

Information Documents

SG/Inf(2021)2

4 February 2021

Safety of journalists

Introduction: stepping up the Organisation's efforts to safeguard freedom of expression

2

As announced following the 129th Session of the Committee of Ministers in Helsinki¹ and the subsequent decisions of the Ministers' Deputies, the Committee of Ministers will be regularly informed of developments in the area of freedom of expression by reports based on Council of Europe work in this field, including the activity of the Platform for the protection of journalism and safety of journalists (the Platform). Given the significant impact of the healthcare crisis on freedom of expression, creating additional challenges, the first report of this kind focused on the impact of this crisis on freedom of expression and media freedom.²

The present report has a specific focus on the issue of the safety of journalists. Given the situation, this requires urgent attention in view of the fundamental rights at stake, notably linked to physical integrity, as well as the worrying trends observed (see below).

Together with the assessment of the situation on freedom of expression that will be included in the Secretary General's 2021 Annual Report on the state of human rights, democracy and the rule of law in Europe, the informal debates of the Committee of Ministers with partners of the Platform, which are organised in co-operation with the respective chairmanships of the Committee of Ministers, and the Council of Europe Conference of Ministers responsible for Media and Information Society which will take place in June 2021, these periodic reports are aimed at helping our Organisation to further increase its efforts on safeguarding freedom of expression, together with its member states.

Appendix I to this report presents a compilation of the alerts received by the Platform between 1 May and 31 December 2020, while Appendix II contains additional information about recent activities of the Council of Europe on freedom of expression more generally.

1. Safety of journalists – a precondition for freedom of expression and a priority for the Council of Europe

The safety of journalists is a crucial factor for freedom of expression.

The European Court of Human Rights (the Court) has on numerous occasions highlighted the essential role played by the press in ensuring the proper functioning of democracy, and stressed the fundamental role of freedom of expression in a democratic society, in particular where, through the press, it serves to impart information and ideas of general interest, which the public is entitled to receive. 4 States are required to create a favourable environment for participation in public debate by all persons concerned, enabling them to express their opinions and ideas without fear: they must secure an "enabling environment" for journalism and free media and guarantee the safety of journalists.5

Therefore, any failure to secure a safe environment for journalists and other media actors needs to be effectively addressed by the Council of Europe and its member states and national authorities, in co-operation with all relevant stakeholders.

¹ Decisions, "2. A shared responsibility for democratic security in Europe – a. Report by the Secretary General "Ready for future challenges – Reinforcing the Council of Europe", decision 3.

² SG/Inf(2020)19.

³ See, amongst others, Lingens v. Austria, 8 July 1986, § 41, Series A no. 103 and Fressoz and Roire v. France [GC], no. 29183/95, § 45, Convention 1999-I.

⁴ See, for example, mutatis mutandis, the Observer and Guardian v. the United Kingdom, 26 November 1991, § 59, Series A no. 216; and Informationsverein Lentia and Others v. Austria, 24 November 1993, § 38, Series A no. 276.

⁵ Dink v. Turkey, nos. 2668/07, 6102/08, 30079/08, 7072/09 and 7124/09, § 137, 14 September 2010. Özgür Gündem v. Turkey, no. 23144/93, §§ 42-43, Convention 2000-III.

As detailed below, indicators show that the safety of journalists has been deteriorating over the past years. Journalists working on issues such as the abuse of power, corruption and other crimes and threats to the separation of powers and rule of law are increasingly facing threats, harassment, violence, abusive legislation and litigation, arbitrary detention and, in some cases, even torture and death.⁶ The impunity of perpetrators of such acts aggravates these phenomena, triggers self-censorship and has a chilling effect on freedom of expression of journalists and of the society as a whole.⁷

3

When joining the Council of Europe, member states undertake the obligation to fully implement the European Convention on Human Rights (the Convention) and to abide by the judgments of the Court. The safety of journalists must be guaranteed under several provisions of the Convention, beginning with Article 10 which guarantees the right to freedom of expression and information, but also by other provisions, guaranteeing: the right to life (Article 2) and the prohibition of ill treatment (Article 3), the right to liberty and security (Article 5), to a fair trial (Article 6), to respect for private and family life (Article 8), and the freedom of thought, conscience and religion (Article 9). The jurisprudence of the Court specifies member states' obligations in all aspects, including the positive obligation to protect the safety of journalists.⁸

The Committee of Ministers' Recommendation <u>CM/Rec(2016)4</u> on the protection of journalism and safety of journalists and other media actors and the appended Guidelines describes systematically the standards for the member states to follow.⁹

In addition, the Implementation Strategy¹⁰ to this recommendation, approved in 2018 by the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society contains priority actions for member states to take.

The Implementation Guide of 2020 "How to protect Journalists and other Media Actors" elaborates, based on identified good practices, concrete suggestions to member states.

⁶ Recommendation CM/Rec(2016)4 starts with the words: "It is alarming and unacceptable that journalists and other media actors in Europe are increasingly being threatened, harassed, subjected to surveillance, intimidated, arbitrarily deprived of their liberty, physically attacked, tortured and even killed because of their investigative work, opinions or reporting, particularly when their work focuses on the misuse of power, corruption, human rights violations, criminal activities, terrorism and fundamentalism".

⁷ See notably the studies "<u>Journalists under pressure – Unwarranted interference, fear and self-censorship in Europe</u>" (Marilyn Clark and Anna Grech, 2017), based on a survey with 940 journalists from across Council of Europe member states; and "<u>A Mission to Inform – Journalists at Risk speak out</u>" (Marilyn Clark and William Horsley, 2020), based on interviews with a handful of journalists across Council of Europe member states who discussed in depth the forms of pressure they have been subjected to due to their work.

⁸ See notably the reports of the Research Division of the European Court of Human Rights' Registry, <u>"Articles 2, 3 and 10 – The safety of journalists"</u>; as well as <u>"Positive obligations on member states under Article 10 to protect journalists and prevent impunity</u>". See also the <u>caselaw guides</u> on the relevant articles of the Convention, published by the Registry.

