ukrainian authorities, when modifying the instrument of ratification, to upgrade the level of protection in order to reflect the domestic level of minority language protection.

13. Several provisions of the Language Law are largely congruent with Charter provisions currently not contained in Ukraine’s instrument of ratification.⁴ The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities, when modifying the instrument of ratification in accordance with Article 3 (2), to take these provisions into account in order to reflect the more favourable domestic level of minority language protection.

⁴ Articles 8.1.ai, bi, ci, di, fi; 9.1.ai, aii, aiv, bi, bii, ci, cii, d; 10.1.a.ii, 10.2.b, 10.4.b and 10.5

Practical implementation of the Charter

14. The information provided in Ukraine's third periodical report still largely focuses on the legal framework and does not deal with all the monitoring recommendations and questions regarding the use of the minority languages in practice. The absence of information about the practical implementation of a considerable number of provisions indicates that no structured approach exists for the application of each of the undertakings entered into by Ukraine under the Charter.

15. In the second monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended to the Ukrainian authorities to **“adopt, for each language, a structured approach for the implementation of the undertakings chosen under the Charter, in co-operation with the respective speakers”**.

16. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the undertakings entered into by Ukraine under the Charter need to be implemented in practice. This requires that the Ukrainian authorities take positive measures, on their own initiative and in co-operation with the representatives of the minority language speakers, with a view to protecting and promoting the minority languages in public life. The Committee of Experts considers that the Ukrainian authorities should consult the associations representing the national minorities concerned as well as the relevant local and regional authorities with a view to drawing up a mid-term strategy on the implementation of the Charter in respect of each minority language. Such a strategy should define concrete steps, administrative responsibilities and a time-frame to implement each undertaking.⁵ In addition, there should be clarity as to which national authority or authorities are in charge of co-ordinating the measures to implement the undertakings of the Charter.

Use of the regional or minority languages in education

17. The situation of the minority languages in education is not uniform. Russian, Hungarian and Romanian are used as a medium of instruction. The situation of these languages in education is by and large satisfactory. Most other languages are only taught as a subject in primary and secondary education. For the majority of languages, there is only a very limited offer of pre-school education. Except for Russian, no minority language is used in technical and vocational education. Belarusian and Yiddish are not taught at primary and secondary levels of public education. There is still a lack of teachers who are able to teach subjects in minority languages.

18. In the preceding monitoring cycles, the Committee of Ministers and the Committee of Experts considered that parents should be able to enrol their children in schools using the respective minority language as a language of instruction (education in minority languages or bilingual teaching) or, if so preferred, in schools teaching that language only as a subject. There is interest within several national minorities (Bulgarian, German, Hungarian, Polish, Romanian and Russian) in education in these languages in local strongholds as well as in teaching them as a subject, depending on the local situation of the given language. Therefore, the Ukrainian authorities should elaborate a comprehensive policy for education in minority languages and for teaching these languages as a subject and determine, for each language, an individual “model mix” (share between minority language medium education⁶ and teaching the minority language as a subject⁷).

19. As far as the organisation of minority language education is concerned, a passive attitude on the part of the authorities persists. In their view, the availability of such an offer is a mere reflection of demand by parents or pupils, requiring no specific activity by the authorities. This passive approach is problematical vis-à-vis the Charter which requires pro-active measures by the authorities. The Committee of Experts underlines that the undertakings entered into by Ukraine under education require the authorities to make available minority language education at the different levels of education. This implies that the educational offer needs to precede the demand, i.e. that the education has to be organised (*inter alia* teacher training, selection of schools, textbook production, financing) before the authorities are approached by parents or pupils. Such an offer also needs to ensure continuity from pre-school through to secondary and higher

⁵ See for example 1st Report of the Committee of Experts in respect of Romania, paragraph 29; 1st Report of the Committee of Experts in respect of Poland, paragraph 24

⁶ Article 8 paragraph 1.ai, ii; bi, ii; ci, ii; di, ii; eiii

⁷ Article 8 paragraph 1.biii; ciii; diii; eiii

education, including technical and vocational education, in the geographical areas concerned. Furthermore, there is still a lack of supervisory bodies monitoring the quality of minority language education.

20. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts considers that more awareness-raising about the advantages of multilingualism and opportunities for minority language education are needed. It could be envisaged, for example, that the local authorities in the traditional language areas regularly inform parents of new-borns about the advantages of early language learning for the child's development and about local schools teaching the given minority language and/or in the given minority language.⁸ Generally, the Ukrainian authorities should encourage parents and pupils to make use of the educational offer.

Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities

21. As far as the use of minority languages before judicial authorities is concerned, only languages that have been granted the status of "regional language" pursuant to the Law of Ukraine "On the Principles of State Language Policy" may be used in judicial proceedings. This implies that the respective Charter undertakings are not fulfilled for Belarusian, German, Greek and Moldovan whose introduction as regional languages is pending.

22. In practice, Russian seems effectively to be used before judicial authorities. There also seems to be some use of Hungarian and of Romanian, in Transcarpathia and the Chernivtsi region respectively, in criminal and civil judicial proceedings. The Belarusian, Bulgarian, Gagauz, German, Greek, Polish, Slovak and Yiddish languages are still not used in judicial proceedings in conformity with Ukraine's undertakings under the Charter. In general, speakers of minority languages are seldom encouraged (and occasionally may in fact be discouraged) to use their language in proceedings. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts was informed during the on-the-spot visit by judges that the national authorities have not provided sufficient information about the possibilities of using minority languages in accordance with the Charter.

Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities

23. Only Russian, Hungarian and Romanian (the latter two at local level and only to a certain extent) are effectively used by local and regional authorities. Bulgarian, Crimean Tatar (Kherson region), Gagauz and Polish have only an emblematic presence in local administration. The other minority languages are effectively not used by regional or local authorities.

24. The Law of Ukraine "On the Principles of State Language Policy" can support the implementation of some of Ukraine's undertakings in the field of administrative authorities. However, it still does not apply to all the languages concerned. The Committee of Experts therefore reiterates its recommendation to the Ukrainian authorities to also apply the Language Law to Belarusian, German, Greek and Moldovan.

25. The Committee of Experts is aware of an ongoing debate to modify the existing legislation, introducing thresholds as high as 30 percent. In this context, the Committee of Experts again underlines its observation made in the previous monitoring cycles that high percentage thresholds (20% or more) for the official use of minority languages in local and regional administration are incompatible with the Charter as they would deprive minority languages whose speakers do not attain such a percentage in any single place to qualify for full protection under the Charter.⁹

26. Additional legal, practical and financial measures also need to be taken to facilitate the publication by regional authorities of their official documents in the relevant minority languages as well as the use by regional and local authorities of minority languages in debates in their assemblies. These fields are not covered by the Language Law.

27. In several municipalities, the original place name in the local minority language (e.g. Hungarian, Romanian) has been restored to once again become the official name of the municipality used in the script of the minority language in conjunction with a Cyrillic transliteration. The adoption and use of a traditional place name in a minority language is a relatively simple promotional measure with a nonetheless considerable

⁸ See for example 1st Report of the Committee of Experts in respect of the United Kingdom, paragraph 68; 2nd Report of the Committee of Experts in respect of the Slovak Republic, paragraph 55; 4th Report of the Committee of Experts in respect of Hungary, paragraph 66

⁹ See for example 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on the Slovak Republic, ECRML(2007)1, paragraphs 592-593; 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on Romania, ECRML(2012)3, paragraphs 35, 37

positive effect for the prestige and public awareness of a minority language. As the steps taken constitute good practice in Europe, Ukraine should pursue the restoration of place names in minority languages that have been changed during the Soviet period. A systematic policy in this respect is relevant for Bulgarian, Gagauz, German, Greek and Yiddish.

28. In order to implement the Charter and the national legislation and to ensure the effective use of a minority language by administrative authorities, and in contacts with them, the Ukrainian authorities need to take organisational measures such as the appointment of public service employees who have a knowledge of the given minority language and measures encouraging the minority language speakers to avail themselves of the possibility to use this language during contacts with the authorities. Measures of encouragement are particularly needed where minority language speakers are not accustomed to using their language in dealings with the authorities. Such measures could avoid that speakers assume that they would be perceived as “trouble-makers”. The Ukrainian authorities should therefore take pro-active measures to encourage the use of minority languages in administration, *inter alia* by making official documents in the minority languages more easily available and by ensuring that signs on administrative buildings as well as doorplates used in administration offices also have inscriptions in the relevant minority languages.

Use of the regional or minority languages in the media

29. Ukraine has a network of regional public broadcasters which have editorial offices for minority languages used in the area. For example, the Transcarpathia Regional State Television and Radio Company has editorial offices for Hungarian, Romanian, German, Slovak, Ruthenian, Romani and Russian. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts met with representatives of this broadcaster who expressed their concern about plans to restructure the public broadcasting network with possible negative repercussions on the programmes in minority languages. Considering that Ukraine’s network of regional broadcasting in minority languages constitutes good practice in Europe, the Ukrainian authorities are encouraged to maintain this regional broadcasting and to develop it further, in respect of the undertakings under the Charter.

30. During recent years, the duration of public broadcasts in minority languages has been increased in some cases (e.g. public television and radio programmes in Romanian and Slovak, public television in Hungarian), but it has been shortened in others. However, even for languages which have benefitted from an extended offer of broadcasting, the daily or weekly duration of these programmes remains too short to supply speakers of these languages with a comprehensive offer of news and entertainment. This limits the impact that the programmes have on the promotion of the minority languages concerned. There is a need to extend the duration of the existing radio and television programmes and to make provisions so that broadcasters also offer programmes in certain languages in other regions.

31. Hungarian and Russian are used by private radio and television broadcasters. Certain other minority languages (Polish, Romanian and Slovak) are only used on private radio. The Ukrainian authorities need to give incentives to private radio and television broadcasters so as to also facilitate private radio and television broadcasts in Belarusian, Bulgarian, Gagauz, German and Greek as well as to launch private television broadcasting in Polish, Romanian and Slovak.

32. Newspapers are published in Bulgarian, Hungarian, Moldovan, Polish, Romanian and Russian. Ukraine should also take measures to facilitate the creation of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Belarusian, Gagauz, German, Greek and Slovak.

Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

33. The Ukrainian authorities have supported many cultural activities relating to minority languages, especially events and publications. With regard to several languages, however, there is a need to diversify the cultural activities and to use the minority languages in different fields (theatre, cinema, new technologies). Moreover, in order to ensure the establishment and operation of facilities such as cultural centres, the authorities should introduce long-term subsidies.

Use of the regional or minority languages in economic life

34. In light of the very limited information provided by the Ukrainian authorities, the Committee of Experts must conclude that only Russian and Hungarian are used in economic life. However, the use of Polish, Romanian and Slovak in cross-border economic relations with the neighbouring kin states as well as German more generally is realistic and should be actively encouraged by the Ukrainian authorities.

Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges

35. Ukraine uses cross-border co-operation as a means of supporting the promotion of minority languages, especially in education (e.g. concerning Gagauz). With regard to some languages such as Romani and Yiddish, such co-operation could still be intensified with a view to creating synergies in language promotion.

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Ukraine

36. The **Belarusian** language can be studied at university, but there is no teaching in or of Belarusian at any other level of education. There are no training courses for Belarusian teachers. Furthermore, the history and culture relating to the Belarusian language is not taught in regular education. Belarusian is neither used by administrative authorities, nor in judicial proceedings. In Ukraine, there are no public or private radio and television programmes broadcasting in Belarusian. In this respect, the Belarusian speakers depend on broadcasts received from the Republic of Belarus. There is also no newspaper in Belarusian. While cultural activities in Belarusian are organised, the offer needs to be diversified beyond the fields of publishing and events. Overall, there is an obvious need for Ukraine to develop and implement a structured policy for the application of the Charter to Belarusian.

37. The presence of **Bulgarian** in primary and secondary education has remained relatively good. Teaching materials are available for years 1-11. However, Bulgarian is not present in kindergarten, technical and vocational education, and adult and continuing education. Bulgarian has been introduced as a regional language at district and town levels in the Kirovohrad and Odesa/Odessa regions. However, Bulgarian is not used in judicial proceedings. In local administration, its use is merely emblematic (names of district and local councils). Public regional television channels and radio stations broadcast in Bulgarian, but there are no private broadcasts. Weekly newspapers are published in Bulgarian. Cultural activities using Bulgarian would need to be diversified beyond the fields of publishing and events.

38. Although the Ukrainian authorities could only take measures regarding **Crimean Tatar** in areas outside the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sebastopol, some positive developments have occurred. Crimean Tatar is taught at pre-school, primary and secondary levels in the Henichesk district (Kherson region) and in Melitopol (secondary education). However, the network of educational institutions teaching Crimean Tatar needs to be enlarged. A particular need arises with regard to the displaced persons from the Crimean Tatar national minority where an educational infrastructure is necessary in the areas where they now live. New teaching materials in Crimean Tatar covering school years 1-11 have been introduced. Furthermore, a new speciality entitled "Crimean Tatar Language, Literature and Translation" is being offered at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Both the basic and the further training of teachers for Crimean Tatar is provided. Crimean Tatar has also been introduced as a regional language at village level in the Kherson region. However, it is not clear to what extent Crimean Tatar is used by public and private broadcast media, newspapers and in cultural activities.

