

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1419th meeting (HR) – [30 Nov. – 2 Dec. 2021]

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
ARMENIA	Mushegh Saghatelian (group)	Link	20/12/2018	Ill-treatment by the police and absence of any official investigation; unlawful arrest and detention ; disproportionate and unnecessary dispersal of protests.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Gafgaz Mammadov	Link	14/03/2016	Dispersals and arrests of demonstrators.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Mahmudov and Agazade (group)	Link	18/03/2009	Violation of the right to freedom of expression , arbitrary application of the law on defamation.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Mammadli (group)	Link	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring (Mammadli) or for their active social and political engagement (Rashad Hasanov and Others) in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5.	Link	Link
AZERBAIJAN	Muradova (group) Mammadov (Jalaloglu) (group) Mikayil Mammadov (group)	Link Link Link	02/07/2009 11/04/2007 17/03/2010	Excessive use of force by the security forces and lack of effective investigations.	Link	Link
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Đokić Mago and Others	Link Link	04/10/2010 24/09/2012	Inability of members of the former Yugoslav People's Army to repossess their pre-war apartments in the aftermath of the war in Bosnia and Herzegovina.	Link Link	Link
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Sejdić and Finci (group)	Link	22/12/2009	Ethnic-based discrimination on account of the ineligibility of persons not affiliated with one of the "constituent peoples" (Bosniaks, Croats or Serbs) to stand for election to the House of Peoples and the Presidency.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	S.Z. Kolevi	Link Link	03/06/2015 05/02/2010	Systemic problem of ineffective criminal investigations in Bulgaria with regard to shortcomings which affect investigations concerning both private individuals and law enforcement agents and lack of guarantees for the independence of criminal investigations against the Chief Prosecutor.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	Velikova (group)	Link	04/10/2000	Excessive use of force by law enforcement agents; ineffective investigations.	Link	Link
BULGARIA	Yordanova and Others (group)	Link	24/09/2012	Eviction of persons of Roma¹ origin or planned demolition of the house of other persons on the basis of legislation not requiring a adequate examination of the proportionality of the measure.	Link	Link
CROATIA	Statileo (group)	Link	10/10/2014	Statutory limitations on use of property by landlords , including through the rent control scheme for flats subject to protected leases.	Link	Link
FINLAND	X.	Link	19/11/2012	Extensions of a confinement in mental hospital and forcible administration of medication without adequate legal safeguards.	Link	Link
FRANCE	Khan	Link	28/05/2019	Lack of care and protection of an unaccompanied foreign minor given his living conditions in the Calais "lande" and the non-enforcement of the order of the juvenile judge aimed at protecting him.	Link	Link
GEORGIA	Identoba and Others (group)	Link	12/08/2015	Lack of protection against homophobic attacks during a demonstration.	Link	Link
HUNGARY	Gazsó (group)	Link	16/10/2015	Excessive length of judicial proceedings and lack of an effective remedy in this respect.	Link	Link

¹ The term "Roma and Travellers" is used at the Council of Europe to encompass the wide diversity of the groups covered by the work of the Council of Europe in this field: on the one hand a) Roma, Sinti/Manush, Calé, Kaale, Romanichals, Boyash/Rudari; b) Balkan Egyptians (Egyptians and Ashkali); c) Eastern groups (Dom, Lom and Abdal); and, on the other hand, groups such as Travellers, Yenish, and the populations designated under the administrative term "Gens du voyage", as well as persons who identify themselves as Gypsies. The present is an explanatory footnote, not a definition of Roma and/or Travellers.

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1419th meeting (HR) – [30 Nov. – 2 Dec. 2021]

