

Լեզու

limbă

# SIXTH EVALUATION REPORT ON SLOVENIA

nyelv

γλώσσα

Committee of Experts of  
the European Charter  
for Regional or  
Minority Languages

ЯЗИК

cànan

ġiöll

språk

Adopted on 19 March 2025

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a state party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the state and, where appropriate, to encourage the party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the state to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the state concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the state in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each state for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the state, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the state in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the state concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective state party for possible comments within a given deadline. A confidential dialogue may, at this stage, be requested by this state party. The final evaluation report is made public, together with the comments, if any, which the authorities of the state party may have made. This document is then transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for the adoption of its recommendations to the state party, on the basis of the proposals for recommendations contained in the evaluation report.

MIN-LANG(2025)3

Published on 11 June 2025

Secretariat of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages  
Council of Europe  
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex  
France

[www.coe.int/minlang](http://www.coe.int/minlang)

## CONTENTS

<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Slovenia – Recent developments and trends .....</b>	<b>6</b>
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Slovenia .....	6
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Slovenia .....	15
<b>Chapter 2 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>2.1 Croatian.....</b>	<b>24</b>
2.1.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Croatian .....	24
2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Croatian in Slovenia .....	25
<b>2.2 German.....</b>	<b>26</b>
2.2.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German .....	26
2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Slovenia .....	27
<b>2.3 Hungarian .....</b>	<b>28</b>
2.3.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian .....	28
2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Slovenia.....	32
<b>2.4 Italian.....</b>	<b>33</b>
2.4.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian .....	33
2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Slovenia.....	37
<b>2.5 Romani .....</b>	<b>38</b>
2.5.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani .....	38
2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Slovenia .....	39
<b>2.6 Serbian .....</b>	<b>40</b>
2.6.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian .....	40
2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Slovenia .....	41
<b>Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.....</b>	<b>42</b>
<b>Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification.....</b>	<b>43</b>

<b>Appendix II: Comments from the Slovenian authorities .....</b>	<b>45</b>
---	-----------

## Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Slovenia in 2001 and applies to the following languages: Croatian, German, Italian, Hungarian, Romani and Serbian.

Hungarian and Italian continue to enjoy a relatively high level of protection and measures are taken by the authorities to support the implementation of the existing legal framework. However, the Slovenian legal framework still makes no provision for the recognition of Croatian, German and Serbian as traditional minority languages, which are covered by Part II of the Charter.

Bilingual education in Hungarian and Slovenian, as well as education in Italian are provided at all levels of education apart from university. There is a legal basis for an extensive use of Hungarian and Italian, which are official along with Slovenian in certain areas and are used to a certain extent in courts and administration. Together with the Hungarian and Italian national communities in 2022 Offices for Bilingualism were set up, tasked with supporting and monitoring the use of these languages in public life. This is a development to be welcomed. As regards media, since 2021 additional funds have been granted to remedy the staff situation for the Hungarian and Italian radio and television programmes. Some legal obligations for the use of Hungarian and Italian exist also in the economic sector.

Certain shortcomings remain, however, when it comes to the use of these languages in practice. A shortage of professionals with an adequate language proficiency is increasingly affecting areas such as education, courts, administration or media. A more pro-active approach from the authorities and further organisational measures are needed to facilitate the use of Hungarian and Italian in administration. There are concerns regarding the impact of the restructurings and savings which need to be made by the public broadcaster, in particular when it comes to the Italian language programmes.

As regards Romani, afternoon lessons have been provided since 2021 as part of a pilot project at two schools, but so far there is no regular teaching of or in this language. Romani is present to some extent in the media.

There is a need to raise awareness in Slovenian society about the regional or minority languages, their history and cultures as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia, in mainstream education and in the mass media.

This sixth evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Slovenia in October 2024.

## **Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Slovenia – Recent developments and trends**

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its states parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. Slovenia signed the Charter on 3 July 1997 and ratified it on 4 October 2000. The Charter entered into force in Slovenia on 1 January 2001. It applies to the following languages: Croatian, German, Hungarian, Italian, Romani and Serbian. Croatian, German and Serbian are covered by Part II (Article 7), Romani is covered by Part II as a non-territorial language, whereas Hungarian and Italian receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).

2. States parties are required to submit reports every five years<sup>1</sup> on the implementation of the Charter. On 16 October 2023, the authorities of Slovenia submitted their sixth periodical report.<sup>2</sup> This sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report, additional information received from the authorities and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (1-4 October 2024) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16.2 of the Charter. The periodical report submitted by Slovenia contained very little information on the implementation of the Charter. The replies to the additional questions of the Committee of Experts were transmitted with a serious delay. The lack of information and the delay hampered the monitoring process. The Committee of Experts highlights the importance of submitting comprehensive and timely information for the monitoring process of the Charter, in accordance with the prescribed outline.<sup>3</sup> During the on-the-spot visit gender balance was taken into account.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in Slovenia and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the Slovenian authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the fifth monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of Slovenia in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the Slovenian authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Slovenia, as provided in Article 16.4 of the Charter. The Committee of Experts encourages the Slovenian authorities to translate this report into the regional or minority languages with a view to supporting the authorities, organisations, advisory bodies and persons concerned in the process of fully implementing the Charter, in accordance with Articles 6 and 7.4.

4. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to Slovenia in October 2024. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 19 March 2025.

### **1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Slovenia**

5. Slovenia’s legal framework continues to show a different approach to the constitutionally recognised “autochthonous Italian and Hungarian national communities” (Article 5, Article 64), to the

---

<sup>1</sup> Article 15.1 of the Charter provides that states parties submit periodical reports every three years. However, following the entry into force of the reform of the monitoring mechanism of the ECRML on 1 July 2019, states parties are now to submit their reports every five years instead of every three years. See Committee of Ministers Decisions “Strengthening the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages” (CM/Del/Dec(2018)1330/10.4e, para. 1.a.).

<sup>2</sup> [MIN-LANG \(2023\) PR 10](#)

<sup>3</sup> [Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties.](#)

“Roma community”, which is also recognised in the Constitution (Article 65) and to the other minority communities, including Croatian, German and Serbian, which results in a different level of protection and promotion of their languages.

6. The Hungarian and Italian languages continue to benefit from high legal protection in specifically defined areas (“ethnically mixed areas”<sup>4</sup>) and steps have been taken to support the implementation of the relevant legal framework. A Programme of Measures of the Government for the Implementation of Regulations on the Exercise of the Rights of the Italian and Hungarian National Communities in Slovenia was adopted for the years 2021–2025, and includes, for example, measures to improve the linguistic competences of teachers in the Hungarian and Italian minority language education. Co-operation agreements between the members of the National Assembly for the Italian and Hungarian national communities and the Government, concluded for the years 2020–2022 and subsequently for the years 2023–2026, are also used to address practical issues, such as further development of the education system, improvement of Italian language proficiency in the social environment or securing the number of journalists and other staff of the Hungarian and Italian language media. Nevertheless, shortcomings are noticeable in the use of Hungarian and Italian in practice in various fields. Insufficient language proficiency has been reported as increasingly problematic when recruiting staff in the fields of education, courts, administration and media. Funding of cultural activities is an issue of concern, despite recent increase to cover inflation. Moreover, repeated references have been made during the on-the-spot visit to the implementation of the 2004 Act on the Public Use of Slovenian and the way it interacts with the protection of Hungarian and Italian (see also below paras. 34 and 55).

7. As regards Romani, it is regrettable that there is still no teaching of Romani as a subject in mainstream education. Funding also appears as problematic, as it is based on an annual call for projects, which is different to the structured funding applied to Hungarian and Italian. Moreover, social tensions in Dolenjska region,<sup>5</sup> which were recent at the time of the on-the-spot visit, are feared to have an impact on the Roma community in the entire country.

### ***Application of the Charter to Croatian, German and Serbian***

8. The application of Part II to Croatian, German and Serbian has been addressed by the Committee of Experts since the first monitoring cycle and has been supported by recommendations of the Committee of Ministers. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers reiterated the recommendation to the Slovenian authorities to **recognise Croatian, German and Serbian as minority languages traditionally spoken in Slovenia and apply the provisions of Part II to these languages, in co-operation with the speakers**. However, the Slovenian authorities have not implemented this recommendation and continue not to apply Part II for these languages.

9. The Committee of Experts noted in its monitoring that Croatian, German and Serbian have been used in the present territory of Slovenia for centuries and are, therefore, traditionally used in the country.<sup>6</sup> Thereby, they are protected by Part II of the Charter in the areas where they have been traditionally used, in accordance with Article 2.1 of the Charter, which provides that “each Party undertakes to apply the provisions of Part II to all the regional or minority languages spoken within its territory, and which comply with the definition of Article 1”.

10. The lack of recognition of Croatian, German and Serbian as traditionally used minority languages in a system based on the constitutional recognition of the Hungarian and Italian “national communities” and of the Roma “community”, although at different levels, is the basic obstacle to the implementation of

<sup>4</sup> These are parts of municipalities where the respective national communities live, designated in the statutes of the municipalities and referred to as “ethnically mixed areas”.

<sup>5</sup> See, for example, reports of RTV Slovenija, such as [Poklukar: Razmere na Kočevskem niso varnostno najboljše - RTV SLO](#), [Kako rešiti napetosti med Romi in večinskimi prebivalstvom na jugovzhodu Slovenije? - RTV SLO](#).

<sup>6</sup> The Slovenian authorities have referred to these minority communities as “historical ethnical or national minorities”, “autochthonous minority communities” e.g. 4<sup>th</sup> periodical report on the Charter MIN-LANG (2013) PR 04, “autochthonous peoples” and “historical ethnic groups in Slovenia”, e.g. in their fourth state report on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, ACFC/SR/IV(2017)001, p. 7 and in their first state report on the Framework Convention, ACFC/SR(2000)4, p. 28.

the Part II provisions concerning these languages. The Slovenian legal framework, policy and practice consider only Hungarian, Italian and Romani as minority languages in the country.

