ԼԵԶՈՒ

limbă

nyelv

γλώσσα

THIRD EVALUATION REPORT ON ROMANIA

язик

cànan

ǩiõll

språk

Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

Adopted on 15 June 2023

COUNCIL OF EUROPE
CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a state party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the state and, where appropriate, to encourage the party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodic reports that a party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the state to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodic report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the state concerned. The periodic report shall be made public by the state in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each state for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the state, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodic report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the state in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the state concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective state party for possible comments within a given deadline. A confidential dialogue may, at this stage, be requested by this state party. The final evaluation report is made public, together with the comments, if any, which the authorities of the state party may have made. This document is then transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for the adoption of its recommendations to the state party, on the basis of the proposals for recommendations contained in the evaluation report.

MIN-LANG(2023)13

Published on 14 September 2023

Secretariat of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages
Council of Europe
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex
France

www.coe.int/minlang

CONTENTS

Executive Summary **6**

Chapter 1 The situation of the minority languages in Romania – Recent developments and trends **7**

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the minority languages in Romania **7**

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Romania **15**

Chapter 2 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations **36**

2.1 Albanian **36**

2.1.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Albanian 36

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Albanian in Romania 37

2.2 Armenian **38**

2.2.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Armenian 38

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Armenian in Romania 39

2.3 Bulgarian **40**

2.3.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Bulgarian 40

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Bulgarian in Romania 44

2.4 Croatian **45**

2.4.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Croatian 45

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Croatian in Romania 49

2.5 Czech **50**

2.5.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Czech 50

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Czech in Romania 54

2.6 German **55**

2.6.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German 55

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Romania 59

2.7 Greek **61**

2.7.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Greek 61

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Greek in Romania 62

2.8 Hungarian **63**

2.8.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian 63

2.8.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Romania 67

2.9 Italian **68**

2.9.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian 68

2.9.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Romania 69

2.10 Macedonian **70**

2.10.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Macedonian 70

2.10.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Macedonian in Romania 71

2.11 Polish **72**

2.11.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Polish 72

2.11.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Polish in Romania 72

2.12 Romani **74**

2.12.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani 74

2.12.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Romania 75

2.13 Russian **76**

2.13.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian 76

2.13.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Romania 79

2.14 Ruthenian **81**

2.14.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ruthenian 81

2.14.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ruthenian in Romania 82

2.15 Serbian **83**

2.15.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian 83

2.15.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Romania 86

2.16 Slovak **88**

2.16.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak 88

2.16.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Romania 91

2.17 Tatar **93**

2.17.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Tatar 93

2.17.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Tatar in Romania 94

2.18 Turkish **95**

2.18.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Turkish 95

2.18.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Turkish in Romania 99

2.19 Ukrainian **100**

2.19.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian 100

2.19.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Romania 104

2.20 Yiddish **105**

2.20.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yiddish 105

2.20.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yiddish in Romania 106

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe **107**

Appendix I: Instrument of ratification **108**

Appendix II: Comments of the Romanian authorities **116**

Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Romania in 2008 and applies to the following languages: Albanian, Armenian, Greek, Italian, Macedonian, Polish, Romani, Ruthenian, Tatar, Yiddish, covered only by Part II of the Charter, and Bulgarian, Croatian, Czech, German, Hungarian, Russian, Serbian, Slovak, Turkish and Ukrainian, covered by Part II and Part III of the Charter.

The Romanian authorities submitted their periodic report more than six years after the second evaluation report and consequently with a delay exceeding an entire monitoring cycle. The information contained was sometimes out-dated and consequently hampered the effectiveness of the monitoring mechanism. However, the quality of the meetings held during the on-the-spot visit permitted to partly remedy such lack of up-to-date information.

The Romanian Constitution alongside specific laws provide a general framework for the protection and promotion of minority languages, and more generally their speakers and all persons belonging to national minorities. Furthermore, there is a large financial support given to the 19 national organisations of citizens belonging to national minorities. They are represented in the Council of National Minorities and in the Romanian Parliament.

The Romanian educational system overall guarantees a high level of support for several minority languages. The teaching in/of most of the minority languages is set in the school curriculum, with exceptions concerning Albanian, Macedonian, Ruthenian, Tatar and Yiddish. At the University and higher education level, Romania promotes most minority languages.

Formally, minority languages can be used in judicial proceedings throughout the country. However, persons submitting written documents in a minority language bear the extra costs of translation in civil and administrative court proceedings, in contradiction with the undertakings of the Charter accepted by Romania.

The current legislation provides that the right to use national minority languages in administration is ensured only in administrative-territorial units where citizens belonging to a national minority represent more than 20% of the population. The Committee of Experts has consistently considered that such a threshold is too high and, if applied in an inflexible manner, deprives many speakers of minority languages of the full protection enshrined in the Charter.

While the offer of radio programmes in minority languages is overall satisfactory, television programmes (except for German and Hungarian), in their current format, are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of the minority languages and should be regarded as merely symbolic. Each minority language should benefit from programmes to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

More efforts are necessary to strengthen the use of German and Hungarian in health care.

For all minority languages, there is a strong and comprehensive offer of cultural activities.

This third evaluation report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Romania in February 2023.

Chapter 1 The situation of the minority languages in Romania – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as "the Charter") is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its states parties to protect and promote the country's traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. The Charter entered into force in Romania on 1 May 2008 and applies to the following languages: Albanian, Armenian, Bulgarian, Croatian, Czech, German, Greek, Hungarian, Italian, Macedonian, Polish, Romani, Russian, Ruthenian, Serbian, Slovak, Tatar, Turkish, Ukrainian and Yiddish. Albanian, Armenian, Greek, Italian, Macedonian, Polish, Romani, Ruthenian, Tatar and Yiddish are covered by Part II (Article 7) only, whereas the other languages receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).

2. The third periodic report was due on 1 May 2018 and the fourth periodic report on 1 May 2021. On 22 June 2022, the Committee of Experts received a periodic report covering the two cycles in one single document and decided exceptionally to carry out an evaluation covering the entire period in order to put Romania on the track of the 2018 reform.[1] Regrettably, the information contained in the periodic report was sometimes out-dated for several Charter undertakings and consequently hampered the effectiveness of the monitoring mechanism. However, the quality of the meetings held during the on-the-spot visit, both with representatives of the speakers and the national authorities, partly permitted to remedy such lack of up-to-date information. The Committee of Experts reminds the Romanian authorities of their duty to submit periodic reports every five years.[2] This evaluation report is based on the information contained in the periodic report and statements made by representatives of the speakers during the on-the-spot visit (6-10 February 2023) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the minority languages in Romania and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the Romanian authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the second monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of Romania in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the authorities of Romania. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Romania, as provided for in Article 16 (4) of the Charter. The Committee of Experts encourages the Romanian authorities to translate this report into Romanian and the minority languages with a view to supporting the authorities, organisations, advisory bodies and persons concerned in the process of fully implementing the Charter, in accordance with Art. 6 and 7.4.

4. As far as the detailed legal examination of each undertaking is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its second evaluation report on the application of the Charter in Romania.[3]

5. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Romania in February 2023. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 15 June 2023.

