

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
1.	Albania	LULI AND OTHERS group (64480/09) final on 01/07/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: February and October 2024	Excessive length of civil proceedings and absence of a remedy in that respect	Art. 6 § 1 and Article 13, Article 6, Art. 1 Prot. 1
2.	Albania	STRAZIMIRI (34602/16) final on 21/05/2020 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Inhuman and degrading treatment of a person suffering from mental health problems due to poor living conditions and failure to ensure adequate therapy; unlawful detention in an inadequate (penitentiary) institution without proper psychiatric treatment; failure to examine speedily proceedings on detention; absence of right to compensation for unlawful detention	Article 3, Article 5 §§ 1, 4 and 5
3.	Albania	SHARXHI AND OTHERS (10613/16) final on 28/05/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Several violations because of a demolition of a building in which the applicants owned flats and business premises in a coastal town, in disregard of an interim court order restraining the authorities from taking any action that could breach the applicants' property rights; lack of effective remedies	Article 6 § 1, Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, Articles 8 and 13
4.	Albania	X AND OTHERS (73548/17) final on 31/08/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: June 2023 and October 2024	Discrimination of pupils in an Albanian school on account of delays and non-implementation of appropriate desegregating measures	Article 1 of Protocol No. 12
5.	Albania	NIKA (1049/17) final on 14/02/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: November 2024	Unjustified use of lethal force by State agents during a political protest resulting in the death of the applicants' relative from a gunshot wound and ineffectiveness of the investigation	Article 2
6.	Albania	DURDAJ AND OTHERS (63543/09) final on 07/02/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: October 2024	Effectiveness of investigation and criminal trial concerning an explosion at Gërdec weapon decommissioning facility resulting in deaths and grievous bodily injuries	Article 2
7.	Armenia	SHIRKHANYAN (54547/16) final on 22/05/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Inadequate medical care in detention; failure to protect the life of a critically ill detainee; lack of effective remedies	Article 2, Article 3, Article 13

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
8.	Armenia	CHIRAGOV AND OTHERS (13216/05) final on 16/06/2015, 12/12/2017 (Article 41) Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: November 2024	Impossibility for persons displaced during the active military phase Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies	Continuing violations of Article 1 of P 1, Articles 8, 13
9.	Armenia	MURADYAN (11275/07) Final on 24/02/2017 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2023	Lack of effective investigation into the death of the applicants' sons and failure of the authorities to provide a plausible explanation in this regard	Article 2
10.	Armenia	MUSHEGH SAGHATELYAN group (23086/08) final on 20/12/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last Information received in: June 2023	Disproportionate and unnecessary dispersal of peaceful protest	Article 3, Article 5 § 1,3,4, Article 6 § 1, Article 11, Article 13
11.	Armenia	VARDANYAN AND KHALAFYAN group (2265/12) final on 08/02/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Ill-treatment, torture and death in police custody	Article 2, Article 3,
12.	Armenia	OGANEZOVA (71367/12) final on 17/08/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Lack of protection against homophobic attacks and hate speech; failure to carry out effective investigation; absence of effective domestic criminal-law mechanism for investigating discrimination complaints	Article 3 in conjunction with Article 14
13.	Armenia	A.P. (58737/14) final on 18/09/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in:	Lack of legislative and regulatory framework to protect minors against sexual abuse	Article 3, Article 8, Article 13
14.	Azerbaijan	GAFGAZ MAMMADOV (60259/11) final on 14/03/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: January 2024	Dispersals of demonstrations and arrests of demonstrators	Article 5, Article 6 § 1, Article 6 § 3, Article 11, Article 34

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
15.	Azerbaijan	HUMBATOV group (13652/06) final on 03/03/2010 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1348 (June 2019) Last information received in: February 2013	Non-enforcement of final domestic judgments (other property rights)	Article 1 Protocol No.1, Article 6
16.	Azerbaijan	INSANOV group (16133/08) final on 14/06/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Inhuman and degrading detention conditions and right to be brought promptly before a judge	Articles 3 and 5
17.	Azerbaijan	KHADIJA ISMAYILOVA group (65286/13) Final on 10/04/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: April 2024	Violations of the rights to respect for private life and reputation as well as to freedom of expression	Articles 8 and 10
18.	Azerbaijan	MAHMUDOV AND AGAZADE group (35877/04) final on 18/03/2009 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Violation of right to freedom of expression, arbitrary application of law of the law on defamation	Articles 6 and 10
19.	Azerbaijan	MAKUCHYAN AND MINASYAN (17247/13) final on 12/10/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: April 2023	Measures taken by the authorities in respect of the perpetrator of an extremely cruel hate crime, which have in effect granted him impunity and had link to the Armenian ethnicity of his victims	Article 2 (procedural aspect), Article 14+2
20.	Azerbaijan	MAMMADLI group (47145/14) final on 19/07/2018 Complex problem Urgent individual measures	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: April 2024	Imprisonment for reasons other than those permitted by Article 5	Articles 5 and 18
21.	Azerbaijan	MIRZAYEV group (50187/06) final on 03/03/2010 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1348 (June 2019) Last information received in: July 2022	Non-enforcement of final judicial decisions ordering the eviction of internally displaced persons (IDPs) who were unlawfully occupying the applicants' apartments	Art. 6 § 1 and Art. 1 Protocol No. 1

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
22.	Azerbaijan	MURADOVA group (22684/05) final on 02/07/2009 MAMMADOV (JALALOGLU) group (34445/04) final on 11/04/2007 MIKAYIL MAMMADOV group (4762/05) final on 17/03/2010 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2023	Excessive use of force by the security forces and lack of effective investigations	Articles 2, 3, 5 § 1, 6 § 1, 10, 11, 13 and 34
23.	Azerbaijan	MUSHFIG MAMMADOV AND OTHERS (14604/08) final on 17/01/2020 Complex problem Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2023	Criminal proceedings against applicants on account of their refusal to perform military service resulting from the absence of alternative service system for conscientious objectors	Article 9
24.	Azerbaijan	NAMAT ALIYEV group (18705/06) final on 08/07/2010 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Various irregularities in the context of the 2005 and 2010 parliamentary elections and lack of safeguards against arbitrariness	Article 3 of Protocol No. 1, Article 34
25.	Azerbaijan	NAMAZOV group (74354/13) final on 30/05/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Violation of the right to respect for private life and the right to a fair trial on account of lawyers' disbarment	Articles 6 and 8
26.	Azerbaijan	NARAYAN AND OTHERS (54363/17) final on 24/06/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: /	Killing of two Armenian soldiers by an Azerbaijani soldier, who crossed the state border and initiated the shooting while acting as an Azerbaijani State agent, and lack of investigation	Article 2
27.	Azerbaijan	RELIGIOUS COMMUNITY OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES (52884/09) final on 20/06/2020 NASIROV AND OTHERS (58717/10) final on 20/06/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: July 2022	Violation of the rights to liberty and security, freedom of religion and freedom of expression	Articles 5, 9 and 10

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
28.	Azerbaijan	SARGSYAN (40167/06) final on 16/06/2015 12/12/2017 (Article 41) Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: August 2024	Impossibility for persons displaced during the active military phase of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies	Continuing violations of Article 1 of P 1, Articles 8, 13
29.	Azerbaijan	SHENTURK AND OTHERS (41326/17) final on 10/06/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	The applicants' extra-legal transfer from Azerbaijan to Türkiye and denial of effective guarantees of protection against arbitrary refoulement	Articles 3 and 5
30.	Azerbaijan	TARVERDIYEV (33343/03) final on 26/10/2007 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1348 (June 2019) Last information received in: September 2008	Failure or delay in the enforcement of final judgments ordering in kind obligations	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, Art. 6 § 1
31.	Azerbaijan	RFE/RL INC.AND OTHERS (56138/18) final on 13/09/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: /	Unlawful blocking of online media outlets	Article 10
32.	Belgium	BELL group (44826/05) final on 06/04/2009 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Excessive length of civil and criminal proceedings, in particular in the judicial district of Brussels	Article 6 § 1
33.	Belgium	L.B. group (22831/08+) / W.D. (73548/13) final on 02/01/2013 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Structural problem concerning the inadequate care of persons with mental health problems (internees) in a prison environment Pilot judgment W.D (73548/13), final on 06/12/2016: the Court gives a period of two years to remedy the structural problem	Articles 3, 5 § 1, 5 § 4 and 3+13
34.	Belgium	VASILESCU (64682/12+) final on 20/04/2015 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Structural problems concerning overcrowding, lack of hygiene and dilapidation in prisons + lack of an effective remedy (Article 46 indication on Articles 3 and 13)	Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
35.	Belgium	MUGEMANGANGO group (310/15) final on 10/07/2020 Structural and complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2023	Inadequate, in particular in terms of impartiality, and insufficient procedural safeguards to ensure an effective examination of complaints against the results of elections	Articles 3 of Protocol No. 1 and 13
36.	Belgium	CAMARA (49255/22) final on 18/10/2023	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Structural problem of non-enforcement of judicial decisions ordering the authorities to provide asylum seekers with material assistance or accommodation	Article 6 § 1
37.	Bosnia and Herzegovina	SEJDIC AND FINCI group (27996/06) final on 22/12/2009 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Ethnic-based discrimination on account of the ineligibility of persons non-affiliated with one of the "constituent peoples" (Bosnians, Croats or Serbs) to stand for election to the House of Peoples (the upper chamber of Parliament) and the Presidency	Article 14, Article 1 of Protocol No. 12
38.	Bulgaria	ANATOLIY MARINOV (26081/17) final on 15/05/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1459 (March 2023) Last information received in: December 2024	Prohibition of voting imposed automatically on any person under curatorship on the basis of a constitutional provision and not accompanied by adequate safeguards	Articles 3 of Protocol No. 1
39.	Bulgaria	EKIMDZHIEV AND OTHERS (70078/12) final on 11/01/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: June 2023	Insufficient guarantees against the arbitrary use of the powers assigned by the law on special surveillance means; absence of an effective remedy	Articles 8 and 13
40.	Bulgaria	BULGARIAN ORTHODOX OLD CALENDAR CHURCH AND OTHERS group (56751/13) final on 20/04/2021 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Unjustified refusals to register the applicant organisations on the ground that these religious organisations had the same beliefs or practices as the Bulgarian Orthodox Church or the names chosen by the applicant churches were similar to the name of the Bulgarian Orthodox Church	Article 9 and 13
41.	Bulgaria	C.G. AND OTHERS group (1365/07) final on 24/07/2008 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Shortcomings of the judicial review of expulsion and deportation of foreign nationals based on national security grounds	Articles 8 and 13

