

# COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

Cases examined at 1507<sup>th</sup> meeting (HR) . 17-19 September 2024

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (European Court)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
<a href="#">ALBANIA</a>	<a href="#">Sharxhi and Others</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>	28/05/2018	Demolition of the applicants' flats and business premises in disregard of an interim court order restraining the authorities from taking any action that could breach <b>property rights</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">ARMENIA</a>	<a href="#">Chiragov and Others</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties in the region; <b>lack of effective remedies</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">AZERBAIJAN</a>	<a href="#">Mahmudov and Agazade</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	18/03/2009	<b>Violation of the right to freedom of expression</b> , arbitrary application of the law on defamation.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">AZERBAIJAN</a>	<a href="#">Mammadli</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring or for their active social and political engagement in <b>breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">AZERBAIJAN</a>	<a href="#">Sargsyan</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>	16/06/2015	<b>Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties</b> in the region; <b>lack of effective remedies</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">BELGIUM</a>	<a href="#">Camara</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>	18/10/2023	Structural problem of <b>non-enforcement of judicial decisions ordering the authorities to provide asylum-seekers with material assistance and accommodation</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">BULGARIA</a>	<a href="#">United Macedonian Organisation Ilinden and Others</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	19/04/2006	<b>Unjustified refusals by the courts to register associations</b> aiming at achieving "the recognition of the Macedonian minority in Bulgaria".	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">GEORGIA</a>	<a href="#">A.D. and Others</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>	01/03/2023	Lack of legislation governing procedures for <b>legal gender recognition</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">GEORGIA</a>	<a href="#">Identoba and Others</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	12/08/2015	<b>Lack of protection against homophobic attacks</b> during a demonstration.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">GREECE</a>	<a href="#">Kanellopoulos</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	21/05/2008	<b>Non-compliance with final domestic judgments ordering the lifting of land expropriation orders</b> or charges on land. In some cases, the lack of an effective remedy to ensure the enforcement.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">HUNGARY</a>	<a href="#">Ilias and Ahmed</a> (group) <a href="#">Shahzad</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	21/11/2019 08/10/2021	<b>Authorities' failure to assess the risks of ill-treatment</b> before expelling the applicants, asylum-seekers, to a "safe third country" ( <i>Ilias and Ahmed</i> ); <b>applicant's collective expulsion</b> without identifying him and examining his situation ( <i>Shahzad</i> ).	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">HUNGARY</a>	<a href="#">László Magyar</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	13/10/2014	<b>Life sentence without parole</b> in combination with the lack of an adequate review mechanism of this sentence.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">HUNGARY</a>	<a href="#">Rana</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	16/07/2020	<b>Lack of legislation governing gender reassignment and name-changing procedure</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">IRELAND</a>	<a href="#">McFarlane</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	10/09/2010	<b>Lack of effective remedy for excessive length of judicial proceedings</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">ITALY</a>	<a href="#">Abenavoli</a> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	02/09/2097	<b>Excessive length of proceedings</b> before the administrative courts.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
<a href="#">LITHUANIA</a>	<a href="#">Macatė</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>	23/01/2023	<b>No legitimate aim for temporary suspension of children's fairy tale book depicting same-sex relationships</b> and its subsequent labelling as harmful to children under the age of 14.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>

# COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

Cases examined at 1507<sup>th</sup> meeting (HR) . 17-19 September 2024

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (European Court)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
MALTA	<i>Feilazoo</i> <i>A.D.</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	11/06/2021 17/01/2024	<b>Unlawfulness of the detention pending deportation</b> , in poor conditions, and interference with correspondence between the applicant and the Court.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	<i>T.M. and C.M.</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	28/04/2014	Authorities' failure to provide <b>protection from domestic violence</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
NORTH MACEDONIA	<i>X.</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	17/04/2019	Lack of legislation governing the conditions and procedures for <b>changing on birth certificates the registered sex of transgender persons</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
POLAND	<i>Juszczyszyn</i> <i>Żurek</i> <i>Tuleya</i>	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a>	30/01/2023 10/10/2022 06/10/2023	Various violations in cases concerning <b>the appointment, mandate and/or disciplinary regime for judges in Poland</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
POLAND	<i>Reczkowicz</i> (group) <i>Broda and Bojara</i> <i>Grzęda</i> <i>Wałęsa</i>	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a>	22/11/2021 29/09/2021 15/03/2022 23/02/2024	Tribunal not established by law due to, inter alia, <b>systemic dysfunction in the judicial appointments' procedures</b> . Deficiencies of the system of <b>extraordinary review appeal</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
POLAND	<i>Xero Flor W Polsce sp. z o.o.</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	07/08/2021	Tribunal not established by law due to <b>grave irregularities in the election of one of the Constitutional Court's judges examining the applicant company's constitutional complaint</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
PORTUGAL	<i>Petrescu</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	03/03/2020	<b>Overcrowding and poor conditions of detention</b> in prisons and lack of effective remedies.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
ROMANIA	<i>Bucur and Toma</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	23/08/2017	<b>Conviction of a whistle-blower</b> for having disclosed information on the illegal secret surveillance of citizens by the Intelligence Service; lack of safeguards in the statutory framework governing secret surveillance.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
ROMANIA	<i>Vlad and Others</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	26/02/2014	<b>Excessive length of judicial proceedings</b> and lack of an effective remedy.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
ROMANIA	<i>X. and Y.</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	19/04/2021	<b>Lack of clear and predictable legislation governing gender reassignment</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Georgia (I)</i>	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> (just satisfaction)	03/07/2014 31/01/2019	<b>Various violations related to the arrest, detention and collective expulsion</b> from the Russian Federation of Georgian nationals in 2006-2007.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Georgia (II)</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	21/01/2021	<b>Various violations of the Convention in the context of the armed conflict</b> between Georgia and the Russian Federation in August 2008.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Kogan and Others</i> <i>Kutayev</i>	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a>	07/06/2023 24/04/2023	<b>Cases on violations of Article 18</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Mozer</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	23/02/2016	<b>Various violations relating to the Transnistrian region of the Republic of Moldova</b> .	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights

Cases examined at 1507<sup>th</sup> meeting (HR) . 17-19 September 2024

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (European Court)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
SLOVAK REPUBLIC	<i>R.R. and R.D.</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	01/12/2020	<b>Excessive use of force in a police operation</b> carried out on a street that is home to a Roma community (R.R. and R.D.). <b>Ineffective investigations.</b> <b>Failure to protect the physical well-being of an unaccompanied Roma minor in police custody</b> and effective investigation.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
	<i>P.H.</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	08/12/2022			
SLOVENIA	<i>Pintar and Others</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	14/12/2021	<b>Lack of an effective remedy to challenge or seek compensation for national bank's extraordinary measures</b> , cancelling the applicants' shares and bonds, which were not accompanied by sufficient procedural guarantees against arbitrariness.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
TÜRKIYE	<i>Bati and Others</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	03/09/2004	<b>Ineffectiveness of investigations against law enforcement officers</b> in allegations of torture and ill-treatment and impunity. <b>Ineffectiveness of investigations on account of the administrative authorisation</b> requirement provided under the Law No. 4483.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
	<i>Elvan</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	26/06/2023			
TÜRKIYE	<i>Cyprus v. Turkey</i>	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> (just satisfaction)	10/05/2001 12/05/2014	<b>14 violations in relation to the situation in the northern part of Cyprus</b> (missing persons).	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
TURKEY	<i>Gurban</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	15/03/2016	<b>Absence of any mechanism to review "aggravated" life imprisonment sentence.</b>	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
TÜRKIYE	<i>Selahattin Demirtaş (No. 2)</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	22/12/2020	<b>Unjustified detention</b> of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; <b>unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity</b> and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
TÜRKIYE	<i>Kavala</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	11/05/2020	<b>Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion</b> and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
TÜRKIYE	<i>Xenides-Arestis</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> (just satisfaction)	22/03/2006	<b>Continuous denial of access to property</b> in the northern part of Cyprus (individual measures and just satisfaction).	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
			23/05/2007			
UKRAINE	<i>M.R. and D.R.</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	22/08/2018	<b>Failure to enforce court orders under the Hague Convention.</b>	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
UKRAINE	<i>Shvets</i> (group)	<a href="#">Link</a>	23/07/2019	<b>Failure to enforce court judgments granting access rights to the applicants' children.</b>	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>
UKRAINE	<i>Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov Zhovner</i> (group) <i>Burmych and Others</i>	<a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a> <a href="#">Link</a>	15/01/2010	<b>Non-enforcement of domestic court decisions</b> against the State or state-owned enterprises.	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a> (postponed)
			29/09/2004			
			12/10/2017			
UNITED KINGDOM	<i>V.C.L. and A.N.</i>	<a href="#">Link</a>	05/07/2021	<b>Failure to take adequate operational measures to protect two potential victims of child trafficking from prosecution.</b>	<a href="#">Link</a>	<a href="#">Link</a>