⁹ The recommendation names the positive obligations member states have under the Convention. It calls on member states notably to prevent infringements on the safety of journalists by putting in place comprehensive legislative frameworks. It calls for the improved protection of journalists by law enforcement and mechanisms of redress for victims. It demands that such cases be prosecuted and asks member states to disseminate the Recommendation and to improve awareness-raising. The Recommendation mentions the principles anchored in the Convention and in the judgments and decisions of the Court.

¹⁰ The Implementation Strategy called for the identification of priority areas of implementation of CM Rec(2016)4 in co-operation with NGOs and journalists' associations. It called for the elaboration of an implementation guide.

¹¹ The Implementation Guide of 2020 describes best practices over 60 pages.

The Resolution of the Parliamentary Assembly of January 2020 "*Threats to media freedom and journalists' security in Europe*" calls on member states to review their legislation and to take national measures to protect journalists.

The obligations of member states in this field and best practices have been amply described in these and other reference documents. In order to move toward a more effective follow-up, this report makes concrete conclusions in chapter 6.

2. Safety of journalists – a longstanding issue for the Convention system

In 2019 and 2020 alone, the Court found 148 violations of the right to freedom of expression. Altogether, it delivered 925 judgments directly concerning Article 10 since its creation in 1959.

The Committee of Ministers supervises the execution of 91 cases in this field.¹³ While this figure does not allow us as such to measure the performance of each member state in the field of freedom of expression, the fact that some of these judgments date back to early 2000 shows that, despite the normative and advisory action of our Organisation, there may still be significant delays in the full implementation of judgments finding violations of freedom of expression.

Some of these cases relate specifically to the safety of journalists, for example to the state's positive obligation to protect journalists and to investigate the link between journalists' activity and a criminal act against them; 14 to the failure of the state to investigate a serious intrusion into an investigative journalist's private and family life, coupled with abusive charges brought against them and their subsequent pre-trial detention; 15 to undue criminalisation of freedom of expression and arbitrary application of criminal legislation to limit freedom of expression and/or impose disproportional sanctions which dissuade or threaten journalists, or produce a "chilling effect". 16

3. Safety of journalists – a priority for several Council of Europe institutions

The findings of the Court and the difficulties in achieving speedy execution of judgments which relate to failures to secure the safety of journalists are unfortunately corroborated by the findings of other Council of Europe organs, institutions and mechanisms.

The Parliamentary Assembly condemned the silencing of critical voices including journalists, and the undue pressure exerted against them, highlighting the need to create an environment conducive to freedom of expression and freedom of the media.¹⁷ It also deplored the slow progress in investigating criminal acts against journalists,¹⁸ referring in particular to the assassination of journalists.¹⁹

¹² Resolution 2317 (2020).

¹³ 91 cases are pending execution in both standard and enhanced procedure (84 leading cases and 15 cases pending in "enhanced supervision").

¹⁴ Gongadze v. Ukraine (No 34056/02).

¹⁵ Khadija Ismayilova v. Azerbaijan (Nos 65286/13 and 57270/14).

¹⁶ Mahmudov and Agazade v. Azerbaijan (No. 35877/04); Dmitrievskiy v. Russia (No. 42168/06); Nedim Şener v. Turkey (No. 38270/11); Bayar and Gurbuz v. Turkey (37569/06).

¹⁷ See <u>Resolution 2260 (2019)</u> and <u>Resolution 2347 (2020)</u>. It further expressed serious concern about the lack of adequate protection of whistleblowers: see <u>Resolution 2300 (2019)</u> and <u>Recommendation 2162 (2019)</u> "Improving the protection of whistle-blowers all over Europe".

¹⁸ See Resolution 2293 (2019) "Daphne Caruana Galizia's assassination and the rule of law in Malta and beyond: ensuring that the whole truth emerges".

¹⁹ See also the Commissioner for Human Rights' <u>Welcome Address</u> at the Online Conference on Safety of Journalists, 14 October 2020; and her <u>Statement</u> on the occasion of the three-year anniversary of the murder of Daphne Caruana Galizia: "Truth and Justice for Daphne Caruana Galizia", 16 October 2020.

As the COVID-19 crisis created new challenges in the field of freedom of expression and freedom of media, the Commissioner for Human Rights addressed this issue in a statement on 3 April 2020, stressing that several journalists were detained in reprisals for their reporting on COVID-19 and underlining that the situation induced by the pandemic and the unprecedented challenges it poses "cannot (...) be an excuse to clamp down on the press and thus restrict people's access to information". ²⁰

As regards violent incidents during demonstrations, the Commissioner expressed her concern that "violence against journalists, especially at the hands of state agents, is contrary to states' duty to uphold press freedom and to protect the safety of journalists". State authorities had to "effectively investigate all reported cases of attacks against journalists and punish the police officers responsible for such unacceptable behaviour"... and "give clear instructions to police officers to respect press freedom and allow journalists and media professionals to cover demonstrations safely".²¹

It is worth noting in this respect that the Venice Commission issued on 15 July 2020, together with the Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) of the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), the third edition of the Guidelines on freedom of peaceful assembly, which contain a chapter stressing the state's duty to protect and facilitate the work of journalists and media personnel. The Guidelines particularly recommend that in principle, no media credentials should be required to cover an assembly. They underline the duty of law enforcement authorities to protect media professionals from violence emanating from third parties, as well as to refrain from interfering with the work of journalists, irrespective of whether they represent national or foreign media; this duty also protects media representatives' freedom from arbitrary arrest or detention in connection with their coverage of an assembly. The right of media representatives to conduct their journalistic activities during an assembly should not be made dependent upon the condition of wearing special clothing or badges identifying them as journalists as long as their identity and profession is known to the police. As journalists are not participants in, but rather observers of an assembly, dispersal orders directed at assembly participants should not oblige journalists to leave the area, unless their individual safety is endangered or their continuing presence would significantly hinder security forces in the performance of their duties. In case of violence against media representatives, as in other instances of unlawful/disproportionate use of force by the security forces, a thorough and independent criminal investigation, if warranted, must be conducted.

