



# Spain and the European Social Charter —

#### Signatures, ratifications and accepted provisions

Spain ratified the European Social Charter on 06/05/1980 and the Revised European Social Charter on 17/05/2021, accepting all of its 98 paragraphs.

Spain signed the Additional Protocol of 1995 providing for a system of collective complaints on 04/02/2021 and ratified it on 17/05/2021.

#### The Charter in domestic law

Automatic incorporation into domestic law in accordance with Article 96(1) of the Constitution.

#### **Table of Accepted Provisions**

1.1	1.2	1.3	1.4	2.1	2.2	2.3	2.4	2.5	2.6	2.7	3.1
3.2	3.3	3.4	4.1	4.2	4.3	4.4	4.5	5	6.1	6.2	6.3
6.4	7.1	7.2	7.3	7.4	7.5	7.6	7.7	7.8	7.9	7.10	8.1
8.2	8.3	8.4	8.5	9	10.1	10.2	10.3	10.4	10.5	11.1	11.2
11.3	12.1	12.2	12.3	12.4	13.1	13.2	13.3	13.4	14.1	14.2	15.1
15.2	15.3	16	17.1	17.2	18.1	18.2	18.3	18.4	19.1	19.2	19.3
19.4	19.5	19.6	19.7	19.8	19.9	19.10	19.11	19.12	20	21	22
23	24	25	26.1	26.2	27.1	27.2	27.3	28	29	30	31.1
31.2	31.3						Grey = accepted provisions				

# Monitoring the implementation of the European Social Charter <sup>1</sup>

# I. Collective complaints procedure <sup>2</sup>

# **Collective complaints (under examination)**

Confederación Intersindical Galega (CIG) v. Spain (Complaint No. 231/2023) The complaint was registered on 3 October 2023.

Federación de Servicios a la Ciudadanía de Comisiones Obreras Región de Murcia (FSC-CCOO) v. Spain (Complaint No. 229/2023)

The complaint was registered on 31 July 2023.

Comisiones Obreras de Castilla y León (CCOO CyL) and Unión General de Trabajadores de Castilla y León (UGT CyL) v. Spain (Complaint No. 228/2023)

The complaint was registered on 6 June 2023.

*Unión Federal de Policía (UFP) v. Spain (Complaint No. 225/2023)* The complaint was registered on 30 May 2023.

European Organisation of Military Associations and Trade Unions (EUROMIL) v. Spain (Complaint No. 219/2022) The Committee <u>declared</u> the complaint admissible on 12 September 2023.

Confederación Sindical de Comisiones Obreras (CCOO) v. Spain (Complaint No. 218/2022) The Committee declared the complaint admissible on 4 July 2023.

*Unión General de Trabajadores (UGT) v. Spain (Complaint No. 207/2022)* The Committee declared the complaint admissible on 14 September 2022.

Defence for Children International (DCI), European Federation of National Organisations working with the Homeless (FEANTSA), Magistrats Européens pour la Démocratie et les Libertés (MEDEL), Confederación Sindical de Comisiones Obreras and International Movement ATD Fourth World v. Spain (Complaint No. 206/2022) The Committee <u>declared</u> the complaint admissible on 19 October 2022 and unanimously decided that it was necessary to indicate immediate measures to the Government.

Further information on the <u>procedures</u> may be found on the <u>HUDOC database</u> and in the <u>Digest of the case law of the</u> Committee.

 $<sup>^1</sup>$  The European Committee of Social Rights ("the Committee") monitors compliance with the Charter under two procedures, the reporting system and the collective complaints procedure, according to Rule 2 of the Committee's rules: « 1. The Committee rules on the conformity of the situation in States with the European Social Charter, the 1988 Additional Protocol and the Revised European Social Charter. 2. It adopts conclusions through the framework of the reporting procedure and decisions under the collective complaints procedure ».

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Detailed information on the Collective Complaints Procedure is available on the <u>relevant webpage</u>.

# II. Reporting system<sup>3</sup>

# **Reports submitted by Spain**

Between 1982 and 2024, Spain has submitted 34 reports on the application of the 1961 Charter and 2 reports on the application of the Revised Charter.

The  $1^{\text{st}}$  report, which was submitted on 16/01/2023, concerns the accepted provisions relating to thematic group 4 "Children, families and migrants" (Articles 7, 8, 16, 17, 16, 19, 27 and 31).

Conclusions with respect to these provisions have been published in March 2024.