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the minority languages in Romania

Legislation, policies and practice at the national and provincial level

6. Romania has a solid legal and policy framework for the protection of persons belonging to national minorities, showing best practices in a significant number of cases. The important and steadily increasing financial support allocated to organisations of persons belonging to national minorities, including for transfrontier

[1] Decision CM/Del/Dec(2018)1330/10.4e of 28 November 2018 "Strengthening the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages.
[2] Article 15.1 of the Charter provides that states parties submit periodic reports every three years. However, following the entry into force of the reform of the monitoring mechanism of the ECRML on 1 July 2019, states parties are now to submit their reports every five years instead of every three years.
[3] See 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Romania, (MIN-LANG (2016) 42).

exchanges, underlines the importance of this topic for the authorities. The authorities also allocate considerable funding for promoting intercultural dialogue, both through the umbrella organisations of national minorities and through project grants. The 19 organisations representing the 20 recognised minorities benefit from the possibility to directly participate in the decision-making process through the Council of National Minorities and reserved seats in the Parliament.[4] However, it should be noted that there is a lack of gender balance in the representation of the national minorities.[5]

7. Language is considered as a specific ground for discrimination under the Romanian Constitution and the Governmental Ordinance 137/2000. Under this legal framework, the National Council on Combatting Discrimination (CNCD) has received 76 petitions between 2017 and 2021 based on this ground.[6]

8. Considering the fact that Romani is spoken as a mother tongue by at least 199,000 persons in the country and taking into account that it is estimated, including by the national authorities, that the number of speakers is in reality much higher, the Committee of Experts invites the Romanian authorities to consider the possibility of promoting further the presence of Romani in public life, in particular in education. The Committee of Experts also invites the Romanian authorities to review their level of commitment regarding other minority languages, and for instance, to extend its acceptance of Article 8.1.h to Czech, Article 11.3 to Croatian and Article 13.1.a to Turkish and Ukrainian, as they are already fulfilled in practice.

Census

9. The provisional results of the 2021 Romanian census showed a decrease of the resident population of Romania to 19,053,815 inhabitants.[7] This specifically affected national minorities, who did not expect such a sharp decline and questioned the accuracy of the census itself. In particular, they criticised the fact that more than 10% of the population did not provide any information on ethnicity, language and religious belief to complete the census.[8] They also pointed out that several technical problems hampered data collection throughout the process. In addition, it was not possible to declare more than one ethnicity, language and/or religion.

10. According to the authorities, efforts were made to raise awareness of the census among minorities (with the help of national minority umbrella organisations and churches), to translate questionnaires into minority languages and to recruit census takers speaking minority languages to meet with members of national minorities. The authorities further argue that the decrease of the population did not affect national minorities disproportionately compared to the whole population and that technical issues were compensated by face-to-face interviews.

11. The Committee of Experts welcomes the positive approach followed by the authorities in ensuring the involvement of minority representatives in the census process and in raising awareness of its importance. However, given the length of the form to be filled in and the technical problems encountered during the process, the Committee of Experts considers that there is a high probability that the number of speakers of minority languages identified is lower than the actual number, thus negatively affecting their rights, especially in territories where they traditionally live.

12. The Committee of Experts underlines that the results of the census should be complemented by collecting and assessing, in co-operation with the speakers, other data concerning the number of users of the regional or minority languages and their geographic distribution.[9] It calls on the authorities to consider the census results as one indicator, among others, used to set and implement relevant policies and measures or to entitle rights that are dependent on thresholds.

---

[4] See Articles 56 and 94 of the Law. 208/2015 regarding the election of the Senate and the Deputies Chamber of Deputies and the functioning of the Permanent Electoral Authority. Following the 2020 parliamentary elections, 18 members of Parliament representing national minority organisations which did not pass the electoral threshold were elected. It should be noted that the Czech and the Slovak minorities are represented by the same organisation. The Hungarian minority has also a parliamentary group composed of 20 members in Parliament.

[5] While each of the 19 national minority organisation has three seats in the Council of National Minorities, only 12 out of the 57 members were women in 2021.

[6] See Home - CNCD. CNCD is an independent body with a broad quasi-judicial and promotional mandate which can initiate proceedings ex officio and issue administrative sanctions. See also its activity report for the year 2022: Reports - CNCD.

[7] Recensamantul Populatiei si Locuintelor – RPL 2021 (recensamantromania.ro). The 2021 Romanian census was postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic and subsequently held between 1 February and 31 July 2022. Compared to the previous 2011 census, Romania lost 1.1 million inhabitants (20,121,641 inhabitants in 2011).

[8] According to the authorities, those who did not provide this information did so deliberately. Other sources suggest that census takers, who were paid by the number of forms completed, did not fill in the ethnicity questions because they were not compulsory.

[9] See 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, MIN-LANG(2021)15, paragraph 14.

Use of minority languages during the Covid-19 pandemic

13. In Romania, like in many other European countries, the Covid-19 pandemic had a strong negative impact on education and cultural activities, and it drastically reduced possibilities for cross-border co-operation. According to the Romanian authorities, information on the legal and sanitary measures adopted during the state of emergency and the state of alert were translated into 16 minority languages, with the help of the umbrella organisations of national minorities. Relevant health related information in minority languages was broadcast on television, and lessons in minority languages were also provided.

14. However, information collected during the on-the-spot visit suggests that such information and regulations were often translated with delay or not at all. When contacted, the umbrella organisations had difficulties in translating information in time, mainly due to the fact that the expected measures were applicable almost immediately after having been adopted. Self-declarations needed for leaving the home during lockdown could not be drawn up in minority languages including in places where the 20% threshold was met, which was considered discriminatory by CNCD

15. Furthermore, the negative impact of school closures during the pandemic disproportionally affected Roma children, given the practical challenges that online learning implies in terms of access to electronic devices.[10]

Use of the minority languages in education

16. The Romanian educational system[11] continues to guarantee a high level of support for many minority languages, showing best practices in many cases. The right to education in the mother tongue is guaranteed by the Constitution and transposed into practice in the National Education Law no. 1/2011, with subsequent amendments and completions.[12] Representatives of most national minorities expressed general satisfaction with the existing system.[13]

17. The teaching in/of most of the minority languages is set in the school curriculum, except for Albanian, Macedonian, Ruthenian, Tatar and Yiddish. The Committee of Experts invites the Romanian authorities, in co-operation with representatives of the speakers concerned, to consider the possibility to develop online education in/of the minority languages, as a complement to face-to-face education, in order to ensure that the teaching in/of these languages is provided where and when face-to-face classes are not easily accessible, because of a lack of teachers or insufficient number of pupils.[14] Online learning should also be developed, as a complement to face-to-face education and for all appropriate stages of education, to reach pupils and students living in territories other than those in which regional or minority languages are traditionally used.

18. The situation for Tatar differs from the other four languages mentioned above as there is a clear wish expressed by the speakers to include the teaching of Tatar in the general curriculum, with basic and continuous training for teachers and a school inspector in charge of monitoring Tatar. The Committee of Experts reminds that in the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers already recommended that the Romanian authorities "**develop comprehensive educational models for the teaching in or of Tatar and Turkish, in co-operation with representatives of the minority language speakers**" (Recommendation No.3).[15]

19. The existing teaching offer of certain languages, such as Bulgarian, Serbian, Turkish or Ukrainian, corresponds to the wishes expressed by the speakers, although the approach followed does not meet entirely the undertakings accepted by Romania under the Charter.

---

[10] European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (2020), Bulletin No. 5, Coronavirus pandemic in the EU – Impact on Roma and Travellers, p. 14.

[11] Under the Romanian educational system, preschool education (*Grădiniță*) is optional for children aged 3-4 (*Grupa mica*) and compulsory from 4 to 6 (*Grupa mijlocie* and *Grupa mare*). Primary school education (*Școala Primară*) is provided for pupils aged 6 to 11 (grades 0 [*Clasa pregătitoare*] and I to IV [*clasele I -IV*]). Lower secondary education (*Gimnaziu*) is provided for pupils aged 11 to 15 (grades V to VIII [*clasele V-VIII*]) and upper secondary education (*Liceu*) is provided for pupils aged 15 to 19 (grades IX to XII [clasele IX-XII]).

