

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1483rd meeting (HR) – 5-7 December 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
ALBANIA	Sharxhi and Others	Link	28/05/2018	Demolition of the applicants' flats and business premises in disregard of an interim court order restraining the authorities from taking any action that could breach property rights .	Link	Link
ARMENIA	Muradyan	Link	24/02/2017	Failure to provide plausible explanation for the injury sustained by the applicant's son (a military conscript based in Nagorno Karabakh) and his ensuing death. Lack of an effective investigation into his death.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Makuchyan and Minasyan	Link	12/10/2020	Failure to continue to enforce prison sentence for ethnic hate crime committed abroad , after transfer to Azerbaijan.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Mammadli (group)	Link	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring or for their active social and political engagement in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5 .	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Muradova (group) Mammadov (Jalaloglu) (group) Mikayil Mammadov (group)	Link Link Link	02/07/2009 11/04/2007 17/03/2010	Excessive use of force by the security forces and lack of effective investigations.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Mushfig Mammadov and Others	Link	17/01/2020	Criminal proceedings against the applicants on account of their refusal to perform military service , resulting from the absence of alternative service system for conscientious objectors.	Link	Link
BELGIUM	Mugemangango (group)	Link	10/07/2020	Lack of adequate and sufficient procedural guarantees as regards post-electoral disputes .	Link	Link
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Sejdić and Finci (group)	Link	22/12/2009	Ethnic-based discrimination on account of the ineligibility of persons not affiliated with one of the "constituent peoples" (Bosniacs, Croats or Serbs) to stand for election to the House of Peoples and the Presidency.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	International Bank for Commerce and Development AD and Others	Link	03/06/2015	Lack of proper access to court concerning the withdrawal of a bank licence and unfairness of the proceedings concerning the banks' insolvency.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	S.Z. (group) Kolevi	Link Link	03/06/2015 05/02/2010	Systemic problem of ineffective criminal investigations in Bulgaria with regard to shortcomings which affect investigations concerning both private individuals and law enforcement agents and lack of guarantees for the independence of criminal investigations against the Chief Prosecutor.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	Velikova (group)	Link	04/10/2000	Excessive use of force by law enforcement agents; ineffective investigations.	Link	Link
CROATIA	Statileo (group)	Link	10/10/2014	Statutory limitations on use of property by landlords , including through the rent control scheme for flats subject to protected leases.	Link	Link
GEORGIA	Identoba and Others (group)	Link	12/08/2015	Lack of protection against homophobic attacks during a demonstration.	Link	Link
GEORGIA	Tkheldize (group)	Link	08/10/2021	Failure to protect from domestic violence and to conduct an effective investigation into police inaction.	Link	Link
GREECE	Bekir-Ousta and Others (group)	Link	11/01/2008	Refusal of domestic courts to register associations .	Link	Link
GREECE	Sidiropoulos and Papakostas (group)	Link	25/04/2018	Use of potentially lethal force and ill-treatment by law enforcement agents and lack of effective investigations.	Link	Link

