

SECRETARIAT

AS/Jur (2024) CB 01
30 January 2023

To the members of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights

Synopsis of the meeting held in Strasbourg on 23, 24, 25 January 2024

The Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights, meeting in Strasbourg on 23, 24, and 25 January 2024:

- on Tuesday 23 January 2024 at 8.30am, with Sir Christopher Chope (United Kingdom, EC/DA), oldest member present, in the Chair, as regards:
 - **Election of the Bureau of the Committee:** elected, by acclamation, Lord Richard Keen (United Kingdom, EC/DA), as Chairperson, Ms Lesia Vasylenko (Ukraine, ALDE) as 1st Vice-Chairperson, Mr Pablo Hispán (Spain, EPP/CD) as 2nd Vice-Chairperson and Ms Thorhildur Sunna Ævarsdóttir (Iceland, SOC) as 3rd Vice-Chairperson;

Then with Lord Richard Keen (United Kingdom, EC/DA), Chairperson, presiding:

- **Minute's silence in honour of Mr Dick Marty:** held a minute of silence in memory of Mr Dick Marty, former member and former Chairperson of the committee;
- **Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI): current state of the negotiations on the Draft Framework Convention on Artificial Intelligence, Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law:** held an exchange of views with the Chairperson of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence, Mr Thomas Schneider;
- **Constitution of Sub-Committees:** agreed to constitute the Committee's current three sub-committees for 2024, namely:
 - i. Sub-Committee on Human Rights
 - ii. Sub-Committee on Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights
 - iii. Sub-Committee on the implementation of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights;
- **Composition of sub-committees:** approved the composition as in the attached appendix¹;
- **Motion for a resolution on the protection of Whistle-blowers:** considered and agreed to table a motion for resolution on this subject on behalf of the Committee;

¹ Subsequent proposals received later than 23 January 2024 are also included in the appendix.

- **Appointment of representatives of the Committee:** agreed to propose to the Bureau that the following members and substitutes be appointed to represent the Committee at meetings of the following bodies in 2024 in the framework of the Assembly's institutional representation:

European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission)

Mr Antonio Gutiérrez Limones (Spain, SOC) - titular

Mr Sergiy Vlasenko (Ukraine, EPP/CD) - substitute

Council for Democratic Elections (of the Venice Commission)

Mr Pablo Hispán (Spain EPP/CD) - titular

Ms Octavie Modert (Luxembourg, EPP/CD) - substitute

Moneyval

Ms Maria-Gabriela Horga (Romania, EPP/CD) - titular

Ms Klotilda Bushka (Albania, SOC) – substitute;

- **Appointment of rapporteurs:**

- **Appointment of a Rapporteur for a report:**

The detention of Julian Assange and its chilling effects on human rights ([Doc. 15777](#)): appointed Ms Thorhildur Sunna Ævarsdóttir (Iceland, SOC) in absentia, subject to her statement of no conflict of interest at a future meeting;

- **Appointment of Rapporteur for opinion:**

Support for the reconstruction of Ukraine ([Doc. 15732](#))

(Rapporteur for the Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy: Mr Lulzim Basha, Albania, EPP/CD): appointed Mr Davor Ivo Stier (Croatia, EPP/CD) as Rapporteur and heard from him a statement of no conflict of interest;