11. In the absence of recognition as traditionally used minority languages, the level of protection and support of these languages is below the requirements of the Charter. This is the case, for example, of Article 7.1.f, which requires “appropriate forms and means for the teaching and study of regional or minority languages” and implies, *inter alia*, the development of a specific educational model covering all levels of education and which takes the traditional character of the given language into account, including by covering the local culture which is reflected by the language.<sup>7</sup> Croatian, German and Serbian do not currently benefit from such measures. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the Charter requires its states parties to recognise regional or minority languages as an expression of cultural wealth (Article 7.1.a) and stresses the need for resolute action to promote them (Article 7.1.c). As the Committee of Experts has pointed out on several occasions concerning Slovenia and other states parties, Article 7.1.a aims at an explicit recognition of the given language in the domestic legal order.<sup>8</sup> “Resolute action” (Article 7.1.c) also requires a legal framework for the promotion of regional or minority languages in public life as well as the establishment of bodies responsible for such promotion, in co-operation with the speakers, and the provision of adequate financial resources.<sup>9</sup> Currently, this is not the case for Croatian, German and Serbian. It should be noted that the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and the Committee of Ministers also called on the authorities to strengthen the legal protection of the German-speaking ethnic group and the Croatian and Serbian national communities, among others, and to consider granting them access to constitutionally protected national minority rights.<sup>10</sup>

12. In 2024, the Act regulating the Exercise of the Cultural Rights of Members of National Communities of the Peoples of the Former Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia in the Republic of Slovenia was adopted, after previous similar efforts had failed.<sup>11</sup> The law applies to the members of Albanian, Bosnian, Croatian, Macedonian, Montenegrin and Serbian national communities of the peoples of the Former Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (SFRY), who reside in Slovenia.<sup>12</sup> It lists cultural rights (the right to preserve and develop their identity, to foster culture, to preserve cultural heritage, to preserve their own cultural and social history, to use their native language and script, to create and disseminate media programme content, to publish their works “and other cultural rights”), which are to be realised through projects. The Ministry of Culture is tasked with conducting a public call for co-financing cultural projects of cultural societies of these national communities (currently carried out in the framework of the Public Fund for Cultural Activities) and defining the status of the representative organisations. The law also regulates the functioning of Council of the Government of the Republic of Slovenia for Affairs of Members of the National Communities of Peoples of the former SFRY in the Republic of Slovenia (hereafter, the Council for the National Communities of the Former SFRY). This becomes a permanent consultative body and will be supported in its functioning by the Ministry of Culture; the General Secretariat of the Government will provide the financial and material conditions. The law further refers to the cultural rights in the field of primary and secondary education, to be implemented by the Ministry of Education. At the time of the on-the-spot visit, the implementation of the law had not started, with transitional periods of six months for the Ministry of Culture and one year as regards education.

13. As the exchanges during the on-the-spot visit, including with the authorities, confirmed, the law does not constitute a recognition of Croatian and Serbian as traditionally used minority languages. The

<sup>7</sup> See, for example, 5<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML(2019)17final, para.11, 4<sup>th</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML(2014)5, para. 65, 3<sup>rd</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML(2010)5, para 55.

<sup>8</sup> See, for example, 5<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML(2019)17final, para. 11, 4<sup>th</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML(2014)5, para. 36; 1<sup>st</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, ECRML(2001)2, para. 30; 7<sup>th</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts on Switzerland, MIN-LANG(2019)10, para. 20.

<sup>9</sup> See, for example, 5<sup>th</sup> report on Slovenia 2<sup>nd</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts on Germany, ECRML(2006)1, para. 24; 2<sup>nd</sup> Report of the Committee of Experts on Sweden, ECRML(2006)4, paragraph 28.

<sup>10</sup> See [Fifth Opinion on Slovenia](#), ACFC/OP/V(2021)9, para. 32, 52; [Resolution CM/ResCMN\(2022\)9](#) on the implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities by Slovenia, recommendation 4.

<sup>11</sup> [Zakon o uresničevanju kulturnih pravic pripadnikov narodnih skupnosti narodov nekdanje Socialistične federativne republike Jugoslavije v Republiki Sloveniji \(ZUKPPNS\) \(PISRS\)](#).

<sup>12</sup> Of these languages, only Croatian and Serbian have a traditional presence on the territory of Slovenia.

law appears to provide a more structured and stable basis to already existing activities or bodies, such as the Council for the National Communities of the former SFRY. It remains unclear whether there will be any impact in the field of education. On the whole, interlocutors during the visit indicated that the law does not bring fundamental change, although it can be seen as a step forward in addressing the situation of national communities of the former SFRY. The adoption of the law was accompanied by important debates, including proposals for referendum and questions about its constitutionality.<sup>13</sup>

14. As regards German, there has been no development since the evaluation of the recommendations for immediate action. The German-speakers developed further their proposals for the implementation of the Charter to German as a minority language, which contain inter alia the long-standing request for bilingual education, radio and television programmes, sufficient and structured funding, information about the history and culture in education and media, including an awareness raising campaign, adequate consultation. They are also interested in the application of certain provisions of Part III of the Charter. Although a special working group for permanent dialogue with representatives of the German speakers was set up in 2020<sup>14</sup> (hereafter, the working group for dialogue with the German speakers) continues to be in place, the discussions have led to no result about the recognition of German and the application of the Charter.

15. The Committee of Experts regrets that more than twenty years after the entry into force of the Charter in respect of Slovenia, no progress has been achieved as regards Croatian, German and Serbian. It considers that the adoption of the law concerning the national communities of the former SFRY indicates certain efforts by Slovenia to address the situation of communities other than Hungarian, Italian and Roma. Such momentum should be used to adequately address the issue of Croatian and Serbian as minority languages, in co-operation with the respective speakers. Furthermore, similar efforts to address the lack of recognition of German as a minority language should be undertaken.

### ***Respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages***

16. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Slovenian authorities **intensify measures to raise public awareness of the regional or minority languages in mainstream education and in the mass media**. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the way a regional or minority language is protected and promoted is also linked to its perception by majority language speakers. Therefore, awareness raising among the majority is of the utmost importance and requires constant efforts in both the educational and the media domains. The fundamental goal is for the majority population to value the fact that regional or minority language speakers form part of the linguistic and cultural heritage of the state with their different languages and cultures.<sup>15</sup> In this sense, Article 7.3 is a key provision of the Charter and education and media are the main means of promoting “respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages”.

17. According to the periodical report and additional information received from the authorities, respect for difference, knowledge and understanding of minority languages, the related culture and history belong to the general goals of education, pursuant to Article 2 of the 1996 Organisation and Financing of Education Act. This goal is pursued through the pre-school curriculum and through different subjects in primary and secondary education. In 2023 the National Institute for Education carried out an analysis on how these goals are integrated in the curricula of the relevant subjects at all levels of education. During

<sup>13</sup> See, for example, [SAZU: Zakon o uresničevanju kulturnih pravic pripadnikov narodnih skupnosti narodov nekdanje SFRJ ni v korist Sloveniji in njenim prebivalcem! | Demokracija na najdi.si novicah, https://www.rtvsllo.si/slovenija/referenduma-glede-kulturnih-pravic-za-pripadnike-narodnih-skupnosti-iz-nekdanjega-sfrj-a-ne-bo/704588](https://www.rtvsllo.si/slovenija/referenduma-glede-kulturnih-pravic-za-pripadnike-narodnih-skupnosti-iz-nekdanjega-sfrj-a-ne-bo/704588), STA: [Odbor za kulturo o predlogu referenduma o predlogu zakona o kulturnih pravicah narodov nekdanje SFRJ, Potrdili zakon, ki ureja kulturne pravice narodov iz nekdanje Jugoslavije - N1 \(n1info.si\)](https://www.rtvsllo.si/slovenija/referenduma-glede-kulturnih-pravic-za-pripadnike-narodnih-skupnosti-iz-nekdanjega-sfrj-a-ne-bo/704588), Državni svetniki predlagajo veto na zakon o pravicah manjšine iz nekdanje SFRJ - N1 (n1info.si), [The Slovenia Times](https://www.rtvsllo.si/slovenija/referenduma-glede-kulturnih-pravic-za-pripadnike-narodnih-skupnosti-iz-nekdanjega-sfrj-a-ne-bo/704588).

<sup>14</sup> See Evaluation by the Committee of Experts of the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action contained in the Committee of Experts' fifth evaluation report on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2021) 11, para. 20; the working group is established by each minister of culture and no funds are foreseen for its functioning.

<sup>15</sup> See, for example, 5<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para.13, 4<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovakia, ECRML (2016) 2, paragraph 69.

the on-the-spot visit the authorities informed the Committee of Experts that teaching about the Hungarian and Italian national minorities and their language is insufficient and they plan to improve this situation as part of the ongoing curricula reform. More details on the integration in different subjects could not be provided due to this ongoing process. Some information is provided also about the Roma minority. There does not seem to be such teaching about Croatian, German and Serbian.

18. As far as media are concerned, according to the periodical report, the public broadcaster *Radiotelevizija Slovenija* (RTV Slovenija) has the obligation to support through its programmes the dissemination of knowledge about other cultures in Slovenia and their representatives. It is not clear how this is done in practice. As already indicated in the previous evaluation report, the objectives of Article 7.3 mainly refer to awareness raising in the mainstream media throughout the country and thus cannot be achieved by programmes in minority languages only, such as those in Hungarian and Italian. In addition, the Ministry of Culture provides co-financing to projects in the field of media, based on annual public calls, with the aim “to support plurality and democratic nature of general news printed media, of radio and television programmes and of electronic publications, as well as to support the development of programmes of local, regional, student or non-profit radio or television channels”. Among co-financed local or regional media (the periodical report refers to five such projects co-financed in 2022), some address issues concerning the Italian, Hungarian or Romani speakers living in the area where the broadcaster is based. As confirmed during the on-the-spot by representatives of the speakers, the media programmes do not provide sufficient information to contribute to raising awareness and promoting understanding in relation to minority languages.

19. The representatives of the minority language speakers point to the insufficient awareness and appreciation in the society as a whole of their presence, history, language and culture.<sup>16</sup> Negative attitudes and stereotypes affect in particular the German, Italian and Romani speakers. Information received by the Committee of Experts indicates that education and media do not adequately and sufficiently raise awareness about the presence, history and culture reflected by Italian, nor about the activities organised by the Italian speakers. Adequate information about the Italian language, culture and history in Slovenia is lacking in the curricula and textbooks used in Slovenian schools, which also affects the schools teaching in Italian. In particular, it appears that a correct understanding of the historical presence of Italian is missing within the mainstream society, with the presence of the Italian speakers mainly perceived as a result of the Second World War. Such a lack of knowledge is noticed not only in various parts of the country, but also increasingly in the region where Italian is used. The historical narrative lacks multi-perspectivity and teachers do not seem to take into account the sensitivity of some topics. There are no historical studies or research on the traditional presence of Italian. There is still a tendency to present the Italian cultural heritage as local or Slovenian, without reference to Italian. A country-wide campaign promoting intercultural dialogue and national minorities as part of the cultural wealth is needed, in view of the Italian speakers. As far as German is concerned, the public discourse and media tend to discredit their efforts to be recognised as a national minority and to present them as a group of last “remnants”.<sup>17</sup> According to the Romani speakers, media reporting about them is often biased, as they focus on social and security issues and tend to exacerbate negative attitudes.<sup>18</sup>

20. The Committee of Experts strongly urges Slovenia to take decisive steps to promote awareness and tolerance about the regional or minority languages in Slovenia.<sup>19</sup> The authorities should raise the awareness of the general public in mainstream education, notably in the curricula, teaching materials and teacher training, regarding the traditional presence of the Croatian, German, Hungarian, Italian, Romani and Serbian languages and their contribution to Slovenian society. Media should be encouraged, without

<sup>16</sup> See also Fifth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, ACFC/OP/V(2021)9, para 91.

<sup>17</sup> See article in Delo, 15.07.2023, Neavtohtoni »Nemci« imajo zelo ambiciozne zahteve.

<sup>18</sup> See also Fifth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, ACFC/OP/V(2021)9, para 91.