39. New teaching materials have been published in **Gagauz**. This language is taught as a subject at primary and secondary levels in the Odesa/Odessa region. The situation of Gagauz in primary education has improved during the period under review, although the number of hours per week is still far too low. Progress has also been made in the field of teacher training. However, there remains a need to make available Gagauz language education at pre-school and technical and vocational levels with a sufficient number of teaching hours. Moreover, the history of the Gagauz minority is not yet taught. Although Gagauz

has been introduced as a regional language at district level in the Odesa/Odessa region, it is absent in the judicial system. In local administration, Gagauz is only emblematically used (names of district and local councils). Gagauz has a certain presence on public radio and television. There is no weekly or daily newspaper in Gagauz. The use of Gagauz in cultural life is largely limited to festivals and needs therefore to be diversified. Gagauz is not used in economic life. The promotion of Gagauz in Ukraine could benefit from extended related cross-border exchanges with the Republic of Moldova.

40. **German** is taught only as a foreign language in primary and secondary education. There is a need to complement the teaching of German by a local offer of bilingual education, to extend pre-school education in German beyond the current offer (one kindergarten) and to introduce the teaching of German in technical and vocational education. Furthermore, the history of the German minority is not yet taught. German still has to be introduced as a regional language in relevant settlements in the Transcarpathia and Odesa/Odessa regions. Measures need to be taken to encourage the use of German before court. The duration of the public television and radio programmes in German in Transcarpathia has been shortened. In order to promote German in the media, Ukraine should also launch public broadcasting of an adequate duration outside Transcarpathia, facilitate private television and radio broadcasts and support the creation of a newspaper, to be published at least weekly. Many cultural activities are organised in German and cross-border exchanges are used to promote the language.

41. The use of **Greek** in pre-school education has slightly improved during the period under review, but should be further extended beyond the current offer (two groups in Mariupol). The situation is better in primary and secondary education where Greek is taught as a subject. While a relatively high number of pupils learn Greek in secondary education, the teaching of Greek in technical and vocational education still has to be launched. Teaching materials concerning the history of the Greek minority have been introduced, and Greek continues to be taught at university. In court proceedings, Greek is not used. There is no information about the use of Greek in the field of administration. It is also unclear whether Greek is still used on television, radio and in the print media. A number of cultural activities have been organised for the Greek minority, but it is not clear to what extent the Greek language has been used in them.

42. Teaching in **Hungarian** continues to be available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels of education in Transcarpathia. In pre-school education in Hungarian, the number of children enrolled has increased. However, the number of students in Hungarian-language secondary education has significantly decreased. Hungarian is still not used in technical and vocational education despite requests made by the Hungarian minority. Hungarian has the status of "regional language" at district and town levels in Transcarpathia. However, the administrative division of the Hungarian-speaking area into four districts makes it difficult to use Hungarian effectively in administration. In practice, Hungarian is used orally by local authorities in areas with a high percentage of Hungarians whereas there is hardly any written use (including on forms and in documents). Furthermore, the oral and written use of Hungarian by the regional authorities still has to be introduced. The use of Hungarian place names is limited to some place name signs and should be extended to the adoption of all relevant topographic names and their use in the related signage. There is some use of Hungarian before courts, including by judges and in written documents (e.g. judgments), but Hungarian speakers are occasionally asked to translate court documents at their expense into Ukrainian. In the media, the duration of the programmes in Hungarian has been considerably increased on public television, but has remained nearly the same on public radio. Furthermore, Hungarian is used by a private radio programme and a private television channel. There are also newspapers published in Hungarian. Many cultural activities are organised in Hungarian, but the domains could be further diversified (e.g. theatre, cinema, new technologies).

43. Teaching in **Moldovan** as well as teaching Moldovan as a subject is well-developed and available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels. On the other hand, Moldovan is not taught in technical and vocational education and is still not used in the courts. In administration, Moldovan is only used to a certain extent at local level. Moldovan is present on public television and radio as well as in the press. Only a few cultural activities have been organised with a view to promoting Moldovan.

44. **Polish** is used as a medium of instruction in pre-school, primary and secondary education. Considering the existing continuity from kindergarten to secondary education, Polish-language education should also be made available at technical and vocational level. The provision of basic and further training for Polish teachers has improved during the period under review. Although Polish is a regional language at village level in the Chernivtsi region, this language is not used in judicial proceedings. There is no information about the use of Polish by local and regional authorities. Public television and radio programmes are broadcast in Polish. Moreover, there are newspapers published in Polish. A high number of cultural activities using Polish have been organised.

45. The Ukrainian authorities have produced teaching materials in **Romani** for the first and second school years. However, Ukraine still has to introduce the teaching of Romani at all appropriate levels of education. In the media, the public television broadcaster in Transcarpathia offers a weekly television programme using Romani and covering culture, music and social issues. There is a need to extend and strengthen the offer of radio and television broadcasts in Romani. As Romani is not used in any other field of public life, Ukraine should adopt a structured approach to the implementation of the Charter to Romani, in co-operation with the speakers. For example, measures should be taken to support the presence of Romani in cultural life and to promote transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by the Charter, for this language.

46. Education in **Romanian** and teaching Romanian as a subject continues to be available in the Transcarpathia and Chernivtsi regions, except in technical and vocational education. More children attend pre-school education in Romanian than in the previous monitoring cycle. However, the number of students attending secondary education in Romanian has significantly decreased. Both teachers who teach Romanian as a subject and those who teach various subjects in Romanian can receive their basic and further training in Ukraine. Romanian is a regional language at district and village levels in the Transcarpathia and Chernivtsi regions. There seems to be some use of Romanian in criminal and civil judicial proceedings in the Chernivtsi region. Romanian is also used by some local authorities in Transcarpathia in official documents and council meetings. In the Novoselytsia/Noua Suliță district, Romanian is used in oral and written contacts with the population, on signs at buildings of local authorities, schools, medical and cultural institutions, in official journals and local council meetings. However, on the whole, the use of Romanian in courts and administration remains patchy and insufficient bearing in mind the number of Romanian speakers; a more structured approach to promote it is needed. In the media, the duration of the Romanian-language public television and radio programmes in Transcarpathia has been increased over the last few years. Considering the number of Romanian speakers, the offer needs to be further extended. This also applies to private radio broadcasting in Romanian which so far exists only to a limited extent. Furthermore, private television broadcasting in Romanian has to be launched. The offer of cultural activities in Romanian remains good.

47. Ukraine has implemented most of its undertakings under the Charter in respect of **Russian**. The Russian language is used as a medium of instruction at all levels of education. Russian is the only language covered under the Charter which is used in technical and vocational education. Furthermore, Russian has been granted the status of regional language and is actually used by administrative and judicial authorities, for example on official forms and in announcements. As the Committee of Experts has pointed out in the previous evaluation reports, the high level of compliance by Ukraine with its Charter undertakings concerning Russian is partly a result of the fact that the ratification for Russian does not adequately reflect the strong sociolinguistic situation of this language in Ukraine.

48. Although the Law of Ukraine "On the Principles of State Language Policy" makes reference to **Ruthenian**, the Ukrainian authorities still do not unambiguously treat Ruthenian as a language in its own right. The public television broadcaster in Transcarpathia broadcasts a weekly television programme in Ruthenian. There are facilities offering Ruthenian courses outside the state education system. Ruthenian is also used in cultural activities. A structured policy for the promotion of Ruthenian needs to be developed as Ruthenian is currently absent from most fields of public life.

49. The situation of the **Slovak** language has improved in the fields of education, administration and media during the period under review. For example, Slovak has been introduced in pre-school education. Teaching in Slovak is also offered at primary and secondary levels, but not yet in technical and vocational education. Furthermore, Slovak has obtained the status of regional language in two villages in Transcarpathia. Particular efforts are still needed to facilitate and encourage the actual use of Slovak in relations with regional and local authorities as well as before court. The duration of public radio and television programmes in Slovak has been extended during recent years. There is also private radio broadcasting in Slovak. However, the launch of private television broadcasting in this language is still pending. In addition, no newspapers have as yet been published in Slovak. The authorities support cultural activities and facilities using Slovak.

50. The **Yiddish** language is used in one pre-school group and is taught at university level in Kiev. With the support of the Ukrainian authorities, a Yiddish dictionary has been published. A few cultural activities using Yiddish have been organised. Apart from that, Yiddish is not used in any other field of public life (judicial and administrative authorities, media, economic and social life, transfrontier co-operation) and is in a particularly precarious situation. Against this background, the Ukrainian authorities should devise flexible and innovative measures for the actual application of the Charter undertakings to Yiddish. For example, such measures could comprise the establishment of one central educational institution for Yiddish. The application of the Charter to Yiddish could also benefit from co-operation with other states where this language is promoted under the Charter. Yiddish users in Ukraine could benefit, with the necessary adaptation, from the already existing infrastructure for this language in the media, education or culture abroad. Where other states are currently in a process of setting up a new infrastructure for Yiddish, these measures could be jointly implemented.

51. The Committee of Experts is not in a position to monitor the application of the Charter to Karaim and Krimchak (see page 6, paragraph 6 above).

Chapter 2 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Belarusian

2.1.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Belarusian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement

↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Belarusian ¹⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Belarusian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Belarusian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Belarusian				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Belarusian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Belarusian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Belarusian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Belarusian to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Belarusian at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Belarusian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Belarusian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Belarusian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Belarusian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Belarusian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Belarusian 		=			
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.iii	make available pre-school education in Belarusian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Belarusian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				=	

¹⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Belarusian ¹⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Belarusian, a substantial part of primary education in Belarusian or teaching of Belarusian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				=	
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Belarusian, a substantial part of secondary education in Belarusian or teaching of Belarusian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Belarusian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Belarusian or teaching of Belarusian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Belarusian or of facilities for the study of Belarusian as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Belarusian as a subject of adult and continuing education				✓	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Belarusian				✓	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Belarusian				✓	
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Belarusian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Belarusian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Belarusian at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Belarusian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				=	
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Belarusian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Belarusian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Belarusian					=
9.3	make available in Belarusian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Belarusian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Belarusian within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Belarusian				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Belarusian				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Belarusian¹⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Belarusian in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Belarusian in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Belarusian				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Belarusian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Belarusian				✓	
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Belarusian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Belarusian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Belarusian				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Belarusian				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Belarusian				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Belarusian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Belarusian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Belarusian 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Belarusian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Belarusian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Belarusian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		↗			
12.1.c	foster access in Belarusian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Belarusian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Belarusian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Belarusian		↗			
12.2	In territories other than those in which Belarusian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Belarusian				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Belarusian and the culture it reflects				✓	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Belarusian ¹⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Belarusian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Belarusian in connection with economic or social activities					=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Belarusian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Belarusian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Belarusian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Belarusian is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

52. Concerning education, the Belarusian language can be studied at university, but there is no teaching in or of Belarusian at any other level of education. There are no training courses for Belarusian teachers. As the Committee of Experts verified during the evaluation process, the Belarusian language is no longer offered as a subject in adult education (Article 8 (1) fiii). Furthermore, the Committee of Experts was able to obtain clarification that the history and culture related to the Belarusian language is not taught in regular education (Article 8 (1) g).

53. As in the previous monitoring round, Belarusian is not used by administrative authorities or in judicial proceedings. No public or private radio or television programmes are broadcast in Belarusian in Ukraine. In this respect, the Belarusian speakers depend on broadcasts received from the Republic of Belarus. There is also no newspaper in Belarusian. Nevertheless, Ukraine guarantees the direct reception of broadcasts from the Republic of Belarus (Article 11 (2)).

54. Regarding culture, Ukraine's third periodical report refers to activities carried out at regional level to foster access to works produced in Belarusian, and for this reason Article 12 (1) b is now considered partly fulfilled. The offer needs to be diversified beyond the fields of publishing and events. As a result of new information, Article 12 (1) g is now also partly fulfilled. In the second evaluation report, Article 12 (1) f was considered partly fulfilled, but there is still a need to provide long-term subsidies to the Belarusian speakers in setting up or running cultural centres. However, materials other than literary works also need to be collected. Ukraine does not refer, in cultural policy abroad, to Belarusian and the culture it reflects (Article 12 (3)).

2.1.2 *Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Belarusian in Ukraine*

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.1.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine¹¹ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

1. Adopt, for Belarusian, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings chosen under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

2. Make available at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Belarusian and provide for the teaching of Belarusian in primary and secondary, as well as in technical and vocational, education.
3. Develop a coherent strategy for the basic and further training of teachers of Belarusian and provide teaching materials for Belarusian-language education.
4. Favour and/or encourage the offering of Belarusian as a subject in adult and continuing education.
5. Ensure the teaching of the history and culture which is reflected by Belarusian.
6. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Belarusian and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings to be made public.

