

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1475th meeting (HR) – 19-21 September 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
ALBANIA	Strazimiri	Link	21/05/2020	Inhuman and degrading treatment of a person suffering from mental health problems due to poor living conditions and failure to ensure adequate therapy, unlawful detention in an inadequate (penitentiary) institution without proper psychiatric treatment, failure to examine speedily proceedings concerning the applicant's detention, absence of right to compensation for unlawful detention	Link	Decision
ARMENIA	Chiragov and Others	Link	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies.	Link	Decision
ARMENIA	Mushegh Saghatelyan (group)	Link	20/12/2018	Ill-treatment by the police and absence of any official investigation; unlawful arrest and detention; disproportionate and unnecessary dispersal of protests.	Link	Decision
AZERBAIJAN	Khadija Ismayilova (group)	Link	10/04/2019	Violations of the applicant's right to privacy and freedom of expression in connection with her work as a journalist.	Link	Decision
AZERBAIJAN	Mahmudov and Agazade (group)	Link	18/03/2009	Violation of the right to freedom of expression, arbitrary application of the law on defamation.	Link	Decision
AZERBAIJAN	Mammadli (group)	Link	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring or for their active social and political engagement in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5.	Link	Decision
AZERBAIJAN	Sargsyan	Link	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies.	Link	Decision
BELGIUM	L.B. (group) W.D. (pilot judgment)	Link Link	02/01/2013 06/12/2016	Structural problem concerning the care of persons with mental health problems detained in prison.	Link	Decision
BELGIUM	Vasilescu (group)	Link	20/04/2015	Structural problem concerning prison overcrowding, material conditions of detention and lack of effective remedies.	Link	Decision
BULGARIA	Association for European Integration and Human Rights and Ekimdzhiev (group)	Link	30/01/2008	Lack of sufficient guarantees against the risk of abuse in the operation of the secret surveillance system.	Link	Decision
BULGARIA	United Macedonian Organisation Ilinden and Others (group)	Link	19/04/2006	Unjustified refusals by the courts to register associations aiming at achieving "the recognition of the Macedonian minority in Bulgaria".	Link	Decision
BULGARIA	S.Z. (group) Kolevi	Link Link	03/06/2015 05/02/2010	Systemic problem of ineffective criminal investigations in Bulgaria with regard to shortcomings which affect investigations concerning both private individuals and law enforcement agents and lack of guarantees for the independence of criminal investigations against the Chief Prosecutor.	Link	Decision
BULGARIA	Y.T. (group)	Link	09/10/2020	Unjustified refusals by the courts to the applicants' applications for gender reassignment.	Link	Decision
CROATIA	M.H. and Others	Link	04/04/2022	Lack of effective investigation into the death of the applicants' daughter at the Croatian border; inadequate conditions of detention of migrant children; lack of administrative and court diligence and expedition concerning asylum seeking applicants' detention and asylum proceedings; collective expulsion; violation of the right of individual application.	Link	Decision
GREECE	M.S.S. (group) Rahimi (group)	Link Link	21/01/2011 05/07/2011	Conditions of detention of asylum seekers and irregular migrants (including minors) and lack of an effective remedy to challenge conditions of detention; living conditions of asylum seekers; ineffective remedies against expulsion due to shortcomings in asylum procedure.	Link Link	Decision
HUNGARY	Ilias and Ahmed (group)	Link	21/11/2019	Authorities' failure to assess the risks of ill-treatment before expelling the applicants, asylum-seekers, to a "safe third country".	Link	Decision