<sup>19</sup> See 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para.18 4th report of the Committee of Experts on by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 99, 3<sup>rd</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2010) 5, paragraph 77. See [Fifth Opinion on Slovenia](#), ACFC/OP/V(2021)9, para.13; [Resolution CM/ResCMN\(2022\)9](#) on the implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities by Slovenia, recommendation 3.

prejudice to their independence, to pay more attention to these languages and cultures as integral parts of Slovenia's history and culture. In addition, awareness of regional or minority languages should be raised as a component and as an expected result of mainstream journalist training, as well as of teacher training. A country-wide dedicated campaign as suggested by some speakers could also be considered.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in education***

21. Bilingual education in Slovenian and Hungarian, as well as education in Italian continue to be organised in specifically defined areas. Romani is still not taught as a subject in mainstream education. There is still no model of teaching of Croatian, German or Serbian as regional or minority languages.

22. Overall, the authorities continue to take measures to support the Hungarian and Italian language education, and the representatives of the speakers show appreciation for the dialogue with the Ministry of Education. In 2023, more detailed rules have been adopted concerning the knowledge of Italian and Hungarian as languages of instruction for professional and other staff in education. Efforts have been made in translating or preparing textbooks, as well as translating curricula. A special task force for the Hungarian and Italian national communities continues to operate at the National Education Institute and provides advice and support. An additional adviser for Hungarian was hired in 2021. However, shortcomings remain in the implementation of minority language education, in particular as regards the bilingual model (see below, para 47).

23. Providing a sufficient number of teachers for bilingual Hungarian-Slovenian and Italian language education is increasingly difficult. In addition, the language competence of teaching staff in Hungarian and Italian remains problematic. Teacher training takes place mainly in Slovenian, although teachers need then to use Hungarian and Italian for teaching subjects. For many years the authorities have been trying to address the issue in the framework of cross-border programmes with Hungary and Italy and, according to the additional information provided by the authorities, such programmes will continue.<sup>20</sup> In addition, a new teacher training programme for bilingual education for pre-schools was launched at the Lendava/Lendva Bilingual Upper Secondary School (vocational education) in 2021/2022. The Committee of Experts reiterates that adequate teacher training, including in Hungarian and Italian for teaching subjects in these languages, as well as a high level of language competence, are essential for the provision of quality minority language education.<sup>21</sup>

24. According to the periodical report and additional information provided by the authorities, the financing guidelines for higher educational institutions for 2021-2024 issued by the Ministry for Higher Education, Science and Innovation included the possibility to finance measures to increase enrolment in the study programmes for Italian and Hungarian. The University of Maribor offers a special Hungarian Language and Literature study programme, with a minority focus, whose graduates can either become teachers or work in bilingual institutions, companies or media. The University of Primorska receives also funding for pre-school and primary school teacher training programmes for kindergartens and schools teaching in Italian.

25. A major curricula reform is on-going in Slovenia. The Committee of Experts has been informed that the Hungarian and Italian national communities have been involved as regards the teaching of the respective languages.

<sup>20</sup> See 5<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para.18, Evaluation by the Committee of Experts of the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action contained in the Committee of Experts' fifth evaluation report on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2021) 11, para.28, see also [Kick-off meeting del progetto Innalzamento delle competenze didattiche nelle scuole della comunità nazionale italiana in Slovenia e nelle scuole della comunità slovena in Italia](#) and [EU funding for raising the quality of bilingual education | GOV.SI](#).

<sup>21</sup> See 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para.22.

26. As far as monitoring of education is concerned (Article 8.1.i), the Slovenian authorities refer to the Education Inspectorate. Exchanges during the on-the-spot visit indicated that no monitoring as required by the undertaking is currently in place.<sup>22</sup>

27. Outside the “ethnically mixed areas” (Article 8.2), Hungarian and Italian are offered as foreign languages. The authorities indicate that at the moment very few pupils from the bilingual Hungarian-Slovenian or from Italian language schools continue secondary education outside the “ethnically mixed area”. At the same time, the periodical report indicates that, at least for Hungarian, there is a tendency of the young people to move to bigger cities. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities to consider whether a more appropriate model of teaching in or of Hungarian and Italian as minority languages is necessary, depending on the numbers of Italian and Hungarian speakers living outside the areas where these languages are traditionally used and to report about it in the next periodical report.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities***

28. Italian and Hungarian are official languages along with Slovenian in parts of municipalities where the Italian or Hungarian national communities live, in accordance with the Constitution of Slovenia (Article 11). Detailed provisions about their use before courts are included in legislation such as the Courts Act (Article 5 and 45) and the Court Rules (Article 61- 69), State Prosecution Service Act (Art. 15), State Attorney’s Office Act (Art.6), Criminal Procedure Act (Articles 8 and 92), Minor Offences Act (Art 143). Proceedings may be held in Italian and Hungarian or bilingually, documents in these languages may be submitted and decisions are issued in Slovenian and Hungarian or Italian. Costs associated to the use of Hungarian or Italian are covered by the state.<sup>23</sup>

29. In practice, Hungarian and Italian remain rarely used before courts. According to the additional information provided by the authorities, in 2023-2024 Hungarian was used in three criminal cases. In the same period, Italian was used in two criminal cases, five minor offence cases, one non-contentious civil case and one land registry case (at the Koper/Capodistria Local Court) and in two civil cases (at the Piran/Pirano Local Court); two property certificates were also issued in Italian by this court. No proceedings were conducted in Italian at the Koper/Capodistria High Court in 2023-2024. As regards staff, there is one Hungarian-speaking judge at the Lendava/Lendva Court and no Hungarian-speaking prosecutor at the Murska Sobota District State Prosecutor’s Office. At the Koper/Capodistria High Court there are three Italian-speaking judges, as well as five Italian-speaking employees. Eight Italian-speaking prosecutors are employed at the District State Prosecutor’s Office in Koper/Capodistria. In 2024, two legal terminology workshops for Italian and one for Hungarian were organised. However, the lack of Hungarian and Italian-speaking legal professionals (including lawyers) with a sufficient proficiency and the need for interpreters, which are not always available, increase the duration of the proceedings. In order to expedite the proceedings, but also to avoid being perceived as “troublemakers”, Hungarian and Italian speakers tend to use Slovenian. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the authorities should continue to take measures to improve the Hungarian and Italian language competence of judges, prosecutors and other legal professionals, in order to facilitate the use of these languages in practice. They should also ensure that a sufficient number of interpreters is available in practice.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities***

30. Hungarian and Italian are official languages in parts of municipalities where the respective national communities live. These parts are designated in the statutes of the respective municipalities and referred to as “ethnically mixed areas”. The State Administration Act and other legislation provide for the use of Hungarian and Italian by and in relations with the authorities. According to the additional information provided by the authorities, knowledge of these languages at basic or advanced level may be required for certain positions in administration and public employees are entitled to an allowance for bilingualism (bilingualism bonus). However, the authorities indicate that some of these positions are not filled, due to

<sup>22</sup> See 5<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para. 23 for details on the requirements of such monitoring.

<sup>23</sup> In addition, the website *nasodiscu.si* provides detailed information about the judicial system in Hungarian and Italian.

lack of candidates or insufficient language proficiency. Funding is also provided from the state budget to municipalities where Hungarian and Italian are used. The Ministry of Public Administration organises consultations on bilingualism with the relevant municipalities and provides guidance on various topics linked to the implementation of the national legislation. The Administration Academy provides Hungarian and Italian language courses for public employees. In 2023 two such courses were organised for Italian and one for Hungarian. However, a specific Italian administrative terminology seminar was cancelled both in 2023 and 2024 due to insufficient financial resources. Hungarian and Italian language courses are organised annually also for the police employees. Some authorities employ translators. The authorities highlight that, based on the constitutional provisions, the use of Hungarian and Italian is ensured to everyone in the specific area, not only to members of the respective national communities. The Committee of Experts commends this approach, which is fully in line with the Charter. The authorities underline that rules on the use of Hungarian and Italian apply also to authorities situated outside the “ethnically mixed areas”, but which have responsibilities in those areas.

31. Hungarian and Italian are used by administrative authorities, but shortcomings remain in practice. According to the additional information provided by the authorities, administrative units in the “ethnically mixed areas” seem to use Hungarian and Italian more regularly. Other local branches of state authorities in various domains (such as financial office, food safety, market inspectorate, labour inspectorate, survey and mapping authority) use Hungarian or Italian if approached in these languages, have positions classified as requiring knowledge of these languages as well as Hungarian- or Italian-speaking employees, publish some documents, and some have bilingual signage. Nevertheless, according to the speakers, proficiency in Hungarian or Italian allowing the use of these languages on a daily basis in a professional environment and mastering the specific terminology is often missing. The possibility to use Hungarian and Italian in direct contacts with the administration is sometimes a matter of chance. As they master Slovenian, the Hungarian and Italian speakers tend to switch to Slovenian, on the one hand, to obtain the required services faster and, on the other hand, for fear of being perceived as “troublemakers” if they insist to make use of their minority language. Often obtaining documents in a minority language takes longer. The Committee of Experts underlines that further practical organisational measures are needed, in order to make sure that Hungarian and Italian can be used in practice in administration. It also underlines that commitment in Article 10.1.a i, requires that the respective authorities use Hungarian and Italian as internal working languages, not only in communication with the users. The Committee of Experts also draws the attention to its statement on the promotion of regional or minority languages through artificial intelligence.<sup>24</sup>

32. The Committee of Experts has been informed of the setting up in 2022 of Offices for Bilingualism, within the Hungarian and Italian national communities, with funding from the Slovenian national authorities. They co-operate with various authorities with a view to supporting the use of Hungarian and Italian in public life and assist with translation of documents and materials. They also monitor how the respective languages are used and, upon their initiative or when notified by individuals, may approach authorities and ask for the minority language to be used in accordance with the law or for various corrections. The Committee of Experts commends the setting up of these offices, which have a positive impact on the use of Hungarian and Italian in practice.

33. During the COVID-19 pandemic, online information on the dedicated website, instructions and documents, as well as the mobile app were made available in Hungarian and Italian.

34. The use or adoption of traditional place names in Italian has been a recurring issue in the monitoring process.<sup>25</sup> Many traditional Italian names have been replaced with Slovenian names, which have then been translated to Italian (for example, Lucija/Lucia, although the traditional Italian name is Santa Lucia; Titov Trg/Piazza Tito in Koper/Capodistria, although the traditional Italian name is Piazza del Duomo). According to the Italian speakers, the restoration of the traditional Italian place names remains sensitive and local authorities are reluctant to take this step. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts noted that additional multilingual signs indicating the traditional names were

<sup>24</sup> <https://rm.coe.int/comex-statement-on-promotion-through-artificial-intelligence-en-/1680b063ec>.

<sup>25</sup> See 5th report, of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para.44, 4<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, para. 216.

being installed, for example in Koper/Capodistria (Titov Trg/Piazza Tito and on an additional sign, “nekdanja/già/formerly Piazza del Duomo”). During the on-the spot visit the Committee of Experts was informed that the Ministry of Culture asked for the additional signs to be removed, following a complaint linked to the Act on the Public Use of Slovenian.<sup>26</sup> In fact, the Italian name on the additional sign would also have to be translated into Slovenian. This was not possible, according to the Italian speakers, since some names cannot be translated or never existed in Slovenian. During the on-the-spot visit the additional signs were turned over, and the authorities have informed the Committee of Experts that the case was still pending and they hoped for a compromise to be found, with only some names being disputed. The Committee of Experts recalls that the Charter requires the “use or adoption [...] of *traditional* and correct form of place names in regional or minority languages”. Therefore, the traditional place name in Italian should be used along with place name in Slovenian and not simply a translation in Italian. The Committee of Experts recalls that bilingual signage is an effective promotional measure, which increases the visibility and prestige of a minority language, raises awareness among the majority population and contributes to maintaining the linguistic heritage.<sup>27</sup> It regrets the recent developments concerning the additional signs and considers that the Slovenian authorities should take steps to ensure the use or adoption of traditional place names in Italian.