GRECO too, recognising the key role journalists play in bringing wrongdoing and corruption to light, especially concerning persons occupying top executive functions, highlighted shortcomings in the policies and practices of law enforcement agencies of some member states, making specific recommendations contributing to address some of the reasons for impunity of crimes against journalists. GRECO recommendations relate to the impartiality and independence of investigations into crimes committed against journalists, improved regulation of conflicts of interest of police officers, assessment of risks of corruption-prone areas in the police, measures against the misuse of confidential information and measures favouring an official communication policy including as regards the victims and their families.²²

²⁰ Statement "Press freedom must not be undermined by measures to counter disinformation about COVID-19".

²¹ Statement "Bulgaria must investigate police violence against journalists", 3 September 2020.

²² This has been particularly noteworthy in GRECO's Fifth Round Evaluation Report on Malta of 22 March 2019, as regards the investigation into the murder of Daphne Caruana Galizia, and GRECO's Fifth Round Evaluation Report on Slovakia of 21 June 2019, in relation to the murder of Ján Kuciak.

4. The Platform for the protection of journalism and the safety of journalists

In 2020, 52 attacks on the physical safety of journalists were reported to the Platform for the protection of journalism and the safety of journalists, as well as 24 cases of detention and 70 cases of alleged harassment.

The 146 alerts published between 1 May and 31 December 2020 (Appendix I to this report), concerned the following allegations:

- 53 alerts (36.3%): harassment and intimidation,
- 44 alerts (30.1%): attacks on physical safety and integrity of journalists,
- 13 alerts (8.9%): detention and imprisonment,
- and 36 alerts (24.6%): other acts having a chilling effect on the freedom of expression of journalists.

Out of the 146 alerts, 50 (34.2%) are of level 1, covering the most severe threats to media freedom.

Since the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, the Platform has registered a sharp increase in the number of alerts. These alerts described mainly:

- Excessive or disproportionate policy responses or regulations against disinformation;
- Restrictions on access or on dissemination of information;
- Surveillance and privacy threats;
- Physical attacks and intimidation of journalists;
- Detention and criminal charges and/or civil claims against journalists for COVID-19 related dissemination of information.

While earlier in the year the alerts primarily concerned emergency legislation or policies to fight the spread of 'fake news', since May 2020 the alerts report actions of fining journalists or media outlets on alleged violations of confinement or social distancing requirements. Alerts also report that journalists were obstructed in their work whenever they were not perceived by authorities as 'essential workers' exempt from these requirements.

Since May 2020, the Platform alerts have also described a high level of obstruction to the reporting of public events, notably public rallies and demonstrations – police orders to leave the area or stop filming operations, assault by law-enforcement officers, arrest and custody, border-crossing bans and other forms of obstruction. The reported incidents often occurred despite reporters showing their professional ID.

There were also alleged obstructions to reporting emanating from private, non-state actors, such as participants in demonstrations. This type of violence revealed insufficient or inadequate policing measures to protect journalists and their equipment from being targeted.

Another group of alerts describes how individuals attempt to exploit legal remedies to silence critical reporting through "strategic" lawsuits (so-called "strategic lawsuits against public participation" – SLAPPs). Such threats can give rise to a severe chilling effect when civil lawsuits are combined with a strategic choice of forum, attracting cases to jurisdictions with restrictive laws on defamation, insult, blasphemy or "fake news".

The alerts published on the Platform reflect concerns about alleged violations and provide an early opportunity for their address and resolution.

In this respect, it can be noted that the profile of cases concerning the protection of journalists which have been brought before the Court, the profile of judgments whose execution is still supervised by the Committee of Ministers and the situations which triggered a reaction from the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, the Commissioner for Human Rights or other bodies of the Council of Europe, largely reflects the typology of cases presented to the Platform.

In principle, this should be an encouraging element, as an early reaction to Platform alerts should allow member states to deal with the issue raised in a timely manner and to prevent or remedy possible violations of human rights and applications before the Court. The early reaction to the Platform alerts is indeed a means to preserve the safety of journalists and the democratic dialogue in our societies.

Unfortunately, none of the alerts submitted during this period has moved to the status of being "resolved" or "progress". Very few alerts have received a response from the member states at this stage – on average it takes three to six months for replies to come in.

It therefore remains essential, following the Committee of Ministers' invitation in its 129th Session in Helsinki (16-17 May 2019),²³ to ensure a more systematic follow-up to alerts posted on the Platform.

The present and subsequent periodic reports offer opportunities for a debate on these alerts and enable the Organisation to better target its action on the most urgent issues they raise.

5. Targeted co-operation and international co-ordination

The Council of Europe also co-operates closely with member and non-member states, as well as international partners in the area of freedom of expression.

Such actions are mostly part of larger programmes and project interventions financed by voluntary contributions from member states, the European Union (EU), and other sources. A substantial number of these projects are implemented as joint programmes between the EU and the Council of Europe.²⁴ The Council of Europe ensures strategic programming of co-operation through country-specific Action Plans, in which freedom of expression and freedom of the media are priority areas for intervention.²⁵ However, only a limited number of Action Plans specifically address the issue of safety of journalists.²⁶

²⁴ Such as: the EU/Council of Europe Horizontal Facility for the Western Balkans and Turkey (Horizontal Facility II) 2019-2022 – total budget: €41 million (EU: 85%, Council of Europe 15%); the South Programme IV "Regional Support to Reinforce Human rights, Rule of Law and Democracy in the Southern Mediterranean" – Total budget: €3,334 million (EU: 89,98% Council of Europe: 10,02%); March 2018 – February 2020; Joint Programme "EU and Council of Europe working together to support freedom of media in Ukraine", 2019-2021, total budget of the media component: € 1,172, 300.