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
42.	Bulgaria	KULINSKI AND SABEV group (63849/09) final on 21/10/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1459 (March 2023) Last information received in: December 2024	Constitutional ban on voting imposed automatically on convicted prisoners serving their sentences	Protocol 1 Article 3
43.	Bulgaria	INTERNATIONAL BANK FOR COMMERCE AND DEVELOPMENT AD AND OTHERS group (7031/05) final on 17/10/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Unfairness of proceedings concerning the withdrawal of a bank licence and the bank's insolvency; prosecutor's decisions affecting the bank's management not surrounded by safeguards against arbitrariness; freezing of the assets of two individual applicants without adequate safeguards	Articles 6 § 1 and 1 of Protocol 1
44.	Bulgaria	I.G.D. (70139/14) final on 07/09/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: March 2023	Lack of periodic judicial review of placement in closed boarding school; infringement of the right to private and family life due to prolonged placement in a closed boarding school, without an assessment of the best interests of the child or measures to facilitate family reunification	Articles 5 § 4, 8 and 13
45.	Bulgaria	GAVAZOV (54659/00) and HARAKCHIEV AND TOLUMOV (15018/11 and 61199/12) final on 06/06/2008 and 08/10/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Inadequate medical care and prolonged application of a restrictive penitentiary regime combined with the effects of inadequate material conditions	Articles 3, 5 § 3, 5 § 4, 5 § 5, 6 § 1, 13 and 13 in conjunction with Article 3 and 6 § 1
46.	Bulgaria	KOIOVA AND BABULKOVA (40209/20) final on 05/12/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: August 2024	Lack of a specific legal framework providing for the recognition and protection of the applicants' union as persons of the same sex.	Article 8
47.	Bulgaria	LYUBOMIR POPOV GROUP/SIVOVA AND KOLEVA GROUP/MUTISHEV AND OTHERS/TOMOV AND NIKOLOVA (69855/01, 30383/03, 18967/03, 50506/09) final on 07/04/2010, 04/06/2012, 03/03/2010 and 21/10/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1468 (June 2023) Last information received in: November 2024	Unjustified delays in complying with judgments and administrative decisions concerning the restitution of agricultural land nationalised during the communist period or providing compensation thereof. Deprivation of property in breach of the principle of legal certainty and without any compensation, on the basis of restitution legislation	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
48.	Bulgaria	MIROSLAVA TODOROVA (40072/13) final on 19/01/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Disciplinary proceedings against a judge, who was President of the main professional association of judges in Bulgaria at the time of the events, and sanctions imposed on her in those proceedings by the Supreme Judicial Council (SJC), which were in retaliation against the applicant's criticism of the SJC and the executive, and amounted to an interference in the exercise of her right to freedom of expression not "necessary in a democratic society"	Article 10 and Article 18 taken together with Article 10
49.	Bulgaria	NENCHEVA AND OTHERS (48609/06) final on 18/09/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1411 (September 2021) Last information received in: June 2024	Lack of prompt and sufficient measures to prevent deaths of children placed in public care, during a severe economic, financial and social crisis in 1996-1997; lack of prompt and effective investigation into these deaths	Article 2
50.	Bulgaria	PAKETOVA AND OTHERS (17808/19) final on 11/01/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: July 2023 and October 2024	The impossibility for the applicants, Bulgarian nationals of Roma ethnic origin, to enjoy their private and family life and their home peacefully, owing to the failure of the authorities to provide them with the requisite protection in connection with demonstrations by the local population against Roma inhabitants of the village; the result was a situation in which all the applicants were driven from their homes, without any legal consequences	Article 8 in conjunction with Article 14
51.	Bulgaria	S.Z. / KOLEVI group (29263/12, 1108/02) final on 03/06/2015 and 05/02/2010 Structural problem / Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: January and April 2024	Systemic problem of ineffective criminal investigations into rape, sequestration and incitement to prostitution committed by private individuals	Article 3
52.	Bulgaria	STANEV (36760/06) final on 17/01/2012 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: September 2024	Placement in social care homes of persons with mental disorders: lawfulness, judicial review, conditions of placement; also, impossibility for partially incapacitated persons to request the restoration of their legal capacity	Article 5 § 1(e), 5 § 4, 5 § 5, 3 and 13, 6 § 1
53.	Bulgaria	UMO ILINDEN AND OTHERS group (59491/00) final on 19/04/2006 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: December 2024 and February 2025	Unjustified refusals to register an association aiming at achieving "the recognition of the Macedonian minority in Bulgaria"	Article 11
54.	Bulgaria	DIMITROV AND OTHERS group (77938/11) final on 17/11/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2023	Excessive use of force by members of the law enforcement agencies; ineffective investigations	Articles 2, 13, Article 6 § 1, 8, 1 of Prot. 1

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
55.	Bulgaria	YORDANOVA AND OTHERS group (25446/06) final on 24/09/2012 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: July and October 2024	Eviction of persons of Roma origin on the basis of a legislation not requiring an adequate examination of the proportionality of the measure	Article 8
56.	Bulgaria	Y. and Others (9077/18) final on 05/09/2022 A.E. (53891/20) final on : 23/08/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: August 2024	Failure to protect a woman's life in the context of repeated incidents of domestic violence Failure to provide adequate protection to a minor victim of domestic violence; discrimination on account of the authorities' failure to adequately address domestic violence against women	Article 2 Articles 3 and 14
57.	Bulgaria	P.H. (46509/20.) final on 22/09/2022 . Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in August 2023	Unjustified refusals of the domestic courts to grant the requests of transgender applicants for recognition of gender reassignment	Article 8
58.	Croatia	STATILEO (12027/10) final on 10/10/2014 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: February 2025	Statutory limitations on the use of flats by landlords, including through the rent control scheme for flats subject to protected leases	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1
59.	Croatia	M.H. AND OTHERS (15670/18) final on 04/04/2022 Complex Problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: May 2024	Lack of effective investigation into death; inadequate conditions of detention of migrant children; lack of administrative and court diligence and expedition concerning asylum seeking applicants' detention and asylum proceedings; collective expulsion; hindrance of the effective exercise of right of individual application	Articles 2, 3, 5 § 1, 4 of Protocol No. 4, 34
60.	Czech Republic	D.H. AND OTHERS (57325/00) final on 07/02/2006, 13/11/2007 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: January 2025	Discriminatory assignment of children of Roma origin to special schools for children with special needs or suffering a mental or social handicap	Articles 14 and 2 of Protocol No. 1
61.	Czech Republic	V. (26074/18) final on 07/03/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: September 2024	Death of the applicant's brother in a psychiatric hospital and ineffectiveness of criminal investigation into his death	Article 2

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
62.	Cyprus	ALTIUS INSURANCE LTD (41151/20) final on 19/02/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: October 2024	Excessive length of civil proceedings and the effectiveness of the existing remedies in this respect	Articles 6 § 1 and 13
63.	Denmark	K.K. AND OTHERS (25212/21) final on 06/03/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: March 2025	Disproportionate interference in children's' right to private life following refusal to allow their adoption after being born abroad through surrogacy	Article 8
64.	France	M.A. group (9373/15) final on 02/07/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Expulsion to Algeria in presence of a real and serious risk of ill-treatment in the M.A. case + failure to comply with the Court's interim measure in the M.A. and A.S. cases	Articles 3 and/or 34
65.	France	J.M.B. AND OTHERS (9671/15) final on 30/05/2020 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: December 2023	Structural problem of poor conditions of detention in prisons, notably overcrowding (Metropolitan France and overseas) + lack of an effective preventive remedy (indication Article 46)	Articles 3 and 13
66.	France	MOUSTAHI (9347/14) final on 25/09/2020 Complex problem Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Detention and expeditious return of two very young unaccompanied foreign children from Mayotte (French overseas territory) to the Comoros, without an examination of their individual situation	Articles 3, 5 § 1, 5 § 4, 8, 4 of Protocol No. 4 and 13 taken together with Articles 8 and 4 of Protocol No. 4
67.	France	H.F. AND OTHERS (24384/19) final on 14/09/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: December 2024	Violation of the right to enter the State of which a person is a national, due to the absence of appropriate safeguards against arbitrariness in the examination of the requests of the applicants to repatriate their two daughters and three grandchildren, who are French nationals held since 2019 in the camps in north-eastern Syria	Article 3 § 2 of Protocol No. 4
68.	Georgia	IDENTOBA AND OTHERS group (73235/12) final on 12/08/2015 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Lack of protection against homophobic attacks or religiously motivated attacks by private individuals during marches/meetings; failure to guarantee the right to peaceful enjoyment of possessions.	Articles 3, 8, 9, 11, and 14; Article 1, P1