- **Allegations of systemic torture and inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment in places of detention in Europe** (Rapporteur: Mr Constantinos Efstathiou, Cyprus, SOC): took position on 7 amendments to the draft resolution;
- **Child abuse in institutions in Europe** (Rapporteur for opinion: Mr Constantinos Efstathiou (Cyprus, SOC) (Rapporteur for the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development: Mr Pierre-Alain Fridez (Switzerland, SOC): considered and approved an oral opinion on the report of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development;
- **on Wednesday 24 January 2024 at 11am**, as regards:
 - **A democratic future for Belarus** (Rapporteur for opinion: Mr Emanuelis Zingeris, Lithuania, EPP/CD) (Rapporteur for the Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy: Mr Kimmo Kiljunen, Finland, SOC): considered and approved an oral opinion on the report of the Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy;
 - **Legal and human rights aspects of the Russian Federation's aggression against Ukraine** (Rapporteur: Mr. Davor Ivo Stier, Croatia, EPP/CD): considered an introductory memorandum and held an exchange of views with Mr Markiyan Kliuchkovskiy, Executive Director, Register of Damage for Ukraine, The Hague, Netherlands. Authorised the Rapporteur to participate in the conference on the Special Tribunal for the crime of aggression against Ukraine, on 1 February 2024 in London, subject to the availability of funds;
 - **The Sub-Committee on Human Rights:** took note of an oral report by the Chairperson of the Sub-Committee regarding the meeting of the Sub-Committee held on Wednesday 24 January 2024 at 10.30am and endorsed the proposal of the Sub-Committee concerning the list of candidates to the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture (CPT) submitted by the delegation of Albania. Noted the postponement of the consideration of the lists of the delegations of the Slovak Republic and Poland;

- **Statutory Opinion on the application for membership set out in the letter of 12 May 2022 addressed to the Secretary General of the Council of Europe, in line with Statutory Resolution (51) 30** (*Rapporteur for opinion: Ms Azadeh Rojhan, Sweden, SOC*): heard an oral report by the Rapporteur for opinion on her fact-finding visit to Kosovo* on 1-3 December 2023;
- **Appointment of representatives of the Committee:** agreed to propose to the Bureau that the following members and substitutes be appointed to represent the Committee at meetings of the following bodies in 2024 in the framework of the Assembly's institutional representation:

Group of States against Corruption (GRECO)
 Ms Agnes Sirkka Prammer (Austria, SOC) – titular
 Ms Elena-Simona Spătaru (Romania, ALDE) – substitute

Committee of Experts on the Protection of the Environment through Criminal Law (PC-ENV):
 Mr Constantinos Efstathiou (Cyprus, SOC) – titular (elected by vote)
 ZZ – substitute;
- **Participation of members in conferences, meetings, seminars etc:** heard reports by the Assembly's representatives on their participation in the following meetings:

79th meeting of the Venice Commission's Council for Democratic Elections, Venice (Italy) 14 December 2023: Mr Davor Ivo Stier, Croatia, (EPP/CD)
 137th European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission), Venice (Italy) 15-16 December 2023: Mr Constantinos Efstathiou, Cyprus, SOC);
- **on Thursday 25 January 2023 at 2pm, as regards:**
 - **Abolition of the death penalty: current global trends and situation in the United States of America** (*General Rapporteur on the abolition of the death penalty: Mr Aleksandar Nikoloski, North Macedonia, EPP/CD*): held a hearing with the participation of:

Mr Raphaël Chenuil-Hazan, Director General, *Ensemble contre la peine de mort* (ECPM), Paris
 Ms Robin Maher, Executive Director of the Death Penalty Information Center (DPIC), Washington (online)
 Ms Bronwyn Dudley, Program Manager, World Coalition Against the Death Penalty, Paris;
 - **Appointment of rapporteurs:**
 - **Appointment of Rapporteur for opinion:**

Review of the partnership for democracy in respect of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic (Doc [15810](#)): (*Rapporteur for the Committee on Political Affairs and Democracy: Ms Marietta Karamanli, (France, SOC)*): appointed Mr Serhii Kalchenko (Ukraine, EC/DA) in absentia, subject to his statement of no conflict of interest at a future meeting;
 - **Hearings during the next meeting:** agreed to hold the following hearings, during the next meeting with invited experts, subject to the availability of funds and that they be open to the public, subject to the agreement of the experts;

Legal and human rights aspects of the Russian Federation's aggression against Ukraine
 Rapporteur: Mr. Davor Ivo Stier (Croatia, EPP/CD), focused on the issue of compensation of the damage caused by the aggression;

* All reference to Kosovo, whether to the territory, institutions or population shall be understood in full compliance with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 and without prejudice to the status of Kosovo.