²⁵ Such as a HELP online course for South Eastern Europe on the protection of journalists; updating a Handbook on the safety of journalists for future training. In Georgia, in 2019 a Baseline Study assessing compliance of national legislative framework and practices with Rec(2016)4. In 2020, the project encouraged national authorities to include safety of journalists in the National Human Rights Action Plan. In Ukraine, the Joint Programme on freedom of media gives legislative expertise on safety of journalists, recommendations for reviewing by-laws on accreditation procedures; insurance of journalists working in the Joint Forces Operation zone; training sessions for judiciary, law enforcement, prosecutors on protection of freedom of expression; creation of a Rapid Response Mechanism for the protection of journalists (based on the Guide for the implementation of the CM Rec 2016(4)). Capacity building on safety of journalists was carried out with the Moroccan Trade Union of Journalists to build up monitoring structures on safety of journalists and to provide psychological, professional and legal support.

²⁶ For example on 9 December 2020, the Council of Europe Office in Pristina, within the framework of the projects EU/CoE "Freedom of Expression and Freedom of the Media (JUFREX2)" and "Reinforcing the fight

²³ See footnote 2.

As regards international co-ordination, the Council of Europe and the EU join forces to enhance standards' coherence and policy complementarity with respect to safety of journalists and media freedom²⁷.

According to the European Democracy Action Plan, the European Commission will propose, in 2021, an EU recommendation on the safety of journalists, drawing from the Recommendation of the Committee of Ministers of 2016 to ensure it is better implemented by EU member states. In a recent discussion with the Vice-President of the European Commission, Ms Věra Jourová, the Secretary General recalled the availability of the Council of Europe to co-operate in this respect.

The Council of Europe also liaises with the OSCE to ensure effective working relations and co-operation, and to generate coherence and complementarity of action. It also maintains and develops contacts with other international organisations, in particular the United Nations.²⁸

6. Conclusions and further steps

The findings of the different organs, bodies and tools of the Council of Europe point toward a need to make further efforts to live up to the obligations which the member states have undertaken to protect journalists.

It is however necessary to make the best possible use of the Platform's work, which is not merely an instrument of registration. The co-operation of all stakeholders is essential in this respect.

Whereas a purely numerical approach would not reflect the complexity of cases dealt with by the Court and the Committee of Ministers within their respective prerogatives under the Convention, the repeated findings of violations and the delays in execution point to the persistence of a number of systemic shortcomings. The Department for the Execution of Judgments has thus been tasked with preparing a factsheet on freedom of expression which will cover best practices on execution issues for such cases, to assist member states. It will contain measures that states have already taken with a view to remedying breaches of the Convention via legislative changes, judicial and administrative practice change, and other institutional or practical measures. In many cases, only a coherent combination of national measures will be able to lead to an improvement of the situation.

It is, however, important to recall that the responsibility to take the required corrective measures lies primarily with the member states under the Convention.

It is of utmost importance that they act with determination to address properly the problems identified, in particular to remedy persisting systemic shortcomings.

against violence against women and domestic violence – Phase II" organised <u>a roundtable discussion</u> <u>addressing issues related to protection and safety of journalists</u>, with special emphasis on women journalists and the risk of violence against women.

²⁷ In light of the 2007 Memorandum of Understanding between the Council of Europe and the EU, the statement of intent of April 2014, the Council Conclusions on EU priorities for co-operation with the Council of Europe 2020-2022, and the EU Action Plan on Human Rights and Democracy 2020-2024.

²⁸ For example participation of the Head of the Council of Europe's Information Society Department in OSCE events such as the Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting, 22-23 June 2020; OSCE South East Europe Media meeting, 17-18 September 2020; OSCE Webinar on access to information and freedom of the media, 21 October 2020; OSCE virtual meeting on Safety of Women Journalists, 2 November 2020; the UNESCO Task Force on Safety of Journalists, 28 October 2020, the Global Conference on Media Freedom, 16 November 2020; International Human Rights Institute of the International Bar Association's High Level Panel of legal Experts on Media Freedom: "Strengthening consular Support to Journalists at Risk", 17 November 2020, and "More effective Investigations into Abuses against Journalists", 25 November 2020.

Our Organisation, for its part, not only has the mandate and capacity to identify the shortcomings in the implementation of our commonly agreed standards, but also stands ready to assist member states, within the framework of targeted co-operation projects or through its regular monitoring and advisory activities, whenever so requested.

The Council of Europe is notably ready to help member states in the implementation of the CM Recommendation of 2016 on the protection of journalism and safety of journalists and other media actors and to put into action the approaches and best practices mentioned in the Implementation Strategy of 2018 and the Implementation Guide of 2020. The co-operation of our Organisation with the European Union in this field can create positive synergies.

One further occasion for member states to renew, specify and clarify their political commitment to what they have already subscribed to, will be the Council of Europe Conference of Ministers responsible for Media and Information Society. This Conference is expected to adopt a final declaration and four resolutions drafted by the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI):

- on the safety of journalists, which will contain a commitment to develop national action plans, including for the implementation of Recommendation CM/Rec(2016)4;
- on freedom of expression and digital technologies;
- on the changing media and information environment; and
- on the impact of the health crisis on freedom of expression.

These commitments, expected to be taken at high political level should boost further concrete and credible action within our member states to produce tangible results, in co-operation with all stakeholders.

APPENDIX I

Alerts on the Platform for the protection of journalism and the safety of journalists between 1 May and 31 December 2020^{29}