Judicial authorities

7. Encourage the practical use of Belarusian in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
8. Ensure that the most important national statutory texts are made available in Belarusian.

Administrative authorities and public services

9. Apply the Law of Ukraine "On the Principles of State Language Policy" to Belarusian and take concrete measures to encourage Belarusian speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.

¹¹ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

10. Encourage the use of Belarusian within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.
11. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Belarusian, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names.

Media

12. Make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Belarusian, including for children.
13. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcast of private radio and television programmes in Belarusian, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
14. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Belarusian.
15. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Belarusian.

Cultural activities and facilities

16. Secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities to provide stability for cultural activities in Belarusian.
17. Provide long-term subsidies to Belarusian speakers to set up or run cultural centres.
18. Foster access in Belarusian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling activities.
19. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Belarusian.

2.2 Bulgarian

2.2.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Bulgarian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Bulgarian ¹²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Bulgarian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Bulgarian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Bulgarian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Bulgarian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Bulgarian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Bulgarian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Bulgarian to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Bulgarian at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Bulgarian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Bulgarian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Bulgarian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Bulgarian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Bulgarian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Bulgarian 		=			
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.iii	make available pre-school education in Bulgarian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Bulgarian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				=	

¹² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Bulgarian ¹²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Bulgarian, a substantial part of primary education in Bulgarian or teaching of Bulgarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Bulgarian, a substantial part of secondary education in Bulgarian or teaching of Bulgarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Bulgarian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Bulgarian or teaching of Bulgarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Bulgarian or of facilities for the study of Bulgarian as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Bulgarian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Bulgarian				✓	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Bulgarian		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Bulgarian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Bulgarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Bulgarian at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Bulgarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↗		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Bulgarian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Bulgarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Bulgarian					=
9.3	make available in Bulgarian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Bulgarian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Bulgarian within the framework of the regional or local authority			↗		
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Bulgarian				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Bulgarian				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Bulgarian in debates in their assemblies				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Bulgarian¹²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Bulgarian in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Bulgarian				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Bulgarian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Bulgarian		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Bulgarian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Bulgarian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Bulgarian				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Bulgarian	↗				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Bulgarian				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Bulgarian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Bulgarian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Bulgarian 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Bulgarian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Bulgarian		✓			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Bulgarian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Bulgarian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Bulgarian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Bulgarian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Bulgarian		↗			
12.2	In territories other than those in which Bulgarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Bulgarian				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Bulgarian and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Bulgarian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Bulgarian in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Bulgarian ¹²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Bulgarian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Bulgarian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Bulgarian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Bulgarian is used in identical or similar form		↑			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

55. The presence of Bulgarian in primary and secondary education has remained relatively good, but there is a need to extend the offer of teaching in Bulgarian and teaching Bulgarian as a subject in municipalities of Bulgarian settlement areas where no educational offer is in place. There is also a need to strengthen the offer of teacher training. Teaching materials are available for school years 1-11. However, Bulgarian is not present in kindergarten, technical and vocational education, and adult and continuing education. In light of the information received during the third monitoring cycle, it is still not clear to the Committee of Experts whether the teaching of the history and the culture of the Bulgarian minority is ensured to pupils belonging to the Bulgarian minority as well as to pupils belonging to the majority population in the areas where Bulgarian is used (Article 8 (1) g). Therefore, the Committee of Experts has to conclude that the undertaking is not fulfilled.

56. Bulgarian has been introduced as a regional language at district and town levels in the Kirovohrad and Odesa/Odessa regions. As a result, Article 10 (2) a as well as Articles 9 (1) aiii, biii and ciii are now considered formally fulfilled. However, Bulgarian is not used in judicial proceedings. In local administration, its use is merely emblematic (names of district and local councils).

57. Public regional television channels and radio stations broadcast in Bulgarian, but the offer is rather limited and there is a need to extend the number of programmes broadcast in Bulgarian. There are no private broadcasts. Concerning the media, the Committee of Experts has now received information indicating that weekly newspapers are published in Bulgarian (Article 11 (1) eii).

58. As far as cultural activities in Bulgarian are concerned, a number of activities, mainly in the fields of publishing and events, are supported by the Ukrainian government. Article 12 (1) f was considered partly fulfilled, but there is a need to provide long-term subsidies to the Bulgarian speakers to set up or run cultural centres. In addition, as a result of new information, Article 12 (1) g is now considered partly fulfilled. However, materials other than literary works also need to be collected. Ukraine does not refer, in cultural policy abroad, to Bulgarian and the culture it reflects (Article 12 (3)).

2.2.2 *Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Bulgarian in Ukraine*

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine¹³ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Bulgarian, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Make available at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Bulgarian and provide for teaching in/of Bulgarian in technical and vocational education.
- c. Extend the offer of teaching in/of Bulgarian in primary and secondary education.
- d. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Bulgarian language.
- e. Provide basic training for teachers able to teach subjects in Bulgarian and ensure that there are teaching materials available for Bulgarian-language education at all levels of education.
- f. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Bulgarian and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.

Judicial authorities

- g. Encourage the practical use of Bulgarian in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- h. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Bulgarian.

Administrative authorities and public services

- i. Take concrete measures to encourage Bulgarian speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- j. Encourage the use of Bulgarian within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.

¹³ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

- k. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Bulgarian, *inter alia* the restoration of historical place names in the Odesa/Odessa region.

Media

- l. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Bulgarian on public radio and television and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Bulgarian for children.
- m. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Bulgarian, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- n. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Bulgarian.
- o. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Bulgarian.

Cultural activities and facilities

- p. Provide long-term subsidies to the Bulgarian speakers to set up or run cultural centres and other cultural facilities using this language.
- q. Foster access in Bulgarian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling activities.
- r. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works, including non-literary works, produced in Bulgarian.
- s. Provide appropriate cultural activities and facilities to showcase the Bulgarian language in territories other than those in which this language is traditionally used.

Transfrontier exchanges

- t. For the benefit of the Bulgarian language, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory the same language is used.

2.3 Crimean Tatar

2.3.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Crimean Tatar

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Crimean Tatar ¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Crimean Tatar as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Crimean Tatar	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Crimean Tatar					=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Crimean Tatar, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Crimean Tatar • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Crimean Tatar at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Crimean Tatar to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Crimean Tatar at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Crimean Tatar					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Crimean Tatar	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Crimean Tatar among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Crimean Tatar among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Crimean Tatar • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Crimean Tatar 					=
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Crimean Tatar or a substantial part of pre-school education in Crimean Tatar at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

¹⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Crimean Tatar ¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Crimean Tatar, a substantial part of primary education in Crimean Tatar or teaching of Crimean Tatar as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Crimean Tatar, a substantial part of secondary education in Crimean Tatar or teaching of Crimean Tatar as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Crimean Tatar, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Crimean Tatar or teaching of Crimean Tatar as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Crimean Tatar or of facilities for the study of Crimean Tatar as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Crimean Tatar as a subject of adult and continuing education		↗			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Crimean Tatar					=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Crimean Tatar	↗				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Crimean Tatar and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Crimean Tatar is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Crimean Tatar at all the appropriate stages of education		=			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Crimean Tatar, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↗		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Crimean Tatar in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Crimean Tatar in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Crimean Tatar					=
9.3	make available in Crimean Tatar the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Crimean Tatar		=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Crimean Tatar within the framework of the regional or local authority			↗		
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Crimean Tatar				✓	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Crimean Tatar				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Crimean Tatar¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Crimean Tatar in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Crimean Tatar in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Crimean Tatar				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Crimean Tatar to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Crimean Tatar					✓
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Crimean Tatar on a regular basis					✓
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Crimean Tatar on a regular basis					✓
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Crimean Tatar				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Crimean Tatar					✓
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Crimean Tatar				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Crimean Tatar • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Crimean Tatar • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Crimean Tatar 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Crimean Tatar are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Crimean Tatar	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Crimean Tatar by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Crimean Tatar to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Crimean Tatar language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Crimean Tatar in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Crimean Tatar				=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which Crimean Tatar is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Crimean Tatar	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Crimean Tatar and the culture it reflects		=			

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Crimean Tatar ¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Crimean Tatar	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Crimean Tatar in connection with economic or social activities					=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Crimean Tatar is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Crimean Tatar in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education		=			
14.b	for the benefit of Crimean Tatar, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Crimean Tatar is used in identical or similar form					=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

59. The Committee of Experts is not in a position to evaluate the application of the Charter to the Crimean Tatar language in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and in the city of Sebastopol. Outside of these territories, some positive developments have occurred. Crimean Tatar is taught at pre-school, primary and secondary levels in the Henichesk district (Kherson region) and in Melitopol (secondary education). However, the network of educational institutions teaching Crimean Tatar needs to be extended, in particular in the areas where displaced persons from the Crimean Tatar community have found refuge. As far as other areas are concerned, Ukraine's undertaking concerning adult education (Article 8 (1) fiii) is now partly fulfilled and the undertaking concerning basic and further training for teachers (Article 8 (1) h) is fulfilled.

Furthermore, a new study programme called "Crimean Tatar Language, Literature and Translation" is being offered at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Both basic and further training for teachers for Crimean Tatar is provided.

60. Crimean Tatar has been introduced as a regional language at village level in the Kherson region. As a result, Article 10 (2) a is now formally fulfilled.

61. Concerning Articles 11 (1) aiii, bii and cii, the undertakings were considered partly fulfilled in the previous monitoring cycle due to the media offer in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and in the city of Sebastopol. In the current circumstances, it is not clear to what extent Crimean Tatar is used by broadcast media. The same applies to newspapers and cultural activities. Article 12 (1) f was considered partly fulfilled, but there is a need to provide long-term subsidies to the Crimean Tatar speakers to set up or run cultural centres. Article 12 (1) g remains not fulfilled. Non-literary works produced in Crimean Tatar also need to be collected. Ukraine does not refer sufficiently, in cultural policy abroad, to Crimean Tatar and the culture it reflects (Article 12 (3)).

2.3.2 *Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Crimean Tatar in Ukraine*

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine¹⁵ remain valid in their own right.

Education

- a. Extend the offer of pre-school and primary education in Crimean Tatar and make technical and vocational education available in/of Crimean Tatar.
- b. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Crimean Tatar language.
- c. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Crimean Tatar and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings to be made public.
- d. Provide teaching in/of Crimean Tatar outside the areas where this language is traditionally used.

Judicial authorities

- e. Encourage the practical use of Crimean Tatar in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- f. Ensure that the most important national statutory texts are made available in Crimean Tatar.

Administrative authorities and public services

- g. Take concrete measures to encourage Crimean Tatar speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- h. Encourage the use of Crimean Tatar within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.

Media

- i. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Crimean Tatar on public radio and television and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Crimean Tatar for children.

¹⁵ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

- j. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Crimean Tatar.
- k. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Crimean Tatar.

Cultural activities and facilities

- l. Secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities to provide stability for cultural activities in Crimean Tatar and provide long-term subsidies to the Crimean Tatar speakers to set up or run cultural centres.
- m. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Crimean Tatar.

2.4 Gagauz

2.4.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Gagauz

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Gagauz ¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Gagauz as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Gagauz	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Gagauz		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Gagauz, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Gagauz • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Gagauz at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Gagauz to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Gagauz at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Gagauz				=	
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Gagauz	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Gagauz among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Gagauz among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Gagauz • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Gagauz 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Gagauz or a substantial part of pre-school education in Gagauz at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				=	

¹⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Gagauz ¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Gagauz, a substantial part of primary education in Gagauz or teaching of Gagauz as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		↗			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Gagauz, a substantial part of secondary education in Gagauz or teaching of Gagauz as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Gagauz, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Gagauz or teaching of Gagauz as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Gagauz or of facilities for the study of Gagauz as an university or higher education subject	↗				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Gagauz as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Gagauz					=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Gagauz		↗			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Gagauz and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	↗				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Gagauz is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Gagauz at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Gagauz, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↗		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Gagauz in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Gagauz in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Gagauz					=
9.3	make available in Gagauz the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Gagauz				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Gagauz within the framework of the regional or local authority			↗		
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Gagauz				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Gagauz				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Gagauz in debates in their assemblies				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Gagauz¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Gagauz in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Gagauz				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Gagauz to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Gagauz		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Gagauz on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Gagauz on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Gagauz				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Gagauz				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Gagauz				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Gagauz • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Gagauz • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Gagauz 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Gagauz are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Gagauz		=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Gagauz by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Gagauz to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Gagauz language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=	
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Gagauz in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Gagauz				=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which Gagauz is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Gagauz				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Gagauz and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Gagauz	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Gagauz in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Gagauz ¹⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Gagauz is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Gagauz in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				✓	
14.b	for the benefit of Gagauz, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Gagauz is used in identical or similar form				✓	
Total number of undertakings:						

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

62. This language is taught as a subject at primary and secondary levels in the Odesa/Odessa region. The situation of Gagauz in primary education has improved during the period under review, although the number of hours per week that it is taught is still far too low. The situation in secondary education also still needs improvement, with a strengthening of the educational offer in terms of hours taught and geographical coverage. Progress has been made in the field of teacher training, mainly regarding further training (Article 8 (1) h). New teaching materials have been published in Gagauz. The situation of Gagauz in university education has significantly improved following the creation of a chair of Turkology at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv and the offer of a major in Gagauz (Article 8 (1) eiii). However, the need to make Gagauz-language education available at pre-school and technical and vocational levels with a sufficient number of teaching hours persists. Moreover, the history of the Gagauz minority is not yet taught. A dedicated mechanism responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in Gagauz teaching has been created (Article 8 (1) i).