Towards a transparency register within the Parliamentary Assembly
Rapporteur: Ms Azadeh Rojhan Gustafsson, Sweden, SOC;

- **Václav Havel Human Rights Prize 2024:** made a call for nominations, noted the deadline of 30 April 2024 and that details are available on the [Václav Havel Human Rights Prize website](#);

- **Other business:**

Gender equality in the functioning of the Assembly: took note of the information memorandum prepared by the secretariat of the Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination;

- **Next meetings:** took note of the plenary meetings for 2024 as follows:

Plenary Committee:

- 4 March 2024, Paris Office
- during the Assembly's 2nd part-session of 2024 (15-19 April 2024)
- 21 May 2024, Paris Office (t.b.c.)
- during the Assembly's 3rd part-session of 2024 (24-28 June 2024)
- 11 September 2023, Paris Office (t.b.c.)
- during the Assembly's 4th part-session of 2024 (30th September – 4 October 2024)
- 10 December 2024, Paris Office (t.b.c.)

The Sub-Committee on Human Rights (of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights), meeting on Tuesday 23 January 2024 at 10.20am, with Mr Thomas Pringle (Ireland, UEL), oldest member present in the Chair, as regards:

- **Election of the Sub-Committee's Chairperson:** elected Ms Octavie Modert (Luxembourg, EPP/CD) Chairperson by acclamation;

Then with Ms Octavie Modert (Luxembourg, EPP/CD), Chairperson, presiding:

- **Election of the Sub-Committee's Vice-Chairperson:** decided to postpone the election to a future meeting

The Sub-Committee on Human Rights (of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights), meeting on Wednesday 24 January 2024 at 10.30am, with Ms Octavie Modert (Luxembourg, EPP/CD), Chairperson, presiding;

- **European Committee for the Prevention of Torture (CPT):** considered the list of candidates to the CPT in respect of Albania. Agreed on an order of preference amongst the candidates to be transmitted to the plenary Committee for endorsement. Noted the postponement of the consideration of the lists submitted by the delegations of the Slovak Republic and Poland;
- **Other business:** took note that a letter had been sent in December 2023 to the delegation of Bosnia and Herzegovina requesting an update of the situation of their procedure owing to the long-term vacancy of their country's seat on the CPT;
- **Next meeting:** during the April 2024 part-session.

The Sub-Committee on the implementation of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights (of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights), meeting on Wednesday 24 January 2024, at 10.40am, with Mr Alain Milon (France, EPP/CD) oldest member present in the Chair, as regards:

- **Election of the Sub-Committee's Bureau:** elected Mr Givi Mikanadze (Georgia, SOC) Chairperson by acclamation;

Then with Mr Givi Mikanadze (Georgia, SOC) Chairperson, presiding:

- **Election of the Sub-Committee's Vice-Chairperson:** decided to postpone the election to a future meeting;
- **Other business:** took note that the sub-committee members wished to hold another meeting of the Sub-Committee before the summer outside of Strasbourg and Paris. Noted the possible invitations from the Albanian and Swiss delegations and authorised the Chair to liaise with both delegations to finalise a concrete proposal of such a meeting without further consultation of members, subject to the agreement of the Bureau and the availability of funds;
- **Next meeting:** left it to the Chairperson to convene the next meeting.

The Sub-Committee on Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights (of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights), meeting on Wednesday 24 January 2024 at 10.50am, with Mr Christian Petry (Germany, SOC), oldest member present in the Chair, as regards:

- **Election of the Sub-Committee's Bureau:** decided to postpone the election to a future meeting.

The Sub-Committee on Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights (of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights), meeting on Thursday 25 January 2024 at 3.05pm, with Mr Constantinos Efstathiou (Cyprus, SOC), oldest member present in the Chair, as regards:

- **Election of the Sub-Committee's Bureau:** elected Mr Damien Cottier (Switzerland, ALDE) as Chairperson by acclamation;

Then with Mr Damien Cottier (Switzerland, ALDE), Chairperson, presiding:

- **Election of the Sub-Committee's Vice-Chairperson:** decided to postpone the election to a future meeting;
- **Next meeting:** left it to the Chairperson to convene the next meeting.

