

Strasbourg, 6 October 2017

DH-SYSC-I(2017)017

STEERING COMMITTEE FOR HUMAN RIGHTS (CDDH)

COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON THE SYSTEM
OF THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS
(DH-SYSC)

DRAFTING GROUP I ON THE FOLLOW-UP TO THE CDDH REPORT ON THE LONGER-TERM FUTURE OF THE SYSTEM OF THE CONVENTION (DH-SYSC-I)

Selection of candidates for Election as Judge to the European Court of Human Rights: procedure and selection criteria in member States

(prepared by the Secretariat)

ALBANIA /ALBANIE	5
ANDORRA / ANDORRE	6
ARMENIA / ARMÉNIE	7
AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE	7
AZERBAIJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN	8
BELGIUM / BELGIQUE	9
BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZÉGOVINE	10
BULGARIA / BULGARIE	10
CROATIA / CROATIE	10
CYPRUS / CHYPRE	
CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE	12
DENMARK / DANEMARK	
ESTONIA / ESTONIE	13
FINLAND / FINLANDE	
FRANCE	15
GEORGIA / GÉORGIE	15
GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE	
GREECE / GRÈCE	
HUNGARY / HONGRIE	
ICELAND / ISLANDE	
IRELAND / IRLANDE	
ITALY / ITALIE	
LATVIA / LETTONIE	
LIECHTENSTEIN	
LITHUANIA / LITUANIE	
LUXEMBOURG	
MALTA / MALTE	
REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / RÉPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA	
MONACO	
MONTENEGRO / MONTÉNÉGRO	
NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS	
NORWAY / NORVÈGE	
POLAND / POLOGNE	
PORTUGAL	
ROUMANIA / ROUMANIE	
RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FÉDÉRATION DE RUSSIE	
SAN MARINO / SAINT MARIN	
SERBIA / SERBIE	
SLOVAK REPUBLIC / RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE	
SLOVENIA / SLOVÉNIE	
SPAIN / ESPAGNE	
SWEDEN / SUÈDE	
SWITZERLAND / SUISSE	
"THE FORMER YUGOSLAV REPUBLIC OF MACEDONIA" / "L'EX-RÉPUBLIQUE YOUGOS	
DE MACÉDOINE"	
TURQUIE / TURKEY	
UKRAINE	
UNITED KINCDOM / ROVAUME-UNI	

Introduction

- 1. The table presented in this document was extracted from Appendix I to the draft report on the process of selection and election of judges of the European Court of Human Rights, prepared by the Chair and the Secretariat in view of the 3rd meeting of the Drafting Group I on the follow-up to the CDDH Report on the longer-term future of the system of the Convention (document DH-SYSC-I(2017)014). The CDDH agreed to separate the abovementioned appendix into a distinct reference document in order to serve as a basis for possible follow-up work (see CDDH(2017)R87 § 9 (iv)). This table presents the selection criteria and procedure for selection of candidates for election as judge to the European Court of Human Rights in Council of Europe member States. The data are presented member State by member State, and are based on information communicated to the PACE as well as the CDDH, DH-SYSC, and DH-SYSC-I.
- 2. The analysis of the table shows that the most commonly applied method of selection is a two-stage process. In 40 member States, such a process is conducted by a selection committee composed of individuals with a relevant background to carry out this task, such as officials working in the Ministry of Justice or the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Supreme Court, as well as members of bar associations and academics. The first stage of the selection process sees the candidates who have expressed their interest being preselected on the basis of the information they have provided in the framework of their application.
- 3. In 30 member States, in the second stage of the selection process, preselected candidates are invited for an interview.² Based on the results of both stages, the selection committee composes a shortlist of three candidates. The committee then presents the three shortlisted candidates to the government, parliament or another national executive or legislative body. In 5 member States the selection committee is required to include a defined ratio of women in its composition to ensure representation of both genders.³
- 4. In 38 member States, the call for applications is made through a public advertisement being published in national daily newspapers, legal journals, gazettes, official ministry webpages, as well as distributed to law faculties and lawyer associations.⁴

Albania, Andorra, Armenia, Austria, A

¹ Albania, Andorra, Armenia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Georgia, Greece, Iceland, Ireland, Latvia, Liechtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Republic of Moldova, Monaco, Montenegro, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Russian Federation, Serbia, Slovak Republic, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", Turkey, United Kingdom.

² Albania, Andorra, Armenia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Georgia, Iceland, Ireland, Latvia, Liechtenstein, Luxembourg, Republic of Moldova, Montenegro, Netherlands, Poland, Romania, Russian Federation, Serbia, Spain, Sweden, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", Turkey, United Kingdom.

³ Austria, Belgium, Croatia, Cyprus, Georgia.

⁴ Albania, Andorra, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Iceland, Ireland, Latvia, Liechtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, Republic of Moldova, Montenegro, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Romania, Russian Federation, Serbia, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", Turkey, United Kingdom.

- 5. Member States generally base their selection criteria on Article 21 of the European Convention on Human Rights, PACE Recommendation 1649 (2004), PACE Resolution 1646 (2009), as well as the Guidelines of the Committee of Ministers on the selection of candidates for the post of judge at the European Court of Human Rights (see document CM(2012)40-final). 31 member States refer in their selection criteria to Article 21 or generally to the rules set out in the Convention. The relevant recommendations and resolutions by the PACE are mentioned by 12 member States. Additionally, a total of 7 member States make reference to the Guidelines of the Committee of Ministers mentioned above.
- 6. Member States have different requirements regarding more specific criteria. The requirement for candidates to be of high moral character and to possess the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognised competence (as stated in Article 21(1) of the Convention), is distinctly mentioned by 21 member States. In 14 member States, candidates must have legal knowledge in the field of public international law, human rights and in particular the Convention and the case law of the Court. States require the candidates to have a certain amount of years of professional experience in a field of activity relevant to the work of the Court.
- 7. The requirement to master at least one of the official languages of the Court constitutes a specific criterion in 25 member States. Age limitations are mentioned by 5 States 2, all detailing a maximum age for a candidate to the position of judge at the Court except Georgia, which in addition to this also sets a minimum age of 30 years.
- 8. Gender-representation among candidates is mentioned in the selection criteria of 15 member States. ¹³ A total of 11 member States mention in their selection criteria the objective to present lists with candidates from both sexes. ¹⁴

⁸ Albania, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Czech Republic, Georgia, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Luxembourg, Montenegro, Netherlands, Norway, Romania, Slovak Republic, Slovenia, Sweden, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", United Kingdom.

⁵ Albania, Andorra, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Georgia, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Latvia, Luxembourg, Malta, Republic of Moldova, Monaco, Montenegro, Netherlands, Norway, Portugal, Romania, Russian Federation, Slovak Republic, Spain, Sweden, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", United Kingdom.

⁶ Andorra, Azerbaijan, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Lithuania, Malta, Monaco, Russian Federation, Sweden, Turkey.

⁷ Belgium, Finland, France, Germany, Iceland, Liechtenstein, Monaco.

Albania, Austria, Belgium, Czech Republic, Denmark, Georgia, Ireland, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Poland, Serbia, Sweden, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", United Kingdom.

¹⁰ Georgia, Slovak Republic, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", Turkey, United Kingdom.

¹¹ Albania, Andorra, Armenia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, Georgia, Hungary, Ireland, Latvia, Luxembourg, Montenegro, Netherlands, Norway, Romania, Serbia, Slovenia, Spain, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia", United Kingdom.

¹² Croatia, Czech Republic, Georgia, Spain, "The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia".

Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, Georgia, Luxembourg, Malta, Norway, Poland, Romania, Spain, Switzerland, Turkey.

¹⁴ Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, Luxembourg, Malta, Poland, Romania, Spain, Turkey.