63. Concerning Articles 9 and 10, Gagauz has been introduced as a regional language at district level in the Odesa/Odessa region. However, since Gagauz is not effectively used in the judicial system or in administration, Articles 9 (1) aiii, biii and ciii as well as 10 (2) a are only formally fulfilled.

64. Gagauz has a certain presence on public radio and television, but the offer is too limited to fulfil the requirements of Article 11 (1) a iii. There is a need to increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Gagauz on public radio and television. There are no Gagauz programmes in private radio and television. There are also no daily or weekly Gagauz newspapers. The use of Gagauz in cultural life is largely limited to festivals and needs to be diversified. Article 12 (1) f was considered partly fulfilled, but there is a need to provide long-term subsidies to the Gagauz speakers to set up or run cultural centres. Article 12 (1) g remains not fulfilled. Non-literary works produced in Gagauz also need to be collected. Ukraine does not refer sufficiently, in cultural policy abroad, to Gagauz and the culture it reflects (Article 12 (3)). The promotion of Gagauz in Ukraine could benefit from extended related cross-border exchanges with the Republic of Moldova.

2.4.2 *Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Gagauz in Ukraine*

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine¹⁷ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Gagauz, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Extend the offer of primary and secondary education in/of Gagauz.
- c. Make available at least a substantial part of pre-school education in Gagauz.
- d. Actively inform pupils and parents about the offer of Gagauz-language education and encourage them to make use of it.
- e. Favour and/or encourage the offering of Gagauz as a subject in adult and continuing education.
- f. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Gagauz language.
- g. Provide basic training for the teachers of Gagauz.
- h. Provide, in co-operation with representatives of Gagauz speakers, teaching in/of Gagauz outside the areas where this language is traditionally used.

Judicial authorities

- i. Encourage the practical use of Gagauz in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- j. Take measures to ensure that the most important national statutory texts are made available in Gagauz.

¹⁷ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

Administrative authorities and public services

- k. Take concrete measures to encourage Gagauz speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- l. Encourage the use of Gagauz within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.
- m. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Gagauz, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names (for example in Vinogradovka/Kurçu, *Aleksandrovka/Satılık-Hacı*, Stari Troyan/Eski Troyan, Kotlovina/Balboka).

Media

- n. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Gagauz on public radio and television and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Gagauz for children.
- o. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Gagauz, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- p. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Gagauz.
- q. Facilitate the creation of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Gagauz.
- r. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Gagauz.

Cultural activities and facilities

- s. Promote cultural activities to showcase the Gagauz language in various fields and provide appropriate cultural activities and facilities in territories other than those in which this language is traditionally used.
- t. Provide long-term subsidies to Gagauz speakers to set up or run cultural centres and other cultural facilities using this language.
- u. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Gagauz.

Transfrontier exchanges

- v. Apply agreements with other countries in such a way as to foster contacts between the users of Gagauz in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education, or conclude such agreements.
- w. Facilitate and/or promote cross-border co-operation, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Gagauz is used.

2.5 German

2.5.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement

↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning German ¹⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of German as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of German	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote German				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of German, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using German • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of German at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of German to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on German at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of German		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of German	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses German • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to German 		=			
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in German or a substantial part of pre-school education in German at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

¹⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning German¹⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in German, a substantial part of primary education in German or teaching of German as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in German, a substantial part of secondary education in German or teaching of German as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in German, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in German or teaching of German as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in German or of facilities for the study of German as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of German as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by German				✓	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) German		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of German and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which German is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of German at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in German, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				=	
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in German in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in German in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in German					=
9.3	make available in German the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of German				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of German within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in German				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in German				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of German in debates in their assemblies				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning German¹⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of German in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in German		=			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of German to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in German		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in German on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in German on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in German				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in German				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using German				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in German • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in German • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in German 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of German are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in German		✓			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in German by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in German to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				✓	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the German language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of German in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in German				=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which German is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using German				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for German and the culture it reflects					✓
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of German	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of German in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning German ¹⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which German is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of German in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of German, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory German is used in identical or similar form					✓

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

65. Concerning education, German is taught only as a foreign language in primary and secondary education. There is a need to complement the teaching of German by a local offer of bilingual education, to extend pre-school education in German beyond the current offer (one kindergarten) and to introduce teaching of German in technical and vocational education. In addition, the offer of teacher training should also cover the training of teachers capable of teaching German as a minority language and to teach subjects in bilingual education. Furthermore, the history and culture related to the German language in Ukraine is not yet taught.

66. German still has to be introduced as a regional language in relevant settlements in the Transcarpathia and Odesa/Odessa regions. Measures need to be taken to encourage the use of German before court. Article 10 (2) g is considered partly fulfilled, with a need to promote the use or adoption of traditional and correct place names in German.

67. The duration of the public television and radio programmes in German in Transcarpathia has been shortened. In order to promote German in the media, Ukraine should also launch public broadcasting of an adequate duration outside Transcarpathia, facilitate private television and radio broadcasts and support the creation of a newspaper published at least weekly.

68. As far as the field of culture is concerned, many cultural activities are organised for the German minority, but only some of them use German as the language of the activity (Article 12 (1) a). In addition, the authorities have not fostered access in German to works produced in other languages due to a lack of aid and development for translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling (Article 12 (1) c). Therefore, the undertaking is considered not fulfilled. It is not clear if Ukraine refers, in cultural policy abroad, to German and the culture it reflects (Article 12 (3)), nor whether German is promoted in the framework of town twinnings (Article 14 b).

2.5.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine¹⁹ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for German, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Extend the offer of pre-school education in German, make primary and secondary education available in German and provide for the teaching in/of German in technical and vocational education, by also including bilingual education.
- c. Actively inform pupils and parents about the offer of German-language education and encourage them to make use of it.
- d. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the German language in Ukraine.
- e. Provide basic and further training for teachers of German as a minority language and ensure that there are adequate teaching materials available for German-language education at all levels of education.
- f. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of German and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.

Judicial authorities

- g. Encourage the practical use of German in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- h. Make available the most important national statutory texts in German.

Administrative authorities and public services

- i. Apply the Law of Ukraine “On the Principles of State Language Policy” to German and take concrete measures to encourage German speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- j. Encourage the use of German within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.

¹⁹ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

- k. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in German, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names in the Transcarpathia and Odesa/Odessa regions (e.g. Barbovo/Bardhaus, Lalovo/Mädchendorf, Verchnij Koropez/Oberschönborn).

Media

- l. Make adequate provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in German, including programmes for children, including in regions other than Transcarpathia.
- m. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to German on public radio and television in the Transcarpathia region.
- n. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in German, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- o. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in German.
- p. Facilitate the creation of at least one daily or weekly newspaper in German.
- q. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using German.

Cultural activities and facilities

- r. Provide long-term subsidies to the German speakers to set up or run cultural centres and other cultural facilities using this language.
- s. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in German.

2.6 Greek

2.6.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Greek

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Greek ²⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Greek as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Greek	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Greek				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Greek, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Greek • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Greek at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Greek to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Greek at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Greek		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Greek	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Greek among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Greek among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Greek • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Greek 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.iiii	make available pre-school education in Greek or a substantial part of pre-school education in Greek at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		↗			

²⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Greek²⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.b.iv	make available primary education in Greek, a substantial part of primary education in Greek or teaching of Greek as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.c.iv	make available secondary education in Greek, a substantial part of secondary education in Greek or teaching of Greek as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.d.iv	make available technical and vocational education in Greek, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Greek or teaching of Greek as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.e.iii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Greek or of facilities for the study of Greek as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.f.iii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Greek as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Greek					=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Greek		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Greek and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Greek is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Greek at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Greek, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				=	
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Greek in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Greek in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Greek					=
9.3	make available in Greek the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Greek				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Greek within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Greek				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Greek				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Greek²⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Greek in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Greek in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Greek				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Greek to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Greek					✓
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Greek on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Greek on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Greek				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Greek				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Greek				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Greek • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Greek • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Greek 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Greek are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Greek		✓			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Greek by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Greek to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Greek language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Greek in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Greek				=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which Greek is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Greek					✓
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Greek and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Greek	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Greek ²⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Greek in connection with economic or social activities					=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Greek is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Greek in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Greek, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Greek is used in identical or similar form	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

69. The use of Greek in pre-school education has slightly improved during the period under review, resulting in the partial fulfilment of Article 8 (1) aiii. However, the offer should be further extended beyond the current offer (two groups in Mariupol). The situation is better in primary and secondary education where Greek is taught as a subject, although the number of pupils receiving Greek lessons remains rather low, in particular in primary education. The teaching of Greek in technical and vocational education still has to be introduced. In order to strengthen the offer of Greek in pre-school and primary education, relevant basic and further training for teachers should be upgraded. Teaching materials concerning the history of the Greek minority have been provided, and Greek continues to be taught at university.

70. In court proceedings, Greek is not used. There is no information about the use of Greek in the field of administration.

71. It is also unclear whether Greek is still used on television, radio and in the print media. A number of cultural activities have been organised for the Greek minority, but it is not clear to what extent the Greek language has been used in them. Moreover, it is unclear if cultural activities have been organised in Greek in areas other than those where Greek is traditionally used (Article 12 (3)).

2.6.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Greek in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine²¹ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Greek, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Extend the offer of pre-school education in Greek.
- c. Provide basic and further training for teachers who would be able to use or teach Greek at pre-school level and ensure that there are teaching materials available for Greek-language education at all levels of education and year groups.
- d. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Greek and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.

Judicial authorities

- e. Encourage the practical use of Greek in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- f. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Greek.

Administrative authorities and public services

- g. Apply the Law of Ukraine “On the Principles of State Language Policy” to Greek and take concrete measures to encourage Greek speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- h. Encourage the use of Greek within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.
- i. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Greek, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names in the Odesa/Odessa and Kherson regions.

Media

- j. Make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Greek, including for children.
- k. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Greek, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- l. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Greek.
- m. Facilitate the creation of a weekly or daily newspaper in Greek.
- n. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Greek.

²¹ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

Cultural activities and facilities

- o. Secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities in order to provide stability for cultural activities in Greek.
- p. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Greek.
- q. Provide appropriate cultural activities and facilities to showcase the Greek language in territories other than those in which this language is traditionally used.

2.7 Hungarian

2.7.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Hungarian ²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Hungarian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Hungarian		=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Hungarian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Hungarian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Hungarian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Hungarian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Hungarian to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Hungarian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Hungarian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Hungarian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Hungarian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Hungarian 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Hungarian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Hungarian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				

²² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Hungarian ²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Hungarian, a substantial part of primary education in Hungarian or teaching of Hungarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Hungarian, a substantial part of secondary education in Hungarian or teaching of Hungarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Hungarian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Hungarian or teaching of Hungarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				✓	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Hungarian or of facilities for the study of Hungarian as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Hungarian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Hungarian		↗			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Hungarian	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Hungarian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Hungarian at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↗			
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Hungarian					=
9.3	make available in Hungarian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Hungarian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Hungarian within the framework of the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian				✓	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian				✓	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies				✓	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Hungarian²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies		=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Hungarian		=			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Hungarian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Hungarian		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Hungarian on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Hungarian on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Hungarian				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Hungarian	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Hungarian		↗			
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Hungarian 	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Hungarian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Hungarian	↗				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Hungarian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Hungarian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Hungarian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Hungarian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Hungarian	↗				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Hungarian				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Hungarian and the culture it reflects				✓	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Hungarian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Hungarian in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Hungarian ²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Hungarian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Hungarian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Hungarian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Hungarian is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

72. Teaching in Hungarian continues to be available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels of education in Transcarpathia. In pre-school education in Hungarian, the number of children enrolled has increased. However, the number of students in Hungarian-language secondary education has significantly decreased. Hungarian is still not used in technical and vocational education despite requests from the Hungarian minority. According to information received from the speakers, problems have arisen with regard to entrance examinations for university, which are now only possible in Ukrainian. The Committee of Experts looks forward to receiving further information on this issue in the next periodical report. Concerning Article 8 (1) g, the Committee of Experts now considers this undertaking partly fulfilled. A sufficient offer of teaching of the Hungarian history and culture in the schools with a Hungarian profile exists, but a corresponding offer seems to be lacking in Ukrainian mainstream schools in Transcarpathia.

