

CDDH(2023)R99  
Strasbourg, 11/12/2023

**STEERING COMMITTEE FOR HUMAN RIGHTS  
(CDDH)**

**REPORT**

---

99th meeting

Strasbourg, 28 November – 1st December 2023

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Summary

ITEM 1: OPENING OF THE MEETING, ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND ORDER OF BUSINESS

ITEM 2: RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

ITEM 3: WORK ON THE SYSTEM OF THE CONVENTION

3.1. Committee of experts on the system of the European Convention on Human Rights (DH-SYSC)

3.1.1 Drafting Group on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights (DH-SYSC-JC)

3.1.2 CDDH ad hoc negotiation Group on the EU accession to the ECHR (“46+1 Group”)

ITEM 4: ENVIRONMENT AND HUMAN RIGHTS

ITEM 5: HUMAN RIGHTS IN SITUATIONS OF CRISIS

ITEM 6: NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS

ITEM 7: ACTIVITIES OF OTHER ACTORS RELATED TO THE WORK OF THE CDDH

7.1 The trade in goods used for the death penalty, torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment

7.2 Trafficking in human beings for the purpose of labour exploitation

ITEM 8: FOLLOW-UP TO THE FOURTH SUMMIT OF HEADS OF STATE AND GOVERNEMENT

ITEM 9: PLANNING OF FUTURE ACTIVITIES

ITEM 10: ACCESS TO OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS

ITEM 11: GENDER EQUALITY

ITEM 12: CONVENTIONS

ITEM 13: REPRESENTATIVES IN OUTSIDE ACTIVITIES

ITEM 14: ELECTIONS

ITEM 15: INVITEES

ITEM 16: PUBLICATIONS

ITEM 17: CALENDAR

ITEM 18: OTHER BUSINESS

**Appendix I** Agenda

**Appendix II** List of participants

**Appendix III** Presentation delivered by Mr Damien COTTIER, UN Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment

**Appendix IV** Presentation delivered by Ms Alice Jill EDWARDS, UN Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment

**Appendix V** CDDH representatives in other bodies

**Appendix VI** Composition of the Bureau, Presidencies, Rapporteurs and Drafting Groups

**Appendix VII** Calendar

## Texts adopted at the meeting

**Addendum 1:** Comments adopted by the CDDH on Recommendations of the Parliamentary Assembly

**Addendum 2:** CDDH Report on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights

**Addendum 3:** Draft Committee of Ministers Toolkit for human rights impact assessment of the measures taken by the State in situations of crisis

## SUMMARY

### Information on the meeting

The Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) held its 99th meeting in Strasbourg, from 28 November to 1<sup>st</sup> December 2023, with Krista OINONEN, Vice- Chairperson (Finland) and then Kristīne LĪCIS, Chairperson (Latvia) in the Chair.

### The agenda of the meeting appears in the Appendix

### Items for decision by the Committee of Ministers

The CDDH adopted the following text and decided to transmit it to the Committee of Ministers for possible adoption:

- Draft Toolkit for human rights impact assessment of the measures taken by the State in situations of crisis.

The CDDH adopted the following text and decided to transmit it to the Committee of Ministers for its consideration:

- Comments on Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation [2258\(2023\)](#) – “Pegasus and similar spyware and secret state surveillance”.

The CDDH adopted the following text and decided to transmit it to the Committee of Ministers for information:

- CDDH Report on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights.

### Items for information of the Committee of Ministers

- The CDDH elected Krista OINONEN (Finland) as its Chairperson and Alain CHABLAIS (Switzerland) as its Vice-Chairperson, re-elected one Bureau member (Nicola WENZEL (Germany)) and elected three Bureau members (Susan DICKSON (United Kingdom), Tim KOLK (Estonia), and Tonje MEINICH (Norway)), re-elected Alain CHABLAIS (Switzerland) as the Chairperson of the DH-SYSC, and elected Nicola WENZEL (Germany) as the Chairperson of the CDDH-ENV.
- The CDDH established a new Drafting Group to prepare draft CDDH Reports evaluating the first effects of Protocols nos. 16 and 15 to the European Convention on Human Rights (DH-SYSC-PRO), under the authority of the DH-SYSC; designated the following 10 member States to have the expenses of their experts' participation in the DH-SYSC-PRO reimbursed by the Council of Europe: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Czech Republic, Finland, Ireland, Montenegro, Netherlands, Poland and Spain; and elected Babette KOOPMAN (Netherlands) as DH-SYSC-PRO Chairperson.
- The CDDH established a new Drafting Group to prepare a draft CDDH Handbook on human rights and artificial intelligence (CDDH-IA); designated the following 10 member States to have the expenses of their experts' participation in the CDDH-IA reimbursed by the Council of Europe: Czech Republic, Estonia, Georgia, Germany, Luxembourg, Montenegro, Norway,

Slovenia, Spain, and Türkiye; and elected Alfonso BREZMES (Spain) as CDDH-IA Chairperson.

- The CDDH established a new Drafting Group to prepare a draft CDDH Study on the need for and feasibility of (an) additional non-binding instrument(s) to complement the 2011 Committee of Ministers' Guidelines on the eradication of impunity for serious human rights violations (CDDH-ELI); designated the following 10 member States to have the expenses of their experts' participation in the CDDH-ELI reimbursed by the Council of Europe: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Estonia, Germany, Greece, Netherlands, Poland, Türkiye, Switzerland and United Kingdom; and elected Hans-Jörg BEHRENS (Germany) as CDDH-ELI Chairperson.

As regards the system of the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), the CDDH:

- exchanged views on the results of the 4th and final meeting of the Drafting Group on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights (DH-SYSC-JC), notably its completion of a draft CDDH report on this issue; considered that, following the adoption of the CDDH Report, the DH-SYSC-JC had fulfilled its mandate;
- received information from the representative of the European Union (EU) on developments concerning the accession of the EU to the ECHR, in particular in relation to the EU's intention to resolve internally the outstanding issue concerning EU acts in the area of the Common Foreign and Security Policy.

As regards the other items on its agenda, the CDDH:

- took note of the adoption by the Committee of Ministers of replies to certain recommendations of the Parliamentary Assembly on which the CDDH had previously adopted comments;
- exchanged views on the results of the 8th meeting of the Drafting Group on human rights and the environment (CDDH-ENV), notably on the state of progress of the draft CDDH Report on the need for and feasibility of a further instrument or instruments on human rights and the environment; considered that the draft report prepared by the CDDH-ENV should examine all options, without excluding any of them, and remain neutral in its conclusions on those options;
- exchanged views on the results of the 4th and 5th meetings of the Drafting Group on human rights in situations of crisis (CDDH-SCR) and the 14th Warsaw Human Rights Seminar, "Human rights in situations of crisis: turning challenging circumstances into opportunities"; designated the United Kingdom to have the expenses of its participation in the CDDH-SCR reimbursed by the Council of Europe;
- exchanged views with Damien COTTIER, Chairperson of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights of the Parliamentary Assembly; decided to leave to its Bureau the decision on whom to invite to its next meeting;
- exchanged views with the following persons concerning their activities related to the work of the CDDH (i) Alice Jill EDWARDS, UN Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, on developments within the UN system concerning the trade in goods used for torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, with reference to Committee of Ministers Recommendation CM/Rec(2021)2 to member States on measures against the trade in goods used for the death penalty, torture, and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment; (ii) Petya NESTOROVA, Executive Secretary of the Group of Experts established under the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), on the latter's activities to promote awareness and implementation of Committee of Ministers Recommendation CM/Rec(2022)21 to member States on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings for the purpose of labour exploitation;
- exchanged views on issues relating to Committee of Ministers Recommendation CM/Rec(2021)1 to member States on the development and strengthening of effective, pluralist and independent national human rights institutions, taking into account the Baseline Study prepared by the European Network of National Human Rights Institutions (ENNHRI);
- took note of information provided by the Secretariat on measures taken and envisaged within the Council of Europe further to the Fourth Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe (Reykjavík, Iceland, 16–17 May 2023);

- took note of information provided by the Secretariat on the adoption of its Terms of Reference for 2024–2027 by the Committee of Ministers;
- adopted a draft questionnaire with a view to preparation for the work of the new Drafting Group DH-SYSC-PRO on a report evaluating the first effects of Protocol No. 16;
- took note of the information provided by certain of its representatives in outside activities; exchanged views on how best to fulfil its role with respect to the activities of other Council of Europe bodies;
- took note of information from the Secretariat on the work of the Access Info Group established under the Convention on Access to Official Documents (CETS No. 205 - Tromsø Convention); agreed to hold at one of its future meetings a thematic debate in the form of a workshop on the right to access State-held information;
- exchanged views with its Rapporteur on gender equality, Philippe WERY (Belgium), on the evaluations carried out by the CDDH's subordinate groups of the gender equality aspects of their activities; appreciated and encouraged the good and regular use of the thematic form "*The gender equality dimension in the work of the CDDH and its subordinate bodies*" and the taking of this dimension into account during all of their meetings; took note of information from the Secretariat on the Secretary General's working group on the use of inclusive language in the Council of Europe;
- took note of the state of signatures and ratifications of the Council of Europe treaties for which the CDDH is responsible, and of recent extensions of derogations to the ECHR;
- adopted its calendar of meetings during the first semester of 2024 and took note of a provisional calendar of meetings during the second semester of 2024.

**Resource implications**

The CDDH noted that all of the above activities were conducted within the foreseen budgetary envelopes.

**Evaluation of completed activities**

As noted above, the CDDH took note of the completion of following deliverables:

Toolkit for human rights impact assessment of the measures taken by the State in situations of crises

CDDH Report on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights

## MEETING REPORT

1. The Steering Committee for Human Rights (CDDH) held its 98th meeting in Strasbourg from 28 November to 1<sup>st</sup> December 2023 in Strasbourg with Krista OINONEN (Finland), Vice Chairperson, and then Kristīne LĪCIS (Latvia), Chairperson, in the Chair (see list of participants in [Appendix II](#)).

### ITEM 1: OPENING OF THE MEETING, ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND ORDER OF BUSINESS

2. The CDDH adopted its agenda as it appears in [Appendix I](#) and agreed to the order of business proposed in the draft annotated agenda (CDDH(2023)OJ02 Annot.).