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
69.	Georgia	MERABISHVILI (72508/13) final on 28/11/2017 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: December 2024	Failure by the domestic courts to give relevant and sufficient reasons to justify continuation of detention on remand; continued detention on remand with the predominant purpose of obtaining information from the applicant about third persons	Articles 5 and 18
70.	Georgia	TSINTSABADZE group (35403/06) final on 18/03/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: February 2024	Lack of effective investigations into allegations of ill-treatment or violations of the right to life; excessive use of force by the police in the course of arrest and/or while detaining suspects	Articles 2, 3, 5, 6 and 38
71.	Georgia	TKHELIDZE (33056/17) final on 8/10/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Domestic violence: positive obligations to protect from murder and investigate police inaction	Article 2 in conjunction with Article 14
72.	Georgia	A.D. AND OTHERS (57864/17) final on 01/03/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: August 2023	Lack of legislation governing procedures for legal gender recognition	Article 8
73.	Greece	BEKIR-OUSTA AND OTHERS group (35151/05) final on 11/01/2008 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Refusal to register or dissolution of the applicants' associations	Article 6 § 1, Article 11
74.	Greece	HOUSE OF MACEDONIAN CIVILIZATION AND OTHERS (1295/10) final on 09/10/2015 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 13 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Refusal to register the applicants' association on the grounds that the use of the word "Macedonian" and the purpose proclaimed in the association's statutes contravened public order and jeopardized the harmonious coexistence of the population of the Florina region	Article 11

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
75.	Greece	M.S.S group (30696/09) / H.A. AND OTHERS (4892/18) final on 21/01/2011 and 13/06/2023 Complex Problem Structural Problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: August 2024	<i>M.S.S.</i> : Shortcomings in the examination of asylum requests entailing risk of life or degrading treatment in case of direct or indirect return to the country of origin; poor detention conditions of asylum seekers and absence of adequate support when they are no longer detained; absence of an effective remedy <i>H.A. and Others</i> : Degrading treatment of the applicants (asylum-seekers) on account of their living conditions and the delayed medical care and the lack of an effective remedy to complain thereof.	Articles 3 and 13
76.	Greece	SIDIROPOULOS AND PAPAPOKOSTAS group (33349/10) final on 25/04/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2023	Ill-treatment by police agents and coastguards and lack of effective investigations	Article 2, Article 3, Article 6 § 1, Article 13, Article 14
77.	Greece	NISIOTIS group (34704/08) final on 20/06/2011 Complex problem Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: January 2025	Inhuman and degrading treatment on account of poor detention conditions in prison. Lack of an effective remedy	Article 3 and Article 13
78.	Hungary	GAZSO group (48322/12) final on 16/10/2015 Pilot judgment Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Excessive length of proceedings and lack of an effective remedy in this respect	Articles 6 § 1 and 13
79.	Hungary	HORVATH AND KISS (11146/11) final on 29/04/2013 Complex problem SZOLCSAN (24408/16) final on 30/06/2023 Complex Problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: October 2023 in <i>Horváth and Kiss</i> , in January 2024 in <i>Szolcsán</i>	Discriminatory assignment of children of Roma origin to schools for children with mental disabilities during their primary education Discrimination of a Roma pupil on account of segregation in a State-run primary school attended almost exclusively by Roma children	Article 14 and Article 2 of Protocol No 1
80.	Hungary	LASZLO MAGYAR group (73593/10) final on 13/10/2014 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: July 2024	Life sentence without parole in combination with the lack of an adequate review mechanism of this sentence and with parole only after having served between 25 years and 6 months and 48 years and 1 month of the sentence	Article 3, Article 6

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
81.	Hungary	VARGA AND OTHERS / ISTVÁN GÁBOR KOVÁCS group (14097/12, 15707/10) final on 10/06/2015 and 17/04/2012 Pilot judgment Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Inhuman and/or degrading treatment due to overcrowding and poor material conditions of detention (Article 3), lack of effective remedies in that regard (Article 13 in conjunction with Article 3), several other dysfunctions regarding the protection of prisoners' rights	Article 3, Article 5 §§ 3 and 4, Article 8, Article 13
82.	Hungary	BAKA (20261/12) final on 23/06/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Premature termination of the applicant's mandate as President of the Supreme Court through <i>ad hominem</i> legislative measures beyond judicial control, prompted by the applicant's expression of views and criticisms and exerting a "chilling effect" also on other judges and court presidents	Article 6 § 1, Article 8, Article 10
83.	Hungary	SZABO AND VISSY (37138/14) final on 06/06/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (March 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance	Article 8
84.	Hungary	GUBACSI group (44686/07) final on 28/09/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Group of cases concerning inhuman or degrading treatment by police officers and/or the lack of adequate investigations in this respect as well as some related but more specific situations	Article 2, Article 3, Article 14
85.	Hungary	TONELLO (46524/14) final on 24/04/2018 Urgent individual measures SHAW group (6457/09) final on 26/10/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: September 2024	Violations of the applicants' right to respect for their family life on account of the authorities' failure to effectively address the issues arising from their children's wrongful removals by the applicants' former spouses or partners (international child abductions)	Article 8
86.	Hungary	ILIAS AND AHMED group (47287/15) final on 21/11/2019 Complex problem SHAHZAD group (12625/17) final on 08/10/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2023	Authorities' failure to discharge procedural obligation under Article 3 to assess the risks of ill-treatment before expelling asylum-seeking applicants to a "safe third country" The asylum-seeking applicant's collective expulsion following application of the "apprehension and escort" measure introduced by the State Borders Act	Article 3 Article 4 of Protocol No. 4, Article 13

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
87.	Hungary	RANA group (40888/17) final on 16/07/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: July 2024	Lack of legislation governing gender reassignment and name-changing procedure	Article 8
88.	Hungary	C.A. ZRT. AND T.R. (11599/14) final on 01/09/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: June 2021	Removal of long-term usufruct rights over agricultural land without compensation	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1
89.	Hungary	R.R. AND OTHERS (36037/17) final on 05/07/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: May 2022	Ill-treatment of the applicants on account of the conditions of their detention in a “transit zone”, unlawfulness of the detention and lack of judicial review in this respect	Article 3, Article 5 §§ 1 and 4
90.	Hungary	L.B. (36345/16) final on 09/03/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: December 2023	Violation of the right to privacy due to the publication of taxpayer data on the list of major debtors	Article 8
91.	Hungary	BAKIRDZI AND E.C. final on 03/04/2023 Complex Problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Discriminatory restriction of voting rights of applicants belonging to recognised national minorities	Article 3 of Protocol No.1 in conjunction with Article 14
92.	Hungary	ALHOWAIS (59435/17) final on 02/05/2023 Complex Problem SHAHZAD NO. 2 (37967/18) final on 05/01/2024 Complex Problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024 in both cases	Ineffective investigation into migrant’s death and alleged ill-treatment by border control agents and failure to protect his life Ill-treatment of a migrant by law-enforcement officers and the lack of effective investigations in this respect	Article 2, Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
93.	Hungary	M.H. AND S.B. (10940/17) final on 22/05/2024 Complex Problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: /	Placement of unaccompanied minors in asylum detention due to the authorities' failure to act expeditiously and in good faith when determining the applicants' age	Article 5 § 1
94.	Hungary	KENEDI (31475/05) final on 26/08/2009 Complex Problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Violation of the right to freedom of expression and the lack of effective remedy in this respect on account of the authorities' reluctance to comply with a court order granting the applicant unrestricted access to documents; excessive length of the enforcement proceedings	Article 6 § 1 Article 10 Article 13 in conjunction with Article 10
95.	Hungary	M.D. AND OTHERS (60778/19) Final on 19/12/2024 Complex Problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received: /	Collective expulsion of an asylum-seeking Afghan family to Serbia	Article 4 of Protocol No. 4
96.	Iceland	GUDMUNDUR GUNNARSSON AND MAGNUS DAVID NORDDAHL (24159/22) Final on 16/07/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received: March 2025	Absence of adequate institutional and procedural safeguards as regards post-electoral disputes	Article 3 of Protocol No. 1, Article 13 in conjunction with Article 3 of Protocol No. 1
97.	Ireland	MCFARLANE group (31333/06) Final on 10/09/2010 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Excessive length of proceedings and lack of effective remedy	Article 6 § 1, Article 13
98.	Italy	AGRATI AND OTHERS group (43549/08) final on 28/11/2011, 08/02/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1348 (June 2019) Last information received in: November 2019	Retrospective application of legislation to on-going judicial proceedings to calculate the length of service of school staff	Article 6 § 1, Article 1 of Protocol 1