73. As far as Articles 9 (1) aiii and biii are concerned, there is evidence of some Hungarian being used before courts, including by judges and in written documents (e.g. judgments), but Hungarian speakers are occasionally asked to have court documents translated at their expense into Ukrainian. Hungarian has the status of “regional language” at district and town levels in Transcarpathia. However, the administrative division of the Hungarian-speaking area into four districts makes it difficult to use Hungarian effectively in administration. In practice, Hungarian is used orally by local authorities in areas with a high percentage of Hungarians whereas there is hardly any written use (including on forms and in documents). Furthermore, the oral and written use of Hungarian by the regional authorities still has to be introduced. The use of Hungarian place names is limited to some place name signs and should be extended to the adoption of all relevant topographic names and their use in the related signage.

74. In the media, the duration of the programmes in Hungarian has been considerably increased on public television, but it has remained nearly the same on public radio, where some improvement is still needed. Furthermore, Hungarian is used by a private radio programme and a private television channel. There are also newspapers published in Hungarian and many cultural activities are organised in Hungarian. Article 12 (1) f is considered partly fulfilled, but there is a need to provide long-term subsidies to the Hungarian speakers to set up or run cultural centres. In addition, as a result of new information, Article 12 (1) g is now considered fulfilled. A body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Hungarian in the sense of Article 12 (1) g exists although it seems to focus only on folk arts rather than on more general cultural works in Hungarian.

2.7.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine²³ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Hungarian, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Make available technical and vocational education in Hungarian.
- c. Ensure the teaching of the history and culture which is reflected by the Hungarian language to the majority population in the area where Hungarian is used.
- d. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Hungarian and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.
- e. Provide teaching in or of Hungarian outside the areas where this language is traditionally used.

Judicial authorities

- f. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Hungarian.

Administrative authorities and public services

- g. Encourage the use of Hungarian within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.
- h. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Hungarian, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names in the Transcarpathia region.

Media

- i. Increase the broadcast time and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Hungarian on public radio and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Hungarian for children.

²³ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

- j. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Hungarian.

Cultural activities and facilities

- k. Provide long-term subsidies to the Hungarian speakers to set up or run cultural centres and other cultural facilities using this language.
- l. Provide appropriate cultural activities and facilities to showcase the Hungarian language in territories other than those in which this language is traditionally used.

2.8 Karaim

2.8.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Karaim

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Karaim ²⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Karaim as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Karaim					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Karaim					=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Karaim, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life					=
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Karaim • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Karaim at all appropriate stages					=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Karaim to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Karaim at universities or equivalent institutions					=
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Karaim					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Karaim					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Karaim among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Karaim among their objectives 					=
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Karaim • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Karaim 					=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

²⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

2.8.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Karaim in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts is not in a position to monitor the application of the Charter to Karaim (see page 6, paragraph 6 above).

2.9 Krimchak

2.9.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Krimchak

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Krimchak ²⁵	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Krimchak as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Krimchak					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Krimchak					=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Krimchak, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life					=
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Krimchak • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Krimchak at all appropriate stages					=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Krimchak to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Krimchak at universities or equivalent institutions					=
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Krimchak					=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Krimchak					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Krimchak among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Krimchak among their objectives 					=
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Krimchak • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Krimchak 					=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

²⁵ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

2.9.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Krimchak in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts is not in a position to monitor the application of the Charter to Krimchak (see page 6, paragraph 6 above).

2.10 Moldovan

2.10.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Moldovan

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Moldovan ²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Moldovan as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Moldovan	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Moldovan				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Moldovan, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Moldovan • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Moldovan at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Moldovan to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Moldovan at universities or equivalent institutions		↗			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Moldovan		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Moldovan	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Moldovan among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Moldovan among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Moldovan • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Moldovan 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Moldovan or a substantial part of pre-school education in Moldovan at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

²⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Moldovan ²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
		8.1.biv	make available primary education in Moldovan, a substantial part of primary education in Moldovan or teaching of Moldovan as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=		
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Moldovan, a substantial part of secondary education in Moldovan or teaching of Moldovan as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Moldovan, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Moldovan or teaching of Moldovan as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Moldovan or of facilities for the study of Moldovan as an university or higher education subject	↗				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Moldovan as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Moldovan				✓	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Moldovan		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Moldovan and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings	↗				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Moldovan is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Moldovan at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Moldovan, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				=	
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Moldovan in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Moldovan in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Moldovan					=
9.3	make available in Moldovan the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Moldovan				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Moldovan within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Moldovan				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Moldovan				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Moldovan in debates in their assemblies				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Moldovan²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Moldovan in debates in their assemblies				✓	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Moldovan				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Moldovan to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Moldovan		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Moldovan on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Moldovan on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Moldovan				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Moldovan	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Moldovan				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Moldovan • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Moldovan • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Moldovan 				=	
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Moldovan are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Moldovan		=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Moldovan by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				✓	
12.1.c	foster access in Moldovan to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Moldovan language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Moldovan in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Moldovan				=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which Moldovan is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Moldovan				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Moldovan and the culture it reflects		=			
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Moldovan	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Moldovan in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Moldovan ²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Moldovan is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Moldovan in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Moldovan, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Moldovan is used in identical or similar form	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

75. Teaching in Moldovan as well as teaching Moldovan as a subject is well-developed and available at primary and secondary levels. Concerning pre-school education, while available, this remains rather limited and there is a need to extend the network of educational institutions providing pre-school education in Moldovan. Moldovan is not taught in technical and vocational education. Moldovan can be studied at university (Article 8 (1) eiii). However, Ukraine does not as yet ensure the teaching of the history and the culture of the Moldovan minority (Article 8 (1) g). A dedicated mechanism responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in Moldovan teaching has been created (Article 8 (1) i).

76. Moldovan is still not recognised as a regional language in the sense of the language legislation. Accordingly, it is still not used in the courts. In administration, Moldovan is only used to a certain extent at local level. Moldovan is not used in local council meetings (Article 10 (2) f) because it does not have the status of a regional language in accordance with Ukrainian legislation.

77. Moldovan is present on public television and radio as well as in the press. However, the extent of the programmes broadcast in Moldovan in the public service network is so limited that the Committee of Experts still considers the undertaking of Article 11 (1) a iii as only partly fulfilled. Accordingly, there is a need to increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Moldovan. There is no offer of Moldovan on private radio and television. Only a few cultural activities have been organised with a view to promoting Moldovan. As far as the field of culture is concerned, Ukraine has not fostered access to works produced in Moldovan due to a lack of aid and development for translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling (Article 12 (1) b). Article 12 (1) f was considered partly fulfilled, but there is a need to provide long-term subsidies to the Moldovan speakers to set up or run cultural centres.

2.10.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Moldovan in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.10.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine²⁷ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Moldovan, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Extend the offer of pre-school education in Moldovan.
- c. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Moldovan.
- d. Provide basic and further training for teachers able to teach subjects in Moldovan.
- e. Provide teaching in or of Moldovan outside the areas where this is traditionally used.

Judicial authorities

- f. Encourage the practical use of Moldovan in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- g. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Moldovan.

Administrative authorities and public services

- h. Apply the Law of Ukraine “On the Principles of State Language Policy” to Moldovan and take concrete measures to encourage Moldovan speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- i. Encourage the use of Moldovan within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.
- j. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Moldovan, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names in the Odesa/Odessa region.

Media

- k. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Moldovan on public radio and television and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Moldovan for children.
- l. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Moldovan, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- m. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Moldovan.

²⁷ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

- n. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Moldovan.

Cultural activities and facilities

- o. Secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities in order to provide stability for cultural activities in Moldovan and provide long-term subsidies to the Moldovan speakers to set up or run cultural centres.
- p. Promote cultural activities to showcase Moldovan in various fields.
- q. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Moldovan.
- r. Provide appropriate cultural activities and facilities to showcase Moldovan in territories other than those in which this language is traditionally used.

2.11 Polish

2.11.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Polish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Polish ²⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Polish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Polish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Polish		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Polish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Polish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Polish at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Polish to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Polish at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Polish		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Polish	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Polish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Polish among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Polish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Polish 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.iiii	make available pre-school education in Polish or a substantial part of pre-school education in Polish at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

²⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Polish ²⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.b.iv	make available primary education in Polish, a substantial part of primary education in Polish or teaching of Polish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.c.iv	make available secondary education in Polish, a substantial part of secondary education in Polish or teaching of Polish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.d.iv	make available technical and vocational education in Polish, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Polish or teaching of Polish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.e.iii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Polish or of facilities for the study of Polish as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.f.iii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Polish as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Polish				✓	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Polish	↗				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Polish and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Polish is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Polish at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Polish, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↗		
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Polish in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Polish in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Polish					=
9.3	make available in Polish the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Polish				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Polish within the framework of the regional or local authority			↗		
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Polish				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Polish				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Polish in debates in their assemblies				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Polish²⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Polish in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Polish				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Polish to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Polish		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Polish on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Polish on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Polish	↗				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Polish	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Polish				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Polish • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Polish • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Polish 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Polish are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Polish	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Polish by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Polish to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Polish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	↗				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Polish in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Polish	↗				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Polish is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Polish	↗				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Polish and the culture it reflects		=			
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Polish	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Polish in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Polish ²⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Polish is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Polish in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Polish, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Polish is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

78. Polish is used as a medium of instruction in pre-school, primary and secondary education, although the offer at pre-school level is so limited that the Committee of Experts considers Article 8 (1) a iii only partly fulfilled. Considering the existing continuity from kindergarten to secondary education, Polish-language education should also be made available at technical and vocational level. Ukraine does not yet ensure the teaching of the history and the culture of the Polish minority (Article 8 (1) g). The provision of basic and further training for Polish teachers has improved during the period under review, with the result that Article 8 (1) h is now fulfilled.

79. Although Polish is a regional language at village level in the Chernivtsi region, this language is not used in judicial proceedings. There is no information about the use of Polish by local and regional authorities. Therefore, Articles 9 (1) aiii, biii and ciii as well as Article 10 (2) a are considered only formally fulfilled.

80. Public television and radio programmes are broadcast in Polish, although the extent of the broadcast duration and the frequency of the time slots are too limited. The Committee of Experts has received information that there are private radio programmes broadcast in Polish (Article 11 (1) bii). In addition, the Ukrainian authorities have encouraged the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Polish (Article 11 (1) d). Moreover, there are newspapers published in Polish.

81. As far as Article 12 is concerned, many cultural activities using Polish have been organised (Article 12 (1) d), including outside the area where Polish is traditionally used (Article 12 (2)). Ukraine has only to a limited extent fostered access to works produced in Polish by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling (Article 12 (1) b), hence this undertaking can only be considered partly fulfilled. At the same time, the authorities have facilitated the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Polish (Article 12 (1) g).

2.11.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Polish in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.11.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine²⁹ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Polish, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Extend the offer of pre-school education in Polish and make technical and vocational education in/of Polish available.
- c. Actively inform pupils and parents about the offer of Polish-language education and encourage them to make use of it.
- d. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Polish language.
- e. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Polish and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.

Judicial authorities

- f. Encourage the practical use of Polish in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- g. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Polish.

Administrative authorities and public services

- h. Take concrete measures to encourage Polish speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- i. Encourage the use of Polish within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.
- j. Promote the use or adoption of traditional and correct forms of place names in Polish, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names.

²⁹ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

Media

- k. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Polish on public radio and television and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Polish for children.
- l. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Polish, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- m. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Polish.

Cultural activities and facilities

- n. Secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities in order to provide stability for cultural activities in Polish.

2.12 Romani

2.12.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Romani ³⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Romani as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romani	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romani				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romani, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Romani • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romani at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romani to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romani at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romani				=	
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romani	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romani • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romani 		=			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

³⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

82. The Ukrainian authorities have produced teaching materials in Romani for the first and second school years of primary education. However, Ukraine still has to introduce the teaching of Romani at all appropriate levels of education. In the media, the public television broadcaster in Transcarpathia offers a weekly television programme using Romani and which covers culture, music and social issues. There is a need to extend and strengthen the offer of radio and television broadcasts in Romani. As Romani is not used in any other field of public life, Ukraine should adopt a structured approach to the implementation of the Charter to Romani, in co-operation with the speakers. For example, measures should be taken to support the presence of Romani in cultural life and to promote transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by the Charter, for this language.

2.12.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.12.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine³¹ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Romani, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.
- b. Take resolute action to promote Romani in order to safeguard it.

Education

- c. Introduce, on the basis of the existing curricula, the teaching of Romani at all appropriate levels of education and strengthen efforts to combat segregation.