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
HUNGARY	Gubacsi (group)	Link	28/09/2011	Inhuman and degrading treatment by law enforcement officers and/or the lack of a dequate investigations in this respect.	Link	Link
HUNGARY	Ilias and Ahmed	Link	21/11/2019	Authorities' failure to assess the risks of ill-treatment before expelling the applicants, asylum-seekers, to a "safe third country".	Link	Link
HUNGARY	Tonello	Link	24/04/2018	Authorities' failure to enforce court decisions ordering return to applicant of his daughter abducted by the mother.	Link	Link
ITALY	Khlaifia and Others	Link	15/12/2016	Absence of clear and accessible legal basis for the detention of irregular migrants arrived on the Italian coasts in 2011 as part of the events related to the "Arab Spring" in Tunisia; lack of domestic judicial review of the lawfulness of the detention and of the conditions of reception.	Link	Link
ITALY	Trapani (group)	Link	12/01/2001	Excessive length of civil proceedings.	Link	Link
LITHUANIA	Beizara and Levickas	Link	14/05/2020	Refusal to open a pre-trial investigation into extreme homophobic online hate speech and lack of an effective remedy.	Link	Link
NORTH MACEDONIA	X.	Link	17/04/2019	Lack of legislation governing the conditions and procedures for changing on birth certificates the registered sex of transgender persons.	Link	Link
POLAND	Tysiac R.R. P. and S.	Link Link Link	24/09/2007 28/11/2011 30/01/2013	Absence of an adequate legal framework for the exercise of the right to therapeutic abortion in the event of disagreement between the patient and the specialist doctor (Tysiac) and lack of access to prenatal test enabling to take an informed decision on whether to seek an abortion (R.R.). Failure to provide effective access to reliable information on the conditions and procedures to be followed to access lawful abortion (P. and S.).	Link Link Link	Link
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Ozdil and Others	Link	11/09/2019	Extra-legal transfer of persons to Turkey , circumventing domestic and international law.	Link	Link
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Sarban (group)	Link	04/01/2006	Various violations mainly arising from pre-trial detention.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	Bucur and Toma	Link	23/08/2017	Conviction of a whistle-blower for having disclosed information on the illegal secret surveillance of citizens by the Intelligence Service; lack of safeguards in the statutory framework governing secret surveillance.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	M.C and A.C.	Link	12/07/2016	Lack of an effective investigation into ill-treatment by private parties including into possible homophobic motives behind the attack.	Link	Link
ROMANIA	S.C. Polyinvest S.R.L. and Others	Link	29/03/2018	Non-implementation of arbitral awards or final domestic court decisions ordering State-controlled companies to pay various sums to the applicant companies.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Catan and Others	Link	19/10/2012	Violation of the right to education of children and parents using Latin-script schools in the Transdniestrian region of the Republic of Moldova.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Georgia (I)	Link (just satisfaction)	03/07/2014 31/01/2019	Various violations related to the arrest, detention and collective expulsion from the Russian Federation of Georgian nationals in 2006-2007.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Jehovah's Witnesses of Moscow and Others Krupko and Others	Link Link	22/11/2010 17/11/2014	Dissolution of the applicant religious community and banning of its activity , resulting in individuals' inability to manifest their religion and to carry out activities indispensable for their religious practice. Refusal to re-register the religious organisation and dispersal of a peaceful religious ceremony in which Jehovah's Witnesses of various congregations participated.	Link Link	Link

COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS - Supervision of the execution of judgments of the ECHR - Cases examined at 1419th meeting (HR) – [30 Nov. – 2 Dec. 2021]

STATE (link to the Country factsheet)	MAIN CASE (link to the judgment)	PRESS RELEASE (ECHR)	JUDGMENT FINAL ON	PROBLEMS REVEALED	STATUS OF EXECUTION	DECISIONS ADOPTED
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Kudeshkina</i>	Link	14/09/2009	Dismissal from judicial office for making critical media statements about the judiciary.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Navalnyy and Ofitserov Navalnye</i>	Link	04/07/2016 05/03/2018	Criminal conviction based on an unfair trial and an arbitrary application of criminal law.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Mikheyev</i> (group)	Link	26/04/2006	Torture or inhuman/degrading treatment in police custody with a view to extracting confessions and lack of effective investigations; arbitrary and/or unacknowledged arrest and detention in police custody. Use in criminal proceedings of confessions obtained in breach of Article 3 and lack of an effective remedy to claim compensation for ill-treatment.	Link	Link
RUSSIAN FEDERATION	<i>Svinarenko and Slyadnev</i> (group)	Link	17/07/2014	Degrading treatment on account of confinement in a metal cage in the courtroom during criminal proceedings or in the remand prison for the purposes of participation, by means of a video link, in the hearings concerning detention.	Link	Link
TURKEY	<i>Cumhuriyetçi Eğitim Ve Kültür Merkezi Vakfı</i> (group) <i>İzzettin Doğan and Others</i> <i>Zengin Hasan and Eylem</i> (group)	Link Link Link	20/04/2015 20/09/2017 19/05/2019 26/04/2016 09/01/2008	Structural and administrative problems leading to various differences in treatment between followers of the Alevi faith and adherents of the majority branch of Islam , including compulsory religious education classes.	Link Link Link	Link
TURKEY	<i>Selahattin Demirtaş (No 2)</i>	Link	22/12/2020	Unjustified detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion that he had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate; unforeseeable lifting of parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicant for political speech.	Link	Link
TURKEY	<i>Gurban</i> (group)	Link	15/03/2016	Absence of any mechanism to review “aggravated” life imprisonment sentence, and conditions of detention.	Link	Link
TURKEY	<i>Kavala</i>	Link	11/05/2020	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Arskaya</i> (group)	Link	05/03/2014	State’s positive obligation to ensure adequate health-care regulations and lack of effective investigations on alleged medical negligence.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Kebe and Others</i>	Link	14/04/2017	Lack of adequate safeguards in the border-control procedure to protect against arbitrary removal and lack of effective remedy.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Levchuk</i>	Link	03/12/2020	Failure to ensure the applicant’s protection from domestic violence.	Link	Link
UKRAINE	<i>Sukachov Nevmerzhitsky</i> (group) <i>Yakovenko</i> (group) <i>Melnik</i> (group)	Link Link Link Link	30/05/2020 12/10/2005 25/01/2008 28/06/2006	Poor conditions of detention and lack of a dequate medical treatment.	Link	Link
UNITED KINGDOM	<i>McKerr</i> (group)	Link	04/05/2001	Actions of security forces in Northern Ireland in the 1980s and 1990s; failure to conduct Article 2-compliant investigations.	Link	Link