<u>Table: Selection of candidates for Election as Judge to the European Court of Human</u> <u>Rights: procedure and selection criteria in member States</u>

MJ: Ministry of Justice

MFA / MAE: Ministry of Foreign Affairs

MEMBER STATE	SELECTION PROCEDURE /	SELECTION CRITERIA /
/ ÉTAT MEMBRE	PROCÉDURE DE SÉLECTION	CRITÈRES DE SÉLECTION
ALBANIE	 "Justice system reform" on 21 July 2016 adopted by the Parliament: creation of a special mechanism designed to propose a check process (the vetting) of every judge and prosecutor at any level. The ad-hoc consultative Commission (the Commission) for carrying out the election procedures is composed of the Chairperson and 4 members who have a significant professional experience. They are experts in Public International Law and Human Rights with knowledge of the English and French languages; a constitutionalist, a former representative of Albania at the Venice Commission, a former judge at the ECHR, the President of the Constitutional Court, the Dean of the Law Faculty (former member of the Supreme Court) and the Director of the Legislation Department of the Prime Minister's Office. In support of the Commission, a technical group was set up. It is composed of a representative from the Prime Minister's Office, a lawyer from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, a lawyer from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, a lawyer from the Ministry of Justice. Call for application in the Official Announcements Bulletin of the Republic of Albania, in the official website of the Prime Minister's Office and reflected it in the media. 1st stage: Based on the criteria of the call for application and the characteristics of 	 To be Albanian citizens. To be lawyers. Shall be of high moral character and must either possess the qualifications required for appointment to a high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognised competence. To have the legal knowledge and practical experience of the national legal system, of public international law, mainly in the field of human rights. To master the Albanian language, one of the official languages of the Council of Europe (English or French) and have at least a basic knowledge of the other language. Mastering both official languages of the Council of Europe shall be deemed an advantage.

- the candidates who appeared, the Commission decided to call all the candidates to continue to the 2nd stage of the selection procedure, that of the interview.
- 50% in one of the official languages of the Council of Europe (English or French).
- Each member of the Commission assessed each candidate secretly assessing their overall performance.
- After the interviews, the Commission, by secret ballot, proposed a list of 3 candidates.

Information as communicated to PACE in January 2015

ANDORRA / ANDORRE

- Announcement is published in the Official Gazette.
- Any interested individuals who met the criteria laid down in the PACE's recommendations and the Convention are required to submit their candidatures and CVs in English and French to the MFA.
- A selection commission of 5 members is set up (the Director of Multilateral Affairs and Co-operation, the Ministry for Foreign Affairs (Chair), the Head of the Private Office of the Head of Government, the Director for the Interior, Ministry of Justice and Interior, a lawyer in the Government's legal office, a lawyer and professor of European law from the University of Barcelona.) The commission meets twice.
- The purpose of the first meeting is to analyse and assess the various candidatures received, in particular to check that the candidates' CVs meet the requirements.
- The purpose of the second meeting is to prepare one-hour interviews.
- Following deliberation, the selection commission submits the national list of three candidates to the Council of Ministers for approval.

- Criteria laid down in the Parliamentary Assembly's recommendations and in the European Convention on Human Rights.
- CVs.
- Experience.
- Reasons for applying.
- Language skills.

ARMENIA / ARMÉNIE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in May 2015</u> and supplemented by information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)005</u>)

See the detailed presentation in doc DH-SYSC-I(2016)005

- Requirements and Documents Consistency Verification (Eligibility Verification) by an independent and impartial commission
- Interview: the Commission invites the candidates who meet the requirement of eligibility to interviews. (Oral round of selection of candidates was transparent (i.e. it was broadcasted, journalists and other third parties were present.));
- The interview of each candidate is divided in 3 phases: (i) interview on personal character, (ii) interview on professional qualities, and (iii) language skills test.
- 4 specialists were invited to support the Commission for the evaluation of the language skills (2 English and 2 French language specialists).
- Comprisal of the Short List of the Winning Candidates. The final list of candidates to be presented to the Parliamentary Assembly was made public at national level.
- Submission of the Proposed List of three Candidates to the President and its Endorsement.

- Shall be of high moral character and possess the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognized competence.
- Gender-representation measure: the highest evaluated representative of under-represented gender (in this case females) is to be included into the list, replacing the third evaluated candidate.
- Evaluation criteria: sense of justice, perception of and attitude towards the fundamental values of the Convention, professional knowledge, professional skills, professional experience, professional authority, main language skills, ability to comprehend the meaning of a genuine text in the second language and describe it in Armenian.

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Information as communicated to PACE in February 2016

- A public call for candidatures is issued in the specialized press.
- Supreme Courts and universities are informed.
- Interviews with the candidates are conducted by a commission composed of four senior officials (one of them a woman) of the Federal Chancellery, the Federal Ministry for Europe, Integration and Foreign Affairs and the Federal Ministry for Science, Research and Economy. Interview with all five candidates. Skills in the two official languages assessed during the interview.
- A list of three candidates is subsequently

- Specialized legal knowledge and other skills relevant for the position of Judge at the ECtHR.
- Skills in the two official languages of the Council of Europe.

submitted to the Austrian Federal Government, which endorses this list and decides to nominate these three persons as Austrian candidates for the position of Austrian Judge at the ECtHR.

- The Austrian Parliament is informed about this decision.
- The nomination procedure is also reported in the Austrian media.

AZERBAÏDJAN / AZERBAÏDJAN

Information as communicated to PACE in August 2016

- In March 2016 the Government requested the Judicial and Legal Council, an independent body of judicial self-government to nominate the candidates to include in the Government's list of candidates for election as judge.
- Notice in an independent daily legal periodical and placed on websites of the Judicial and Legal Council and of the MJ.
- Period for submission: 1 month.
- The Council summoned seven out of twelve applicants to interviews.
- Criteria specified in Recommendation 1649 (2004) and Resolution 1646 (2009) of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe and those indicated in the Panel's Final Activity Report (§§ 26-31 and 34-35).
- Certain balance between the sexes or between different branches of the legal profession
- Legal expertise.
- Professional experience.
- Suitability to exercise the role of judge.
- Guarantees of independence and impartiality.
- The linguistic abilities and suitability to work as part of a team within an international environment.
- Active knowledge of one and a passive knowledge of the other official language of the Council of Europe.
- Every list should contain candidates of both sexes.

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Information contained in <u>CDDH-SC(2011)002Rev.2</u> and supplemented by information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)005)</u>

- Le Bureau de l'Agent devant la Cour procède à un appel public à candidatures largement publié (Moniteur belge, lettre aux Cours suprêmes, à l'Ordre des Barreaux et aux universités). L'appel contient une phrase invitant spécifiquement les femmes à se porter candidates à la fonction de juge.
- Appel publié durant 1 mois (pouvant être allongé d'un mois selon les nécessités).
- L'appel à candidature est envoyé à toutes les universités belges, aux deux ordres des avocats, au collège des Procureurs généraux, à la Cour constitutionnelle, au Conseil d'Etat ainsi qu'aux présidents des assemblées parlementaires fédérales.
- Aucune présélection des candidatures n'est opérée : l'ensemble des candidats ayant réagi à l'appel (par envoi de CV) est soumis à l'interview.
- Le jury compte six personnes (un magistrat, deux parlementaires, un membre du Conseil Supérieur de la Justice et deux membres du bureau de l'Agent du Gouvernement devant la Cour). Il est composé de manière à représenter tant un équilibre politique qu'une représentation équitable hommes-femmes. Chaque membre du jury note les candidats sur les réponses données aux diverses questions (entretien de 45 minutes testant tant les connaissances de la jurisprudence de la Cour que les connaissances linguistiques (EN/FR)). La note finale de chaque candidat résulte de l'addition des scores attribués par chaque membre du jury. Ainsi, l'évaluation des qualifications et de l'expérience de chaque candidat se fait sur un strict pied d'égalité.

- Considération morale mais il n'existe pas de procédure de vérification de ce critère.
- Compétence pour l'exercice de hautes fonctions judiciaires ou juridiques (avocat, professeur d'université...). Lors de l'entretien de 45 minutes, les questions portent sur l'expérience professionnelle des candidats.
- Connaissances de la jurisprudence de la Cour (notamment mise en perspective de la jurisprudence de la Cour à partir d'un arrêt spécifique et de son impact sur le système légal national).
- Faire face aux défis (réforme, arriéré, crédibilité, confiance du public et des institutions nationales et internationales à son égard).
- L'entretien se déroule en partie en français, en partie, en anglais. Il est attendu du candidat qu'il ait, au moins, une connaissance active de l'une des langues officielles du Conseil de l'Europe et passive de l'autre.
- Disponibilité requise pour une activité à plein temps et leur disponibilité leur est demandée lors de l'entretien.
- Invitant spécifiquement les femmes à se porter candidates à la fonction de juge. Le jury est composé d'au moins une femme.
- Les principes qui se dégagent des Lignes directrices sont scrupuleusement respectés par la procédure de sélection.

BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE-HERZEGOVINE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in March 2012</u> and supplemented by information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)005)</u>

- Job posting in three leading daily newspapers in Bosnia and Herzegovina.
- The authorized body (which in this
- particular case is BiH MFA) announces an open competition for this position, considers fulfilment of administrative conditions and deadlines of the applications received, and submits to BiH Presidency all applications of the candidates meeting the criteria the Presidency of BiH makes the final selection of three candidates.
- High moral integrity and possess qualifications requested for fulfilling high judicial duties, that is, be a recognised legal expert;
- Be fluent in one, and have the knowledge of the other official language of the Council of Europe (the English and French languages);
- A judge acts in his or her personal capacity;
- During his or her mandate the judge cannot perform duties or jobs which are incompatible with his or her independence, impartiality or requests of the permanent service.

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

No recent information available.

CROATIA/

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in March 2012</u>

- The Candidate Selection Committee was established by the Decision of the Government of the Republic of Croatia.
- The Decision prescribes the tasks and composition of the Committee, including the obligation of publishing a public tender for the selection of candidates when the requirements have been met. The Decision stipulates the obligation to publish a public tender in two daily papers, in the Official Gazette and on the MJ website.
- Committee tasks include submitting the proposal to the Government of the Republic of Croatia. The Decision also prescribes that the Ministry of Justice provides professional, administrative and technical support to the Committee.
- Committee is composed of a Representative of the Justice Committee of the Croatian Parliament in the capacity of

- Be of high moral character;
- Possess the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognized competence;
- Be younger than 70;
- Assume the obligation to discontinue all activities which could be incompatible with their independence, impartiality or the requirement of working full time during their term, if selected.
- Active knowledge of one, and a passive knowledge of the other, official language of the Council of Europe.

	the Committee Chairperson and one representative from each of the following institutions: Constitutional Court of the Republic of Croatia, Supreme Court of the Republic of Croatia, Ministry of Justice and one representative chosen from faculties of law. Both genders are represented in the Committee (two female and three male members). • Term of 30 days for the submission of candidate applications. • The Committee concluded there was no need for an interview with the three short-listed candidates since they are known to the general public and Committee members for their professional activities and decided to submit the proposal on the selection of candidates to the Government.	
CYPRUS / CHYPRE	 Information as communicated to PACE in Noncommunicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc DH-SYSC) Decision by the Council of Ministers of the Republic (Decision 76.854 of 3rd July 2014). The call for applications is widely available to the public by publication in the Official Gazette of the Republic and dissemination via the Supreme Court, Cyprus Bar Association and Commissioner for the Protection of Human Rights and also dissemination via universities. A selection body is established under the authority of the MFA whose mandate is to evaluate the candidates and recommend up to five candidates to the Government. The selection body interviews all serious candidates. (Members of the selection body are drawn from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Justice and Public Order, Office of the Attorney General, the judiciary, Office of the Commissioner for the Protection of Human Rights, the Cyprus Bar 	
	Association and academics from the universities in Cyprus). • Candidates were selected upon evaluation	

	of all candidatures submitted and interviews held by the competent national	
	 committee. The final decision of candidates to be presented to the Parliamentary Assembly is taken by the President of the Republic. 	
	Information as communicated to PACE in April 20	12
CZECH REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE	 L'organisation de la procédure de sélection des candidats appartient au MJ qui fait appel à candidatures, organise les entretiens avec les candidats, établit la liste de candidats et la présente pour approbation au Gouvernement. Il peut être fait recours à une évaluation des connaissances linguistiques du candidat sans que cette possibilité soit davantage précisée dans les règles applicables à la procédure de sélection. Un appel à candidatures tout à fait ouvert est lancé, tenu d'assurer la publicité la plus large possible à l'appel à candidatures et doit notamment publier l'appel sur ses pages web et l'annoncer aux tribunaux, aux différentes unités du ministère public, aux organisations professionnelles de juristes et aux doyens des facultés de droit des universités publiques. Délai de présentation des candidatures : 	tre de nationalité tchèque avoir un haut caractère moral ouvoir être nommé juge d'une our suprême ou de la Cour constitutionnelle ou être un uriste renommé offrir des garanties 'indépendance et d'impartialité; avoir une connaissance affisante de la problématique de a protection internationale des roits de l'homme et surtout de a jurisprudence de la Cour; avoir une connaissance active e l'une des langues officielles e la Cour au moins. Critères complémentaires : connaissance active de l'autre angue officielle; e pas entraîner la nécessité de
	de sélection a été relancée suite au rejet du projet de liste par le Gouvernement. • le que le le le que le le le que le	ommer un juge ad hoc; e candidat devrait avoir un âge ui lui permet d'accomplir tout e mandat.
DENMARK/ DANEMARK	Information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc DE SC(2011)002Rev.2) • Independent standing committee of five • In	H-SYSC-I(2016)005 and CDDH- n addition to the moral qualities
DANEWIAKK	members appointed by the MJ upon nomination from the President of the Supreme Court (nomination of the chairman of the Committee), the Presidents of the High Courts, the Council of the Danish Bar and Law Society, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Justice respectively.	and data to the moral quanties and experience expected of andidates laid down in Art.21§1 of the Convention. Experience in the field of human ghts. Candidates of both sexes. Ufficient knowledge of at least ne of the two official languages. James of the candidates are
		laced in alphabetical order.

	as the secretariat of the Committee.
•	Publication of the vacancy in Djøfblad
	1. 11 . 1. 1. 1.

- let (a biweekly periodical issues to members working within the field of law, business economics and political), on two major websites for vacant positions in Denmark and on websites of the MJ and MFA.
- The Committee summoned 5 out 7 applicants to interviews and proposed to the Government three candidates.
- As far as possible no candidate should be submitted whose election might result in the necessity to appoint an ad hoc

ESTONIA / **ESTONIE**

Information as communicated to PACE in June 2010 and information contained in doc CDDH-SC(2011)002Rev.2

- Legal grounds: § 9(9) of the Foreign Relations Act of Estonia.
- MFA publishes an announcement for public competition in two daily newspapers, in electronically published publication and on the Internet web-pages of MFA, MJ, the Supreme Court and webpages of the organisations gathering lawvers.
- MFA forms a committee for review of the submitted applications and selection of the candidates.
- Members of the Committee: Minister of Foreign Affairs (chairman), the Minister of Justice, the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, the Chancellor of Justice and the Secretary of State (see §9(9) of the Foreign Relations Act above). All members of the Committee are entitled to consult with the institution they are representing and ask for an expert opinion.
- Public competition with a duration of up to 4 weeks.
- The Committee reviews the applications that have been submitted and selects three candidates. It has the right to ask for additional information from the candidates and to interview them.
- The decision of the Committee should be made by the simple majority of the votes, all members of the Committee must vote.
- The decision of the Committee should be made by the simple majority of the votes, all members of the Committee must vote.

- Criteria for the judges set forth in the Convention and in the relevant documents of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe.
- Selected candidates fulfilled the criteria set forth judges in Estonia, especially in article 47 of the Courts Act, incl. requirements to the education and requirements not to be convicted of criminal offence.

The MFA and the MJ must be in favour	r
the decision.	

- The chairman of the Committee presented the list of three selected candidates to the Government for approval.
- The Government approves the list by its order. The Government has the right to refuse to approve the list but there has never been such a situation in Estonia.

FINLAND/ FINLANDE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in February 2015</u> and supplemented by information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)002</u> and <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)005</u>)

See the detailed presentation in doc DH-SYSC-I(2016)005

- Finland has, in 2010, reformed the procedures for nominating candidates for judges or members of international courts and tribunals and the Court of Justice of the European Union, by amending the Act on Judicial Appointments (amendment No. 741 / 2010).
 - The MFA initiates the procedure by notifying the Expert Advisory Board of the vacancy and advertising it in major national newspapers, on the website of the MFA, sent by e-mail to the Supreme Court, the Supreme Administrative Court, all Courts of Appeal, the Association of Finnish Lawyers, the Finnish Bar Association, and to all universities having a faculty of law.
 - The Board examines the applications in the light of the criteria.
 - It may interview eligible candidates.
 - The Board may also test the applicants' language skills and take into account other relevant matters, such as their communication skills.
 - The Minister of Foreign Affairs presents the list of three candidates recommended by the Board and the Government appoints the list of candidates in its plenary session.