Media

- d. Extend and strengthen the offer of radio and television broadcasts in the Romani language.

Cultural activities

- e. Take measures, in co-operation with the speakers, to support the presence of Romani in cultural life.

Transnational exchanges

- f. Promote appropriate types of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for Romani used in identical or similar form in two or more States.

³¹ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

2.13 Romanian

2.13.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romanian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement

↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Romanian ³²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Romanian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romanian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romanian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romanian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Romanian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romanian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romanian to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romanian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romanian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romanian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romanian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romanian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romanian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romanian 		=			
Part III of the Charter						
(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Romanian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Romanian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

³² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Romanian³²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Romanian, a substantial part of primary education in Romanian or teaching of Romanian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Romanian, a substantial part of secondary education in Romanian or teaching of Romanian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Romanian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Romanian or teaching of Romanian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Romanian or of facilities for the study of Romanian as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Romanian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Romanian				✓	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Romanian	↗				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Romanian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Romanian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Romanian at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Romanian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		↗			
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Romanian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations		↗			
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Romanian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Romanian					=
9.3	make available in Romanian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Romanian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Romanian within the framework of the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Romanian				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Romanian				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Romanian in debates in their assemblies				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Romanian³²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Romanian in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Romanian		=			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Romanian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Romanian		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Romanian on a regular basis		↗			
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Romanian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Romanian				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Romanian	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Romanian		=			
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Romanian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Romanian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Romanian 	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Romanian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Romanian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Romanian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				✓	
12.1.c	foster access in Romanian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				✓	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Romanian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Romanian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		↗			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Romanian		↗			
12.2	In territories other than those in which Romanian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Romanian				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Romanian and the culture it reflects		=			
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Romanian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Romanian in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Romanian ³²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Romanian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Romanian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Romanian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Romanian is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

83. Education in Romanian and the teaching of Romanian as a subject continues to be available in the Transcarpathia and Chernivtsi regions, except in technical and vocational education. More children attend pre-school education in Romanian than previously, although there is still a need to increase the network of educational institutions providing pre-school education in Romanian. There is also a need for improvement as regards the offer of primary and secondary education. In particular, the number of students attending secondary education in Romanian has significantly decreased, which would point to the need for improvement as regards the offer of Romanian secondary education. The Committee of Experts received sufficient information in the current monitoring cycle to consider Article 8 (1) h fulfilled, as both teachers who teach Romanian and those who teach various subjects in Romanian can receive their basic and further training in Ukraine. There are no indications that the Ukrainian authorities ensure the teaching of the history and the culture of the Romanian minority to pupils belonging to the Romanian minority and to pupils belonging to the majority population in the area where Romanian is used (Article 8 (1) g).

84. Romanian is a regional language at district and village levels in the Transcarpathia and Chernivtsi regions. There seems to be some use of Romanian in civil and criminal judicial proceedings in the Chernivtsi region. This does not seem to be the case in Transcarpathia. Therefore, Articles 9 (1) aiii and biii are partly fulfilled. Romanian is also used by some local authorities in Transcarpathia in official documents and council meetings. In the Novoselytsia/Noua Suliță district, Romanian is used in oral and written contacts with the population, on signs of buildings of local authorities, schools, medical centres and cultural institutions, in official journals and local council meetings. However, on the whole, the use of Romanian in courts and administration remains patchy and insufficient bearing in mind the number of Romanian speakers; a more structured approach to promote it is indeed needed.

85. In the media, the duration of the Romanian-language public television and radio programmes in Transcarpathia has been increased during the last years. Considering the number of Romanian speakers, however, the offer needs to be further extended. This also applies to private radio broadcasting in Romanian which so far exists only to a limited extent. Furthermore, the broadcasting of private television programmes in Romanian has to be encouraged.

86. The offer of cultural activities in Romanian remains good. However, there is no indication that Ukraine has supported translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling (Article 12 (1) b, c), and the undertaking is considered not fulfilled. The authorities have provided more specific information about the direct participation by representatives of the users of Romanian in planning and organising cultural activities (Article 12 (1) f) and Ukraine thus now partly complies with this undertaking. In Transcarpathia, a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Romanian (Article 12 (1) g) exists although it seems to focus only on folk arts rather than on more general cultural works in Romanian. However, it is not clear whether such a body also exists in Bukovina.

2.13.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romanian in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.13.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine³³ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Romanian, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Extend the offer of pre-school education, primary education and secondary education in Romanian as well as make technical and vocational education in/of Romanian available.
- c. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Romanian language.
- d. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Romanian and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.
- e. Provide, in co-operation with representatives of the Romanian speakers, teaching in or of Romanian outside the areas where this language is traditionally used.

Judicial authorities

- f. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Romanian.

Administrative authorities and public services

- g. Take concrete measures to encourage Romanian speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- h. Encourage the use of Romanian within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.

³³ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

- i. Continue efforts to restore the traditional and correct forms of place names in Romanian.

Media

- j. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Romanian on public radio and television and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Romanian for children.
- k. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Romanian, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- l. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Romanian.
- m. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Romanian.

Cultural activities and facilities

- n. Secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities in order to provide stability for cultural activities in Romanian and provide long-term subsidies to the Romanian speakers to set up or run cultural centres.
- o. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Romanian.
- p. Provide appropriate cultural activities and facilities to showcase the Romanian language in territories other than those in which this language is traditionally used.

2.14 Russian

2.14.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Russian ³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Russian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Russian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Russian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Russian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life	=				
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Russian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Russian at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Russian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Russian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Russian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Russian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Russian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Russian 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Russian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Russian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				

³⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Russian³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Russian, a substantial part of primary education in Russian or teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Russian, a substantial part of secondary education in Russian or teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Russian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Russian or teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Russian or of facilities for the study of Russian as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Russian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Russian					=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Russian	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Russian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Russian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Russian at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Russian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Russian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Russian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Russian	=				
9.3	make available in Russian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Russian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Russian within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Russian	=				
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Russian	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Russian in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Russian in debates in their assemblies	=				

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Russian ³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Russian	=				
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Russian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Russian	=				
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Russian on a regular basis	=				
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Russian on a regular basis	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Russian	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Russian	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Russian	↗				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Russian 	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Russian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Russian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Russian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Russian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Russian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Russian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Russian					=
12.2	In territories other than those in which Russian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Russian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Russian and the culture it reflects					=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Russian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Russian in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Russian ³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Russian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Russian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Russian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Russian is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

87. Ukraine has implemented most of its undertakings under the Charter in respect of Russian. The Russian language is used as a medium of instruction at all levels of education. Russian is the only language covered under the Charter which is used in technical and vocational education.

88. Furthermore, Russian has been granted the status of regional language and is used by administrative and judicial authorities, for example on official forms and announcements. There is also a broad offer of radio and television programmes in Russian as well as of newspapers in Russian. During the on-the-spot visit, the Ukrainian authorities informed the Committee of Experts of the blocking of some radio stations broadcasting from the Russian Federation and parts of Ukraine which are outside of the effective control of the Ukrainian authorities and considered as spreading anti-Ukrainian propaganda.

89. The Committee of Experts received information during this monitoring cycle indicating that the training of journalists and other media staff using Russian is supported (Article 11 (1) g). Furthermore, the interests of the users of Russian are to a certain extent represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media (Article 11 (3)).

90. There are also many cultural activities carried out in Russian and practically all the undertakings for Russian under Article 12 are fulfilled, with the exception of Article 12 (1) g. In addition, there is a strong presence of Russian in economic and social life.

2.14.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.14.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine³⁵ remain valid in their own right.

Education

- a. Ensure that education in Russian remains available to those pupils whose families so request.
- b. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Russian language.
- c. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Russian and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.

Administrative authorities and public services

- d. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Russian.

Cultural activities and facilities

- e. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Russian.

³⁵ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

2.15 Ruthenian

2.15.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ruthenian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Ruthenian ³⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Ruthenian as an expression of cultural wealth		=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ruthenian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ruthenian				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ruthenian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Ruthenian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ruthenian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ruthenian to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ruthenian at universities or equivalent institutions				=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ruthenian				=	
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ruthenian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ruthenian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ruthenian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ruthenian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ruthenian 				=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

³⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

91. Although the Law of Ukraine "On the Principles of State Language Policy" makes reference to Ruthenian, the Ukrainian authorities still do not unambiguously treat Ruthenian as a language in its own right. This unclear position of the Ukrainian authorities with regard to Ruthenian has prevented the development of a structured policy for the promotion of Ruthenian which is currently absent from most fields of public life. However, the public television broadcaster in Transcarpathia broadcasts a weekly television programme in Ruthenian and there are facilities offering Ruthenian courses outside the state education system. Ruthenian is also used in cultural activities.

2.15.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ruthenian in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.15.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine³⁷ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Ruthenian, a structured approach to the implementation of the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Develop and implement a comprehensive policy for teaching Ruthenian at all appropriate levels of education.

Transnational exchanges

- c. Promote appropriate types of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by the Charter, for Ruthenian.

Consultation

- d. Consult the representatives of the Ruthenian speakers regarding the implementation of the recommendations on the Charter and in the context of the drafting of the next periodical report.

³⁷ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

2.16 Slovak

2.16.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Slovak ³⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Slovak as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Slovak	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Slovak				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Slovak, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Slovak • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Slovak at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Slovak to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Slovak at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Slovak		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Slovak	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Slovak • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Slovak 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Slovak or a substantial part of pre-school education in Slovak at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	↗				

³⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Slovak³⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Slovak, a substantial part of primary education in Slovak or teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Slovak, a substantial part of secondary education in Slovak or teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Slovak, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Slovak or teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Slovak or of facilities for the study of Slovak as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Slovak as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Slovak				✓	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Slovak	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Slovak and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Slovak is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Slovak at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Slovak, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↗		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Slovak in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Slovak in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↗		
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Slovak					=
9.3	make available in Slovak the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Slovak				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Slovak within the framework of the regional or local authority		↗			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Slovak				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Slovak ³⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Slovak				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Slovak in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Slovak in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Slovak				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Slovak to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Slovak		=			
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Slovak on a regular basis		↗			
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Slovak on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Slovak				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Slovak				✓	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Slovak				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Slovak 	↗				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Slovak are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Slovak	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Slovak by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Slovak to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				✓	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Slovak language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	↗				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Slovak in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Slovak				=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which Slovak is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Slovak				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Slovak and the culture it reflects				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Slovak ³⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Slovak	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Slovak in connection with economic or social activities					=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Slovak is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Slovak in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Slovak, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Slovak is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

92. The situation of the Slovak language has improved in the fields of education, administration and media during the period under review. Slovak has been introduced in pre-school education. Teaching in Slovak is also offered at primary and secondary levels, but there is a need to extend the offer of Slovak education. Slovak is not yet taught in technical and vocational education. The undertaking of Article 8 (1) h is only partly fulfilled, which means that there is a need to improve the training for teachers providing education in Slovak and teaching the Slovak language. The history and the culture of the Slovak minority are not taught to pupils belonging to the Slovak minority or to pupils belonging to the majority population in the area where Slovak is used (Article 8 (1) g).

93. Furthermore, Slovak has obtained the status of regional language in two villages in Transcarpathia. As a result, the undertakings concerning judicial proceedings (Articles 9 (1) aiii, biii and ciii) are now formally fulfilled. However, full fulfilment of these undertakings would require that Slovak is also used in practice before courts. Slovak is to a certain extent used in local administration, but not in regional administration. Therefore, Article 10 (2) a is only partly fulfilled.

94. The duration of public radio and television programmes in Slovak has been extended during recent years. There is now also private radio broadcasting in Slovak, although the amount is so limited that the undertaking of Article 11 (1) b ii can only be considered partly fulfilled. The launch of private television broadcasting in this language is still pending. The Ukrainian authorities and the Slovak minority clarified in this monitoring cycle that there are no weekly or daily newspapers published in Slovak (Article 11 (1) ei).

95. The authorities support cultural activities and facilities using Slovak. The Ukrainian authorities have not fostered access in Slovak to cultural works in other languages (Article 12 (1) c). Nevertheless, the authorities now ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Slovak language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing (Article 12 (1) d).

2.16.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.16.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine³⁹ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Slovak, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Extend the offer of primary and secondary education in or of Slovak.
- c. Favour and/or encourage the offering of Slovak as a subject in adult and continuing education.
- d. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Slovak language.
- e. Provide basic and further training required for Slovak-language education for teachers and provide adequate teaching materials for Slovak-language education.
- f. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Slovak and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.
- g. Provide, in co-operation with representatives of the Slovak speakers, teaching in or of Slovak outside the areas where this language is traditionally used.

Judicial authorities

- h. Encourage the practical use of Slovak in criminal and civil proceedings as well as in proceedings concerning administrative matters in accordance with the undertakings ratified.
- i. Make available the most important national statutory texts in Slovak.

