TEACHING 20TH CENTURY WOMEN'S HISTORY: A CLASSROOM APPROACH

A teaching pack designed for use in secondary schools

by Ruth Tudor

with contributions from
Elena Osokina and Philip Ingram

The **Council of Europe** was founded in 1949 to achieve greater unity between European parliamentary democracies. It is the oldest of the European political institutions and has forty-one member states,[1] including the fifteen members of the European Union. It is the widest intergovernmental and interparliamentary organisation in Europe, and has its headquarters in Strasbourg.

With only questions relating to national defence excluded from the Council of Europe's work, the Organisation has activities in the following areas: democracy, human rights and fundamental freedoms; media and communication; social and economic affairs; education, culture, heritage and sport; youth; health; environment and regional planning; local democracy; and legal co-operation.

The **European Cultural Convention** was opened for signature in 1954. This international treaty is also open to European countries that are not members of the Council of Europe, and enables them to take part in the Council's programmes on education, culture, sport and youth. So far, forty-seven states have acceded to the European Cultural Convention: the Council of Europe's full member states plus Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Bosnia and Herzegovina, the Holy See and Monaco.

The **Council for Cultural Co-operation** (CDCC) is responsible for the Council of Europe's work on education and culture. Four specialised committees – the Education Committee, the Higher Education and Research Committee, the Culture Committee and the Cultural Heritage Committee help the CDCC to carry out its tasks under the European Cultural Convention. There is also a close working relationship between the CDCC and the standing conferences of specialised European ministers responsible for education, culture and the cultural heritage.

The CDCC's programmes are an integral part of the Council of Europe's work and, like the programmes in other sectors, they contribute to the Organisation's three main policy objectives:

– the protection, reinforcement and promotion of human rights and fundamental freedoms and pluralist democracy;
– the promotion of an awareness of European identity;

---

1. Albania, Andorra, Austria, Belgium, Bulgaria, Croatia, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Georgia, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Italy, Latvia, Liechtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, Moldova, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Russian Federation, San Marino, Slovak Republic, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", Turkey, Ukraine, United Kingdom.

– the search for common responses to the great challenges facing European society.

The CDCC's education programme covers school and higher education. At present, there are projects on education for democratic citizenship, history, modern languages; school links and exchanges; educational policies; training for educational staff; the reform of legislation on higher education in central and eastern Europe; the recognition of qualifications; lifelong learning for equity and social cohesion; European studies for democratic citizenship; and the social sciences and the challenge of transition.

About the teaching pack

Produced by the Council of Europe's CDCC project "Learning and teaching about the history of Europe in the 20th century", *Teaching 20th century women's history* is a teaching resource designed to integrate women's history into current classroom practice throughout Europe.

The issue of "women" occupies very different places in European society. In parts of Europe, women's studies are in their nascent stage. In others, the topic is mainstream in the media and the young are confronted with the mass of information that this entails. In some countries, radical forces of both the extreme right and left have claimed to serve the cause of "women's rights".

Within European schools' curricula, the status and quality of women's history is variable. While some countries have made women's history a legal requirement within the school curriculum, others are beginning to introduce it. In all European countries there is a shortage of resources to support the teaching of women's history at school level. In view of its vital link to democratic society, one of the aims of this book is to make the study of women a topical issue in the classroom. Given the elusive and sometimes sensitive nature of the subject, the school is surely one of most credible places to examine it.

It is also our intention that this teaching pack will contribute to young people's understanding of gender equality, including the social and individual forces that have and still do push against it. Without equality of opportunity between all of Europe's citizens, regardless of their sex, precious resources are lost and European democracy can only be partial.

The main author and designer of this material, Ruth Tudor, has used a holistic approach by focusing on the tangled and sometimes hidden links between work, family, culture, war and politics which have shaped women's experiences. She also encourages teachers to use a critical and a hands-on approach within their teaching. Students should be enabled to engage critically with a variety of sources on the past, including under exploited ones such as oral history, photography and media.

Currently working in London as an education consultant, she has been a history teacher at secondary level and has had responsibility for the history curriculum in England at national level. She has also written educational resources for a number of organisations including the BBC, Channel 4 and has been involved in teacher training throughout Europe.

Elena Osokina is currently a senior research fellow at the Institute of Russian History at the Russian Academy of Sciences. She has also been a visiting scholar at the Hoover Institution Archives at Stanford University in California, and at the Maison des Sciences de l'Homme in Paris. Her latest book, *Our daily bread: socialist distribution and the art of survival in Stalin's Russia* (M.E. Sharpe, publisher) will be published in the United States this year.

Phil Ingram, a specialist in oral history, has taught history in secondary schools for fourteen years in England. Currently working on a textbook about the Holocaust, he has written school textbooks on *Russia 1900-1999,* Key stage 4 textbook (Cambridge University Press, 1997) and *The 20th century world,* Keystage 3 textbook (Hodder and Stoughton Publishers, 2000).

CONTENTS

I. USING THE PACK

Introduction

This teaching pack has been designed to meet the aims and objectives of the Council of Europe's project on "Learning and teaching about the history of Europe in the 20th century". These aims and objectives are as follows:

- to interest young people in secondary schools in the recent history of our continent;
- to provide curriculum developers, textbook authors and history teachers with practical advice and examples of innovatory approaches and good practice;
- to appreciate the richness and diversity of European history and understand the forces, movements and events which have shaped Europe in the 20th century;
- to understand the historical roots and context of the main challenges facing Europe today;
- to reflect on the kind of Europe in which they may wish to live in future;
- to acquire attitudes which are essential for citizens of democratic pluralist societies, in particular intellectual honesty, open-mindedness, respect for truth, tolerance, acceptance of difference, empathy and civil courage;
- to develop key skills of investigation, research and critical thinking, in particular the handling and analysis of written and audiovisual sources and the detection of bias, distortion and propaganda.

Who is the pack for?

The pack has been written for teachers of 14- to 18-year-olds. This age group has particular and distinctive needs. It is the age when young people begin to acquire and exercise rights and responsibilities and begin to make decisions that affect their own lives and the lives of those around them in fundamental ways.

Therefore, it is crucial that this age range is offered an education which enables their decisions and actions to be informed by knowledge and understanding of real people and events from the past, based on reasoning and reflecting the values and issues outlined in the aims and objectives of the project. They will need to have a sense of their identity and their own ability to

contribute to and transform the society in which they live. In addition, these young people will need to function effectively in societies where global communications predominate and the skills of flexibility and transferability are crucial requirements both in the world of employment and the wider society.

The approach taken to the history of women in the pack will develop the above skills and qualities. The emphasis is on integration of skills with knowledge and understanding, rather than the acquisition of knowledge in itself. This approach has the potential to enable students to ask meaningful and relevant questions and be critical in their thinking. It will develop a wide range of enquiry skills, including the ability to use a range of diverse sources of information, handle evidence and think analytically. By addressing sensitive and controversial issues, it will foster tolerance and the ability to think about moral dilemmas in a responsible way.

The contents of the pack have been written for the teachers of this age group. A significant challenge of this work has been to produce a pack that can benefit a very wide range of teacher practice that takes place in a range of diverse settings/contexts. As a result, teachers will need to *select* and *adapt* from the pack as appropriate to their own teaching and learning context. Guidance on how to select and adapt is given. This guidance also demonstrates how the pack can be adapted for younger or older children.

10

Teaching and learning issues[1]

Teaching and learning women's history in school

The process of teaching and learning women's history in school can involve:

- challenging whole school values and beliefs as expressed in whole school policies and practices;
- rethinking history's contribution to the whole school curriculum in relation to the representation, rights and needs of minorities;
- identifying opportunities to collaborate with other curriculum areas to support education about women's role in and contribution to society, for example history and science through a study of Marie Curie, history and literature through the study of Eugenia Ginzburg;
- challenging values, beliefs and attitudes, for example, recognising and addressing stereotypes, tackling sensitive issues and taking risks;
- recognising that women are a diverse group that represent a range of ethnic groups and social classes.

Within the world of the classroom this may involve:

- questioning and being critical of the current curriculum/syllabus/resources in terms of their content and approach;
- rethinking what is important about the past, for example, what we select to teach, therefore, necessarily involves teaching children that history is not the same as the past but a construct that involves selection, interpretation and presentation;
- recognising and making explicit to students that the history that is taught is, therefore, dependent on time and place and will change according to time and place;
- shifting our attention from the political sphere to the social and economic;
- recognising the relationship between the private and personal lives of women and the broader picture – in other words – that the personal is political;
- a shift in the sources used to find out about the past to focus in greater depth on local, personal, oral history;
- a shift from a knowledge-based approach to a more integrated knowledge and skills approach;
- enabling students to be historians themselves;

---

1. The points below will be more/less relevant depending on the starting points of the teacher, school, society, which are very diverse.

11

- identifying whether the amount of time dedicated to women's studies is dependent on the sex of the teacher and/the students in the class and, if so, whether this relationship is valid.

Assessment and learning issues

Teaching women's history can involve fundamental changes to our teaching practice. In short, it may not be possible to teach women's history through "traditional" didactic/teacher centred pedagogy. Instead we may need to empower students to challenge both the current approach to historical thinking in our classrooms and the wider society, as well as the historical content. This shift in how we teach our subject will involve looking at assessment issues in relation to learning.

The relationship of learning to assessment

There is a close and intimate relationship between learning and assessment which needs to be recognised by teachers when planning their lessons. Assessments show students which aspects of the learning experience we value most and, therefore, influence the nature of the learning process. For example, if our assessments consist of short answers which require students to recall factual information, learning experiences will be limited to rote learning. As a result other types of learning, such as conceptual understanding or the higher order knowledge skills of selection and organisation, will be neglected. Assessment then will involve the following questions:

- What types of learning are we prioritising/focusing on?
- What messages are we sending to students about what we value and consider important?
- Are we learning about and assessing areas that are sufficiently important and meaningful?
- Do the learning experiences that we offer enable the student to see the world in a different way?

Fitness for purpose

Fitness for purpose is a necessary and vital part of designing assessments that will raise the quality of learning. In ensuring/enhancing the "fitness for purpose" of a particular assessment, we need to ask the following questions:

- Are the learning objectives clear, meaningful and relevant to the students?
- Has the activity been designed in such a way that the learning objectives can be achieved?
- Is the activity interesting and challenging for all students?
- Will all students be able to demonstrate achievement in this activity?
- Are there a variety of ways, for example, through speaking, writing, drawing, etc. that the students can demonstrate achievement (what they know, understand and can do)?

- In what ways can the achievements of the students be recorded?

Status of women's history and assessment

The relationship between learning and assessment has a particular relevance to the study of the history of women. The status of a topic is closely affected by its assessment. Is the topic being assessed? Why? Why not? How is it being assessed?

For example, personal and social education is often seen as less important by students because it is not formally assessed. It may be important, therefore, to recognise that if the women's history that you do is never formally assessed – for instance, for certification purposes, this will send powerful messages to students about the relative importance of women's history compared to "other" history. There are a number of ways this problem can be approached:

- Is it possible to include women's history in work for an external examination? This could be in the form of a piece of personal research by the student which forms part of their examination.

- Are there opportunities to include aspects of women's history within the current syllabus content? For example, the experience of totalitarianism within the Soviet Union/nazi Germany is a popular option on many external examination syllabuses. How can we make sure that we study these topics from the perspective of women as well as men? What are the differences and the similarities in their experience?

- How can women's history be more formally assessed internally? Could it form part of the way you reach your judgements about student performance? This may be more possible with younger/non-examination classes.

Informal/formal assessment

As teachers we need to be aware that we are consistently making judgements about all students within the classroom. Assessment is therefore an on-going process, which we may be more or less aware of at different times. It is important to recognise that we, as teachers, may have our own unexamined assumptions/beliefs about the relative performance of different groups of students in the classroom. In short, we may have our own biases/prejudices that limit our expectations of particular groups, for example, girls. As teachers, we need to ask ourselves the following questions:

- What types of assumptions/prejudices do we have as teachers about different groups of students?

- How can we make ourselves more aware of our own, possibly biased, behaviour within the classroom? For example, we could use a critical friend to monitor a lesson, recording the number of times we interact with a particular group of students. How does our behaviour (questioning, discussion, giving time to) vary between female and male students?
- What does our own use of language say about our own beliefs and prejudices? How can we avoid bias through our use of language? How could we use a "critical friend" to monitor our own use of language?

Alternative assessments: self-assessment

An alternative and potentially productive way of assessing student achievements is through self-assessment. Self-assessment can be an important way of enabling all students to develop their understanding of what they are trying to achieve, how they can achieve it and how they can improve their own performance. In order to be able to self-assess in history, students will need to understand as precisely as possible what are the aims and learning objectives of the lesson/activity and be given opportunities to reflect on their own performance in relation to the learning objectives. It may be desirable, therefore, to share the learning objectives with the students. In this way students can see the point of the exercise and have a better chance of demonstrating learning outcomes in terms of knowledge, understanding and skills. In this way, students are given greater responsibility for their own learning and achievements and this should enhance their sense of ownership of the learning process.

It is very important to think about whether all students, regardless of gender, recognise and value their own achievements? That is – do girls and boys self-assess to the same standard and in the same way? Are there differences in what they value in their learning and achievements?

15

Selecting and adapting

One of the challenges of this pack is that it is intended to work effectively in a variety of contexts/settings. Context is crucial in determining how successful a particular teaching and learning experience will be in practice. It is probably neither possible nor desirable to simply "lift" the broad approach or specific activities from the pack without giving some thought to your own particular circumstances. For example, an activity which involves group work will be more or less successful depending on to what extent teachers and students are used to group work, the environment in which it takes place and the resources available. This does not mean that teachers and students should not take risks with the pack and use it to try out innovations in the classroom. However, some thought will need to be given to how the pack and particular activities within it can/should be selected and adapted to your own circumstances.

Selecting from the pack

A list of points that may help to inform selection and adaptation in relation to context is given below. In selecting aspects of the pack and its activities, consider the following:

- What type of teacher expertise (knowledge, confidence, commitment) is needed?
- What sorts of resources are needed?
- What learning skills, for example, independent research, group work, oral presentations, will the students need to have?
- What type of approach to classroom management will be more/less appropriate? For example, student centred/teacher centred?
- Is the wider school context, for example, policies and practices, appropriate to the approach you may take in history lessons?

Adapting for older children

In adapting aspects of the pack and its activities for older students, consider the following:

- offer less guidance and give less structure to tasks;
- deal with a wider range of issues and in greater depth;
- identify links and connections between different areas of learning, for example, compare and contrast local, national, international trends;
- encourage greater independence of thought;
- enable students to conduct own research;
- use a more varied range and more complex sources of evidence;

16

- raise expectations regarding skills of selecting and combining evidence from sources;
- encourage students to be more critical in their thinking;
- encourage students to make and substantiate their own judgements about the relative importance of a figure, development, event, etc.

Adapting for younger children

In adapting aspects of the pack and its activities for younger students, consider the following:

- offer more guidance and give more structure to tasks, for example, support research with highly structured enquiry routes;
- focus more on concrete examples/illustrations and less on abstract concepts;
- focus more on similarity and difference, and less on change and continuity;
- use fewer and less complex sources of evidence; support reading and writing with tape recorded text, highlighted text, glossary of key words.

Women's history in the 20th century

This section[1] gives a brief introduction to the historiography of the history of women. This is intended to enhance teacher understanding of how their own approach to women's history fits into the overall picture.

In order to make this information clear and manageable, it has been laid out in a linear format. However, this is not meant to suggest that women's history has steadily made progress with the passage of time. In using this section, it must be remembered that social change does not happen at a uniform pace; that continuity can be as important as change; that time and "progress" are not the same, that is life does not necessarily "get better" with the passing of time; that there are reversals, backlashes, tensions, contradictions as well as leaps forward.

Phases

In the late 19th and early 20th centuries, women's rights movements which were focused primarily on the right to vote/the suffrage, led to an interest in women's history.

The 1930s onwards saw the rise of social history, that is some historians moved away from studying public/political/military events to look at aspects of lives of ordinary people, such as health and belief systems. They were interested in more long-term developments and developments that were more to do with the social, economic and intellectual life and less to do with the public and political life. But this was not a focus on the lives of women as women. It was not exclusively women's history but that of ordinary people, including women.

During the 1960s some historians developed the "new social history" movement. This was closely linked to the civil rights movements of the decade, for example, an increasing awareness of and interest in the lives of minorities, including women. This development in historical thinking was often deliberately intended to change power relationships and their corresponding political institutions in favour of these minority groups.

The 1960s also saw the development of the modern feminist movement, which included the aim of finding out more about the particular and unique experiences of women in the past. As a result from the 1960s feminist historians (in the United States and western Europe) began to look at women's history. The late 1970s onwards saw the first courses in women's studies being offered within higher education in America and then in northern and

---

1. This section draws on *Women and gender in early modern Europe,* by Merry E. Wiener (Cambridge University Press, New York, 1993).

western Europe. This perspective was no longer rooted exclusively in social history but also in political, military, economic, intellectual and cultural history.

More recently, there has been an increased emphasis on the diversity of women, acknowledging ethnic, socio-economic, sexual orientation, age, religious differences as well as what women have in common. There has also been a focus on gender studies in addition to or instead of the study of women.

19

Asking important questions about women's history

The following are a collection of important questions and statements that can be asked about women's history. The activities in the pack are all designed to enable students to think critically about one or more aspects of the issues addressed by these questions and statements. The principles demonstrated below are more or less implicit within the approach of the pack, however, it may also be useful to use some of the following questions/statements as discussion points. In particular, they could be used with older students.

• *All historical change affects the lives of women in some way.* To what extent is this true/false? Ask this question about a historical development in your own society. For example, how did technological advances change life within the home from 1950 onwards?

• *In what ways did a particular historical development affect the lives of women differently from how it affected the lives of men?* Ask this question about a historical development in your own society. For example, how did fascism, communism or capitalism affect the lives of women differently from that of men?

• *How has your local, national, international history been organised? What devices have been used to give history its shape?* For example, European history has been organised into periods – the Renaissance, the Reformation, nation-state, industrial, and communist. How much relevance do these periods have for women's history? The historian Joan Kelly, for example, has asked the question: "Did women have a Renaissance?" What similar questions could be asked in your classroom?

• *What alternative turning points/developments could you use to organise women's history?* For example, can you identify turning points linked to changes in the suffrage, education, technology, birth control, divorce law, peace and war?

• *What are the main differences between women's studies and gender studies?* One difference between the two lies in the types of questions we ask about the past. Women's history is about finding out about the experiences of women in the past. Gender studies is about finding out about the relationship between men and women in the past. An important aspect of gender studies is to look at how gender has been socially constructed through language, beliefs, values, and what this tells us about power relationships both in past and contemporary societies.

• *What does a study of historical language tell us about gender and power?* For example, think about the word "kingdom". What examples can you find in your own language of gendered historical terms?

- *What challenges are posed by trying to find out about women's lives?* What types of sources can we use to find out about women's lives? What type of information will they give us?

- *What dangers might there be in focusing all women's history on the private, domestic life of women?* What questions can be asked to address/compensate for these dangers?

- *Gender studies have a useful contribution to make in this area.* By asking questions about the division of life between the two sexes, they focus our attention on how, when and where those divisions have happened. It is vital to remember that the impact of ideas about gender has varied over time and place.

- *When and where have ideas about gender been more important in shaping the experiences of women?* And when and where have ideas about gender been less important in shaping the experiences of women?

- *What are the important differences between women that have shaped their history?* For example, ethnic group, location, class, marital status, number of children, health provision, rural/urban.

- *What if you were a very poor woman living in a city during industrialisation?* What would be more important in shaping your life – your sex or your class?

21

II. Women's history in the 20th century

Overview of women in the 20th century: forces, developments and events

Introduction

This section gives an overview of the main themes, developments and events that could be covered in the teaching of the history of women in Europe in the 20th century. The material has been organised into five areas: work, family life, political life, cultural life and war and conflict.