- The criteria set forth in the ECHR and by the Council of Europe (including the non-binding Guidelines on the selection for the post of judge at the European Court of Human Rights and their Explanatory Memorandum) are expressed in the announcement of the MFA.
- Specific consideration to the recommendation of the Parliamentary Assembly to present candidates of both sexes is given.
- Proficiency in at least one of the official languages of the CoE is required.

FRANCE

Information as provided to PACE in February 2011

- Un appel public à candidatures est publié sur le site internet du ministère des Affaires étrangères, sur celui du ministère de la Justice et également signalé dans plusieurs revues juridiques.
- L'examen des candidatures est confié au Groupe national français de la Cour permanente d'arbitrage, comme pour l'élection des juges français d'autres juridictions internationales permanentes (CIJ et CPI) (ce groupe est composé de 4 membres : présidé actuellement par un ancien directeur des affaires juridiques au ministère des affaires étrangères et ancien juge à la Cour internationale de justice, et composé en outre d'une professeure émérite de droit public, du directeur des affaires juridiques au ministères des affaires étrangères et d'une ancienne directrice des affaires juridiques au ministère des affaires étrangères).
- Cette instance auditionne les candidats dont la candidature lui semble correspondre le mieux aux fonctions postulées, au regard des critères de sélection définis par la Convention et les lignes directrices du comité des ministres.

• La sélection est effectuée au regard de l'article 21 de la Convention EDH, des Lignes directrices du Comité des Ministres concernant la sélection des candidats au poste de juge à la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme, ainsi que des diverses recommandations de l'APCE en la matière.

GEORGIA/ GÉORGIE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in August 2016</u> and supplemented by information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)005</u>)

See the detailed presentation in doc DH-SYSC-I(2016)005

- Commission was chaired by the MJ and was comprised of 5 female and 6 male members.
- At the first stage, candidates' CVs and supporting documents were verified.
- At the next stage, the State Commission contracted the British Council office in Georgia and the French Institute in Georgia, where candidates took free language tests (APTIS) respectively.
- Commission gathered at the Justice Training Center facility to interview the successful 12 candidates. Media

- Shall be a citizen of Georgia of legal capacity, between the age of 30-65 years;
- Has perfect command of the state language;
- Has good command of one of the official languages of the Council of Europe (English or French);
- Has perfect knowledge of the European Convention on Human Rights, relevant case law and has working experience in this field;
- Has perfect knowledge of the principles of public international law and the legislation of

DH-SYSC-I(20	017)017	
GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE	representatives had the right to attend the interviews and/or take comments from those candidates who had previously agreed to speak to media. Each member of the State Commission evaluated each of the candidates separately. After interviewing all the candidates, the State Commission shall approve 2 lists of candidates according to their gender, on the basis of the average scores in decreasing order. The Government of Georgia examined the files of the 5 shortlisted candidates, heard the Chair of the State Commission and chose the 3 candidates for nomination. Information as communicated to PACE in Apcommunicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc DH-SYSC) Public call: announcements are placed in the newspapers Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung and Süddeutsche Zeitung, as well as in Neue Juristische Wochenschrift, a specialized law journal. A press release calling for expressions of interested was released by the Federal MF and the notice was also placed on the Justice Ministry's website. All federal courts, the Federal Prosecutor General, the German Judges Association, the German Bar Association (Deutscher Anwaltverein), the German Federal Bar (Bundesrechtsanwaltskammer), and the German Institute for Human Rights were informed that interested persons should be invited to apply or that their names should be submitted to the Ministry. The Federal Government selects the three most suitable candidates from among the candidates who contacted the Federal Ministry of Justice or who were recommended by third parties.	

GREECE / GRÈCE

Information as communicated to PACE in June 2010

- MJ et MAE font un appel public qui est publié sur le site web du MAE.
- L'appel à manifestation d'intérêt a été transmis aux présidents des Cours. suprêmes de la Grèce (Cour suprême civile et pénale, Conseil d'Etat, Cour des comptes) ainsi qu'aux doyens des facultés de droit grecques en vue d'une plus large diffusion auprès de tous les membres du corps judiciaire et des facultés de droit. Cet appel a été aussi publié dans des journaux à gros tirage.
- Une commission composée de trois membres, à savoir le Secrétaire Général du MAE, le Secrétaire Général du ministère de la Justice, de la Transparence et des Droits de l'homme et le président du Conseil juridique de l'Etat, a examiné attentivement les candidatures et adressé des recommandations au ministre des Affaires étrangères et au ministre de la Justice, de la Transparence et des Droits de l'homme.
- Critères relatifs à l'élection des juges près la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme, tels qu'ils sont énoncés à la fois dans la Convention européenne des droits de l'homme et les résolutions applicables de l'Assemblée parlementaire, notamment la Résolution 1646(2009).

HUNGARY/ HONGRIE

Information as communicated to PACE in August 2016

• The Minister of Justice is responsible for the ECHR matters within the structure of the Government.

Le MAE et le MJ ont choisi les trois candidats à inscrire sur la liste.

- The minister discusses with various competent experts concerning the nomination. He also discusses with the potential candidates in order to receive information about the depth and breadth of the professional knowledge and experience of the candidates.
- Upon the proposal of the minister, the Government takes the decision concerning the list of candidates. After the decision of the Government, the minister requests the Ambassador to transmit the necessary documents to the Advisory Panel and later to the Parliamentary Assembly.
- Submits their names in alphabetical order.

- The depth and breadth of the professional experience of the candidates is of a sufficiently high level for the position to exercise judicial functions in the ECHR, they are considered a jurisconsult of standing or a person entitled to be appointed to high judicial office within the meaning of Article 21 (1) of the Convention.
- Taken carefully into consideration not only the professional background of the candidates, but also their linguistic capacities as well as how they would qualify as judges.

 Have been named after a wide range of consultations with various experts, having taken carefully into consideration not only the professional background of the candidates, but also their linguistic capacities as well as how they would qualify as judges.

ICELAND/ ISLANDE

Information as communicated to PACE in March 2013

- Notice placed on the website of the Ministry of the Interior, and on the public advertisement site of the Government Offices, in the Legal Gazette and in the jobs sections of the two most widely circulated newspapers in Iceland.
- A separate notice was sent to all law schools in Iceland, all the courts of law, the Bar Association and the Lawyers' Association.
- Discussed in mainstream and Internet news media.
- Committee of five members appointed, three women and two men (a Professor at the Reykjavik University School of Law and ad hoc judge at the European Court of Human Rights, an attorney to the Supreme Court, a Supreme Court Judge, the Chief Judge, and the ambassador, nominated by the Ministry for Foreign Affair). The Ministry appointed the chairman of the committee ex officio.
- Interviews all candidates.
- In the event that the candidate do not meet the level of language proficiency required for the post of judge in an official language [the second], s/he has to confirm his intention to follow intensive language classes of the language concerned prior to, and if need be also at the beginning of, the term of duty, if elected a judge on the Court.

- Eligibility requirements for nomination in accordance with Article 21 of the ECHR and the qualifications to accept the office in accordance with the Guidelines of the Council of Europe CM(2012)40 of 29 March 2012.
- Sign a declaration, with reference to Article 21 of the Act on the ECHR, to the effect that they had not said, done or written anything which might harm the reputation of the Court, that they would not engage in any activity which is incompatible with the independence of judges at the European Court of Human Rights, their impartiality or the requirements made with regard to a full-time office as a judge at the Court and that they would not foreseeably be disqualified in general from hearing cases brought before the Court.