[12] See Art. 45 of the National Education Law no. 1/2011. See also the Methodology set in the Order of the Ministry of Education no. 5671/2012 (Articles 33, 34 and 35). See as well the Emergency Ordinance no. 87/2018 concerning primary school education; Law no. 201/2018 regarding pre-school education; Law no. 48/2019 on the establishment of classes in the mother tongue.

[13] They actively take part to the Language and Literature Olympiads that are organised every year at the school, county, and national level. Such events, well appreciated by the pupils, are important incentives for the promotion of minority languages.

[14] See Statement of the Committee of Experts on the Development of complementary online education in regional or minority languages.

[15] See CM/RecChL(2018)3.

20. Several representatives of minority languages raised the difficulty of creating and then maintaining classes in their mother tongue when the number of pupils is below the minimum threshold provided for in Article 63 of the National Education Law.[16] While welcoming the legal possibility to derogate from said minimum threshold, the Committee of Experts is of the view that the current system is particularly cumbersome for the school administration, which needs to ask for a derogation every year. The current system also does not provide sufficient guarantees and predictability for the parents to register their children in classes offering teaching in/of minority languages. The Committee of experts is of the view that the Romanian authorities must ensure that classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold complete the full cycle of education without the need for an annual approval.

21. Although German and Hungarian benefit from a very favourable situation, there is a recurrent shortage of teachers capable to teach in/of these languages. The Committee of Experts considers that this situation, as well as the shortage of teachers of Czech and Romani should be addressed without delay, including through incentives to make the profession more attractive.

22. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Romanian authorities "**continue to develop a comprehensive offer of teaching in or of Romani, taking account of the needs and wishes of the Romani speakers"** (Recommendation No.4). While noting that the authorities continued to make considerable efforts to ensure better access to education for Roma children,[17] the Committee of Experts is of the view that the situation concerning teaching in/of Romani is a source of concern. Considering the fact that the authorities themselves acknowledge that the number of persons belonging to the Roma minority is much higher than the one from the provisional result of the latest census,[18] the teaching offer in/of Romani is only made available to a relatively small percentage of Roma children. Therefore, the Committee of Experts calls on the authorities to extend the teaching offer in/of Romani, including at pre-school level, taking into account the needs and wishes of the speakers. It also encourages the authorities to launch national campaigns to recruit Romani teachers and to continue to regularly update textbooks, with the help of the National Center for Roma Culture - Romano-Kher. The Committee of Experts also invites the authorities to continue implementing the "*Strategy of the Romanian Government on inclusion of Romanian citizens belonging to the Roma minority for the period 2022-2027*" to close the education gap between Roma and the majority population, whilst taking an inclusive and gender-sensitive approach.

23. Textbooks about the history and culture of most of Romania's national minorities have been developed to serve as a basis for compulsory classes of one hour per week in grades 6 and 7 for pupils being taught in their mother tongue or receiving teaching of their mother tongue. However, the teaching of the history and culture of national minorities is not included in the national curriculum, except as an optional subject in grade 10. The Committee of Experts calls on the Romanian authorities to continue raising public awareness of regional or minority languages and the contribution of their speakers to Romanian society in general education, in particular in curricula, teaching materials and teacher training. It invites the Romanian authorities to consider the possibility of joining the Observatory on History Teaching in Europe of the Council of Europe.[19]

24. At the University and higher education level, Romania promotes regional and minority languages and shows best practices in a considerable number of cases (as for instance the trilingualism [German, Hungarian, Romanian] of the Babeş-Bolyai University).

25. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Romanian authorities "**provide the basic and further training of a sufficient number of teachers to fully implement the undertakings in the field of education with regard to the Bulgarian, Czech, Croatian, German, Hungarian, Romani, Russian, Serbian, Slovak, Turkish and Ukrainian languages"** (Recommendation No.2). The initial training of teachers teaching in minority languages is carried out in higher education institutions in Romania. The continuous training of teachers is ensured through the centres for further training of the teachers (*Teaching Staff Houses*), universities and other providers accredited by the Ministry of Education. In some cases, bilateral co-operation agreements have been concluded with other countries

[16] A 2020 amendment to the Law on National Education lowered the thresholds for opening classes (10 pupils in primary schools and gymnasiums, 15 pupils in high schools, see Law 185/2020). In addition, the Minister of Education Order no. 5511 of 28 October 2021 clarified the conditions for the exceptional approval of minority language classes when the minimum numbers are not met.
[17] During the reporting period, several measures have been taken, such as improving the existing infrastructure for early childhood education, recruiting school mediators, launching 'second chance' programmes for young people or adults who have not completed compulsory education, proactively contacting parents to ensure their children's enrolment in school, providing free meals.
[18] Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that the number of persons belonging to the Roma minority in Romania is two to three times higher than the provisional result of the latest census, with at least 6% of the population in each county.
[19] See Observatory on History Teaching in Europe.

for the initial and continuing training of teachers speaking minority languages, with training courses organised annually abroad. Two specialised centres ensure specifically the further training of teachers teaching in German and Hungarian.

26. The monitoring of the progress achieved in the teaching in/of minority languages is ensured at county level by county school inspectorates and at national level by the Ministry of Education. There are inspectors appointed under the law assuring such direct guidance and control. However, except for Hungarian, periodic reports of their findings are not being made public.

Use of the regional of minority languages by judicial authorities

27. Article 128 (2) of the Romanian Constitution states that "*Romanian citizens belonging to national minorities have the right to express themselves in their mother tongue before the courts of law, under the terms of the organic law*".[20] Such principle has been generally transposed into the Code of criminal procedure, in the Code of civil procedure, in the Law on judicial organisation, which complements the provisions of the Code of civil procedure, as well as in the Law on administrative litigation.[21] However, there are no data on the use, free of charge, of minority languages in practice.

28. In criminal proceedings, translation and interpretation during a trial are ensured free of charge for the accused, witnesses, victims. The Code of criminal procedure foresees that the act of indictment (*rechizitoriu*) must also be translated free of charge if the accused belongs to a national minority.[22]

29. However, in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that documents shall be "drawn up in Romanian". While the authorities indicated in their periodic report that documents and evidence are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages, persons submitting such documents in a minority language seem to bear the additional costs of translation, contrary to Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii and 9.1.d of the Charter.

30. The Committee of Experts calls on the Romanian authorities to amend the relevant laws so as to make it unambiguously clear that minority language speakers may use their language in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings even if they have a command of Romanian, and that they will not incur additional expense if interpretation or translation of requests, evidence or other documents is provided.[23]

31. Additionally, the Committee of Experts considers that there is a need to raise awareness about the right to use minority languages before courts and to promote their use. The Romanian authorities could encourage minority language speakers to use their languages in judicial proceedings, for example through bi-or multilingual notices, signs in/on courts buildings and websites, information in public announcements, court forms or in correspondence with interested parties.[24] The Romanian authorities are invited to provide information in the next monitoring cycle on how Article 21 (3) of Law No 242 of 12 October 2018 on the status of judges and prosecutors, which provides that "in the constituencies of courts and public prosecutor's offices where a national minority accounts for at least 50% of the number of inhabitants, in case of equal grade average, priority shall be given to candidates who speak the language of that minority", is implemented in practice.

Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities

32. The Committee of Experts has on several occasions indicated to the Romanian authorities that the 20% threshold set in the national legislation appears to be too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of Article 10 of the Charter.[25] In its previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers also recommended that the Romanian authorities "**reconsider the thresholds for official use of minority languages in the administration**" (Recommendation No.1). The Committee of Experts underlines that thresholds should not constitute an undue obstacle to the official use of certain minority languages in areas inhabited by persons belonging to national minorities. It invites the authorities to determine, in co-operation with the minority language speakers, the areas in which these minority

[20] See The Constitution of Romania (presidency.ro).
[21] See Articles 12 (2) and (3), in conjunction with Articles 81 (1) g) and 83 of COD PR PENALĂ (A) 13/01/2017 - Portal Legislativ (just.ro), Article 18 (2) and (4), in conjunction with Articles 225 of LEGE (R) 134 01/07/2010 - Portal Legislativ (just.ro), Article 16 (3) of LEGE 304 15/11/2022 - Portal Legislativ (just.ro) and Article 28 of LEGE 554 02/12/2004 - Portal Legislativ (just.ro).
[22] See Article 329(3) of the Code of criminal procedure.
[23] See 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Armenia, MIN-LANG (2020)3, paragraph 32.
[24] See 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Austria ECRML (2012)7, paragraph 209. See also 7th report of the Committee of Experts on the Netherlands, MIN-LANG (2022)19, paragraphs 65-67.
[25] See 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on Romania, ECRML(2012)3, paragraphs 35-37, and 2nd Report of the Committee of Experts on Romania, MIN-LANG(2016)42, paragraph 15.

languages are traditionally present in sufficient numbers for the purposes of the commitments undertaken by Romania and to apply Article 10 to the local authorities concerned, irrespective of the thresholds.[26]

33. The Committee of Experts notes that in 2019, Romania adopted a new Administrative code[27] regulating, *inter alia*, the use of national minority languages.[28] The new Administrative code not only confirmed the existing threshold, but also reinforced the conditions under which the use of national minority languages is regulated, in the light of the results of the "*last census*".[29]

34. Contrary to the previous Law no. 215/2001 on Local public administration, the 2019 Administrative code no longer contains a provision for maintaining the *status quo* if the share of a given minority population falls below the threshold of 20% in a successive census.[30] Considering the provisional results of the 2021 census, showing a decrease of persons belonging to national minorities, representatives of minority language speakers met during the on-the-spot visit expressed their concern that this would hamper the right to use minority languages in relation with administrative authorities. The Committee of Experts shares this concern and invites the Romanian authorities, including at local level, to secure and ensure the use of minority languages, to reconsider the existing threshold and to apply the Charter wherever the number is sufficient for the purpose of this undertaking.[31]

35. The Committee of Experts acknowledges that some efforts are made regarding the use of certain minority languages (e.g. Hungarian, German, Ukrainian, etc.) in some local branches of the national authorities providing public services.[32] However, the effective implementation of Article 10.1.aii of the Charter is still hampered by the 20% threshold. Moreover, even in areas where such threshold is met, speakers are still not entitled to use forms and types of administrative texts in common use in minority languages. While Article 195 (4) of the 2019 Administrative code clearly specifies that forms and types of administrative texts in common use shall be made available in minority languages, such possibility is subjected to a list that shall be established by Government Decision, on the proposal of the Department for Interethnic Relations (DRI) elaborated in co-operation with the Institute for the Study of National Minorities Problems, with the opinion of the ministries responsible for public administration, public finance and internal affairs. However, to this date, such list, which is a precondition for the use of minority languages in writing, has been prepared by the Department for Interethnic Relations but has not been approved by the government. The Committee of Experts invites the Romanian authorities to provide, in their next periodic report, a detailed explanation of the reasons why it is not "reasonably possible" to apply in practice the undertakings accepted under Article 10.1.aii for the minority languages covered by this undertaking.

36. At county level, given the existing 20% threshold, relevant provisions of the Administrative code concerning the use of minority languages do not apply in practice, except for Hungarian in six counties. Although it is not uncommon for civil servants speaking minority languages to be employed in decentralised and local administrations to provide – usually oral – replies when needed, information collected during the on-the-spot visit showed that certain public institutions are reluctant to use languages other than Romanian.

37. At local level, in the administrative-territorial units where citizens belonging to national minorities represent more than 20% of the population, local public administration authorities generally ensure the use of minority languages in their relations with them. Usually, speakers have the possibility to submit oral or written applications in minority languages (when no forms are required). However, their use is much more limited in the provision of public services. Concerning the publication of official documents or the use of minority languages in debates in public local assemblies, the situation varies from one municipality to another. With regard to the use of minority languages in local councils, the Committee of Experts welcomes the fact that, since the adoption of the new Administrative code,[33] two previous thresholds (concerning the minimum number of councillors belonging to the national minority necessary for the use of minority languages) have been abolished. The 2019 Administrative Code (Article 195 (5)) also provides for the recruitment and training of local civil servants speaking minority languages in areas where they are traditionally spoken.

---

[26] See 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, MIN-LANG(2021)15, paragraph 47.
[27] See Government Emergency Ordinance no. 57/2019 on the Administrative Code, published on 5 July 2019.
[28] See Article 94 (1) of the Administrative code on the use of the language of national minorities.
[29] See Article 135 (5) concerning the publication of the draft agenda for local councils; Article 138 (3) concerning the conduct of local council meetings; Article 195 concerning the use of the language of national minorities between citizens and local public administration authorities; Article 198 concerning the administrative acts of regulatory nature; Article 199 concerning administrative acts of individual character.
[30] See Article 94 (2) of the Administrative code.
[31] See 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on the Slovak Republic, ECRML(2007)1, paragraphs 40-47, and 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML(2011)5, paragraphs 75-78.
[32] Such as in Prefects' Offices, Gendarmerie, Police, General Inspectorate for Emergency Situations, the National Archives.
[33] Former Article 42.1-2 of the Law on Local Administration no. 215/2001 and Articles 3 and 6.1-2 of Government Decision no. 1206/2001.

38. Bilingual signs at the entrance and exit of municipalities and on buildings of institutions that are subordinated to local authorities are displayed in most municipalities or cities where speakers of minority languages traditionally live or are present in significant numbers. Some municipalities have voluntarily set up new bilingual or multilingual placename signs even though the minorities concerned do not reach 20% of the population. Other municipalities have maintained bilingual placename signs even though the local share of the given national minority has fallen below 20%. However, information collected during the on-the-spot visit not only suggests that the right to display bilingual signs and indications of placenames is subject to the 20% threshold set by Law,[34] for which the Committee of Experts has already indicated that it considers it to be too high, but also to an explicit decision taken by local authorities. Considering the expected decrease of persons belonging to national minorities in the last census, the Committee of Experts asks the national and local authorities to refrain from interpreting the norms too rigidly, so as not to limit the scope of existing provisions regarding topographical signage in minority languages.

Use of the regional or minority languages in the media

39. The national legislation[35] guarantees the protection and promotion of minority languages in the media, as well as a representation of minority language speakers in the National Audiovisual Council. A representative of the parliamentary Minority Group also sits in the board of administration of TVR.

40. The Romanian Television has three dedicated departments for programming in Hungarian, German, and languages of other minorities. All programmes are subtitled in Romanian. The Committee of Experts considers the weekly shows *Convieţuiri*, *Europolis* and *Toți împreună* as examples of good practices for the visibility of minority languages.[36] However, the undertakings accepted by Romania for the ten languages protected under Part III require to ensure adequate broadcasting duration and regularity in the use of the various minority languages.[37] While the existing offer is satisfactory for German and Hungarian, existing programmes for the other languages are unlikely, in their current format, to make an impact on the situation of the minority languages and should be considered as merely symbolic. The Committee of Experts asks the Romanian authorities to allocate to each minority language time slots for a television programme to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

41. Overall, the offer of radio programmes in minority languages is satisfactory. *Radio Cluj* and *Radio Târgu Mureş* broadcast many programmes in Hungarian. *Radio Constanța*, *Radio Reşiţa*, and *Radio Timişoara* cover together 15 minority languages, with programmes ranging between 30 and 60 minutes per week. In addition, several local studios such as *Radio Craiova* or *Radio Iași* have programmes focused on intercultural dialogue. Representatives of national minorities expressed overall satisfaction with the supply of public radio broadcasting.