### ITEM 2: RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

3. The Secretariat provided information on the replies adopted by the Committee of Ministers to the following Parliamentary Assembly Recommendations on which the CDDH had previously adopted comments: [2238\(2020\)](#) “Safe third countries for asylum seekers”, [2246\(2023\)](#) “Environmental impact of armed conflicts”, and [2251 \(2023\)](#) “Political strategies to prevent, prepare for, and face the consequences of natural disasters”.

4. The CDDH examined draft comments on Parliamentary Assembly Recommendation 2258(2023) – “Pegasus and similar spyware and secret state surveillance”. The comments as adopted by the CDDH appear in Addendum 1 to the present report.

### ITEM 3: WORK ON THE SYSTEM OF THE CONVENTION

#### 3.1 Committee of experts on the system of the European Convention on Human Rights (DH-SYSC)

##### 3.1.1 Drafting Group on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights (DH-SYSC-JC)

5. The Chairperson of the DH-SYSC-JC, Hans-Jörg BEHRENS (Germany), informed the CDDH of the results of the Group’s 4th and last meeting (20–22 September 2023) and its subsequent adoption by electronic procedure of the draft Report on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights (DH-SYSC-JC(2023)01REV4). The draft report contains information collected from former judges the European Court of Human Rights (the Court) and from applicants and potential applicants in national selection procedures for the post of the judge at the Court. Representatives of the Court had participated in and contributed constructively to the work of the Group. The Chairperson underlined in particular the Group’s analysis of the proposed extension of the length of the term of office of the judges of the Court from the current nine-year to 12 years. He noted that having analysed all the advantages and drawbacks of this proposal and in view of the fact that it would require an amendment of the European Convention on Human Rights (the Convention), the Group had considered that there was no sufficiently convincing reason to change the current nine-year term of office. The Group had also noted that the process of amendment by the Court of Rule 28 of the Rules of Court is advancing and considered preferable that the issue of judges’ recusal remains within the competence of the Court.

6. The CDDH examined the draft report paragraph-by-paragraph and agreed on some minor changes. It asked the Secretariat to update the data on the lists of candidates considered by the Committee on Election of Judges of the Parliamentary Assembly since January 2023. On this basis, the CDDH adopted the draft report on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights (see Addendum 2 to the present meeting report) and decided to transmit it to the Committee of Ministers for information. The CDDH congratulated the DH-SYSC-JC for the successful completion of its mandate.

### **3.2 CDDH ad hoc negotiation Group on the EU accession to the ECHR (“46+1” Group)**

7. The representative of the European Union (EU), Dora SCHAFFRIN, provided information on developments in the EU’s internal discussions on resolution of the outstanding issue concerning jurisdiction over acts under the EU’s Common Foreign and Security Policy (CFSP). She noted that the European Commission continued to work with the EU Council on possible solutions but that no consensus solution had yet been found. In parallel, the Advocate General of the Court of Justice of the EU (CJEU) had delivered opinions in two cases concerning human rights and the CFSP that could be relevant for resolution of the outstanding issue.<sup>1</sup> The European Commission hoped that the CJEU would follow these opinions in its judgments. In response to questions, she affirmed that the EU’s internal rules on implementation of the accession agreement would have to be in place when the agreement entered into force after all parties had ratified it, which would take some time.

## **ITEM 4: ENVIRONMENT AND HUMAN RIGHTS**

8. The Vice-Chairperson of the Drafting Group on Human Rights and Environment (CDDH-ENV), Nicola WENZEL (Germany), informed the CDDH of the results of the Group’s 8th meeting (25–29 September 2023) which she had chaired in the absence of the Chairperson, Kristīne LĪCIS (Latvia). The Group had continued its work to prepare a draft CDDH Report on the need for and feasibility of a further instrument or instruments in this field. In order to allow the CDDH to present a clear and preferably consensual report to the Committee of Ministers, it was proposed to draft this report as neutrally as possible, setting out facts without conclusions. She noted a lack of consensus on certain fundamental questions, including whether the draft report should contain conclusions drafted by the Group or instead remain neutral. The Group would benefit from guidance from the CDDH on this matter.

9. The Director General of Human Rights and Rule of Law, Christos GIAKOUMOPOULOS, highlighted the Council of Europe’s prioritisation of the environment, as reflected in the Reykjavik Declaration, and the importance of the work of the CDDH in this context. He cited examples of other Council of Europe intergovernmental committees that had produced studies containing clear conclusions on the need for and feasibility of new instruments in controversial areas and suggesting possible further action. He mentioned another example where a lack of clarity in a committee’s position had complicated subsequent action by the Committee of Ministers. In the present case, a feasibility study without conclusions on the questions of need and feasibility could complicate subsequent decision-making by the Committee of Ministers and result in the matter being referred back to the CDDH.

10. Some members felt that the CDDH should be able to arrive at technical conclusions on the issues of need and feasibility. Amongst these, some thought that the CDDH-ENV should make preliminary proposals for possible conclusions, whilst others thought that only the CDDH, as a plenary body, should explore possible conclusions. Other members said that the report should remain neutral, without expressing preferences or making proposals. Following

---

<sup>1</sup> See joined cases C-29/22 and C-44/22, *KS and KD v. Council and Others*, and case C-351/22, *Neves 77 Solutions*.

discussions, the CDDH considered that the draft report prepared by the CDDH-ENV should examine all options, without excluding any of them, and remain neutral in its conclusions on those options.

#### **ITEM 5: HUMAN RIGHTS IN SITUATIONS OF CRISIS**

11. The Chairperson of the Drafting Group on human rights in situations of crisis (CDDH-SCR), Jan SOBCZAK (Poland), informed the CDDH of the results of its 4th (12–14 September 2023) and 5th (25–26 October 2023) meetings. At its 4th meeting, the Group had adopted a draft Toolkit on human rights impact assessment of the measures adopted by the State in situations of crisis. At its 5th meeting, the Group had started its work on the draft non-binding instrument of the Committee of Ministers on the effective protection of human rights in situations of crisis, which it proposed should take the form of a recommendation to member States. The Group had appointed Susan DICKSON (United Kingdom) as Rapporteur to prepare a first draft and adopted a document giving guidance for her work. The CDDH-SCR will examine a preliminary draft at its next meeting (31 January–1 February 2024). The CDDH-SCR Chairperson also provided information on the Warsaw Human Rights Seminar (24 October 2023) on “Human rights in situations of crisis: turning challenging circumstances into opportunities”, organised by the Polish authorities under the auspices of the Secretary General of the Council of Europe, in which members of the CDDH-SCR had participated.

12. Following a paragraph-by-paragraph examination, the CDDH adopted the draft Toolkit on human rights impact assessment of the measures adopted by the State in situations of crisis (see Addendum 3 to the present meeting report) and decided to transmit it to the Committee of Ministers for adoption. It congratulated the CDDH-SCR for the successful completion of the Group’s second deliverable. The Secretariat informed the CDDH that once adopted, the Toolkit would be made available in an engaging, accessible online format. Opportunities to make the Toolkit available in non-official languages would also be explored, in order to maximise its readership and impact.

13. The CDDH designated the United Kingdom to have the expenses of its expert’s participation in the CDDH-SCR reimbursed by the Council of Europe, replacing Norway.

#### **ITEM 6: NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS**

14. The CDDH held an exchange of views on issues relating to the implementation of Committee of Ministers Recommendation CM/Rec(2021)1 to member States on the development and strengthening of effective, pluralist and independent national human rights institutions, with presentations by Krista OINONEN (Finland), Vice-chairperson of the CDDH and former Chairperson of the CDDH-INST Drafting Group on civil society and national human rights institutions, who recalled this group’s work to prepare Recommendation CM/Rec(2021)1, along with Recommendation CM/Rec(2018)11 on the need to strengthen the protection and promotion of civil society space in Europe and Recommendation CM/Rec(2019)6 on the development of the Ombudsman institution; Debbie KOHNER, Secretary General, European Network of National Human Rights Institutions (ENNHRI), who presented ENNHRI’s Baseline Study of the implementation of Recommendation CM/Rec(2021)1 by both Council of Europe member States and the Council of Europe itself; Christophe POIREL, Director for Human Rights, Council of Europe, who described the nature and scope of the Council of Europe’s well-established and wide-ranging co-operation with NHRIs and ENNHRI; and Brigitte OHMS (Austria), Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg), and Andrii LUKSHA (Ukraine), who provided information on the situation of the national human rights institution in their respective countries. The CDDH also received information on cooperation with NHRIs and ENNHRI from members of the Secretariat of Council of Europe bodies including the Parliamentary Assembly, the Office of the



Commissioner for Human Rights, the Department for the Execution of Judgments of the Court, the European Social Charter, GRETA, the Lanzarote Committee, and the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission).

**ITEM 7: ACTIVITIES OF OTHER ACTORS RELATED TO THE WORK OF THE CDDH**

15. The CDDH exchanged views with Alice Jill EDWARDS, United Nations Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, on developments within the UN system concerning the trade in goods used for torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment. The presentation delivered by Ms Edwards appears in [Appendix IV](#).

16. The ensuing discussions covered a range of topics, including her call for the development of an international torture-free trade agreement; her second interim report dedicated to a thematic study on the global trade in weapons, equipment and devices used by law enforcement and other public authorities that are capable of inflicting torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment; the list of prohibited items, classified as being inherently cruel, inhuman or degrading, either by design or purpose, that appears in her report; next steps to continue and reinforce efforts to regulate the trade; the link between the trade in torture and death penalty goods and the topic of business and human rights; examples of national practice in implementing CM/Rec(2021)2 on measures against the trade in goods used for the death penalty, torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment; and the role of National Preventive Mechanisms and National Human Rights Institutions in relation to the trade in torture and death penalty goods.