Alert	Publication date	Category	Level	Source	State reply
Albania					
Police Uses Force and Detains Two Journalists Covering Street Clashes in	15.12.2020	attacks	1	state	
Albania					
Explosives Detonate in Front of Albanian Journalist Elidon Ndreka's House	05.11.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Journalist Elvis Hila Obstructed and Detained by Police in Albania	23.06.2020	harassment	2	state	11.09.2020
Heavy Fines and Shutdown Threat against Albanian TV Channel	19.05.2020	other acts	2	state	16.07.2020
Armenia					
Demonstrators Attack RFE/RL Office in Yerevan, Assault Journalists	12.11.2020	attacks	2	unknown	
Armenian Ministry of Foreign Affairs strips Russian Journalist Ilya Azar of Press Accreditation	23.10.2020	other acts	2	state	13.11.2020
Austria					
Journalist Nurettin Civandag Assaulted in Vienna after Filming Pro-Kurdish Demonstration	02.07.2020	harassment	1	non-state	
Azerbaijan					
Journalist Arzu Geybulla Targeted by Harassment Campaign	10.12.2020	harassment	2	non-state	
Shelling Injures two Russian Journalists Yuriy Kotenok and Levon Arzanov covering the Nagorno- Karabakh conflict	23.10.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Shelling Injures Four Journalists covering the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict	23.10.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Journalist Afgan Sadikhov Detained and Charged with Extortion	18.06.2020	detention	1	state	
Azerbaijani Reporter Elchin Mammad Detained	15.05.2020	detention	1	state	
Belgium					
News Website Apache Ordered by Court to Take Down an Article	24.09.2020	other acts	2	state	
Journalist Florence Hainaut Targeted by Harassment Campaign	24.07.2020	harassment	2	non-state	
MIA Brussels Correspondent Tanja Milevska Receives Death and Rape Threats	15.07.2020	harassment	1	unknown	
EU observer under Threat of Legal Action in Belgium after Complaint was Dismissed in Luxembourg	25.06.2020	harassment	2	non-state	
Journalist Jeremy Audouard Intimidated by Brussels Police while Filming an Arrest	08.06.2020	harassment	2	state	

²⁹ Update 13 January 2021.

Bosnia and Herzegovina Death Threat Sent to Nezavisne Novine	22.12.2020	harassment	1	unknown	
Newsroom	22.12.2020	narassment	'	unknown	
TV Journalist Sinan Gluhić Attacked by	10.06.2020	attacks	1	non-state	04.08.2020
Politician				11011 01010	000
Death Threats against N1 Journalist	03.06.2020	attacks	1	non-state	21.07.2020
Nikola Vučić					
Journalist Vanja Stokić Received Death Threat	27.05.2020	attacks	1	non-state	
Bulgarian Reporter Martin Georgiev	24.09.2020	harassment	2	state	
Summoned for Questioning over	24.09.2020	Harassinein		State	
Request for Comment					
Bulgarian Journalist Polina Paunova	11.09.2020	attacks	2	unknown	
Attacked while Covering Party					
Conference					
Bulgarian Freelance Journalist Dimitar	04.09.2020	attacks	1	state	
Kenarov Beaten and Detained by					
Police while Covering Protest Bulgarian Media Owner Ivo Prokopiev	29.06.2020	harassment	1	state	
under Threat of Imprisonment for	29.00.2020	Harassment	'	State	
Expressing "Opinion"					
Investigative Journalist Dimiter Petzov	19.06.2020	harassment	1	state	
Charged with Drug Possession Days					
after Filing a Freedom of Information					
Request					
Croatia					
Death Threats against Croatian	03.12.2020	harassment	2	non-state	
Journalists after Man Storms into					
Zadarski.hr Editorial Offices	00.40.0000	<u> </u>	0		
N1 TV Crew Insulted and Threatened during Interview	22.10.2020	harassment	2	non-state	
during interview					
Estonia					
Results of Investigation Remain Offline	10.12.2020	other acts	2	non-state	
Amid Ongoing Lawsuit Against					
Estonian Public Broadcaster and Journalists Mihkel Kärmas and Anna					
Pihl					
Estonian Justice Minister to Look into	24.11.2020	harassment	2	state	17.12.2020
Journalists' Practices Following	22020	narassment	_	oldio	1711212020
Revelations					
France					
France Press Photographer Guillaume	20.12.2020	harassment	2	state	
Fauveau Intimidated by Police	20.12.2020	Harassinein	4	State	
Flyers Inciting Hatred against	01.12.2020	other acts	2	state	
Journalists in French Police Stations			_		
Several Journalists Wounded during	01.12.2020	attacks	1	state	
"March for Freedoms" in Paris					
Journalists Assaulted by Police during	27.11.2020	attacks	1	state	
Forced Evacuation of Migrant Camp	04.44.0000	1		-1-1	
Journalists Tangi Kermarrec and	24.11.2020	harassment	2	state	
Hannah Nelson Detained Overnight	00 11 2020	other esta	2	ctoto	
Bill on Global Security Threatens Press	09.11.2020	other acts	2	state	
Freedom					
Freedom The Minister of the Interior Tries to	09.11.2020	harassment	2	state	
The Minister of the Interior Tries to Identify the Sources of Journalist Willy	09.11.2020	harassment	2	state	

TF1 and Journalist Liseron Boudoul Targeted by Hate Campaign	03.11.2020	harassment	2	non-state	16.12.2020
Five Journalists Held in Police Custody	08.10.2020	detention	2	state	16.12.2020
Two Media Workers Injured in Knife	28.09.2020	attacks	1	non-state	16.12.2020
Attack	20.09.2020	allauns	'	11011-State	10.12.2020
New National Policing Plan Raises Concerns among Journalists	23.09.2020	other acts	2	state	04.01.2021
Journalists Obstructed during Yellow Vest Demonstrations	18.09.2020	harassment	2	state	04.01.2021
Journalist Alexandre Reza Kokabi	30.06.2020	detention	2	state	16.12.2020
Arrested and Taken into Custody Subject to Repeated Intimidation,	15.06.2020	harassment	2	non-state	04.01.2021
Journalist Inès Léraud Faces New Defamation Charges					
Deputy Eric Ciotti Wants to Sanction	09.06.2020	other acts	2	state	
Journalists who Broadcast images of	00.00.2020	Other dots	_	State	
Police Officers					
Journalist Ysis Percq Threatened and Intimidated by Far-right Activists	27.05.2020	harassment	2	non-state	16.12.2020
Journalists Banned from Railway	13.05.2020	other acts	2	non-state	16.12.2020
Stations	1010012020	ourior doto	_	Tion state	1011212020
Georgia					
At Least 5 Journalists Attacked,	07.10.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Beaten in Run-Up to Parliamentary					
Elections					
Germany					
Journalists Insulted and Harassed by	03.08.2020	harassment	2	non-state	31.08.2020
Demonstrators in Berlin	04.05.0000		4		45.00.0000
ZDF Camera Crew Severely Assaulted in Berlin	04.05.2020	attacks	1	unknown	15.06.2020
Greece					
Three German Freelance Journalists	27.11.2020	detention	1	state	
Detained on Lesbos while Reporting	27.11.2020	determon	I	State	
on Refugee Landings	00.07.0000				04.07.0000
Critical Greek Media Excluded or Side-	23.07.2020	other acts	2	state	31.07.2020
lined from State Funding Package during Covid-19					
Smear Campaign Against Four Sport	12.05.2020	harassment	2	unknown	27.05.2020
<u>Journalists</u>					
Hungary			_		
Police Question Journalists over an Article	29.10.2020	harassment	2	state	
Civil Court Gags Investigative Report	22.10.2020	other acts	2	state	
under EU Data Privacy Rules	24 00 2020	other acts	2	ototo	
Hungarian Ministry of Foreign Affairs to List Journalists' Trips Abroad	21.09.2020	other acts	2	state	
Hungary's Last Independent Radio	11.09.2020	other acts	2	state	01.10.2020
Station has License Extension					
Rejected by Media Council	31.07.2020	other ests	2	unknown	17.08.2020
Dismissal of Index News Website Editor Further Constricts Media	31.07.2020	other acts		unknown	17.00.2020
Independence					
Threats of Legal Action against	11.05.2020	harassment	2	non-state	25.06.2020
Cartoonist Gábor Pápai					
Ireland					
Lawsuit Filed against the "Dublin	08.09.2020	other acts	2	non-state	
Inquirer"					