One of the challenges of teaching the history of women is to find a thread which holds the narrative together and makes it coherent. To simply call it women's history is inadequate and is likely to result in learning experiences which are not sufficiently rigorous or challenging. Each of the five areas, therefore, can be regarded as a possible thread or route through the complex and varied history of women in the 20th century.

Another way of ensuring coherency is to organise women's history around one key question: in what ways have women gained greater control over their lives during the 20th century? In this way, students have a clear sense of the purpose of their learning. Many of the key questions within the table below relate to this overarching question.

The section is intended to be flexible while at the same time trying to retain precision and clarity in the way that the main issues are expressed. In order that the section works in countries across Europe, the main issues have been expressed as questions rather than as statements and dates have not been included. This means that teachers can select the areas that are relevant to their particular context. It is unlikely that all the questions will be relevant to one particular region of Europe and some questions will need adapting to suit local needs and circumstances.

For example, the section on "Women and work: the main points" covers the key issues, such as equal pay, childcare, working conditions, equal access to success, legislation, impact of industrialisation and technology, nature of women's work, that may be relevant to all European countries but not necessarily during the same period of time or in the same way.

Most of the areas are then exemplified in activities/approaches that can be used and adapted by individual teachers.

The relationship between each of the five areas of work, family, politics, culture and war, is very important. In order to know and understand the roles and experiences of women, it is vital to see the connections between different areas of life. For example, work covers the world of paid work outside the home but the particular issues within work and the role of woman in the wider society can only be fully understood within the context of family issues. These family issues include unpaid domestic work within the home and attitudes to family wages that often explain why equal pay is not a reality for many women in Europe. Similarly the lack of political representation for women today in many European countries can only be fully understood within the context of other areas of women's lives, for example, the nature of their education, cultural role models, family life and so forth.

It is also important to investigate links across Europe in relation to women's history. There are many opportunities to use the key questions in the next section to explore the European dimension of women's history. For example, in relation to the acquisition of the suffrage, the European dimension could be addressed through the following questions:

• What are the similarities and differences in the dates when women got the vote across Europe?

• If dates are mapped across Europe, do any patterns or significant questions emerge?

• In what ways did the suffrage for women in one country contribute to the suffrage for women in another country?

• What are the similarities and differences in opposition to women's suffrage across Europe?

• What similarities and differences are there in attitudes to women across Europe?

• How can these similarities and differences be explained?

The activity on comparing and contrasting the experiences of women in different political systems across Europe shows how the experiences of women under fascism, communism and capitalism can be linked. This approach could be used with other areas, for example, experiences of motherhood, propaganda and indoctrination, education, equality at work, contribution to war, political representation, and so forth.

There are also opportunities to investigate links between Europe and the wider world. For example, how did the women's liberation movement in America influence women's liberation in Europe? What impact do changes in Islamic countries have on European attitudes towards women?

Five categories of key questions about women in the 20th century

1. Work, including economic life, production, education, training

What has been/is the impact of industrialisation on women's lives?

How has industrialisation changed the nature/type of work done by women?

What type of work was done by women in pre-industrial society?

Was this work done inside/outside the home?

To what extent was work segregated into "male" and "female" labour in pre-industrial times?

What is/was the contribution of women to the process of industrialisation?

Did women carry a double burden (at home and at work) at this time?

What were working conditions like for women at this time?

In what ways, if any, did women's work become restricted by legislation during industrialisation?

What was the impact of industrialisation on women from different socio-economic classes, such as working class, middle class, upper class?

And from different regions, such as rural/urban?

How have attitudes, beliefs and values about women been reinforced by and reflected in their education?

Have girls had access to education throughout the 20th century?

Have girls had access to the same curriculum as boys?

What do any differences reveal about attitudes to the role of women?

How has education been organised for girls and women?

If girls and boys have been segregated (separated) for education, has the education been equal in quality?

Have girls had access to the same qualifications as boys?

If not, what have been the short- and long-term consequences for girls and women?

At different points in the 20th century have the educational achievements of girls and boys been equal?

Currently do schools have equal opportunities policies? Why/why not?

How effective are these policies?

What are the issues today around the education of girls and women?

Have women had access to the same university and professional education as men?

What changes have taken place in access to higher education?

What has been the significance of unequal access and of change?

Where and why do women continue to be denied equal access to higher education?

What are the consequences?

At work, have women had access to the same training opportunities as men?

When barriers have existed to training at work for women, what have been the consequences?

Does legislation exist/has it existed to protect/promote women's access to training at work?

What has been the nature of women's work? What type of work is seen as "traditional" women's work?

Consider:

- caring roles, for example nursing;
- domestic roles, for example cooking, cleaning;
- light/heavy industry;
- administrative/supportive roles.

Have women been more or less likely to do skilled, as opposed to unskilled, jobs?

To what extent have these roles been determined by social attitudes and/or legislation?

What can we learn from the nature of women's work about attitudes, values and beliefs about women?

Has women's work been more likely to be temporary and/part-time?

What impact has this had on the ability of women to organise at work for specific aims, such as equal pay, better conditions?

What changes have taken place in the nature of women's work throughout the 20th century?

What have been the key turning points/periods of rapid change?

What have been the causes of these changes?

What have been the consequences?

What are the main issues to do with equality at work between men and women?

Do women have equal pay? Have they always had it?

What has been/is the attitude of the state and society to equal pay?

When equal pay does not exist, what are the reasons?

What have been/are the barriers, for example attitudes, nature of work (temporary, part time, low status), education, training, to equal pay?

Have "separate roles" been "equal" roles?

To what extent do women have equal access to success with men?

What are the barriers, for example temporary, part-time, low status, education, training, to equal access to success at work for men and women?

2. Family, including motherhood, reproduction, consumerism

What has been/is the impact of industrialisation on family life?

How have the functions of the family changed pre- and post-industrialisation?

What impact have these changes had on the roles and experiences of women?

What impact did changes in family roles and responsibilities have on the social and economic power of women?

How have changes in family functions and relationships been reflected in and reinforced by changes in the physical home, including separation of male and female areas?

What particular roles and responsibilities have women had within the family?

As mothers/carers/domestic labourers, for example child minders, cleaners/income managers?

What have been the causes and consequences of any change or continuity?

What has been societies' attitudes towards motherhood?

What methods of social control (religion, media, education) have reinforced and/reflected the role of mothers within the family?

What supporting structures, for example childcare, health care, have been available to mothers?

What value has been placed on the roles and responsibilities of mothers within the wider society?

What change and continuity have occurred in these attitudes over time?

What have been the causes and consequences of any change or continuity?

To what extent, why and how has the state intervened in family life?

What impact have particular political periods, such as Thatcherism in the United Kingdom, Stalinism in the Soviet Union, German post-unification, had on family life in general and women's lives in particular?

At what times and why has the state directed propaganda at family life?

What impact has the existence/not of a welfare state had on family life?

How has marriage changed over the 20th century and what has been the impact on the lives of women?

How much choice have women had in relation to marriage and other significant relationships?

What access have women had to divorce?

What impact has legislative change in relation to marriage had on women?

What have been the attitudes to married/single/widowed/divorced women and how have these attitudes been conveyed?

How has marriage changed the legal and financial position of women at different times during the 20th century?

How have expectations of women towards work, education, travel, changed after marriage?

What is the relationship between status and family position? For example married/single/widowed, oldest/youngest daughter, daughter/mother/granddaughter?

How are female rites of passage, for example puberty, recognised?

How much control have women had over their roles and experiences within the family?

To what extent has this control increased over the 20th century?

What access have they had to contraception, abortion, housing, healthcare, childcare, education, welfare?

Why has the extent of control changed over time?

Have women within the wider society seen themselves as responsible for harmony and happiness within the family?

What kinds of emotions have women experienced as key family members?

What types of conflict have occurred within families?

To what extent have they been functional/dysfunctional for society and its members?

To what extent have women been able to express the conflict of family life? Where is the evidence?

What has been the impact of consumer culture on the experiences of women within the family?

To what extent have advertising and marketing strategies been directed at women rather than men within the family?

What attitudes, values and opinions about women have these strategies reflected/reinforced?

What has been the impact of technological change on the experiences of women within the family?

What benefits, if any, have women had from the introduction of machines into the home?

How has technology changed the nature of family life?

What has been the impact of the built environment (architecture, town planning, facilities) on the experiences of women within the family?

In what ways has it been/is it supportive of family life?

In what ways has it not been/is it not supportive of family life?

Who has control over the built environment?

What types of skills have women developed as key family members?

Consider:

- organisation;
- collaboration;
- management;
- pragmatism;
- flexibility.

To what extent have these skills been recognised/acknowledged, valued by the wider society including by women themselves?

29

How relevant are these skills to a flexible workforce?/the needs of the 21st century?

3. Political life, including suffrage/vote, local politics, national politics, representation, rights and responsibilities, activism

When did women get the suffrage/were able to vote?

Why did the movement for women's suffrage gather impetus across Europe around 1918 to 1920?

Why was it phased in later in some parts of Europe?

How was the vote/suffrage achieved?

Why was there resistance/opposition to women's suffrage?

What did this opposition reveal about attitudes to women?

What were the methods and aims of those who campaigned for votes for women/female suffrage?

To what extent did women of different social classes and ethnic groups unite in their struggle for the suffrage and other political rights?

What long-term impact did women's political activism for the suffrage have on other 20th century political protest?

How much difference did the suffrage make to the lives of women in the short-term term?

How many women had/have representation in the national government?

What are the barriers/challenges to women's representation, including: attitudes and values, legislation, and education?

Which particular individual women have achieved political power at a national level?

What has been their contribution to national life?

What has been their contribution to the lives of women?

How have different political systems impacted the lives of women, including fascism, liberalism, democracy, communism, and socialism?

How have these systems tried or not tried to control the lives of women?

In relation to women, what were their aims and methods?

Who have been the individual women who have been political figures?

What were their achievements both for the lives of women and for the wider society?

What particular challenges or barriers have they faced? How did they overcome them?

To what extent did they identify themselves with "women" issues?

How have powerful women been portrayed by the media including cartoonists?

What do these portrayals reveal about attitudes, values and beliefs about the role of women?

What impact have women had on local politics, including community action (co-operatives, food supply, education, leisure, facilities)?

During periods of political crises/resistance, what particular role have women taken?

What has been the impact of the women's liberation movement on the lives of women?

What were its aims? Which areas did it focus on? For example childcare, abortion, contraception, education.

What were its methods?

What has been the particular history of the movement nationally?

What international influences have affected its methods, aims and achievements?

What specific legislation has the campaign achieved/aimed at?

What type of women campaigned/campaign for women's liberation, in terms of ethnicity, social class, rural/urban, region.

What other movements have had an impact on women's rights?

What pressure/interest groups have promoted women's rights?

What has been/is the relationship between political, social and economic rights?

Why have political rights been seen as a necessary precursor to other rights?

What are the differences between campaigning for political rights (the vote) and social rights (freedom to travel)?

What are the benefits and the limitations of political rights?

How has different legislation impacted the lives of women?

This should be examined in terms of the tax system, pension, maternity rights, sickness rights.

What attitudes about women lie behind these systems?

4. **Cultural life, including sexuality, gender identity, self-expression, art, literature, music, religion and morality**

What changes in gender identity have occurred in the 20th century?

What images existed of the "ideal" woman at different points in the 20th century?

How did these images change over time?

In what ways did these images stay the same (continuity)?

How can we use the context of the times to explain these similarities and differences?

Which images of the "ideal" woman were more uniform and restrictive?

Which images of the "ideal" woman showed variety and were more flexible?

What different and varied means of self-expression have women used?

Consider:

- literature;
- music;
- art;
- drama.

What means of self-expression were available to women at different times during the 20th century?

When self-expression was prohibited or limited, how did this happen?

Consider:

- censorship;
- social attitudes;
- education;
- financial constraints;
- legislation;
- persecution.

During these times, how did different women respond?

How have women used writing, painting, drama as a means of resistance?

To what extent has gender identity been class specific and ethnic specific?

What have been the differences in how women from different social classes have expressed themselves?

To what extent has gender identity been ethnic group specific?

What can fictional literature tell us about women's lives?

What sorts of heroines and anti-heroines exist in 20th century novels and poems?

In what ways is the subject matter of "women" literature different to "other" literature?

What does the plot reveal about socially acceptable and unacceptable behaviour and feelings?

What sort of morality for women is shown in drama?

Are there significant differences between popular and classical literature?

What can drama (films and plays) tell us about women's lives?

What sorts of heroines and anti-heroines exist in 20th century drama?

What does the plot reveal about socially acceptable and unacceptable behaviour and feelings?

What sort of morality for women is shown in literature?

Are there significant differences between popular and other drama?

What can music tell us about women's lives?

How have women used music, including popular music, as a means of self-expression?

What can art (painting and sculpture) tell us about women's lives?

How are women portrayed in painting and sculpture?

How have women used art for self-expression?

What is the subject matter of art by women?

What can the media tell us about attitudes, values and beliefs about women in the 20th century?

How are women portrayed in headlines, articles, images?

How "visible" are women within the media of the past and of today?

What is the subject matter of the "women's" media including magazines?

What advertisements are directed towards women? What images do they show?

What advertisements portray women? What images do they show? Why are these images used?

Which particular women writers, philosophers, thinkers, artists have caused turning points in the way that women see themselves?

What beliefs about women have they expressed?

How have ideas about "independence", "feminism", "femininity", "sexuality" and so forth, been interpreted?

How have these interpretations changed over time and for what reasons?

What has been the impact of religious beliefs on the lives of women?

What ideas about the nature of women have religious institutions held?

What ideas about morality have religious institutions held?

What changes have occurred in these ideas during the 20th century?

At what times and for what reasons have particular women and groups of women come into conflict with religious/moral groups?

How have changes in body image symbolised change in attitudes, beliefs and values about being a woman?

How have changes in fashion reflected and reinforced changes in how women see and express themselves?

5. **War and conflict, including particular contribution of women, resistance, survival, the Holocaust, war and work, war and family**

What was the particular role of women during wars and conflicts, including the first and second world wars, and civil wars?

What type of work did women do: traditional "male" jobs, such as heavy industry; war work, such as nursing, munitions industry?

How typical or atypical was this of women's work during peacetime?

Were supporting structures introduced? For example nurseries, health care, food supplies, legislation (protection at work)?

What happened to these after the war/conflict was over?

How crucial was the contribution of women to the national war effort?

What was the impact of war on family life?

Were mothers and children separated during the war?

Did the state intervene more/less in family life during war/conflict?

What was the impact on the role of and attitudes towards women?

Did women do war work in addition to their family responsibilities?

How did women cope with the "double burden" of work and family during the war/conflict?

How did women resolve moral dilemmas during the war, for example evacuation, food supply and distribution?

Did women take responsibility for "hidden" areas, for example, the moral well being of their community, education of children?

What was the attitude of the state to women's role during war?

Was legislation, such as conscription, introduced?

Was propaganda used? How? Why?

What beliefs, attitudes and values about women does this propaganda reveal?

What particular contribution did women make during periods of occupation/resistance?

In what ways did women suffer during the war, including rape, bereavement, separation?

In what ways did and do women and children suffer in "modern warfare" through blitz, bombing, sieges and so forth?

What was the impact of war on women in the short-term and in the long-term?

What similarity and difference, change and continuity was there in women's roles and experiences between wars?

What were the causes and consequences of the changes?

What was the particular experience of women during the Holocaust?

For what reasons were particular groups of women persecuted during the Holocaust?

In what ways did they suffer?

What dilemmas were faced during the Holocaust, including in the ghettos?

What survival strategies were used at this time?

How did women use writing, drawing, and so forth, to help endure suffering?

Women and work: the main points[1]

This section deals with issues around paid work, education and training. The connection with family life is particularly important since much of women's work is "hidden" and unpaid within the family. The separation of work and family is also not a reality for many women nor has it been at different points in time. On the contrary, many women do paid work inside homes such as childcare, domestic labour, which can remain "invisible". Only by seeing women's work within the context of family life can we fully understand the double burden (production outside the home, caring and reproduction inside the home) that many women carry. In addition, only by understanding the contradictory roles that women often fulfil can we understand and explain problematic attitudes over issues such as equal pay or equal opportunities.

The liberal progressive view of history current in some European countries has fuelled the myth that, in relation to work, women have increased their opportunities steadily as the century has progressed. In fact, in most pre-industrial societies, women and men worked alongside each other and there was little or no separation between home and work. It is not necessarily helpful, therefore, to see women's achievements in the world of work as one of progression over time. The nature of women's work before, during and after the process of industrialisation should be compared and contrasted.

Similarly women's crucial contribution to the process of industrialisation must be identified and acknowledged. In Soviet Russia, the contribution of women to industrialisation was vital but was not made as visible as that of men. In some countries, it was during industrialisation that laws were introduced that claimed to "protect" women but at the same time created barriers to women in work. For example, the 1892 law in France prohibiting women from working at night was called protective legislation. In fact it also served to protect male employment as many women lost their jobs as a result of the legislation.

The image of the "ideal" woman as being inside the home, caring and dutiful, emerged in most European countries during industrialisation. This ideal can itself lead to misconceptions and myths about women's work. At the turn of the century in Britain, over one-third of the female population was in paid work despite the stereotype of a woman's place being within the home. During the 20th century in France the number of working women has never

---

1. The material in this section, as well as the following sections on family, politics, culture and war, draws upon *A century of women: the history of women in Britain and the United States,* by Sheila Rowbotham (Penguin Books, London, 1999). It also draws upon the unpublished paper "Visibility and invisibility of women in 20th century history teaching", by the French historian Christine Bard. This paper was presented at the Council of Europe's 83rd European In-Service Training Seminar for Educational Staff, on the theme of women in history.

fallen below one-third of the female population. Evidence must be used, therefore, that shows the actual extent and nature of women's work as well as the prevailing attitudes, beliefs and values. The two are often contradictory. For example, in western Europe during the post-war economic boom, women were encouraged to return to the home. The ideal woman of the time was a carer, mother, wife. At the same time a shortage of labour led to campaigns to get women, including married women, into the world of paid work. Women were subjected to propaganda to get them into work at the same time as they were subjected to propaganda to keep them at home.

The relationship between education and work is crucial. Education systems can both serve and challenge assumptions about work and gender. At different points in time and in different places, women have had more or less equal access to the same educational experience and qualifications as men. This can and has resulted in different access to the curriculum – when different subjects were/are taught to girls than boys because of apparent different qualities/needs. It can also result in different forms of school organisation for girls and boys, for example, single sex/segregated education.

When education is segregated along gender lines, it is important to examine whether the provision is equal for both sexes. Access to equal education, including university and professional education, is an important method of creating equal opportunities at work for women. Access to training at work has often been denied to women with negative consequences for their capacity to achieve or to be promoted on the same basis as men.

As we move into the 21st century, it is arguable that the types of qualities that will be needed in the new world of work, such as flexibility, communication, co-operation, are skills that young girls and women are encouraged to develop within the family and wider society to a greater degree than men. This may explain better performances by women than men at school and university and increasingly at work in some European countries today.

The nature of the work that has been done by women at different points in time is often very revealing of attitudes, beliefs and values that society has of women. These are deep seated and unexamined assumptions about the fundamental nature of women as opposed to that of men. Women's work has tended to be concentrated in domestic labour, light industry, caring roles (nurses, teachers), administration. Often it is these social attitudes that have prevented change and denied women equal opportunities and equal access to success within the world of work.

The type of women who have worked at different times is also an important factor and shows great variation according to social class, age and married status. For example, in some societies it has been acceptable for single

women to work but not married women. It is crucial here to try and identify the assumption that lies below the practice. In most societies, the assumption is that married women are dependent on men and, therefore, should not need to work after marriage. The work of poorer/working class women has also been neglected or made invisible when historians have focused on the achievements of middle class women within work.

It is these attitudes that help to explain problematic issues like equal pay. For many women in Europe, equal pay is still not a reality. The assumption that political rights (gaining of the vote) would lead to economic rights (equal pay and equal opportunities) has not been borne out by history. In some countries legislation has been introduced to enforce equal pay but prevailing attitudes remain and prevent its realisation. A study of equal pay can highlight for students the power of social attitudes compared to the limitations of legislation.

