

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

Cases examined at 1514th meeting (HR) . 3-5 December 2024

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
ALBANIA	Luli and Others (group)	Link	01/07/2014	Excessive length of civil and criminal proceedings and absence of a remedy in that respect.	Link	
ALBANIA	X. and Others	Link	31/08/2022	Failure to implement swift and comprehensive desegregation measures in an elementary school attended almost exclusively by Roma ¹ and Egyptian children.	Link	
ARMENIA	Chiragov and Others	Link	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies .	Link	
ARMENIA	Oganezova	Link	17/08/2022	Lack of protection against homophobic attacks and hate speech ; failure to carry out effective investigation; absence of effective domestic criminal-law mechanism for investigating discrimination complaints.	Link	
ARMENIA	Virabyan (group)	Link	02/01/2013	Torture in police custody and killing during the arrest operation and ineffective investigations , including into allegations that the ill-treatment was politically motivated.	Link	
AZERBAIJAN	Makuchyan and Minasyan	Link	12/10/2020	Failure to continue to enforce prison sentence for ethnic hate crime committed abroad , after transfer to Azerbaijan.	Link	
AZERBAIJAN	Mammadli (group)	Link	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring or for their active social and political engagement in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5 .	Link	
AZERBAIJAN	Namat Aliyev (group)	Link	08/07/2010	Various irregularities in the context of the 2005 and 2010 parliamentary elections and lack of safeguards against arbitrariness.	Link	
AZERBAIJAN	Muradova (group)	Link	02/07/2009	Excessive use of force by the security forces and lack of effective investigations.	Link	
	Mammadov (Jalaloglu) (group)	Link	11/04/2007			
	Mikayil Mammadov (group)	Link	17/03/2010			
AZERBAIJAN	Sargsyan	Link	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies .	Link	
BELGIUM	L.B. (group)	Link	02/01/2013	Structural problem concerning the care of persons with mental health problems detained in prison .	Link	
	W.D. (pilot judgment)	Link	06/12/2016			
BELGIUM	Vasilescu (group)	Link	20/04/2015	Structural problem concerning prison overcrowding, material conditions of detention and lack of effective remedies.	Link	
BULGARIA	C.G. and Others (group)	Link	24/07/2008	Shortcomings in the judicial review mechanism set up in 2003 in the field of expulsion on national security grounds.	Link	
BULGARIA	Yordanova and Others (group)	Link	24/09/2012	Eviction of persons of Roma origin or planned demolition of the house of other persons on the basis of legislation not requiring adequate examination of the proportionality of the measure.	Link	
BULGARIA	Paketova and Others	Link	04/01/2023	Roma being driven away from their homes after anti-Roma protests and not being able to return.	Link	

¹ The term "Roma and Travellers" is used at the Council of Europe to encompass the wide diversity of the groups covered by the work of the Council of Europe in this field: on the one hand a) Roma, Sinti/Manush, Calé, Kaale, Romanichals, Boyash/Rudari; b) Balkan Egyptians (Egyptians and Ashkali); c) Eastern groups (Dom, Lom and Abdal); and, on the other hand, groups such as Travellers, Yenish, and the populations designated under the administrative term "Gens du voyage", as well as persons who identify themselves as Gypsies. The present is an explanatory footnote, not a definition of Roma and/or Travellers.