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1483rd meeting (HR) – 5-7 December 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
HUNGARY	Baka	Link	23/06/2016	Lack of access to a court as regards the premature termination of the applicant's mandate as President of the Supreme Court which also led to a violation of his right to freedom of expression .	Link	Link
ITALY	Cestaro (group)	Link	07/07/2015	Ill-treatment by the police ; inadequate criminal legislation to punish acts of torture and inhuman and degrading treatment.	Link	Link
MALTA	Feilazoo	Link	11/06/2021	Unlawfulness of the detention pending deportation , in poor conditions, and interference with correspondence between the applicant and the Court.	Link	Link
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Cosovan (group)	Link	22/06/2022	Lack of adequate medical care in prison , lack of domestic remedies, and lack of sufficient reasons for prolongation of pre-trial detention.	Link	Link
NETHERLANDS	Corallo	Link	09/10/2018	Poor conditions of detention in Sint Maarten (Caribbean part of the Kingdom of the Netherlands) pending extradition proceedings	Link	Link
NORTH MACEDONIA	X.	Link	17/04/2019	Lack of legislation governing the conditions and procedures for changing on birth certificates the registered sex of transgender persons .	Link	Link
NORWAY	Strand Lobben and Others (group)	Link	05/09/2019	Various shortcomings in the decision-making processes in child welfare proceedings .	Link	Link
POLAND	Juszczyszyn	Link	30/01/2023	Unforeseeable suspension of a judge , by a tribunal not established by law, predominantly aiming to sanction and dissuade him from verifying the lawfulness of appointment of judges upon recommendation of the reformed National Council of the Judiciary (NCJ) (Juszczyszyn) and application of a set of measures against a former judicial member of the NCJ in connection with his views in defence of judicial independence (Żurek).	Link	Link
POLAND	Żurek	Link	10/10/2022		Link	
POLAND	Reczkowicz (group)	Link	22/11/2021	Tribunal not established by law due to, <i>inter alia</i> , systemic dysfunction in the judicial appointments' procedures (Reczkowicz group) and lack of access to court regarding the termination of the applicants' terms of office (Broda and Bojara , Grzęda).	Link	Link
POLAND	Broda and Bojara	Link	29/09/2021		Link	
POLAND	Grzęda	Link	15/03/2022		Link	
POLAND	XERO FLOR w POLSCE sp. z o.o.	Link	07/08/2021	Insufficient reasons of courts for refusal to refer a legal question to the Constitutional Court . Tribunal not established by law due to grave irregularities in the election of one of the Constitutional Court's judges examining the applicant company's constitutional complaint.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	Association "21 Decembre 1989" (group)	Link	28/11/2011	Ineffectiveness of criminal investigations into violent crackdowns on anti-governmental demonstrations in 1989 and the early 1990s.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	E.B.	Link	19/03/2019	Breaches of the State's positive obligation effectively to apply a criminal-law system punishing any non-consensual sexual acts , in particular when the victims are children and persons with psychosocial disabilities.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	M.G.C. (group)	Link	15/06/2016		Link	
ROMANIA	Săcăleanu (group)	Link	06/12/2005	Failure or substantial delay in the enforcement of final domestic judicial decisions against the State and State-owned enterprises.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Alekseyev (group)	Link	11/04/2011	Discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation in the exercise of the right to freedom of peaceful assembly (Alekseyev , Bayev and Others , Berkman group).	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Bayev and Others (group)	Link	13/11/2017		Link	
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Berkman (group)	Link	01/03/2021	Refusal to register LGBT associations (Zdganov and Others).	Link	
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Zhdanov and Others	Link	16/10/2019		Link	
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Georgia (I)	Link (just satisfaction)	03/07/2014 31/01/2019	Various violations related to the arrest, detention and collective expulsion from the Russian Federation of Georgian nationals in 2006-2007.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Georgia (II)	Link	21/01/2021	Various violations of the Convention in the context of the armed conflict between Georgia and the Russian Federation in August 2008.	Link	Link

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1483rd meeting (HR) – 5-7 December 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Magnitskiy and Others</i> <i>Mazepa and Others</i> (group)	Link Link	27/11/2019 17/10/2018	High-profile murder cases and lack of effective investigation.	Link Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Navalnyy and Ofitserov</i> (group)	Link	04/07/2016	Criminal conviction based on an unfair trial and an arbitrary application of criminal law.	Link	Link
SERBIA	<i>R. Kačapor and Others</i> (group)	Link	07/07/2008	Non-enforcement of final court and administrative decisions , including against “socially-owned” companies.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Selahattin Demirtaş (No 2)</i> (group)	Link	22/12/2020	Unjustified detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Kavala</i>	Link	11/05/2020	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Opuz</i> (group)	Link	09/09/2009	Failure to take protective measures and to apply appropriate sanctions , giving impunity to perpetrators of domestic violence and violence against women.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Ahmet Yildirim</i> (group)	Link	18/03/2013	Restriction of access to the internet and wholesale blocking of internet sites .	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Polyakh and Others</i>	Link	24/02/2020	Dismissal of civil servants under lustration law .	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Kaverzin</i> <i>Afanasyev</i> (group) <i>Belousov</i>	Link Link Link	15/08/2012 05/07/2005 07/02/2014	Ill-treatment / torture by police and lack of effective investigation.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Fedorchenko and Lozenko</i> (group)	Link	20/12/2012	Failure to carry out an effective investigation into violent acts against persons of Roma origin and to investigate possible racist motives.	Link	Link
UNITED KINGDOM	<i>Gaughran</i> (group)	Link	13/06/2020	Disproportionate interference with right to respect for private life due to the indefinite retention of DNA profile, fingerprints and photograph of person convicted of minor offence , in the absence of any real review.	Link	Link