35. According to the additional information provided by the authorities, municipal services issue notices, bulletins, and invoices in Hungarian and Italian. As far as the information from the speakers are concerned, Hungarian and Italian are used to a limited extent in the provision of public services (Article 10.3). A more pro-active approach in this respect is needed, in order to *ensure* the use of these languages as required by the ratification.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in media***

36. RTV Slovenija broadcasts programmes in Hungarian, Italian and Romani.

37. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Slovenian authorities **ensure sufficient resources for the provision of television programmes in Hungarian and Italian**. Since 2021, based on co-operation agreements with the two deputies of the Hungarian and Italian national communities, additional funds have been granted by the Slovenian government to ensure a sufficient number of journalists for the Hungarian and Italian radio and television programmes (e.g. for replacing posts lost in previous years, replacing staff leaving, changing fixed term contracts to permanent contracts). Until 2026 funds will be granted to replace the staff retiring both for the Hungarian and Italian programmes, in order to maintain the same staffing level.

38. As many other public broadcasters, RTV Slovenija continues to face financial problems and discussions about restructuring and savings are taking place. In this context, the Italian speakers in particular are very concerned about maintaining the programmes in Italian at the current level also in the future.

39. The Hungarian and Italian speakers continue to be represented in the programme committees in place for the Hungarian and Italian radio and television programmes. They also have one representative each on the RTV Slovenija Programme Board (Article 11.3). However, the speakers are concerned, in particular in the context of the restructuring to follow, as to what extent their views will be taken into account.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities***

40. Support is given to cultural activities, but this varies greatly among languages. Cultural programmes of the Hungarian and Italian national communities are funded based on an annual direct call by the Ministry of Culture and include the running of institutions and activities. The Ministry of Culture also

<sup>26</sup> See, for more details, [UN ATTO LEGALE, MA INAPPROPRIATO: L'Ispettorato del Ministero della Cultura sloveno ha ordinato la rimozione delle targhe con gli odonimi storici d... - Istra24](#).

<sup>27</sup> See 7<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Germany, MIN-LANG (2022) 7, para. 30.

organises an annual call for tenders for co-financing cultural projects of the Roma community. Project funding based on different public tenders is also granted to Croatian, German and Serbian speakers. As far as these languages are concerned, in many cases the amounts are insufficient to carry out adequate cultural activities. Moreover, the Hungarian, and especially Italian and Romani speakers also raised the issue of insufficient funding. The Committee of Experts underlines that project-based funding alone is insufficient to ensure adequate support and sustainability for the activities promoting minority languages. A more stable and permanent funding is essential.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in economic and social life***

41. There are legal obligations for companies operating in the areas where Hungarian and Italian are official to use these languages for providing basic information on the characteristics, terms of sale, use of goods and services, price lists (when required by a specific law) and opening hours. However, according to the speakers, this is not always the case in practice. The Slovenian authorities consider that such information may be provided orally or in writing and that consumers can thus make an informed decision. Moreover, the Market Inspectorates cover consumer protection issues and can provide information. The Committee of Experts notes that neither the Slovenian Consumers' Association,<sup>28</sup> nor the European Consumer Centre Slovenia<sup>29</sup> provide any information in Hungarian and Italian (Article 13.2.e). No information has been provided by the authorities about safety instructions being drafted in Hungarian or Italian (Article 13.2.d). According to the legislation in force, health care providers in the public network have to ensure that patients may use Hungarian and Italian and health workers in the respective areas have to be proficient in these languages.<sup>30</sup> However, this remains problematic in practice, in particular for hospitals (Article 13.2.c).

42. Two Programmes for the Promotion of the Economic Base of the Hungarian and Italian national communities respectively have been running for 2017-2020 and 2021-2024. These target economic entities and aim to boost economic investments, promote tourism, etc. in the area where the two communities live. In this context, according to the periodical report, Hungarian and Italian are also promoted. The Committee of Experts welcomes this information; the economic development of the areas where minority language speakers live is important for the future of these languages and they can be a factor in this process, for example in activities such as tourism. It is therefore important that the use of Hungarian and Italian is also encouraged in economic life through such activities.

### ***Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges***

43. Cross-border co-operation plays an important role in promoting minority languages and numerous activities are carried out. Programmes aimed at improving bilingual education for Hungarian and education in Italian are carried out in a cross-border framework and using EU funding instruments as well. Within the co-financing of the Hungarian and Italian national communities, costs linked to transfrontier exchanges with Hungary and Italy are also covered.

## **1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Slovenia**

### **Croatian - Part II language**

44. The Committee of Experts noted in the previous monitoring cycles that the Croatian language has a traditional presence in Bela Krajina and Žumberak (Dolenjska region).<sup>31</sup> According to the speakers, this is also the case for Pomurje and Istria. Croatian is not recognised as a traditional minority language, and

<sup>28</sup> [Consumer protection | GOV.SI, Zveza potrošnikov Slovenije | ZPS.](#)

<sup>29</sup> [Evropski potrošniški center Slovenija - Evropski potrošniški center.](#)

<sup>30</sup> See Periodical Report, p.54 and references to Health Services Act, Patients' Rights Act, Medical Services Act, Act on Recognition of Professional Qualifications for Medical Doctors, Specialist Doctors, Doctors of Dental Medicine and Specialist Doctors of Dental Medicine.

<sup>31</sup> See 5<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final, para. 38, 4th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 14, 3<sup>rd</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2010)5, paragraph 15.

it is only addressed in the context of the national communities of the people of former SFRY. The periodical report does not provide information on financial support for activities promoting Croatian. Exchanges with the speakers indicate that support for cultural activities consists only of co-financing projects based on public call in general and is insufficient. They mainly rely on support from Croatia for carrying out activities. Public information<sup>32</sup> show that co-financing of various cultural activities consists in a few hundred euros per activity. Moreover, these comprise various activities, which are not only dedicated to the promotion of the language, are organised throughout Slovenia and do not focus on the area where the language has been traditionally spoken. This is insufficient for an adequate protection and promotion of Croatian. Earmarked permanent funding in order to ensure the running of minority institutions in the long run is also necessary.<sup>33</sup> There is no radio or television programme in Croatian. The language is occasionally used in *Sami naši* and *Na Glas!*, the radio and television programme, respectively of RTV Slovenia dedicated to the national communities of the peoples of former SFRY.<sup>34</sup> This does not amount to a sufficient broadcasting duration in Croatian. There is no appropriate educational model for Croatian as a minority language. According to the periodical report, Croatian can be taught as a compulsory or optional elective subject in grades 4 or 7 to 9, for two hours per week or during supplementary classes of “mother tongue and culture for children of other nationalities”, models which do not meet the requirements of the Charter for teaching regional or minority languages (see paragraph 11). Croatian may be studied at university level. The Council for the national communities of the former SFRY continues to function. However, it does not appear that the council deals with the obligations stemming from the Charter.

## German - Part II language

45. As noted in all previous monitoring cycles, German is traditionally spoken in Slovenia and most speakers live nowadays in the areas of Maribor, Apače, Celje, Kočevje, as well as Ljubljana.<sup>35</sup> The authorities provide co-financing to projects of associations, in insufficient amounts.<sup>36</sup> The associations of the German speakers strive to keep the German language and the culture alive in Slovenia, by organising cultural activities, language courses, summer camps, including in Maribor and the Kočevje area. It is necessary to grant earmarked permanent funding to ensure the running of minority institutions in the long run. German is almost absent from public life, including media. There is a need for broadcasts in German on local radio and television, in the areas where German has been traditionally spoken, which would also help raise awareness of the traditional presence of the German language in Slovenia. No appropriate model exists for teaching German as a minority language in the Slovenian education system. German is taught as a foreign language or during supplementary classes “mother tongue and culture for children of other nationalities”, models which do not meet the requirements of the Charter for teaching regional or minority languages (see paragraph 11). German can be studied at university level. Associations of German speakers are active in cross-border co-operation, but it is unclear how this is supported by the authorities. The working group for dialogue with the German speakers, which meets twice per year, does not discuss with the German speakers the request for recognition of the language as a traditional minority language and the implementation of the Charter, as the authorities are of the view that these issues are outside the working group’s mandate. No progress has been made on the wish for bilingual kindergarten education expressed in one of the initial meetings in 2021, since the authorities consider that such a proposal has no legal basis (see also para. 71). The German speakers have complained to the Ombudsman about their situation, including the lack of application of the Charter.

<sup>32</sup> See the results for the past several years of the public calls managed by the Public Fund for Cultural Activities for “cultural projects in the field of various minority ethnic communities and immigrants”, available at [Javni sklad RS za kulturne dejavnosti](#).

<sup>33</sup> See, for example, 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final, para. 38.

<sup>34</sup> *Sami naši* is a weekly programme with a total duration of 30 to 45 minutes, *Na Glas!* is a 20-minute programme broadcast once every two weeks.

<sup>35</sup> See 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final, para. 39, 4th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 14, 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2010)5, paragraph 14.

<sup>36</sup> For example, €60 000 were foreseen for 2024 and, while projects totalling €144 000 were proposed, only €38 000 euros were awarded for projects proposed by ten associations promoting German.

## Hungarian - Part II and Part III language

46. Hungarian is official language along with Slovenian in the “ethnically mixed areas” of the municipalities of Hodoš/Hodos, Šalovci, Moravske Toplice, Dobrovník/Dobrovnak and Lendava/Lendva.<sup>37</sup> All pre-schools and schools in the area provide bilingual education in Hungarian and Slovenian to all their pupils, irrespective their first language. The system foresees the use of both languages in equal shares. At pre-school level, the presence of two teachers or one teacher/one assistant each using one language is foreseen. At primary level, for the first three grades, there are also two teachers, one for each language while in the next grades, bilingual teachers are present, meaning one teacher who is in command of both Hungarian and Slovenian. Lessons take place bilingually and textbooks are bilingual; pupils may choose to study the history and geography of Hungary in Hungarian only. Examinations may be taken in the language the pupils choose. Hungarian as a subject is taught at different levels. At pre-school, and primary secondary level, the number of pupils has slightly increased from 2019 to 2023.<sup>38</sup> History and culture reflected by Hungarian is taught to pupils in bilingual schools, which follow an adapted curriculum. Other schools provide some general information about the Hungarian national community.

47. There is a strong attachment to this model of education in the region but there are also views acknowledging that it needs to be reformed and improved.<sup>39</sup> Although both languages should be used in equal shares, in practice, teachers adapt to the class and use mainly Hungarian or mainly Slovenian depending on the first language of the pupils. While the choice of language depends on composition of the group or class the Committee of Experts has been informed that often Slovenian prevails. At pre-school level, there is insufficient staff to ensure the presence of a Hungarian-speaking teacher for the entire period children spend at kindergarten. Concerns have been expressed about the decrease of the pupils’ language competence level. There is a need to strengthen the actual presence of Hungarian within the educational model, in order to ensure a sufficient level of Hungarian.