17. The CDDH thanked Ms Edwards for her participation and for the information she had shared.

18. The CDDH then exchanged views with Petya NESTOROVA, Executive Secretary of the Group of Experts established under the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA), on the latter's activities to promote awareness and implementation of Recommendation [CM/Rec\(2022\)21](#) of the Committee of Ministers to member States on preventing and combatting trafficking in human beings for the purpose of labour exploitation. Ms Nestorova noted that the GRETA secretariat had translated the recommendation into many languages for its projects, and GRETA now referred to the recommendation during national roundtable events on implementation of GRETA recommendations and in all of its evaluation reports. At an event in Warsaw in June 2023, organised with the Secretary General's Special Representative on Migrants and Refugees, work had begun on a draft checklist of possible indicators for self-assessment of implementation of the recommendation. The recommendation was also discussed at a Western Balkans-focused event on the role of the financial sector in human trafficking and was promoted by GRETA members and secretariat at events organised by other international organisations including the OSCE, the IOM, and the EU.

19. The CDDH thanked Ms Nestorova for her participation and for the information she had shared, expressing its appreciation for the efforts being made by GRETA and its secretariat to operationalise the Committee of Ministers recommendation.

**ITEM 8: FOLLOW-UP TO THE FOURTH SUMMIT OF HEADS OF STATE AND GOVERNMENT**

20. The Secretariat provided information on follow-up of the Fourth Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe, notably the ongoing work of the Committee of

Ministers' Rapporteur Group on human rights (GR-H) in relation to issues of particular relevance to the CDDH (including the system of the European Convention on Human Rights, human rights and the environment, and abolition of the death penalty).

## **ITEM 9: PLANNING OF FUTURE ACTIVITIES**

21. The Secretariat provided information on the adoption of the CDDH's terms of reference for 2024–2027 by the Committee of Ministers on 23 November 2023.

22. The CDDH adopted terms of reference for the following three new drafting groups to conduct preparatory work on deliverables expected under its new terms of reference:

- DH-SYSC-PRO, to prepare evaluations of the first effects of Protocols no. 16 and no. 15 to the European Convention on Human Rights;
- CDDH-IA, to prepare a Handbook on human rights and artificial intelligence, subject also to the results of the work of the Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI);
- CDDH-ELI, to prepare a study on the need for and feasibility of (an) additional non-binding instrument(s) to complement the 2011 Committee of Ministers' Guidelines on the eradication of impunity for serious human rights violations.

23. The CDDH designated the following 10 member States to have the expenses of their experts' participation in the DH-SYSC-PRO reimbursed by the Council of Europe: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Czech Republic, Finland, Ireland, Montenegro, Netherlands, Poland, and Spain. It elected Babette KOOPMAN (Netherlands) as DH-SYSC-PRO Chairperson.

24. The CDDH designated the following 10 member States to have the expenses of their experts' participation in the CDDH-IA reimbursed by the Council of Europe: Czech Republic, Estonia, Georgia, Germany, Luxembourg, Montenegro, Norway, Slovenia, Spain, and Türkiye. It elected Alfonso BREZMES (Spain) as CDDH-IA Chairperson.

25. The CDDH designated the following 10 member States to have the expenses of their experts' participation in the CDDH-ELI reimbursed by the Council of Europe: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Estonia, Germany, Greece, Netherlands, Poland, Türkiye, Switzerland, and United Kingdom. It elected Hans-Jörg BEHRENS (Germany) as CDDH-ELI Chairperson.

26. The Chair of the CDDH proposed that preparatory work for the DH-SYSC-PRO begin in advance of its first meeting. To this end, the Chairperson of the DH-SYSC, Alain CHABLAIS (Switzerland), presented a draft questionnaire containing questions addressed to all member States, questions addressed to the highest courts designated pursuant to Article 10 of the Protocol, and questions addressed to the European Court of Human Rights. The CDDH adopted this questionnaire (CDDH(2023)20REV) and decided to invite the addressees to consider replying within two months of receipt. In respect of the designated highest courts, the CDDH agreed that its members representing the States Parties to Protocol No.16 should, following their receipt of a letter from Babette KOOPMAN, the Chair of DH-SYSC-PRO, transmit the relevant questions to the office of the President or the highest administrative official in each of the courts designated by their State Party.

## **ITEM 10: ACCESS TO OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS**

27. The Secretariat provided information on developments concerning the Council of Europe Convention on Access to Official Documents (CETS No.205 – the Tromsø Convention). With

its recent entry into force in respect of Slovenia and Spain, the Convention now has 15 Parties. Awareness of the Convention is growing, with its importance recognized in the Declaration adopted at the Fourth Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe (Reykjavik, 16–17 May 2023), and further support expressed in the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights of the Parliamentary Assembly and by the Group of States against Corruption (GRECO). The Consultation of the Parties, at its last meeting (6 October 2023), had re-elected Rasmus LUMI (Estonia) as Chairperson and Ganna KRASNOSTUP (Ukraine) as Vice-Chairperson. The Access Info Group had transmitted draft evaluation reports for comment to eight of the first eleven Parties and expected to do so for the three other Parties at its 4<sup>th</sup> meeting in January 2024. The Group aims to publish its first baseline evaluation in respect of all these Parties by mid-2024.

28. Two delegations reported on ongoing work in their capitals regarding the ratification of the Convention.

29. The Secretariat presented a proposal for a future CDDH thematic debate on the right of access to official documents (CDDH(2023)21). On this basis, the CDDH agreed to organize a workshop presenting the standards of the Tromsø Convention and focusing on its balanced approach to the right to access State-held information at one of its future meetings.

#### **ITEM 11: GENDER EQUALITY**

30. The CDDH exchanged views with the Rapporteur on Gender Equality, Philippe WERY (Belgium), on the evaluation carried out by the CDDH-SCR of the gender equality aspects of its activities. The CDDH appreciated and encouraged the good and regular use of the thematic form and discussed how information related to the consideration of gender equality in its work could be presented in future.

31. The Secretariat informed the CDDH that since the decision taken at its 97th meeting (6–9 December 2022) to give preference to the use of the expression “*droits humains*” over that of “*droits de l’homme*” in the French version of its documents, the practice had been generalized across the Directorate General for Human Rights and Rule of Law, including in the French version of its title and those of subordinate structures. The expression “*droits humains*” would be used in the titles given to all Council of Europe intergovernmental committees under their 2024-2027 terms of reference, and in the descriptions of the deliverables that those committees were expected to produce. The Secretariat also provided information on the ongoing drafting process of guidelines for the use of inclusive language in the Council of Europe Secretariat, building on existing standards endorsed by the Committee of Ministers since 1990, that the Secretary General was expected to issue in early 2024.

#### **ITEM 12: CONVENTIONS**

32. The CDDH took note of information provided by the Secretariat on recent signatures and ratifications of Council of Europe conventions under the responsibility of the CDDH (doc. CDDH(2023)13), and of information from the Chairperson of the CDDH-SCR on extensions of derogations to the ECHR that had been notified to the Secretary General since the CDDH last met.

#### **ITEM 13: REPRESENTATIVES IN OUTSIDE ACTIVITIES**

33. The CDDH thanked those of its representatives who provided information in writing or orally and encouraged all of its representatives to continue providing information, wherever

possible in writing, on the activities of the relevant bodies in future. It then exchanged views on how best to fulfil its mandatory role with respect to the activities of other Council of Europe bodies, in particular by asking its representatives on other intergovernmental committees to examine the new terms of reference of the respective committees in order to identify future activities with which the CDDH could engage more closely.

34. The full list of the CDDH's representatives in other Council of Europe bodies appears in [Appendix V](#).

#### **ITEM 14: ELECTIONS**

35. The CDDH elected Krista OINONEN (Finland) as its Chairperson and Alain CHABLAIS (Switzerland) as its Vice-Chairperson, re-elected one Bureau member (Nicola WENZEL (Germany)) and elected three Bureau members (Susan DICKSON (United Kingdom), Tim KOLK (Estonia), and Tonje MEINICH (Norway)), re-elected Alain CHABLAIS (Switzerland) as the Chairperson of the DH-SYSC, and elected Nicola WENZEL (Germany) as the Chairperson of the CDDH-ENV. The full composition of the CDDH Bureau and the presidencies of its subordinate bodies appear at [Appendix VI](#).

#### **ITEM 15: INVITEES**

36. The CDDH exchanged views with Damien COTTIER (Switzerland, ALDE), Chairperson of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe. The presentation delivered by Mr Cottier appears in [Appendix III](#).

37. The ensuing discussions covered a range of topics, including the Council of Europe's work on artificial intelligence, the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights, the trade in goods used for the death penalty and torture, the abolition of the death penalty, EU accession to the European Convention on Human Rights, and human rights in situations of crisis. Members also expressed their appreciation to Mr Cottier for his committee's work on Russia's war of aggression against Ukraine and its continuing support for Ukraine.

38. The CDDH thanked Mr Cottier for his participation and for the information he had shared. It decided to leave to its Bureau the decision on whom to invite to its next meeting.

#### **ITEM 16: PUBLICATIONS**

39. The CDDH noted that no new publications have been prepared by the Secretariat since its 98th meeting.

#### **ITEM 17: CALENDAR**

40. The CDDH adopted its calendar of meetings for the first semester of 2024 and took note of a proposed calendar of meetings for the second semester of 2024, as they appear in [Appendix VII](#).

#### **ITEM 18: OTHER BUSINESS**

41. The head of the Transversal Challenges and Multilateral Projects Division, Tigran KARAPETYAN, provided information on the project "Support to efficient domestic capacity for

the execution of judgments of the European Court of Human Rights (Phase 1)”, for which several members of the CDDH had been interviewed by the expert consultants. A study on a possible Execution Coordinators’ Network would be published in December 2023; this network should be established in the first half of 2024; and an online platform should be created later in 2024, under phase 2 of the project.

42. The Secretariat provided information on work by the Council of Europe International Cooperation Group on Drugs and Addictions (Pompidou Group) concerning drug policies and human rights. The Permanent Correspondents of the Pompidou Group were expected to adopt a policy paper containing guidelines on human rights and drug policies in spring 2024, which could subsequently be adapted into a Committee of Ministers recommendation to member States. The Pompidou Group envisaged that this recommendation could be prepared under the authority of the CDDH. This would require a decision of the Committee of Ministers giving supplementary terms of reference to the CDDH.

43. Finally, the CDDH warmly thanked its outgoing Chairperson, Kristīne LĪCIS (Latvia), and expressed to her its deep gratitude for her outstanding work as Chairperson and many years of service to the Committee before becoming Chairperson. The members and the Secretariat wished her the very best in her new functions.