42. All umbrella organisations regularly publish magazines about their activities. However, considering the long-standing interpretation of the Committee of Experts according to which a “newspaper” in the sense of the Charter is published daily or at least weekly, such publications cannot be considered as fulfilling the undertakings accepted under Article 11.1.ei by Romania. Newspapers only exist for German, Hungarian, Serbian and Turkish.

43. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that public broadcasters organise some trainings for their employees speaking minority languages. Training programmes for journalists and media personnel are sometimes carried out in co-operation with neighbouring states. The Committee of Experts encourages the Romanian authorities to continue providing financial and technical support to such training in minority languages.

44. Romanian legislation does not prevent the reception of radio and television broadcasts and the distribution of print media in minority languages in a cross-border context. However, information provided during the

---

[34] See Article 195 (6) of the Administrative code (former Articles 4.1 and 11.1 of Government Decision 1206/2001). The Committee of Experts understands that this provision must also be read in accordance with Articles 11 and 12 of the rules of 27 November 2001 “*implementing the provisions on the right of citizens belonging to a national minority to use their mother tongue in local public administration*”. In the present evaluation report, the Committee of Experts is going to make use of the Romanian names, bearing in mind that the names of localities in the mother tongue of citizens belonging to minorities can be found in the Annexes of the rules of 27 November 2001.

[35] Law no. 504/2002. See Articles 10 (f), 17 (1), 40, 42^7, 75, 82 and 91^2.

[36] These programmes are uploaded on the TVR+ în direct » TVR 1 (tvrplus.ro) portal. These shows are broadcast weekly and last between 45 and 120 minutes. Reports made within local communities or at various events of the organisation may contain excerpts, moments, interviews in minority languages or other audio - video collages inserted in the shows.

[37] See 6th report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG(2019)18, paragraph 51; 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Armenia, MIN-LANG(2020)3, paragraphs 49.

on-the-spot visit shows that speakers experience many difficulties in receiving programmes broadcast from neighbouring states, mainly due to geo-blocking and decisions taken by public and private providers. Therefore, the Committee of Experts, aware that the issue at stake involves different stakeholders, including private providers, encourages the Romanian authorities to raise this issue in the framework of bilateral and multilateral negotiations and to take measures to remove the respective practical and technical obstacles.

Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

45. There are many cultural activities in minority languages organised at national and local level in Romania, with a strong and substantial financial support from the Romanian authorities.[38] Overall, speakers of minority languages expressed satisfaction regarding the situation for cultural activities and facilities.

46. Every year, hundreds of cultural events and projects take place to promote the languages and traditions of persons belonging to national minorities (through traditional and folkloric music, dancing and singing activities, painting exhibitions, book presentations, theatre plays, film festivals, conferences, etc.). The Committee of Experts welcomes that in this context, members of national minorities regularly organise activities together or invite each other to events that they organise (for instance the Armenian Street Festival or the *Alfabetul Convieţuiri* Festival). Several cities across the country explicitly adopt language policies and strategies.[39] The existence of several theatres in minority languages throughout the country provides examples of good practices to be followed. A particular emphasis is placed on all minority languages during the Minority Days, in the context of the *ProEtnica* festival or the *Gaudeamus International Fair-Radio Romania*. The *Dimitrie Gusti National Village Museum* also regularly organises activities linked to the promotion and preservation of minority languages, with the participation of all or several minorities.

47. Furthermore, the National Library of Romania keeps copies of works and documents linked to Romania's minority languages and its speakers. The Romanian authorities also regularly organise cultural events abroad that promote minority languages.

Use of the regional or minority languages in economic life

48. During its on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was not made aware of any legal provision, internal regulations of companies or private contracts which unjustifiably prohibit or restrict the use of a minority language in documents relating to economic and social life. The Committee of Experts is also aware that, should such a case arise, the CNCD could assess such a situation directly.

49. Regarding provisions under article 13.2 (for German and Hungarian), the Committee of Experts notes that the Romanian authorities have amended in 2017 the legislation on social care[40] in order to establish that "*social assistance institutions and units shall, through the local public administration authorities, also provide staff who speak the language of the national minorities concerned*" in administrative-territorial units where the 20% threshold is met or where at least 5,000 citizens belong to a national minority. The Committee of Experts welcomes the idea of an alternative numerical threshold introduced for the field of health care and considers that such a practice should be further implemented in the general legislation on language use with public authorities. However, information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that the necessary secondary legislation is still missing five years after the legislative change. Consequently, there is no active recruitment of minority language speakers and no language training for existing staff is taking place. In addition, it notes that there is little awareness of this legislation among local authorities. Therefore, the Committee of Experts asks the Romanian authorities to adopt the necessary secondary legislation in order to recruit the needed staff members speaking the required minority languages. It also invites the authorities to raise awareness of this legislation among all relevant stakeholders.

Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges

50. The Romanian authorities have concluded co-operation agreements with neighbouring countries and other states where the minority languages are spoken in similar forms. Similarly, twinning agreements have been concluded at the local level between regional and/or local authorities, under which co-operation across borders is facilitated. The Committee of Experts encourages the Romanian national, regional and

[38] The funds allocated annually to the main umbrella organisations of national minorities by the Romanian authorities, as well as additional funding for sectoral programmes and projects, serve as a basis to finance such cultural activities.
[39] The city of Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar was designated "*2023 European Capital of Culture*" by promoting its diverse cultural palette formed over the centuries.
[40] See Article 41 (6) of LEGE 292 20/12/2011 - Portal Legislativ (just.ro) as modified in Article II of LAW No. 110 of 19 May 2017.

local authorities to continue promoting exchanges under these agreements for the benefit of all minority languages in Romania.

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Romania

Albanian – Part II language

51. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 645 persons belong to the Albanian "ethnic group" in Romania and 421 declared Albanian as their mother tongue. They are mainly concentrated in Constanța, Craiova and Bucharest, but there are no municipalities where the national minority exceeds 20% of the population. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Association League of Albanians of Romania (ALAR).[41]

52. ALAR organises many events each year to promote Albanian, such as the Albanian Language Days in Brăila or the Albanian Culture Days in Craiova. It also participates to other events, keeping close contact with all national minorities. A bilingual library is available and provides with hundreds of books and albums published by the printing house of the Association *Privire Veshtrimi*. The Albanian national minority is very active on social networks, and also publishes the cultural magazine *Drita*. Through radio (*Radio Bucharest*, *Radio Oltenia Craiova*) and television (*TVR 3, TVR Bucharest*), the Albanian national minority promotes its ethnic identity, language and culture. There are weekly programmes on several local radio stations.

53. Albanian is not included in the general curriculum in mainstream education. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that this situation is due to the fact that Albanian speakers are dispersed through Romania and a reported lack of interest from persons belonging to the national minority themselves to learn the language which may be a matter of concern. In addition, there are too few pupils of the same age group to organise Albanian teaching courses in any municipality. Yet, new useful tools have been published[42] and distributed freely to persons belonging to the Albanian national minority and ALAR continues to offer weekly courses with qualified teachers for those wanting to learn Albanian.[43] At higher education level, Albanian is no longer taught as the master's degree in Balkan Cultural Relations of the University of Bucharest no longer exists. The Committee of Experts emphasizes the importance of education for the protection and promotion of regional minority languages.

54. ALAR has developed strong connections with several partners from Albania, especially in the cultural field, as well as with Albanian speakers in Italy and Croatia.