Günter Schirmer, Guillem Cano-Palomares, Eleanor Hourigan, George Stafford, Rafał Sokół

cc:

Secretary General of the Assembly

Director and all staff of the Secretariat of the Assembly

Secretaries of National Delegations and of Political Groups of the Assembly

Secretaries of observer and partner for democracy delegations

Secretary General of the Congress

Secretary to the Committee of Ministers

Directors General

Director of the Private Office of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe

Director of the Office of the Commissioner for Human Rights

Director of Communication

Permanent Representations to the Council of Europe

Appendix

Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights *Commission des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme*

Sub-Committee on Human Rights (28 seats) *Sous-commission des Droits de l'Homme (28 sièges)* *List of members - Liste des membres*

Titular member / Membre titulaire

Alternate member/
Membre remplaçant

1.	Ms MODERT Octavie (Chair/Présidente)	Luxembourg	Mr CRUCHTEN Yves
2.	Ms BAYR Petra	Austria/Autriche	Ms PRAMMER Agnes Sirkka
3.	Ms BARDELL Hannah	United Kingdom/ Royaume-Uni	Mr SHEPPARD Tommy
4.	M. BITZ Olivier	France	
5.	M. CHAILLOU Christophe	France	
6.	Mr CORLATEAN Titus	Romania/Romanie	Mr ȚUȚUIANU Marius-Horia
7.	Ms DECROIX Eva	Czechia /Tchéquie	
8.	Mrs FILIPOVSKI Dubravka	Serbia/ Serbie	Ms PANTIC PILJA Biljana
9.	Mr GONCHARENKO Oleksii	Ukraine	
10.	Mr KLEINWAECHTER Norbert	Germany/Allemagne	Mr ABRAHAM Knut
11.	Mr LAMUÀ Marc	Spain/Espagne	
12.	Mr MIKANADZE Givi	Georgia/Géorgie	
13.	Ms NOWICKA Wanda	Poland/Pologne	
14.	Mr PRINGLE Thomas	Ireland / Irlande	
15.	Ms ROCHA FERREIRA, Catarina	Portugal	
16.	Mr ROMANOWSKI Marcin	Poland/Pologne	
17.	Ms ROTH Franziska	Switzerland/Suisse	Mr GERMANN Hannes
18.	Ms SPINELLI Domenica	Italy/Italie	
19.	Mr STYLIANIDIS Evripidis	Greece/Grèce	Mr MANTZOS Dimitrios
20.	Ms VAN VAERENBERGH Kristien	Belgium/Belgique	Mme REUTER Florence
21.	Mr VARDANYAN Vladimir	Armenia/Arménie	
22.	Ms VASYLENKO Lesia	Ukraine	
23.	Ms YILDEZ Zeynep	Turkey/ Turquie	Mr KOÇAK Konuralp
24.	ZZ		
25.	ZZ		
26.	ZZ		
27.	ZZ		
28.	ZZ		

ex officio: Chairperson of AS/Jur : Lord Richard Keen

Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights
Commission des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme
Sub-Committee on the implementation of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights
(28 seats)
Sous-commission sur la mise en œuvre des arrêts de la Cour européenne des droits de
l'homme
(28 sièges)