48. One of the main issues is teacher training and recruitment, as it becomes increasingly problematic to find Hungarian-speaking staff and a significant number of retirements are planned in the coming years. Basic teacher training is organised only for Hungarian as a subject (study of Hungarian with a pedagogy component), not for subject teaching. Training takes place in Slovenian. Schools are allowed to recruit teachers who do not speak Hungarian and who have to learn it and pass an exam, before they can receive permanent employment. Further training falls into the remit of the National Education Institute and 19 such courses/seminars have been organised from 2019 to the end of 2023. They addressed the Hungarian language competence, as well as didactical and pedagogical topics. Hungarian is offered as subject of adult and continuing education, for example, at the public university in Lendava and Murska Sobota.

49. According to the information provided by the authorities, 36 textbooks and textbook materials for primary school have been published from 2019-2023. Authorities acknowledge that translation took time, due to difficulties in recruiting translators with Hungarian language skills and knowledge of the Slovenian education system and terminology. All curricula for the bilingual primary school programme and 15 curricula for the upper secondary school programmes (general education, technical, vocational and technical-vocational education) have been translated to Hungarian, as well as several instructions.

50. Hungarian is rarely used in practice before courts. While one judge and some other employees speak Hungarian and can provide information in this language, using Hungarian in proceedings requires a certified interpreter. The authorities acknowledge a shortage of court interpreters for Hungarian. Since the August 2023 retirement of a court interpreter, the post has not been filled and it is very difficult to find even outsourced court interpreters. This leads also to the extension of the proceedings or to the use of Slovenian. In addition, during the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts was informed that the documents and certificates are increasingly issued electronically and automatically in Slovenian only,

<sup>37</sup> See 4<sup>th</sup> periodical report of Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2013) PR 04, p.6.

<sup>38</sup> See 6<sup>th</sup> periodical report of Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2023) PR 10, p.36-39.

<sup>39</sup> See also 5<sup>th</sup> report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final, para. 40, Fifth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, ACFC/OP/V(2021)9, para.161, the Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on minority issues after the visit to Slovenia, A/HRC/40/64/Add.1, 8 January 2019, paragraph 47.

while obtaining the version in Hungarian takes time, due to the lack of the local translator. The Land Register also issues documents in Slovenian only and additional time is needed to obtain a version in Hungarian.

51. Hungarian is used to some extent in administration and public services. According to information received during the on-the-spot visit and additional information received from the authorities, the Lendava Administrative Unit (Article 10.1) uses bilingual seals, signs, plates and provides content in Hungarian on its website. Employees can provide information orally in Hungarian. The Unit issues documents, such as personal documents, bilingually. Applications related to personal documents, driving licenses, building permits, agricultural land, farm or forest may be done in Hungarian. Knowledge of Hungarian is required for some positions and a school certificate is needed as proof. Priority in employment is given to those who can communicate in Hungarian. However, mastering the terminology is problematic and there is only one employee who is responsible for checking it. Five civil servants participated in the 2023 training and there is an interest in continuing such training. In the Murska Sobota Administrative Unit, which is also responsible for part of the “ethnically mixed area”, an interpreter should be available, but this is not the case, according to the speakers, and only Slovenian is used. According to the authorities, its two local offices in the “ethnically mixed area” communicate in Hungarian and issue bilingual documents such as personal documents or driving licences. According to the information provided by the authorities, other local branches of state authorities have Hungarian-speaking employees (for example, one staff member at the Health Inspectorate or the Market Inspectorate), make available forms in Hungarian (for example, the complaint form for the Market Inspectorate), issue documents bilingually or in Hungarian, even automatically (for example, decisions of the Financial Office, certificates of the Survey and Mapping Authority). Some of these authorities indicate that they can also provide information by phone, in person or in writing in Hungarian. Nevertheless, individual cases where people intended to use Hungarian with the authorities, and it was not possible were reported to the Committee of Experts. Some authorities also indicate that Hungarian is rarely used in practice or has not been used at all. Printed or online information and materials about the national health programmes are made available in Hungarian by the National Institute for Public Health; its unit in Murska Sobota produces thematic broadcasts in Hungarian on health topics.

52. Hungarian is more consistently used by local authorities (Article 10.2), according to the speakers. These usually issue documents bilingually. The Committee of Experts notes that Lendava/Lendva and Dobrovnik/Dobronak use bilingual logos and have websites in Hungarian or bilingual. For the other municipalities, some information in Hungarian is provided on their websites. Online, some applications and forms are available in Hungarian, as well as some documents of the local authority, such as the statutes. Place names signs and other signage in Hungarian are widespread. Hungarian is, however not used in debates in assemblies at local level, because people using Hungarian would have to interpret to Slovenian for the others.

53. According to the periodical report, the Office for Bilingualism has assisted with translations and monitored the use of Hungarian in the “ethically mixed area”.

54. As far as media are concerned, radio programmes in Hungarian continued to be broadcast by Muravidéki Magyar Rádió, part of RTV Slovenija (24 hours/day), while television programmes continue to be broadcast for 30 minutes, four times per week, which is an insufficient amount in light of the ratification. A programme is in place for training and retaining young journalists, and additional earmarked funding was granted to replace journalists leaving or retiring. However, recruitment of staff remains problematic due to the high level of knowledge of Hungarian required. There is also a weekly newspaper in Hungarian, in print version. Co-funding from the authorities covers slightly more than half of the costs of the newspaper. There is a wish to develop additionally an online portal with daily news, but this is not possible due to understaffing.

55. As regards culture, activities are organised by the institutions of the Hungarian national community. The funds granted to the cultural programme of the Hungarian national community and its activities varied from €457 000 in 2019 to €616 918 in 2023. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that a minority cultural institution received a warning from the body monitoring

the implementation of the 2004 Act on the Public Use of Slovenian, for using Hungarian before Slovenian on a poster. The Committee of Experts asks the authorities to consider whether such practices could discourage the use of minority languages.

56. According to the additional information provided by the authorities, the Lendava Community Health Centre has Hungarian-speaking staff and as a rule, in each team, either a doctor or a nurse is fluent in Hungarian. The Murska Sobota General Hospital, which is situated outside the “ethnically mixed area”, does not have statistics on the bilingual staff, but according to the authorities, some doctors and nurses are proficient in Hungarian.

57. There is co-operation across borders with local authorities, schools and cultural institutions in Hungary, as well as participation in cultural events, fairs or other meetings. Bilateral agreements on national minorities, on economic development of the border area, as well as a programme of cooperation in the field of education, culture and science for 2022-2025 also apply.

### **Italian - Part II and Part III language**

58. Italian is an official language, along with Slovenian, in the “ethnically mixed areas” of the municipalities of Koper/Capodistria, Izola/Isola, Piran/Pirano and in the municipality of Ankaran/Ankarano.<sup>40</sup> Education in Italian is provided at pre-school, primary and secondary levels, as well as in technical and vocational education. The periodical report indicates a slight decrease of the number of children enrolled at the pre-school level, and a slight increase for primary and secondary level, for the period 2019-2023. All curricula for the primary school programme and for the general upper secondary school programme with Italian as the language of instruction has been translated to Italian; the same applies for the general education subjects in upper secondary school programmes with Italian as language of instruction for technical and vocational education. Slovenian is taught as a subject in the Italian language schools *de facto* at the same level as Italian and with a similar number of hours and the same textbooks are used as in the mainstream schools. Textbooks for all subjects may be imported from Italy or can be translated from Slovenian, but the former do not meet the requirements of the Slovenian curriculum, whereas the latter are often of poor quality. In addition, some translations are missing, as it is the case, for example, with some tests preparing for the final exams where pupils preparing for them must use those in Slovenian. Italian may be studied at university level (8.1.eiii). Italian is offered as subject of adult and continuing education, e.g. at the public university in Koper/Capodistria. History and culture reflected by Italian is taught to pupils in schools with Italian as language of instruction, which follow an adapted curriculum.

59. As regards teacher training, the University of Primorska in Koper/Capodistria provides basic training for teachers of pre-school and primary education with Italian as the language of instruction. The university receives funding from the Ministry for Higher Education, Science and Innovation for this purpose, but such funding should be, according to the speakers, systematic and uninterrupted. They also highlight the shortage of teaching staff in kindergartens and schools teaching in Italian. The Committee of Experts notes from the information provided by the authorities that the number of students enrolled in these programmes is low. One additional issue is that teacher training generally takes place in Slovenian (at the University of Primorska, only a few courses are in Italian). This poses a problem as regards the Italian language level, especially for subject teaching and has an impact on the quality of Italian language, particularly noticeable in the case of the scientific subjects. Further training falls into the remit of the National Education Institute and 16 such courses/seminars have been organised from 2019 to the end of 2023. Summer and autumn seminars on Italian language and culture are also organised by the Italian national community and are funded by Italy. These are the only further training courses organised in Italian. According to the speakers, it is important to organise further training in Italian, possibly in Italy, with financial support from Slovenia, in order ensure the use of the correct Italian terminology. The long-standing issue of the recognition of teaching qualifications for those having studied in Italy remains an issue of concern. Italian is taught in the Slovenian medium schools in the area as “language of the

<sup>40</sup> See 5<sup>th</sup> periodical report of Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) PR 1, p.7.

environment” (7.1.g). However, the Committee of Experts has been informed that the level is low and there is little understanding among pupils as to why they should learn it. (see also under Article 7.3).

60. The representatives of the Italian speakers informed the Committee of Experts that, while education takes place in Italian, extracurricular activities, regional or national competitions, which may be taken into account for university enrolment, take place only in Slovenian. Regulations and other documents from the Ministry of Education, documents and information about school activities that reaches also parents are sent only in Slovenian. Translations are done by teachers and more recently, the Office for Bilingualism.

61. Italian is rarely used before courts. The lack of legal professionals, especially lawyers able to handle cases in Italian is one of the causes. The use of Italian relies on interpreters and the Committee of Experts has been informed that parties have been asked to pay for interpretation, which is against Slovenian legislation and is not in compliance with the Charter.<sup>41</sup> Courts issue documents primarily in Slovenian and only upon request in Italian.