At the root of the issue of equal pay is the belief that women are dependent upon men. If women are dependent on men then there is no justification for equal pay. Many contemporary politicians are opposed to equal pay and the reasons that they give for their opposition can be critically assessed. Many justify their opposition on the grounds that equal pay would be too expensive for businesses and to enforce it would, therefore, damage the whole society. Students should be encouraged to look at the issue from different perspectives and challenge the apparent "logic" of the anti-equal pay argument. The activity "Equality at work" is designed to help teachers plan successful learning experiences around these complex issues.

It is also important to identify and analyse the reasons for changes in the world of work. Many of the gains made for women at work have been achieved because of direct action and campaigning. This is despite the challenges faced by women in trying to organise political and industrial action. Women's work is often part-time, temporary, flexible, lower status. All of these conditions make it harder for women to unite as a group in pursuit of common aims. In addition, the achievements within work both by women and for women should be a source of inspiration and a cause for celebration.

Women and family: the main points

*The role of wife, mother and housekeeper is a
social norm which is the major factor shaping women's lives.*

Christine Bard in "Visibility and invisibility
of women in 20th century history teaching"

The history of women within the family as wives, mothers and carers, is a major factor in shaping women's lives in all spheres. It can explain their lack of representation in parliament, the failure to achieve equal pay and equal access to success at work with men. It is the contribution of women within the family to society as a whole that has been most neglected in the history of women.

Similarly it is only by recognising the interdependence of the private and public spheres that it is possible to make sense of women's history. For example, the French historian Christine Bard takes the example of motherhood to illuminate the problem. Motherhood has been seen as a female experience and relegated to the "private" sphere of history. However, it is not possible to fully understand the history of motherhood without examining the impact of the "public" sphere, such as legislation, public health policies, pro-birth policies, sterilisation programmes, on the experiences of women in the family. Motherhood is different according to the political system in which women have lived. For example, political systems such as fascism can have a radical impact on women's experience of reproduction.

Legislation about health, welfare and family rights must be analysed in order to understand the distribution of power within the family. For example, in some European countries women did not gain equal parental responsibility with men until the 1970s. Laws have existed that denied women the right to have bank accounts or to work without their husband's permission. It is also important to consider whether changes in the law made any significant difference to women's lives in the short- or long-term. For example, the attitudes that made such legislation possible in the first place may not have shifted as a result of changes in the law. The history of legislation relating to maternity pay, pensions, abortion, divorce, parental responsibility, rape in marriage, can be particularly revealing of attitudes towards the position and relative power of women in society.

It is within the family that women have been most likely to feel the pressures of social expectations. At different points in time, women within the family have been seen as responsible for the health and harmony of the whole society. A failure to create a happy and harmonious home life can lead to feelings of guilt and inadequacy amongst women. The dysfunctional elements of

family life should be recognised and the burden of responsibility on women acknowledged. Psychological theory throughout the 20th century about the roles and responsibilities of women towards their children have often had a profound affect on behaviour and feelings.

It is important to critically assess to what extent the wider society supports functional family life. This could involve an examination of the local environment: to what extent are leisure, consumer, transport, health and education facilities, supportive of family life? To what extent have governments seen themselves as responsible for functional family life through the provision of health and welfare facilities? Or, in contrast, to what extent has functional family life been seen as the personal responsibility of individual women?

The impact of technological change and consumerism on women within the family can also be critically examined. The introduction of machinery into the home has transformed domestic life but may not necessarily have led to less time being spent on housework. The culture of consumerism has resulted in a vast amount of advertising being directed at women within the home. These advertisements can be analysed to infer attitudes, beliefs and values about women.

The media in general is a rich and engaging source about family life. Newspapers can be used to identify "moral panics" about family life both today and in the past. Students can analyse these "moral panics" to identify to what extent the behaviour of women is seen as responsible for social and cultural problems. Television programmes that focus on family issues in situation comedies and soap operas and drama series can be used in a similar way. What messages do these plots and characters send to women about their roles and responsibilities?

The diversity of women's experiences within the family according to social class must also be recognised and made explicit to students. For many poorer or working class women, the history of the 20th century has been one of economic survival and it can be harder, therefore, to identify sources of information about their experiences. Oral history can be used to redress the balance, see for example "Three generations of women: activity" in this pack. Statistics relating to maternal death rates, infant death rates, poverty indicators, can all be used to make inferences about the experiences of these "invisible" women.

The achievements of particular campaigns and movements, such as the women's movement in challenging traditional attitudes to the family and in affecting social and economic change should be examined. Typically, these campaigns have focused on abortion, contraception, childcare, food provision. All of these aim to give women within the family a greater degree of

control over their own lives and, therefore, a greater degree of indepen-
dence. Many of these campaigns were influenced by the aims and methods
of suffragette movements (votes for women). In addition, in many European
countries women have been particularly pro-active at a local community level
– setting up food co-operatives, communal kitchens, contraception and
abortion clinics.

Women and politics: the main points

This section focuses on the nature of political life and its impact on women in the 20th century. Issues include exclusion from political rights, the causes and consequences, both of exclusion and increasing inclusion, political represen-tation, national and local politics and political activism by and for women.

Students should be made aware of the nature and extent of the exclusion of women from political rights and domination by men of the "public" political sphere across the 20th century. The arguments put forward to oppose giving equal political rights to women should also be critically examined. Underlying these opposing arguments were (and continue to be) powerful and often unexamined beliefs and prejudices about the "nature" of women as distinct to men. Students should be given opportunities to investigate and explore the consequences of this exclusion on the social, economic, cultural experi-ences of women.

Significant changes in the political rights of women during the 20th century, such as the suffrage, and the causes of these changes, including campaigns by women themselves are also important topics for study. In many western European countries the extension of the franchise to women is seen by some historians as a "gift" or "reward" for war work. In this way the activism of the suffragettes is made "invisible" and insignificant and the effect on women today continues to be disempowering. It also leads to a lack of understanding of the influence and impact of the suffragettes on all other forms of political activism during the 20th century. It is arguable that the methods and approaches of wider civil rights movements within western Europe from the 1960s onwards were pioneered by the suffragettes.

This is also an opportunity to look at the relationships between women's rights in different parts of Europe. The pro-suffrage movement gained im-petus in a number of European countries at the same time following the first world war. The causes of this increasing impetus can be examined as well as the reasons for the failure to achieve the suffrage in some of those countries until the latter half of the century. Similarities and differences across Europe in attitudes to women's political rights can also be investigated.

Other important and interesting questions focus on the impact of the suf-frage. In most countries the impact was minimal, at least in the short-term. Women did not gain equal representation in national parliaments and politi-cal rights did not necessarily lead to the achievement of economic and social rights. In order to explain why not, we need to look at other areas of women's lives, for example the history of the family, the representations of "ideal" women within the media and so on. Students could be asked to con-sider why the suffrage did not lead to equal representation of men and

women in national parliaments and why barriers still existed to equality at work and in social life. This will help them to understand the powerful impact of cultural values and beliefs on political life.

Emphasis should also be placed on the campaigns of the feminists in the post-1960s in many European countries. Changes in the political rights of women have not been automatic but a result of deliberate action by particular groups. The aims of feminists in western Europe in the latter part of the century focused on the need to free and empower women from traditional beliefs and norms. In this way, feminists challenged the way in which the political sphere was seen as separate and distinct from the personal private sphere. Many feminists declared that the "personal" was "political" – that issues such as sexuality, body image, personal empowerment, were closely linked to political systems. The aims of feminist movements (childcare, abortion, contraception, etc.) should be identified and the extent to which women did achieve a greater control over their own lives, assessed.

A distinction can be made between the political activism of women at a national and local level. Women are often more politically active within local communities than nationally and have been proactive for change in areas such as health care, education, social life. The capacity of women to unite for common goals despite differences of social class, religion, ethnicity, should also be identified. In many countries, suffragettes and feminist campaigners have been drawn from across the range of social, ethnic and religious groupings.

The impact of different political systems on women's lives could be analysed. The similarities and differences between the roles and responsibilities of women under fascism, communism and capitalism could be identified and evaluated. The differences in the nature of education, propaganda, motherhood and so on, under different political systems could be focused on. This would also enable students to appreciate the relationship between the political life of the nation and the private life of the woman.

Individual famous women are often used to teach about women in politics. Undoubtedly particular individual women have made important contributions to female emancipation but they can be the exceptions that prove the rule and render the exclusion of the majority of women from political life even more "invisible". In addition, individual famous women have not always been in favour of rights for women and have often supported regimes that support the subjugation of women. A critical examination of these women can throw light on the interaction between the different identities that a woman might have and prioritise. Women do not necessarily act in favour of their own gender group but in favour of ethnic, political and religious identities at the expense of gender.

Women and cultural life: the main points

This section deals with issues around the cultural lives of women including the impact of different forms of communication, representations of women in popular and "high" culture, the self-expression of women and their impact on culture.

The 20th century has seen significant changes in the gender identity of both women and men. These changes can be identified through mapping and comparing a range of different representations of women from across the century. Students can assess the periods of greatest change and continuity. They can use learning about other aspects of women's lives within the 20th century to explain the changes. For example, changes in political rights, changes in economic status, impact of consumer culture, impact of teenage culture and so on, can all be relevant developments to explaining differences in the way women have been represented across the century. Changes in body image, including hair, clothing, cosmetics, to name a few, all reflect and reinforce changes in social beliefs and values about women.

The extent to which images of women reflect or reinforce change can be explored. What is the impact of representations of women in the media, for example, on the behaviour of women? What messages are sent by these images and how far do they represent a form of social control. Students can investigate whose perspective on women is being portrayed. Who has control over the images and what sorts of women do they choose to show? The feminist interpretation of women as object in many 20th century representations can be evaluated. Images can be assessed for the extent to which they do "objectify" women. The historical roots of contemporary images could be identified. For example, to what extent are images of women affected by icons of woman as Madonna and woman as whore?

The "invisibility" or "visibility" of women compared to men can be assessed. For example, students could investigate the media to identify differences in the amount of representations of women compared to men and their nature. Where do representations of women appear within the media? What is their purpose and how does their purpose differ to images of men? The media can also be a useful source on moral attitudes towards women. For example, what implicit or explicit messages regarding mortality are being sent by the media? Reporting of judicial cases, including rape, abortion, prostitution, infanticide, can be particularly rich sources on moral attitudes towards women within society.

The impact of religious beliefs within particular societies can be explored in relation to women. How does both the teaching of the religion and the structure and practice of its institutions have an impact on attitudes and values

44

towards women? Are there particular conflicts or tensions between religious beliefs and attitudes towards women throughout the society? The influence of religious groups on the political and family life of the society could be discussed.

The variety and range of means of self-expression that has been available to women throughout the century should be identified. Women have used literature, art, music, performing art, as means of self-expression. Particular points in time when these have been denied, for example during censorship or to social attitudes, could be identified. How did some women overcome these barriers to self-expression? In some societies it may be difficult to find examples of women who have made significant contributions to cultural life in terms of literature, art or music. In these cases it is important to use wider learning, for example about the nature of political or family life, to explain why women were not able to perform in these areas.

Literature, art and drama that portray women could be analysed to infer social attitudes. What sort of women become heroines and anti-heroines and what does the plot reveal about attitudes to women. Atypical, rebellious or radical behaviour by fictional women characters is often punished during the plot through death or ostracism.

Individual women whose contribution caused a turning point within a society could be a topic for a cross-curricular study which draws on art, science, literature, etc. as appropriate. For example, paintings of particular women such as Nobel prize winner Dorothy Hodgkin could be used to both support and enrich learning about famous women scientists and to develop historical skills of interpretation.

The impact of the technological revolution of the 20th century on the lives of women could be a topic for investigation. Students could map changes in forms of communication, for example radio, cinema, television and the Internet, and consider their different natures and possible impact on the lives of women. They could assess the influence that representations of women on television, including advertising, might have had on family life. The Internet, for example, gives the possibility of hiding gender in a way that radio does not. It also enables women to work at home. What opportunities might this offer to women that other forms of communication did not? The dangers of exclusion from forms of communication could also be considered.

Women and war: the main points

The questions in this section deal with the experiences of women in times of armed conflict including international wars, civil wars and the Holocaust. This is an important area for women's history for a number of reasons.

As workers, carers, mothers, lovers, women are deeply affected by armed conflict. During times of conflict, women have often been crucial outside the home because they were needed to do the work that had been done by men, including work within heavy industry, and they were needed to do particular war work, such as nursing and munitions production. Women have also continued to be vital inside the home during wartime because their function as food suppliers and mothers often becomes even more crucial. The "double burden" of family and work can become even heavier for women during times of conflict.

Many history books that cover wars ignore the crucial contribution that women have made to the war effort and the particular nature of their suffering. Women often take on important moral and survival functions during times of conflict and are vulnerable to particular types of danger. Women often act as moral guardians of the whole community at times when morality is being challenged. For example, during the second world war, Jewish women ran schools within the ghetto in Warsaw, Poland, and at the same time had to use their children to carry out illegal and dangerous tasks in the effort to obtain food. Moral dilemmas, therefore, can be a feature of women's experience during wars. During the second world war in Britain mothers separated from their children through evacuation in an attempt to protect them. Similarly many Jewish families sent their children to safety during the nazi era.

Women are vulnerable in different ways than men during wartime. Women are often raped as an additional act of violence against a nation or ethnic group to symbolise their conquest. Since the first world war, rape of women by soldiers has occurred with impunity. It is often women as wives and mothers and daughters who are bereaved by wars and conflicts.

War often leads to important changes in women's lives. War can give new opportunities to women that were not available in peacetime. The patriotism that war can cause and the need to mobilise whole populations often makes acceptable and legitimate the type of behaviour from women that is condemned during peace time. For example, during wartime women have often been able to travel, work in traditional male industries, act as managers and organisers and so on. A greater degree of independence and responsibility can therefore be available to women during war than during peacetime.

In times of war, the state often interferes in family life to a far greater degree than during peacetime. This can happen in different ways. Sometimes, as in Britain during the second world war, women are conscripted to serve the war effort. Similarly the state often feels a greater need to protect the next generation during times of war and this can result in changes in health provision for children and maternal health for mothers.

Propaganda as well as legislation is often used to try and persuade women to support the war effort. The amount of propaganda directed at women underlines their crucial importance during times of war. The nature of the propaganda can be used effectively to work out what sorts of attitudes, beliefs and values the society as a whole has about women. Often these messages are contradictory in times of war – women are to be protected; women are to fight; women can do "men's jobs".

The short- and long-term impact of war on women needs to be assessed. Many historians have seen both world wars as contributory causes of women achieving the vote in some western countries, such as France. The experiences that women gain during the war often dispel myths about what women "can" and "cannot" do. This can lead to changes in attitudes of others and it can also lead to changes in the way that women see themselves. These changes are often less tangible that gaining the vote. For example, the experience of being organisers, managers and soldiers during wartime can give women confidence that their peacetime experiences have denied them.

III. Developing activities about women's history

Equality at work: activity

Learning objectives

The following are the learning objectives for this section:

- to appreciate the importance of equal pay to women's rights;
- to understand the reasons given for and against equal pay both in the past and today;
- to find relevant information about equality at work;
- to understand the particular challenges that have affected women at work.

Background

The particular issues around equal pay will vary across Europe but the following broad points may be useful in planning teaching on equal pay.

Equal pay by law has not been achieved in all European countries and has only recently been achieved in many. Attitudes towards the position of women in society are central to understanding the lack of equal pay both in the past and the present. If women are seen as dependent within the family on the male wage, then they should not be paid equal amounts to men.

Legislation does not guarantee that equal pay will be a reality for all women. Equal rates of pay are only achieved when women are doing the same work as men. Much labour however, is segregated/divided into "male" and "female" occupations.

Equal rates of pay by law does not address the issue of male domination of higher status and better paid jobs. Equal pay legislation does not address the problems that women can face after returning to work from child rearing. Their experiences and skills as a consequence of being responsible for a family are often not recognised or financially rewarded. Campaigns in support of equal pay, including from the women's movement should be examined and their methods, aims and successes evaluated.

The arguments of those governments and politicians who oppose equal pay for women could be critically assessed. Many justify their opposition on the grounds that equal pay is too expensive and would damage the economy,

including women. Businesses would go bankrupt and society as a whole would suffer. Students could be encouraged to think of counter arguments that show how equal pay can benefit everyone.

This activity could be extended to examine why it has been difficult for women to organise at work for better conditions, equal pay, equal opportunities. Focus should be directed onto legislation and attitudes including prejudice and discrimination that has prevented and continues to prevent women from achieving equality at work. The nature of women's work – often low paid, part-time, temporary, isolated – should also be discussed. The nature of women's work has made it harder to organise into unions and prejudice from male workers has often resulted in "protective" legislation which holds back women workers.

Other important issues around equality at work, such as equal access to success, equal opportunities (to training, up-skilling, promotion, etc.) could be looked at in the same way.

The Internet is a useful source on rates of pay across Europe and on current debates within the European Union.

Activity

The following are arguments which have been used in the debate about equal pay:

- women should not have equal pay because they are not the main bread-winner;
- women need equal pay in order to be financially independent;
- financial independence is an important condition of equality and freedom;
- women should not have equal pay because their time at work is often temporary and interrupted by caring responsibilities within the family;
- the skills and experiences gained by women as mothers should be recognised within the work place;
- equal pay is too expensive and will bankrupt businesses;
- equal pay is bad for society;
- equal pay is good for everyone.

Which statements do you agree with? Which statements do you disagree with? Explain two of your choices.

Construct a logical argument in favour of or against equal pay for women.

What challenges might young women face in 2000 as they enter the world of work?

What opportunities might young women have in 2000 as they enter the world of work?

Challenging history: activity

Learning objectives

The following are the learning objectives for this section:

- to critically analyse history curricula and resources in order to find out about our society's attitudes to and beliefs about the role and status of women;

- to understand that history is written by real people who choose to ask particular questions and answer those questions by selecting particular facts;

- to appreciate that different questions can be asked and different information will be needed to answer them;

- to understand that our own school curriculum is not "accidental" or "inevitable" but constructed by the government/school/teacher; examination board; publishers, among others.

Resources: school history syllabuses, higher education curriculum/syllabus, school history resources

Activity 1: thinking critically about the school curriculum

The following questions could be addressed:

- How is the history curriculum/syllabus organised? By themes/periods/nation-states/other methods?

- Where does "women's history" appear? Are there specific topics about women?

- If so, are these topics political/economic/social/cultural/military?

- Which women are studied?

- Are they famous/individual/groups/ordinary women?

- If they are famous, why are they famous?

- What is their class and/ethnic status?

- Are any "mainstream" topics, for example, second world war, human rights, and industrialisation taught from a female perspective?

- What can be found out from the history curriculum/syllabus about how "women's history" is seen in a particular society?

Compare the curriculum with that of another school (preferably of a different type) and/another country and/another period in time. What differences and similarities are there in the treatment of women's history? What has been found out about change and continuity in the treatment of women's history?

Repeat the exercise with a university curriculum. What course is offered? Is women's history covered? How is it done? How much is done? What messages are sent by these approaches?

Activity 2: thinking critically about history resources

The following should be asked about the structure and focus of the resource.

- What is the main topic of the resource?

- Where does "women's history" appear?

- Does it appear as a single chapter/section?

- If so, what is the focus of the chapter/section?

- Does this mean that the remainder of the resource is not about women's history?

- Look at the whole resource: which areas are relevant to the history of women?

- Explain how they are relevant and/how they could be made relevant?

- Is there a single chapter/section on the history of men? Why/why not?

The language of the resource: look at the title, chapter/section headings. Can you find any examples of "gendered language"? Some examples in English would be "manpower", "mankind" and "chairman", to name but a few. At the Council of Europe and other international organisations and businesses, these terms have been replaced. Some example of alternative terms to use would be "workforce", "humanity", "chair" or "chairperson". Sometimes gendered language can discriminate against men, such as "midwife".

Look at the vocabulary used (if the book has an index/glossary use these). Can you find any more examples of "gendered language"?