\* \* \*

## Appendix I

## Agenda

<b>1: OPENING OF THE MEETING, ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND ORDER OF BUSINESS</b>	<b>1 : OUVERTURE DE LA RÉUNION, ADOPTION DE L'ORDRE DU JOUR ET DE L'ORDRE DES TRAVAUX</b>
<a href="#">CDDH(2023)R98</a> - Report of the 98th meeting <a href="#">CDDH-BU(2023)R110</a> – Report of the 110th meeting	<a href="#">CDDH(2023)R98</a> – Rapport de la 98 <sup>e</sup> réunion <a href="#">CDDH-BU(2023)R110</a> – Rapport de la 110 <sup>e</sup> réunion
<b>2: RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY</b>	<b>2 : RECOMMANDATIONS DE L'ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE</b>
CDDH Comments on PACE Recommendations <a href="#">2238(2022)</a> and <a href="#">2251(2023)</a> <a href="#">CDDH(2023)16REV</a> – Replies of the Committee of Ministers to PACE Recommendations	Commentaires du CDDH sur les Recommandations de l'APCE <a href="#">2238(2022)</a> et <a href="#">2251(2023)</a> <a href="#">CDDH(2023)16REV</a> – Réponses du Comité des Ministres aux Recommandations de l'APCE
<a href="#">CDDH(2023)18</a> – Draft CDDH comments on PACE Recommendations	<a href="#">CDDH(2023)18</a> – Projet de commentaires du CDDH sur des Recommandations de l'APCE
<b>3: WORK ON THE SYSTEM OF THE CONVENTION</b>	<b>3 : TRAVAUX RELATIFS AU SYSTÈME DE LA CONVENTION</b>
<b>3.1. Committee of Experts on the system of the European Convention of Human rights (DH-SYSC)</b>	<b>3.1 Comité d'experts sur le système de la Convention européenne des droits de l'homme (DH-SYSC)</b>
<b>3.1.1. Drafting Group on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights (DH-SYSC-JC)</b>	<b>3.1.1. Groupe de rédaction sur les questions relatives aux juges de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme (DH-SYSC-JC)</b>
<a href="#">DH-SYSC-JC(2023)R4</a> – Report of the 4th meeting <a href="#">DH-SYSC-JC(2023)01REV5</a> – Draft CDDH report on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights <a href="#">CDDH(2023)22</a> – Compilation of comments received on the draft CDDH report on issues relating to judges of the European Court of Human Rights	<a href="#">DH-SYSC-JC(2023)R4</a> – Rapport de la 4 <sup>e</sup> réunion <a href="#">DH-SYSC-JC(2023)01REV5</a> – Projet de rapport du CDDH sur les questions relatives aux juges de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme <a href="#">CDDH(2023)22</a> – Compilation des commentaires reçus sur le Projet de rapport du CDDH sur les questions relatives aux juges de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme
<b>3.2 CDDH ad hoc negotiation Group on the EU accession to the ECHR (“46+1 Group”)</b>	<b>3.2 Groupe de négociation ad hoc du CDDH sur l'adhésion de l'UE à la CEDH (« Groupe 46+1 »)</b>
<b>4: ENVIRONMENT AND HUMAN RIGHTS</b>	<b>4 : ENVIRONNEMENT ET DROITS HUMAINS</b>
<a href="#">CDDH-ENV(2023)R8</a> – Report of the 8th meeting <a href="#">CDDH-ENV(2023)06</a> – Draft CDDH Report on the need for and feasibility of a further instrument or instrument(s) on human rights and the environment, which focuses on the issue of feasibility	<a href="#">CDDH-ENV(2023)R8</a> – Rapport de la 8 <sup>e</sup> réunion <a href="#">CDDH-ENV(2023)06</a> – Projet de Rapport sur la nécessité et la faisabilité d'un instrument ou d'instruments additionnels sur les droits humains et l'environnement
<b>5: HUMAN RIGHTS IN SITUATIONS OF CRISIS</b>	<b>5 : DROITS HUMAINS EN SITUATIONS DE CRISE</b>
<a href="#">CDDH-SCR(2023)R4</a> – Report of the 4th meeting <a href="#">CDDH-SCR(2023)R4 Addendum</a> – Draft toolkit for human rights impact assessment of the measures taken by the state in situations of crisis <a href="#">CDDH-SCR(2023)R5</a> – Report of the 5th meeting	<a href="#">CDDH-SCR(2023)R4</a> – Rapport de la 4 <sup>e</sup> réunion <a href="#">CDDH-SCR(2023)R4 Addendum</a> – Projet de Boîte à outils pour l'évaluation de l'impact sur les droits humains des mesures prises par l'État en situations de crise <a href="#">CDDH-SCR(2023)R5</a> – Rapport de la 5 <sup>e</sup> réunion

<b>6: NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS</b>	<b>6: INSTITUTIONS NATIONALES DES DROITS HUMAINS</b>
Recommendation <a href="#">CM/Rec(2021)1</a> of the Committee of Ministers to member States on the development and strengthening of effective, pluralist and independent national human rights institutions  <a href="#">Contextual information and draft programme</a>	Recommandation <a href="#">CM/Rec(2021)1</a> du Comité des Ministres aux États membres sur le développement et le renforcement d'institutions nationales des droits de l'homme efficaces, pluralistes et indépendantes  <a href="#">Informations contextuelles et projet de programme</a>
<b>7 : ACTIVITIES OF OTHER ACTORS RELATED TO THE WORK OF THE CDDH</b>	<b>7: ACTIVITÉS D'AUTRES ACTEURS RELATIVES AUX TRAVAUX DU CDDH</b>
<b>7.1. The trade in goods used for the death penalty, torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment</b>	<b>7.1. Le commerce de biens utilisés pour la peine de mort, la torture et autres peines ou traitements cruels, inhumains ou dégradants</b>
Recommendation <a href="#">CM/Rec(2021)2</a> of the Committee of Ministers to member States on measures against the trade in goods used for the death penalty, torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment	<a href="#">Recommandation CM/Rec(2021)2</a> du Comité des Ministres aux États membres sur des mesures contre le commerce de biens utilisés pour la peine de mort, la torture et autres peines ou traitements cruels, inhumains ou dégradants
<b>7.2. Trafficking in human beings for the purpose of labour exploitation</b>	<b>7.2. La traite des êtres humains à des fins d'exploitation par le travail</b>
Recommendation <a href="#">CM/Rec(2022)21</a> of the Committee of Ministers to member States on preventing and combatting trafficking in human beings for the purpose of labour exploitation	Recommandation <a href="#">CM/Rec(2022)21</a> du Comité des Ministres aux États membres sur la prévention et la lutte contre la traite des êtres humains à des fins d'exploitation par le travail
<b>8 : FOLLOW-UP TO THE FOURTH SUMMIT OF HEADS OF STATE AND GOVERNMENT</b>	<b>8: SUIVI DU QUATRIÈME SOMMET DES CHEFS D'ÉTAT ET DE GOUVERNEMENT</b>
<a href="#">Reykjavik Declaration</a>	<a href="#">Déclaration de Reykjavik</a>
<b>9: PLANNING OF FUTURE ACTIVITIES</b>	<b>9 : PLANIFICATION DES ACTIVITÉS FUTURES</b>
<a href="#">CDDH(2023)19</a> – [Draft] CDDH terms of reference 2024-2027 <a href="#">CDDH(2023)17</a> - Provisional draft terms of reference for possible new subordinate bodies <a href="#">CDDH(2023)20</a> – Preparations for the work of DH-SYSC-PRO – Draft questionnaire prepared by the Secretariat in consultation with the Chair of the DH-SYSC	<a href="#">CDDH(2023)19</a> – [Projet de] Mandat 2024-2027 du CDDH <a href="#">CDDH(2023)17</a> – Avant-projet de mandats pour d'éventuelles nouvelles instances subordonnées <a href="#">CDDH(2023)20</a> – Préparation des travaux du DH-SYSC-PRO – Projet de questionnaire préparé par le Secrétariat en consultation avec le Président du DH-SYSC
<b>10: ACCESS TO OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS</b>	<b>10 : ACCÈS AUX DOCUMENTS PUBLICS</b>
<a href="#">AIG_Inf(2023)R3</a> – Report of the 3rd meeting of the Access Info Group <a href="#">AIG_Inf(2023)LD4</a> – List of decisions taken at the 4th meeting of the Access Info Group <a href="#">TC-CP(2023)R3</a> – Report of the 3rd meeting of the Consultation of the Parties	<a href="#">AIG_Inf(2023)R3</a> – Rapport de la 3 <sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe Accès à l'information <a href="#">AIG_Inf(2023)LD4</a> – Liste des décisions prises lors de la 4 <sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe Accès à l'information <a href="#">TC-CP(2023)R3</a> – Rapport de la 3 <sup>e</sup> réunion de la Consultation des Parties
<b>11: GENDER EQUALITY</b>	<b>11 : ÉGALITÉ DE GENRE</b>
<a href="#">CDDH(2023)14</a> – The gender equality dimension in the work of the CDDH and its subordinated bodies  <a href="#">CDDH(2020)13</a> – Thematic Form on Gender Equality	<a href="#">CDDH(2023)14</a> – La dimension d'égalité de genre dans les travaux du CDDH et de ses instances subordonnées  <a href="#">CDDH(2020)13</a> – Fiche thématique sur l'égalité de genre

<b>12: CONVENTIONS</b>	<b>12 : CONVENTIONS</b>
<a href="#">CDDH(2023)13</a> – Chart of signatures and ratifications of certain treaties under the responsibility of the CDDH - Information provided by the Secretariat	<a href="#">CDDH(2023)13</a> – État des signatures et ratifications de certains traités sous la responsabilité du CDDH - Informations fournies par le Secrétariat
<b>13: REPRESENTATIVES IN OUTSIDE ACTIVITIES</b>	<b>13 : REPRÉSENTANTS DANS DES ACTIVITES EXTERNES</b>
<a href="#">CDDH(2023)15</a> - Information provided by the experts	<a href="#">CDDH(2023)15</a> - Informations fournies par les experts
<b>14: ELECTIONS</b>	<b>14 : ÉLECTIONS</b>
<b>15: INVITEES</b>	<b>15 : INVITÉS</b>
<b>16: PUBLICATIONS</b>	<b>16 : PUBLICATIONS</b>
<a href="#">CDDH Publications' website</a>	<a href="#">Site internet des publications du CDDH</a>
<b>17: CALENDAR</b>	<b>17 : CALENDRIER</b>
<b>18: OTHER BUSINESS</b>	<b>18 : QUESTIONS DIVERSES</b>
<b>19: ADOPTION OF THE ABRIDGED REPORT</b>	<b>19 : ADOPTION DU RAPPORT ABRÉGÉ</b>