62. Italian is used in the field of administration, but shortcomings remain in practice. According to the speakers, it is a matter of chance, although generally one finds Italian-speaking public employees, especially for verbal exchanges. According to the information provided by the authorities, the Administrative Units in Koper/Capodistria, Izola/Isola, Piran/Pirano (Article 10.1) use signs and doorplates in Italian, as well as provide content in Italian on their websites. Employees can provide oral information in Italian. Documents, such as personal documents, are issued bilingually, and applications related to personal documents, driving licenses, building permits, agricultural land, farm or forest may be done in Italian. Other local branches of state authorities have Italian-speaking employees (for example, one staff member at the Health Inspectorate and four at the Market Inspectorate), make available forms in Italian (for example the complaint form of Market Inspectorate) issue documents bilingually or in Italian, even automatically (for example, decisions of the Financial Office, certificates of the Survey and Mapping Authority). Some of these authorities indicate that they can also provide information by phone, in person or in writing in Italian. Some authorities also indicate that Italian is rarely used in practice or has not been used at all. Printed or online information and materials about the national health programmes are made available in Italian by the National Institute for Public Health and its regional unit in Koper/Capodistria. According to the representatives of the speakers, administrative units display most forms in Slovenian, rather than bilingual or in Italian; in some cases, staff are not aware which forms are available in Italian and which need to be translated. As a consequence, Italian speakers do not use consistently Italian in dealings with this level of administration. As regards the financial administration, it has been co-operating with the Italian national community to improve services in Italian. According to the speakers, police rarely use Italian. The e-government website *E-Uprava* is partly available in Italian, with a focus on the most important documents, and it is being updated; however, many operations are available only in Slovenian. As regards local authorities (Article 10.2), the Committee of Experts notes that the four municipalities have websites in Slovenian and Italian, use bilingual logos and make available forms in Italian online. To varying degrees, they publish documents in Italian, such as strategies, reports, public announcements and calls, agendas of local council meetings or decisions, although these to less extent. Bilingual place names, including street names, are used, but they are often translations to Italian of names in Slovenian, not the traditional names in Italian (see also para. 34 above).<sup>42</sup>

63. As regards public services, according to the Italian speakers, the post offices provide some bilingual forms, but otherwise operate in Slovenian only. Municipal companies also operate almost exclusively in Slovenian. Among these, Marjetica Koper, covering several services (e.g. garbage collection, parking, public lighting, markets) provides information in Italian on its website, but the forms are, with one or two exceptions, in Slovenian only. Rižanski vodovod Koper, water utility company, uses only Slovenian. Electricity and phone companies operate only in Slovenian.

<sup>41</sup> As regards national legislation, see Art. 5 of the Courts Act.

<sup>42</sup> See 5<sup>th</sup> report, of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para.44, 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 216.

64. According to the Italian speakers, the Office for Bilingualism contributed to improving the situation as regards the use of Italian. The office approached institutions at the national level and branches of the state authorities to ensure that the legislation concerning the use of Italian is applied and it also supported the translation of various school documents. It also obtained improvements in translations of public information or in the use of Italian. Most of these concerned local branches of state authorities (e.g. financial administration, environment and spatial planning), public service companies (e.g. Marjetica Koper), societies and private companies. The office also organised terminology courses for civil servants. The office is a member of a network fostering exchanges among administrations, academia, and professionals in different countries, for the benefit of Italian. The Italian national community also set up a working group, composed of translators and legal and administrative experts, dedicated to terminology and aimed at creating a glossary to standardise translations in Italian in the area, together with partners from Croatia and Italy.

65. Programmes in Italian are produced by the regional centre of the RTV in Koper/Capodistria and broadcast by Radio Capodistria (24hours/day) and TV Koper/Capodistria (10 hours/day). The cuts in terms of staff and funding have been a long-term concern for the Italian speakers. According to data made available by the Italian speakers, between 2015 and 2019 the TV programme lost 12% of staff and the radio programme 24%. The situation began to improve in 2021-2022, based on the agreements with the member of the National Assembly for the Italian national community, which meant additional funding to replace posts lost in previous years. A new agreement covering 2023-2026 should allow the maintenance of jobs, the replacement those lost in the past and the continued replacement of retired staff. Nevertheless, Italian speakers are very concerned, in the context of the financial problems of the public broadcaster, by views that the resources for minority language programmes could be a source of savings and their duration could thus be reduced. The Committee of Experts recalls the undertakings ratified and underlines that reducing the duration of the programmes in Italian would undermine the fulfilment of these undertakings.

66. As regards cultural activities, the Italian speakers draw attention to the fact that funding has remained unchanged for many years, not even taking the inflation into account and leading to cuts of the cultural programmes. The recent increase, based on an agreement with the member of the National Assembly for the Italian national community allows to maintain current programmes, but not to develop further programmes, including in co-operation with the Italian speakers in Croatia. The Committee of Experts notes that according to the periodical report, from 2019 to 2024 the funding for the cultural programme of the Italian national community increased from €324 135 in 2019 to € 388 144 in 2023.

67. As far as social and economic life are concerned, there is very little use of Italian. According to the speakers, despite the legal provisions, companies do not provide information and documentation in Italian and there is insufficient staff which can communicate with customers in Italian. Commercial advertising is rarely bilingual. According to the speakers, pharmacies do not use Italian. As far as social care facilities, including hospitals, retirement homes, laboratories, clinics, are concerned, Italian is rarely used, except on signage, which is bilingual. Despite the legal requirements, there are only a few doctors and nurses able to communicate in Italian (see footnote 30). Additional information provided by the authorities indicate that the community health care centres in Koper/Capodistria and Piran/Pirano have bilingual websites. They also state that complaints may be transmitted to the Patients' Rights Advocate for the Coastal and Karst Region, but this has not yet been the case.

68. As regards cross border exchanges, in addition to co-operation with local authorities, schools and cultural institutions, the Italian national community is involved in numerous co-operation programmes with EU funding, in the framework of the Italian-Slovenian cross border co-operation programmes INTEREG V 14-20 and INTEREG VI 21-27.<sup>43</sup> One particular project is Cross-Term - Cross border standardisation of institutional terminology, which aims at improving the quality and efficiency of language services in public administration operating in more languages with the realisation of common strategies, models and tools for standardisation of legal-administrative terminology in Slovenian and Friulian in Italy and Italian in Slovenia. Bearing in mind the number and variety of domains, they are a good practice example of

<sup>43</sup> [Primis Plus | Italy-Slovenia](#), [TARTINI BIS | Italy-Slovenia](#), [KISS & GO! | Italy-Slovenia](#), [CrossTerm | Italy-Slovenia](#).

cross-border co-operation for the benefit of minority languages. Nevertheless, the Italian speakers are interested in stronger support for co-operation with Croatia, due to the common history and institutions with the Italian minority.

### Romani - Part II language

69. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Slovenian authorities **develop the teaching of the Romani language and culture at all appropriate levels**. However, Romani is not taught as a subject in mainstream education in Slovenia. In 2021/2022 a pilot project providing supplementary classes of Romani and Roma culture started at two primary schools: in Metlika (Dolenjska region) and Beltinci (Prekmurje).<sup>44</sup> The second group was however dissolved after one year. In 2021/2022 18 pupils in both schools were involved, while in 2022/2023, 16 in one school. In 2023/2024, 51 pupils participated again in two schools. Classes are run by Roma teaching assistants and take place in the afternoon. It is not clear to which extent these classes teach Romani, since, according to the periodical report, they consist in revisions of lessons' content in Romani. There is no information on the number of hours per week, nor the actual grades when these classes are offered. Romani does not appear on the list of subjects in Slovenia, nor is there a curriculum for its teaching. It is unclear how this pilot project will continue. *Romani culture*, a subject about the culture and history of the Roma, remains a compulsory elective subject (one hour per week in the 7<sup>th</sup>-9<sup>th</sup> grades), but it is taught in very few schools and does not include language teaching. Slovenia also participates in the Council of Europe project *Romani Plurilingual Policy Experimentation* (2022-2025), which pilots a multilingual methodological approach for the education of Roma children. The Ministry of Education provided supports to the production of a teaching material about the language, culture and history of the Roma (*Romasam: knowledge opens doors*, a collection of cards and answer books). A Slovenian-Romani dictionary (*I know Romani*) with the most important concepts and phrases in Romani was translated into nine language varieties, as part of an EU co-funded project. In 2024, the Centre for School and Outdoor Education started a project which will be implemented in multi-purpose Roma centres and include activities to develop communicative capacity for pre-school and primary school children in Romani and Slovenian. The Committee of Experts regrets that, despite several activities dedicated to Romani, the long-standing recommendation about teaching Romani as a subject has not yet been implemented. It notes that representatives of the Romani speakers were concerned about the decreasing use of Romani in families and hopes that the pilot project and the participation in the Romani Plurilingual Policy Experimentation will facilitate teaching Romani at all appropriate levels.

70. Project funding is based on annual calls for tender organised by the ministry of culture and is provided for activities promoting culture, language, identity and cover publications, websites, various cultural activities, etc. The funds have increased from €92 115 in 2019 to €142 115 in 2023. There is a wish of the Romani speakers that funding becomes structural, similar to the Hungarian and Italian national communities. RTV Slovenia broadcasts radio and television programmes which use Romani (on radio, *Amare Droma*, 50 minutes, once per week, with content in Slovenian and Romani language, on television, *So vakeres?*, 19 minutes every two weeks, mostly in Romani). Radio Romic, an NGO initiative, broadcasts in Slovenian and Romani. Programmes about Roma co-financed by the authorities are also broadcast by local radios such as *Radio Univox (Romani Urica)* and *Radio Murski Val*. Publications, including for children, offer some content in Romani. However, according to the speakers, the publication frequency decreased, due to insufficient funding.

### Serbian - Part II language

71. The Committee of Experts noted in the previous monitoring cycles that the Serbian language has a traditional presence in Bojanci, Marindol, Miliči and Paunoviči.<sup>45</sup> Similar to Croatian, Serbian is not recognised as a traditional minority language, and it is only addressed in the context of the national

<sup>44</sup> See also Evaluation by the Committee of Experts of the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action contained in the Committee of Experts' fifth evaluation report on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2021) 11, para.37.

<sup>45</sup> See 5th report, of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019)17final, para.48, 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 17, 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2010)5, paragraph 19.

communities of nations of former Yugoslavia. The periodical report does not provide information on financial support for activities promoting Serbian. Public information<sup>46</sup> show that co-financing of various cultural activities consists in a few hundred euros per activity. Moreover, these comprise various activities which are not only dedicated to the promotion of the language, are organised throughout Slovenia and do not focus on the area where the language has been traditionally spoken. This is insufficient for an adequate protection and promotion of Serbian as a minority language in Slovenia. Earmarked permanent funding in order to ensure the running of minority institutions in the long run is also necessary.<sup>47</sup> There is no radio or television programme in Serbian. The language is used, during the programmes *Sami naši* and *Na Glas!*, the radio and television programmes, respectively, of RTV Slovenia dedicated to the national communities of nations of former Yugoslavia (see above para. 44). This does not amount to a sufficient broadcasting duration in Serbian. There is no appropriate educational model for Serbian as a minority language. According to the periodical report, Serbian can be taught as a compulsory elective subject in grades 7-9, for two hours per week or as supplementary classes of “mother tongue and culture for children of other nationalities”, models which do not meet the requirements of the Charter for teaching regional or minority languages (see paragraph 11). The Committee of Experts notes that, following a meeting with representatives of the Serbian speakers in 2023, the Ombudsman raised the issue of education with the responsible ministry, which indicated that bilingual education is only guaranteed to the Hungarian national community as a constitutionally recognised minority and that there are no legal grounds for bilingual education for Serbian speakers, who are not a constitutionally recognised minority.<sup>48</sup> Serbian may be studied at university level. The Council for the National Communities of the former SFRY Socialist Republic of Yugoslavia continues to function. However, it does not appear that the council deals with the obligations stemming from the Charter.

---

<sup>46</sup> See the results for the past several years of the public calls managed by the Public Fund for Cultural Activities for “cultural projects in the field of various minority ethnic communities and immigrants”, available at [Javni sklad RS za kulturne dejavnosti](#).

<sup>47</sup> See, for example, 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final, para. 48.