The illustrations in the resource: count up all the illustrations (pictures) in the resource. How many show women? How many show men? What is the percentage that shows women? Choose at least one illustration of a woman. Describe the illustration. What does it show? What is the purpose of this illustration? Why has it been included?

Write a letter to the publisher suggesting how the resource could be improved. Try to include reasons for these improvements.

In addition, a statement box is given below. This can be used/adapted to support students by stimulating ideas and vocabulary or to provoke debate and discussion.

Table 1: challenging history – a statement box[1]

Women are shown as heroines/victims/symbols/ordinary.

Women shown are political/social/economic/military/religious/cultural figures.

The sections/chapters on women's history are about social/political/economic/military/religious/cultural history.

"Other" history is about men.

"Other" history is not about men, it is about everyone.

Ordinary women or groups of women are not shown. All the women are "famous" women.

There is no chapter/section on "men's history" because all "other" history is about men.

---

1. This table and all others in this book may be downloaded in A4 format from the Internet site: http://culture.coe.fr/hist20

The history of motherhood: activity

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are the following:

- to use a range of sources of information to find out about the history of motherhood;
- to identify and analyse different influences on the roles and responsibilities of mothers;
- to use representations and interpretations of motherhood within the media to identify attitudes, beliefs and values about mothers within a particular society;
- to understand the interrelation between political systems and the experiences of mothers;
- to appreciate the diverse experiences of mothers across different social classes and or ethnic groups.

Background

A history of motherhood could be done by examining different points of time within the same area or country or by comparing and contrasting the different experiences of mothers under different political systems. Sterilisation programmes, abortion legislation, birth control legislation and availability within different countries or at different points in time can be good starting points for making comparisons.

Public health and social welfare are useful starting points for thinking about motherhood. Motherhood could be used as an "in depth" study within a wider study of the history of public health and welfare systems. Public health includes identifying campaigns which were used to change or influence the behaviour of mothers. Sometimes these campaigns are also strongly influenced by ideas about social class and may only be directed at one section of the population. In this way students can be helped to see the diversity within women's lives and how other powerful influences such as wealth, ethnic group, interact with gender. Similarly care should be taken not to represent the experiences of one section of the population as universal. For example, middle and upper class experiences of motherhood have been very different to those of the poorer sections of society.

A history of motherhood is also an opportunity to examine the impact of psychology on the lives of women. Contemporary childcare theory can be analysed and particular messages identified about how mothers should behave. These sometimes can be linked to wider political agendas such as the

need for women to go out to work or to stay at home. In this way the impact of political and economic policies including job organisation and opportunities on motherhood can be identified.

There are often contradictions and tensions evident in a study of motherhood. Mothers are often under conflicting pressures, for example, to stay at home and care for children and to contribute to/solely support the family income. These contradictions can lead to feelings of guilt and inadequacy and problem pages of contemporary magazines and newspapers can be a useful source on feelings and emotions.

The approach to oral or personal history outlined in this pack can also be used to provide evidence about changes in motherhood over time. See, for example, the "Three generations of women: activity".

The media, particularly soap operas, comedies, documentaries are also a useful source for finding out about contemporary attitudes to motherhood. See, for example, the activity on television and family life below.

Activity

Use a range of sources of information to answer the following:
- What was the impact of public health and social welfare on motherhood?
- What facilities of health education, maternity care, childcare, hospital treatment, existed for mothers at this time?
- What were the contemporary "needs of society" (including economic, political) in relation to the roles and responsibilities of mothers?
- What sort of messages were sent to mothers through the media about their roles and responsibilities?
- What childcare theories were influential at the time?
- What impact did they have on the behaviour and feelings of women?
- Are there any contradictions in the messages that were sent to women about their roles and responsibilities as mothers?
- How do the "needs of society" help to explain these contradictions?

Three generations of women: activity

The learning objectives for this section are the following:

- to use oral history to find out about the lives of three generations of women;
- to identify change and continuity between their lives;
- to interpret the interviews in the context of wider knowledge and understanding of the lives of women.

Context

When finding out about the lives of women throughout the 20th century, we can use the oral or personal histories of three consecutive generations. It is likely that their collective memory will cover the period.

The interviews should be carefully planned and well focused. Questions could be asked about particular areas of life such as fashion, leisure, domestic life, work, education. The focus of the interviews could be part of a wider enquiry on women that the class is covering or has covered. Otherwise students will need to do background research in order to probe more effectively during the interview and to interpret the information more accurately.

If the same questions are asked of each generation, students will find it easier to identify both change and continuity over time. Alternatively the students could record three generations of women in conversation with each other on a particular topic. Interviewees should be encouraged to use photographs, letters, coins and so on, illustrate and stimulate memories.

The activity could be extended by asking students to present their information for an audience. They could design an exhibition, a website, a lesson plan, a pamphlet. This could involve learning about selection of material for a particular purpose and audience and is, therefore, also a lesson in interpretations of history.

Activity

The framework outlined in Chapter V on making oral history could be used to structure the interview and organisation and interpretation of the information. For example:

- What is the focus of the interviews?
- What will be the main questions?
- How will the information be recorded?

- How will it be interpreted?
- What background information is needed?
- How can it be used effectively when interpreting and presenting the interviews?

Television and family life: activity

Learning objectives

The following are the learning objectives for this section:

- to know about and understand attitudes towards women's role within the family during the 20th century;

- to use a range of sources to describe, explain and analyse the key features and characteristics of women's role and experiences within the family in the 20th century;

- to identify and explain change and continuity in women's role and experiences within the family in the 20th century;

- to appreciate the diversity of women's experiences according to ethnicity, social class, region, religion;

- to think critically about the media as an agent of social control.

Background

Soap operas, comedies, advertisements are all rich and engaging sources for finding out about family life. Magazines can also be used in the same way as an addition or substitute to television.

Focus should be directed at the particular roles and responsibilities that women are shown as having within the family. What sorts of relationships are shown within the families portrayed on television? Asking students to compare images of both men and women can encourage them to be more critical in their analysis. The distribution of power within the family should be a focus. What sort of power is legitimate for women within the plot and how is humour used to try and influence behaviour?

A good way into the topic with younger students is to ask them to identify advertisements directed at them and to analyse why particular images have been chosen. What do those images reveal about the attitudes of society towards them? How are they supposed to behave and what values should they have?

Television often deals with images of women which are partial and limited. Students should be guided to recognise stereotypes and idealised representations of women's lives. Images of women are often iconic and can be traced back to religious or cultural icons. These "idealised" images could be analysed in relation to information about the "real" lives of women. Students could consider to what extent real women's lives were similar or different to the images. This will involve identifying some different sources of information, including statistics, census returns and oral testimonies.

Activity

What can be learned about attitudes, beliefs and values about women from a particular programme, including:

- plot/story line;
- female characters (qualities, appearance, behaviour);
- other characters and their relationships.

Other questions which could dealt with are:

- How is the ideal housewife portrayed?
- Which family member is shown carrying out particular tasks, for example cooking, cleaning, caring?
- What do you notice about relationships within the family? Who are the most powerful members of the family? What sort of power do they have? How do they use it?
- What changes can be identified in family life over time? What has stayed the same?
- How visible are women in programmes and magazines that are not related to family life?
- Identify advertisements that are directed at women and that portray women. What are the adverts trying to sell? How are women portrayed? What messages are sent about their roles and responsibilities?
- In what ways did the lives of a group of women differ from the ideal?

Compare and contrast women in different political systems: activity

Compare and contrast the experiences of women in different political systems: communism, capitalism and fascism.

Learning objectives

The learning objectives are:

- to understand the impact of the political system on the lives of women, including their personal life;
- to identify differences between the experiences of women and to use the history of a particular area to explain the differences;
- to identify similarities in the experiences of women across Europe;
- to select relevant information within an enquiry and to use it critically;
- to reach substantiated judgements and conclusions and to assess their relative significance.

Background

The area covered in the activity below is vast and it is likely that teachers will need to select and adapt to particular needs. For example, by allocating different parts of the enquiry to different students/groups of students. Collective learning can be shared at the end and, if students are involved in teaching others, can be used to further consolidate their understanding.

Other approaches could include focusing on one area in depth. There is sufficient information available about the roles and responsibilities of women within the family in all three political systems. In particular, beliefs about the *role of women in reproduction, including ideas about genetics,* can be examined.

The family is an interesting choice because students often find it difficult to appreciate the powerful relationship between the political system – the public sphere – and the private, personal sphere within the home. A learning experience which enables them to see the differences between the impact of fascism and communism, for example, on women's lives can help them to better appreciate the inter-relatedness of the two areas.

An alternative approach could examine change between decades within one country or political system. It is more accessible for students in terms of identifying and organising relevant information if the decades chosen are at least twenty years apart.

Whatever approach is taken, students should design or be presented with questions around which to structure their enquiry. This will focus their research, helping them to select relevant information and to organise it effectively.

Representations of women in film, television, magazines, painting, sculpture are a rich and engaging source for students to use to identify ideas and beliefs about women within a particular society. During the second world war propaganda was used widely by all three political systems and much of this propaganda was about and directed towards women.

Activity

The enquiry could be focused around one or more interrelated areas, including:

- What beliefs and ideas did the particular system have about women (nature, role, responsibilities)?
- What impact did these ideas and beliefs have on women's experiences within: the family, education, work, political life.
- How were these ideas communicated to the people?
- What methods of propaganda were used?
- What are the differences between the three systems (fascism, communism, capitalism)? Use your knowledge of the history of each political system to help explain the differences.
- What are the similarities?
- Choose the most significant similarity and explain your choice?
- What conclusions can you reach from all your answers?
- Try to find three main points and explain your choice.

Why did women get the vote? – a historical debate: activity[1]

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are:

- to critically evaluate a range of interpretations about women's suffrage;
- to evaluate the short- and long-term impact of the vote and to suggest reasons why women have found it difficult to gain political representation;
- to make inferences about attitudes towards women from the history of women's suffrage;
- to understand the relationships between political, economic and social rights.

Context

In many European countries, historians disagree about why women got the vote. Many of the explanations ignore women and present the suffrage as a gift awarded by men in power. This makes women invisible from history. Some attribute the gaining of the vote to the contribution of women in times of war but ignore the impact of the political activism of suffragettes.

This activity enables students to learn about the different interpretations historians have about the past and to assess the validity and reliability of those interpretations.

It is also important to find out what arguments were used by those who opposed votes for women. What beliefs and values were they expressing about women? Similarities are evident in a number of European countries in relation to suffragettes issues and international comparisons can be made. In both France and Britain, for example, the vote has been attributed to the contribution of women to the war effort – an experience which enabled them to "prove" themselves and for which they deserved a reward.

The short- and long-term impact of votes for women should be identified and evaluated. Most women did not benefit in the short-term from the gaining of the vote and in many countries it is not seen as a significant turning point in the history of women's rights. Students could be asked to find out about current proportions of women and men politicians and discuss issues

---

1. Useful information on the acquisition of the suffrage for women in Europe is included in the activity "Status of women across Europe in the 20th century". This activity can also be used to develop ideas about political rights and citizenship.

of political representation. If students have done work on women within the family, education, media, they could be asked to identify possible causes of the lack of political power amongst women. In this way they can use prior learning effectively to make links and connections.

A study of suffragette campaigns is often a good opportunity to acknowledge the unity of women from different backgrounds in pursuit of a common aim.

The activity could be followed up with a class debate. The Internet has a number of sites devoted to this topic.

In most European countries, political rights (the vote) were seen as crucial if women were to get other rights such as economic (equal pay) and social (equality within the family) rights. Students should be encouraged to see the links between rights in different areas.

Activity

Historians have disagreed about why women got the vote. Some think it was because of the war effort. Some think it was because of the suffragette campaign. Some think it had nothing at all to do with the behaviour of women.

Look at the statements below. Each one could be used to support one side of the debate.

• Why did women get the vote in _____? war effort/suffragette campaign?

• Women in France contributed to the first world war effort but did not get the vote until the 1940s.

• Women were able to prove that they could do "men's jobs" during the war.

• Widespread publicity was won for women's rights by suffragettes.

• Violence and hunger strikes showed governments how determined women were.

• In Britain, many women who contributed to the war effort were 21 to 30 years old but this group did not get the vote until 1928.

Draw a table like the one below and sort out the statements.

Table 2: sorting statements

Women got the vote because of the war effort	Women got the vote because of the suffragette campaign

Which statements do you think are the most valid?

Choose statements from each side and explain whether you think this is a valid and reliable explanation or not. Statements could be ranked in order of importance as an explanation for why women got the vote.

Why was it important for women to get political rights (the vote) in order to get other rights?

Votes for women did not result in women taking over political power as some opposers had feared. Why do you think women have not achieved equal representation with men in almost all European countries?

Status of women across Europe in the 20th century: activity

Key themes

There are four key themes in this section:

- change and continuity in the status of women;
- having rights and enjoying rights;
- models of women's rights across Europe;
- the role of institutions such as the Council of Europe, the United Nations, in promoting and protecting women's rights.

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are:

- to know about and understand the legal status of women during the 20th century;
- to understand and use effectively terms such as "rights", "status", "legal", "political", "social", "citizenship", "discrimination", and to understand their significance to women's history in the 20th century;
- to identify change and continuity in the status of women in Europe in the 20th century;
- to understand the difference between "having rights" and "enjoying rights" and to be able to suggest reasons for the difference.

Context[1]

The main purpose of this activity is to learn about the development of women's rights both from the point of view of women's legal rights (having rights in theory) and the actual exercise of these rights (enjoying rights in practice). In other words, even when women did get legal rights to vote, own property, have equal opportunities at work and so on, women were not necessarily able to use or benefit from these rights in their real lives. This is often because social attitudes and values continued to discriminate against women.

At the start of the 20th century women did not have equal status with men in Europe but as second class citizens were excluded from public life and the

---

1. The section is partially based on a paper entitled "Developments in the status of women in the 20th century: legal and socio-political aspects" by Maria Regina Tavares da Silva. It was presented at the Council of Europe's 83rd European In-Service Training Seminar for Educational Staff, on the theme of the history of women in the 20th century.

running of society. At the same time, emancipation/freedom movements arose in all countries to put forward claims for equal citizenship with men. In particular, a suffrage/right to vote campaigns developed significantly in northern Europe and women in that area gained the vote earlier than women in the south of Europe.

The following information shows the dates of acquisition of the vote for women in European countries:

Finland	1906	Turkey	1934
Norway	1913	France	1944
Denmark	1915	Bulgaria	1944
Iceland	1915	Hungary	1945
Poland	1918	Albania	1945
The former Soviet Union	1918	Italy	1945
Austria	1918	Romania	1946
Germany	1918	Malta	1947
Ireland	1918	Belgium	1948
Netherlands	1919	The former Yugoslavia	1949
Luxembourg	1919	Greece	1952
The former Czechoslovakia	1920	Cyprus	1960
Sweden	1921	Monaco	1962
UK	1928	Switzerland	1971
Spain	1931	Portugal	1974

The above information suggests particular patterns in terms of the suffrage across Europe. Students should be encouraged to recognise differences between geographical areas, for example, northern, southern, western, eastern Europe; disparities at certain key points, for example, 1918 and 1945; and differences between different political systems, for example, communist and capitalist.

Acquiring the vote, however, did not mean that women in western Europe had gained equal rights of citizenship with men. For example, married

women in particular were excluded from political and public life and were subordinate to men within private life. In southern European countries, men, as the head of the family, could authorise their wives to work, choose their living accommodation, administer joint property, administer their wives' property.

Three main models of the legal status of women can be discerned across Europe:

- the Anglo-Saxon and Nordic model, influenced by common law and relatively more liberal;

- the Latin, south European model, heavily influenced by the Napoleonic Code which had excluded women from public life;

- the communist, eastern European model.

The period following the second world war saw important developments in human rights in general and including the status of women. The destruction of fundamental human rights before and during the war was fresh in everyone's minds and consequently the founding Charter of the United Nations formally established for the first time at a global level the principle of equality for men and women. In 1948 the Universal Declaration of Human Rights of the United Nations went one step further by guaranteeing that:

"Everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth in the declaration, without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex…. "

The declaration, therefore, was formally recognising that discrimination against women could and did stop them enjoying the legal rights which they had acquired in theory. The declaration was supplemented by two covenants adopted in 1966 which stated that:

"The States Parties to the present Covenant undertake to ensure the equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of all civil and political rights set forth in the present covenant."

In addition, the Council of Europe was established in 1949 with the role of safeguarding and promoting peace and human rights. In 1961 The European Social Charter, adopted at the Council of Europe, had provisions concerning the status of women, for example, regarding maternity protection for working women. In the 1960s, therefore, developments occurred in relation to specific conditions for women rather than mere general principles.

During the 1970s there arose a much greater awareness of the need to have an integrated approach to women's issues. For example, the need to make legal provision for social and economic rights as well as political and civil rights. During the 1970s the United Nations defined a range of areas where

action should be taken to promote women's rights, including family life, rural life, education, employment.

Such declarations and conventions, however, are limited at national level. Some individual countries within Europe have not accepted them entirely but entered reservations on the grounds of culture and tradition. These reservations often maintain situations of discrimination towards women, particularly within the family.

During the 1980s and 1990s there were further shifts in how women's rights were viewed by institutions such as the United Nations. The most important shift is to seeing women's rights as essential for the development of everyone within a society. In other words, the success of health care, educational reform, economic development is dependent in part upon women having an equal status with men.

Activity

- Discuss and explain the difference between "having rights in theory" and "enjoying rights in practice".

- Study the dates of the acquisition of the vote/suffrage for women in Europe. The dates could be mapped onto a timeline or map of Europe. Then organise the dates into different categories, for example, regions of Europe, key points in time, political systems, religion and faith.

- What conclusions can be reached about trends and patterns in when the suffrage was gained across Europe? What further questions could be asked about these trends and patterns?

- How useful are the three models of the legal status of women in organising the dates of the acquisition of the suffrage?

- Are there exceptions to the models? How can these exceptions be explained?

- What were the significant changes in the provision made for equal rights for women by institutions such as the United Nations and the Council of Europe between 1945 and 2000? Describe each change, explain its significance and suggest reasons for the change.

- Using additional resources, such as national and community (local government, school) policies towards equal rights for women, explore: how far do your national and local policies reflect international declarations, conventions and policies?

- Are their significant differences? If so, how can they be explained? It might be necessary at this point to refer to national culture, tradition, religion.

- Explain why equal rights for women is necessary for the successful development of the whole society.

Teaching about famous women: activity

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are:

- to critically assess the role of individual famous women within women's history;

- to understand the particular achievements and experiences within the context of the wider society;

- to use the history of famous women to identify attitudes towards all women within particular societies;

- to appreciate that being famous involves selection by the wider society and that this is dependent on social, cultural, political, economic context.

Background

Teaching about the lives of famous women can be problematic within women's history. Often these famous women are unusual, privileged and their "visibility" in contrast to the "invisibility" of the vast majority of women can underline the invisibility of the mass. To focus on a few famous women can suggest that they are merely the exception that prove the rule.

These problems can be addressed by both ensuring that women's history within the classroom is not just about the famous and by teaching the lives of the famous in a critical manner. Attention should be given to asking why it is that these particular women have become famous while others have not. What do the famous represent (physical attributes, wealth, intellectual achievements, cultural achievements) and what qualities have they shown (courage, determination, organisation, leadership, etc.). What can we learn from this about wider attitudes to women within society as a whole?

In addition, the achievements of famous women should be set within the context of the wider society. What trends were evident at the time that help to explain the achievements of particular individuals? Can groups or movements be identified that made the achievements possible? An examination of context also enables the student to appreciate barriers and challenges that particular individual might have had to face or overcome. In this way it is also possible to show why famous women are a minority in comparison with famous men.

The French historian Christine Bard refers to the need to recognise "gender outlaws" within the ranks of famous women. For example, women such as Joan of Arc, Greta Garbo, George Sand all blurred gender distinctions. This

69

can help students recognise the "atypical" nature and behaviour of many famous women.

