

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1451st meeting (HR) – 6-8 December 2022

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
ALBANIA	Luli and Others (group)	Link	01/07/2014	Excessive length of civil and criminal proceedings and absence of a remedy in that respect.	Link	Link
ARMENIA	Chiragov and Others	Link	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies .	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Khadija Ismayilova (group)	Link	10/04/2019	Violations of the applicant's right to privacy and freedom of expression in connection with her work as a journalist.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Mammadli (group)	Link	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring or for their active social and political engagement in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5 .	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Namazov (group)	Link	30/05/2020	Lack of procedural safeguards in disciplinary proceedings , having led to the applicants' disbarment for breach of professional ethics following verbal altercations with a judge.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Sargsyan	Link	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access in 1992 to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies .	Link	Link
BULGARIA	Association for European Integration and Human Rights and Ekimdzhiev (group)	Link	30/01/2008	Lack of sufficient guarantees against the risk of abuse in the operation of the secret surveillance system .	Link	Link
BULGARIA	United Macedonian Organisation Ilinden and Others (group)	Link	19/04/2006	Unjustified refusals by the courts to register associations aiming at achieving "the recognition of the Macedonian minority in Bulgaria".	Link	Link
BULGARIA	S.Z. (group) Kolevi	Link Link	03/06/2015 05/02/2010	Systemic problem of ineffective criminal investigations in Bulgaria with regard to shortcomings which affect investigations concerning both private individuals and law enforcement agents and lack of guarantees for the independence of criminal investigations against the Chief Prosecutor.	Link	Link
CYPRUS	Khani Kabbara (group)	Link	05/09/2018	Ill-treatment by police officers and lack of effective investigation.	Link	Link
FRANCE	J.M.B. and Others	Link	30/05/2020	Poor conditions of detention (overcrowding) and lack of an effective preventive remedy.	Link	Link
FRANCE	Khan	Link	28/05/2019	Lack of care and protection of an unaccompanied foreign minor given his living conditions in the Calais "lande" and the non-enforcement of the order of the juvenile judge aimed at protecting him.	Link	Link
GEORGIA	Identoba and Others (group)	Link	12/08/2015	Lack of protection against homophobic attacks during a demonstration.	Link	Link
GEORGIA	Tkhelidze (group)	Link	08/10/2021	Failure to protect from domestic violence and to conduct an effective investigation into police inaction.	Link	Link
GREECE	Bekir-Ousta and Others (group)	Link	11/01/2008	Refusal of domestic courts to register associations .	Link	Link
HUNGARY	Gubacsi (group)	Link	28/09/2011	Inhuman and degrading treatment by law enforcement officers and/or the lack of adequate investigations in this respect.	Link	Link
HUNGARY	Tonello (Shaw group)	Link	24/04/2018	Authorities' failure to enforce court decisions ordering return to applicant of his daughter abducted by the mother.	Link	Link

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1451st meeting (HR) – 6-8 December 2022