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
99.	Italy	CESTARO (6884/11) final on 07/07/2015 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: July 2024	Structural problem: ill-treatment by police; inadequate criminal legislation to punish acts of torture and inhuman and degrading treatment	Article 3
100.	Italy	CITRARO AND MOLINO (50988/13) final on 04/06/2020 Complex problem SY (11791/20) final on 24/04/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Failure of the authorities to comply with their positive obligation to protect the right to life of a prisoner with mental health problems who committed suicide while in detention: shortcomings in the psychiatric follow-up and monitoring and excessive delay in authorising his transfer to a specialised structure (<i>Citraro and Molino</i>) Continued detention in an ordinary prison of a person with a mental health condition without any overall therapeutic strategy and in disregard of court order for his transfer to an appropriate institution, for lack of available places. Delay in enforcing the Court's interim measure (<i>Sy</i>)	Articles 2, 3, 5 and 34
101.	Italy	CORDELLA AND OTHERS (54414/13) final on 24/06/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Lack of reaction on the part of the authorities to air pollution by a steelwork, to the detriment of the surrounding population's health and lack of an effective remedy to obtain decontamination of the affected areas	Articles 8 and 13
102.	Italy	TRAPANI group (45104/98) final on 12/01/2001 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1419 (December 2021) Last information received in: August 2023	Excessive length of proceedings before the civil courts	Article 6 § 1
103.	Italy	DE TOMMASO (43395/09) final on 23/02/2017 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1443 (September 2022) Last information received in: July 2022	Lack of foreseeability of the Italian legislation regulating the imposition of special preventive measures on persons deemed to pose a danger to society and the lack of public hearing in the relevant proceedings	Articles 2 of Protocol No. 4 and 6 § 1
104.	Italy	LEDONNE (No. 1) (35742/97) final on 12/08/1999 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1406 (June 2021) Last information received in: July 2022	Excessive length of proceedings before the criminal courts	Article 6 § 1

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
105.	Italy	COLLARILE (10652/02) final on 18/12/2012 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1302 (December 2017) Last information received in: August 2023	Excessive length of bankruptcy proceedings	Articles 6 § 1, 8, 13, Articles 1 and 3 of Protocol No. 1 and 2 of Protocol No. 4
106.	Italy	MARCELLO VIOLA (77633/16) final on 07/10/2019 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1459 (March 2023) Last information received in: October 2023	Reducibility of a whole-life prison sentence imposed for leadership of a Mafia organisation depended on cooperation with the police	Article 3
107.	Italy	PETRELLA (24340/07) final on 06/09/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1451 (December 2022) Last information received: July 2023	Impossibility for the injured party to lodge a complaint about the length of a preliminary investigation	Article 6 § 1 (civil) and 13
108.	Italy	NASR AND GHALI (44883/09) final on 23/05/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1377 (June 2020) Last information received in: July 2023	The case concerns an operation of extraordinary rendition	Articles 3 (substantive and procedural limbs), 5, 8 and 13
109.	Italy	R.V. AND OTHERS (37748/13) final on 18/10/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1428 (March 2022) Last information received in: January 2022	Childcare measures in respect of the applicant's two children that had been kept in force for over ten years. Concern of the Court over a system in which temporary placement into public care can be protracted indefinitely, with no time-limits for the duration of the measures or for their judicial review	Article 8

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
110.	Italy	TALPIS group (41237/14) final on 18/09/2017 Complex problem J.L. (5671/16) final on 27/08/2021 Complex problem M.S. (32715/19) final on 07/10/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: April 2024	Failure of the authorities to comply with their positive obligation to properly assess the risk to life in due time in a case of domestic violence; delays in mounting an adequate response to acts of domestic violence; shortcomings in the protection afforded to women against domestic violence; secondary victimization and sexism in the perception of the phenomenon of violence against women; impunity for domestic violence acts due to combination of judicial passivity and intervening changes in the prescription regime	Articles 2, 3, 8 and 14 in conjunction with Articles 2 and 3
111.	Italy	TERNA (21052/18) final on 14/04/2021 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1428 (March 2022) Last information received in: July 2023	Failure to make adequate and sufficient efforts to ensure respect of family members' visiting rights regarding children	Article 8
112.	Italy	DARBOE AND CAMARA group (5797/17) final on 21/10/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: January 2024	Placement of unaccompanied minors in adult reception centres in inadequate conditions and without being provided with minimum procedural guarantees in age-assessment procedure	Article 3, 8 and 13 in conjunction with Articles 3 and 8
113.	Italy	J.A. AND OTHERS group (21329/18) Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Unlawful detention of migrants at Lampedusa "hotspot" in poor conditions and collective expulsion from Italy	Articles 3, 5 § 1 (f), Article 4 of Protocol No. 4
114.	Italy	PENNINO group (43892/04) Final on 17/11/2014 Complex problem CROCE AND OTHERS group (17607/08) Final on 16/12/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Infringement of the applicants' rights to peaceful enjoyment of possessions and of access to a court due to the non-implementation or delayed implementation of domestic final judicial decisions and the impossibility for the applicants to obtain their execution through enforcement proceedings	Article 6 Article 1 of Protocol No. 1
115.	Italy	LOCASCIA AND OTHERS Final on 19/01/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received: December 2024	Interference with the applicants' personal well-being as a result of the pollution caused by a landfill site and by the waste crisis in the Campania region.	Article 8

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
116.	Italy	CRAMESTETER (19358/17) Final on 06/09/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received: /	Unlawful detention of the applicant in a psychiatric facility. Absence of means to obtain redress for unjust detention (issue at stake in the case of Richmond Yaw, No.3342/11, closed on the IM).	Articles 5 § 1, 5 § 5
117.	Latvia	D. (76680/17) final on 11/04/2024 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received: November 2024	Inhuman and degrading treatment inflicted on the applicant due to his position at the lowest level of an informal prisoner hierarchy in the prisons where he was incarcerated between 2008 and 2017	Article 3
118.	Lithuania	ABU ZUBAYDAH group (46454/11) final on 08/10/2018 Urgent individual measures Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Various violations related to the applicants' transfer to and from Lithuania, their detention in a secret CIA prison and the regime they were subjected to during this detention, in the context of an "extraordinary rendition" operation	Articles 3, 5, 8 and 13
119.	Lithuania	L. (27527/03) final on 31/03/2008 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Lack of legislation governing the conditions and procedures relating to gender reassignment and legal recognition of gender identity	Article 8
120.	Lithuania	MACATE (61435/19) final on 23/01/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: January 2025	No legitimate aim for temporary suspension of children's fairy tale book depicting same sex relationships and its subsequent labelling as harmful to children under the age of 14	Article 10
121.	Malta	FEILAZOO (6865/19) final on 11/06/2021 A.D. (12427/22) final on 17/01/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: April and June 2024	Feilazoo: Inadequate conditions of detention since 2018, particularly given excessively stringent and long period of <i>de facto</i> isolation, and unnecessary placement with new arrivals in Covid-19 quarantine; unlawful detention in view of deportation and interference with correspondence with the Court and ineffective legal representation through legal aid system. A.D.: Poor conditions of detention of a vulnerable individual in 2021/2022, due to presumed minority and health situation; restriction of movement for health reasons amounting to a <i>de facto</i> detention, arbitrary immigration detention, and lack of an effective remedy	Articles 3, 5 § 1, 13 and 34
122.	Malta	GALEA AND PAVIA (77209/16) final on 11/06/2020 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: January 2025	Excessive length of criminal, civil and constitutional redress proceedings, and lack of effective remedies	Articles 6 and 13

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
123.	Malta	S.H. final on 22/05/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: December 2024	Refusal of applicant's asylum requests since his arrival to Malta in 2019 without an assessment of his claim as to the risk faced on his return to Bangladesh and lack of access to an effective remedy	Articles 3 and 13
124.	Republic of Moldova	I.D. (47203/06) final on 11/04/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Poor conditions of detention in facilities under the authority of the Ministry of Justice; absence of an effective remedy	Articles 3, 13,
125.	Republic of Moldova	LEVINTA group (17332/03) final on 16/03/2009 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: November 2024	Ill-treatment, torture and death during police detention; ineffective investigations; absence of an effective remedy; conviction based on evidence obtained under torture	Articles 2, 3, 13, 6 § 1,
126.	Republic of Moldova	OZDIL AND OTHERS (42305/18) final on 11/09/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Extra-legal transfer of persons to Türkiye, circumventing domestic and international law	Articles 5 § 1 + 8
127.	Republic of Moldova	SARBAN group (3456/05) final on 04/01/2006 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1468 (June 2023) Last information received in: March 2023	Violations mainly related to unlawful detention on remand (lawfulness, duration, justification)	Articles 5 § 1, 5 § 3, 5 § 4 and 5 § 5
128.	Republic of Moldova	T.M. AND C.M. (26608/11) final on 28/04/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Authorities' failure to provide protection from domestic violence	Articles 3, 8 and 14