Appendix II**List of participants****MEMBERS / MEMBRES**

<b>ALBANIA / ALBANIE</b>	
<b>ANDORRA / ANDORRE</b>	<b>Marc CASADEVALL TOUSEIL</b> Juriste, Troisième secrétaire, Département des Affaires juridiques internationales et des Ressources humaines, ministère des Affaires étrangères
<b>ARMENIA / ARMÉNIE</b>	<b>Rafayel MOVSESYAN</b> Head of Division of the Department of Treaties and International Law, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
<b>AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE</b>	<b>Brigitte OHMS</b> Deputy Government Agent, Division for European and International Law, Human Rights Protection (dpt. V 7), Federal Chancellery
<b>AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAIDJAN</b>	<b>Şahin ABBASOV</b> Senior consultant of the Human Rights Division, Department for Work with Law Enforcement Bodies, Administration of President
<b>BELGIUM / BELGIQUE</b>	<b>Philippe WERY</b> Chef du Service des droits de l'homme, SPF Justice, Service des Droits de l'Homme
<b>BULGARIA / BULGARIE</b>	<b>Boyana TRIFONOVA</b> Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Permanent Representation of Bulgaria to the Council of Europe  <b>Aleksandra DIMITROVA</b> Deputy to the Permanent Representative Permanent Representation of Bulgaria to the Council of Europe
<b>BOSNIA HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZÉGOVINE</b>	
<b>CROATIA / CROATIE</b>	<b>Štefica STAŽNIK</b> Representative of the Republic of Croatia before the ECHR
<b>CYPRUS / CHYPRE</b>	<b>APOLOGISED</b>
<b>CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE</b>	<b>Petr KONŮPKA</b> Deputy Agent of the Government for the representation before the European Court of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice
<b>DENMARK / DANEMARK</b>	<b>Ida Marie SPIEGELHAUER</b> Head of Section, Ministry of Justice

<b>ESTONIA / ESTONIE</b>	<b>Tim KOLK</b> Agent du gouvernement estonien auprès de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme, ministère des Affaires étrangères
<b>FINLAND / FINLANDE</b>	<b>Krista OINONEN</b> Government Agent before the ECtHR, Director, Unit for Human Rights Courts and Conventions, Ministry for Foreign Affairs
<b>FRANCE</b>	<b>Paloma REPARAZ GONCER</b> Sous-directrice des droits de l'Homme à la direction des affaires juridiques, ministère de l'Europe et des affaires étrangères
<b>GEORGIA / GÉORGIE</b>	<b>Nana TCHANTURIDZE</b> Deputy Head of the Department of State Representation to International Courts, Ministry of Justice
<b>GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE</b>	<b>Hans-Jörg BEHRENS</b> LL.M., Head of Unit IV C 1 (Human Rights), Government Agent before the European Court of Human Rights, Federal Ministry of Justice  <b>Nicola WENZEL</b> LL.M., Head of Unit IV C 1 (Human Rights), Government Agent before the European Court of Human Rights, Federal Ministry of Justice
<b>GREECE / GRÈCE</b>	<b>Elias KASTANAS</b> Senior Legal Counselor, Legal Department, Public International Law Section, Hellenic Ministry of Foreign Affairs
<b>HUNGARY / HONGRIE</b>	<b>Zoltan TALLODI</b> Government Agent before the ECtHR, Ministry of Justice, Department of International Criminal Law and Office of the Agent before ECHR
<b>ICELAND / ISLANDE</b>	<b>Ragnhildur ARNLJÓTSÐÓTTIR</b> Permanent Representative of Iceland to the Council of Europe
<b>IRELAND / IRLANDE</b>	<b>John Finbarr LYSAGHT</b> Agent of the Government before the ECHR, Department of Foreign Affairs
<b>ITALY / ITALIE</b>	<b>Raffaele FESTA</b> Adjoint au Représentant Permanent, Représentation permanente de l'Italie auprès du Conseil de l'Europe
<b>LATVIA / LETTONIE</b>	<b>Kristīne LĪCIS (Chairperson)</b> Government Agent before the ECtHR, Representative of the Government before International Human Rights Organisations  <b>Elīna Luīze VĪTOLA</b> Head of Office of the Representative of Latvia before International Human Rights Institutions, Deputy Agent of the Government, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

<b>LIECHTENSTEIN</b>	<b>LOREZ-SCHWEIG Helen</b> Permanent Representation of the Principality of Liechtenstein to the Council of Europe
<b>LITHUANIA / LITUANIE</b>	<b>APOLOGISED</b>
<b>LUXEMBOURG</b>	<b>Brigitte KONZ</b> Présidente du Tribunal, Tribunal d'Arrondissement de Diekirch
<b>MALTA / MALTE</b>	<b>Christopher SOLER</b> State Advocate and Government Agent
<b>REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / RÉPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA</b>	<b>Doina MAIMESCU</b> Head of the Government Agent's Office, Ministry of Justice  <b>Dumitru OBADĂ</b> Government Agent, Ministry of Justice
<b>MONACO</b>	<b>Xavier RAUSCHER</b> Direction des Affaires Juridiques
<b>MONTENEGRO / MONTÉNÈGRO</b>	<b>Valentina PAVLIĆIĆ</b> Government Agent before the ECtHR
<b>NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS</b>	<b>Babette KOOPMAN</b> Government Agent before the EctHR, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
<b>NORTH MACEDONIA / MACÉDOINE DU NORD</b>	<b>APOLOGISED</b>
<b>NORWAY / NORVÈGE</b>	<b>Tonje MEINICH</b> Deputy Director General, Legislation Department, Ministry of Justice and Public Security
<b>POLAND / POLOGNE</b>	<b>Jan SOBCZAK</b> Government Agent before the ECHR, Deputy Director, Legal and Treaty Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
<b>PORTUGAL</b>	<b>Ricardo MATOS</b> Government Agent before the ECHR, Procureur-Général Adjoint de la République  <b>Ana GARCIA MARQUES</b> Legal advisor to the Portuguese Agent
<b>ROMANIA / ROUMANIE</b>	<b>Adriana BARBIERU</b> Deputy to the Permanent Representative, Co-Agent of the Government before the ECHR, Permanent Representation of Romania to the Council of Europe
<b>SAN MARINO / SAINT-MARIN</b>	<b>Michela BOVI</b> Co-Agente du Gouvernement auprès de la CEDH, Ambassade de Saint-Marin en Belgique
<b>SERBIA / SERBIE</b>	<b>Zorana JADRIJEVIĆ MLADAR</b> State Attorney Deputy Government Agent of the Republic of Serbia before the ECHR, The State Attorney's Office, The Agency Department before the European Court of Human Rights

<b>SLOVAK REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE</b>	<b>Miroslava BÁLINTOVÁ</b> Government Agent before the ECHR, Ministry of Justice
<b>SLOVENIA / SLOVÉNIE</b>	<b>Matija VIDMAR</b> Secretary, Department for International Cooperation and EU law, Ministry of Justice
<b>SPAIN / ESPAGNE</b>	<b>Alfonso BREZMES</b> Agent before the ECtHR, Head of the Human Rights Area of the Constitutional Law & Human Rights Department, Ministry of Justice
<b>SWEDEN / SUÈDE</b>	<b>Daniel GILLGREN</b> Deputy Director, Department for International Law, Human Rights and Treaty Law, Ministry for Foreign Affairs
<b>SWITZERLAND / SUISSE</b>	<b>Alain CHABLAIS</b> Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP, Office fédéral de la justice OFJ, Agent du Gouvernement suisse devant la Cour européenne des droits de l'Homme
<b>TÜRKIYE</b>	<b>Burcin BAYRAK SENOCAK</b> Deputy Head of Department of Human Rights, Ministry of Justice  <b>Ömer YILMAZ</b> Legal counselor, Représentation Permanente de Türkiye
<b>UKRAINE</b>	<b>Andrii LUKSHA</b> Head of the Division for Representation of the Government in Interstate Cases of the Office of the Agent before the European Court of Human Rights
<b>UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI</b>	<b>Susan DICKSON</b> Foreign and Commonwealth Office

**PARTICIPANTS**

<b>HOLY SEE / SAINT-SIÈGE</b>	<b>Christine JEANGÉY</b> Officiel, Chargée des Droits de l'Homme et du Droit Humanitaire, Dicastère pour le service du développement humain intégral
<b>JAPAN / JAPON</b>	<b>Daichi ITO</b> Consul (Attorney), Consulate General of Japan in Strasbourg  <b>Tetsushi HIRANO</b> Chargé de mission, Consulate General of Japan in Strasbourg  <b>Elea ROGER</b> Assistant, Consulate General of Japan in Strasbourg
<b>DELEGATION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION TO THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / DÉLÉGATION DE L'UNION EUROPÉENNE AUPRÈS DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE</b>	<b>Dora SCHAFFRIN</b> Legal Adviser

