



Strasbourg, 9 May 2019

CDCPP(2019)5
Item 5.1 of the agenda

**STEERING COMMITTEE FOR CULTURE,
HERITAGE AND LANDSCAPE (CDCPP)**

CULTURE

Promoting the CoE's Recommendations on culture and digitisation

**Follow-up to the expert seminar "E-relevance of culture in the age of AI" in the
framework of the high-level conference
"Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on
Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law"
(Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019) and conference conclusions**

Cultural Policy Review of the Republic of Moldova

**Progress report on the Association of the Compendium
of Cultural Policies and Trends**

**Follow-up to the Council of Europe's Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy
(IFCD)**

For information and action

Secretariat Memorandum
prepared by the
Directorate of Democratic Participation
Culture, Nature and Heritage Department

This document is public. It will not be distributed at the meeting. Please bring this copy.

I. Promoting the CoE's Recommendations on culture and digitisation

The Committee of Ministers adopted Recommendation CM/Rec(2018)10 on "Culture's contribution to strengthening the internet as an emancipatory force" at its 1329th meeting on 14 November 2018. A pack has been produced to disseminate this new Recommendation, together with the two previous texts generated by the CDCPP, namely Recommendation CM/Rec (2016)2 on the Internet of Citizens and Recommendation CM/Rec (2017)8 on Big Data for Culture, Literacy and Democracy. The pack can be made available to member States upon request.

Action required

The CDCPP is invited to:

- raise awareness on and disseminate the culture and digitisation Recommendations pack to cultural and educational policy makers and other interested stakeholders at national level.

II. Follow-up to the expert seminar "E-relevance of culture in the age of AI" in the framework of the high-level conference "Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law" (Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019) and conference conclusions

As a contribution from the cultural sector, the conclusions and action proposals derived from the Rijeka expert seminar (12-13 October 2018) on culture, creativity and artificial intelligence were presented at a side-event *E-relevance of Education and Culture in the Age of AI*. (see <https://www.coe.int/en/web/culture-and-heritage/-/e-relevance-of-culture-in-the-age-of-ai>) as part of the "AI in Action" sessions of the high-level conference "Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law (Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019). In addition, the exhibition *Anatomy of an AI System* by Vladan Joler and Kate Crawford was offered as a contribution from the culture sector, adding a thought-provoking visual element to the high-level debates. Later this year, the exhibition will be on display at the Council of Europe possibly related to a session of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe.

The Helsinki conference "Governing the Game Changer" concluded that more research, understanding, trust and transparency are needed with regards to the complex challenge of AI, as well as multi-stakeholder cooperation. Specific conclusions are available at <https://rm.coe.int/conclusions-from-the-conference/168093368c> and underline (selective list) that timely and thoughtful policy responses should be placed at the top of governments' political agenda and AI should be developed in a human-centric manner and in line with the principles of human rights, democracy and rule of law and respecting existing landmark international instruments to produce benefits for individuals and for societies. There is also a need for effective supervisory mechanisms and democratic oversight structures regarding the design, development and deployment of AI and for effective and legitimate mechanisms to prevent human rights violations and thwart discrimination, inequality and bias. Public awareness of the potential risks and benefits of AI must be enhanced and necessary new competencies and skills developed. The Council of Europe should continue to develop sector-specific recommendations, guidelines and codes of conduct to promote human rights and the viability of democratic institutions and processes, as it should monitor the impact of AI on the collective foundations of democratic societies.

The essential contributions by arts and culture to the deliberations about our common technology influenced future, both in terms of realistic insight (through critical media art) and sense of direction (reflexive and holistic approach) and the challenges and opportunities related to AI applications in the cultural and heritage sector deserve further investigation. Based on the contributions to the Rijeka expert seminar, a reader is being produced to gather insights and inspire possible further initiatives by the Council of Europe and relevant stakeholders in the cultural/heritage area. The publication should be available in summer 2019 and made available both online and offline.