³⁹ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

Administrative authorities and public services

- j. Take concrete measures to encourage Slovak speakers to use their language in dealings with local and regional authorities.
- k. Encourage the use of Slovak within the framework of regional and local authorities, including in official documents and debates of local and regional assemblies.
- l. Promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in Slovak, *inter alia* by pursuing the restoration of historical place names in the Transcarpathia region.

Media

- m. Increase the duration of broadcasting and the frequency of the time slots allocated to Slovak on public radio and television and make adequate provision so that broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Slovak for children.
- n. Encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Slovak, for example through financial support or licensing requirements.
- o. Encourage the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Slovak.
- p. Encourage and/or facilitate the publication of a weekly or daily newspaper in Slovak.
- q. Develop and implement a specific scheme supporting the training of journalists and other media staff using Slovak.

Cultural activities and facilities

- r. Secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities in order to provide stability for cultural activities in Slovak and provide long-term subsidies to the Slovak speakers to set up or run cultural centres.
- s. Encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body or bodies responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Slovak.

2.17 Yiddish

2.17.1 Compliance of Ukraine with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yiddish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement
 ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Yiddish ⁴⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Yiddish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Yiddish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Yiddish				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Yiddish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Yiddish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 					=
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Yiddish at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Yiddish to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Yiddish at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Yiddish				=	
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Yiddish	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yiddish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yiddish among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Yiddish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Yiddish 		=			
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.iii	make available pre-school education in Yiddish or a substantial part of pre-school education in Yiddish at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		↗			

⁴⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Yiddish⁴⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Yiddish, a substantial part of primary education in Yiddish or teaching of Yiddish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				↙	
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Yiddish, a substantial part of secondary education in Yiddish or teaching of Yiddish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Yiddish, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Yiddish or teaching of Yiddish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Yiddish or of facilities for the study of Yiddish as an university or higher education subject	↗				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Yiddish as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Yiddish					=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Yiddish				=	
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Yiddish and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	
8.2	in territories other than those in which Yiddish is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Yiddish at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Yiddish, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned				=	
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Yiddish in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Yiddish in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.2.c	not to deny the validity, as between the parties, of legal documents drawn up within the country solely because they are drafted in Yiddish					=
9.3	make available in Yiddish the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Yiddish				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.a	use of Yiddish within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Yiddish				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Yiddish				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Yiddish in debates in their assemblies				=	

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Yiddish ⁴⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Yiddish in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Yiddish				=	
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Yiddish to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used				=	
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Yiddish				=	
11.1.bi i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Yiddish on a regular basis				=	
11.1.ci i	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Yiddish on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Yiddish				=	
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Yiddish				✓	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Yiddish				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Yiddish • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Yiddish • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Yiddish 				=	
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Yiddish are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Yiddish		=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Yiddish by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Yiddish to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Yiddish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				✓	
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Yiddish in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Yiddish				=	
12.2	In territories other than those in which Yiddish is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Yiddish				=	
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Yiddish and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Yiddish	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Yiddish in connection with economic or social activities					=

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Ukraine concerning Yiddish ⁴⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Yiddish is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Yiddish in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				=	
14.b	for the benefit of Yiddish, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Yiddish is used in identical or similar form				=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking or the Committee of Experts has over several monitoring cycles not received any information on the implementation.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Overall situation and changes in the evaluation compared to the last monitoring cycle

96. During the period under review, Yiddish has been introduced in state pre-school education (Article 8 (1) aiii) and is taught at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Article 8 (1) eiii). However, Yiddish is no longer taught in primary education (Article 8 (1) biv). It remains unclear to the Committee of Experts whether the teaching of the history and the culture of the Yiddish speakers is ensured (Article 8 (1) g). With the support of the Ukrainian authorities, a Yiddish dictionary has been published.

97. As Yiddish is not a regional language, Articles 9 (1) aiii, biii and ciii are not fulfilled. There are also no radio and television programmes in Yiddish. The Ukrainian authorities clarified in this monitoring cycle that there are no weekly or daily newspapers published in Yiddish (Article 11 (1) ei). Moreover, there are no indications that the authorities ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Yiddish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing (Article 12 (1) d). However, a few cultural activities using Yiddish have been organised. Apart from these, Yiddish is not used in any other field of public life and is in a particularly precarious situation. Against this background, the Ukrainian authorities should devise flexible and innovative measures for the actual application of the Charter undertakings to Yiddish. For example, such measures could comprise the establishment of one central educational institution for Yiddish. The application of the Charter to Yiddish could also benefit from co-operation with other states where this language is promoted under the Charter. Yiddish users in Ukraine could benefit, with the necessary adaptation, from the already existing infrastructure for this language in the media, education or culture abroad. Where other states are currently in a process of setting up a new infrastructure for Yiddish, these measures could be jointly implemented.

2.17.2 Recommendations on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yiddish in Ukraine

The Committee of Experts encourages the Ukrainian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.17.1 above). Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process. The following overview presents the recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Ukraine has not yet implemented as well as recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The Committee of Experts urges the Ukrainian authorities to implement these recommendations as a matter of priority. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Ukraine⁴¹ remain valid in their own right.

General issues

- a. Adopt, for Yiddish, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the speakers.

Education

- b. Provide for the teaching of Yiddish as a subject in primary and secondary education.
- c. Ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the Yiddish language.
- d. Provide the basic and further training of the teachers required to teach Yiddish and teaching materials for Yiddish-language education.
- e. Set up a supervisory body or bodies responsible for monitoring the measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Yiddish and for drawing up periodic reports of their findings, which will be made public.

Media

- f. Make adequate provision so that Yiddish is used in the media.

Cultural activities and facilities

- g. Promote cultural activities to promote Yiddish in different fields.

Transfrontier exchanges

- h. Apply or conclude agreements with other countries where Yiddish is used in such a way as to foster contacts between the users of the language in the fields covered by the Charter.

⁴¹ CM/RecChL(2010)6 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b0432); CM/RecChL(2014)1 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6abf)

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Ukrainian authorities have undertaken to protect the regional and minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes, on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Ukraine.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Bearing in mind the instrument of ratification submitted by Ukraine on 19 September 2005;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Ukraine;

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Ukrainian authorities on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Ukraine in its third periodical report, supplementary information given by the Ukrainian authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Ukraine and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

Recommends that Ukraine take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. adopt, for each language, a structured approach to the implementation of the undertakings under the Charter, in co-operation with the respective speakers;
2. develop and implement, for each Part III language, a comprehensive policy for teaching in/of these languages at all levels of education;
3. extend and strengthen the offer of radio and television broadcasts in the Part III languages;
4. ensure that the Part III languages can be used in practice in the field of administration;
5. promote the adoption and use of traditional and correct forms of place names in the minority languages;
6. secure long-term financial support for cultural facilities in order to provide stability for cultural activities in minority languages;
7. take resolute action to promote Romani in order to safeguard it.

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification



Ukraine:

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 19 September 2005 - Or. Engl.

Ukraine declares that the provisions of the Charter shall apply to the languages of the following ethnic minorities of Ukraine: Belorussian, Bulgarian, Gagauz, Greek, Jewish, Crimean Tatar, Moldavian, German, Polish, Russian, Romanian, Slovak and Hungarian.

Period covered: 1/1/2006 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s): 3

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 19 September 2005 - Or. Engl.

Ukraine undertakes obligations under Parts I, II, IV, V of the Charter except paragraph 5 of Article 7 of Part II.

Ukraine declares that the following paragraphs and subparagraphs of Article 8 to 14 of Part III of the Charter shall be applied with respect to each regional language listed above () to which the provisions of the Charter shall apply:*

- a. Subparagraphs a (iii), b (iv), c (iv), d (iv), e (iii), f (iii), g, h, i of paragraph 1, and paragraph 2 of Article 8;*
- b. Subparagraphs a (iii), b (iii), c (iii) of paragraph 1, subparagraph c of paragraph 2 and paragraph 3 of Article 9;*
- c. Subparagraphs a, c, d, e, f, g of paragraph 2, and subparagraph c of paragraph 4 of Article 10;*
- d. Subparagraphs a (iii), b (ii), c (ii), d, e (i), g of paragraph 1, paragraph 2 and paragraph 3 of Article 11;*
- e. Subparagraphs a, b, c, d, f, g of paragraph 1, paragraph 2 and paragraph 3 of Article 12;*
- f. Subparagraphs b and c of paragraph 1 of Article 13;*
- g. Subparagraphs a and b of Article 14.*

Ukraine declares that, in application of the provisions of the Charter, the measures aimed at the establishment of the Ukrainian language as the official language, its development and functioning in all spheres of social life in the whole territory of Ukraine shall not be construed as preventing or threatening the preservation or development of the languages to which the provisions of the Charter shall apply as stated above ().*

(*) [Note by the Secretariat: See the declaration made by Ukraine to Article 3 of the Charter, on 19 September 2005.]

Period covered: 1/1/2006 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s): 2

Appendix II: Comments from the Ukrainian authorities

“

To P. 2 of the Executive summary and Also Paragraph 6 of the Report (page 6)

The illegal occupation of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol¹ (hereinafter - Crimea) by the Russian Federation in February 2014, and further military interference of the Russian Federation in Ukraine, which led to the occupation of certain parts of Donetsk and Lugansk regions, negatively affected the human rights situation.

It is important to clearly indicate that the delegation of ECRML was unable to visit temporarily occupied Crimea, because the access of the delegation to these territories was denied by the Russian occupation authorities after the formal notification by the CoE Secretariat.

However, having no possible means to assess the situation with application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages on the occupied territories by national mechanisms, the Ukrainian Government calls on the Committee of Experts to continue its efforts in view to carry out the fact-finding visit to the territory of temporarily occupied Crimea. According to international humanitarian law, the Russian Federation as the occupying power bears the responsibility to ensure the safety of the whole population of temporarily occupied Crimea².

To p. 40 of short content (Transthcarpathian)

Secondary education in German is not provided due to the lack of students wishing to study in this language, but the German language is studied by foreign students in accordance with the curricula (including children from the German minority

To paragraph 48 of the summary and subsection 2.15. (Transthcarpathian)

¹ According to the CM decision "Situation in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol (Ukraine)" of May, 3 2017, Russian Federation called to uphold all of its obligations under applicable international humanitarian law, International human rights law, including the European Convention on Human Rights, and the Council of Europe principles and standards and to take all measures necessary to respect human rights in Crimea and to bring an immediate end to all violations of these rights.

² The Russian Federation as an occupying-state cannot be a party to the monitoring mechanism when it comes to temporarily occupied Crimea. Its participation should be limited to providing free access of the ECRML mission to the temporarily occupied territory of Crimea, and to ensuring its unfettered activities. Thereby, ECRML requests the Russian Federation as occupying power to ensure the access to Crimea and further will inform the Ukrainian Side on the reaction of the Russian Federation on the said request. When carrying out the fact-finding visits to the territory of the temporary occupied Crimea, the ECRML monitors should enter/leave the territory of temporarily occupied Crimea according to the national legislation of Ukraine.

In accordance with the decision of the regional council of December 21, 2012 № 652 "On the implementation of the norms of the Law of Ukraine" On the Principles of State Language Policy "it was noted that in the territory of separate administrative-territorial units of the region (villages, towns and cities), along with the Ukrainian language, as State-wide, as regional, Hungarian, Romanian and Rusyn. At the same time, today the Rusyn language in Ukraine is not codified. Speaking of Transcarpathians differ in vocabulary and phonetics, so different versions of the Ruthenian language also differ in vocabulary and spelling. At the same time, the local authorities contribute to the satisfaction of the ethno-cultural needs of the Rusyns and the development of their identity.

In the region, 11 Rusyn NGOs with the status of oblast, which have city-districts and primary cells, are legalized.

In order to meet the informational needs of the Rusyns, a joint editorial board of the programs of the languages of national minorities functioning in the Rusyn language and on the basis of the branch of the National Television and Radio Company "Transcarpathian Regional Directorate" operates. The weekly editorial (Tuesday and Saturday) broadcasts the program "Rusyn Family". The journal Ottuznina is published in the same language.

Public organizations of Rusyns have the opportunity to exercise their statutory activities at the Center for the Cultures of National Minorities of Transcarpathia, whose activities are financed from the regional budget. Every year the regional festival of Rusyn culture "Cherven Ruga" is held for the organizational and financial support of the regional state administration.

p. 29

The National Council of Television and Radio Broadcasting of Ukraine

Article 24 of the Law of Ukraine "On Basic Principles of the State Language Policy" foresees that TV and radio organizations of Ukraine can at their own disposal provide broadcasting in the state language, in regional languages or in languages of minorities, in languages of international communication and other languages – either one language or several languages. The volumes of state-wide, regional and local broadcasting in the state language, in regional languages or in languages of minorities have to comply with the density of language groups and shall be defined by broadcasters by themselves, except for the cases provided for by the Law of Ukraine "On Television and Radio Broadcasting" on the compulsory share of songs in the state language, share of programmes in the state language, as well as on increasing of programmes amount in the Ukrainian language in the TV broadcasting (commencing 13 October 2017).