Students can be helped to distinguish between women who achieved a great deal for women's rights as an aim, for example, Simone de Beauvoir, and others who achieved as a role model. For example, it is arguable that Margaret Thatcher contributed to women's rights as a role model but also damaged women's rights through particular political policies.

The Internet is a particularly effective way of gaining information about the lives of famous women (see Appendix I).

Activity

Students can be asked to structure their enquiry around the following questions:

• What were the achievements of _____?
• What was their contribution, if any, to women's rights?
• What barriers or challenges did they face and overcome?
• Why do you think they became famous and are still remembered today?

Analysing images of women: activity

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are the following:

- to use images of women to identify characteristic features and trends;
- to appreciate and understand the range of ways in which women in the past have been represented;
- to identify change and continuity in how women are represented over time;
- to use their knowledge and understanding of the period to interpret changes;
- to use sources critically and in their historical context.

Background

This activity involves collecting and analysing images of women from across the century and from across Europe. Representations of women in textbooks, paintings, sculpture, films, magazines, newspapers, advertisements, religious books, to name but a few resources, can be used.

Students should be encouraged to look carefully at the images before categorising and interpreting them. They should use their wider knowledge of particular periods, societies, individuals and trends to help explain characteristic features. The impact of the images on the women of that time could also be a focus.

When images are compared from across the century, the focus can be on change and continuity in the female body image. Such changes, such as shorter hair, trousers, can be symbolic of other changes in social attitudes towards women. Similarities and differences between the appearance of both men and women can stimulate hypotheses about changes in the relationship between men and women during the 20th century. Such changes in image could also reflect economic change or cultural influence from other parts of the world.

The images can be categorised according to different perspectives. Older students could decide on their own categories for the images while younger students could be given categories. The concept of "icons" could be used to help students categorise images and to trace their origins.

Students could be asked to consider who controls the images and whether women are being portrayed from a female or male perspective. Older students could be asked to what extent the women are shown as "objects" or as respected individuals.

71

Ideally the provenance of each source should be known. This enables the students to consider the impact of the date, purpose, author, on the content of the image. Knowing and understanding the purpose of the image is important in categorising and interpreting it.

Activity

Choose one image to describe in detail and focus on:

- what the image shows;
- how woman is portrayed;
- what the purpose of the image is;
- whether the image is symbolic.

How can the purpose of the image help to explain its content?

Focus on a range of images from across the century. What changes do you notice over time in images of women if you consider appearance, fashion, poses and physical action. How can these changes be explained?

Make a collage to illustrate your conclusions about images of women.

Using the Internet – teenage life across Europe: activity

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are:

- to use the Internet to exchange information with other students in Europe;
- to find out about cultural differences in teenage life across Europe with particular focus on girls;
- to explore issues of identity;
- to use prior learning within different contexts, make links and connections.

Background

The Internet is both a valuable source of information and a means of communicating with other schools in Europe. Prior to doing an activity of this kind, contacts will need to be made with a range of different schools who are willing to provide information or carry out the same enquiry.

The following suggests a way to use the Internet to carry out an enquiry into contemporary teenage life. Students will need to have a clear sense of the purpose of their enquiry. They will need to consider whether they want to collect information about all aspects of teenage life or focus on a particular aspect, such as fashion, money, school life, family responsibilities. The questions will need to be meaningful in a range of different cultures. It is, therefore, cross-curricular. The skills and knowledge used both to carry out the research and to explain the findings will be drawn from a range of curriculum areas, including information technology, history, geography, languages, religious education, communication skills.

After collecting information in response to the questions, students will need to analyse their findings. They will need to use language skills and historical skills of interpretation. The chapter below on "Case studies on making oral histories" has useful ideas for organising and interpreting information within a particular enquiry.

Students will need to use prior learning and research to explain differences between teenage life across Europe. For example, religious history, state of economy, impact of migration, ethnicity, can all be important in explaining teenage culture.

The information that has been collected and interpreted can be used to reach conclusions about issues of identity. Students can compare the relative importance of different identities on their culture. For example what affects their behaviour, attitudes and values the most – being a girl? a boy? a Muslim/Jew? a Buddhist? and so forth. Or being working/middle class. It could also be being from a different country. What is the impact of being a girl on teenage culture within a particular society? Is it more or less than within another society? How important are other identities, for example ethnic or religious, and how do they interact with gender identity?

The big picture – women and change: activity

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are the following:
- to identify change and continuity in women's lives over time;
- to identify links and connections between different areas of women's lives;
- to understand how change in one area can lead to change in another area;
- to make judgements about the importance of different changes.

Background

This activity suggests an approach to looking at changes across the 20th century and the relationships between those changes. For example, how did changes in the role of women during wartime lead to other changes in peacetime? How did changes in technology after 1945 lead to changes in domestic life from the 1950s onwards?

The enquiry should be focused and manageable. Depending on the age, ability and prior learning of the students, it could focus on change throughout the century or between two particular periods or across three or four decades. The following areas could be investigated: international events; work; technology; leisure; national politics; population size and structure; family life and health.

This activity could be done as a summative activity to learning about women's lives in the 20th century.

Activity

Students could be organised into small groups investigating the above-mentioned different aspects of the 20th century.

Each group could then consider how best to present their findings to the rest of the class. This would involve selecting relevant and interesting information and explaining it clearly. A record of the main points could be organised as shown in the following table. The table should then be used to help students make links between different areas, showing how change in one area can lead to change in another.

For example, changes in the post-war economy in many European countries caused a boom that meant that governments actively campaigned for female labour. This in turn helped to develop the campaign for equal pay and formed a central aim of campaigns by women for equal rights. The increase in the number of married women at work meant an increased provision of childcare and changes in family life.

Students could be asked to assess the significance of the changes in relation to the improved status of women. How did women benefit from the change? Were there any disadvantages for women? Which women benefited from the change and which did not?

Table 3: women and change

	1950s	1960s	1970s	1980s	1990s
International events					
Work					
Technology					
Leisure					
National politics					
Population structure					
Family life and health					

Note: this table could have a variety of headings as suitable to the context, for example, education, art and architecture.

Addressing sensitive issues in the classroom

Teaching the history of women is likely to arouse controversy within most European classrooms. This will occur because teaching about women in the past is very likely to raise questions about women's role in present societies. Depending on the particular context in which you work, this will challenge many assumptions and stereotypes that all students may have about the role and status of women today and in the past.

The following activity enables students to express their attitudes and feelings confidentially. At the same time it enables all the attitudes and feelings of the classroom to find expression and, therefore, be addressed in subsequent lessons. It also enables the teacher to gauge broadly the spectrum of attitudes and feelings within a particular group of students.

It is important to stress that there are no "right" answers to these questions. They are intended to help express views and provoke further discussion and debate about the role and status of women in our society.

Resources: copies of questionnaires for each student, large numbers 1-5 on wall.

To do the activity:

• hand out copies of questionnaires;

• students should fill them in. Point out that all the answers are confidential;

• all students fold up their questionnaires and swap them with someone else in the room, without looking;

• repeat the swapping several times until it is impossible to know who has whose questionnaire;

• ask students to open questionnaires and position themselves under large number on wall for question 1. Keep a record, for example, how many ticked 1/2/3/4/5;

• repeat for the remainder of the questions and record all the outcomes;

• discuss the outcomes.

Questionnaire

The questions below are intended to be examples, capable of being adapted and/selected to your own particular needs.

Table 4: opinion box

Statement	1 strongly disagree	2 agree	3 no opinion	4 disagree	5 strongly agree
Women and men should have very different roles in our society					
Women and men are equal in our society					
Women and men should be equal in our society					
A woman's class/ethnicity/religion are more important influences on her life than her gender					
50% of our curriculum should be about women's history					
We should learn about famous women in history lessons					
We should learn about groups of women in history lessons					
We should learn about ordinary women in history lessons					
Teaching the history of women will help to achieve equality in our society					
We should study "history of men" as well as that of women					

IV. Case study on women in the Soviet Union

Women in Stalin's Russia: introduction

Notes for teachers about "The crucial role of women in the Stalin's Russia" and "What is the big idea?" are to be found in the following sections.

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are:

- to understand the ideas of a Russian historian about the role of women in Stalin's Russia;
- to find out about the role of women in production (factory and farm work) and in reproduction (mothering and caring);
- to understand how and why this role was crucial to Stalin's Russia;
- to understand how one historian has put together hypothesis, argument and evidence.

Background

Adapted from an essay by the Russian historian Elena Osokina, "The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia" is a text which has been put in question and answer form. However it remains a fairly demanding piece of extended reading and should be adapted for particular groups of students.

"What is the big idea?" contains activities to support learning about the historian's ideas. These should also be adapted according to the classroom context. Suggestions about how to do this are given below.

Students will need to have some knowledge and understanding of Russian history before doing this work. It would be helpful to have been introduced to: the structure of Russian society, communism, beliefs and a brief history of the Soviet Union, industrialisation, urbanisation, production, reproduction. For example: how did Stalin try to industrialise the Soviet Union?

After Lenin's death Stalin started his fight for political power in the Soviet Union.[1] By the end of the 1920s he had won the political battle and began

---

1. It is essential that students understand the differences between the terms "Russia", the "Soviet Union" and the term denoting the latter's successor state, the "Russian Federation". It should be made particularly clear that Stalin's Russia refers to Soviet Russia or the former Soviet Union.

transformations which western historians call "Stalin's revolution from above". A key part of this revolution was to industrialise the Soviet Union. The main goal of this industrialisation was to develop heavy industry and be ready for war. Stalin wanted to industrialise the Soviet Union very quickly.

Industrialisation meant urbanisation: heavy industry was developed in factories which needed to be in towns. The workers in these towns needed food and the factories needed raw materials. Therefore from 1929 Stalin started collectivisation. Through collectivisation, peasant households were replaced with collective farms which were dependent on the state. Collectivisation was carried out through coercion and terror.

Adapting

"The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia" could be adapted in the following ways. Put students in groups. Give each group member/pair a specific question to focus on and after a set time, each member reports back to the group. The questions should be different to those that the essay is organised around so that students have to read and select the relevant information.

Questions could be made more or less difficult for different age and ability students. The whole essay could be given to each student or it could be divided up into sections and shared out to lower the reading demand. Examples of specific questions:

- How was propaganda used to get women to work?
- How was propaganda used to get women to be "feminine"?
- What type of work did women do between 1930 and 1935?
- What type of work did women do from 1935?
- How and why did women oppose Stalin's policies?
- What were the differences between women in the towns and women in the countryside?

Key words and phrases could be highlighted for students who find reading more difficult. The essay could be put on tape and students listen as they read. Students could make their own tapes of summaries (key points) of the essay.

Supplement the historian's account with illustrations, videos, history books. These could also be used to develop an activity that would enable students to compare the essay "The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia" with other sources of information about Stalin's Russia. The following areas could be focused on:

- How are women shown in other sources of information about Stalin's Russia;

- What do you learn about the "role of women" in these other sources?
- Do they show women as having a "crucial" role?
- What do you learn about the role of men in these other sources?
- Can you find evidence in these other sources that supports the ideas of the historian Elena Osokina?
- Can you find evidence in these other sources that do not support her ideas?

The section "What is the big idea?" could be adapted in the following ways. The second part of the activity focuses on the arguments and evidence that Osokina uses to support her hypothesis/big idea. These could be made more accessible by writing out arguments and evidence on cards and asking students to sort them into two piles. Further support to help students understand the historian's ideas could be done. For example, the following statements could be written out on cards and students asked to put them in a sequence that makes sense.

The statements in the table below are examples. Different statements will need to be done according to the age and ability of the students.

Table 5: statement box on Stalin's Russia

The historian Elena Osokina has a big idea about the role of women in Stalin's Russia.
This big idea is that women had a crucial role as producers and as reproducers.
She uses statistics to support her big idea.
These statistics show that the majority (most) of women worked outside the home.
She points to the difference between 1930 and 1935 and after 1935 as further evidence that women had a crucial role in Stalin's Russia.
Between 1930 and 1935 women were encouraged to go out to work by making the family seem less important.
After 1935 women were encouraged to have more children by making the family seem more important and by making abortion illegal.

The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia

1. Why were women needed as workers in Stalin's Russia?

The industrialisation of Russia meant that more workers were needed, both in the factories and in the collective farms. The state both encouraged and forced women to work in production – that is – in industry and collective farms. Women were also expected to work within the home as mothers and wives – as reproducers and carers.

2. How did the state get women to work?

The state made women work by changing the importance it gave to the family. This was done through laws and propaganda. For example the Code on Marriage, Family and Guardianship (1926) gave the same legal rights to people living together as those who were married. It made divorce easy. To get a divorce, one of the spouses could come to an official and ask for a divorce certificate and then inform the former spouse about the fact by letter. In addition, from 1920, women could have free, legal abortions. The Soviet Union was the first country in the world to legalise abortions.

These laws therefore carried on the Bolshevik's revolutionary agenda – to free women from the "drudgery of housework". Marxists thought of the family as a bourgeois/middle class institution that had to wither away in order for communism to grow.

3. Why did the state change its attitude towards divorce and abortion?

The state aimed to free women not for their own sake but for the good of production. The state tried to convince Soviet women that through work in industrialisation and collectivisation, they could improve their position within society. However, a women's chance for promotion was not equal to that of a man. In addition, an urban woman had a much better chance at improving her condition than a rural one. Women workers had to cope with difficult working conditions, discrimination and often harassment from male bosses and co-workers. The motives of the state were not, therefore, to make women equal for the good of women and the wider society but to get women to work in order to help the process of industrialisation.

4. How did women respond?

Millions of women joined the paid labour force. During the 1930s, more than 80% of those who entered the Soviet labour force for the first time were women. By the end of the decade more than 70% of Soviet women aged 16 to 59 were employed. Women became lathe operators, tractor drivers, teachers, doctors, agronomists, scientists, pilots and government bureaucrats. In the mid- to late 1930s women made up one-third of the students

enrolled in higher agricultural education. As a result thousands of women became managers in rural society.

5. What was the experience of women workers in Stalin's Russia?

As a whole, Stalin's transformations proved to be more of a nightmare than a happy life for the majority of Soviet women.

Forced industrialisation and collectivisation started a food crisis in the Soviet Union. Ration cards for food and goods were used from 1928 to 1936. When there was food shortage, the state tried to give what supplies of food and goods existed to industrial workers rather than to agricultural/rural workers and other non-industrial workers. Peasants were not given ration cards, and rations for the unemployed adult urban population were few and irregular.

As a result, women had to become industrial workers to receive higher norms than they could have as housekeepers, thus obtaining food at lower prices. By the end of the 1930s, about 40% of the workers in the Soviet Union were women. They worked mostly in light industry, where salaries were lower than in the heavy industries which had a predominantly male labour force.

Working in industrial production did not free women from taking care of their families. Shopping and housekeeping were traditionally thought of as women's work and in the 1930s made up a large part of their life. As a consequence, women had a double burden: in addition to working full time at the factories, they still had to secure food and clothing for their families at a time when shortages were common.

6. How did women in the towns react to the shortage of food?

There was much protest about the shortage of food. Most of the protestors were women. Urban male workers were less likely to protest. In the metal factories, an industry dominated by male workers, there were twenty-two strikes during the first half of 1930. In the textile industry, dominated by women workers, there were ninety-two strikes during only the first three months of 1930! The biggest one, where 600 women participated, took place at the Telegin textile factory in the Ivanovo-Voznesensk region. Women stopped their work asking for better bread rations with the slogan: "You make work us hard but give us no bread".

The most common protests were in the lines at the food shops and most of the people in these queues were women. In June 1930 at the Black Sea city of Novorossiysk about 350 women destroyed two bread shops and headed to the city authorities shouting: "Give us bread and meat!" By the end of the day the number of protestors had reached 800. Moving through the city, they beat two policemen and a director of the co-operative store. On their march, women asked male workers from the nearby railway station and cement factory to join the demonstration but they refused. The women then

headed toward the international ships at the port. They beat a captain of a foreign ship as a way of protesting against Soviet export of grain. The demonstration ended only after the city authorities agreed to a meeting.

Evidence from this time shows a picture of semi-starvation in the cities and gives us many examples of women's resistance.

7. What happened to women in the countryside during the food shortage?

The situation in the countryside during the first half of the 1930s was even worse than in the cities. Peasants were not given ration cards. They were supposed to feed themselves out of the collective farms' production and the individual farmland that remained. However, the state made this very difficult by destroying individual farmland and taking almost all the agricultural produce to provide food for the towns and the army, and to export abroad.

Under this policy just one failed harvest was enough to result in tragedy. In 1932-33 a bad harvest caused a terrible famine. Millions died. During the famine, rural women as a whole found themselves in worse situations than men.

Men were more mobile (could move around easier) than women because their role within the family was seen as less crucial. They migrated to the cities to work in the factories and left their wives and children behind in the villages. Some of them helped their families by sending money and clothes, others soon forgot about their peasant past, remarried and had new families in the cities. Between 1926 and 1939 about 23 million persons, disproportionately male, left the countryside to take up permanent residence in towns. Another 5.5 million rural residents, once again overwhelmingly male, were temporarily absent for seasonal work outside their native villages.

The growing number of women who were left in the countryside had to take care of their children and household and had to work in the collective farms. By the end of the 1930s women made up almost 60% of the available rural labour force and an even larger proportion of those involved in actual agricultural work, like raising crops and caring for livestock. Rural males continued to control the most powerful and better-paid positions in the new collective farms: chairmen, assistant chairmen, managers, brigade leaders, book keepers and accountants.

8. How did women protest in the countryside?

There was more resistance in the countryside than in the cities. Women played a very important role in this rural unrest. In 1929, out of 1307 uprisings registered in the countryside, 486 were entirely made up of women. During the first half of 1930, among 8707 registered uprisings in the villages, 2800 were almost entirely made up of women.

Documents from this time also show male peasants often used women at the head of the crowds as a shield because they believed the authorities would

deal leniently with women, due to their "female emotionalism" and "lower political consciousness".

9. What happened to women during the Good Years?

By 1934 the food crisis was over. The years 1934-36 are known as the "Good Years". The government abolished the rationing system. More food and goods could be bought in the shops. Many new shops were opened all around the country, along with cafes and restaurants. People, especially in the towns, could go to movie theatres, theatres, music halls, art exhibits. For many, life became better and more enjoyable.

At the same time, there was an important change in the role women were to fulfil. The state needed to increase the population after the deaths caused by famine and collectivisation. Women had an important role as reproducers of children. Laws and propaganda were used to encourage women to have more children.

Soviet media began to urge women to become more "feminine". Hair perms, manicures, stylish clothes, cosmetics, recently seen as "bourgeois luxuries", became necessary for the ideal woman, the "new Soviet woman".

The government proclaimed that the family was one of the most important parts of Soviet society. The decrees of 1936 made divorce more difficult and made abortion illegal. Divorce now required the presence of both spouses at a governmental registration office, and the fact of the divorce was documented in passports. Divorce was made expensive. The government gave subsidies (money) to women with large numbers of children in order to encourage a rise in the birth rate.

At the same time women were not freed from their role in production. The government continued to encourage women to work outside the home. An American historian, Roberta Manning, has analysed women's pictures published in the newspaper *Pravda* (Truth) – the main propaganda organ of the Central Committee of the Communist Party. She found out that half the women who appeared in *Pravda* photos in 1936 were shown for their work achievements, and almost all were identified in the captions by their occupation. As a result, women continued to carry a double load – both working in production and in the family.

10. When did the Good Years end?

The Good Years ended with local famine in the countryside at the end of 1936. According to documents, women with children, whose husbands went to work in the cities, were the first to suffer and die. The famine in the countryside caused a food crisis in the cities. Ration cards were re-introduced in order to make sure that town workers had enough food. Once again, long lines, empty stores and the fight for food became a part of a woman's daily

life. Fortunately, the harvest of 1937 was excellent. The food situation rapidly improved and the crisis was overcome.

11. What happened to women during the Great Terror?

The years 1936-38 are known as the "Great Terror" – the bloodiest time of Stalin's rule. Millions were arrested, shot or died in the concentration camps from hard work, diseases and starvation. Nobody, except Stalin, could feel safe.