Action required

The CDCPP is invited to:

- note the results of the High-level conference "Governing the Game Changer – Impacts of artificial intelligence development on Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law" (Helsinki, 26-27 February 2019) and the cultural sector's contribution to it;
- emphasise arts' and culture's important role in the debate about artificial intelligence and as vectors in generating the social intelligence and emancipation to accompany new life practices marked by increasing human-machine interaction and hence the pertinence of the Committee's work on culture, digitisation and AI;
- welcome the production of a reader on the Rijeka expert seminar on culture, creativity and artificial intelligence, for presentation at a subsequent CDCPP session.

III. Cultural policy review of the Republic of Moldova

The Ministry of Education, Culture and Research of the Republic of Moldova has asked for a Cultural Policy Peer Review to be carried out in 2019 on the topic of "culture industries and regional development: maximizing the impact and building a new sustainable model".

The Cultural Policy Peer Review aims at:

1. identifying policy options and measurement indicators to help local and regional governments to increase the development impact of culture and participation, and conceive new ways to measure the impact of culture and migration on local development so as to effectively channel public and private funding;
2. identifying good practices – examples of "what works" and "what doesn't" to maximize the impacts; creating linkages between the cultural institutions and the local economy and social fabric; implications for a wide spectrum of policies ranging from culture and tourism to employment and skills, business development, innovation and spatial planning;
3. proposing recommendations for policies in the area of culture and cultural industries, employment and skills, business development, IT, innovation and spatial planning;
4. proposing new governance arrangements and funding models and looking at how work is organised within cultural institutions, including human resources and funding.

An expert visit will take place from 1-4 September in Moldova with Peer Reviewers from Estonia, Georgia and Germany, and a lead expert from Belgium.

Action required

The CDCPP is invited to:

- note the forthcoming targeted cultural policy peer review in the Republic of Moldova in the framework of the Council of Europe programme of policy reviews and legal assistance to member States in the fields of culture and heritage;
- notify the Committee and the Secretariat of any interest in having a Policy Peer Review exercise undertaken in individual countries.

IV. Progress report on the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends

Regarding the first five months of 2019, the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends can report on the following developments:

On the current Culturalpolicies.net-website:

- A special section for short cultural policy profiles was implemented on Culturalpolicies.net in January.
- The Spanish cultural policy profile – the first to be written along the lines of the new methodological grid – was published on Culturalpolicies.net in February.
- In February, updates of statistics regarding cultural prices were included on the website,
- As well as an update on cultural prices in Europe (The Cupix), as provided by the Compendium's Expert Authors.
- In April, a report on developments in public funding of culture in Europe during the period 2004-2017 was uploaded.

Regarding the renewal of Culturalpolicies.net:

- Last April, a team of three developers started working on the renewal of Culturalpolicies.net. The renewed platform will provide the navigational ease that internet users in this day and age expect and require. The updated layout will also convey the vast amount of information the website has to offer much more clearly and include news items, that will invite visitors to explore the platform further. The launch is scheduled for the autumn of this year; September being the target month.

Regarding the updating of Cultural Policy profiles:

- The following cultural policy profiles will be updated before or during the Summer: Austria, Bulgaria, Germany, the Netherlands, Scotland and the United Kingdom.
- At least six other country profiles are scheduled to be updated before the end of the year: Denmark, Estonia, Ireland, Latvia, Malta and Romania.

On the Compendium Association's memberships:

- In 2019, two councils joined the Compendium association as Stakeholder Members: **The Arts Council Malta** and the **Lithuanian Council of Culture**
- The Italian **Associazione per L'Economia della Cultura** and the **Estonian Academy of Music and Theatre** became Standing members of the Association, which means they will provide their cultural policy updates as in kind contributions.