On 20 December 2023, an ad hoc report on the cost-of-living crisis was submitted by Spain<sup>4</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Detailed information on the Reporting System is available on the relevant webpage. The reports submitted by States Parties may be consulted in the relevant section.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In accordance with the <u>decision of the Ministers' Deputies</u> adopted on 27 September 2022 concerning the <u>new system</u> for the presentation of reports under the European Social Charter, the European Committee of Social Rights and the Governmental Committee have decided to request an *ad hoc* report on the cost-of-living crisis to all State parties.

# Situations of non-conformity 5

#### Thematic Group 1 "Employment, training and equal opportunities" - Conclusions XXII-1 (2020)

► Article 1§1 - Right to work - Policy of full employment
Employment policy efforts have not been adequate in combatting unemployment and promoting job creation.

► Article 1§4 – Right to work – Vocational guidance, training and rehabilitation

It has not been established that the right of adult workers to vocational training and retraining is guaranteed.

► Article 10§3 – Right to vocational training – Vocational training and retraining of adult workers

It is not established that the right of adult workers to vocational training and retraining is guaranteed.

#### Thematic Group 2 "Health, social security and social protection" - Conclusions XXII-2 (2021)

- ▶ Article 3§2 Right to safe and healthy working conditions Enforcement of safety and health regulations
- The measures taken to reduce the number of accidents at work are insufficient;
- Occupational diseases are not monitored effectively.

► Article 12§1 – Right to social security - Existence of a social security system The minimum level of unemployment benefit is not adequate.

► Article 12§4 – Right to social security - Social security of persons moving between states

The length of residence requirement (10 years) for entitlement to non-contributory old-age pension is excessive.

► Article 13§1 – Right to social and medical assistance - Adequate assistance for every person in need

- Minimum income eligibility is subject to a length of residence requirement in the majority of Autonomous Communities;
- Minimum income eligibility is subject to age requirements;
- Minimum income is not paid for as long as the need persists;
- The level of social assistance paid to a single person is not adequate.

▶ Article 4 of the 1988 Additional Protocol - Right of the elderly to social protection

- The level of the non-contributory pension is manifestly inadequate;
- It has not been established that there are adequate and affordable health care programmes available to older persons.

#### Thematic Group 3 "Labour rights" - Conclusions XXII-3 (2022)

► Article 2§1 – Right to just conditions of work - right to reasonable working time

The maximum weekly working time may exceed 60 hours in flexible working time arrangements and for certain categories of workers.

► Article 2§3 – Right to just conditions of work – Annual holiday with pay

Not all employees have the right to take at least two weeks of uninterrupted holiday during the year.

▶ Article 2§4 - Right to just conditions of work - Elimination of risks in dangerous or unhealthy occupations
It has not been established that all workers performing dangerous or unhealthy work are entitled to appropriate compensation measures, such as reduced working hours or additional paid leave.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Further information on the situations of non-conformity is available on the HUDOC database.

- ► Article 4§1 Right to a fair remuneration Decent remuneration
- It has not been established that the minimum wage in the private sector can ensure a decent standard of living;
- It has not been established that the minimum wage in the public sector can ensure a decent standard of living.
- ► Article 4§2 Right to a fair remuneration- Increased remuneration for overtime work

  Increased remuneration or an increased compensatory time-off for overtime work is not guaranteed.
- ► Article 4§4 Right to a fair remuneration Reasonable notice of termination of employment There is no notice period for workers on probation.
- ► Article 6§2 Right to bargain collectively Negotiation procedures

  National legislation permits employers unilaterally not to apply conditions agreed in collective agreements.
- ► Article 6§4 Right to bargain collectively Collective action
- Legislation authorises the Government to impose arbitration to end a strike in cases which go beyond the limits set by Article 31 of the 1961 Charter;
- The police are denied the right to strike.