<b>PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY</b> <i>ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE</i>	<b>Rafal SOKOL</b> Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights
<b>OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS / BUREAU DE LA COMMISSAIRE AUX DROITS DE L'HOMME</b>	<b>Géraldine MATTIOLI-ZELTNER</b>
<b>DEPARTMENT FOR THE EXECUTION OF JUDGMENTS OF THE ECtHR / SERVICE DE L'EXÉCUTION DES ARRÊT DE LA COUR</b>	<b>Patrick SCHAFER</b>
<b>SOCIAL RIGHTS / DROITS SOCIAUX</b>	<b>Niamh CASEY</b>
<b>COMMITTEE FOR THE PREVENTION OF TORTURE AND INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT / COMITÉ POUR LA PRÉVENTION DE LA TORTURE ET DES PEINES OU TRAITEMENTS INHUMAINS OU DEGRADANTS (CPT)</b>	<b>Christian LODA</b>
<b>CONVENTION ON ACTION AGAINST TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS</b> <i>CONVENTION SUR LA LUTTE CONTRE LA TRAITE DES ETRES HUMAINS (GRETA)</i>	<b>Petya NESTOROVA</b> Executive Secretary / <i>Secrétaire exécutive</i>
<b>LANZAROTE CONVENTION / CONVENTION DE LANZAROTE</b>	<b>Ekatarina MALAREVA</b>
<b>CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES / CONVENTION POUR LA PROTECTION DES MINORITÉS NATIONALES</b>	<b>Lusine DRAMPYAN</b>
<b>EUROPEAN COMMISSION FOR DEMOCRACY THROUGH LAW (VENICE COMMISSION) / COMMISSION EUROPÉENNE POUR LA DÉMOCRATIE PAR LE DROIT (COMMISSION DE VENISE)</b>	<b>Caroline MARTIN</b>
<b>TRANSVERSAL CHALLENGES AND MULTILATERAL PROJECTS / DÉFIS TRANSVERSAUX ET PROJETS MULTILATERAUX</b>	<b>Tigran KARAPETYAN</b>



<b>CO-ORDINATOR FOR THE ABOLITION OF DEATH PENALTY / COORDONATEUR POUR L'ABOLITION DE LA PEINE DE MORT</b>	<b>Sébastien POTAUFEU</b>
--	---------------------------

**OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS**

<b>EUROPEAN NETWORK OF NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS / LE RÉSEAU EUROPÉEN DES INSTITUTIONS NATIONALES DES DROITS DE L'HOMME (ENNHRI)</b>	<b>Debbie KOHNER</b> Secretary General, Permanent Secretariat  <b>Marta GATTINI</b> Advisor to ENNHRI Secretary General  <b>Mattia CONCAS</b> Assistant, Permanent Secretariat
<b>CCBE</b>	<b>Piers GARDNER</b> Chair of the CCBE Permanent Delegation to the European Court of Human Rights
<b>AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL</b>	<b>Michael CROWLEY</b> Omega Research Foundation  <b>Rita PATRICIO</b> Senior Executive Officer for the Council of Europe, Amnesty International  <b>Patrick WILCKEN</b> Researcher/adviser on military, security and policing issues, Amnesty International, Law and Policy Programme

**INVITEE(S) / INVITÉ(S)**

<b>Damien COTTIER</b> (Switzerland, ALDE), Chairperson of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe / (Suisse, ADLE), <i>Président de la Commission des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme de l'Assemblée parlementaire du Conseil de l'Europe.</i>
<b>Alice Jill EDWARDS</b> UN Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, on developments within the UN system concerning the trade in goods used for torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment / <i>Rapporteuse spéciale des Nations Unies sur la torture et autres peines ou traitements cruels, inhumains ou dégradants, sur les développements au niveau de l'ONU concernant le commerce de biens utilisés pour la torture et autres peines ou traitements cruels, inhumains ou dégradants.</i>

**SECRETARIAT / SECRÉTARIAT**

<b>Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / Direction générale Droits humains et État de droit (DG I)</b>	
	<b>Christos GIAKOUMOPOULOS</b> Director General / Directeur général, Human Rights Directorate / <i>Direction des droits humains</i>
	<b>Christophe POIREL</b> Director / Directeur, Human Rights Directorate / <i>Direction des droits humains</i>
	<b>Daniele CANGEMI</b> Head of the Human Rights, Justice and Legal Co-operation Standard-settings activities Department / <i>Chef du Service des activités normatives en matière de droits humains, justice et coopération juridique</i>
<b>Human Rights Intergovernmental Cooperation Division / Division de la coopération intergouvernementale en matière de droits humains</b>	
	<b>David MILNER</b> Head of Division, Secretary of the CDDH / <i>Chef de Division, Secrétaire du CDDH</i>
	<b>Elvana THACI</b> Administrator / Administratrice, Secretary of the Committee of experts on the System of the European Convention on Human Rights / <i>Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur le système de la Convention européenne des droits de l'homme (DH-SYSC)</i>
	<b>Yanna PARNIN</b> Administrator / Administratrice, Secretary of the Drafting Group on Human Rights in situations of crisis / <i>Secrétaire du Groupe de rédaction sur les droits humains en situations de crise (CDDH-SCR)</i>
	<b>Daniel PAP</b> Administrator / Administrateur, Secretary of the Drafting Group on Human Rights and environment / <i>Secrétaire du Groupe de rédaction sur les droits humains et l'environnement (CDDH-ENV)</i>
	<b>Louise PORCHER</b> Assistant Lawyer / <i>Juriste assistant</i>
	<b>Corinne GAVRILOVIC</b> Assistant / <i>Assistante</i>
	<b>Charlotte PIVETEAU</b> Stagiaire

**INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES**

Gregoire DEVICTOR  
Sylvie BOUX  
Corinne MCGEORGE



Appendix III

**Presentation delivered by Mr Damien Cottier**  
Chairperson of the Committee on legal affairs and human rights  
of the Parliamentary Assembly

(via ZOOM, 29 November 2023)

Mesdames et Messieurs,

Tout d'abord j'aimerais vous remercier pour cette invitation. J'ai l'honneur de présider la Commission des affaires juridiques et des droits de l'homme de l'Assemblée depuis janvier 2022 et je suis très heureux de pouvoir partager avec vous ce matin les résultats de nos travaux les plus récents.

Je me réjouis que votre Comité directeur et notre Commission des affaires juridiques et des droits de l'homme de l'APCE collaborent et aient des échanges réguliers sur des sujets qui sont au cœur de nos travaux, les droits de l'homme et l'état de droit en Europe. C'est important de se parler et se coordonner, pour assurer une cohérence accrue entre la dimension intergouvernementale et la dimension parlementaire de notre organisation. Je suis conscient aussi que de nombreuses recommandations que nous adressons au Comité des Ministres vous sont envoyées pour commentaires.

Un des sujets qui a été au cœur de nos travaux pendant ces deux années a été l'agression russe contre l'Ukraine et ses conséquences juridiques.

Depuis l'invasion à grande échelle de l'Ukraine par la Fédération de Russie en février 2022, l'Assemblée parlementaire a joué un rôle de premier plan dans la condamnation de **l'agression contre l'Ukraine**. Après l'expulsion de la Russie de l'organisation avec le soutien unanime de l'Assemblée (avis 300), notre commission a adopté un premier rapport dans le cadre d'un débat d'urgence sur le thème « **L'agression de la Fédération de Russie contre l'Ukraine : faire en sorte que les auteurs de graves violations du droit international humanitaire et d'autres crimes internationaux rendent des comptes** ». La résolution adoptée par l'Assemblée à la suite de ce rapport (2436(2022), avril 2022) exprimait un soutien unanime à la création d'un tribunal pénal international ad hoc chargé d'enquêter et de poursuivre le crime d'agression commis par les dirigeants politiques et militaires de la Fédération de Russie. L'Assemblée a ainsi été le premier organe de caractère international à soutenir la création d'un tel tribunal, qui a été repris par d'autres organes tels que le Parlement européen, l'Assemblée parlementaire de l'OSCE et la Commission européenne.

Quelques mois après, en janvier 2023, notre Assemblée a adopté une autre résolution (2482(2023)), cette fois-ci sur la base d'un rapport que j'ai préparé sur les « **Questions juridiques et violations des droits de l'homme liées à l'agression de la FR contre l'Ukraine** ».

La résolution traite principalement de 3 questions différentes liées à la responsabilité de la Fédération de Russie pour son agression contre l'Ukraine et les violations du droit international qui en résultent : (1) **le crime d'agression** ; (2) **les crimes de guerre, les crimes contre l'humanité et le génocide éventuel** ; (3) **l'indemnisation de tous les dommages causés par l'agression et les violations du droit international découlant de l'agression**.

S'agissant du **crime d'agression**, étant donné que la CPI n'a pas compétence sur l'actuel crime d'agression contre l'Ukraine (en l'absence d'un renvoi au Conseil de sécurité des Nations Unies), l'Assemblée réitère son appel aux États membres et aux États observateurs du Conseil de l'Europe à créer un tribunal pénal international spécial pour le crime d'agression contre l'Ukraine, qui devrait être approuvé et soutenu par le plus grand nombre possible d'États et d'organisations internationales, et en particulier par l'Assemblée générale des NU. La résolution

détaille ensuite certains aspects relatifs au futur tribunal spécial, tels que sa compétence, la question des immunités, le rapport avec la CPI, etc.

S'agissant des **crimes de guerre et crimes contre l'humanité**, l'Assemblée condamne ces crimes commis par les forces russes ou les groupes armés affiliés. Elle considère que le discours officiel russe utilisé pour justifier l'invasion présente des caractéristiques d'incitation publique au **génocide** et révèle une intention génocidaire. Pour tous ces crimes, l'Assemblée appelle les Etats membres à soutenir l'enquête lancée par le procureur de la CPI ainsi que celles menées par le bureau Procureur général de l'Ukraine, à faire usage de l'entraide judiciaire (par ex, équipe commune d'enquête mise en place sous l'es auspices d'Eurojust) et à utiliser le principe de compétence universelle éventuellement prévu dans leurs législations.

Enfin, le troisième pilier de du rapport/résolution traite de la question de l'**indemnisation du dommage résultant de l'agression**. Dans ce cadre, l'Assemblée appelle les Etats membres à mettre un place un mécanisme international d'indemnisation, comprenant un registre international des dommages, qui servirait dans un premier temps à recenser les éléments de preuve et les demandes concernant les dommages. A un stade ultérieur, les Etats devraient créer une commission internationale d'indemnisation, qui serait chargée d'examiner les demandes présentées et recensées par le registre, ainsi qu'un fonds d'indemnisation. Selon l'Assemblée, le Conseil de l'Europe devrait un jouer un rôle de premier plan dans la mise en place de ce mécanisme.