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
129.	Republic of Moldova	MANOLE AND OTHERS (13936/02) final on 17/12/2009 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Violation of the right to freedom of expression due to censorship and political control by State authorities at State Television Company, Teleradio-Moldova	Article 10
130.	Republic of Moldova	COSOVAN (13472/18) final on 22/06/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Inadequate medical treatment in prisons and lack of domestic remedy in this respect	Articles 3 and 13
131.	Republic of Moldova	G.M. AND OTHERS (44394/15) final on 22/02/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Forced abortions and birth-control measures imposed on persons with intellectual disabilities and failure to carry out an effective investigation in this respect	Article 3
132.	Republic of Moldova	V.I. (38963/18) final on 26/06/2024 Complex problem Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received: December 2024	Involuntary placement in a psychiatric hospital and unnecessary psychiatric treatment of a minor with an intellectual disability, as well as lack of investigation into negligence by the authorities and into sexual abuse on the hands of other patients	Article 3
133.	Montenegro	DEDIC AND OTHERS (4847/20) final on 11/04/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received: October 2024	Non-enforcement of domestic decisions against socially-owned companies	Article 6 § 1, Article 1 of Protocol No.1
134.	Netherlands	CORALLO (29593/17) final on 09/10/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2023	Inhuman and/or degrading treatment on account of the poor conditions of the applicant's detention on remand in Sint Maarten (Caribbean part of the Kingdom of the Netherlands)	Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
135.	Netherlands	MURRAY (10511/10) final on 26/04/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received: September 2023	De facto irreducibility of life sentence imposed on prisoner suffering from mental illness	Article 3
136.	North Macedonia	X (29683/16) final on 17/04/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Lack of legislation governing the conditions and procedures for changing on birth certificates the registered sex of transgender people	Article 8
137.	North Macedonia	KITANOVSKI group (15191/12) final on 22/04/2015 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Ill-treatment by the police and lack of effective investigation	Articles 2, and 3
138.	North Macedonia	ELMAZOVA AND OTHERS (11811/20) final on 13/03/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received on: September 2024	Discrimination of Roma pupils on account of their segregation in two State-run primary schools attended by a majority of Roma children and featuring Roma-only classes	Article 14 in conjunction with Article 2 of Protocol No. 1
139.	Norway	STRAND LOBBEN AND OTHERS (37283/13) Final on 10/09/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: December 2024	Various shortcomings in the decision-making processes in child welfare proceedings	Article 8
140.	Poland	AL NASHIRI group (28761/11) final on 16/02/2015 Complex problem Urgent individual measures	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Various violations related to secret rendition operations	Articles 2, 3, 5, 6 § 1, 8, 13, 38 and Article 1 of Protocol No. 6

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
141.	Poland	BAK (7870/04) final on 16/04/2007 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: July 2023	Excessive length of proceedings in criminal cases; lack of effective remedy	Article 6 § 1 and 13
142.	Poland	BELLER group (51837/99) final on 06/06/2005 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Excessive length of proceedings before administrative bodies and courts; absence of an effective remedy	Article 6 § 1 and 13
143.	Poland	BRODA AND BOJARA (26691/18) final on 29/09/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: March and June 2024	Infringement of the right to access to court on account of the premature termination of the applicants' term of office as vice-presidents of a regional court based on temporary legislation in force between 12 August 2017 and 12 February 2018, which did not allow for examination either by an ordinary court or by another body exercising judicial duties	Article 6
144.	Poland	GRZEDA (43572/18) final on 15/03/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: March and June 2024	Lack of judicial review of a premature termination ex lege of a mandate of a judicial member of the National Council of the Judiciary	Article 6
145.	Poland	JUSZCZYSZYN (39650/18) final on 30/01/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: March and June 2024	Unforeseeable suspension of a judge, based on manifestly unreasonable application of law in connection with giving of a judicial decision, by a body not complying with a requirement of a tribunal established by law. Disciplinary measures leading to the applicant's suspension predominantly aiming to sanction and dissuade him from verifying lawfulness of appointment of judges	Article 8, 18
146.	Poland	KACZMAREK (16974/14) final on 22/05/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: /	Disclosure of a recording of the applicant's telephone conversation and retention of data obtained during a covert surveillance operation	Article 8
147.	Poland	KUCHTA AND METEL. (76813/16) final on 02/12/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Excessive use of force by the Police and ineffective investigation in the circumstances of this incident	Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
148.	Poland	M.K. AND OTHERS (40503/17) final on 14/12/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: January 2024	Summary removal of asylum seekers to a third country with a risk of refoulement to and ill-treatment in the country of origin. Collective expulsion of aliens coming from Belarus. Lack of effective remedy with a suspensive effect. Non-compliance with interim measures under Rule 39	Article 3, Article 4 Protocol No. 4, Article 13, Article 34
149.	Poland	M.L. (40119/21) final on 14/03/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: October 2024	Lack of possibility to perform lawful abortion due to foetal abnormalities in consequence of the Constitutional Court's judgment, adopted in a composition not complying with the rule of law requirements and in circumstances disclosing the lack of foreseeability	Article 8
150.	Poland	P. AND S. (57375/08) final on 30/01/2013 Complex problem TYSIAC (5410/03) R.R. (27617/04) final on 24/09/2007 and 28/11/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Failure to provide effective access to reliable information to a mother and her minor daughter on the conditions and procedures to be followed in order to access lawful abortion, disclosure of the applicants' personal data resulting in their harassment, unlawful detention of the minor applicant. Inadequate legal framework to enable women effectively to exercise the right under national law to abortion on grounds of maternal or foetal health where the doctor disagrees that such grounds exist (Tysiac) or that prenatal tests necessary to assess this are justified (R.R.)	Articles 3, 5 § 1 and 8
151.	Poland	PAJAK AND OTHERS (25226/16) final on 24/01/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: July 2024	Discriminatory lowering of the retirement age for female judges and the refusal to authorise the applicants to continue performing their duties after reaching retirement age without providing reasons and without judicial review	Articles 6, 8, 14
152.	Poland	PIETRZAK, BYCHAWSKA-SINIARSKA AND OTHERS (72038/17) final on 28/08/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in:	Insufficient guarantees provided by law against arbitrariness and abuse as regards secret surveillance, retention and access to communications data	Article 8
153.	Poland	POKLIKAYEW (1103/16) final on 06/11/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: May 2024	Expulsion on national security grounds on the basis of undisclosed classified information without sufficient counterbalancing safeguards	Article 1 of the Protocol 7

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
154.	Poland	PRZYBYSEWSKA AND OTHERS group (11454/17) final on 12/03/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: April 2025	Absence of any form of legal recognition and protection for the same-sex couples.	Article 8
155.	Poland	RECKOWICZ (43447/19) final on 22/11/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: March and June 2024	Infringement of the right to tribunal established by law, due to the fact that the judges of the Disciplinary Chamber in the Supreme Court that dismissed the applicant's cassation appeal against disciplinary penalty were appointed in a deficient judicial appointment procedure involving the National Council of the Judiciary lacking independence from legislature and executive	Article 6
156.	Poland	RUTKOWSKI AND OTHERS + MAJEWSKI + ZALUSKA AND OTHERS (72287/10,52690/99) final on 07/07/2015 and 11/01/2006 Pilot judgment Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: July 2023	Excessive length of proceedings in civil cases; lack of effective remedy	Article 6 § 1 and 13
157.	Poland	TULEYA (21181/19) final on 06/10/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: April and June 2024	Lifting of judicial immunity by a body that cannot be considered an independent and impartial tribunal established by law, that together with disciplinary inquiries into the applicant requesting preliminary ruling from the CJEU and participating in public meetings and TV programmes affected his private life and freedom of expression	Article 8, 10
158.	Poland	XERO FLOR W POLSCE SP. Z O.O. (4907/18) final on 07/08/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: March and June 2024	Tribunal not established by law on account of the participation in the Constitutional Court's panel that rejected the applicant's constitutional complaint of Judge M.M., whose election was vitiated by grave irregularities. Domestic courts' failure to duly examine the pleas that subordinate legislation limiting the right to compensation should not have been applied in the case, owing to its incompatibility with the Constitution	Article 6
159.	Poland	WALESA (1103/16) final on 06/02/2024 Pilot judgment	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: March and June 2024	Reversal by the Supreme Court's Chamber of Extraordinary Review, not complying with the requirement of a court established by law, of final civil defamation judgment adopted in the applicant's favour, adversely affecting his private life, in the procedure incompatible with principle of legal certainty	Article 6, 8

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
160.	Poland	ZUREK (39650/18) final on 10/10/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: March and June 2024	Application of a set of measures against a judicial member of the National Council of the Judiciary and its spokesperson, in connection with the views that he had expressed in defence of judicial independence	Article 10
161.	Portugal	VICENTE CARDOSO group (30130/10) final on 12/03/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1411 (September 2021) Last information received in: October 2022	Excessive length of judicial proceedings	Article 6 § 1
162.	Portugal	PETRESCU group (23190/17) final on 03/03/2020 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: July 2024	Overcrowding and poor conditions of detention in prisons; lack of an effective remedy	Articles 3 and 13
163.	Portugal	FERNANDES (33023/17) final on : 16/01/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: July 2024	Continued imposition of high security regime in prison and restrictive measures, including frequent strip searches, on the applicant for a particularly long duration and without demonstrating that it remained necessary	Article 3
164.	Portugal	MIRANDA MAGRO (30138/21) final on 09/04/2024 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: March 2025	Preventive detention of a person, exempted from criminal responsibility due to a mental disorder, at a prison hospital's psychiatric unit, in inadequate conditions and without appropriate assistance and care, pending placement in an appropriate mental health facility	Article 3 and 5 § 1 (e)

