

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1468th meeting (HR) – 5-7 June 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
ARMENIA	Oganezova	Link	17/08/2022	Lack of protection against homophobic attacks and hate speech ; failure to carry out effective investigation; absence of effective domestic criminal-law mechanism for investigating discrimination complaints.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Makuchyan and Minasyan	Link	12/10/2020	Failure to continue to enforce prison sentence for ethnic hate crime committed abroad , after transfer to Azerbaijan.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Mammadli (group)	Link	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring or for their active social and political engagement in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5 .	Link	Link
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Sejdić and Finci (group)	Link	22/12/2009	Ethnic-based discrimination on account of the ineligibility of persons not affiliated with one of the "constituent peoples" (Bosniacs, Croats or Serbs) to stand for election to the House of Peoples and the Presidency.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	Bulgarian Orthodox old calendar church and Others (group)	Link	20/04/2021	Unjustified refusals to register religious organisations.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	Lyubomir Popov (group) Sivova and Koleva (group) Mutishev and Others Tomov and Nikolova	Link Link Link Link	07/04/2010 04/06/2012 03/03/2010 21/10/2016	Unjustified delays in complying with judgments and administrative decisions concerning the restitution of agricultural land nationalised during the communist period or providing compensation thereof. Deprivation of property in breach of the principle of legal certainty and without any compensation , on the basis of restitution legislation.	Link Link Link Link	Link
BULGARIA	Miroslava Todorova	Link	19/01/2022	Disciplinary proceedings and sanctions against the President of the judges' association in retaliation against her criticism of the Supreme Judicial Council and the executive.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	S.Z. (group) Kolevi	Link Link	03/06/2015 05/02/2010	Systemic problem of ineffective criminal investigations in Bulgaria with regard to shortcomings which affect investigations concerning both private individuals and law enforcement agents and lack of guarantees for the independence of criminal investigations against the Chief Prosecutor.	Link	Link
CROATIA	Statileo (group)	Link	10/10/2014	Statutory limitations on use of property by landlords , including through the rent control scheme for flats subject to protected leases.	Link	Link
FRANCE	Moustahi	Link	25/09/2020	Detention and rapid return of two foreign unaccompanied minors from Mayotte to the Comoros, without an examination of their individual situation.	Link	Link
GEORGIA	Tsintsabadze (group)	Link	18/03/2011	Lack of effective investigations into allegations of ill-treatment or violations of the right to life ; excessive use of force by the police in the course of arrest and/or while detaining suspects.	Link	Link
GREECE	Bekir-Ousta and Others (group)	Link	11/01/2008	Refusal of domestic courts to register associations.	Link	Link
HUNGARY	Gazsó (group)	Link	16/10/2015	Excessive length of judicial proceedings and lack of an effective remedy in this respect.	Link	Link
ITALY	Sy Citraro and Molino	Link Link	11791/20 50988/13	Detention in ordinary prison of persons mentally ill (Sy) and failure to protect their right to life (Citraro and Molino).	Link Link	Link
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Sarban (group)	Link	04/01/2006	Various violations mainly arising from pre-trial detention.	Link	Link
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	T.M. and C.M.	Link	28/04/2014	Authorities' failure to provide protection from domestic violence.	Link	Link
NORTH MACEDONIA	Kitanovski	Link	22/04/2015	Ill-treatment by the police and ineffective investigations.	Link	Link