<sup>48</sup> See Annual Report of the Human Rights Ombudsman for 2023, available at [LETNA POROČILA, priporočila DZ, odzivna poročila Vlade](#), p.173.

## Chapter 2 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

### 2.1 Croatian

#### 2.1.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Croatian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Croatian <sup>49</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>					
7.1.a	recognition of Croatian as an expression of cultural wealth				=
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Croatian				=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Croatian				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Croatian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Croatian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=		
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Croatian at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Croatian to learn it				=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Croatian at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Croatian		=		
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Croatian				✓
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Croatian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Croatian among their objectives				=
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Croatian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Croatian				=

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

<sup>49</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

72. In the current monitoring cycle, the Slovenian authorities indicated that there is no legal basis for bilingual education in the case of minority communities which are not constitutionally recognised minorities. This demonstrates the impact of the lack of constitutional recognition in the Slovenian legal system and constitutes an unjustified distinction between traditionally used minority languages. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 7.2 not fulfilled.

### **2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Croatian in Slovenia**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of Slovenia to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Slovenia has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia<sup>50</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. Recognise Croatian as a traditional minority language and start dialogue with the Croatian speakers with a view to implementing Part II of the Charter.**
- b. Develop and make available, in the area where the language has been traditionally spoken, an appropriate educational model for Croatian as a minority language from pre-school to secondary education.**

#### **II. Further recommendations**

- c. Promote awareness of the Croatian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.
- d. Facilitate the broadcasting of local radio and television programmes in Croatian.
- e. Take resolute action to promote Croatian in public life, including by providing long-term sufficient funding for the cultural activities and organisations promoting Croatian.
- f. Ensure an adequate consultation of the relevant organisations representing the Croatian speakers on all matters pertaining to the protection and promotion of their language.

<sup>50</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)2](#).

## 2.2 German

### 2.2.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning German <sup>51</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled no conclusion
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>					
<b>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</b>					
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>					
7.1.a	recognition of German as an expression of cultural wealth				=
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of German				=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote German				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of German, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using German • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=		
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of German at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of German to learn it	=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on German at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of German		=		
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of German				✓
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among their objectives				=
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses German • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to German				=

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

<sup>51</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

73. In the current monitoring cycle, the Slovenian authorities indicated that there is no legal basis for bilingual education in the case of minority communities which are not constitutionally recognised minorities. This demonstrates the impact of the lack of constitutional recognition in the Slovenian legal system and constitutes an unjustified distinction between traditionally used minority languages. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 7.2 not fulfilled.

## **2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Slovenia**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of Slovenia to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Slovenia has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia<sup>52</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. Recognise German as a traditional minority language and start dialogue with the German speakers with a view to implementing Part II of the Charter.**
- b. Develop and make available, in the areas where the language has been traditionally spoken, an appropriate educational model for German as a minority language from pre-school to secondary education.**

### **II. Further recommendations**

- c. Promote awareness of the German language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.
- d. Facilitate the broadcasting of local radio and television programmes in German.
- e. Take resolute action to promote German in public life, including by providing long-term sufficient funding for the cultural activities and organisations promoting German.
- f. Strengthen and institutionalise the existing mechanism for dialogue with the German speakers and ensure adequate consultation with the relevant organisations representing the German speakers on all matters pertaining to the protection and promotion of their language.

<sup>52</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)2](#).

## 2.3 Hungarian

### 2.3.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ✓ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian <sup>53</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
<b>Part II of the Charter</b> <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>					
7.1.a	recognition of Hungarian as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Hungarian	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Hungarian		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Hungarian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Hungarian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=		
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Hungarian at all appropriate stages		=		
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Hungarian to learn it	=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Hungarian at universities or equivalent institutions	=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Hungarian	=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Hungarian	=			
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among their objectives		=		
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Hungarian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Hungarian	=			
<b>Part III of the Charter</b> <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>					
8.1.a.ii	make available a substantial part of pre-school education in Hungarian		✓		
8.1.b.ii	make available a substantial part of primary education in Hungarian		=		
8.1.c.ii	make available a substantial part of secondary education in Hungarian		=		
8.1.d.ii	make available a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Hungarian		=		
8.1.e.iii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Hungarian or of facilities for the study of Hungarian as a university or higher education subject	=			
8.1.f.iii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Hungarian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Hungarian	=			

<sup>53</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking <sup>*</sup> :					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian <sup>53</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Hungarian		=		
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Hungarian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				✓
8.2	in territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Hungarian at all the appropriate stages of education	=			
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities<sup>54</sup></b>					
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.iii	guarantee the accused the right to use Hungarian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.ii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Hungarian and the related use of documents and evidence in Hungarian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Hungarian	=			
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>					
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Hungarian		=		
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Hungarian or in bilingual versions	=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Hungarian	=			
10.2.a	use of Hungarian within the framework of the regional or local authority	=			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Hungarian to submit oral or written applications in Hungarian to the regional or local authority	=			

<sup>54</sup> Slovenia has ratified "Article 9, paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d", thereby covering all the possibilities provide by the Charter under Article 9.1. In its previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts assessed these undertakings from the perspective of the highest option (9.1.ai, bi, ci), with the understanding that is includes all the other options. In the new layout of the report, the Committee of Experts has decided to examine each provision.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking <sup>*</sup> :					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian <sup>53</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled no conclusion
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian				= 55
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian	=			
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies				= 56
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies			=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Hungarian	=			
10.3.a	ensure that Hungarian is used in the provision of public services		=		
10.4.a	provide translation or interpretation		=		
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Hungarian		=		
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Hungarian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=		
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Hungarian	=			
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>					
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Hungarian	= 57			✓ 58
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Hungarian	=			
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Hungarian</li> </ul>	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Hungarian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=			
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Hungarian	=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Hungarian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=			
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Hungarian	=			
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Hungarian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=			
12.2	In territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Hungarian				✓
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Hungarian and the culture it reflects				✓
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>					
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Hungarian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=			
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Hungarian				=

<sup>55</sup> This undertaking is currently not applicable.

<sup>56</sup> This undertaking is currently not applicable.

<sup>57</sup> Public radio.

<sup>58</sup> Public television.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian <sup>53</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Hungarian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Hungarian in economic and social life		↗			
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Hungarian in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents or ensure the implementation of such provisions				=	
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Hungarian in economic and social life					=
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Hungarian		=			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Hungarian				=	
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Hungarian				✓	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Hungarian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Hungarian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Hungarian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Hungarian is used in identical or similar form	=				

**\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

74. The Committee of Experts was informed that, while Hungarian and Slovenian should be used in equal shares in education, in practice this is not always the case, in particular where the Hungarian-speaking children are not the most numerous in a group/class; at pre-school there is insufficient staff to ensure the presence of a Hungarian-speaking teacher the entire day. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 8.1.iii only partly fulfilled. Monitoring of education as required by Article 8.1.i is currently not in place. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 8.1.i not fulfilled. In light of the lack of practical use of Hungarian in civil and administrative court proceedings and the shortage of court interpreters, the Committee of Experts must revise its conclusion and consider the undertakings in Articles 9.1.bi, bii, biii, 9.1.ci, cii, ciii formally fulfilled. Bearing in mind that the duration of the television programmes in Hungarian (4 x 30 minutes/week) is clearly below the requirements of the undertaking ratified and has remained unchanged since the first monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts must revise its conclusion and consider the undertaking in Article 11.1.ai not fulfilled as regards television. The Slovenian authorities do not have any data on cultural activities and facilities promoting Hungarian outside the “ethnically mixed areas”. The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking in Article 12.2. They also do not have any data on cases

where Hungarian language and culture is included in Slovenia's cultural policy abroad. The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking in Article 12.3. There are legal obligations for companies in the "ethnically mixed areas" to provide some information in Hungarian. A Programme for the Promotion of the Economic Base of the Hungarian national community has been running for several years. In this context, Hungarian is also promoted. However, further steps are needed to facilitate/encourage the use of Hungarian in economic and social life. Moreover, the undertaking in Article 13.1.d applies "within the whole country". The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 13.1.d partly fulfilled. Information concerning the rights of consumers is not made available by authorities in Hungarian. The possibility to receive oral information from staff of the Market Inspectorate is not sufficient in the context of this undertaking. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 13.2.e not fulfilled.

### **2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Slovenia**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of Slovenia to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts' recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Slovenia has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia<sup>59</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. Strengthen the presence of Hungarian in the bilingual education system, including by providing adequate teacher training for teaching in Hungarian.**
- b. Promote the use of Hungarian before courts and address the shortage of court interpreters**
- c. Increase the duration of broadcasting in Hungarian on public television.**

#### **II. Further recommendations**

- d. Promote awareness of the Hungarian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.
- e. Continue to take practical measures to facilitate the use of Hungarian in administration and public services.
- f. Ensure that social care facilities, in particular hospitals responsible for the "ethnically mixed areas", offer the possibility of receiving and treating people in Hungarian.
- g. Take practical measures to facilitate/encourage the use of Hungarian in economic and social life.

<sup>59</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)2](#).

## 2.4 Italian

### 2.4.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian <sup>60</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>					
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>					
7.1.a	recognition of Italian as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Italian	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Italian		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Italian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Italian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=		
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Italian at all appropriate stages	=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Italian to learn it	=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Italian at universities or equivalent institutions	=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Italian	=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Italian	=			
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among their objectives		=		
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Italian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Italian	=			
<b>Part III of the Charter</b>					
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
<b>Art. 8 – Education</b>					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Italian	=			
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Italian	=			
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Italian	=			
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Italian	=			
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Italian or of facilities for the study of Italian as a university or higher education subject	=			
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Italian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Italian	=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Italian	=			

<sup>60</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking <sup>61</sup> :					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian <sup>60</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Italian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				✓
8.2	in territories other than those in which Italian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Italian at all the appropriate stages of education	=			
<b>Art. 9 – Judicial authorities</b>					
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.iii	guarantee the accused the right to use Italian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.ii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=			
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=			
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Italian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=			
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Italian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=			
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Italian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Italian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			✓	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Italian and the related use of documents and evidence in Italian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned		✓		
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Italian	=			
<b>Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services</b>					
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Italian		=		
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Italian or in bilingual versions	=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Italian	=			
10.2.a	use of Italian within the framework of the regional or local authority	=			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Italian to submit oral or written applications in Italian to the regional or local authority	=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Italian				= 61
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Italian	=			

<sup>61</sup> This undertaking is currently not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking <sup>62</sup> :					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian <sup>60</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Italian in debates in their assemblies				= 62
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Italian in debates in their assemblies	=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Italian		=		
10.3.a	ensure that Italian is used in the provision of public services		=		
10.4.a	provide translation or interpretation		=		
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Italian		=		
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Italian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=		
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Italian	=			
<b>Art. 11 – Media</b>					
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Italian	=			
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Italian	=			
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Italian</li> <li>• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Italian</li> <li>• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Italian</li> </ul>	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Italian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=			
<b>Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities</b>					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Italian	=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Italian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=			
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Italian	=			
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Italian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=			
12.2	In territories other than those in which Italian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Italian				✓
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Italian and the culture it reflects				✓
<b>Art. 13 – Economic and social life</b>					
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Italian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=			
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Italian				=
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Italian in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Italian in economic and social life		↗		
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Italian in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents or ensure the implementation of such provisions				=