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1475th meeting (HR) – 19-21 September 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
HUNGARY	László Magyar (group)	Link	13/10/2014	Life sentence without parole in combination with the lack of an adequate review mechanism of this sentence.	Link	Decision
IRELAND	McFarlane (group)	Link	10/09/2010	Lack of effective remedy for excessive length of judicial proceedings.	Link	Decision
ITALY	Talpis (group) J.L. M.S.	Link Link Link	18/09/2017 27/08/2021 07/10/2022	Failure to comply with the positive obligation to properly assess the risk to life in domestic violence cases and to secure a timely and adequate response. Sexism in the perception of the phenomenon of violence against women, including in court decisions, leading to secondary victimisation. Impunity for domestic violence acts due to a combination of judicial passivity and intervening changes to the prescription regime.	Link	Decision
LITHUANIA	Abu Zubaydah	Link	08/10/2018	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicant, who has been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base without charge and without any safeguards against arbitrary detention.	Link	Decision
LITHUANIA	L.	Link	31/03/2008	Lack of legislation governing the conditions and procedures relating to gender reassignment.	Link	Decision
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Levinta (group)	Link	16/03/2009	Ill-treatment and torture in police custody ; ineffective investigations; lack of an effective remedy; conviction based on evidence obtained under torture.	Link	Decision
POLAND	Al Nashiri (group)	Link	16/02/2015	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicants, who have been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base. Mr Al Nashiri remains there at risk in particular of the death penalty in the proceedings before a United States military commission and Mr Abu Zubaydah is being detained without charge and without any safeguards against arbitrary detention.	Link	Decision
POLAND	Bqk Majewski (group) Rutkowski and Others Jan Zaluska, Marianna Rogalska and 398 other applications	Link	16/04/2007 11/01/2006 07/10/2015 20/06/2017	Excessive length of civil and criminal proceedings and problems in the functioning of the domestic remedy.	Link	Decision
PORTUGAL	Petrescu (group)	Link	03/03/2020	Overcrowding and poor conditions of detention in prisons and lack of effective remedies.	Link	Decision
ROMANIA	Al Nashiri	Link	08/10/2018	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicant, who has been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base, where he remains at a risk in particular of the death penalty in a trial before a United States military commission.	Link	Decision
ROMANIA	Bucur and Toma	Link	23/08/2017	Conviction of a whistle-blower for having disclosed information on the illegal secret surveillance of citizens by the Intelligence Service; lack of safeguards in the statutory framework governing secret surveillance.	Link	Decision
ROMANIA	Cegolea	Link	24/07/2020	Discrimination related to the right to stand in parliamentary election and lack of judicial review regarding the fulfilment of an eligibility requirement that disadvantages national minority organisations not yet represented in Parliament	Link	Decision
ROMANIA	Nedescu	Link	16/04/2018	Impossibility for the applicants to recover frozen embryos seized in the context of criminal proceedings against a third party in the absence of clear provisions on the procedure to be followed.	Link	Decision
ROMANIA	S.C. Polyinvest S.R.L. and Others and Omegatech Enterprises Ltd.	Link	29/03/2018	Non-implementation of arbitral awards or final domestic court decisions ordering State-controlled companies to pay various sums to the applicant companies.	Link	Decision
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Catan and Others (group)	Link	19/10/2012	Violation of the right to education of children and parents using Latin-script schools in the Transdnistrian region of the Republic of Moldova.	Link	Decision
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Dmitriyevskiy (group)	Link	29/01/2018	Unjustified prosecution for alleged hate speech and/or extremism.	Link	Decision

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1475th meeting (HR) – 19-21 September 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Taganrog Lro and Others</i> (group)	Link	07/09/2022	Violation of various rights of the Jehovah's Witnesses.	Link	Decision
SERBIA	<i>Jevremović</i> (group)	Link	17/10/2007	Excessive length of judicial proceedings and lack of an effective remedy.	Link	Decision
TÜRKIYE	<i>Alparslan Altan</i> (group) <i>Akgün</i>	Link Link	09/09/2019 22/11/2021	Unjustified detention of the applicants without reasonable suspicion and, in the <i>Alparslan Altan</i> group through extensive interpretation of the concept of in flagrante delicto.	Link Link	Decision
TÜRKIYE	<i>Bati and Others</i> (group)	Link	03/09/2004	Ill-treatment by the police and the gendarmerie ; actions of security forces during military and police operations; ineffective investigations.	Link	Decision
TÜRKIYE	<i>Cyprus v. Turkey</i>	Link Link (just satisfaction)	10/05/2001 12/05/2014	14 violations in relation to the situation in the northern part of Cyprus.	Link	No decision adopted
TÜRKIYE	<i>Selahattin Demirtaş (No 2)</i> (group)	Link	22/12/2020	Unjustified detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech.	Link	Decision
TÜRKIYE	<i>Joannou</i>	Link	12/03/2018	Lack of coherent and diligent examination of the applicant's claim as regards properties situated in the northern part of Cyprus.	Link	Decision
TÜRKIYE	<i>Kavala</i>	Link	11/05/2020	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence.	Link	Decision
TÜRKIYE	<i>Xenides-Arestis</i> (group)	Link Link (just satisfaction)	22/03/2006 23/05/2007	Continuous denial of access to property in the northern part of Cyprus (individual measures and just satisfaction).	Link	Decision
UKRAINE	<i>Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov Zhovner</i> (group) <i>Burmych and Others</i>	Link Link Link	15/01/2010 29/09/2004 12/10/2017	Non-enforcement of domestic court decisions against the State or state-owned enterprises.	Link	Decision
UKRAINE	<i>Sukachov</i> <i>Nevmerzhitsky</i> (group) <i>Yakovenko</i> (group) <i>Melnik</i> (group)	Link Link Link Link	30/05/2020 12/10/2005 25/01/2008 28/06/2006	Poor conditions of detention and lack of adequate medical treatment.	Link	Decision
UKRAINE	<i>Yukhymovych</i>	Link	17/03/2021	Killing during a police operation and lack of an effective investigation.	Link	Decision
UNITED KINGDOM	<i>McKerr</i> (group)	Link	04/05/2001	Actions of security forces in Northern Ireland in the 1980s and 1990s; failure to conduct Article 2-compliant investigations.	Link	Decision