Italy					
La Nazione Photojournalist Tommaso	09.11.2020	attacks	2	non-state	24.11.2020
Germogli Hospitalised with Head	09.11.2020	allacks	4	11011-State	24.11.2020
Trauma after Attack					
	03.11.2020	ottooleo	2		24 44 2020
Sky TG 24 Crew Covering Anti-	03.11.2020	attacks	2	unknown	24.11.2020
Lockdown Demonstration Attacked					
and Chased in Naples			_		
Italian Journalist Mimmo Rubio	30.10.2020	attacks	2	non-state	24.11.2020
<u>Threatened over Coverage of COVID-19</u>					
Protests and Organised Crime					
Cars of Italian Journalists Claudio	20.10.2020	attacks	1	unknown	19.11.2020
Brambilla and Luisa Biella Destroyed					
in Suspected Arson Attack					
Italian Journalist Saverio Tommasi	14.10.2020	harassment	2	non-state	12.11.2020
Insulted and Threatened by Anti-face					
Mask Protesters in Rome					
Online Threats Against the President	26.08.2020	harassment	2	non-state	24.09.2020
of Federazione Nazionale Stampa	20.00.2020	Harassinein	_	11011-State	24.09.2020
Italiana	40.00.0000	atte -l		me:= =1=1=	00.07.0000
Journalists Attacked and Labelled as	10.06.2020	attacks	2	non-state	02.07.2020
"Terrorists" during Far-Right Protests					
in Rome					
Government Signals Reversal of	05.05.2020	other acts	2	state	26.05.2020
Commitments to End Jail Penalties for					
Journalists in Defamation Law					
Malta					
Attempt by a Lawyer to Bribe	05.11.2020	other acts	2	non-state	
Journalist Ivan Martin					
British-Azerbaijani Businessman	15.07.2020	harassment	2	non-state	
Threatens Defamation Actions against			_	11011 010110	
Five Media Outlets					
Netherlands					
Intelligence and Security Agencies Act	23.12.2020	other acts	2	state	
Threatens Press Freedom and the	25.12.2020	Other acts		State	
Protection of Sources					
Frotection of Sources					
North Macedonia					
Journalist Miroslava Byrns Threatened	27.07.2020	ottooko	1	non ototo	
		attacks	-	non-state	
TV Klan Crew Threatened and Asked to	03.06.2020	other acts	2	unknown	
<u>Delete Footage</u>					
Poland					
Orlen's Takeover of Polska Press	23.12.2020	other acts	1	non-state	
Exposes Media Pluralism					
Gazeta Wyborcza Journalist Angelika	25.11.2020	harassment	2	state	15.12.2020
Pitoń faces Two Charges in Poland					
Polish photojournalist Agata	24.11.2020	detention	1	state	
Grzybowska detained and charged					
Polish Photojournalists Beaten by Riot	12.11.2020	attacks	1	state	
Police	12.11.2020	attaono	'	State	
Gazeta Wyborcza Journalists Magda	30.10.2020	attacks	1	non-state	
	30.10.2020	allacks	'	non-state	
Kozioł and Joanna Urbańska-Jaworska					
Assaulted by Masked Men while					
Covering Women's March					
Warsaw Publishing House Broken into	15.07.2020	harassment	2	unknown	27.10.2020
and Vandalised					
International Floation Observans	15.07.2020	other acts	2	state	10.09.2020
International Election Observers	1				
Criticise TVP Election Coverage	07.05 2020	harassment	2	state	22,07 2020
	07.05.2020	harassment	2	state	22.07.2020