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
ITALY	<i>Olivieri and Others</i> (group)	Link	04/07/2016	Issues raised by the 2012 reform of the “Pinto” Act; ineffectiveness of this remedy concerning the excessive length of administrative proceedings ; impossibility to complain about the excessive length of preliminary investigations in criminal proceedings.	Link	Link
LITHUANIA	<i>Abu Zubaydah</i>	Link	08/10/2018	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicant, who has been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base without charge and without any safeguards against arbitrary detention.	Link	Link
MALTA	<i>Apap Bologna</i> (group)	Link	30/11/2016	Disproportionate restrictions to property rights due to the requisition and imposition of a landlord-tenant relationship on the landlord ; lack of effective remedy.	Link	Link
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	<i>Ozdil and Others</i>	Link	11/09/2019	Extra-legal transfer of persons to Türkiye , circumventing domestic and international law.	Link	Link
NORTH MACEDONIA	X.	Link	17/04/2019	Lack of legislation governing the conditions and procedures for changing on birth certificates the registered sex of transgender persons .	Link	Link
POLAND	<i>Al Nashiri</i> (group)	Link	16/02/2015	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicants, who have been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base. Mr Al Nashiri remains there at risk in particular of the death penalty in the proceedings before a United States military commission and Mr Abu Zubaydah is being detained without charge and without any safeguards against arbitrary detention.	Link	Link
POLAND	<i>XERO FLOR w POLSCE sp. z o.o.</i>	Link	07/08/2021	Insufficient reasons of courts for refusal to refer a legal question to the Constitutional Court . Tribunal not established by law due to grave irregularities in the election of one of the Constitutional Court's judges examining the applicant company's constitutional complaint.	Link	Link
POLAND	<i>Reczkowicz group</i>	Link	22/11/2021	Tribunal not established by law due, inter alia, to the fact that Supreme Court judges were appointed in a deficient procedure involving the National Council of the Judiciary, a body which since 2018 offered no sufficient guarantees of independence; violation of the right to access to court on account of the absence of judicial examination of the premature termination of the applicants' term of office as vice-presidents of a regional court.	Link	Link
	<i>Broda and Bojara</i>	Link	29/09/2021			
ROMANIA	<i>Al Nashiri</i>	Link	08/10/2018	Various violations related to the secret detention and "extraordinary rendition" of the applicant, who has been since detained at the US Internment Facility at the Guantánamo Bay Naval Base, where he remains at a risk in particular of the death penalty in a trial before a United States military commission.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	<i>Association "21 Decembre 1989"</i> (group)	Link	28/11/2011	Ineffectiveness of criminal investigations into violent crackdowns on anti-governmental demonstrations in 1989 and the early 1990s.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	<i>Loiry</i>	Link	17/05/2022	Authorities' failure to enforce a final court decision ordering the return of the applicant's children to their habitual residence.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	<i>Bucur and Toma</i>	Link	23/08/2017	Conviction of a whistle-blower for having disclosed information on the illegal secret surveillance of citizens by the Intelligence Service; lack of safeguards in the statutory framework governing secret surveillance.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	<i>S.C. Polyinvest S.R.L. and Others</i>	Link	29/03/2018	Non-implementation of arbitral awards or final domestic court decisions ordering State-controlled companies to pay various sums to the applicant companies.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Catan and Others</i> (group)	Link	19/10/2012	Violation of the right to education of children and parents using Latin-script schools in the Transdniestrian region of the Republic of Moldova.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Georgia (I)</i>	Link Link (just satisfaction)	03/07/2014 31/01/2019	Various violations related to the arrest, detention and collective expulsion from the Russian Federation of Georgian nationals in 2006-2007.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Georgia (II)</i>	Link	21/01/2021	Various violations of the Convention in the context of the armed conflict between Georgia and the Russian Federation in August 2008.	Link	Link

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1451st meeting (HR) – 6-8 December 2022

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Jehovah's Witnesses of Moscow and Others Krupko and Others	Link Link	22/11/2010 17/11/2014	Dissolution of the applicant religious community and banning of its activity , resulting in individuals' inability to manifest their religion and to carry out activities indispensable for their religious practice. Refusal to re-register the religious organisation and dispersal of a peaceful religious ceremony in which Jehovah's Witnesses of various congregations participated.	Link Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Mozer (group)	Link	23/02/2016	Various violations relating to the Transnistrian region of the Republic of Moldova.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Navalnyy and Ofitserov Navalnyye	Link	04/07/2016 05/03/2018	Criminal conviction based on an unfair trial and an arbitrary application of criminal law.	Link Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Volodina (group)	Link	04/11/2019	Failure to protect from domestic violence and to conduct an effective investigation.	Link	Link
SERBIA	R. Kačapor and Others (group)	Link	07/07/2008	Non-enforcement of final court and administrative decisions , including against "socially-owned" companies.	Link	Link
SERBIA	Stanimirović (group)	Link	30/03/2012	Inhuman and degrading treatment by law enforcement officers and/or the lack of effective investigations in this respect.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	Selahattin Demirtaş (No 2) (group)	Link	22/12/2020	Unjustified detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	Kavala	Link	11/05/2020	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence.	Link	Link
TÜRKIYE	Opuz (group)	Link	09/09/2009	Failure to take protective measures and to apply appropriate sanctions , giving impunity to perpetrators of domestic violence and violence against women.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	Levchuk (group)	Link	03/12/2020	Failure to ensure the applicant's protection from domestic violence.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	Zelenchuk and Tsytsyura (group)	Link	22/08/2018	Indefinite blanket ban on alienation of agricultural land.	Link	Link
UNITED KINGDOM	Gaughran (group)	Link	13/06/2020	Disproportionate interference with right to respect for private life due to the indefinite retention of DNA profile, fingerprints and photograph of person convicted of minor offence , in the absence of any real review.	Link	Link
UNITED KINGDOM	McKerr (group)	Link	04/05/2001	Actions of security forces in Northern Ireland in the 1980s and 1990s; failure to conduct Article 2-compliant investigations.	Link	Link