Armenian – Part II language

55. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 1,213 persons belong to the Armenian "ethnic group" in Romania and 421 declared Armenian as their mother tongue. The Armenian national minority is dispersed in all areas of the country, but mostly lives in urban areas. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Armenian Union of Romania (UAR).[44]

56. There are many cultural activities involving the Armenian culture and tradition throughout the country, such as festivals (Armenian Street Festival; Days of Armenian Film), regular exhibitions (Days of Armenian culture in Iași), fairs or creation workshops.[45] Summer courses about the Armenian culture and civilisation are also organised yearly in Suceava. UAR has its own publishing house - *Ararat* – and publishes an online newspaper (in Romanian only)[46]. Furthermore, each branch of the UAR has a small library. Persons belonging to the Armenian national minority make regular appearances on public radio and television channels programmes for minorities (in the infotainment *Transylvania polychrome* or on *Radio Constanța* and *Radio Iași)*.

57. Armenian is studied by more than 40 children and pupils at the *Misakian-Kesimian Armenian Schools* in Bucharest, Constanța, Botoșani and Pitesti during weekends (three hours per week). The courses teach the Armenian children the language, history and other aspects of the Armenian culture. The educational

---

[41] See Asociația Liga Albanezilor din România - Asociația Liga Albanezilor din România (alar.ro). ALAR organises promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. ALAR has a reserved seat in Parliament and its budget allocated in 2022 was of 3,647,830 Lei.
[42] ALAR re-edited and printed Romanian-Albanian conversation dictionaries and Albanian language textbooks.
[43] ALAR is also organising summer and winter schools, including in Albania.
[44] See Uniunea Armenilor din România – Uniunea Armenilor din România. UAR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UAR has also a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UAR in 2022 was of 8,670,140 Lei.
[45] In 2019, the Romanian Parliament adopted Law no. 181/2019 for the establishment of the Armenian language, alphabet and culture Day (12 October).
[46] See araratonline.com | Publicatia Uniunii Armenilor din Romania.

and training process are organised and governed by the objectives contained in the national curriculum. Several teaching materials have been developed recently.[47] At higher education level, there is a Department of Armenian Studies at the Babeş-Bolyai University and a Department of Armenian Language at the University of Bucharest, with the participation of a lecturer appointed by Armenia.

58. UAR has strong ties with many organisations worldwide and regularly participates in different programmes organised by the Armenian authorities (for instance the *Ari Tun Youth* programme or the *Diaspora Meeting of Armenian Journalists* in Yerevan).

Bulgarian – Part II and Part III language

59. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 5,975 persons belong to the Bulgarian "ethnic group" in Romania and 4,478 declared Bulgarian as their mother tongue. The Bulgarian national minority is compactly settled in Timiş county. In the south of Romania and especially along the Danube, the Bulgarian national minority is more dispersed. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Bulgarian Union of the Banat – Romania (UBB-R).[48]

Education

60. At pre-school level, education in Bulgarian is only offered in Timiş county and attended by 34 pupils. The teaching of Bulgarian is offered in Timiş county and attended by 339 pupils.[49] It is part of the curriculum and taught 3-4 hours per week. At secondary education level, Bulgarian is studied as a subject three hours per week.[50] Bulgarian is not offered at the technical and vocational education level. At university level, Bulgarian is studied at the Bulgarian language and literature department of the University of Bucharest. Bulgarian is also provided as a subject of study at the University of Craiova and the West University of Timişoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar.[51] Teachers teaching Bulgarian receive regular training in the context of activities carried out by the School Inspectorates of Timiş and Dâmbovița counties and Bucharest. In Timiş county, one inspector and one methodology teacher are responsible for monitoring the educational process on the study of Bulgarian. In certain areas outside Banat, UBB-R organises activities in which children participate in order to communicate in their mother tongue.

Administrative authorities and public services

61. Persons belonging to the Bulgarian minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the Bulgarian minority represent more than 20% of the population in Dudeştii Vechi. The municipality of Denta in the county of Timiş also has a significant share of Bulgarians. In these two places, information provided during the on-the-spot visit shows that Bulgarian speakers can submit oral or written applications in Bulgarian, as there are Bulgarian speakers employed. Bulgarian is used in debates in the council meetings of the local assembly of Dudeştii Vechi, which has also developed a website where official documents are published in Bulgarian.[52] Traditional and correct forms of placenames in Bulgarian are used in practice in Dudeştii Vechi, Breştea and Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvara, as well as the name of public services and public institutions.

Media

62. Bulgarian is present in nationwide television programmes such as *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. *TV Arad* transmits twice per month a 30-minutes programme in Bulgarian. However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Bulgarian is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. *Radio Timişoara* broadcasts once per week a one-hour programme in Bulgarian. There are no private radio programmes in Bulgarian. UBB-R publishes every two weeks the bilingual magazines

[47] A Romanian-Armenian conversation guide and a first textbook of western Armenian has been published for children in secondary studies and high schools. UAR is implementing an e-learning programme that facilitates the learning of Armenian in areas inhabited by an Armenian-speaking population. More recently, a new textbook entitled *Limba armeană fără professor* ('Armenian language without a teacher') has also been published. Pupils also have the possibility to participate to Summer School programmes, with the support of UAR.
[48] See Uniunea Bulgară din Banat-România / Balgarskotu Društvu ud Banáta-Rumanija | Facebook. UBB-R organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UBB-R also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UBB-R in 2022 was of 7,173,800 Lei. It should be noted that due to internal issues within UBB-R, no public funds were allocated by the Romanian authorities between 2016 and 2020.
[49] 127 pupils in primary schools, 123 pupils in gymnasium and 89 pupils in high schools, for most of them at the *Theoretical High School Saints Kiril and Metodii* from Dudeştii Vechi.
[50] Including in Bucharest, at the *Hristo Botev Bulgarian Theoretical High School*.
[51] Three lecturers are seconded by the Bulgarian Ministry of Education in these two universities.
[52] It should be noted that in small rural communities, decisions of the local council can be made public by a town crier speaking Bulgarian.

Náša Glás and *Gândul Literar*. Moreover, the local council of Dudeştii Vechi publishes, from its own resources and on a monthly basis, *Foaia de Dudeşti*, a local, bilingual Romanian-Bulgarian publication.

Cultural activities and facilities

63. Several cultural activities[53] take place, promoting the artistic folklore of the Bulgarian national minority. Many activities are carried out by UBB-R and take place at the Dudeştii Vechi Cultural Centre *Jaku Ronkov*. Furthermore, UBB-R regularly organises cultural activities to promote Bulgarian culture in areas other than those where the language is traditionally used, and abroad.

Transfrontier exchanges

64. Several twinning agreements have been concluded.[54] UBB-R has connections and contacts with the organisations of the Bulgarian national minorities of Serbia, Hungary, Ukraine and the Republic of Moldova. Moreover, persons belonging to the Bulgarian minority have contacts with various cultural, mass communication and educational institutions of Bulgaria.

Croatian – Part II and Part III language

65. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 4,842 persons belong to the Croatian "ethnic group" in Romania and 4,664 declared Croatian as their mother tongue. The Croatian national minority has been compactly settled in Caraş-Severin county. There are also some speakers in Timiş county. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Union of Croatians of Romania (UCR).[55]

Education

66. Teaching in Croatian is present at all levels of education and taught to approximately 150 pupils in Caraș-Severin county by 17 teachers.[56] Some of the existing classes have been created only recently, in derogation from the minimum threshold set in the national legislation. The teaching of Croatian is also ensured at gymnasium level, 3-4 hours per week, and 4 hours per week in upper secondary education.[57] Croatian is studied at the Department of Croatian Language and Literature of the University of Bucharest,[58] and at the Western University of Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar.[59] A bilateral co-operation agreement has been concluded with the Ministry of Education of Croatia on the initial and continuing training of teachers, with training courses organised annually in Zagreb. Since 2021, the Caraş-Severin school inspectorate has one inspector dedicating half of his/her time to monitor the progress achieved in the teaching of all minority languages (including Croatian) in the county.