Information as communicated to PACE in February 2015 and information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc CDDH-SC(2011)002Rev.2) IRELAND / **IRLANDE** Advertisement in Irish and English posted The advertisement makes it clear in the national newspapers, circulated to that only candidates of a high appropriate persons in the legal standard with an established community, posted on the Department of reputation and meeting the FA and Trade website and on the Public requirements of Article 21 of the Appointments Service website. Convention and the Applications are considered by a Selection requirements contained in the Panel convened by the Attorney General relevant recommendations and to advise on persons qualified to act as a resolutions of the Parliamentary judge of the ECHR. Assembly of the Council of The Selection Panel was composed of: the Europe should apply Director General of the Office of the • Refer to a high level of Attorney General, an Established achievement in the areas of law Professor of Law and Head of the School in which they have been of Law at NUI Galway, part-time engaged and experience relevant Commissioner of the Law Reform to the post of judge of the Commission and a retired Supreme Court European Court of Human Rights, • A short list of nine candidates was drawn • Have the capacity to learn and up and those persons were interviewed by understand other legal, the Selection Panel. constitutional and political The Selection Panel recommended three of systems, the interviewees be put forward as • Have the ability to communicate candidates for election and the effectively orally and in writing Government accepted this particularly in the role of judge recommendation. rapporteur, and to work well in a chamber of international judges, • Have a good knowledge of the European Convention on Human Rights and the case-law of the Court. • Have an operational working knowledge of French. ITALY/ITALIE No recent information provided Information as communicated to PACE in April 2015 LATVIA / • Public and open call (official edition Eligibility requirements for the **LETTONIE** Latvijas Vēstnesis ("Latvian Herald") and position as Judge at the European widely disseminated among the official Court of Human Rights in websites of the Cabinet of Ministers, the accordance with Article 21 of the European Convention on Human MFA, the MJ and the domestic courts,

	·	
	enclosing model CV).	Rights.
	• Establishment of a Selection Committee.	Linguistic competences.
	• The Selection Committee assesses whether	
	all applicants meet the eligibility	
	requirements.	
	The Selection Committee invites the	
	remaining applicants to one-hour	
	interviews in Latvian and in English.	
	The Selection Committee through secret	
	ballot, chooses three candidates for	
	inclusion on the list of candidates.	
	The list of three candidates and the	
	English versions of the curriculum vitae is	
	transmitted to the Advisory Panel of	
	Experts on Candidates in order to obtain	
	its view.	
	• The opinion of the Advisory Panel is	
	discussed in the meeting of the Selection	
	Committee which unanimously decided to	
	submit the list of three candidates for the	
	approval by the Cabinet of Ministers.	
	The Cabinet of Ministers has to approve	
	the list of candidates as proposed by the	
	Selection Committee, and submits it to	
	PACE.	
	Information as communicated to PACE in Jan	uary 2015 and information
LIECHTENSTEIN	communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc DH-SYSC	<u>C-I(2016)002</u>)
	The Government establishes a selection	Takes into account the relevant
	body to submit a list of three candidates.	criteria, e.g. the Committee of
	• Five experts are nominated to this body:	Ministers' Guidelines on the
	the Director of the Office for FA (Chair),	selection of candidates for the
	the Director of the Office of Justice, the	post of judge at the ECtHR.
	Deputy Director of the Office of Human	
	Resources and Organisation, the President	
	of the Constitutional Court and a Swiss	
	University Professor.	
	• A public call for applications is published.	
	After the selection body had carefully	
	assessed the written applications, 11	
	applicants were invited for interviews,	
	including an assessment of applicants'	
	linguistic abilities.	
	The selection body decided unanimously	
	on a list of three candidates and the	
	Government approved this decision.	

LITHUANIA / LITUANIE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in April 2013</u> and information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>CDDH-SC(2011)002Rev.2</u>)

- Pursuant to Article 77 of the Constitution of the Republic of Lithuania, the ECHR partially amended by the Protocol No. 11 and No. 14 and taking into consideration the proposal submitted by the Prime Minister.
- A working group composed of the Minister of Justice (chairperson of the group), MFA, the Chairperson of the Parliamentary Committee on Human Rights, the Chairperson of the Parliamentary Committee on Legal Affairs, the Chancellor of the Prime Minister, the Senior Advisor to the President of the Republic, and the Chairperson of the Judicial Council was formed by the Prime Minister and entrusted with the task of pre-selection of candidates.
- Call for candidatures in the Official Gazette (its supplement for information notes) and two biggest dailies ("Lietuvos rytas" and "Respublika") and on the MJ's website.
- The call is brought to the attention of Lithuanian lawyers' associations and law faculties of Lithuanian universities.
- The working group publicly announces the names of the selected candidates and brings it as a recommendation to the attention of the Prime Minister.
- The Prime Minister, having assessed the recommendation from the working group regarding the choice of candidates, proposes the list of three candidates to the President of the Republic.
- The President of the Republic, having assessed the proposal from the Prime Minister and the recommendation from the working group, finalizes the list of candidates by issuing the decree.
- The MFA then informs the Council of Europe of the outcome of the selection procedure.

• Requirements set out in the ECHR and in the Parliamentary Assembly resolution No. 1646 (2009).

DH-SYSC-I(20	017)017	
	• The draft law envisages a procedure involving the participation of the Government, the President of the Republic and the Parliament. The Parliament has not yet examined it in 2011.	
	Information as communicated to PACE in Feb	oruary 2015
LUXEMBOURG	 L'appel à candidature est publié dans les principaux quotidiens et hebdomadaires du Luxembourg (le Luxemburger Wort, le Tageblatt, Je Journal et le Letzebuerger Land.); et sur le site Internet MJ et au Journal officiel du Luxembourg, et diffusé par voie électronique aux barreaux du Luxembourg et à la magistrature. Toutes les candidatures reçues dans le délai sont soumises à l'examen de l'organe de sélection constitué de manière ad hoc créé par le ministre de la Justice. Ce dernier s'est adressé par voie de courrier officiel aux personnes ou instances qu'il voulait voir siéger au sein d'un comité de sélection national du juge luxembourgeois à la CEDH. Le comité de sélection national s'est réuni à plusieurs reprises, afin de discuter des modalités pratiques des entretiens, d'examiner et valider les demandes de candidatures entrées au ministère de la Justice, puis effectuer les entretiens des candidats qui remplissent les conditions requises, en partie menés en langue anglaise, d'une durée de 45 minutes chacun. Les membres du panel délibèrent ensuite puis votent par bulletin secret, chacun ayant la possibilité d'y écrire le nom de trois candidats. Cette liste ainsi que les noms des autres candidats est remise au ministre de la Justice qui la fait sienne. La liste est rendue publique par voie de communiqué de presse et sur le site Internet du MJ, et l'information est largement reprise par tous les médias nationaux 	 Etre des juristes jouissant de la plus haute considération morale et réunissant les conditions requises pour l'exercice de hautes fonctions judiciaires du pays ou possédant une compétence notoire; Avoir une expérience juridique pratique et des connaissances du système légal luxembourgeois et en droit international public notamment dans le domaine des droits de l'Homme; Maîtriser la langue nationale et l'une des langues officielles du Conseil de l'Europe et avoir au moins une connaissance passive de l'autre langue. La maîtrise des deux langues du Conseil de l'Europe sera considérée comme un avantage. Le Gouvernement luxembourgeois accorde une importance particulière à pouvoir présenter une liste mixte. Les candidat(e)s ne peuvent exercer aucune activité incompatible avec les exigences d'indépendance, d'impartialité ou de disponibilité requises par un exercice à temps plein du mandat de juge.

nationaux.

MALTA/MALTE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in April 2010</u> and information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)002</u>)

- The Government of Malta published a call for applications in English and Maltese languages, in the four Maltese languages, in the four Maltese daily newspapers.
- Of the three candidates to be selected at least one would be female.
- Specific reference to Art.21 of the ECHR and the relative Parliamentary Assembly resolutions on the election of judges.
- Malta is aware of its obligation to ensure that the Court is composed of the highest quality judges and consequently has always sought to ensure that candidates of the highest standard are nominated for election as Judges of the Court.

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / RÉPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Information as communicated to PACE in August 2012

- Process was conditioned *inter alia* by the adoption by the Committee of Ministers of the Guidelines.
- The Regulations and the Commission's composition were largely disseminated through the Official Gazette and official web-database of the Ministry of Justice. Civil society has also been involved in the decision making process.
- The Commission consisted of 17 notorious persons, representing all competent national authorities and institutions, academic staff, civil society (5 out 17 members were women).
- All members of the Commission were equal in their opinion and votes to be casted, each of them having had the right to a dissenting opinion.
- The selection procedure encompassed three stages: (i) call for candidates, (ii) shortlisting, (iii) written test and interview.
- Candidates were called to submit their applications during one month time.
- The public call was largely disseminated via the Official Gazette, mass-media, official web-sites of the Moldovan diplomatic missions and the official webpage of the MJ.
- Nine candidates applied for the selection,

- Criteria under Article 21 of the Convention.
- Candidates declared that they do not have any pending applications before the European Court, neither as an applicant nor as a representative.