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
165.	Romania	AL NASHIRI (33234/12) final on 08/10/2018 Urgent individual measures Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Various violations related to the applicant's transfer to and from Romania, his detention in a secret CIA prison and the regime he was subjected to during this detention, in the context of an "extraordinary rendition" operation	Articles 2, 3, 5, 6 § 1, 8 and 13 and Article 1 of Protocol No. 6
166.	Romania	ASSOCIATION '21 DECEMBRE 1989' AND OTHERS group (33810/07) final on 28/11/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: November 2024	Ineffectiveness of criminal investigations into violent crackdowns on anti-governmental demonstrations in 1989 and early 1990ies	Article 2, Article 3, Article 6 § 1, Article 8
167.	Romania	BALSAN group (49645/09) final on 23/08/2017 Complex problem BUTURUGĂ (56867/15) final on 11/06/2020 Complex problem P. (36049/21) final on 12/12/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Inadequate response from the judicial authorities to acts of domestic violence, including cyberbullying, and insufficient action to effectively tackle the widespread phenomenon of domestic violence Failure by the authorities to protect the applicant from acts of domestic violence involving also her children due to ineffective investigation	Article 3, Article 8, Article 14 in conjunction with Article 3
168.	Romania	BRAGADIREANU group + REZMIVES AND OTHERS (22088/04, 61467/12+) final on 06/03/2008, 25/07/2017 Complex problem Pilot judgment	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: March 2025	Overcrowding and poor conditions in police detention facilities and prisons, including failure to secure adequate medical care and lack of an effective remedy	Articles 3 and 13
169.	Romania	BUCUR AND TOMA (40238/02) final on 08/04/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: November 2024	Conviction of a whistle-blower for having disclosed information on the illegal secret surveillance of citizens by the Intelligence Service; lack of safeguards in the statutory framework governing secret surveillance	Articles 6 § 1, 8, 10, 13 and 38 § 1

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
170.	Romania	BUHUCEANU AND OTHERS (20081/19) final on 25/09/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: March 2024	Absence of any form of legal recognition of and protection for same-sex couples.	Article 8
171.	Romania	C. (47358/20) final on 30/11/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Failure to protect the applicant's personal integrity due to significant flaws in the criminal investigation concerning alleged sexual harassment at the workplace	Article 8
172.	Romania	CEGOLEA (25560/13) final on 24/07/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: September 2024	Discrimination related to the right to stand in parliamentary election and lack of judicial review regarding the fulfilment of an eligibility requirement that disadvantages national minority organisations not yet represented in Parliament	Articles 14 and 3 of Protocol No. 1
173.	Romania	CENTRE FOR LEGAL RESOURCES ON BEHALF OF VALENTIN CAMPEANU (47848/08) final on 17/07/2014 Complex problem N. (No. 2) (38048/18) final on 16/02/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: February-March 2025	Lack of adequate legal protection and serious deficiencies in the medical and social care afforded to a young man of Roma origin with intellectual disabilities, who died in 2004 during his stay in a psychiatric hospital Deficiencies in the legal protection afforded to vulnerable persons and lack of legal safeguards allowing an incapacitated person to have a say in the proceedings leading to the change of a legal guardian	Articles 2 and 13 Article 8
174.	Romania	CRISTIAN TEODORESCU group (22883/05) final on 19/09/2012 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: February-March 2025	Legislative deficiencies as regards the procedure and safeguards for involuntary placement in psychiatric hospital facilities and general failure of the competent authorities to apply this procedure as well as the provisions related to patients' consent to psychiatric treatment	Articles 5 and 8
175.	Romania	DORNEANU (55089/13) final on 28/02/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: February 2024	Inhuman treatment on account of the continued imprisonment of a terminally ill detainee	Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
176.	Romania	ENACHE (10662/06) final on 01/07/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: September 2017	Detention regime of prisoners classified as “dangerous”	Articles 3 and 34
177.	Romania	LINGURAR (48474/14) final on 16/04/2019 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1406 (June 2021) Last information received in: June 2021	Police raid based on ethnic profiling of a Roma community and failure to conduct an effective investigation into discriminatory motives for the raid	Articles 3 and 14
178.	Romania	M.C. AND A.C. (12060/12) final on 12/07/2016 Complex problem ASSOCIATION ACCEPT AND OTHERS (19237/16) final on 01/09/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1419 (December 2021) Last information received in: April 2023	Lack of an effective investigation into ill-treatment by private parties including into possible homophobic motives behind the attack (<i>M.C. and A.C.</i>) Discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation due to State’s failure to ensure that an LGBTI event proceeded peacefully, without verbal abuse, and carry out effective investigation into possible homophobic motives of counter-demonstrators (<i>Association ACCEPT and Others</i>)	Articles 3 and 14 Article 14 in conjunction with Articles 8 and 11
179.	Romania	M.G.C. group (61495/11) final on 15/06/2016 Complex problem E.B. (49089/10) final on 19/03/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: October 2023	Lack of effective and child-sensitive investigations and court proceedings into allegations of rape in a context marked by the absence of a settled and consistent practice of the national courts when addressing the question of victims’ consent to differentiate rape from the statutory offence of sexual intercourse with a minor (group <i>M.G.C.</i>) Lack of effective investigations and court proceedings into rape allegations by vulnerable adults: excessive reliance on absence of proof of physical resistance by the victims and deficiencies in the protection of their rights (<i>E.B.</i>)	Articles 3 and 8
180.	Romania	MUTU group (71434/17) final on 12/10/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: May 2022	Excessive use of force by State agents and lack of prompt and effective investigations in this regard	Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
181.	Romania	N. (59152/08) final on 28/02/2018 Structural problem R.D. and I.M.D. (35402/14) final on 12/10/2021 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: February 2025	Psychiatric confinement as a security measure prolonged in the absence of a legal basis. Insufficient safeguards in the judicial review proceedings regarding the continued psychiatric detention Absence of a legal framework on the administration of psychiatric treatment to such patients	Article 5 §§ 1 and 4, Article 8
182.	Romania	NEDESCU (70035/10) final on 16/04/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: April 2024	Impossibility to recover frozen embryos seized in the context of criminal proceedings against a third party in the absence of clear provisions on the procedure to be followed	Article 8
183.	Romania	PARASCINETI (32060/05) final on 13/06/2012 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: February-March 2025	Overcrowding and poor conditions in psychiatric facilities	Article 3
184.	Romania	SACALEANU group (73970/01) final on 06/12/2005 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2024	Failure or significant delay of the administration or of legal persons under the responsibility of the State in abiding by final domestic court decisions	Articles 6 § 1 and 1 of Protocol No. 1
185.	Romania	SOARE AND OTHERS group (24329/02) final on 22/05/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1406 (June 2021) Last information received in: April 2021	Unjustified and disproportionate use of firearms by the police and ineffective investigations into incidents reported; lack of an adequate statutory and regulatory framework	Articles 2 and 13

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
186.	Romania	STRAIN AND OTHERS group + MARIA ATANASIU (57001/00) final on 30/11/2005 12/01/2011 Pilot judgment VALEANU AND OTHERS (59012/17) final on 03/04/2023 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2025	Ineffectiveness of the mechanisms set up to afford restitution or compensation for properties nationalised during the communist period	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, Article 6 § 1
187.	Romania	TICU group (24575/10) final on 01/01/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1355 (September 2019) Last information received in: February-March 2025	Ill-treatment in prison due to the inadequate management of the applicants' psychiatric conditions	Article 3
188.	Romania	TUSA (21854/18) Final on 30/10/2023 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: August 2023	Lack of effective avenues to obtain reparation in cases of alleged medical negligence	Article 8
189.	Romania	X AND Y group (2145/16) final on 19/04/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (June 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Absence of a clear and foreseeable legal framework for recognition of gender identity	Article 8
190.	Serbia	KACAPOR group (2269/06) final on 07/07/2008 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: September 2024	Non-enforcement of domestic decisions, including against socially-owned companies	Article 6 § 1, Article 1 of Protocol No.1
191.	Serbia	JEVREMOVIC group (3150/05) final on 17/07/2007 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: July 2024	Excessive length of judicial proceedings and lack of an effective remedy	Article 6 § 1, Article 13

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
192.	Serbia	STANIMIROVIC group (26088/06) final on 08/03/2012 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Ill-treatment by law enforcement officers and the lack of effective investigations in that regard	Articles 3
193.	Slovenia	PINTAR AND OTHERS (49969/14) final on 14/12/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Protection of property: lack of an effective remedy to challenge or seek compensation for national bank's extraordinary measures, cancelling the applicants' shares and bonds, which were not accompanied by sufficient procedural guarantees against arbitrariness	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1
194.	Slovak Republic	MASLAK (No. 2) (38321/17) final on 30/06/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last Information received in April 2024	Unlawful placement in high security regime while serving a prison sentence, in the light of the failure of the domestic system to afford adequate legal protection against abuse	Article 8
195.	Slovak Republic	R.R. AND R.D. group (20649/18) final on 01/12/2020 P.H. (37574/19) final on 08/12/2022 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last Information received in August and October 2024	Excessive use of force in a police operation carried out in a Roma community, ineffective investigation and lack of inquiry into the alleged discrimination in the planning of the operation; failure to investigate possible racist motive in an alleged ill-treatment by the police of Romani minors; failure to investigate powerful indicators of racism in shooting by an off-duty police officer at the home of a Roma family; failure to protect the physical well-being of an unaccompanied Romani minor in police custody, and failure of effective investigation	Articles 2, 3 and Article 14 in conjunction with Articles 2 and 3
196.	Slovak Republic	ZOLTAN VARGA group (58361/12) final on 22/11/2021 PLECHLO (18593/19) final on 26/01/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last Information received in November and December 2024	Implementation of a surveillance operation, without adequate legal safeguards against abuse, due to the practically unfettered power exercised by the Slovak Intelligence Service; lack of safeguards in respect of persons randomly affected by the implementation of a secret surveillance warrant in the context of criminal proceedings	Article 8
197.	Spain	A.C. AND OTHERS (6528/11) final on 22/07/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: January 2025	Lack of an effective remedy, with suspensive effect, against decisions to remove the applicants to their country of origin, notwithstanding the risk to their lives/risk of ill-treatment, taken in the framework of an accelerated asylum procedure	Articles 3 and 13