List of members / Liste des membres

Titular member / Membre titulaire

Alternate member /
Membre remplaçant

1.	Mr	MIKANADZE Givi (Chair, Président)	Georgie/ Géorgie	Mr BEZHASHVILI Levan
2.	Ms	ALVES MOREIRA, Isabel	Portugal	
3.	Ms	BAYR Petra	Austria/Autriche	Ms PRAMMER Agnes Sirkka
4.	Mr	BEZHASHVILI Levan	Georgia/Géorgie	
5.	Mr	CORLATEAN Titus	Romania / Roumanie	Mr NAGY Szabolcs
6.	Ms	DECROIX Eva	Czechia /Tchéquie	
7.	Mr	EFSTATHIOU Constantinos	Cyprus/Chypre	
8.	Mr	GERMANN, Hannes	Switzerland/Suisse	Mr COTTIER Damien
9.	Ms	GÖREN BÖLÜK Seda	Turkey/Turquie	
10.	Ms	GJONAJ Etilda	Albania/Albanie	
11.	Mme	GREAUME Michelle	France	
12.	Mr	GUTIÉRREZ PIETRO Sergio	Spain/Espagne	
13.	Ms	JULHAKYAN Arusyak	Armenia/Arménie	
14.	Lord	KEEN Richard	United Kingdom/ Royaume-Uni	Sir LEIGH Edward
15.	Mr	KUHLE Konstantin	Germany/Allemagne	Mr MIJATOVIĆ Boris
16.	Mr	LICHERI Ettore Antonio	Italy/Italie	
17.	Mr	MAGAZINOVIĆ, Saša	Bosnia and Herzegovina	
18.	M.	MILON Alain	France	
19.	Ms	MODERT Octavie	Luxembourg	
20.	Ms	PANTIC PILJA Biljana	Serbia/Serbie	
21.	Mr	PRINGLE Thomas	Ireland/Irlande	
22.	Ms	REUTER Florence	Belgium/Belgique	Ms GAHOUCI Latifa
23.	Mr	STIER Davor Ivo	Croatie/ Croatie	
24.	Mr	STYLIANIDIS Evripidis	Greece/Grèce	Ms EFTHYMIΟΥ Anna
25.	Mr	VLASKENKO Sergiy	Ukraine	
26.	Ms	VOGELS Rian	Netherlands/Pay-Bas	
27.	ZZ			
28.	ZZ			

ex officio: Chairperson of AS/Jur: Lord Richard Keen

Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights
Commission des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme

Sub-Committee on Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights
(28 seats)

Sous-commission sur l'intelligence artificielle et les droits de l'homme (28 sièges)

List of members / Liste des membres

Titular member / Membre titulaire

Alternate member /
Membre remplaçant

1.	Mr COTTIER Damien (Chair/ Président)	Switzerland/Suisse	Mr MICHEL Matthias
2.	Ms BUSHKA Klotilda	Albania/Albanie	
3.	Mr CRUCHTEN Yves	Luxembourg	
4.	Mr EFSTATHIOU Constantinos	Cyprus/Chypre	
5.	Ms EFTHYMIOU Anna	Greece/Grèce	Ms KANELLI Liana
6.	Ms HIGGINS Emer	Ireland / Irlande	
7.	Ms HOYO Belén	Spain/Espagne	
8.	Mr MAGAZINOVIĆ Saša (Mr)	Bosnia and Herzegovina	
9.	Mr NICULESCU ȚĂGÂRLAȘ Cristian Augustin	Romania/Roumanie	Ms HORGHA Maria Gabriela
10.	Mr ORLANDO Andrea	Italy/Italie	
11.	Mme PETIT Maud	France	
12.	Mr PETRY Christian	Germany/Allemagne	Mr KLEINWAECHTER Norbert
13.	Ms ROCHA FERREIRA Catarina	Portugal	
14.	Mr ROMANOWSKI Marcin	Poland/Pologne	
15.	Mr VARDANYAN Vladimir	Armenia/Arménie	
16.	Ms VASYLENKO Lesia	Ukraine	
17.	Ms YILDIZ Zeynep	Turkey/ Turquie	Mr EMRE Yunus
18.	ZZ		
19.	ZZ		
20.	ZZ		
21.	ZZ		
22.	ZZ		
23.	ZZ		
24.	ZZ		
25.	ZZ		
26.	ZZ		
27.	ZZ		
28.	ZZ		

ex officio: Chairperson of AS/Jur : Lord Richard Keen