•	
 all of them being shortlisted for the next stage which included written test and interview. The first meeting of the Commission was video recorded and broadcasted. Consequently, the press was allowed to reflect the following stages of the selection procedure. Two by two interpreters from English and French languages (two university professors and two licensed interpreters) were present during the interview. They tested the candidates' language proficiency in both official languages of the Council of Europe. The national selection procedure was won by the first three candidates who obtained the highest grades. 	2015
 Liste présentée par le Gouvernement de la Principauté de Monaco. L'instance nationale de sélection des candidats au poste de juge à la CEDH est chargée d'émettre un avis au Gouvernement Princier sur les candidatures. Commission issue d'une décision administrative qui prend en considération les lignes directrices du Comité des Ministres s'agissant des règles de désignation et de composition de ladite instance. Organe composé du : Président du Haut Conseil de la Magistrature, Président du Tribunal Suprême, Premier Président de la 	Critères prescrits tant par la Convention européenne des droits de l'Homme (articles 21 à 23) que par les textes pertinents de l'Assemblée Parlementaire du Conseil de l'Europe en la matière.
Gouvernement pour les Relations Extérieures et la Coopération et le Délégué aux Affaires Juridiques. • Les autorités monégasques saisissent ensuite le Panel consultatif d'experts	• Of high moral character; • Possess the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults
	stage which included written test and interview. The first meeting of the Commission was video recorded and broadcasted. Consequently, the press was allowed to reflect the following stages of the selection procedure. Two by two interpreters from English and French languages (two university professors and two licensed interpreters) were present during the interview. They tested the candidates' language proficiency in both official languages of the Council of Europe. The national selection procedure was won by the first three candidates who obtained the highest grades. Information as communicated to PACE in Ma Liste présentée par le Gouvernement de la Principauté de Monaco. L'instance nationale de sélection des candidats au poste de juge à la CEDH est chargée d'émettre un avis au Gouvernement Princier sur les candidatures. Commission issue d'une décision administrative qui prend en considération les lignes directrices du Comité des Ministres s'agissant des règles de désignation et de composition de ladite instance. Organe composé du: Président du Haut Conseil de la Magistrature, Président du Tribunal Suprême, Premier Président du Cour de Révision, Conseiller de Gouvernement pour les Relations Extérieures et la Coopération et le Délégué aux Affaires Juridiques. Les autorités monégasques saisissent ensuite le Panel consultatif d'experts Information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (de Commission formed in 2007. National procedure published on the

Supreme Court of Montenegro, MJ,
Minister for Human and Minority Rights
Protection, Dean of the Faculty of Law,
Secretary of the Secretariat for Legislation
and President of the Committee on
International Relations and European
Integration. President of the Commission
is the MJ.

- Every person who applied to the public notice had to be interviewed for the checking of their language skills. 2 committees (1 English/1 French) are formed to conduct the interview.
- Then, the Commission sent to the Government the proposal list with 3 candidates for further procedure.

- of recognized competence.
- Required to possess the full knowledge of one or both official languages of the Court (English or French).

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in April 2012</u> and supplemented by information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)005</u> and <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)002</u>)

- The vacancy is announced in relevant law journals and newspapers and on relevant websites.
- The vacancy includes an invitation to third parties to suggest in writing candidates whom they consider suitable.
- All candidates, including those who do not apply themselves but are invited later for an interview at the suggestion of a third party, must complete the entire application procedure.
- For each vacancy, a recommending committee is composed (the President of the Supreme Court, the Vice-President of the Council of State or the President of the Administrative Jurisdiction Division of the Council of State and a third member with ample knowledge of and experience in international and/or European law and the Council of Europe or a comparable international organisation).
- The MFA and the Minister of Security and Justice may only deviate from the recommendation made by the committee on substantiated grounds.
- This recommending committee will on the basis of the received applications and

- High moral character.
- Possess the qualification required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognised competence.
- Judicial experience, thorough knowledge of the Convention.
- Ability to express oneself effectively in spoken and written French or English.
- Relevant international experience and the ability to take account of differences in legal culture among the countries of the Council of Europe.

interviews with a number of candidates
draw up a recommendation - a shortlist of
at least three candidates - for the MFA and
MJ

 After consultation between these two Ministers, the list will be submitted to the Council of Ministers, who will after consultation forward it to the PACE.

NORWAY / NORVÈGE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in January 2011</u> and information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc DH-SYSC-I(2016)002)

- New procedure established in 2009.
- The MJ issues an open call for applications on the Government website and in specialist journals.
- The Ministry informs certain relevant institutions about the call for applications and ask them to inform their contacts/members, for example by publishing information on their own websites.
- Informs Norway's delegation to the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe and the current Norwegian judge.
- The Ministry of Justice appoints a selection committee consisting of five members. The committee will be chaired by the chair of the Judicial Appointments Board (subject to this person's agreement). The other members are appointed on the basis of proposals from the Supreme Court, the Office of the Attorney General of Civil Affairs, the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights and the Norwegian Bar Association. Each of these bodies is encouraged to put forward the names of one woman and one man.
- The committee is to submit its proposal for three candidates, with reasons for selecting the candidates, to the MJ.
- The MJ takes the decision on Norway's nomination of three named candidates after the names have been submitted to the ministers concerned and to the Office of the Prime Minister
- The MFA submits the list of candidates to the Parliamentary Assembly.

- High moral character.
- Law degree (Master's degree or equivalent) and relevant legal experience.
- Thorough knowledge of the Norwegian legal system and of the human rights field.
- Professional competence, personal aptitude, language skills and the requirement of high moral character of article 21 of the Convention.
- Good command of written and spoken English or French and as a minimum to be able to read and understand the other language.
- The selection committee may seek advice from relevant external actors, and may use external expertise to evaluate the language proficiency of relevant applicants.
- As far as possible, at least one of the candidates should be of the sex which is under-represented at the Court.

The list of candidates is made public. Information as communicated to PACE in April 2012 and Information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc DH-SYSC-I(2016)002) POLAND/ **POLOGNE** • Legal basis: Ordinance of the MFA dated Knowledge of issues related to 13 January 2012 on appointment of the human rights: Panel responsible for selection of Knowledge of the law, in candidates. particular Polish law; Call for candidatures published in at least • Experience related to its two national newspapers and on the practical application; website of the MFA. Academic achievements. • Declaration stating their • Applications are examined by a Panel composed of: an Undersecretary of State intention to cease any activity at the MFA responsible for Legal and that could not be reconciled with Treaty affairs (the Panel's Chairperson); independence, impartiality and representative of the Minister of Justice in the requirements of full-time the rank of at least an undersecretary of service as judge of the Court. • Declare that nothing in their state; directors of the Legal and Treaty Department and of the Department of the hitherto activity, if made public, United Nations and Human Rights at the would compromise the Ministry of Foreign Affairs; President of reputation of the Court. • List of candidates should include the State Treasury Solicitor's Office; a person indicated by the Head of the representatives of each sex, Chancellery of the Prime Minister. The unless in view of exceptional Government Agent acts as a secretary to circumstances it would not be the Panel and sits on the Panel without the possible. right to vote. • In the first stage of the procedure, the Panel verifies whether the applications fulfil formal requirements specified in the call. In case of doubt, the Panel requests the candidate to submit clarifications or missing documents within 14 days otherwise his/her candidature will be dropped. The Panel interviews those candidates who have fulfilled formal requirements (in English or in French). When taking decisions, the Panel seeks to decide by consensus, although a majority vote can be held if necessary. If there is an even number of votes, the Chairperson has the casting vote. • The Panel draws a list of three candidates and two reserve candidates. Final list is made public on the MFA website.

PORTUGAL

Information as communicated to PACE in January 2011

- The principles of freedom of candidature, publicity, transparency and nondiscrimination.
- Consideration was given to a more balanced representation of women and men in drawing up the list of candidates.
- The Minister of Justice therefore organised a nationwide call for candidatures, accompanied by the rules governing the selection procedure, by publishing advertisements in three national newspapers, placing an official announcement in the Official Gazette, and including a news item on the website "Portal da Justiça" and by further circulating these notices to the Higher Council of the Judiciary and the General Council of the Bar Association.
- The Minister of Justice set up an independent commission with four members appointed by the Higher Council of the Judiciary, the Higher Council of the Administrative and Fiscal Courts, the Procuradoria-Geral da República (Public Prosecutor's Office) and the General Council of the Portuguese Bar Association.
- Admissibility of the candidatures using the CV assessment method.
- The commission played an advisory role in the process.

 Preconditions of Article 21 of the European Convention on Human Rights.