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
198.	Sweden	CENTRUM FOR RATTVISA (35252/08) final on 25/05/2021 (GC) Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: November 2024	Insufficient safeguards in bulk signals-intelligence gathering	Article 8
199.	Switzerland	I.L. (No. 2) (36609/16) final on 20/05/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: November 2024	Detention of the applicant in solitary confinement in prisons unable to offer him care appropriate to his mental illness	Articles 3 and 5 § 1, 5 § 4
200.	Switzerland	VEREIN KLIMASENIORINNEN SCHWEIZ AND OTHERS (53600/20) (GC) final on 09/04/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: February 2025	The authorities' failure to mitigate climate change and in particular the effects of global warming	Articles 6 and 8
201.	Switzerland	WA BAILE (43868/18) final on 20/05/2024 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: November 2024	Racial profiling during identity checks	Articles 14, read in conjunction with Article 8 and 13 in connection with the complaint under Article 14, read in conjunction with Article 8
202.	Türkiye	ALPARSLAN ALTAN group (12778/17) final on 09/09/2019 AKGUN (19699/18) final on 22/11/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: April 2024	Unlawful and unjustified arrest and initial pre-trial detention, including members of judiciary by means of extensive interpretation of the concept of in flagrante delicto; Lack of relevant reasons to justify continuing pre-trial detention; Inability to access the evidence available exclusively to the prosecution; Unlawful search in the home of a judge	Articles 5 § 1, 5 § 3, 5 § 4, 5 § 5 and 8
203.	Türkiye	ASSOCIATION OF SOLIDARITY WITH JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES AND OTHERS (36915/10+) final on 17/10/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Planning restrictions making it impossible for small religious community to have a place of worship	Article 9

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
204.	Türkiye	FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION groups (ALTUG TANER AKCAM group (27520/07), ONER AND TURK group (51962/12) (former INCAL group), ARTUN AND GUVENER group (75510/01), ISIKIRIK (41226/09)) final on 25/01/2012; 30/06/2015; 26/09/2007; 09/04/2018) Complex and structural problems	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Criminal investigation for “denigrating Turkishness”; Unjustified interferences with freedom of expression, owing notably to criminal convictions, including defamation cases; unforeseeable conviction of membership of an illegal organization for the mere fact of attending and expressing views at a public meeting	Articles 5, 6, 10, 11
205.	Türkiye	FREEDOM OF ASSEMBLY group (OYA ATAMAN group (74552/01)) final on 05/03/2007 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1459 (March 2023) Last information received in: March 2025	Excessive use of force while dispersing demonstrations; unjustified detention orders or administrative fines issued against participants	Article 2, Article 3, Article 11, Article 13
206.	Türkiye	BATI AND OTHERS group (33097/96) final on 03/09/2004 Complex problem ELVAN (64937/19) final on 26/06/2023 Complex and structural problems	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: July 2024 Last information received in: January 2024	Ineffectiveness of investigations against law enforcement officers in allegations of torture and ill-treatment; impunity Ineffectiveness of investigation on account of administrative authorisation requirement provided under Law No. 4483	Articles 2, 3 and 13
207.	Türkiye	BILGEN group (1571/07) final on 09/06/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: March 2022	Inability of judge to have recourse to judicial review of unjustified non-consensual transfer decision to lower ranking judicial district; unlawful interference with private life; unjustified interferences with freedom of expression	Articles 6, 8 and 10
208.	Türkiye	CYPRUS (25781/94) final on 10/05/2001, 12/05/2014 Interstate	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: March 2025 (missing persons)	14 violations in relation to the situation in the Northern part of Cyprus	Article 2, 3, 6, 8, 9, 10 and 13 and Articles 1 and 2 of Protocol No. 1

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
209.	Türkiye	DERYAN group (41721/04) final on 21/10/2015 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1436 (June 2022) Last information received in: August 2023	Violation of the applicant's right to a fair trial on account of the failure of the domestic courts to provide adequate reasons for their decisions	Article 6 § 1
210.	Türkiye	DINK (2668/07) final on 14/12/2010 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Failure of the authorities to protect the life and freedom of expression of a journalist, lack of an effective investigation, criminal investigation for "denigrating Turkishness"	Articles 2, 10 and 13
211.	Türkiye	DURUKAN AND BIROL (14879/20) final on 19/02/2024 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: July 2024	Inadequate quality of the legal framework for suspension of the pronouncement of judgment	Article 10
212.	Türkiye	ERDOGAN AND OTHERS group (19807/92) final on 13/09/2006 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1411 (September 2021) Last information received in: July 2022	Actions of security forces during military operations and lack of effective investigation	Articles 2, 3 and 13, Article 38
213.	Türkiye	GENC AND DEMIRGAN group (34327/06) final on 10/10/2017 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Failure to comply with administrative court decisions in cases concerning the environment	Articles 6 and 8
214.	Türkiye	GEYLANI AND OTHERS (10443/12) final on 12/12/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: March 2025	Disproportionate and unjustified use of force, in particular water cannons, by law enforcement officers during peaceful demonstration and subsequent ineffectiveness of investigations	Articles 3 and 11
215.	Türkiye	GOMI (38704/11) final on 24/06/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1436 (June 2022) Last information received in: April 2023	Continued detention of the applicant, who has been suffering from a psychotic illness since 2003	Article 3

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
216.	Türkiye	GUZELYURTLU AND OTHERS (36925/07) final on 29/01/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: July 2019	Türkiye's failure to cooperate with Cyprus in murder investigation	Article 2
217.	Türkiye	ILERDE AND OTHERS (35614/19) final on 08/04/2024 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: October 2024	Overcrowding in prisons -Placement of an applicant in a penal facility located far away from his family's place of residence	Articles 3 and 8
218.	Türkiye	MANSUR YALCIN AND OTHERS (21163/11) final on 16/02/2015 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Lack of objectivity and pluralism in the teaching of religious instruction and limited possibilities for exemption from compulsory classes	Article 2 of Protocol No 1
219.	Türkiye	KAKOULLI group (38595/97) final on 22/02/2006 ISAAK group (44587/98) final on 24/09/2008 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Deaths of the applicants' relatives or injury to one applicant along the cease-fire line in Cyprus; lack of effective investigation thereof	Article 2
220.	Türkiye	KAVALA (28749/18) final on 11/05/2020 11/07/2022 (Article 46 § 4) Urgent individual measures Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: February 2025	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence	Article 5, Article 18, Article 46 § 1
221.	Türkiye	NEDIM SENER group (38270/11) final on 08/10/2014 Complex and structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: January 2024	Pre-trial detention without relevant and sufficient reasons, on serious charges based on the detainee's publications or speech	Articles 5 and 10
222.	Türkiye	GURBAN group (4947/04) final on 15/03/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: July 2024	Absence of any review mechanism for an aggravated life imprisonment sentence and conditions of detention	Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
223.	Türkiye	OPUZ group (33401/02) final on 09/09/2009 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1451 (December 2023) Last information received in: October 2024	Authorities' failure to provide protection from domestic violence	Article 2, Article 3, Article 14
224.	Türkiye	PISKIN (33399/18) final on 19/04/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Inadequate judicial review of the dismissal of an employee of a public institute, under an emergency legislative decree, on account of his alleged links with a terrorist organisation	Article 6 § 1, Article 8
225.	Türkiye	SELAHATTIN DEMIRTAS (No. 2) group (14305/17) final on 22/12/2020 Urgent individual measures Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: January 2025	Unjustified detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech	Article 10, Article 3 of Protocol No. 1; Article 5 § 1 and 3; Article 18 in conjunction with Article 5
226.	Türkiye	ULKE group (39437/98) final on 24/04/2006 Complex problem Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: March 2024	Repetitive convictions and prosecutions for refusing to carry out compulsory military service on account of religious beliefs or other convictions; absence of an accessible procedure to establish status as conscientious objector	Article 3, Article 6, Article 9
227.	Türkiye	VARNAVA AND OTHERS (16064/90) final on 18/09/2009 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: March 2025	Lack of effective investigations into the fate of Greek Cypriots who disappeared during the Turkish military operations in Cyprus in 1974	Article 2, Article 3, Article 5
228.	Türkiye	XENIDES-ARESTIS group (46347/99) final on 23/05/2007, 22/03/2006 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: September 2024	Continuous denial of access to property in the northern part of Cyprus and consequent loss of control thereof and violation of the right to respect for the applicants' home in some cases	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, Article 8
229.	Türkiye	YUKSEL YALCINKAYA (15669/20) final on 26/09/2023 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: March 2025	Several violations of the Convention on account of expansive and unreasonable interpretation of the law and offence in an unforeseeable manner, failing to accord the requisite minimum protection against arbitrary prosecution, conviction and punishment; inability to challenge the evidence in proceedings	Article 6 § 1, Article 7, Article 11