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

Cases examined at 1514th meeting (HR) . 3-5 December 2024

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
GEORGIA	Tkheldize (group)	Link	08/10/2021	Failure to protect from domestic violence and to conduct an effective investigation into police inaction.	Link	
GERMANY	Basu	Link	18/01/2023	Lack of independent effective investigation into arguable allegations of racial profiling by the police during identity check on a train.	Link	
GREECE	Bekir-Ousta and Others (group)	Link	11/01/2008	Refusal of domestic courts to register associations.	Link	
HUNGARY	Alhowais Shahzad No. 2	Link Link	02/05/2023 05/01/2024	Ill-treatment of migrants by law-enforcement officers and border control agents, failure to protect life, and ineffective investigations in these respects.	Link Link	
HUNGARY	Gubacsi (group)	Link	28/09/2011	Inhuman and degrading treatment by law enforcement officers and/or the lack of adequate investigations in this respect.	Link	
HUNGARY	Kenedi	Link	26/08/2009	Non-enforcement of a court order granting the applicant unrestricted access to certain documents and lack of an effective remedy in this respect.	Link	
HUNGARY	Tonello (Shaw group)	Link	24/04/2018	Authorities' failure to enforce court decisions ordering return to applicant of his daughter abducted by the mother.	Link	
ITALY	Cestaro (group)	Link	07/07/2015	Ill-treatment by the police ; inadequate criminal legislation to punish acts of torture and inhuman and degrading treatment.	Link	
ITALY	Cordella and Others	Link	24/06/2019	Lack of reaction on the part of the authorities to air pollution by steelworks , to the detriment of the surrounding population's health and lack of an effective remedy to obtain decontamination of the affected areas.	Link	
LITHUANIA	Abu Zubaydah	Link	08/10/2018	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicant, who has been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base without charge and without any safeguards against arbitrary detention.	Link	
MALTA	Apap Bologna (group)	Link	30/11/2016	Disproportionate restrictions to property rights due to the requisition and imposition of a landlord-tenant relationship on the landlord ; lack of effective remedy.	Link	
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	I.D. (group)	Link	11/04/2011	Poor conditions of detention in facilities under the authority of the Ministries of the Interior and Justice, including lack of access to adequate medical care; absence of an effective remedy.	Link	
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Cosovan (group)	Link	22/06/2022	Lack of adequate medical care in prison , lack of domestic remedies, and lack of sufficient reasons for prolongation of pre-trial detention.	Link	
NORTH MACEDONIA	Elmazova and Others	Link	13/03/2023	Discrimination of Roma pupils on account of their segregation in two State-run primary schools.	Link	
POLAND	Al Nashiri (group)	Link	16/02/2015	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicants, who have been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base. Mr Al Nashiri remains there at risk in particular of the death penalty in the proceedings before a United States military commission and Mr Abu Zubaydah is being detained without charge and without any safeguards against arbitrary detention.	Link	
ROMANIA	Rezmiveş and Others Bragadireanu (group)	Link Link	25/07/2017 06/03/2008	Overcrowding and poor conditions of detention in prisons and police detention facilities ; lack of an effective remedy in that regard; inadequacy of medical care and several other dysfunctions regarding the protection of prisoners' rights.	Link	
ROMANIA	Bucur and Toma	Link	23/08/2017	Conviction of a whistle-blower for having disclosed information on the illegal secret surveillance of citizens by the Intelligence Service; lack of safeguards in the statutory framework governing secret surveillance.	Link	

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

Cases examined at 1514th meeting (HR) . 3-5 December 2024

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Khashiyev and Akayeva</i> (group)	Link	06/07/2005	Action of the security forces , mostly in the Chechen Republic (the search for missing persons in the cases concerning events which took place between 1999 and 2006).	Link	
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Bryan and Others</i> <i>Butkevich</i> <i>Chemodurov</i> (group) <i>Chirikov and Nekrasov</i> (group) <i>Dzhavadov</i> <i>Kazakov</i> (group) <i>Kudeshkina</i> <i>Obukhova</i> <i>Saliyev</i> <i>Verzilov and Others</i>	Link Link Link Link Link Link Link Link Link Link	27/09/2023 02/07/2018 31/10/2007 29/03/2022 27/12/2007 05/06/2009 14/09/2009 08/04/2009 21/01/2011 29/11/2023	Freedom of expression groups of cases.	Link	
TÜRKIYE	<i>Dink</i>	Link	14/12/2010	Failure of the authorities to protect the life and freedom of expression of a journalist.	Link	
TÜRKIYE	<i>Genç and Demirgan</i>	Link	10/10/2017	Failure to comply with administrative court decisions in cases concerning the environment.	Link	
TÜRKIYE	<i>Kavala</i>	Link	11/05/2020	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence.	Link	
TÜRKIYE	<i>Selahattin Demirtaş (No. 2)</i> (group)	Link	22/12/2020	Unjustified detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech.	Link	
UKRAINE	<i>Kaverzin</i> <i>Afanasyev</i> (group) <i>Belousov</i>	Link Link Link	15/08/2012 05/07/2005 07/02/2014	Ill-treatment / torture by police and lack of effective investigation.	Link	
UKRAINE	<i>Maymulakhin and Markiv</i>	Link	01/09/2023	Absence of any form of legal recognition and protection for same-sex couples.	Link	