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1468th meeting (HR) – 5-7 June 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
POLAND	Reczkowicz group	Link	22/11/2021	Tribunal not established by law due to, <i>inter alia</i> , systemic dysfunction in the judicial appointments' procedures (<i>Reczkowicz group</i>) and lack of access to court regarding the termination of the applicants' terms of office (<i>Broda and Bojara, Grzęda</i>).	Link	
	Broda and Bojara	Link	29/09/2021		Link	Link
	Grzęda	Link	15/03/2022		Link	
POLAND	Tysiąc	Link	24/09/2007	Absence of an adequate legal framework for the exercise of the right to therapeutic abortion in the event of disagreement between the patient and the specialist doctor (<i>Tysiac</i>) and lack of access to prenatal test enabling to take an informed decision on whether to seek an abortion (<i>R.R.</i>). Failure to provide effective access to reliable information on the conditions and procedures to be followed to access lawful abortion (<i>P. and S.</i>).	Link	
	R.R.	Link	28/11/2011		Link	Link
	P. and S.	Link	30/01/2013		Link	
POLAND	XERO FLOR w POLSCE sp. z o.o.	Link	07/08/2021	Insufficient reasons of courts for refusal to refer a legal question to the Constitutional Court. Tribunal not established by law due to grave irregularities in the election of one of the Constitutional Court's judges examining the applicant company's constitutional complaint.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	Rezmiveş and Others	Link	25/07/2017	Overcrowding and poor conditions of detention in prisons and police detention facilities; lack of an effective remedy in that regard; inadequacy of medical care and several other dysfunctions regarding the protection of prisoners' rights.	Link	Link
	Bragadireanu (group)	Link	06/03/2008		Link	Link
ROMANIA	Centre for legal resources on behalf of Valentin Câmpeanu	Link	17/07/2014	Deficiencies in the legal protection and medical and social care afforded to vulnerable persons.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	Parascineti	Link	13/06/2012	Overcrowding and inadequate living conditions, treatment and care afforded to patients in psychiatric establishments; unlawful or arbitrary involuntary psychiatric placements and insufficient safeguards against such deprivations of liberty; systematic failure to seek consent to psychiatric treatment and absence of minimum legal safeguards attending the forcible administration of psychiatric treatment to involuntary patients	Link	
	Cristian Teodorescu (group)	Link	19/09/2012		Link	
	N.	Link	28/02/2018		Link	Link
	R.D. and I.M.D.	Link	12/10/2021		Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Catan and Others (group)	Link	19/10/2012	Violation of the right to education of children and parents using Latin-script schools in the Transdnistrian region of the Republic of Moldova.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Finogenov and Others (group)	Link	04/06/2012	Inadequate preparation of hostage-rescue operations resulting in loss of life and injuries and lack of effective investigations.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Georgia (I)	Link Link (just satisfaction)	03/07/2014 31/01/2019	Various violations related to the arrest, detention and collective expulsion from the Russian Federation of Georgian nationals in 2006-2007.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Georgia (II)	Link	21/01/2021	Various violations of the Convention in the context of the armed conflict between Georgia and the Russian Federation in August 2008.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Mozer (group)	Link	23/02/2016	Various violations relating to the Transnistrian region of the Republic of Moldova.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Navalnyy and Ofitserov (group)	Link	04/07/2016 05/03/2018	Criminal conviction based on an unfair trial and an arbitrary application of criminal law.	Link Link	Link
SLOVENIA	Pintar and Others	Link	14/12/2021	Lack of an effective remedy to challenge or seek compensation for national bank's extraordinary measures, cancelling the applicants' shares and bonds, which were not accompanied by sufficient procedural guarantees against arbitrariness.	Link	Link

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1468th meeting (HR) – 5-7 June 2023

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
TÜRKIYE	<i>Cumhuriyetçi Eğitim Ve Kültür Merkezi Vakfı</i> (group) <i>İzzettin Doğan and Others</i> <i>Zengin Hasan and Eylem</i> (group)	Link Link Link	20/04/2015 20/09/2017 19/05/2019 09/01/2008	Structural and administrative problems leading to various differences in treatment between followers of the Alevi faith and adherents of the majority branch of Islam , including compulsory religious education classes.	Link Link Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Selahattin Demirtaş (No 2)</i> (group)	Link	22/12/2020	Unjustified detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Isaak</i> (group) <i>Kakoulli</i> (group)	Link Link	24/09/2008 22/02/2006	Deaths of the applicants' relatives or life-threatening injury of an applicant along the cease-fire line in Cyprus; lack of effective investigation thereof .	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Kavala</i>	Link	11/05/2020	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	<i>Ülke</i> (group)	Link	24/04/2006	Repetitive convictions and prosecutions for having refused to carry out compulsory military service on account of their religious beliefs or convictions as pacifists and conscientious objectors.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Merit</i> (group) <i>Svetlana Naumenko</i> (group)	Link Link	30/03/2005 30/06/2004	Excessive length of criminal and civil proceedings and lack of effective remedy.	Link Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Oleksandr Volkov</i> (group)	Link	27/05/2013	Various violations related to the independence and impartiality of the judiciary ; unfair disciplinary proceedings brought against a judge.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Shvydka</i>	Link	30/01/2015	Non-suspensive effect of appeals against administrative offences (detention served before appeal heard); disproportionate sanction (detention) for act of freedom of expression.	Link	Link
UNITED KINGDOM	<i>V.C.L. and A.N.</i>	Link	05/07/2021	Failure to take adequate operational measures to protect two potential victims of child trafficking from prosecution .	Link	Link
UNITED KINGDOM	<i>McKerr</i> (group)	Link	04/05/2001	Actions of security forces in Northern Ireland in the 1980s and 1990s; failure to conduct Article 2-compliant investigations.	Link	Link