Update on the Compendium's annual Assembly in Paris (June 5-6):

- The theme of this year's Compendium Assembly is *Imagining the Cultural Policy future*, during which topics such as the value of culture, sustainability and lessons for CP future (derived from our monitoring work in the past) will be discussed. The opening day will take place at the home of this year's host: the French Ministry of Culture.
- The new director of the Boekman Foundation (the Compendium's Service Provider), Jan Jaap Knol, will be present during all the Assembly days to meet with the Association's communities of members and authors.
- The Association's second General Assembly meeting will take place in the morning of the 6th at the INHA (Institut national d'histoire de l'art) and is open to both existing and aspiring members of the Compendium Association. (Please contact office@culturalpolicies.net if you wish to attend).
- The Assembly is followed by the Public Forum at 'Sciences Po, amphithéâtre Émile Boutmy' on June 7th. The theme of this day is the territorial dimension of cultural policies in the digital age, which will be discussed during two round tables. The day is open to the general public. Registrations can be made through [this link](#).

Action required

The CDCPP is invited to:

- Thank the Executive Director of the Compendium Association for her comprehensive report at the CDCPP plenary session;
- welcome the developments regarding the new Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends;
- invite member States and interested cultural policy research institutions to become Stakeholder members of the new Association and encourage interested parties to attend the 2019 Compendium Assembly (inform: office@culturalpolicies.net);
- thank the French government for hosting the second Assembly of the Association of the Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends on 5-6 June 2019 in the framework of its Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.

V. Follow-up to the Council of Europe's Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy (IFCD)

Following suspension of the work on the Council of Europe's IFCD, linked to a decision on budget cuts by the Committee of Ministers in April 2018¹, efforts have aimed at consolidating the existing IFCD project, so as to limit the loss of previous investments and ensure that other interested parties can optimally use the related tools.

In this respect, the following activities were carried out:

- a complete update of the Policy Maker's Guidebook to be launched in spring as the second edition of the online publication;
(see <https://www.coe.int/en/web/culture-and-heritage/indicators-culture-and-democracy>);
- production of a comprehensive report that traces the methodological development of the IFCD from 2013 to 2017;
- production of a report on the IFCD transfer workshop of November 2018² and
- agreement on the legal aspects related to the transfer of the IFCD project to the University of Administrative Sciences of Speyer, drawn up by the Council of Europe's Legal Advice Department in March 2019.

The opportunity arose for the University of Speyer to apply, in a Consortium with other leading European Research Institutions, for a Horizon2020 funded grant (under TRANSFORMATIONS-08: The societal value of culture and the impact of cultural policies in Europe). The suggested research project "DNA Culture" will focus on generating new data and quantitative indicators, thereby building on existing indicator frameworks, i.e. the IFCD, and developing an integrated data platform which will openly share the data and knowledge generated.

¹ This preceded the launch of the SG's 2018 Report on the State of Democracy, Human Rights and the Rule of Law in May that quotes IFCD findings in Chapter V, Inclusive Societies:

"According to analyses carried out by the Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy (IFCD) in 2017 where people are more involved in cultural life, especially by creating or performing art and participating in cultural activities, confidence in political institutions such as parliaments, government and the judiciary tends to be higher. Trust in the governing system goes along with individuals' feelings of security, which might free people to participate in cultural activities and create. Moreover, participation in cultural life strengthens an individual's feeling of belonging to the system, and thus engenders greater trust in its institutions. Participation in cultural life thrives under conditions of what could be called "good governance". Analysis of the IFCD data in 2017 shows that levels of cultural participation are higher where judicial impartiality and independence, quality of the legal system, transparency, and government checks and balances are stronger."

² The transfer from the Hertie School of Governance to the University of Administrative Science Speyer became necessary due to lack of resources at the Hertie School to carry the project forward.

The Council of Europe supported the application and will follow the project with interest should it be awarded a grant. This would allow the IFCD to be kept alive in a useful context and in line with the ambitions of the Council of Europe Conference of Ministers of Culture of 2013 that initiated the work on an Indicator Framework on Culture and Democracy.

The Compendium Association has joined the "DNA Culture" Research Consortium and it is expected that that this step will allow further synergies, eventually benefiting researchers and policy makers alike in their quest to showcase the societal value of culture and the impact of cultural policies in Europe.

Action required

The CDCPP is invited to:

- take note of the developments regarding the IFCD and underline the importance of the project in demonstrating the societal and political value of culture to governments and other stakeholders.