Thousands of women became victims of the Great Terror. They were arrested, shot, sent to the concentration camps as the alleged "enemies of the people" or for being the wives, sisters, daughters, mothers or friends of accused "enemies of the people". Many were punished for not having informed on their husbands, sons, fathers and friends. Those women left "free", lived and worked under the stigma of being a relative of an "enemy of the people".

Stalin kept the wives of his closest men in concentration camps as hostages. For example, Polina Zhemchuzhina, the wife of V. Molotov – Chief of the Council of People's Commissars, second in command after Stalin, was arrested and kept in a camp. Some women have left their memoirs about those terrible years, such as Eugenia Ginzburg's *Journey into the whirlwind.*

12. What role did women play in the Soviet war effort?

During the war, women played a crucial role in the mobilisation of people and resources. By 1943 about eight hundred thousand female volunteers were serving in the Soviet armed forces, making up 8% of the military. They were not only in the medical corps, in transport, and in clerical positions, but also in combat as tank drivers, snipers, sappers, machine gunners and pilots. Women fought in the underground resistance in the occupied territories.

Women contributed much to the victory by taking the places of men in industry and agriculture. By the end of the war women made up 56% of the paid labour force (about 40% in 1939). In comparison, American women made up 36% of the national labour force in 1945. In agriculture, the labour force became almost entirely female. During this time, women held the leading positions of factory directors and heads of the collective farms. During the war, most Soviet physicians were women.

In the post-war period, the state continued the pre-war policy of encouraging women's crucial role within the family and within production. At the beginning of the 1950s women played a very important role in industry and in agriculture they made up about 60% of the farm workers. Besides working in production, women were expected to recreate "happy" homes and they did this under very poor living conditions, including hunger. In addition, after the war men retrieved their jobs as managers in industrial and agricultural production.

What is the big idea?

The following activities are on the question and answer text in the previous section, "The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia".

Activity

Read the text "The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia". Support your reading by: highlighting/listing important points, recording ideas and thoughts; recording words/points that you do not understand.

Check your understanding of terms that she uses. For example, what is "the crucial role of your teacher in the classroom?" What does Osokina mean by "the crucial role of women"? (Imagine you are explaining it to a friend/parent/younger student).

Historians organise their ideas about the past around a hypothesis or big idea. You must now find the big idea or hypothesis in Osokina's work. Look at the table below. Tick what you think is the big idea.

Table 6: what is the big idea?

	Tick
Ration cards existed from 1928 to 1936.	
There was a change in the role of women after 1935.	
The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia was to be producers (industrial workers) outside the home and reproducers (mothers) inside the home.	
Women played a very important role in resisting (opposing) Stalin's policies. They took part in strikes and demonstrations. They were often punished by being sent to Siberia, Kazakhstan and the Russian north.	
The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia was to be happy and beautiful.	

Compare your choices with other students around you. Record the reasons you and other students have given for your choice.

Osokina supports her big idea (hypothesis) with supporting arguments and with evidence. The remainder of the questions will help you to understand this process.

1. Osokina argues that women played a crucial role as producers in Stalin's Russia.
- Why did Stalin need women to work as producers in industry?
- Why did Stalin need women to work as producers in agriculture?

2. Osokina also argues that women played a crucial role as reproducers in Stalin's Russia.
- How did women support Stalin's Russia within the home as well as in the work place?

3. Osokina argues that the state used propaganda and laws towards women to support industrialisation and not to support equality for women.
- What were the laws about divorce and abortion up to 1936?
- What were the laws about divorce and abortion after 1936?
- Why was there a change in the laws about divorce and abortion from 1930 to 1935 and 1936 onwards?

4. Osokina also argues that one of the crucial roles of women did not change during the period.
- Which of the crucial roles of women did not change during the period?

Fill in the table at the end of the section to help you answer questions 3 and 4.

5. Osokina argues that women were important as protestors against conditions in Stalin's Russia.
- What is her evidence for this argument?
- What happened to some of the women who opposed/resisted Stalin?

Table 7: change and similarty

Differences in the role of women between 1930-35 and 1935 onwards: change	Reasons for the differences
1930-35 women were not encouraged to be mothers. After 1935 women were encouraged to have more children; abortion was made illegal.	Stalin wanted the population of the Soviet Union to rise, for example preparing for war.
Similarities in the role of women between 1930-35 and 1935 onwards: continuity	Reasons for the similarities

Propaganda and reality: images of women in the Soviet Union

Learning objectives

The learning objectives for this section are:
- to focus on, analyse and be critical of images of women photographed during the Stalinist period;
- to use these images to find out about their lives;
- to understand how we can use propaganda to find out about the past;
- to identify similar sources of information in their own societies and to evaluate them in a critical way.

Background

These activities ideally should be done after having read: "Women in Stalin's Russia: introduction", "The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia" and "What is the big idea?"

If they are not done after, the students will need some background knowledge about life during this period, for example on the communist system, famine, rationing, collectivisation.

Adapting and extending

"Images of women in the Soviet Union: the historian's view" is an analysis of the nature and purpose of propaganda in Soviet Union. It should be read only by students towards the upper end of the age/ability range, if at all. It should be used as a supplement to visual sources and to support teacher knowledge, understanding and therefore lesson planning. If a copy of the film *The happy way* cannot be used, the approach can be applied to other propaganda films of the time both inside and outside the Soviet Union.

Similarly, the same approach could be used with different types of sources including stamps, coins, statues, adverts and so on.

Information could be selected from "Images of women in Soviet Union: the historian's" view to enable students to extend their understanding of Stalin's Russia. If students are going to read it for themselves the reading techniques used earlier could be repeated (see "The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia").

The happy way narrative should be shown as visually as possible. Take a sheet of A4 divided into six boxes. Draw key scenes/lines from the story into each box. Students focus on and analyse the narrative in this way. This

technique can be used to support student understanding of films that they have seen as well as those they have not!

You may find the following structure helpful for students writing an essay at the end of this section.

The following is a list of paragraph headings:

- the hypothesis/big idea about the crucial role of women;
- the purpose of propaganda;
- images of women in Soviet propaganda;
- how we can use the propaganda – what it tells us;
- women as workers outside the home;
- women as workers inside the home;
- a brief introduction to Stalin's Russia;
- the differences and similarities in propaganda and policies before and after 1935.

Then, choose the headings you want to use, put them in a clear and logical order and make notes under each heading. Add an introduction and a conclusion.

Using photographs of women in the Soviet Union

Use photographs Nos. 4, 5 and 6 as sources of evidence about: the role of women in the food supply, the role of women in the rationing system and the physical and emotional appearance of women.

Ask:

- Who are in the photographs? Men/women/children? What are they doing?
- How are they dressed? What is their pose?/How are they standing?
- What expressions can you see on their faces? What other clues can you use to learn about their lives?

Compare Nos. 1, 2 and 3 with 4, 5 and 6. The first group were produced by the government and used as propaganda. The second group were produced by private photographers. Ask:

- What are the differences between the two sets of photographs?
- What clues are there that Nos. 1, 2 and 3 were used as propaganda while the others were not?

Alternative/supporting questions could include:

- Who produced this source of evidence? (private/state photographer?)
- Why was it produced? What was its purpose?

Following on from the questions above, decide which set of photographs is more reliable an investigation into the reality of women's lives under Stalin? Give reasons for your answer.

Then decide which set of photographs is more useful for finding out about the attitudes towards women in Stalin's Russia? Give reasons for your answer.

How far does the evidence in the photographs support the evidence in the essay "The crucial role of women in Stalin's Russia"?

92

1. A peasant is buying his daughter a new coat
(Stalingrad, 1933)

2. A perfume shop (1940)

3. "The Good Years": abolition of the rationing system for bread – a bakery inside a car factory (Gorky, 1935)

4. People buying bread on the first day of the rationing system (Moscow, 1929)

94

5. A bread line (Moscow, 1929)

6. Peasants who did not receive their ration coupons, heading home after selling milk to buy bread (Moscow region, 1929)

Images of women in the Soviet Union: the historian's view[1]

Soviet media – newspapers, radio, and the arts – played a very important role in Stalin's transformation of and control over the Soviet society. The Soviet media was totally controlled by the state. Its main purpose was to explain and promote all of Stalin's campaigns. Every day Soviet people opened newspapers and turned on the radio to read and to hear about their happy destiny to live in the first proletarian society and to take part in the creation of a new world.

Movies as propaganda

Soviet movies played an important part in the brainwashing. The beauty of the music, poetry, choreography, professional acting and directing strengthened the messages that movies brought to the population.

Images of women in movies

Women were the central characters of many Soviet movies under Stalin. This was because Stalin saw women as having a crucial role to play in the transformation of Russia. The movies were almost entirely comedies or musicals. The female type was shown as beautiful and talented; women who became happy through working for the good of the state. There was no trace in the movies of starvation, queues for food, fear, terror or any other pressures of life under Stalin. Instead, the Soviet woman sang, danced, smiled, and, most importantly, worked.

The happy way *(1940)*

One of the best examples of a Russian propaganda film from Stalin's Russia is *The happy way* (*Svetlyi put'*) directed by Grigoriy Aleksandrov and starring Lyubov' Orlova.

The happy way is a Cinderella story, a Soviet industrial Cinderella. The story has all the characters of this genre: a prince in the palace, a fairy godmother and a poor girl – Tanya – who finally becomes a princess.

Tanya, the heroine, comes to a big city to be a household servant in a family. The movie does not provide any explanations about why she left her village. The main causes for the mass movement from the countryside to the cities in the 1930s – collectivisation, repression, mass famine – are not shown in the story. At the start of the movie we see Tanya as an illiterate peasant girl in rag

---

1. Based upon a text by Elena Osokina.

clothes with a dirty face. She cooks, cleans and takes care of her house-lady's child.

Then one day she meets the man of her dreams and falls in love. However, Tanya cannot even hope for his love because of the social and cultural gap between them – he is an engineer at a big textile factory.

At this point a fairy godmother – the local party leader, comes to change Tanya's life for the best. The fairy godmother makes Tanya leave her servant job and brings her to the "palace" – a big textile factory – and a place that Tanya has dreamt about. From now on she works in the daytime and goes to school in the evenings. In this way she makes her way from an unskilled worker to a *Stakhanovite* (a worker who exceeds the production plan by many times). Sometimes Tanya makes political mistakes (do not forget about her peasant origin) but the fairy godmother is always nearby to help Tanya raise her proletarian consciousness.

The movie creates a picture of happy and healthy workers. The factory is light and clean. The movie does not show the real working conditions of the 1930s and the inequality (in salaries and rations) between male and female labour in the Soviet Union. In reality, bad living conditions, and often hunger forced the majority of Soviet women into industrial work. The movie does not show the strikes in the textile industry and the female anti-Soviet demonstrations.

For her amazing achievements in the factory, Tanya is invited to Moscow. In the Kremlin with many other distinguished workers, peasants, intellectuals, military people she receives her first decoration. The final episode of the movie shows Tanya, beautiful and happy, with her engineer-prince in Moscow. They are equal now. Together, they are ready to make their country stronger.

Images of women and men in Soviet propaganda

One of the main purposes of these movies was to persuade Soviet women that participation in the making of the Soviet state would make them socially and professionally equal to Soviet men. However, that was not true. In reality, the chances for promotion were never equal for a man and a woman. Other Soviet propaganda tells us more about the official attitude about women and the inequality between men and women.

In the 1930 Soviet coins only showed the male image. None of the 300 plus stamps issued by the Soviet government after the revolution included women in their design. The female image appeared for the first time on stamps in 1929 with the issue of four stamps. An analysis of Bolshevik political posters suggests that they saw the revolution largely as a male event.

Almost all the post-revolutionary posters showed only men and were directed at a male audience.

However, from the early 1930s the female figure on posters became more familiar. The economy needed female labour at this time and posters began to show images of working women.

The male figure remained the central and universal symbol of the proletariat and the victory of socialism. The female form played only a supportive role. She made the central image only on the posters for "women's" campaigns. Industrialisation posters continued to be predominantly male. When appearing on posters with men, a woman always took second place or stood for "the peasantry". The peasantry, according to Soviet ideology, played a secondary role to the workers in building a socialist society.

The same ideas about the role and status of women and men are reflected in the sculpture of the time. The most famous example is Vera Mukhina's statue *The industrial worker* and the *Collective-farm woman* ("Rabochiy I Kolkhoznitsa"), which decorated the Soviet pavilion at the Paris Exhibition of 1937. In Soviet propaganda, women were "the other".

The Great Retreat: 1935 onwards

From the mid-1930s (the period known as the "Great Retreat"), the propaganda started promoting women's role as loving mothers. This was the state's mobilisation for reproduction (having babies). In 1938 the first stamp on childcare was issued, and in 1940 the Order of the Glory of Motherhood was instituted. Movies were also used to persuade women to have more children.

In these images, children were not shown as making women's lives more difficult. For example, in the movies, mothers never had any problems in securing food and clothing for their families. In reality, during the next supply crisis in the winter of 1939-40, some women wrote to Stalin that they were thinking of killing their children because there was no food.

Even during the mobilisation for reproduction, movies very seldom showed a woman as just a mother, and a housekeeper could never be their central character. The state never stopped encouraging women to seek employment. Their nurturing role was always in addition to state employment.

Images of women in the Soviet Union: activity

Read the preceding section entitled "Images of women in the Soviet Union: the historian's view" and examine the images described in this text.

Using all the material in this section, fill in the table below. An example has been done for you.

Table 8: image and reality

Image: what Soviet propaganda shows us about the role and status of women	Reality: what Soviet propaganda does not tell us about the role and status of women
Women who worked in Soviet factories were happy and healthy, as shown in *The happy way.*	Conditions in Soviet factories were poor, for example dirty, dangerous, overcrowded.

How can you explain the difference between the information in the first column and the information in the second column? For example, what does the difference between the two columns tell you about Soviet propaganda?

We can use propaganda to find out about attitudes towards women and methods of controlling people in Soviet Russia.

Use the following questions to help you use the images to find out about these two areas:

- How are women shown? Think about pose, expression, purpose.
- What is the "ideal" woman?
- How might these images affect people?
- Who would see them? Where? How often?
- Why do pictures make effective (good) propaganda?

You could also use propaganda images to find out the differences between the role of men and women in Stalin's Russia.

What about your society?

Identify national and/European images from your own country, for example, stamps, coins, national/state campaigns, adverts, and so forth. Ideally you should identify images from today and from the past. The following questions could then be addressed:

- What similarities and differences can you find between your images and the Soviet images/between your images from today and the past/between your images from your nation and from Europe?
- What do you learn from these images about the role that women are supposed to play in your society and/in Europe?
- Can you think of any ways in which reality is different from the images?
- Can you explain these differences?
- Can you find any images of women from the Council of Europe? Describe them.
- What do these images tell you about the Council's attitudes to women?

The role of the historian

by Elena Osokina

The role of the historian in any country and in any time is the study of the past. The knowledge that the historian provides through research not only serves scholarly purposes but also carries out very important social and political functions in society. It satisfies the public interest in history and provides information (textbooks, educational video programme, syllabuses and so forth) for teaching history at schools and higher education institutions. The historical knowledge about the past also plays an important role in guiding an economic, social and political course for the future development of a country. In this sense, the debate about the past is also a debate about the future, and debate about history is very often a debate about politics.

Historians can successfully accomplish their professional mission only if certain factors exist: access to information (archives, libraries, living witnesses, etc.), the freedom to express in public and in the press personal points of view, the open scholarly exchange between professionals in the world, and the separation of professional history from politics (historians must not accept evaluations from politicians).

For many decades these necessary conditions for successful work in history were missing in the Soviet Union. Although this was not a period of complete stagnation in historical research, the access of historians to the archives relating to 20th century history was considerably restricted. Special party-state ideological departments supervised history and historians. The censorship and repression did not allow for new research and new approaches to develop. Scholars who expressed the official point of view held a monopoly of control in branches of history. Unofficial views were possible only in private. History was a servant of ideology. Soviet historians were isolated from the historical profession in the west. As a result, the history of the 20th century and also some issues from earlier periods written by Soviet historians were substantially falsified. Soviet historians owed a large debt to science and the public. It can be said that the above is also true of the eastern European countries that were under the Soviet sway.

Gorbachev's policy of perestroika and glasnost, launched soon after he was appointed General Secretary of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union in March 1985 opened a new era for the Soviet/Russian and eastern European historians. A mental revolution started and historians were to play one of the leading roles. The main task which they carried out was a re-examination of the past – first and most of all, rethinking the principles and practice of socialism in their countries. The new historical research was to be based on previously secret information and a new methodological approach.

However, we must say that in the Soviet Union historians, with a few exceptions, were not the first to start the fight. Novelists, journalists and social scientists discussed crucial aspects of Soviet history for almost a year by the time historians, at the end of 1988, joined the search for truth. This delay happened not only because professional historians, unlike journalists and publicists, who are "thirsty for sensation", have to provide a detailed and objective study based on research and analysis of many sources, but mainly because of the ideologisation and conservatism of the official history in the Soviet Union. It is not by accident that the historical "portfolio" of works completed in the past but rejected from publication for ideological reasons turned out to be much smaller than that of the novelists. Literature, in the first stage of the mental revolution, overtook the historians in the re-examination of the Soviet past.

Historians were slow to start but then, along with an increasing polarisation in their views of the socialist past, they became leading participants in the development of the mental revolution. Pursuing their professional goals they did not just passively "consume the fruits of perestroika". They took an active part in the scholarly and public debate, and in the social and political struggle. Their participation was one of the factors that broadened and pushed the reforms forward.

What credits should be given to the historians? What were the results achieved through their efforts?

Historians succeeded much in the complicated and stormy battle for access to information. In the Soviet Union, due to pressure from society, some new appointments in the central archival administration were made. The process of declassification of secret materials started. Historians worked and are working with archivists in the commissions to declassify information. As a result, during the period 1989-98 the archives released many millions of files. The major progress in the Russian archives was achieved after the defeat of the August *coup d'état* in 1991. With the opening of archives, publication activity followed. As a result, Soviet history now has volumes of published documents on subjects that were secret in the past. These are party-state documents, materials of the political police, letters, diaries, etc. The publication of documents continues. Almost all of the big current publication projects are international.

The fight for information took place in libraries as well. Thousands of books that under communists were kept in special libraries departments, with limited access for researchers, were transferred to the general reading rooms. Thus, historians and the general public received access to western historiography.

Access to information and freedom to express views made the re-examination of the past possible. Many aspects of pre-revolutionary and Soviet history were studied during the Gorbachev and Yeltsin eras. The most stormy discussions were on the Stalinism issue: mass repression, compulsory collectivisation, the 1932-33 mass famine, industrialisation, alternatives to Stalinism, the Stalinist system, and so on. These days, new topics are attracting the attention of Russian historians: Soviet foreign policy, the second world war, the cold war, history of non-Russian nationalities and many others. Historians from the former socialist eastern European countries had their "blank spots" in the historical past to study and discuss.

Research and discussions materialised in many substantial articles and interesting books on history that came out during the last decade. Of course, it is not a complete version of the past (if such could be created at all). However, historians have accomplished a very important work in gathering and analysing new information, covering with knowledge the former blank spots in their national histories. Such work is a necessary prerequisite in the formulating of new paradigms and concepts.

Historians succeeded in bringing information to the public. The existing academic historical journals were reformed. These days they publish materials on the most sensitive historical issues of the past. During the mental revolution new historical newspapers, journals, and magazines appeared, including some independent of the state. Hundreds of thousands of presentations in the public halls, on TV, and on the radio were given by historians about the most crucial historical issues.

It is important to note the role of historians in fighting the crisis in teaching. With the collapse of official history in the Soviet Union, and other east European countries of former socialist orientation, a crisis in history teaching emerged. Dogmatic textbooks with a false conception of historical development could not satisfy the growing interest of the young generation fed by the mental revolution. Teachers and students found themselves in a hard situation. Teachers did not know how to answer their students' questions, the students did not know how to answer exam questions. The tension between teachers and students grew. As a culmination of the teaching crisis, in the Soviet Union schools had to cancel the final leaving examination in history and social studies; many departments at universities cancelled their entrance exams on history. Due to the efforts of historians, by the end of the 1990s the teaching crisis in history was overcome. New syllabuses, new textbooks and other teaching materials were produced. They are not comprehensive yet. However, they give a refreshing look at the historical past, they incorporate the work of the western historians, and they contain many insights which stimulate discussion.