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
230.	Ukraine	AFANASYEV group (38722/02) final on 05/07/2005 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Ill-treatment/torture by police and lack of effective investigations	Articles 2 and 3
231.	Ukraine	ARSKAYA group (45076/05) final on 05/03/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1419 (December 2021) Last information received in: February 2023	Medical negligence in public hospitals having caused death or serious health issues, and lack of effective investigation	Article 2, Article 3
232.	Ukraine	BELOZOROV (43611/02) final on 15/01/2016 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: May 2024	Various breaches of the applicant's rights to liberty and security, and the right to privacy, by the authorities of Ukraine and the Russian Federation, in the course of his unlawful transfer from Ukraine to the Russian Federation	Article 5 § 1 and Article 8
233.	Ukraine	FEDORCHENKO AND LOZENKO group (387/03) final on 20/12/2012 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483(December 2023) Last information received in: May 2024	Failure to carry out effective investigations into violent acts allegedly carried out on racial/ethnic grounds and to investigate a possible causal link between alleged racist attitudes and the attacks	Articles 2, 3, 8, 9 and Article 14
234.	Ukraine	GONGADZE (34056/02) final on 08/02/2006 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1390 (December 2020) Last information received in: January 2022	Killing of a journalist and lack of effective investigation	Article 2, Article 3, Article 13
235.	Ukraine	IGNATOV group (40583/15) final on 15/03/2017 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Unlawful arrests, unlawful and lengthy detention on remand, notably lack of court order for detention between the end of investigation and trial	Article 2 § 1 of Protocol No. 7, Article 3, Article 5, Article 5 § 1, Article 5 § 3, Article 5 § 4, Article 5 § 5, Article 6 § 1
236.	Ukraine	KARABET AND OTHERS group (38906/07) final on 17/04/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1340 (March 2019) Last information received in: April 2020	Large-scale violence against prisoners with involvement of special forces units either as punishment or during training exercises, and absence of effective investigation	Article 3, Article 1 of Protocol No. 1

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
237.	Ukraine	KEBE AND OTHERS group (12552/12) final on 12/04/2017 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1419 (December 2021) Last information received in: July 2024	Various deficiencies in the procedures related to different aspects of the treatment of asylum-seekers	Article 13 in conjunction with Article 3; Article 5 § 1 (f), Article 5 § 4
238.	Ukraine	KHAYLO group (39964/02) final on 05/03/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1324 (September 2018) Last information received in: January 2025	Violations of right to life and lack of effective investigation.	Article 2, Article 3, Article 5, Article 34
239.	Ukraine	KOVAL AND OTHERS (22429/05) final on 15/02/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1398 (March 2021) Last information received in: September 2024	Unlawful search and seizure of property, lack of effective remedy	Articles 3, 5 § 1, 6, 8, 13 and Article 1 of Protocol No. 1
240.	Ukraine	LEVCHUK (17496/19) final on 03/12/2020 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1451 (December 2022) Last information received in: March 2024	Failure to ensure the applicant's protection from domestic violence	Article 8
241.	Ukraine	LOGVINENKO group (13448/07) final on 14/01/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1406 (June 2021) Last information received in: July 2023	Lack of adequate medical treatment in detention and lack of effective remedies, failure to comply with interim measures indicated under Rule 39 and provide the applicants with adequate medical care; and failure to protect the right to life of individuals in pre-trial detention by denying urgent hospitalisation	Articles 2, 3 and 34
242.	Ukraine	LUTSENKO (6492/11) final on 19/11/2012 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Circumvention of legislation by prosecutors and judges in the context of criminal investigations in order to restrict liberty for reasons other than those permissible under the Convention	Article 5 and Article 18
243.	Ukraine	MAYMULAKHIN AND MARKIV (75135/14) final on 01/09/2023 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1514 (December 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Absence of any form of legal recognition and protection for same-sex couples	Article 14 in conjunction with Article 8

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
244.	Ukraine	MERIT group (66561/01) final on 30/06/2004 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1468 (June 2023) Last information received in: September 2024	Excessive length of civil and criminal proceedings; absence of an effective remedy	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, Article 2 of Protocol No. 4, Article 5 § 3, Article 6 § 1 and 13
245.	Ukraine	M.R. AND D.R. (63551/13) final on 22/08/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Lack of available legislative and administrative framework to enforce the court order under the Hague Convention	Article 8
246.	Ukraine	NAYDYON group (16474/03) final on 14/01/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1348 (June 2019) Last information received in: March 2024	Lack of a clear procedure allowing prisoners access to documents necessary to substantiate their complaints to the Court	Article 34, Article 6 § 1
247.	Ukraine	NECHIPORUK AND YONKALO (42310/04) final on 21/07/2011 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: May 2012	Unfair trials following torture and ill-treatment in police custody and ineffective investigations	Articles 3, 5 § 1, 5 § 2, 5 § 3, 5 § 4, 5 § 5, 6 § 1 and 6 § 3 (c)
248.	Ukraine	NEVMERZHITSKY group (54825/00) final on 25/01/2008 Complex problem Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: April 2024	Poor conditions of detention and transportation of detainees and lack of effective remedies	Articles 3, 13, 5, 6, 8 and 34
249.	Ukraine	OLEKSANDR VOLKOV group (21722/11) final on 27/05/2013 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1492 (March 2024) Last information received in: May 2024	Various violations related to the independence and impartiality of the judiciary; interference of the executive power with the judiciary; unfair disciplinary proceedings brought against a judge	Articles 6 and 8
250.	Ukraine	PETUKHOV (No. 2) group (41216/13) final on 09/09/2019 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1459 (March 2023) Last information received in: September 2024	Irreducibility of life sentences	Article 3

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
251.	Ukraine	SERGEY SHEVCHENKO group (32478/02) final on 04/07/2006 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 976 (October 2006) Last information received in: September 2021	Death during military service and lack of effective investigation	Article 2, Article 13
252.	Ukraine	SHMORGUNOV AND OTHERS group (15367/14) final on 21/04/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1521 (March 2025) Last information received in: December 2024	Numerous violations of human rights during Maidan protests	Articles 2, 3, 5, 8, 11
253.	Ukraine	SHVETS (22208/17) final on 23/07/2019 Structural and complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: June 2024	Failure to enforce the court judgment granting access rights to the applicant's minor grandchild	Article 8
254.	Ukraine	SHVYDKA (17888/12) final on 30/01/2015 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1468 (June 2023) Last information received in: May 2024	Non suspensive effect of appeals against administrative offences; disproportionate administrative arrest for act of freedom of expression	Article 10 Article 2 of Protocol No. 7
255.	Ukraine	VYERENTSOV group (20372/11) final on 11/07/2013 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1288 (June 2017) Last information received in: March 2022	Deficiencies in the legislation and administrative practices governing the right of freedom of assembly, notably leading to unforeseeable convictions of participants in demonstrations	Articles 3 and 6 § 1
256.	Ukraine	YUKHYMOVYCH (11464/12) final on 17/03/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: September 2024	Killing during an arrest attempt and lack of effective investigation	Article 2
257.	Ukraine	YURIY ILLARIONOVICH SHCHOKIN (4299/03) final on 03/01/2014 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: / Last information received in: October 2014	Killing in a penitentiary colony and ill-treatment before the death (involving inter-prisoner violence) and lack of effective investigation	Article 2 Article 3

Table of cases under enhanced supervision of the Committee of Ministers

4 April 2025

N°	State	Name	Information on the case	Main problem (cases may also raise other problems dealt with in other cases/groups)	Violations
258.	Ukraine	ZELENCHUK AND TSYTSYURA (846/16) final on 22/08/2018 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1451 (December 2022) Last information received in: October 2022	Long-standing and disproportionate land moratorium of broad scope and inflexible nature	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1
259.	Ukraine	ZHOVNER group + YURIY NIKOLAYEVICH IVANOV (56848/00) final on 29/09/2004, 15/01/2010 Complex problem Pilot judgment	Previous DH meeting: 1475 (September 2023) Last information received in: July 2024	Long standing problem of non-enforcement of domestic judgments, mostly delivered against the State or State enterprises; absence of effective remedies	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1, Article 6 § 1, Article 13
260.	United Kingdom	GAUGHRAN group (45245/15) final on 13/06/2020 Structural problem	Previous DH meeting: 1483 (December 2023) Last information received in: November 2023	Indefinite retention of DNA profile, fingerprints and photograph of person convicted of minor offence or arrested but ultimately not convicted, in the absence of any real review	Article 8
261.	United Kingdom	MCKERR group (28883/95) final on 04/08/2001 Structural problem Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1501 (June 2024) Last information received in: November 2024	Actions of security forces in Northern Ireland in the 1980s and 1990s: shortcomings in subsequent investigation of deaths; lack of independence of investigating police officers; lack of public scrutiny and information to victims' families on reasons for decisions not to prosecute	Article 2 (procedural)
262.	United Kingdom	V.C.L AND A.N. (77587/12) Final on 05/07/2021 Complex problem	Previous DH meeting: 1507 (September 2024) Last information received in: October 2024	Failure to take adequate operational measures to protect two potential victims of child trafficking from prosecution	Article 4 and 6