Romania					
Judicial Intimidation Targeting the	03.08.2020	harassment	2	state	24.09.2020
Romanian Union of Journalists and					
Daily Newspaper "Libertatea"	00.00.0000	h a ra a a ra a ra t		non state	10.07.0000
Lawsuits Filed against the Romanian Centre for Investigative Journalism	08.06.2020	harassment	2	non-state	16.07.2020
Russian Federation					
Police Arrest Journalists Covering	18.11.2020	detention	1	state	
Protests in Khabarovsk, Anton	1011112020	dotomion	•	otato	
Kurdiumov, Andrey Solomakhin and					
Dmitry Khetagurov Remain in					
Detention			_		
Russian Journalist Aleksandr Pichugin	12.11.2020	harassment	2	state	
Awaiting Verdict in False News Trial Police Detain, Interrogate Journalist	30.10.2020	other acts	2	state	
Yana Toporkova, Raid Her Home	30.10.2020	Other acts		State	
Journalist Sergey Plotnikov Abducted,	21.10.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Questioned, Beaten, then Released in					
Russia's Far East					
Koza Press Editor-in-Chief Irina	07.10.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Slavina Dies After Self-Immolation	07.00.000				
Russian Journalists Aleksandr	27.08.2020	detention	1	state	
Dorogov and Yan Katelevskiy Imprisoned, Beaten During Arrests and					
Detention					
Journalist from Dagestan, Russia	29.07.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Threatened with Death in a Phone Call					
Russian Journalist Dmitriy Nizovtsev	27.07.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Beaten by Unidentified Men	40.07.0000	Interior	4	-1-1-	
Russian Journalist Ivan Safronov Arrested over Charges of Treason;	10.07.2020	detention	1	state	
Journalists Detained at Protests for his					
Release					
Attack on Russian Journalist David	02.07.2020	attacks	1	state	
Frenkel Covering Constitutional					
Election Fined	04.07.0000	ath ay acta	2	atata	
Echo of Moscow Radio Station Fined over COVID-19 Interview	01.07.2020	other acts	2	state	
Russian Journalists Investigated,	19.06.2020	other acts	2	state	
Fined over COVID-19 Reporting	10.00.2020		_	State	
Serbia New Threats to TV N1 Journalist	20.11.2020	harassment	2	unknown	
Zaklina Tatalovic	20.11.2020	Harassment		unknown	
Serbian Journalist Jeton Ismaili's	20.08.2020	attacks	1	unknown	26.10.2020
Family Threatened during Break-In					
Serbia: Finance Ministry Demands	03.08.2020	other acts	2	unknown	
Access to Bank Records of Journalists					
and NGOs	15.07.2020	ottooko	1	ototo	26 10 2020
Journalists and Media Workers Attacked and Obstructed while	15.07.2020	attacks	I	state	26.10.2020
Covering Belgrade Protests					
Several Journalists Attacked while	15.07.2020	attacks	1	non-state	26.10.2020
Covering Protests in Novi Sad and Nis					
Journalist Sasa Mikic Reporting on	25.06.2020	attacks	1	non-state	26.10.2020
Serbian Election Assaulted Outside					
Polling Station	12.06.2020	harasamant	2	unknown	03 09 3030
Journalist Bojana Pavlović Harassed in Front of the Police who Confiscated	12.00.2020	harassment	2	unknown	03.08.2020
her Phone					
KRIK Targeted by a Smear Campaign	18.05.2020	harassment	2	state	
after Investigation					

Slovak Republic					
Slovak Investigative Journalist Peter	26.06.2020	attacks	1	unknown	15.07.2020
Sabo Finds Bullet in His Mailbox					
Slovenia					
Journalists Attacked and Injured while	09.11.2020	attacks	1	non-state	02.12.2020
Covering Protests in Slovenia	09.11.2020	attacks	1	Tion-state	02.12.2020
Two Journalists from RTV Slovenia	06.10.2020	harassment	2	state	02.12.2020
Subject to Preliminary Investigation for	0011012020	11010001110111	_	June	022.2020
Violating COVID-19 Restrictions					
39 Lawsuits against Journalists from	30.09.2020	other acts	2	non-state	27.10.2020
<u>Necenzurirano</u>					
Director of the Government	20.08.2020	harassment	2	state	
Communication Office Calls for					
Citizens to Publicly Denounce Media					
"Manipulators" Reporter Eugenija Carl Receives	22.06.2020	harassment	2	unknown	07.07.2020
Threatening Letter with White Powder	22.00.2020	Harassment		UTIKITOWIT	07.07.2020
Prime Minister Janez Janša Denigrates	18.05.2020	harassment	2	state	25.08.2020
Journalists	10.00.2020	Harassment	_	State	20.00.2020
Spain	00.00.0000	-41	0	-1-1-	
RTVE Left without Board of Directors	23.09.2020	other acts	2	state	
for the Past Two Years	15.09.2020	horocomont	2	non-state	
Sexist Graffiti Painted on the façade of «Pikara Magazine» headquarters	15.09.2020	harassment		non-state	
Spanish Journalist Physically	05.06.2020	attacks	2	non-state	
Assaulted while Reporting on Protests	00.00.2020	attaoko	_	non state	
in Madrid					
Portuguese Journalists Banned from	12.05.2020	other acts	2	state	18.05.2020
Entering Spain					
Sweden True laws elicite Process to differ	00.40.0000			-1-1-	40.44.0000
Two Journalists Prosecuted for Investigative Documentary on 'MS	20.10.2020	harassment	2	state	13.11.2020
Estonia'					
Exiled Turkish Journalist Abdullah	02.10.2020	attacks	1	unknown	
Bozkurt Attacked in Stockholm	02.10.2020	attaono	•	diminowii	
Exiled Pakistani Journalist Sajid	13.05.2020	attacks	1	unknown	18.05.2020
Hussain Baloch Found Dead					
Cartoonist Mahmoud Abbas	11.05.2020	harassment	1	unknown	19.05.2020
Threatened with Death					
Toulous					
Turkich leurneliet Avecaül Değen	00.40.0000	dotouticu	1	otata	
Turkish Journalist Ayşegül Doğan	08.12.2020	detention	1	state	
Sentenced to 6 Years, 3 Months in Prison					
Turkish Police Raid Mezopotamya	25.11.2020	detention	1	state	
News Agency, Detain Journalist Dindar	20.11.2020	dotortion	•	State	
Karatas					
Turkish News Agency Office Raided	13.10.2020	detention	1	state	
and Four Journalists Detained					
Turkish Journalists Rawin Sterk and	11.09.2020	detention	1	state	
Selman Keles on Trial over Alleged					
Membership in Terrorist Organisations	44.00.0000	date of	0	-1-1-	
Turkish Journalist Oktay Candemir	11.09.2020	detention	2	state	
Charged with 'Insulting' Deceased Sultan in Satirical Tweet					
Several Attacks on Local Journalists	27.08.2020	attacks	1	non-state	
and Journalists' Associations	21.00.2020	allauno	1	าเบา-จเสเษ	
Turkey Proposed Social Media Law,	27.07.2020	other acts	2	state	
Threatening Press Freedom			_		