Administrative authorities and public services

67. Persons belonging to the Croatian minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level.[60] At local level, persons belonging to the Croatian minority represent more than 20% of the population in several municipalities. There are civil servants speaking Croatian employed in mayors' offices who can provide answers to oral or written applications submitted in Croatian. Croatian is used in all local activities, including debates in the council meetings of the local assembly. The minutes are being recorded in Romanian, and the decisions are translated into Croatian. Official documents are also published in Croatian. Croatian is used in the provision of public services in health services, post offices, cable providers, etc. Traditional and correct forms of placenames in Croatian are used.

---

[53] For instance traditional Bulgarian costumes, songs and dance festivals in Banat; the Bulgarian Cultural Days; concerts given by the Men Chorus of Dudeştii Vechi and the chorus of Vinga.
[54] See CBC Romania Bulgaria which presents the details of the cross-border co-operation programmes developed between Romanian and Bulgarian municipalities.
[55] See Uniunea Croatilor din Romania | Zajednistvo Hrvata u Rumunjskoj - Home (zhr-ucr.ro). UCR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UCR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to the Union of Croatians of Romania in 2022 was of 5,110,460 Lei.
[56] 38 pupils at pre-school level, 22 pupils at primary education level, 57 pupils in Gymnasium and 36 high school pupils.
[57] Subjects taught in Croatian in secondary school education level are Croatian language and literature, the history of national minorities (grades 6 and 7) and religion. In upper secondary school, mathematics and biology are also taught in Croatian.
[58] Within the Department there are two lecturers for the approximately 20 students who follow these courses annually.
[59] Approximately 15 students are enrolled each year in the first year of study.
[60] However, according to the data provided by the Ministry of Interior, the Caraș-Severin county prefecture has Croatian-speaking civil servants who can take over requests and formulate answers to requests addressed in Croatian.

Media

68. Croatian is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Croatian is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. *Radio Resita* broadcasts a 30-minutes weekly programme in Croatian. In Bucharest, an additional radio programme is broadcast in Croatian with a duration of 45 minutes. UCR produces audio and audio-video works in Croatian and publishes the monthly magazine *Hrvatska Grančica*. However, information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that *HRT1* and *HRT2*, two television channels from Croatia, are not retransmitted anymore.

Cultural activities and facilities

69. Most cultural activities promoting Croatian are carried out by UCR (publication of textbooks, promotion of art, folklore, sport competitions).[61] UCR has also opened a "traditional house" acting in particular as a documentation centre. Currently, a cultural and sports centre is being launched for persons belonging to the Croatian minority.

Transfrontier exchanges

70. UCR has developed connections and contacts with the organisations of the Croatian national minorities in other countries. The Croatian national minority has regular contacts with various cultural, mass communication and educational institutions of Croatia. Furthermore, twinning agreements have been concluded between Romanian and Croatian municipalities (for instance between the municipalities of Alba Iulia and Biograd na Moru).

Czech – Part II and Part III language

71. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 1,576 persons belong to the Czech "ethnic group" in Romania and 1,130 declared Czech as their mother tongue. Although persons belonging to the Czech national minority live in compact groups in Caraș-Severin and Mehedinți counties, the larger villages of the minority are isolated from each other due to this being a mountainous area and also due to a lack of infrastructures. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Democratic Union of the Slovaks and Czechs of Romania (UDSCR).[62]

Education

72. In 2021-2022, at pre-school level, Czech was used in kindergartens only for 5 children in the Caraș-Severin county. At primary education level, teaching in Czech was provided for 15 pupils at the J. A. Komensky school of Sfânta Elena. The teaching of Czech was provided for 13 pupils in this same school. At gymnasium level, 23 pupils take part in lessons of Czech language and literature for 3 hours per week.[63] However, Czech is not taught in high school, nor in technical and vocational education. At university level, Czech can be studied at the Czech Language and Literature Department of the University of Bucharest. There are 12 teachers teaching Czech, including three from the Czech Republic. A bilateral co-operation agreement has been concluded with the Ministry of Education of the Czech Republic on the initial and continuing training of teachers, with training courses organised annually in Prague. Two inspectors are responsible for monitoring the Czech language education (in Caraș-Severin and Mehedinți counties, respectively).

Administrative authorities and public services

73. Persons belonging to the Czech minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the Czech minority represent more than 20% of the population in Gârnic, Eibenthal, and Baia Nouă. There are civil servants speaking Czech employed in mayor's offices who can provide answers to oral or written applications submitted in Czech in Nădlac, Berzasca, Coronini, Moldova Nouă or Eibenthal. Czech is however absent in the provision of public services. Czech is not used in debates during council meetings of the local assembly. Official documents are not published in Czech. Traditional

[61] See for instance the support given to the Croatian folk-dance group *Karaševska Zora* or the promotion of the Croatian Mother Tongue School Olympics.
[62] See UDSCR. UDSCR, as the umbrella organisation, organise several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UDSCR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to the Democratic Union of the Slovaks and Czechs of Romania in 2022 was of 7,079,980 Lei.
[63] Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that the small number of children studying Czech can be explained by the geographical difficulty to establish one school.

and correct forms of placenames in Czech are used in practice in all municipalities where persons belonging to the Czech minority traditionally live.

Media

74. Czech is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună.* However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Czech is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. *Radio Timişoara* and *Radio Resita* both broadcast a 30-minutes weekly programme in Czech. However, there are no private radio stations or television channels broadcasting programmes in Czech. The cultural magazine *Naše snahy* is published monthly but there are no daily or weekly newspapers in Czech. The magazine has also a supplement, "*Naše snahy plus*", a quarterly literary magazine in the Slovak and Czech languages. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that *CT1* (the Czech national television station) is not retransmitted anymore.

Cultural activities and facilities

75. Cultural activities promoting Czech have significantly increased since the previous evaluation report (publication of textbooks, promotion of artistic, scientific, folklore, cultural activities). Most of them are carried out by UDSCR (*June 1st - International Children's Day, Children's Theatre Camp, Children's Dance Camp, Creative Children's Camp, Farshang Customs, Czech Traditions and customs, Traditions and customs of Seceris, In the footsteps of our ancestors*). The library of Nădlac and the school libraries keep collections of books in Czech.

Transfrontier exchanges

76. The Czech national minority has contacts with various cultural, mass communication and educational institutions of the Czech Republic. Twinning agreements have been concluded between Romanian and Czech municipalities (for instance between the county council of Caraș Severin the county council of the region of Pilsen, between the villages of Dubovaidin and the Union of the localities of Prostejov-Venkov or between the city of Nădlac and the city of Novy Byzdov).