ROUMANIA / ROUMANIE

Information as communicated to PACE in September 2013

- Cadre légal : ordonnance du 27 mars 2013.
- Le MJ convoque le comité de sélection, composé: du MJ; du MAE; de l'agent du gouvernement auprès de la Cour européenne des droits de l'homme; de la directrice de la Direction des affaires européennes et des droits de l'homme au ministère de la Justice; d'un membre du Conseil supérieur de la magistrature, désigné en réunion plénière de celui-ci; d'un juge à la Haute cour de justice et de cassation, désigné par le conseil d'administration de celle-ci; du médiateur;
- Conditions requises pour ces fonctions par le droit national, par la Convention de sauvegarde des droits de l'homme et des libertés fondamentales et par les instruments juridiques adoptés au niveau du Conseil de l'Europe qui sont pertinents dans ce domaine.
- Répartition équilibrée des sexes sur la liste de candidats.
- Maîtrise d'au moins une des

	de deux universitaires des facultés de droit d'universités. Annonce publiée en même temps sur les sites internet du MJ, du ministère des Affaires étrangères, de la Haute cour de justice et de cassation et du Conseil supérieur de la magistrature, et elle a été distribuée aux médias et aux organisations professionnelles de juristes et communiquée à un site juridique spécialisé. Modèle de CV exigé par l'APCE traduit en roumain et indiquant les liens vers la version française et la version anglaise du CV obligatoires. Le comité de sélection a vérifié les connaissances par les candidats des langues officielles. Délai dans lequel les candidatures devaient être présentées : deux semaines. La liste de propositions et la liste de réserves sont transmises au gouvernement puis publiée sur le site du MJ. les commissions des questions juridiques et des droits de l'homme interrogent les candidats et donnent un avis consultatif. A l'issue d'un vote au scrutin secret, l'avis consultatif est transmis au gouvernement	langues officielles du Conseil.
	qui adopte la liste définitive.	
	Information as communicated to PACE in Apr	<u>ril 2012</u>
RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FÉDÉRATION DE RUSSIE	 A public call for candidatures was made on 1 July 2011 through the specialized press, the daily federal newspaper and the relevant information materials were simultaneously published on the website of the MJ. The initial examination of the candidates' applications was entrusted to the Competition commission composed of 9 members: 4 representatives from the Russian MJ, 3 representatives from the MFA, 1 representative of the All-Russian Non-Commercial Organization "Association of Lawyers of Russia" and 1 professor of the European Studies Institute 	Requirements set out by the Convention and the relevant Parliamentary Assembly resolutions and recommendations.

	 at the Moscow State Institute of Foreign Relations, i.e. the officials and independent experts with relevant proficiency in international law and human rights. The Commission short-listed 10 of them and assigned the date of its second meeting when personal interviews, also including language assessment. The Commission was also assisted by 2 professional translators from the Russian Diplomatic Academy. Shortlist containing 6 candidates was then approved by the Interdepartmental Commission and then forwarded to the President of the Russian Federation, who chose the final 3 among them. 	
SAN MARINO / SAINT MARIN	No recent information provided.	
SERBIA / SERBIE	 Information as communicated to PACE in No. The Minister of Justice established a Commission to supervise an open competition to nominate candidates. The Commission consisted of the President of Supreme Cassation Court, as Chairman, the Deputy Prosecutor of the Republic of Serbia, the Attorney of the Republic of Serbia, a Judge of SC Court, the State Secretary in the MJ and State Administration. A Public Call was published in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Serbia, in the daily newspaper "Politika", distributed in the entire territory of the Republic of Serbia and on the official site of the MJ and State Administration. Written language tests, in English and in French. Interviews with candidates who had successfully completed the requirements. The Commission adopts the list. Publication of the list on the site of the MJ and State Administration List. 	The Commission examined registration forms of candidates who had passed the language test, their biography, professional experience and all submitted evidence on possessing theoretical and practice knowledge proving experience with recognized competence in the field of the National Legal System, International Public Law or European Protection of Human Rights.

SLOVAK REPUBLIC/ RÉPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Information as communicated to PACE in August 2015

- Legal basis: Article 141a § 4 d) of the Constitution: it is under the authority of the Judicial Council to submit to the Government proposals of candidates for judges. The Judicial Council is the judiciary's highest body, independent from the legislative and executive power. This body is consists of 18 members, almost all of them are serving judges.
- Judicial Council performed its duties in accordance with national procedure (Act 185/2002 Coll).
- Candidate for the position of a judge can be submitted to the Judicial Council by: a member of the Judicial Council, the MJ, professional organisation of judges, other professional organisation of lawyers.
- For the nomination to be approved it has to obtain majority of votes of all Judicial Council members in secret ballot.
- The Judicial Council submitted nominations for a judge of the ECHR to the Government, which endorsed the proposed list of candidates.

- Acquired legal education by completion of a MA course at the law faculty of a university in the Slovak Republic, or possesses recognised or nostrified document of law education obtained by completion of studies of the same level at foreign university.
- Is of integrity; is probably a credible personality in the field of law and his/her moral qualities give a guarantee that he/she will duly perform his/her mandate.
- Has permanent residence in the territory of the Slovak Republic.
- Has full legal capacity and health conditions which allow him/her to perform the judicial mandate.
- Passed the judicial professional exam, prosecutor's exam, bar exam or notary exam and has at least 5 years of legal practice.

SLOVENIA / SLOVÉNIE

 $\frac{Information\ as\ communicated\ to\ PACE\ in\ January\ 2016}{information\ to\ DH-SYSC-I\ (doc\ \underline{DH-SYC-I(2016)005})}$ and supplemented by

- Legal basis: Act on the Nomination of Candidates from the Republic of Slovenia to Judges at International Courts.
- MJ publishes a call for applications (Official Gazette and on the official website of the MJ).
- Official letter is sent to the Slovenian Supreme Court, the Constitutional Court, the Ombudsman and all relevant law faculties in Slovenia informing them of the call for applications.
- Period for submission: 40 days.
- CV in one of the official languages of the Court.
- MJ delivers the submitted applications to the President of the Republic of Slovenia.
- When obtaining written opinions on the candidates from the Slovenian

- Must comply with the condition of active knowledge of at least one of the official languages used at the international court.
- He/ she fulfills the conditions for a Supreme Court judge or a Constitutional Court judge (see the detailed presentation in doc DH-SYSC-I(2016)005).

- Government and the Judicial Council, the President submitted his shortlist of four candidates to the National Assembly (the Parliament).
- Three candidates for international court judge are elected by the National Assembly in a secret ballot by a majority of all deputies.
- The nomination procedure has been reported in the Slovenian media on several occasions.

Information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc DH-SYSC-I(2016)002)

SPAIN/ESPAGNE

- Wide dissemination of the call for submission of applications shall be guaranteed through publication in the "Official State Gazette", as well as by means of those additional procedures to be decided by the Undersecretary of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation, the Undersecretary of Justice and the Undersecretary of Presidency and Territorial Administration, to come to the attention of potentially suitable candidates and for a reasonable period of time. Applications may be presented in any of the places provided for in Article 16.4 of Act 39/2015, of October 1st, on Common Administrative Procedure of Public Administration.
- A Committee is hereby established to assess the suitability of candidates, consisting of the State Secretary for Foreign Affairs, the State Secretary for Justice, the Undersecretary of Justice and the Undersecretary of Presidency and Territorial Administration. The State Secretary for Foreign Affairs will chair the Committee Presidency. The Committee decisions shall be taken, in any event, by agreement of all the members concerned. The powers conferred on their members cannot be delegated. A State Attorney appointed by the General State Attorney-Directorate of the Legal Service shall provide the secretariat for the Committee, who shall attend the meetings with
- Pursuant to the provisions of the Court, candidates shall be of high moral character and shall possess the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognised competence, and should undertake not to engage, if elected, in any activity incompatible with their independence or impartiality or with the demands of a full-time office.
- The Committee shall evaluate the candidates' curricula vitae and shall perform any interview as it deems necessary in order to assess their suitability for the post to be filled, whom, in any event, shall meet the following requirements:
 - To be a Spanish national;
- Not to exceed the age of 61 years by the closing date for the submission of applications;
- To be proficient in one official language of the Court (English or French) and also possess at least a passive knowledge of the other.
- Having examined the curricula vitae and performed the eventual interviews, the Committee shall propose a list of candidates for the post of judge at the Court

•	In the exercise of their functions, the
	Committee shall be assisted by a number
	of advisers entitled to represent, among
	others: the international Legal Department
	of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and
	Cooperation, the General Council of the
	Judiciary, the Office of the Prosecutor-
	General, the Ombudsman and the Ministry

of Foreign Affairs' Office of Language

Services.

speaking rights but not to vote.