<sup>62</sup> This undertaking is currently not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian <sup>60</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Italian in economic and social life				=
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Italian		=		
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Italian				✓
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Italian				✓
<b>Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges</b>					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Italian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Italian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=			
14.b	for the benefit of Italian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Italian is used in identical or similar form	=			

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

### Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

75. Monitoring of education as required by Article 8.1.i is currently not in place. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 8.1.i not fulfilled. In light of the lack of practical use of Italian in administrative court proceedings, the Committee of Experts must revise its conclusion and consider the undertakings in Article 9. 1ci, cii, ciii formally fulfilled. Taking into consideration the information that parties have been asked to pay for interpretation in some cases, the Committee of Experts must revise its conclusion and consider the undertaking in Article 9.1.d only partly fulfilled. The Slovenian authorities do not have any data on cultural activities and facilities promoting Italian outside the “ethnically mixed areas”. The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking in Article 12.2. They also do not have any data on cases where Italian language and culture is included in Slovenia’s cultural policy abroad. The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking in Article 12.3. There are legal obligations for companies in the “ethnically mixed areas” to provide some information in Italian. A Programme for the Promotion of the Economic Base of the Italian national communities has been running for several years. In this context, Italian is also promoted. However, further steps are needed to facilitate/encourage the use of Italian in economic and social life. Moreover, the undertaking in Article 13.1.d applies “within the whole country”. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 13.1.d partly fulfilled. The authorities did not provide any information on safety instructions being drafted in Italian; according to the speakers this is not the case. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 13.2.d not fulfilled. Information concerning the rights of consumers is not made available by authorities in Italian. The possibility to receive oral information from staff of the Market Inspectorate is not sufficient in the context of this undertaking. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 13.2.e not fulfilled.

## **2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Slovenia**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of Slovenia to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Slovenia has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia<sup>63</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. Use the traditional forms of place names in Italian.**
- b. Ensure the provision of radio and television programmes in Italian at least at the present level.**
- c. Provide quality textbooks in Italian for all levels of education and adequate teacher training for subject teaching in Italian.**

### **II. Further recommendations**

- d. Ensure that social care facilities, in particular hospitals responsible for the “ethnically mixed areas”, offer the possibility of receiving and treating people in Italian.
- e. Promote awareness of the Italian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.
- f. Promote the use of Italian before courts and ensure that the use of interpreters does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned.
- g. Continue to take measures to facilitate the use of Italian in practice in administration, public services.
- h. Take practical measures to facilitate/encourage the use of Italian in economic and social life.

<sup>63</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)2](#).

## 2.5 Romani

### 2.5.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Romani <sup>64</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>					
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>					
7.1.a	recognition of Romani as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romani				= 65
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romani		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romani, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Romani • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=		
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romani at all appropriate stages				↗
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romani to learn it		=		
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romani at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romani	=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romani	=			
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among their objectives		=		
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romani • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romani	=			

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

<sup>64</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

<sup>65</sup> This undertaking is not applicable to Romani as a non-territorial language.

## **Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle**

76. It is not clear to which extent the classes organised in the framework of the pilot projects teach Romani, since, according to the periodical report, they consist in revisions of lessons' content in Romani. While acknowledging the efforts of the authorities, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the undertaking in Article 7.1.f.

### **2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Slovenia**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of Slovenia to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts' recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Slovenia has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia<sup>66</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

#### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. Start teaching Romani at all appropriate levels and develop a scheme for the training of teachers of Romani.**
- b. Promote awareness of the Romani language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.**

#### **II. Further recommendation**

- c. Ensure long-term sufficient funding to the cultural activities and organisations promoting Romani.

<sup>66</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)2](#).

## 2.6 Serbian

### 2.6.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Serbian <sup>67</sup>	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
<b>Part II of the Charter</b>					
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
<b>Art. 7 – Objectives and principles</b>					
7.1.a	recognition of Serbian as an expression of cultural wealth				=
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Serbian				=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Serbian				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Serbian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Serbian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=		
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Serbian at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Serbian to learn it				=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Serbian at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Serbian		=		
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Serbian				✓
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among their objectives				=
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Serbian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Serbian				=

\* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

**Fulfilled:** Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

**Partly fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

**Formally fulfilled:** Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

**Not fulfilled:** No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

**No conclusion:** The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

<sup>67</sup> In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

77. In the current monitoring cycle, the Slovenian authorities indicated that there is no legal basis for bilingual education in the case of minority communities which are not constitutionally recognised minorities. This demonstrates the impact of the lack of constitutional recognition in the Slovenian legal system and constitutes an unjustified distinction between traditionally used minority languages. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 7.2 not fulfilled.

## **2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Slovenia**

The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities of Slovenia to comply also with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. The following overview presents the Committee of Experts’ recommendations of the previous monitoring cycles which Slovenia has not yet implemented and the recommendations of the current monitoring cycle. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia<sup>68</sup> remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

### **I. Recommendations for immediate action**

- a. Recognise Serbian as a traditional minority language and start dialogue with the Serbian speakers with a view to implementing Part II of the Charter.**
- b. Develop and make available, in the area where the language has been traditionally spoken, an appropriate educational model for Serbian as a minority language from pre-school to secondary education.**

### **II. Further recommendations**

- c. Promote awareness of the Serbian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.
- d. Facilitate the broadcasting of local radio and television programmes in Serbian.
- e. Take resolute action to promote Serbian in public life, including by providing long-term sufficient funding for the cultural activities and organisations promoting Serbian.
- f. Ensure an adequate consultation of the relevant organisations representing the Serbian speakers on all matters pertaining to the protection and promotion of their language.

<sup>68</sup> [CM/RecChL\(2004\)3](#); [CM/RecChL\(2007\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2010\)5](#); [CM/RecChL\(2014\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2020\)2](#).

### Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the authorities of Slovenia have undertaken to protect the regional or minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Slovenia.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Having regard to the instrument of ratification deposited by Slovenia on 4 October 2000 and the declaration registered on 27 June 2007;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Slovenia;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Slovenia in its sixth periodical report, supplementary information given by the authorities of Slovenia, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Slovenia and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the authorities of Slovenia on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;

Recommends that the authorities of Slovenia take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. recognise Croatian, German and Serbian as minority languages traditionally spoken in Slovenia and apply the provisions of Part II to these languages, in co-operation with the speakers;
2. develop the teaching of the Romani language and culture at all appropriate levels;
3. strengthen the presence of Hungarian in bilingual education and provide adequate teacher training for teaching in Hungarian and in Italian;
4. ensure the provision of radio and television programmes in Hungarian and Italian at an appropriate level;
5. intensify measures to raise public awareness of the minority languages in mainstream education and in the mass media.

The Committee of Ministers invites the authorities of Slovenia to submit the information on the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action contained in the sixth report of the Committee of Experts in due course and their seventh periodical report by 1 January 2028.<sup>69</sup>

<sup>69</sup> See Committee of Ministers Decisions [CM/Del/Dec\(2018\)1330/10.4e](#), and Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties, [CM\(2019\)69 final](#).

## Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification



Slovenia

**Declaration contained in a Note Verbale from the Permanent Representation of Slovenia, dated 19 September 2000, handed to the Secretary General at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification, on 4 October 2000 – Or. Fr.**

In accordance with Article 7, paragraph 5, of the Charter, the Republic of Slovenia will apply *mutatis mutandis* the provisions of Article 7, paragraphs 1 to 4, also to the romani language.

**Period covered: 01/01/2001 -**

Articles concerned: 7

**Declaration contained in a Note verbale from the Permanent Representation of Slovenia, dated 26 June 2007, registered at the Secretariat General on 27 June 2007 – Or. Engl.**

The Republic of Slovenia declares that it accepts several other obligations of the Charter not already specified in a Note verbale handed to the Secretary General at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification. At the same time the Republic of Slovenia specifies the paragraphs or sub-paragraphs chosen in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, and Article 3, paragraph 2, of the Charter, from among the provisions of Part III of the Charter it applies in respect of each of the two languages it declared are considered as regional or minority languages in the territory of the Republic of Slovenia, respectively. In accordance with Article 3, paragraph 3, these undertakings are deemed to form an integral part of the ratification and have the same effect as from their date of notification. Within the meaning of the above-said, the Republic of Slovenia replaces the declaration contained in a Note verbale, dated 19 September 2000, with the following declaration:

"The Republic of Slovenia declares that the Italian and Hungarian languages are considered as regional or minority languages in the territory of the Republic of Slovenia within the meaning of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. In accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, of the Charter, the Republic of Slovenia will apply to these two languages the following provisions of the Part III of the Charter :

### **Article 8**

For the Italian language:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b (i), c (i), d (i), e (iii), f (iii), g, h, i

Paragraph 2

For the Hungarian language:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (ii), b (ii), c (ii), d (ii), e (iii), f (iii), g, h, i

Paragraph 2

### **Article 9**

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a

**Article 10**

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b, c

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3, sub-paragraph a

Paragraph 4

Paragraph 5

**Article 11**

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), e (i)

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3

**Article 12**

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, d, e, f

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3

**Article 13**

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1

Paragraph 2

**Article 14**

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph a

Paragraph b".

**Period covered: 27/06/2007 -**

Articles concerned: 2

## **Appendix II: Comments from the Slovenian authorities**

1. Regarding the recognition of Croatian, German, and Serbian as minority languages: The Republic of Slovenia explains that the legal framework for the recognition of national communities and their languages is linked to historical presence and constitutional provisions. The Croatian, German, and Serbian communities in Slovenia are not constitutionally recognized as indigenous national communities.

The Republic of Slovenia has adopted the Act on the Implementation of Cultural Rights of Members of National Communities of the Former Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia in the Republic of Slovenia (ZUKPPNS - Zakon o uresničevanju kulturnih pravic pripadnikov narodnih skupnosti narodov nekdanje Socialistične federativne republike Jugoslavije v Republiki Sloveniji), which has been in force since June 19, 2024 (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, No. 45/24) and regulates the ways of implementing the cultural rights of members of national communities of the former Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia in the Republic of Slovenia, support for their implementation, and the powers of the state.

2. Regarding the shortage of experts with knowledge of the Hungarian and Italian languages: Slovenia is aware of the challenges in ensuring adequate staffing.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages is an independent body that evaluates the compliance of the States Parties with their undertakings and, where appropriate, encourages them to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on 25 June 1992 and entered into force on 1 March 1998, is the European convention for the protection and promotion of regional and minority languages. It is designed to enable speakers to use them both in private and public life and obliges the States Parties to actively promote the use of these languages in education, courts, administration, media, culture, economic and social life, and cross- border co-operation.

Regional or minority languages are part of Europe's cultural heritage and their protection and promotion contribute to the building of a Europe based on democracy and cultural diversity.

The text of the Charter is available in over 50 languages.

[www.coe.int/minlang](http://www.coe.int/minlang)

**www.coe.int**

The Council of Europe is the continent's leading human rights organisation. It comprises 46 member states, including all members of the European Union. All Council of Europe member states have signed up to the European Convention on Human Rights, a treaty designed to protect human rights, democracy and the rule of law. The European Court of Human Rights oversees the implementation of the Convention in the member states.