During the mental revolution a new generation of Russian and east European historians emerged (they are in their 30s and early 40s now). They present a large spectrum of views on history. This new generation, born during the policy of glasnost is open-minded and respects the professional competence of their colleagues in the world. As for the methodology, modern European historians use a vast array of comparative studies in history. A very important result of their scholarly work and social activity is that the Russian and east European historians came out of their isolation and became a part of the world historical community. Due to their work, to a large extent, professional history in the Russian Federation and eastern Europe is now separated from politics.

With all the results achieved we cannot say that the mental revolution in the Russian Federation and eastern Europe has been completed. There is a lot to do in rethinking the past or in studying new topics that the historical development of the world produces. The fight for information, including archives, is to be continued. As a matter of fact, after vast progress in 1991-92, the process of opening the archives in the Russian Federation today has slowed down. Some documents that were previously available have even been reclassified and are no longer available to the public.

The work to improve teaching materials in history should be continued as well. Russian and east European historians have to maintain and develop their position in the world historical community by taking an active part in conferences, scholarly exchange programs, international projects, and so on. Having in mind that for the last several years the public interest in history has declined, historians should put more efforts in popularising the results of their research through the media. The crucial role in the accomplishment of this extensive programme will belong to the new generation of historians raised during the mental revolution of the late 1980s and the 1990s.

Selected readings

Davies, R.W., *Soviet history in the Gorbachev revolution* (Indiana University Press, Bloomington and Indianapolis, 1989)

Davies, R.W., *Soviet history in the Yeltsin era* (St. Martin's Press, Inc., N.Y., 1997)

McClarnand, Elaine, "The politics of history and historical revisionism: de-Stalinisation and the search for identity in Gorbachev's Russia, 1985-1991"; in *The History Teacher*, Vol. 31, Number 2, February 1998

McClarnand, Elaine, "The debate continues: views on Stalinism from the former Soviet Union"; in *The Soviet and Post-Soviet Review*, 20, No. 1, 1993

V. Case studies on making oral history[1]

A classroom approach to oral history

Oral or personal history can be particularly valuable in relation to women. The "invisibility" of women's history can be made visible through building up oral sources of information. Women often serve as the memory of their family and local community history. Oral history is also appropriate to 20th century history where most developments and events can be recalled by individuals.

The section below shows a rigorous approach to using oral history in the classroom. It could be used to support most of the activities in the pack and in particular the "Three generations of women: activity".

What is oral history?

It is historical narrative composed of evidence gained through oral interview of witnesses. This is perhaps a most pretentious way of describing what is the most democratic form of historical research. It requires no expensive resources and can be accessed to some degree by anyone who is able to speak or listen. Furthermore, everyone can choose to be a historian and a source. Everyone has an oral history of their own that they can share with others and the topic matter is limited only by the interviewees available.

Why use oral history?

Obviously the accessibility of oral history is not in itself a sufficient reason to employ it in the classroom. Oral history is much more than a cheap somewhat unsatisfactory alternative to the use of texts or technology in delivering the curriculum. It has many strengths which make it a worthwhile classroom strategy.

It helps the student to develop important social skills

Many of the most basic social skills which the student will acquire through life are important practical tools to the oral historian. The student must develop listening skills and the tolerance not to interrupt. They must think hard about how to formulate questions which will generate useful and precise answers and how to approach subjects which can sometimes be very sensitive. They

---

1. This section is based upon ideas developed by Philip Ingram.

must develop their own self-awareness to realise the importance of their own body language and tone of voice.

It is socially important

Oral history breaks down the barriers between different people and can have an important social role. This is especially significant if your students interview much older people. The break-up of the extended family in many areas of Europe has broken the link between youth and old age. The old and young have developed stereotypes for each other which are damaging and dangerous. These stereotypes can be challenged through face to face contact. Oral history offers the shared experience. It enables individuals to empathise and value each other. It builds mutual respect between witness and listener.

It will make history more popular with students

Oral history puts a human face on your lessons. For some students it shows that history is not confined to the classroom, it is a happening which affects them and their relations. It is about where they have come from. It is immediate and intimate. Above all it is active and practical. It puts the serious work of the historian into the students' hands and breaks the passive character of the history lesson. Students are able to *do* history instead of just study it.

It helps the student to develop historical skills

It is too easy to think of oral history as a socialising experience without real academic merit. If we are to get the greatest benefit from this important area we must also treat it as a serious academic pursuit. Once the interviews have taken place the real work should begin. Students must be encouraged to question their evidence, put it into useful categories and employ it to tell a story which goes beyond the experience of an individual.

Challenging myths and formulating a world view

So much of popular or local history is riddled with bias, based on ethnicity or sectarianism that when we ask our students to carry out interviews we run the risk of opening them to popular indoctrination in local or national myths about the past. We must remember however that our students are already exposed to such myths and it is only through allowing them to develop their own critical faculties that we can hope to assist the student in forming a more balanced worldview. Obviously the teacher must be careful here or they too will become part of the myth-making. Remember it is the role of the teacher to encourage critical thought about the past, not to counter one-sided myths with their own possibly biased ideas.

Oral history allows the student access to an enormous amount of information

Through their interviews my own students have gained secondary experience of so many events which have seemed lost in time. They have come back to me with descriptive scenes of world events; zeppelins exploding over England in 1915; allied interventionist forces with the Whites in Russia; Italian prisoners of war singing as they worked in the fields of southern England during the second world war. They revive memories of national events, such as mining disasters and the effects of unemployment during the 1930s and they remember many of those oral experiences which made up everyday life in the past such as shy pre-war courting rituals or the use of corporal punishment in schools.

Problems with oral history

Despite its obvious value, oral history is a most underused classroom strategy. Too often its image is a poor one. Witnesses often give evidence of dubious veracity or value which students are unable to challenge or correct within their own thinking. Below are a number of practical case studies which should serve to illustrate some of the problems encountered by students.

Case study 1

Witnesses will sometimes provide evidence which has no general significance, however memorable or important to them. One woman told a tale at great length about a disagreement she had once had with a customer whilst serving in a shop. The argument was of an oral and very narrow nature but the woman's vivid recollection made my students convinced that it had some broader significance which they could not fathom.

Case study 2

Evidence may not agree with the national trends which are accepted by most historians. The student may therefore come away with an unrepresentative view. A woman described how formal courting precluded any form of sex prior to marriage during the 1930s. This may be her experience (and it is a popular view), but it ignores existing statistical evidence about unwanted pregnancies and the amount of couples who cohabited without ever marrying.

Case study 3

Students are often exposed to false memories from their witness. One man recalled walking over the top of a bus in a snow drift during the harsh winter

of 1947. The story may or may not be true, but whatever the case, the student completely accepted the truth of the story.

Case study 4

Witnesses will often simply fail to recollect details which may be important. A woman (born 1904) simply ran out of memories. In such a case there is a real danger of the student posing leading questions in order to get the desired answers. A useful way to restart the memory can be the use of photographs or even a site visit. Oral or contemporary artefacts may also be profitably employed.

Case study 5

Witnesses sometimes suffer from *intermittent* memory loss. A woman describing her use of corporal punishment in schools during the 1920s claimed that her own brother was punished but could remember nothing about the matter a few minutes later.

Case study 6

Witnesses sometimes set out to please the questioner by telling them what they think they want to hear. This leads to the development of exciting myths which do little to further historical understanding.

Case study 7

Witnesses are always prone to bias and exaggeration which students may not be able to identify. Describing local amateur football in the 1950s one witness showed a clear bias, even to the point of claiming that his team won with such ease that his goalkeeper actually had the time and complacency to build a snowman in his goal area!

The challenge of oral history

Whatever its value, oral history is not easy; rather it is loaded with difficulties which make it perhaps the most challenging form of historical research. When we ask our students to use oral history we may expose them to enormous falsehoods which we have no means of correcting. Witnesses may not deliberately mislead students, but even if they set out to tell the truth there are still many problems. This is no reason to abandon the use of oral history, for in the difficulties lie the educational rewards.

It is often difficult for witnesses to select relevant information. Much of the collected evidence will have little value and so the student must develop the skill to recognise and select only that information which is valuable.

Students will collect statements from individuals whose experience may be exceptional and may not represent the broader story. They must have the means to compare and cross-reference information so as to form a general picture which does not completely exclude the unusual individual.

Even amongst completely honest individuals the memory plays tricks. Sometimes memory comes and goes and students require patience and must be willing to return to an issue several times in order to get an answer. There is then the danger that an interviewee may create false memories in order to please the interviewer. On other occasions the memory may fail altogether in which case the student should be prepared to encourage without prompting. It is a good idea on these occasions to use any available artefacts, pictures, books, video or even site visits to restart the memory.

It is possible that the interviewee may deliberately mislead the student. Interviewers must identify bias and exaggeration in order to form an accurate picture, but it is not the job of the student to correct or challenge the inter-viewee. Students must always be careful not to cause offence to the inter-viewee.

Using evidence

The role of the student

Once the evidence has been gathered the student needs to be able to employ it in creating a broader picture or narrative. This should focus on a specific issue or ideally be phrased as a question so as to encourage an inves-tigative approach. Students must be able to evaluate evidence based on:

- worth: is it relevant and "useable"?
- truth: can you see bias or exaggeration? Does the evidence support what you know to be fact?
- representativeness: Is this a rogue experience which may actually mislead because it is so unusual?
- chronology: place the evidence in the order that it happened.

The role of the teacher

You the teacher must have the opportunity to assist the student by structur-ing their approach to the evidence and developing their ability to evaluate. This is very difficult because you cannot be there for every interview and so many things may go unchallenged. You need to be able to act as a critical cipher when dealing with the evidence collected by students. Your role is not to make judgements about the collected evidence, it is to encourage students to make their own judgements. In order to do this it is vital that you are able to:

- see the evidence which they have collected. This means that the evidence must be recorded since it is unlikely that you will be able to sit in on every interview;

- understand and guide the process by which they sort and evaluate their evidence;

- bring together the best evidence from all the students to form a worthy, representative, truthful and ordered narrative. It is at this stage that students must tackle questions of relevance, significance, veracity, and so forth.

If oral history is usefully employed as an academic pursuit in the classroom, this process must be followed. The teacher must get inside the students thought process and in order to do so the students' information and thoughts must be open to view by the teacher.

What follows is only one suggestion for forming the evidence gathered by a number of students from a wide number of witnesses into a narrative which tells a broader story. You may find it impractical and you may certainly be able to improve it. Please feel free to do so.

Use **worksheet 1.** As the students take evidence either directly from an interview (in this case it would be advisable to have one student writing and one talking) or from an audio or video recording, they should note the points made by the interviewee in the boxes provided. Encourage them to use a different box for each point. This may in itself pose problems as students have difficulty determining where a "point" begins and ends, but as long as the evidence is being recorded this problem can be dealt with after the interview.

Sorting the evidence

At the end of the interview students should:

- cut **worksheet 1** up into individual statement boxes;

- place the statement boxes in the correct areas of **worksheet 2.** This might best be done as a paired or group activity so as to create the opportunity for discussion amongst the students who will have to make judgements on the significance and truth of each statement. The teacher can now have an important input. It will be possible to challenge student decisions and ask them to reconsider their attitudes towards each statement;

- teachers may choose to use **worksheet 3.** This asks students to justify their decisions by explaining each statement's place on the sheet in writing. Remembering that often in the study of history the decision-making process can itself often be just as important as the final decision itself;

- students have now gathered the information which they think is most valuable and relevant, they have also hopefully eliminated much of the "low grade" or unreliable information.

The process could also be carried out on a class basis to form an agreed body of evidence from interviews carried out by a whole class. To do this simply photocopy **worksheet 2** onto a transparency and project onto a wall. Each group or individual will then have the opportunity to stick the evidence which they most value into the enlarged segment. The rejected evidence can also be re-evaluated by the entire class.

Forming the narrative

By this stage the students (either as individuals, groups or classes) have gathered the evidence which they feel they can trust. It is time to combine the evidence into an overall picture. The teacher must use his/her knowledge (with the advice of the students) to decide on the broad themes which the interviews have exposed. These themes should be written on **worksheet 4** and then the students should divide their evidence into the correct thematic boxes thus forming the material for a number of different thematic chapters.

Instead of using **worksheet 4** it might be preferable to use a table or blackboard which has been laid out in the same format as the worksheet. This would enable greater access for the whole class/group to examine the entire body of the evidence.

Students are now in a position to use the sorted information to present a broader narrative. They can write their work in thematic chapters without reference to other sources so that it becomes a pure investigation using only those sources available or they can incorporate their research into their wider learning using texts, lessons, commercial videos, etc. For our purposes the process might easily be used to select excerpts for an edited videotape.

When forming paragraphs students should be encouraged to draw conclusions from the evidence which they have gathered. They must also be encouraged to include some of those sources which contradict the main findings, allowing them to evaluate and draw their own conclusions.

The international perspective

If the same method was employed across a number of countries there would be a real opportunity for co-operation. Take one event or theme in 20th century history, for example the suffrage or women's contribution to war work, or one trend, for example women in work or pre-war schooling. Collect evidence using your students and collate and refine what you gathered. Share your evidence with schools in other countries and we may be able to move towards a pan- European study.

Worksheet 1: recording evidence from an interview

Worksheet 2: sorting oral history evidence

I think that these statements are true and significant…	I think that these statements are not significant…
I think these statements may not be completely true…	From my knowledge, I think that the following statements are not representative…

Worksheet 3: justifying the evidence

I think that these statements are true and significant…	I think that these statements are not significant… because because because
I think these statements may not be completely true… because because	From my knowledge, I think that the following statements are not representative… because

Worksheet 4: themes

Title:_____		Title:_____
	What was the role of the woman in the family in the 1950s and 1960s?	
Title:_____		Title:_____

Oral history: Romania

Women and memory in Romania

The following extract is from an oral history done in Romania by a 12th grade student, Elena Soare. She interviewed her grandmother about an event that changed Romanian history fifty-five years ago – the marching of Russian troops into Romania in 1944. Now the old lady, Rada Dinca, lives in the village Castelu, department Constanta and is 66 years old. She has spent her life at the countryside, practising agriculture, and she can remember well the events which impressed her deeply, even if at the time she was only a small girl of 9-years-old.

Elena used books for background research and to prompt her grandmother but after putting some questions, she noticed that her grandmother loved to speak, and did not interrupt her anymore.

Then, in 1944…
My grandmother, at that time a 9-year-old, who is remembering the incoming of the Red Army's soldiers in her village, a Dobrudjan one, named Tikederes, in the commune Tudor Vladimirescu, by the Bulgarian frontier:

" How was it? I can still remember it very well. In the morning, a plane flew over the village and dropped small paper pieces on which it was written, 'we don't want to fight more than the Germans'. All the people came to the centre of the village in front of the town hall; some said that the war was over, some that the worse will begin now. After a while people walked home or to their work. I went with my parents to the melon field, and in the evening when we were coming home with the cart, we met six soldiers on horses. We didn't know that they were Soviets, but one of the horses hobbled and the man cursed it in Russian. My father told me: 'The Russians have come in our country, Radita!'

We had heard that when they came in the villages they acted like barbarians. People told a lot of stories and we were afraid! But in the neighbouring villages they were not so bad. They behaved just like that in our village too.

When we arrived home, my mother, very worried, gathered some things, and we went together with some neighbours to the field. We spent the whole night there, and when the day came, my mother went home. In our yard she found eight or ten Russian soldiers who were eating the melons we had left in the wagon the evening before. They were normal with her, and one of them who spoke Romanian told her that six of them would stay in our home, but she didn't need to worry, because it was peace, and the war was over. Because we heard that in other villages the soldiers had raped the women and the girls, me, my sisters and my cousins were hidden in the loft

118

in the neighbourhood. We stayed there one day, and after that, seeing that the Russian weren't aggressive, we came out, and nothing bad happened.

In the evening, my uncle heard on the radio that peace had come. He was the only one in the village who had a radio, so he woke everybody up, and there was so much joy! We didn't know yet about the people from the village who had died in Transylvania, fighting against the German army. The Russians, who lived in our house, brought a radio station and installed telephones. Then, one of them, named Andrei, asked my mother if she knew Bulgarian, and she lied saying that she didn't. Then, Andrei turned on the radio, and my mother heard a dispatch that she understood, and that frightened her. It could be seen on her face that she had understood everything, and the soldier observed that too. He turned off the radio, blamed her for lying to him and he never after turned on the radio when some of us were around.

The next day, soldiers began to pass through our village. We could see their weapons and their tanks. People of the village, especially the older ones, were speaking ill of them. I can remember that one of the soldiers asked my grandfather the way to Bulgaria. And he answered that it was in the direction 'of hell, on the right, there is Bulgaria'. The soldier smiled, and than he told my grandfather that neither of them were guilty for the war and that they had had enough of walking through the world without news from their homes.

That soldier, Andrei, told us that he had a boy, a home, that he missed him, and he loved to play with my little brother who was the same age as his son. The soldiers stayed with us three or four days. When they left, they told my father that behind them, there was the army that would come and that could be a disaster for the people of the village. So, my father hid the horses in the forest, and he brought them home only in the evening, to water them.

Some days passed, and after that the army came to the village. One day they requested a pig, a sheep, some chickens from us and our neighbours; next day they moved in the other part of the village and asked for food again. And so, even if they didn't plunder us, they left our yards empty.

We became used to their presence in the village. We could see them everywhere: in the orchard, in the melon field, at the village fountain, washing their shirts.

When they left the village, we were called to the town hall, and every family was asked to give some more for their food: a pig, a sheep, some grain. We gave everything they asked for, and they also took the wagon and the horses that we couldn't keep hidden without being observed. So, after the Soviet army left our village, we remained poor. But we were happy to be all alive

and in good health in our family. Only one of our cousins died in the war, in Transylvania.

We, the children didn't understood too much about the war. We were very impressed because we had seen soldiers on horses and camels (!). We got excited every time we found cartridges in the field, when we were out with the cattle. We were playing dangerous: we took the cartridges, put them on straw, set them on fire and than we would hide in the trenches, because there were many in our village."

By Elena Soare, 12th grade A
Eforie Sud High School

Translated by Florina Serbu
history teacher at Eforie Nord School, Romania

Oral history: Malta

The following is an oral history gathered in a Malta secondary school.

Interview

1. What is your name and nationality?

My name is Magda and my nationality is Maltese.

2. How old are you?

I am 60 years old.

3. What was your position in the family?

I was the second of two children. My brother was only 14 months older than me.

4. How did this affect your life?

My brother, being a boy, was sent to a well-known private school where my dad paid for his education. Unfortunately my father was not ready to pay for my education as he argued that I might get married and the money he paid would be wasted. I was sent to the local state primary school and I had to do my best and study hard in order to gain a scholarship into a state secondary school. The first time I tried I failed my examinations but I succeeded the second time which was just as well as it was my last chance due to the age limit imposed. When my favourite aunt offered to pay for my secondary education in a private school, the rest of the family were up in arms and they convinced her to use the money for educating my male cousin privately. She did, but my cousin never made it.

5. What was your relationship with your parents?

My relationship with my parents was good as long as I was ready to help with the housework after school. This meant that I had to stay up late at night to do my homework. In those days we believed that girls had to help with the housework but boys were exempted from this. Hence my brother had much more time to go out to play with the boys than I ever had and he could do his homework at leisure.

6. Did you feel that you were discriminated against because you were a girl?

Yes, I certainly did. Even on a religious level my brother could become an altar boy, help in serving Mass and participate actively in religious ceremonies

121

whereas I could not as I was a girl. This chauvinistic attitude extended even into tertiary education where some of the professors, who were all males, considered the presence of the few female students (ten in number) as being an intrusion and occupying places which could have been better filled by males.