The powers of the National Council related to regulation of existence of foreign programmes in the networks of programme service providers of Ukraine, which are the licensees of the National Council, are enshrined in paragraph 2 of Article 42 of the Law of Ukraine "On Television and Radio Broadcasting" (The economic entity, which is under the jurisdiction of Ukraine, intends to retransmit programmes and has obtained a relevant permission from a rights holder (producer),

which is not under the jurisdiction of either an EU Member-State or a state that has ratified the European Convention on Transfrontier Television, has the right to retransmit programmes only subject to their content compliance with the requirements of the legislation of Ukraine, the European Convention on Transfrontier Television and subject to their inclusion into the list of programmes that can be retransmitted according to the decision of the National Council of Television and Radio Broadcasting of Ukraine).

As of 26 June 2017 the *List of programmes content of which complies with the requirements of the European Convention on Transfrontier Television and the legislation of Ukraine* includes 161 foreign programmes which are under the jurisdiction of 20 countries, where 13 countries are EU countries, that makes 93.1% out of all foreign programmes which broadcast in the territory of Ukraine. In particular, broadcasting is provided fully or partially in the Polish language (10 programmes), in the German language (3 programmes), in the Bulgarian language (2 programmes), in the Belarusian language (2 programmes).

The National Council does not keep regular records related to TV and radio programmes intended to meet the language needs of ethnic minorities in Ukraine. However, the regional central offices of the National Public Broadcasting Company of Ukraine (NPBCU) and a number of private TV and radio companies in their programmes broadcasting use languages of ethnic minorities, which densely populate certain territory.

By the way of example, the following can be provided. In order to meet the information needs of ethnic minorities of Bukovyna the Chernivetska Regional Central Office of the NPBCU prepares TV (analogue and digital formats) and radio programmes in the Romanian language. The Odesa Regional Central Office regularly provide broadcasting of TV programmes in the Moldavian and Gagauz languages, as well as two more private companies broadcast weekly programmes in the Bulgarian language, and in the Moldavian and Gagauz languages as well. For example, in Lviv and Zhytomyr Regions private TV and radio companies broadcast programmes in the Polish language. In Zakarpattia Region the Regional Central Office of the NPBCU broadcast programmes in the Rusyn, Hungarian, Romanian, Slovak and German languages. Moreover, in this region there are radio stations broadcasting in the Hungarian language. Concerning the Crimean-Tatar language in Ukraine there broadcast the LLC TVC "Atlant-SV" (call sign "Radio Meidan" and the logo "ATR T").

Moreover, the National Council takes all possible measures foreseen by the legislation in order to prevent and cease broadcasting of programmes of anti-Semitic and xenophobic nature in the media area of Ukraine.

Concerning facilitation of producing of programmes for children in languages of minorities, as well as encouraging broadcasting by private TV and radio companies of programmes in languages of ethnic minorities via financial support and licensing regime facilitation please be informed that according to the Methodology of calculation of the amounts of licensing fee for issuance or renewal of a broadcasting license and issuance of a duplicate broadcasting license, of a programme service provider license (the amended Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 412) there foreseen a possibility to reduce the amount of a license fee if a TV and

radio organization in its programme content uses mainly programmes of domestic and/or children, educational programmes of domestic production.

Related to presenting interests of minorities in the bodies that guarantee media freedom and pluralism it should be mentioned that one of the Members of the Steering Council of the NPBCU is a representative of non-governmental organizations in the area of ethnic minorities, who ensures their rights in the public service broadcasting. This representative was elected at the election conference by preferential voting among candidates from organizations and association. In this very area there were held two election conferences, since the first conference failed to elect a representative. The repeated conference had 53 applicants, 32 ones of which were allowed to participate in the conference.

The State Committee for Television and Radio Broadcasting

By 2016, the State Committee for Television and Radio Broadcasting in accordance with the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine dated July 13, 2004 No. 918 "On Approval of the Provisions concerning the State Order for the Production and Distribution of Television and Radio Programs" concluded State Contracts with subordinate TV and Radio Organizations for the Implementation of the State Order for the Production and Broadcasting of Television and Radio programs for state needs for a year.

An integral part of the relevant State Contract includes thematic plans for the production and broadcast of television and radio programs that determined the content of the state order. During the elaborating of thematic plans the broadcasting organization were guided by the Methodological recommendations of the State Committee for Television and Radio Broadcasting for the relevant year, which determined the main thematic areas of broadcasting and proved the List of legal acts for mandatory inclusion in the formation of thematic content. In addition, during the year, the TV and radio companies reported other normative and legal acts that included the task of promoting the activities of the supreme bodies of state power, events, highlights and dates of national importance, as well as informing about the work done.

In 2016, volumes of state-owned television and radio companies' own production of audio and audiovisual productions in the languages of minorities and other foreign languages were as follows:

#	Name of the State Television and Radio Broadcasting Company	Language	Volume of program production, hour/year	% of the licensed volume of broadcasting
TV Broadcasting				
1	Transcarpathian Regional State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company	Hungarian	89,9	1,0
		Romanian	60,2	0,7
		Slovak	60,8	0,7
		German	34,7	0,4
		Roma	17,3	0,2
		Ruthenian	26,0	0,3

5

		Russian	22,5	0,3
2	Odesa Regional State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company	Moldavian	24,9	0,3
		Bulgarian	25,3	0,3
		Gagauzian	24,7	0,3
		Russian	120,5	1,4
3	Chernivtsi Regional State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company	Romanian	92,6	1,1
Radio Broadcasting				
1	Zhytomyr Regional State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company	Polish	4,8	0,6
		Czech	4,8	0,6
2	Transcarpathian Regional State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company	Hungarian	154,3	1,8
		Romanian	107,3	1,2
		Slovak	51,1	0,6
		German	51,1	0,6
		Roma	17,4	0,2
		Ruthenian	17,4	0,2
		Russian	17,4	0,2
3	Odesa Regional State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company	Moldavian	25,0	0,3
		Bulgarian	26,0	0,3
		Gagauzian	38,0	0,4
		Russian	17,3	0,2
4	Chernivtsi Regional State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company	Romanian	174,1	7,8
5	National State TV and Radio Broadcasting Company of Ukraine	English	2561,8	29,2
		German	733,2	8,4
		Russian	1463,6	15,3
		Romanian	688,1	7,9

At the same time, we attract attention that according to the laws of Ukraine "On Public Television and Radio Broadcasting of Ukraine", "On State Registration of Legal Entities and Individual Entrepreneurs", "On the Management of State Property Objects" and the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine dated August 5, 2015 No 567 "Some Issues of the Establishing of the Public Company "National Public Broadcasting Company of Ukraine", the National Television Company of Ukraine and its affiliates (formerly ОДТРК) on January 19, 2017 were transformed into a public joint-stock company" National Public Broadcasting Company of Ukraine (hereinafter PJSC "NPBCU").

One of the main tasks of PJSC "NPBCU" is the development and strengthening of the status of Ukrainian language and culture, promotion of the development of languages and cultures of national minorities.

In accordance with clauses 2 and 3 of Article 3 of the Law of Ukraine "On Public Television and Radio Broadcasting of Ukraine" (hereinafter - the Law)

6

interference of state bodies and local self-government bodies, their officials and civil servants, as well as non-governmental organizations in the activity of the NPBCU in order to establish censorship, preliminary control and illegal influence on the content of information promulgated by the Public Television and Radio Broadcasting of Ukraine is prohibited. The obligations of the Public Television and Radio Broadcasting of Ukraine regarding the distribution of reports of the authorities are determined solely by this Law.

Also, in accordance with the requirements of the Law, the NPBCU Statute contains a provision prohibiting interference by the shareholder (State Committee for Television and Radio Broadcasting) and other subjects of power in its editorial policy.

According to clause 2 of Article 18 of the Law, the NPBCU is not obliged to cover the activities of executive authorities, other state bodies, local self-government bodies, and their officials.

Therefore, the issue of information providing or coverage of certain events, the organization of broadcasting in the languages of national minorities is currently exclusively belongs to the competence of PJSC "NPBCU" and in accordance with the Law cannot be coordinated by state authorities.

p. 38 and 59

(Zaporizhzhya Regional State Administration)

In Melitopol Crimean Tatar language is optionally learned at 2 educational institutions: secondary school of I-III grades № 22 and secondary school of I-III grades № 13. In general there are 16 pupils in both institutions, which attend classes of Crimean Tatar. Therefore there is no necessity in increasing of educational institutions quantity; this issue depends on parental wish to learn Crimean Tatar by their children. Moreover there is Sunday school at the Palace of Culture named by T. Shevchenko, which provides lessons of Crimean Tatar for children and adults. This school works with support of municipal government.

p. 55

(Zaporizhzhya Regional State Administration)

Since 2002 there have been optional classes of Bulgarian at Melitopol State Pedagogical University named by B. Khmelnytskyi.

At the time we inform that Regional State Administration positively takes the results evaluation comparing with the previous Report of European Experts Committee

p. 72 of subsection 2.7.

(Transthcarpathian)

For graduates of comprehensive educational institutions with teaching in national minority languages, the tests of subjects of external independent assessment

of knowledge in their languages are translated (tests on history of Ukraine, world history, mathematics, biology, geography, physics, chemistry, if necessary, translated by Hungarian, Crimean Tatar, Moldavian, Polish, Russian, Romanian, world literature - in Russian), with the exception of the test of Ukrainian language and literature and foreign languages. The language of the test is chosen by persons who have expressed a desire to undergo an external assessment.

Due to the lack of relevant applications from students (for minors - from parents or persons who are replacing them), lack of educational literature and specialists who are ready to provide high-quality vocational training, vocational schools in the region do not teach subjects in the languages of national minorities.

p. 73 of subsection 2.7.
(Transthcarpathian)

In the places of compact residence of Hungarians, according to the decisions of the regional council, according to local referendums held in settlements, the corresponding resolutions of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine, some settlements of the region returned the former names (a total of 42). Toponyms (names of settlements, streets, etc.) are created and submitted in Ukrainian, and in the settlements where compact representatives of the Hungarian community live, the pointers are submitted in the official language and language of the given national, executed in accordance with the applicable standards.

To subsection 2.11 ("Education"). From 2017-2018 academic year, the Faculty of Philology of the Uzhhorod National University introduces the preparation of bachelors and masters in the specialty "Polish Language and Literature", where students will receive the qualification of a language teacher, a philologist, a researcher of the Polish language, an interpreter.

To item 2.12.2 of subsection 2.12.
(Transthcarpathian)

In the 2016/2017 academic year, a special course "Roma Studios" was introduced at the Uzhgorod National University. After completing the course, students receive knowledge in the field of Romance.

In June 2017 a book was published in the Romanian language "Signs and Superstitions of the Roma of Transcarpathia" (authors: historian E. Navrotska and Roman activist V. Chovka).

p. 83 of subsection 2.13.
(Transthcarpathian)

In colleges of general education in Romanian, students study the history and culture of the Romanian people in grades 10-11. At the educational hours in grades 5-9 of these schools, conversations are held on culture, customs, Romanian ceremonies.

p. 92 of subsection 2.16.**(Tranскарпатіан)**

Representatives of the Slovak minority have the opportunity to study in their native language at the specialized secondary school of the I - III grades № 4 with in-depth study of the Slovak language of the Uzhgorod City Council. There are 11 classes in this general education institution, and 363 students study. Primary classes are taught in Slovak, as a separate subject Slovak is taught in grades 5-11.

In order to develop the creative abilities of students in accordance with their cognitive interests in the 10th-11th forms of the above-mentioned educational institution, electives "Slovak Country Studies" and "Literature" (Slovak) were introduced. Five teachers from the Slovak Republic work in the school: four are primary school teachers, one teacher teaches Slovak in grades II and III.

In addition, according to the educational needs of the population of the region, 720 students in the 10 regional secondary schools study the Slovak language, which is 143 students more than in the 2015/2016 school year.

p. 6 of the recommendations to Ukraine, which should be taken into account as a matter of priority.**(Tranскарпатіан)**

In order to meet the needs of national minorities in the region, regional programs are implemented, in particular, the Program for the development of education, culture, traditions of the national minorities of the region for 2016-2020, the Program "Center for the Cultures of National Minorities of Transcarpathia" for 2016-2020 and the Program "Roma Population of Transcarpathia on 2016-2020 years" (the estimated funding amounts to UAH 8727.6 thousand). In addition, measures and expenditures for the cultural and artistic needs of the national communities are part of the programs on culture, education, and culture Mass media and programs of socio-economic development of the oblast, regions and cities where representatives of national minorities live compactly.

At the same time, representatives of public organizations of national minorities have the opportunity to exercise their statutory activities on the basis of the Center for the Cultures of National Minorities of Transcarpathia, whose activities are financed from the regional budget).