Quelques mois seulement après cette résolution, les chefs d'Etats et du gouvernement, réunis à **Reykjavik** en mai 2023, ont soutenu la plupart de ces propositions. D'une part, ils se sont félicité des efforts internationaux en vue de la création d'un tribunal spécial chargé de juger le crime d'agression et ont appelé le Conseil de l'Europe à participer aux consultations et négociations pertinentes, ce qui se fait en l'actualité dans le cadre du « core group » de 38 Etats qui examine les différentes modalités pour créer un tribunal. D'autre part, et ceci est une des réalisations les plus importantes du Sommet, ils ont décidé de créer un Registre des dommages causés par l'agression russe dans le cadre institutionnel du Conseil de l'Europe (en tant qu'accord partiel élargi), invitant tous les États membres et observateurs et l'UE, ainsi que tout autre État éligible, à y adhérer. Aujourd'hui, le Registre des dommages compte 38 membres et 4 membres associés, dont l'UE, le Japon, les États-Unis et le Canada.

On voit donc comment l'action de l'APCE et de notre Commission a été essentielle pour imprimer un cap stratégique et donner une réponse juridique ferme à la guerre d'agression de la Russie contre l'Ukraine. Notre travail est loin d'être fini, et nous avons un nouveau rapport en cours sur les « questions juridiques et violations des DH liées à l'agression de la Russie contre l'Ukraine » (M. Stier), qui sera examiné et débattu par l'Assemblée en avril 2024.

Au-delà de la question de l'agression contre l'Ukraine, notre commission a continué à suivre la **situation des droits de l'homme et de l'état de droit en Russie**, même après l'expulsion de l'organisation. Par exemple, en 2022, nous avons produit un rapport sur les **prisonniers politiques en Russie** (Mme Aevarsdottir), et dans la résolution pertinente l'Assemblée (2446(2022)) appelle la libération des 478 prisonniers politiques russes, y compris ceux pour lesquels la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme a rendu des arrêts de condamnation, comme par exemple Alexei Navalny. En l'actualité, nous sommes en train de préparer deux rapports sur la **détention et persécution de l'opposant politique Vladimir Kara-Murza**, qui a reçu le prix Vaclav Havel de l'Assemblée l'année dernière. Récemment, nous avons approuvé un rapport sur la **dérogation ad hominem à la limitation des mandats en faveur du Président de la Russie** (donnant lieu à la Résolution 2519 (2023), octobre 2023) : sur la base du rapport l'Assemblée a considéré que les modifications constitutionnelles *ad hoc* en question étaient contraires non seulement à la Constitution russe mais également aux principes du droit international. Pour la première fois, l'Assemblée qualifie la Fédération de Russie de « *dictature de facto* », compte tenu entre autres du pouvoir démesuré du Président russe et de l'exercice extrêmement long de ses fonctions. Elle appelle en outre les Etats membres à reconnaître Putin comme illégitime après la fin de son mandat actuel.

Je voudrais également attirer votre attention sur certains rapports de notre commission qui me semblent importants du point de vue du développement normatif et qui concernent l'ensemble des Etats membres (**rapports thématiques transversaux**) :

- Rapport sur la **répression transnationale**, une menace croissante pour l'Etat de droit et les droits humains (Res 2509 (2023) et Recommandation 2557 (2023), juin 2023) : dans ce rapport nous appelons les Etats à établir une définition officielle de la répression transnationale et au Comité des Ministres à élaborer une recommandation qui comprendrait également une définition de ce phénomène. Nous rappelons également dans la résolution les obligations qu'impose la Convention européenne des droits de l'homme vis-à-vis des actes de répression transnationale provenant d'un pays tiers.
- Rapport sur **Pegasus et autres types de logiciels similaires** (Résolution 2513(2023) et Recommandation 2258(2023), octobre 2023) : l'Assemblée a appelé les Etats à s'abstenir d'utiliser de tels logiciels espions jusqu'à ce que leurs lois et pratiques en matière de surveillance soient pleinement conformes à la Convention, dans le cadre d'une évaluation qui va être menée par la Commission de Venise. Pour l'avenir, en tout état de cause, ils ne devraient l'utiliser que dans des « situations exceptionnelles, en dernier recours », « pour prévenir ou enquêter sur un acte spécifique constituant une menace réelle et sérieuse pour la sécurité nationale ou un crime grave spécifique et précisément défini ». Par ailleurs, l'Assemblée a demandé au CM d'adopter une recommandation aux Etats sur la surveillance secrète et les droits humains, en tenant compte des menaces que présentent les logiciels espions, et même d'examiner la faisabilité d'une nouvelle Convention du Conseil de l'Europe sur l'acquisition, utilisation, vente et exportation de logiciels espions.

Notre commission a continué à suivre **l'exécution des arrêts de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme**, qui fait bien évidemment partie de notre mandat. Nous avons adopté le 11<sup>ème</sup> rapport sur la mise en œuvre des arrêts en avril 2023, ainsi qu'un rapport spécifique en débat urgent sur l'affaire *Kavala c. Türkiye* en octobre 2023. Dans notre 11<sup>ème</sup> rapport, nous avons examiné de près les problèmes d'exécution des affaires interétatiques et des affaires « article 18 ». Nous avons également invité le Comité des Ministres à fournir à l'Assemblée une mise à jour annuelle sur les progrès réalisés dans l'exécution des arrêts de la Cour, et de manière plus générale à améliorer le dialogue avec l'Assemblée afin que celle-ci soit en mesure de faciliter le mieux possible le travail du CM. Par exemple, en organisant des conférences et des échanges avec les parlements et parlementaires nationaux. Quant à **l'affaire Kavala**, notre rapport « Appel à la libération immédiate d'Osman Kavala », a appelé le CM à mettre en place un suivi national de l'exécution par la Türkiye des arrêts de la CEDH dans le cadre du processus de la Déclaration du CM 1994 (respect des engagements pris par les EM). L'Assemblée a considéré également que le moment est venu d'envisager la « procédure conjointe complémentaire » entre le CM et l'APCE en cas de violation grave des obligations statutaires par un Etat, dans la mesure où l'inexécution de l'arrêt *Kavala* sape les fondements du système de la Convention dans son ensemble.

Nous réfléchissons aussi au sein de notre sous-commission sur la mise en œuvre des arrêts à de nouvelles initiatives et activités pour impliquer davantage nos parlementaires dans l'exécution des arrêts de la Cour dans leurs propres pays. Une des idées qui sont sur la table est de créer un réseau des membres de l'APCE qui seraient chargés de suivre les questions liées à l'exécution des arrêts rendus contre leurs propres pays et à demander à leurs gouvernements des comptes. Ce travail s'inscrit dans le droit fil de la déclaration de **Reykjavik**, qui invite le Président de l'APCE et manière plus générale tous les acteurs concernés à renforcer le dialogue politique avec leurs interlocuteurs nationaux respectifs sur la mise en œuvre des arrêts.

Je m'arrête ici pour donner le temps qu'il faut à notre échange. Je suis prêt à répondre à vos questions et à développer davantage les points qui vous intéressent le plus.

Appendix IV

**Presentation delivered by Ms Alice Jill Edwards**  
Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment  
or Punishment

*(via ZOOM, 30 November 2023)*

Ladies and gentlemen,

I thank you for the invitation to brief you this morning on my work, as the United Nations' Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, towards the development of an international torture-free trade agreement.

Any such treaty would complement and reinforce existing obligations to prohibit and prevent torture and other ill-treatment, an obligation to which all countries are bound.

Last month, I presented my second interim report to the Third Committee of the General Assembly, which was dedicated to how as an international community we can remove certain equipment, restraints and weapons used by law enforcement and other public authorities which are inherently violative of the international prohibition against torture.

I noted that there is currently no international agreement governing the trade in items intended – or being misused – for torture, so the proposal for a torture-free trade agreement is a tangible step towards our global desire to live in torture-free societies.

In practice this gap means that State and private companies – outside the European Union and unless regulated at national level – are free to develop and sell items that inflict unnecessary or excessive pain.

This is a global challenge. The trade in instruments that torture – and use by public authorities – has tentacles that stretch across the globe.

Chair, my proposal contains two components.

A 'Category A' Prohibited list of items which I have classified as being inherently cruel, inhuman or degrading, either by design or purpose. These items should be removed from production and use immediately.

And a 'Category B' list which includes ordinary law enforcement equipment to be controlled, because they pose a heightened risk of misuse.

My proposal includes an early warning trigger such that a trade could be suspended or cancelled when there are reasonable grounds that torture or other serious human rights violations are being undertaken or prepared.

These lists are detailed in Annexes 1 and 2 of my report.

My report took note of the efforts taken by this body to support a world where such items are relegated to history, through the Council of Europe Recommendation CM/Rec(2021)2 on measures against the trade in goods used for the death penalty, torture and other ill-treatment.

The trade in law enforcement equipment, a sub-set of the overall market, is significant and estimated to reach 27 billion USD by 2028, growing by 8 per cent per annum. Much of this forecasted rise is correlated to expected rises in civic mobilization.

This issue is also becoming ever more important as governments outsource public functions to private entities.

Chair, ladies and gentlemen, police and other public authorities must be properly equipped and protected. However, precisely because such weapons can cause harm potentially amounting to atrocity crimes, there is a need for better regulation.

According to my research, with sincere thanks to the Omega Research Foundation, at least 335 companies in at least 54 countries are manufacturing or promoting items I have included in my Prohibited List.

A recent arms fair at Milipol Paris showed that certain items that are on my Prohibited List continue to be promoted for sale.

My Prohibited List includes such egregious items as spiked batons that can easily rip through skin. Thumb cuffs, some with cerated edges, to restrain an individual and which can easily fracture the fine bones of the hand. And electric shock belts that electrocute individuals at the touch of a button.

My list further includes caged beds, gang chains, hoods and blindfolds, spit hoods, whips, sjamboks and *lathis*, and shields and body armour with spikes. It includes excessively weighted batons and gloves that turn otherwise defensive equipment into offensive weapons. Some of the items conjure up painful and degrading images associated with slavery and servitude.

Ammunition containing multiple kinetic impact projectiles and directed energy weapons also feature on my list.

The items on my Prohibited List have no place in human-rights compliant law enforcement. They are quite literally modern-day torture tools.

Next steps?

For my part I will be following up on my prohibited list – firstly I request that all States undertake a stocktake of equipment manufactured, procured for or used by relevant public authorities and immediately legislate against, remove and decommission the items on my Prohibited List.