#### Thematic Group 4 "Children, families, migrants" – Conclusions 2023

- ► Article 7§5 Right of children and young persons to protection Fair pay
- Young workers' wages are not fair;
- Apprentices' allowances are not appropriate.
- ► Article 7§9 Right of children and young persons to protection Regular medical examination
  Young workers under 18 years of age employed in occupations prescribed by national laws or regulations are not subject to regular medical control.
- ► Article 8§2 Right of employed women to protection Illegality of dismissal during maternity leave
- The grounds for dismissing an employee during pregnancy or maternity leave go beyond the permissible exceptions.
- I reinstatement proves impossible a judge may not award adequate compensation to compensate for all loss suffered.
- ► Article 16 Right of the family to social, legal and economic protection access to family benefits is not guaranteed because of the excessive length of residence requirement;
- Child benefit does not provide a significant extra income;
- Family allowances do not cover a significant number of families.
- ► Article 17§1 Right of children and young persons to social, legal and economic protection Assistance, education and training
- The rate of children at risk of poverty is too high;
- Bone testing is used to assess the age of children in irregular migration situation;
- Immediate expulsion of children in an irregular migration situation can be carried out by the authorities without providing them with any assistance;
- The length of pre-trial detention of children is excessive.
- ► Article 19§6 Right of migrant workers and their families to protection and assistance Family reunion Social benefits are excluded from the calculation of the necessary financial means (for first time applications).

▶ Article 19§10 - Right of migrant workers and their families to protection and assistance - Equal treatment for the self-employed

The grounds of non-conformity under Articles 19§6, 19§8, 19§9 and 19§12 apply also to self-employed migrant workers.

► Article 19§12 – Right of migrant workers and their families to protection and assistance - Teaching mother tongue of migrant

The teaching of the migrant worker's mother tongue to the children of the migrant worker is not adequately promoted and facilitated for all migrants.

► Article 27§1 – Right of workers with family responsibilities to equal opportunity and treatment - Participation in working life

The absence from work during parental leave is not taken into account for the calculation or determination of pension rights.

► Article 27§2 – Right of workers with family responsibilities to equal opportunity and treatment - Parental leave

Parental leave is not remunerated.

► Article 27§3 – Right of workers with family responsibilities to equal opportunity and treatment - Illegality of dismissal on the ground of family responsibilities

There are ceilings on the amount of damages that may be awarded to workers with family responsibilities following dismissal.

The Committee also considered that the failure to provide requested information on Articles 7§3, 7§5, 7§8, 7§10, 16, 17§1, 19§6, 19§8 and 19§9 amounts to a breach by Spain of its reporting obligations under Article C of the Charter.

## The Committee has been unable to assess compliance with the following provisions:

# Thematic Group 1 "Employment, training and equal opportunities"

```
▶ Article 1§2 - Conclusions XXII-1 (2020)
▶ Article 15§1 - Conclusions XXII-1 (2020)
▶ Article 15§2 - Conclusions XXII-1 (2020)
```

## Thematic Group 2 "Health, social security and social protection"

```
►Article 3§1 - Conclusions XXII-2 (2021)
►Article 11§1 - Conclusions XXII-2 (2021)
►Article 11§3 - Conclusions XXII-2 (2021)
►Article 12§3 - Conclusions XXII-2 (2021)
```

# Thematic Group 3 "Labour rights"

►Article 5 - Conclusions XXII-3 (2022)
►Article 6§3 - Conclusions XXII-3 (2022)
►Article 3 of the Additional

Protocol

Thematic Group 4 "Children, families, migrants"

-

# II. Examples of progress achieved in the implementation of rights under the Charter

(non-exhaustive list)

#### Thematic Group 1 "Employment, training and equal opportunities"

- ► Since 2006 when the Organic Law of Education entered into force a total of 148 vocational education qualifications have been developed of which 108 were developed during 2011-2014.
- ▶Royal Decree 10/2011 of 26 August 2011 on urgent measures to promote youth employment, support job stability and maintain vocational retraining programmes for those who have exhausted their unemployment benefits is aimed at improving the skills of young people.