7. Has your handling in early life in any way affected your social position in adulthood?

My handling in early life affected me in adulthood in the sense that I always felt that I was not expected to reach the levels that my brother was given the means to reach.

8. Has this affected your self-esteem?

It has naturally affected my self-esteem which, as a result, has never been as high as it should have been.

9. Do you think your handling had repercussions on the society you grew up in?

Yes, of course. If I and other girls like me had been given the same opportunities as the boys, our society would have had a much more valuable contribution to its culture and its economy from the female half of the population. At this point I feel that I have to add that when I became a state school teacher in September 1958 I always received a monthly salary that amounted to two-thirds of the salary of a male teacher who was doing exactly the same work as I was doing. This state of affairs remained until the mid-1970s when equal pay for equal work was finally introduced; no compensation whatsoever was given to make up for the discrimination suffered. At secondary level, far more subjects were available to boys than to girls. No physical education was offered to girls and no science subjects or even physics.

Ms Mary Carabott, teacher, Malta
Ms Magda Muscat, interviewee

A brief report on the interview

The class teacher chose to use the interview in the following way. This interview was made when a discussion topic was needed for Form III A, a class of 13- to 14- year-olds. The class of twenty-six students was divided into two groups of thirteen students each. Both groups were asked to listen to a replay of the tape. Groups A and B were then given fifteen minutes during which they were to write down as many social and historical facts as they could learn from the interviews. It was also an exercise in listening comprehension.

Learning objectives

Group A had to pick out a number of points that showed how and in what ways women were discriminated against. They produced the following facts.

- Young girls had accepted the fact that they were expected to offer their services for the greater comfort of the family and especially the males even at the cost of sacrificing their sleep and their recreation.

- By much later than the mid-20th century girls still regarded themselves as second class citizens doing the housework, helping with the washing and the caring while boys went out to play or occupied themselves as best suited their fancy while the girls were always on call.

- While all kinds of sacrifices were made to give boys a good education very little was done to ensure a good education for girls. The obvious reason was that boys were considered to be the traditional bread winners.

- As a result of their handling the self-esteem of girls was badly impaired.

Group B had to pick out a number of historical facts that they learned from the interview and they came up with the following.

- In the mid-20th century the Maltese state offered free primary education for all, but free secondary education was offered only to the enlightened few who could pass highly competitive examinations.

- Very few females gained entrance into the university and those who did were considered to be usurpers.

- All the professors were males but further down the scale women could teach at primary and secondary level though their education was obviously never good enough to qualify to teach at higher levels.

- Female teachers received a lower salary than their male counterparts for doing exactly the same work.

- Fewer subjects were available to girls than to boys at secondary level. Girls never did physical education or science subjects.

- The country must have been experiencing an economic depression as money was very short.

- Women were not expected to go for salaried employment.

Conclusion: through the personal history of one person the students could draw up a series of convincing social and historical facts related to the topic in question that is the history of women in Europe in the 20th century.

Ms Mary Carabott

123

GLOSSARY

The following are key words that might be relevant to a study of women's history. The words can be used to build up a glossary by students and to carry out searches on the Internet and in libraries for relevant sources of information.

Activism
Advertising
Attitude
Benefits
Blitz
Campaign
Capitalism
Communism
Conscription
Consumer/consumerism
Discrimination
Division of labour
Divorce
Documentaries
Domestic
Dysfunctional
Economic
Economic boom
Employment
Equal opportunities
Equal pay
Equality
Eugenics
Family
Fascism
Fashion
Feature films
Functional
Gender
Gendered language
Generation

Government
Home front
Housewife
Ideal
Industrial action
Industry
Industry: service, light, heavy
Marriage
Maternity
Motherhood/mothering
Munitions
Patriotic/patriotism
Picket
Political
Prejudice
Promotion
Propaganda
Rates of pay
Roles
Social
Socialisation
Stereotypes
Strike
Suffrage/franchise
Suffragettes
Technology/technological
Teenage/teenager
Trade unions/unionism
Values
Women's liberation

Glossary activities

It is probably not adequate to simply hand out lists of words and meanings to students. In order to understand and use new words accurately and with confidence, students need opportunities to internalise the meanings, that is to fit them into their own conceptual framework.

The following exercises are designed to help perform this function:

• write out words and meanings on separate cards – students match words to meanings;

• hand out words for students to construct sentences;

• hand out words/meanings – students mime the meaning and the class tries to guess the word;

• hand out words/meanings – students draw a picture/cartoon that explains the meaning of the word to a younger student.

Appendix I: Internet sites

Internet sites

Site of UK national and local government information. Includes conference papers, legislation, research papers, statistics, press releases on issues relating to women in the family and work.
http://www.open.gov.uk

Site of the Department for Education and Employment. Contains statistics, research reports, press releases, news, consultations relating to employment issues and education. Contains specific information on work and gender issues.
http://www.dfee.gov.uk

Site of the National Children's Bureau, organisation to promote well-being of children and young people. Includes information on childcare theory and practice, research summaries, and press releases.
http://www.ncb.org.uk

Site dedicated to women artists.
http://home.webcom.se/art

Site with substantial material on women's history.
http://www.gale.com

Site on women's history with links to other relevant sites.
http://home.earthlink.net/~womenwhist

Site of US National Women's History Project, contains resources, and lists of relevant organisations and links to other sites.
http://www.nwhp.org/

Site of educational resources for teachers, includes topics on women's emancipation, the first world war, plus hyperlinks.
http://www.spartacus.schoolnet.co.uk

Site dedicated to famous women through time.
http://www.DistinguishedWomen.com

Site on project "What did you do in the war, Grandma?" Collection of oral histories of women in the second world war.
http://www.stg.brown.edu/projects/WWII_Women/tocCS.html

Site of the European Commission on behalf of schools.
http://www.devise-Europe.org

Site for female teenagers and young feminists.
http://www.femina.cybergrrl.com

For more information on the project "Learning and teaching about the history of Europe in the 20th century", see Appendix II and http://culture.coe.fr/hist20. All tables and worksheets found in this book may be downloaded from this site.

128

APPENDIX II: LEARNING AND TEACHING ABOUT THE HISTORY OF EUROPE IN THE 20TH CENTURY[1]

Often considered by historians as the most difficult to study and to teach, the 20th century is the subject of a specific project on "Learning and teaching about the history of Europe in the 20th century". In 1993 and 1997, the two summits of heads of state and government of the Council of Europe member states called upon the Council to develop in particular activities and educational methods relating to this period. The Parliamentary Assembly expressed a similar wish in a recommendation on history and the learning of history in Europe, adopted in 1996.

This project represents a complete teaching kit and may be described as an "atom" in which "satellites" gravitate around a "nucleus". This nucleus is a handbook for history teachers, devoted to the methods and different ways of presenting the 20th century to students. A British historian, Robert Stradling, has prepared this work which comprises educational chapters and practical worksheets and exercises based on concrete cases and themes. While drawing on and amplifying the Council of Europe's recommendations already adopted in the field of history, he has adapted them to the problems and difficulties of the 20th century, taking into account the intellectual, political and social upheavals which have marked it. He has also attempted to identify the omissions and falsifications in the presentation of the century and deal with contentious issues, the source of conflict, confrontations and misunderstandings.

The satellites are teaching packs looking at women's history, population movements, cinema, the Holocaust and nationalism in 20th century Europe. They are supplemented by reports and contributions on, amongst others, the use of new technologies in teaching, the problem of sources in contemporary history and the study of misuses of history. All these components form a teaching pack which can be used by all teachers and adapted to their needs and resources.

Specifically dealt with by several reports and workshops, the question of the collection and exploitation of source material for 20th century history is included in the project within a transversal approach. It seeks to initiate stu-

---

1. This text is based upon a chapter previously published in *Lessons in history* (Council of Europe Publishing, 1999).

dents in the consultation and use of archives as a documentary basis or discussion theme. But unlike previous centuries, the 20th century can be studied and interpreted through new media such as the cinema, radio, television and more generally images which accompany or indeed replace written information.

These new sources must be inventoried and known, decoded and assessed. The power of images, whether still or moving, also increases the risk of the spectator's being manipulated: propaganda films shot by totalitarian regimes are perhaps the most tragic illustration of this, but omissions and misrepresentations – including those made by editing techniques or clever camerawork – are also a feature of films or documentaries which lay claim to objectivity or information. By discovering these techniques, deliberate or not, today's students who live in a permanent audiovisual environment will also learn how to be more critical towards it when watching television news programmes or a "contemporary" film.

Clearly, however, above and beyond propaganda and manipulation, the gradual transition from the written word towards an image society is also a historical phenomenon worthy of study. In this context, the teaching pack on cinema offers teachers a filmography of the 20th century containing films illustrative of historical themes. These are to be used to shed light upon their period, both historically and culturally, and prompt discussion.

The project also seeks to encourage the use of sources which are little used in teaching, such as oral history. Sometimes, this is the only source available on a particular event or living environment and can provide an insight capable of counterbalancing the official history; increasingly it makes for more personalised history by giving the speaker the role of witness. Some schools already invite former members of the resistance or former deportees to recount their memories, thereby enabling the listeners to put the period in context. Similarly, life in a factory can be illustrated by a talk by a former factory worker. However, oral history must also be multiple, since, like any other written or visual source, it too can lack objectivity.

The most recent technology, computers in particular, can also provide new sources of information, such as CD-Roms or Internet sites, but they can also be used as a means of teaching. Here too, it is important to help both teachers and students select and evaluate the plethora of documents available on the Internet, and to encourage them to look at their source, their reliability and all the risks of manipulation or omission which they may contain. For teachers, using the Internet means first of all knowing how to use it: depending on their training and their own attitude to such tools, teachers can be very much in favour or very much against. The project therefore also seeks to help them use these tools which will provide them with text and images. In

130

this way, Internet sites and CD-Roms can be valuable supplements to text-books and lessons.

Nevertheless, while these new tools have significant educational potential, teachers attending the training seminars stress the fact that they cannot replace books and papers and that while they do open new avenues, they will not completely revolutionise teaching. Furthermore, many teachers point out that their development in school is at present still limited because of the cost.

The present pack on women's history fits in with the Council of Europe's desire for fair representation of both sexes in society, but its aim goes far beyond simply redressing the balance. While emphasising the role of women in society, too long overlooked, it also seeks to view history from their per-spective. Several seminars were held on this project which is based on specific collective or individual examples. Amongst these, the role of women in Stalin's Russia illustrates the life, activities and image of women of the time, and the period through them. Biographies of famous women could provide the framework for lessons or themes, but it is also essential to present ordi-nary or unknown women and their views on events and the world. For that, the use of oral history must be encouraged: the teaching pack suggests examples and interviewing methods which could be used with women who have lived through historic events or who are representative of a period or a theme.

The pack also contains general subjects to be addressed in lessons, such as the struggle for the right to vote, working women or the image of women. It also deals with bias and omissions in the presentation of women in history and consequently has resulted in a genuine work of historiography con-ducive to comment and critical judgement.

Conceived in a similar way the pack on nationalism goes beyond mere defi-nitions of the phenomenon to look at the more day-to-day aspects, even including topics such as sport or currency. It covers the major historic conse-quences of nationalism, such as shifting borders or the break-up of empires (Austria-Hungary, the Ottoman Empire and the Soviet Union) and looks at relations between majority and minority groups within states. It then dis-cusses the cohabitation of groups and the means of living together, for example via federalism. The pack, like the two others, is supplemented by a bibliography including written documents, films, and also CD-Roms and Internet sites.

The pack on migration examines population movements in Europe in the 20th century, the reasons why individuals and groups change countries and the cultural and social exchanges which result from these movements. Not

restricted simply to the major migration waves of recent decades, it also covers transfrontier movements caused as a result of border changes or economic necessities, as in the case of border workers. It seeks to illustrate the situation and views of migrants as inhabitants of a host country, while facilitating dialogue and mutual understanding concerning increasingly similar concerns and lifestyles.

The pack on teaching the Holocaust, above and beyond the facts themselves, should personalise events through the life of victims, for example before and during the Holocaust. A 15-year old adolescent will be more moved by the story of a young person of the same age before and during the war than by an overview of the period, and will develop a more concrete understanding of the extent of the tyranny and crimes. At a time when anti-Semitism is growing alarmingly in certain countries, it is important, over and above the facts, to point out that anyone could one day become the victim of such crimes, but thought must be given to the mechanisms which can, at the same time, turn normal individuals into torturers and executioners.

The project also examines the way in which the history of the 20th century is taught across Europe, in textbooks, syllabuses and lessons. It calls on teachers not merely to pass on facts but to deal with the practical expression and memory implicit in those facts. The concept of "place of remembrance", conducive to discussion and recollection, also introduces the idea of cultural heritage, which should not be restricted to a palace or a church, but should also include sites recalling the darkest hours of the 20th century, such as the trenches of 1914 or the concentration camps.

The theme of "living memory" can be illustrated by using little known documents such as letters sent by soldiers in the Great War to their families; these also provide an individual dimension to a collective event. Maps and photos, like film extracts, often speak more effectively to students than a mere chronological listing of events, and the presentation of a memorial also shows how a conflict affects a country or a region.

Lastly, comparative studies have been made on the training of history teachers and these serve as a basis for recommendations. Depending on the country, future teachers move directly from university to the school environment and their academic qualifications are supplemented by teacher training varying from short courses to one or more years of preparation for entry to the profession. The project sets out to assess and inventory the various models of teacher training although it seeks only to improve them and not to make them uniform. It insists on the need to develop in-service training for teachers, in both teaching techniques and in the choice of themes which should be presented to students.

The project aims to enable history teachers in Europe, whatever country they are from, to develop methods and themes adapted to the specific nature of 20th century history. It also aims to help them to incorporate all documentary sources and subjects into their teaching, and to adapt their approach to modern technological developments. The project underscores the specific nature of teaching 20th century history in relation to history training in general, and insists that the 20th century should be presented in a way which is more open to the outside world and enables students to understand this world more readily. Dynamic and appealing, such teaching must remind students, confronted outside the classroom by numerous external sources of history information, that school is the most appropriate place to learn about and analyse the history of Europe in the 20th century.

Sales agents for publications of the Council of Europe
Agents de vente des publications du Conseil de l'Europe

AUSTRALIA/AUSTRALIE
Hunter Publications, 58A, Gipps Street
AUS-3066 COLLINGWOOD, Victoria
Tel.: (61) 3 9417 5361
Fax: (61) 3 9419 7154
E-mail: Sales@hunter-pubs.com.au
http://www.hunter-pubs.com.au

AUSTRIA/AUTRICHE
Gerold und Co., Graben 31
A-1011 WIEN 1
Tel.: (43) 1 533 5014
Fax: (43) 1 533 5014 18
E-mail: buch@gerold.telecom.at
http://www.gerold.at

BELGIUM/BELGIQUE
La Librairie européenne SA
50, avenue A. Jonnart
B-1200 BRUXELLES 20
Tel.: (32) 2 734 0281
Fax: (32) 2 735 0860
E-mail: info@libeurop.be
http://www.libeurop.be

Jean de Lannoy
202, avenue du Roi
B-1190 BRUXELLES
Tel.: (32) 2 538 4308
Fax: (32) 2 538 0841
E-mail: jean.de.lannoy@euronet.be
http://www.jean-de-lannoy.be

CANADA
Renouf Publishing Company Limited
5369 Chemin Canotek Road
CDN-OTTAWA, Ontario, K1J 9J3
Tel.: (1) 613 745 2665
Fax: (1) 613 745 7660
E-mail: order.dept@renoufbooks.com
http://www.renoufbooks.com

**CZECH REPUBLIC/
RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE**
USIS, Publication Service
Havelkova 22
CZ-130 00 PRAHA 3
Tel./Fax: (420) 2 2423 1114

DENMARK/DANEMARK
Munksgaard
35 Norre Sogade, PO Box 173
DK-1005 KØBENHAVN K
Tel.: (45) 7 733 3333
Fax: (45) 7 733 3377
E-mail: direct@munksgaarddirect.dk
http://www.munksgaarddirect.dk

FINLAND/FINLANDE
Akateeminen Kirjakauppa
Keskuskatu 1, PO Box 218
FIN-00381 HELSINKI
Tel.: (358) 9 121 41
Fax: (358) 9 121 4450
E-mail: akatilaus@stockmann.fi
http://www.akatilaus.akateeminen.com

FRANCE
C.I.D.
131 boulevard Saint-Michel
F-75005 PARIS
Tel.: (33) 01 43 54 47 15
Fax: (33) 01 43 54 80 73
E-mail: cid@msh-paris.fr

GERMANY/ALLEMAGNE
UNO Verlag
Proppelsdorfer Allee 55
D-53115 BONN
Tel.: (49) 2 28 94 90 231
Fax: (49) 2 28 21 74 92
E-mail: unoverlag@aol.com
http://www.uno-verlag.de

GREECE/GRÈCE
Librairie Kauffmann
Mavrokordatou 9
GR-ATHINAI 106 78
Tel.: (30) 1 38 29 283
Fax: (30) 1 38 33 967

HUNGARY/HONGRIE
Euro Info Service
Hungexpo Europa Kozpont ter 1
H-1101 BUDAPEST
Tel.: (361) 264 8270
Fax: (361) 264 8271
E-mail: euroinfo@euroinfo.hu
http://www.euroinfo.hu

ITALY/ITALIE
Libreria Commissionaria Sansoni
Via Duca di Calabria 1/1, CP 552
I-50125 FIRENZE
Tel.: (39) 556 4831
Fax: (39) 556 41257
E-mail: licosa@licosa.com
http://www.licosa.com

NETHERLANDS/PAYS-BAS
De Lindeboom Internationale Publikaties
PO Box 202, MA de Ruyterstraat 20 A
NL-7480 AE HAAKSBERGEN
Tel.: (31) 53 574 0004
Fax: (31) 53 572 9296
E-mail: lindeboo@worldonline.nl
http://home-1-worldonline.nl/~lindeboo/

NORWAY/NORVÈGE
Akademika, A/S Universitetsbokhandel
PO Box 84, Blindern
N-0314 OSLO
Tel.: (47) 22 85 30 30
Fax: (47) 23 12 24 20

POLAND/POLOGNE
Głowna Księgarnia Naukowa
im. B. Prusa
Krakowskie Przedmiescie 7
PL-00-068 WARSZAWA
Tel.: (48) 29 22 66
Fax: (48) 22 26 64 49
E-mail: inter@internews.com.pl
http://www.internews.com.pl

PORTUGAL
Livraria Portugal
Rua do Carmo, 70
P-1200 LISBOA
Tel.: (351) 13 47 49 82
Fax: (351) 13 47 02 64
E-mail: liv.portugal@mail.telepac.pt

SPAIN/ESPAGNE
Mundi-Prensa Libros SA
Castelló 37
E-28001 MADRID
Tel.: (34) 914 36 37 00
Fax: (34) 915 75 39 98
E-mail: libreria@mundiprensa.es
http://www.mundiprensa.com

SWITZERLAND/SUISSE
BERSY
Route d'Uvrier 15
CH-1958 LIVRIER/SION
Tel.: (41) 27 203 73 30
Fax: (41) 27 203 73 32
E-mail: bersy@freesurf.ch

UNITED KINGDOM/ROYAUME-UNI
TSO (formerly HMSO)
51 Nine Elms Lane
GB-LONDON SW8 5DR
Tel.: (44) 171 873 8372
Fax: (44) 171 873 8200
E-mail: customer.services@theso.co.uk
http://www.the-stationery-office.co.uk
http://www.itsofficial.net

**UNITED STATES and CANADA/
ÉTATS-UNIS et CANADA**
Manhattan Publishing Company
468 Albany Post Road, PO Box 850
CROTON-ON-HUDSON,
NY 10520, USA
Tel.: (1) 914 271 5194
Fax: (1) 914 271 5856
E-mail: Info@manhattanpublishing.com
http://www.manhattanpublishing.com

_____

STRASBOURG
Librairie Kléber
Palais de l'Europe
F-67075 STRASBOURG Cedex
Fax: (33) 03 88 52 91 21