And second, for all States to work towards an international torture-free trade instrument so that we are all safer and better protected in our communities.

I will be supporting the UN level process, following the recommendations of the Group of Governmental Experts, in May 2022, who recommended that an instrument be developed on the trade in items used for torture (the consensus view was to drop tools used for the death penalty).

The UN process is at a pivotal moment. There is a need for the tabling of a resolution to start the drafting process.

As Council of Europe Member States, I believe you could and should play a decisive role in re-energizing that process through, for example, statements of support and practical diplomatic action.

I would encourage you to publicize your own national efforts to regulate the trade; and to take concrete steps to implement your own Recommendation. I would be very pleased to hear from you about your engagement with my own lists and the steps you are taking to ban items in Annex 1.

For my part, I plan to keep this important issue on my agenda and to continue to push States to do the right thing. Concretely, I will be taking up this issue during my country visits, as I recently did on my latest visit to Chile last month.

The Committee against Torture has informed me that they will be taking up these questions as part of their periodic review of State party reports, relying on my Prohibited List. While the Sub-Committee on the Prevention of Torture will likewise be adding this to areas of work during their visits.

I will also be reaching out to the Committee for the Prevention of Torture in Europe to engage them similarly.

Finally, I wish to end by encouraging you to keep the momentum towards an important treaty which would be a vital complement to the existing anti-torture framework. It is a generational opportunity to take a stand against torture.

Thank you for your attention.

Appendix V**CDDH representatives in other bodies**

*(List as revised by the CDDH at its 99th meeting, 28 November – 1st December 2023)*

1. Committee on Bioethics (DH-BIO): Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg)
2. Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission): Brigitte OHMS (Austria)
3. European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice (CEPEJ): Liliya ELENKOVA (Bulgaria)
4. Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law (CAHDI): Zinovia STAVRIDI (Greece)
5. European Committee on Legal Co-operation (CDCJ): **Vacant**
6. Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI): Hans-Jörg BEHRENS (Germany)
7. Committee of experts on Roma and Traveller Issues (ADI-ROM): Romana KUZMANIĆ-OLUIĆ (Croatia)
8. Advisory Committee of the Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data (T-PD): Brigitte OHMS (Austria)
9. Council of Europe Committee on Counterterrorism (CDCT): Susan DICKSON (United Kingdom)
10. Committee of the Parties to the Council of Europe Convention on the Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse ("Lanzarote Committee"): Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg)
11. Steering Committee for the rights of the child (CDENF): Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg)
12. European Committee on Democracy and Governance (CDDG): Krista OINONEN (Finland)
13. Steering Committee on Anti-discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI): Elias KASTANAS (Greece)
14. Ad hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAI): Tim KOLK (Estonia)
15. Gender Equality Commission (GEC): **Vacant**

\* \* \*

Appendix VI**Composition of the Bureau, Chairmanships, Rapporteurs and Drafting Groups**

<b>BUREAU OF THE CDDH</b>	<b>END OF THE MANDATE</b>	<b>REFERENCES</b>
Krista OINONEN (Finland) Chair	31 December 2024 (elected for 1 year, renewable once)	99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
Alain CHABLAIS (Switzerland) Vice-Chair	31 December 2024 (elected for 1 year, renewable once)	99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
Brigitte OHMS (Austria) Member	31 December 2024 (not renewable)	97th CDDH meeting (December 2022)
Babette KOOPMAN (Netherlands) Member	31 December 2024 (non-renewable)	97th CDDH meeting (December 2022)
Nicola WENZEL (Germany) Member	31 December 2025 (elected for 2 years, non- renewable)	99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
Susan DICKSON (United Kingdom) Member	31 December 2025 (elected for 2 years, renewable once)	99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
Tim KOLK (Estonia) Member	31 December 2025 (elected for 2 years, renewable once)	99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
Tonje MEINICH (Norway) Member	31 December 2025 (elected for 2 years, renewable once)	99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
<b>CHAIRS</b>		
<b>DH-SYSC</b> Alain CHABLAIS (Suisse)	31 December 2024 (elected for 1 year, non-renewable)	99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
<b>DH-SYSC-JC</b> Hans-Jörg BEHRENS (Germany)		96th CDDH meeting (June 2022)
<b>"46 + 1"</b> Tonje MEINICH (Norway)		92nd CDDH meeting (November 2019)
<b>CDDH-ENV</b> Nicola WENZEL (Germany)		99th CDDH meeting (November 2023)
<b>CDDH-SCR</b> Jan SOBCZAK (Poland)		95th CDDH meeting (November 2021)



<b>RAPPORTEURS</b>	
Krista OINONEN (Finland)	Human Rights in culturally diverse societies
Nicolas WENZEL (Germany)	Human Rights and business
Philippe WERY (Belgium)	Gender equality
Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg)	Children's rights
Brigitte KONZ (Luxembourg)	Rights of persons with disabilities
Romana KUZMANIC-OLUIC (Croatia)	Issues relating to Roma and Traveller
<b>DRAFTING GROUPS</b>	
<b>DH-SYSC-PRO</b>	
Armenia	
Azerbaijan	
Belgium	
Czech Republic	
Finland	
Ireland	
Montenegro	
Netherlands ( <i>Chair</i> )	
Poland	
Spain	
<b>CDDH-SCR</b>	<b>CDDH-ENV</b>
Armenia	Armenia
Azerbaijan	Austria
Estonia	Finland
Georgia	France
Montenegro	Germany ( <i>Chair</i> )
Netherlands	Latvia
Poland ( <i>Chair</i> )	Poland
Portugal	Romania
Türkiye	Spain
United Kingdom	Switzerland
	Türkiye
<b>CDDH-ELI</b>	<b>CDDH-AI</b>
Armenia	Czech Republic
Azerbaijan	Estonia
Estonia	Georgia
Germany ( <i>Chair</i> )	Germany
Greece	Luxembourg
Netherlands	Montenegro
Poland	Norway
Türkiye	Slovenia
Switzerland	Spain ( <i>Chair</i> )
United Kingdom	Türkiye

Appendix VII**Calendar for 2024**

*as adopted (for the first semester) and approved (for the second semester) at the 99th CDDH meeting 28 November – 1<sup>st</sup> December 2023*

17 – 19/01/2024	<a href="#"><u>9th meeting of the Drafting Group on Human Rights and Environment / 9<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur les droits humains et l'environnement (CDDH-ENV)</u></a>
22/01/2024 ( <i>online</i> )	<a href="#"><u>5th meeting of the Council of Europe Access Info Group / 5<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe Accès à l'information du Conseil de l'Europe</u></a>
31/01 – 02/02/2024	<a href="#"><u>6th meeting of the Drafting Group on human rights in situations of crisis / 6<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur les droits humains en situations de crise (CDDH-SCR)</u></a>
19 – 21/03/2024	<a href="#"><u>10th meeting of the Drafting Group on Human Rights and Environment / 10<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur les droits humains et l'environnement (CDDH-ENV)</u></a>
26 – 28/03/2024	1st meeting of the Drafting Group on the first effects of Protocols Nos. 15 & 16 ECHR / <i>1<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur les premiers effets des Protocoles 15 &amp; 16 à la CEDH (DH-SYSC-PRO)</i>
03 – 05/04/2024	<a href="#"><u>7th meeting of the Drafting Group on human rights in situations of crisis / 7<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur les droits humains en situations de crise (CDDH-SCR)</u></a>
24 – 26/04/2024	<a href="#"><u>7th meeting of the Committee of experts on the system of the ECHR / 7<sup>e</sup> réunion du Comité d'experts sur le système de la CEDH (DH-SYSC)</u></a>
15 – 17/05/2024	1st meeting of the Drafting Group on the eradication of impunity for serious human rights violations / <i>1<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur l'élimination de l'impunité pour les violences graves des droits humains (CDDH-ELI)</i>
23 – 24/05/2024	<a href="#"><u>111th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights / 111<sup>e</sup> réunion du Bureau du Comité directeur pour les droits de l'homme (CDDH-BU)</u></a>
29 – 31/05/2024	<a href="#"><u>6th meeting of the Council of Europe Access Info Group / 6<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe Accès à l'information du Conseil de l'Europe</u></a>
25 – 28/06/2024	<a href="#"><u>100th meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights / 100<sup>e</sup> réunion du Comité directeur pour les droits de l'homme (CDDH)</u></a>

- 11 – 13/09/2024 | ~~1st meeting of the Drafting Committee on human rights and the environment / 1<sup>e</sup> réunion du Comité de rédaction sur les droits humains et l'environnement (DH-ENV)~~  
1st meeting of the Drafting Committee on human rights and artificial intelligence / 1<sup>e</sup> réunion du Comité de rédaction sur les droits humains et l'intelligence artificielle (CDDH-IA)
- 25 – 27/09/2024 | 2nd meeting of the Drafting Group on the first effects of Protocols Nos. 15 & 16 ECHR / 2<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur les premiers effets des Protocoles 15 & 16 à la CEDH (DH-SYSC-PRO)
- 02 – 04/10/2024 | 4th meeting of the Consultation of the Parties to the Tromsø Convention / 4<sup>e</sup> réunion de la Consultation des Parties à la Convention de Tromsø
- 15 – 17/10/2024 | 2nd meeting of the Drafting Group on the eradication of impunity for serious human rights violations / 2<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur l'élimination de l'impunité pour les violences graves des droits humains (CDDH-ELI)
- 29 – 31/10/2024 | ~~1st meeting~~ 2nd meeting of the Drafting Group on human rights and artificial intelligence / ~~1<sup>e</sup> réunion~~ 2<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe de rédaction sur les droits humains et l'intelligence artificielle (CDDH-IA)
- 07 – 08/11/2024 | [112th meeting of the Bureau of the Steering Committee for Human Rights / 112<sup>e</sup> réunion du Bureau du Comité directeur pour les droits de l'homme \(CDDH-BU\)](#)
- 13 – 15/11/2024 | [7th meeting of the Council of Europe Access Info Group / 7<sup>e</sup> réunion du Groupe Accès à l'information du Conseil de l'Europe](#)
- 26 – 29/11/2024 | [101st meeting of the Steering Committee for Human Rights / 101<sup>e</sup> réunion du Comité directeur pour les droits de l'homme \(CDDH\)](#)