• Once the list of candidates has been adopted by the Council of Ministers, it shall be submitted to the Advisory Panel of Experts of the Council of Europe with a view to the election of judges to the European Court of Human Rights.

which should as a general rule include candidates of both sexes, and shall be communicated to the Executive Council on Foreign Policy prior to its submission to the Council of Ministers for a decision to be taken

SWEDEN/SUÈDE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in April 2012</u> and information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)002</u>)

- On 1 September 2014 Sweden changed the procedures for nominating candidates to the European Court of Justice and the European Court of Human Rights by the new Act (2014:414) on nominations to the European Court of Justice and the European Court of Human Rights ('the 2014 Act').
- The preparation of the nomination of judges to the European Court of Human Rights under the 2014 Act is initiated by the Swedish MFA. The Judges Proposals Board is responsible for the preparation of matters concerning the nomination of judges to the European Court of Human Rights.
- The nomination procedure involves a public call for candidates through advertisements in newspapers and on the Internet and ends by a proposal from the Judges Proposals Board to the Government on suitable candidates.
- The Judges Proposals Board is composed of nine members who are elected for a period of four years. Two of the members are elected by the Swedish Parliament as

- The criteria laid down in the Convention and the requirements established by the Parliamentary Assembly are expressed in the public call for candidates by the MFA:
- The candidates should have high moral reputation and possession of the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognised competence;
- Special consideration is given to knowledge of public international law and human rights law, knowledge of the languages of the Council of Europe and experience of work in an international environment and with organisational issues.

representatives of the public. The remaining seven members are appointed by the Government (five of them must be or have been permanent national judges, two of them lawyers active outside the judiciary, one of which shall be an advocate). There is also a person with special knowledge of the work of the Court.

• The Judges Proposals Board examines the applications in the light of the criteria set forth in the ECHR and by the Council of Europe. The interviews are conducted by an external consultant and/or members of the Judges Proposals Board. The decision on which candidates to nominate are taken by the Government.

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

<u>Information as communicated to PACE in February 2011</u> and information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)002</u>)

- Appel à candidature dans l'édition électronique et dans l'édition papier d'un quotidien de chacune des trois régions linguistiques du pays ainsi que sur plusieurs bourses d'emploi sur Internet.
- L'offre d'emploi est portée à l'attention des présidents et présidentes du Tribunal fédéral et des tribunaux supérieurs des cantons
- Les dossiers des six personnes présélectionnées (de même que les noms des six autres candidats) furent transmis à la Délégation parlementaire suisse auprès du Conseil de l'Europe (DCE) et à la Commission judiciaire (CJ) de l'Assemblée fédérale.
- Ces six personnes ont passé une audition devant la DCE et la CJ réunies.
- Ces dernières, dans un vote secret, ont établi un classement, que le président de la DCE a communiqué au Conseil fédéral avec une évaluation des auditions.

- Qualifications;
- Le sexe (2 femmes, 4 hommes), l'aire linguistique (2 candidats de la Suisse romande, 4 de la Suisse alémanique);
- Type de profession juridique représentée (représentants des domaines judiciaires et universitaires et du barreau).

"THE FORMER
YUGOSLAV
REPUBLIC OF
MACEDONIA"/
"L'EXRÉPUBLIQUE
YOUGOSLAVE
DE MACÉDOINE"

Information as communicated to PACE in September 2016

- Law on 23 February 2016: the Government of the Republic of Macedonia establishes a Commission for selection of candidates, which carries out the procedure for selection of candidates for the position of Judge in the ECHR.
- Commission was composed of MFA (Chairman), a Judge of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Macedonia, a member of the Judicial Council of the Republic of Macedonia, member of the Council of Public Prosecutors of the Republic of Macedonia, the State Secretary at the Ministry of Justice, a professor at the Faculty of Law at University of Tetovo.
- public call in the Official Gazette and daily newspapers, as well as on the websites of the MFA, MJ, Supreme Court of the Republic of Macedonia, Constitutional Court of the Republic of Macedonia, Public Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Macedonia and the Judicial Council of the Republic of Macedonia.
- The public call lasted 15 days since its publication date.
- CV in the Macedonian language and also in one of the two official languages (English or French). A model CV was also attached to the public call.
- The Commission adopted a decision for candidates who passed the initial administrative selection to be invited to an interview.
- A segment of the interview was carried out in English.
- The evaluation of candidates was carried out individually and anonymously. Each member of the Commission evaluated candidates with scores from 1 to 10, and subsequently a list of the candidates was drafted with their scores, with candidates with highest score average topping the list.

- High moral reputation;
- Must either possess the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults of recognised competence (minimum of 12 years of adequate experience);
- Must be less than 65 years of age;
- Must have experience in the field of human rights;
- Must have active knowledge of one, and passive knowledge of the other official language of the Council of Europe (English and French).

	• The Government, based on the proposal of		
	the Commission, approved the list.	DI GYGG YOOLGAS	
TUDOUIE /	Information communicated to DH-SYSC-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)005</u>)		
TURQUIE / TURKEY	 The election procedure is initiated with a public announcement for candidatures posted simultaneously on the websites of the MFA and the MJ. The public announcement remains on these websites for 30 days. Interview Committee composed of: Senior representative of the Prime Ministry (Chairperson of the Committee), Senior representative of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Senior representative of the Ministry of Justice, Secretary General of the Constitutional Court, a member of the Council of State, a member of the Council of State, a member of the Council of Higher Education. Following the interviews, the Interview Committee agrees on a short list of six candidates and these names are submitted to the Council of Ministers of Turkey in order to make the final decision. During the interviews, questions about the Court's case-law and its functioning are asked to all candidates both in Turkish and in their language of fluency. 	 The applicants are expected to meet the criteria of the Resolution 1646 (2009) of the Parliamentary Assembly the representation of both sexes is observed. In addition, the applicants are also expected to have one of the following qualifications: hold at least the academic title of associate professor for academic candidates; be of first class (highest level of seniority) under the Law no. 2802 and to have spent three years as first class judge or prosecutor for judge or prosecutor candidates; be a member of a High Court; be in possession of a document that he / she has effectively worked in his / her profession for at least 15 years for attorneys; for the remaining candidates; public officials shall have worked for at least 15 years in public institutions and those who are not public officials shall have at least 15 years of effective professional experience. 	

Information communicated to DH-SYSC	-I (doc <u>DH-SYSC-I(2016)002</u>)		
The work on this issue is ongoing. Howe in the national legislation yet.	The work on this issue is ongoing. However, the Guidelines were not implemented in the national legislation yet.		
UNITED KINGDOM/ ROYAUME-UNI • The Lord Chancellor tasked the Judicia Appointments Commission of England and Wales (JAC) with the administration of the recruitment campaign. • The JAC's online application form was adapted to include all the information needed for the Council of Europe's mocurriculum vitae. The published application materials also included a complete description of the process and the selection criteria used. • The JAC advertised the opening of the campaign, having trailed this for some weeks on its website. • The former President of the Internation Court was appointed to chair the selection panel. The Master of the Rolls and Lor Reed, a Justice of the Supreme Court at former judge in the Court of Session (Scotland) also served on the selection panel, bringing considerable legal and judicial expertise and experience. The panel also included Permanent Secretar of the MJ, a legal academic, the chair of the Equality and Human Rights Commission, and the Foreign and Commonwealth Office Legal Adviser. • The selection panel met in February 20 to sift applications received and reconvened at the end of February 2016 conduct interviews. • The candidates shortlisted for interview were tested for French language competence by the Institut Français.	 High moral character and either possess the qualifications required for appointment to high judicial office or be jurisconsults (for example academic lawyers and practitioners) of recognised competence. passive knowledge of French, or a commitment to acquire such knowledge in due course, so as to be able to play a full part in the work of the Court and able to understand case documents in both languages. Have a proven and consistently high level of expertise, with at least seven years' experience in the areas of law in which they have been engaged. Candidates will normally be expected to have experience in criminal or civil fields, with demonstrable knowledge of the UK's national legal systems, public international law, public law, Strasbourg law and human rights. Possess the interpersonal and communication skills necessary to exert his or her influence within the Court. 		