Two Journalists, Müyesser Yıldız and	12.06.2020	detention	1	state	
İsmail Dükel, Detained by Police for					
"Military Espionage"; Yıldız Arrested					
Journalist Metin Uca Sentenced to 14	09.06.2020	harassment	1	non-state	
Months for Tweeting Suspiciously					
Accurate Election Forecast by State-					
run News Agency					
Interior Minister Denigrates Oda TV	20.05.2020	harassment	2	state	
Journalist Müyesser Yıldız					
Radio Television High Council Bans	11.05.2020	other acts	2	state	
Halk TV after Interview with Opposition					
Politician					
Turkish Radio and Television High	11.05.2020	other acts	2	state	
Council Cancels Broadcast of Northern	11.00.2020	other dots	_	State	
Cypriot Diyalog TV					
Fox TV Banned from Broadcast,	11.05.2020	haracement	1	state	
Anchor Fatih Portakal Faces Three-	11.05.2020	harassment	I	State	
year Imprisonment	40.05.0000				
Criminal Complaint Filed against	10.05.2020	harassment	2	state	
Journalist Ragıp Zarakolu					
Ukraine					
Arson Attack on Alternatyva.org	22.10.2020	harassment	2	unknown	04.12.2020
Editorial Office					
Investigative Programme 'Schemes'	17.08.2020	harassment	2	unknown	12.11.2020
Targeted with Car Burning					
Ukrainian Investigative Journalist	12.08.2020	other acts	2	unknown	12.11.2020
Mykhailo Tkach Finds Traces of					
Surveillance Devices at his Home					
Judges Illegally Tried to Gain Access	04.08.2020	other acts	2	state	12.11.2020
to a Ukrainian Journalist Telephone			_		
Ukrainian Journalist Katerina	24.07.2020	harassment	2	unknown	12.11.2020
Sergatskova in Hiding amid Threats	2110712020	Harassmon	_	a mano min	1211112020
sorgatore ta in maning arms in outs					
United Kingdom					
Lawsuit Against Swedish Outlet	09.12.2020	other acts	2	non-state	
Realtid Filed in London	09.12.2020	Other acts		11011-State	
	24 40 2020	baraaamant	2	unknourn	
Journalist Patricia Devlin Subject to	21.10.2020	harassment	2	unknown	
Threats and Intimidation Despite Police					
Complaint	24 22 222				
Investigative Media Outlet	01.09.2020	other acts	2	state	23.09.2020
"Declassified UK" Blacklisted by the					
Ministry of Defence					
Media Workers Threatened and	17.06.2020	attacks	2	non-state	
Assaulted at Violent Far-right Rally in					
<u>London</u>					
Journalist Amy Fenton Put under	03.06.2020	attacks	2	non-state	
Police Protection due to Threats					
following Coverage of a Criminal case					
Open Democracy Journalist Banned	28.05.2020	other acts	2	state	
from Asking Questions at UK					
Government's Daily Press Briefings					
Loyalist Threats against Journalists in	11.05.2020	harassment	1	unknown	25.06.2020
Northern Ireland	11.00.2020	Tarassineill	'	GIRTIOWII	20.00.2020
Jogger Insults a TV Journalist and	07.05.2020	attacks	2	non-state	
	07.03.2020	allacks	_	11011-State	
Throws Water over Her					

APPENDIX II

Other recent developments in the field of freedom of expression and information in the Council of Europe

- On 1 December 2020, the Council of Europe Convention 205 on Access to Official Documents, generally referred to as the Tromsø Convention, entered into force after ratification by 10 states. This Convention is the first binding international legal instrument to recognise a general right of access to official documents held by public authorities. Transparency of public authorities is a key feature of good governance. This treaty is open for signature by the member states and for accession by non-member states and by any international organisation.
- The PACE Committee on Culture, Science, Education and Media is currently working on reports on "Media freedom, public trust and the people's right to know"; "The role of the media in time of crisis"; and "The control of on-line communication: a threat to media pluralism, freedom of information and human dignity". As a part of the preparation of these reports, the PACE Culture Committee is regularly organising hearings and exchanges of views with partners of the Platform and experts in the field of freedom of expression.
- On 7 July 2020, the Venice Commission issued a compilation of its Opinions and reports concerning freedom of expression and media.³⁰
- As part of its on-going Fifth Evaluation Round, GRECO frequently comments on the
 access by journalists and the public to information, especially in relation to persons
 exercising top executive functions. GRECO has issued various recommendations to
 member states (e.g. Belgium, Croatia, Denmark, Luxembourg, Malta, Poland and Spain)
 to improve access to information and has encouraged those member states which have
 not yet done so to sign and ratify the Tromsø Convention.
- On 27 October 2020, the Commissioner for Human Rights issued a statement against Strategic Lawsuits against public participation (SLAPPs).³¹ She advocates a threefold approach: preventing the filing of SLAPPs by allowing the early dismissal of such suits. This should go hand in hand with awareness raising among judges and prosecutors, and proper implementation of the caselaw of the Court on defamation; introducing measures to punish abuse, particularly by reversing the costs of proceedings; minimising the consequences of SLAPPs by giving practical support to those who are sued.
- The latest study commissioned by the Media Division "The impact of COVID-19 and ensuing measures on freedom of expression in Council of Europe member states" describes a number of allegedly too far-reaching actions of member states in the face of the COVID-19-crisis and proposes conclusions on which steps should be taken to protect and promote freedom of expression in times of this crisis.

³¹ <u>Time to take action against SLAPPs – Human Rights Comments – Commissioner for Human Rights (www.coe.int).</u>

³⁰ https://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/?pdf=CDL-PI(2020)008-e.

³² The impact of COVID-19-19 and ensuing measures on freedom of expression in Council of Europe member states.

 On 29-30 September 2020 the Committee of Experts on Combating Hate Speech (ADI/MSI-DIS) held its first meeting and started work on a draft Committee of Ministers' recommendation on a comprehensive approach to combating hate speech, including in the context of an online environment, within a human rights framework.