# Thematic Group 2 "Health, social security and social protection"

- ▶Law No. 3/2012 of 6 July 2012 on urgent measures for the reform of the labour market has been adopted. According to the report, Section 13 of the Law defines "teleworking" as work where the work activity is carried out primarily in the worker's home or in a place chosen freely by the worker, as an alternative to being physically present at the company's work centre. The Law recognises that teleworkers have the right to suitable protection in relation to safety and health.
- ▶The new Law No. 23/2015 of 21 July 2015 on the regulation of the Labour and Social Security System Inspectorate (ITSS) which repeals and replaces Law No. 42/1997 of 14 November 1997. The new law features several innovations in that it assigns new powers to sub-inspectors in relation to the prevention of occupational risks and creates a labour and social security inspectorate as a body which is independent of the national administration of the state or the regulation of a national body to tackle undeclared work, illegal employment and social security fraud as a specialised department of the ITSS. The law also governs the functions and powers of the ITSS, the remit, its organisation and its co-operation with other institutions. It explicitly recognises protection for its staff, including against acts of violence, compulsion, threats or illegal influence aimed at its inspectors and sub-inspectors.
- ▶The new Labour, Social Security and Occupational Health Sub-inspectors Service strengthens the functions of the ITSS in terms of overseeing and monitoring the application of regulations concerning the prevention of occupational risks. In particular, this Service is responsible for verifying or checking the application of regulations which directly involve physical working conditions (situations as regards safety, health and hygiene at work), preventative actions according to the analysis of the rate of accidents at work, and information and assistance for businesses and workers.
- ▶The integration into the general social security scheme of the special scheme for domestic staff and the special agricultural scheme (Act 27/2011 of 1 August 2011, Act 28/2011 of 22 September 2011, Royal Legislative Decree 29/2012 of 28 December 2012), and of clergy belonging to the Spanish federation of evangelical churches (Royal Decree 839/2015 of 21 September 2015, implementing the European Court of Human Rights judgment of 3 April 2012, final on 3 July 2012, in the case of Manzanas Martin, application No. 17966/10).
- ▶ Measures to authorise persons, under certain conditions, to combine receipt of a retirement pension with certain forms of employment (Royal Legislative Decree 5/2013 of 15 March 2013).
- ▶ Measures to assist the self-employed, including reductions in and rebates on their contributions (Royal Legislative Decree 4/2013 of 22 February 2013; Act 14/2013 of 27 September 2013; Act 25/2015 of 28 July 2015).
- ▶Reduced employer contributions under measures to promote business creation and youth employment (Act 11/2013 of 26 July 2013), and the employability of workers in general (Royal Legislative Decree 16/2013 of 20

December 2013; Royal Decree 3/2014 of 28 February 2014; Royal Legislative Decree 8/2014 of 4 July 2014; Royal Decree 637/2014 of 25 July 2014).

- ► Measures to protect part-time workers (Royal Legislative Decree 11/2012 of 2 August 2012; Act 1/2014 of 28 February 2014).
- ► A special agreement to assist persons with disabilities (Royal Decree 1567/2013 of 1 March 2013).

#### Thematic Group 3 "Labour rights"

- ▶The Royal Decree 299/2016 on the protection of health and safety for workers who face the risks of exposure to electromagnetic fields, further strengthened the specific protection, in addition to the general Law No. 31/1995 on the prevention of occupational risks.
- ▶In the field of public administrations, Spain signed on 21 December 2015 the "Framework Agreement on information and consultation rights for central governments administrations". The Sectorial Social Dialogue Committee for Central Government Administrations signed a social partner agreement on common minimum standards of information and consultation rights for central administration workers in matters of restructuring, work-life balance, working time and occupational health and safety.
- ▶The Royal Decree 1084/2014 of 19 December 2014 amending the Royal Decree 67/2010 of 29 January 2010 on the adaptation of the legislation on the prevention of occupational risks to the general administration of the State has intervened to amend the legislation on the participation of workers in the determination and improvement of working conditions. This amendment is essentially in response to the decision of the General Bargaining Committee of the General State Administration, adopted on October 29, 2012, regarding the allocation of resources to the bargaining and participation structures and the streamlining of these structures. The decision concerns on the one hand the election of the delegates to the prevention and the credits of hours which they benefit and, on the other hand, the committees of safety and health at work, which must adapt, except in the cases provided for in the said royal decree, to the new definition of "workplace" according to which it constitutes the new electoral unit.

The agreement of the General Negotiating Committee of the General State Administration is also at the origin of the provisions contained in Royal Decree-Law 20/2012 of 23 July 2012 adopting measures to guarantee budgetary stability and to encourage competitiveness. Specifically, Article 10 of this text designates the General Negotiating Committees as the responsible bodies for agreements in this area, in particular as regards the exercise of representational and negotiating functions.

#### Thematic Group 4 "Children, families, migrants"

- Section 38§3 of the Workers' Statute was amended through the Royal Decree-Law No. 3/2012. Under the new provision, if the holiday period coincides with a temporary incapacity resulting from pregnancy, childbirth or breastfeeding that prevents the worker from enjoying it fully or partially during the calendar year to which the holiday relates, the worker may take the holiday once the incapacity is over and provided that not more than eighteen months have passed from the end of the year in which the holiday was accrued.
- ► Section 6 of Royal Decree No. 1621/2011 has extended to domestic workers the right provided under Section 37 of the Workers' Statute.