German – Part II and Part III language

77. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 22,907 persons belong to the German "ethnic group" in Romania and 15,943 declared German as their mother tongue.[64] The German national minority comprises several geographical groups living in different parts of the country: the Transylvanian Saxons, Landler (near Sibiu/Hermannstadt), Zipser Germans (northern Transylvania), Sathmar Swabians (Satu Mare), Banat Swabians, Banater Berglanddeutsche (Germans of the Banat mountain region in/around Reșița), Bukovina Germans, Dobruja Germans, and urban communities (Bucharest, Iași, Craiova and others). Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Democratic Forum of Germans in Romania (FDGR).[65]

Education

78. German has historically benefited from a well-developed and geographically diversified offer of German-medium education. Education in German is organised for 24,255 pupils[66] in 16 counties. As a result of the reputation that the schools of the German national minority enjoy in Romania, a considerable number of the pupils enrolled in these schools belong to the majority population. The same model of teaching is applied to all pupils. The teaching of German is also provided in the counties of Brașov and Timiş for 144 pupils in total. Overall, there are more than 200 schools with German classes and sections, employing 689 teachers. However, there is still a shortage of teachers which significantly hampers the educational system, in particular the continuity between the different level of education in some territorial units. In order to make the profession more attractive, the private foundation *Fundația Saxonia* pays top-ups on teachers' salaries.[67] Several high schools in Romania, such as the *Goethe* German school in Bucharest, the *Nikolaus Lenau* high school in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar or the *National College Samuel von Brukenthal* in Sibiu/Hermannstadt, offer teaching of the curriculum exclusively in German. Furthermore, there are several projects taking place for the promotion of languages in education and direct

[64] In a press release published on 12 January 2023 in *Allgemeine Deutsche Zeitung*, FDGR considered that the result of the last census was very unlikely.
[65] See Forumul Democrat al Germanilor din România (fdgr.ro). FDGR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. FDGR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to FDGR in 2022 was of 15,887,940 Lei.
[66] 5,436 pupils at pre-school level; 8480 pupils at primary school level, 6,609 pupils in gymnasium and 3,730 students in high schools.
[67] See Saxonia Stiftung :: Fundația Saxonia.

co-operation between schools in Romania and schools in Germany. Since 2012, vocational schools have been established in Brașov/Kronstadt/Brassó, Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar, Oradea and Sebeș. At university level, the study of the German language is carried out in eleven university centres. German language courses are offered in Romania for adults by the Goethe Institute (Bucharest), as well as by the German Cultural Centres. Furthermore, at the level of private institutions and entities (economic companies, non-governmental organisations) there are numerous modules of adult education in German.

79. Initial teacher training is carried out through the Germanic philology/studies of several universities in the country (for instance the Lucian Blaga university of Sibiu/Hermannstadt). The initial training of the teaching staff of kindergartens and primary schools providing education in German is carried out at the *Andrei Şaguna Pedagogical College* in Sibiu/Hermannstadt. Continuous training is provided by the *Centre for Lifelong Training in German* in Mediaș (CFCLG).[68] The training is also supported through projects promoted by various NGOs, such as the Annual International Conference of the *Association of Teachers of German Language of Romania*.[69] 16 inspectors (one in each county where education in German is organised) are responsible for monitoring the educational process on the study of German. They are appointed under the law and in consultation with FDGR Education Forum.

Administrative authorities and public services

80. Persons belonging to the German minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the German minority also do not meet the 20% threshold, and many German speakers do not enjoy the protection offered by Article 10 of the Charter. Some officers of local branches of the national authorities might be able to use German in their relations with persons applying to them in German.[70] Furthermore, administrative texts and forms do not exist in German or in bilingual versions. In practice, local branches of the State authorities do not draft documents in German.

81. German is used in relation with the speakers in several municipalities throughout the country. There is also the possibility to submit applications in German in several municipalities, including in places where the share of the German minority is below 20%. Local authorities do not publish official documents in German nor use the language in their debates. Although German might be used occasionally in public ceremonies at local level, it is absent in the provision of public services. Several municipalities (including those where the German minority has met the 20% threshold in the recent past but no longer meets it) have bilingual placename signs (Romanian-German) and placenames are also used in other domains, for example on street-name signs, inscriptions on public buildings, train stations, cultural sites and tourist signposts.

Media

82. German is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună. TVR1 broadcasts Akzente* 100 minutes per week. *TVR Cluj, TVR Tg. Mureș* and *TVR Timişoara* also broadcast some programmes in German. *Radio Romania* (6,5 hours per week), *Radio Târgu Mureș* (6 hours per week), *Radio Timişoara* (6 hours per week), *Radio Resita* (30 minutes per week) also provide programmes in German. Furthermore, the association of editors of German-language media from Central and South-Eastern Europe, based in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar, has launched a joint radio station and TV channel in German called *Funkforum*. There is one daily newspaper (*Allgemeine Deutsche Zeitung für Rumänien*, ADZ), which is the only German-language daily newspaper in south-east Europe. ADZ has weekly supplements for the German communities of Brașov/Kronstadt/Brassó (*Karpetenrundschau*) and Banat (*Banater Zeitung*). The *Hermannstädter Zeitung* is a weekly publication in Sibiu/Hermannstadt. The Committee of Experts considers the general offer of newspapers as constituting best practice.

Cultural activities and facilities

83. The Romanian authorities support a high number of cultural activities related to German (publication of books, periodicals, scientific series; events on literature, exhibitions, lectures on cultural topics; presentation of German music; festivals). For instance, the *Days of German Literature* in Resita is a large international project highlighting the German-language literature in Romania. The German State Theatre of Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar and the Radu Stanca Theatre in Sibiu/Hermannstadt are two theatres performing in German. Major cultural sites which are linked to the German minority have also

[68] See Centrul pentru Formarea Continua in Limba Germana (zfl.ro). Nationwide, there are 17 teacher trainers for German. The centre coordinates 40 teachers who work on the design and translation of teaching materials. In 2020/2021, 132 in-service training seminars were organised with 2352 participants.
[69] Deutschlehrerverband Rumäniens – Asociatia Profesorilor de Limba Germană din România.
[70] For instance within the Prefect administration of the Sibiu county, in some decentralised public services in the Caraș-Severin, Maramureș, Suceava and Timiș counties or within the Romanian Gendarmerie.

inscriptions with historical/cultural information in German. Many cultural projects in German are translated in Romanian or Hungarian.

Economic and social life

84. There are several private institutions offering the use of German in health care.[71] Furthermore, there are public services offering treatment and medical care in German administered directly by the local public authorities. However, it seems that no measures have been taken concerning public hospitals.

Transfrontier exchanges

85. The Romanian authorities have concluded co-operation agreements with neighbouring countries and other states where German is spoken. Cross-border co-operation is also promoted/facilitated between regional or local authorities in areas where German is used through twin cities in Germany and Austria (e.g. Sibiu/Hermannstadt – Landshut – Klagenfurt or Sighişoara/Schäßburg/Segesvár – Dinkelsbühl). Several cross-border activities are taking place (camps, meetings, seminars).

Greek – Part II language

86. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 2,086 persons belong to the Greek "ethnic group" in Romania and 1,069 declared Greek as their mother tongue. The Greek national minority is present in the Dobrogea region, but also in several cities, such as Bucharest, Iași, Ploiesti, Brașov/Kronstadt/Brassó or Turnu Severin. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Hellenic Union of Romania (UER).[72]

87. UER is organising many events to promote Greek, such as the *Alfabetul Convieţuiri* festival, *E vremea Carnavalului* or *Dialog cu timpul şi lumea*. It also participates in the Hellenism Festival which takes place every year in Greece. These activities receive a strong media coverage. There are small libraries in all the territorial branches of UER, composed of books provided by donations, procurement of new materials and publications of the Union. There are several local music and dance groups. Greek is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. Furthermore, *TVR1* broadcasts *Kalimera* for 30 min every week. *Radio Constanța* runs weekly a one-hour programme in Greek. UER also participates as a guest in local and national television broadcasts. Furthermore, the Romanian Society of Hellenic Studies publishes its research and studies at the renowned *Omonia Publishing House*. *UER Press publishing house* publishes the bilingual quarterly magazine *Elpis*. It also prints bilingual publications of notable Greek writers and poets.

88. In Bucharest, UER organises a permanent program of initiation and training in Greek for pre-schoolers. At primary and secondary school level, Greek is taught as an optional subject. Modern Greek language and literature is studied by several hundreds of pupils in grades 1 to 4 and 5 to 12, for 2 hours during weekends, in the premises of UER.[73] Dedicated teaching materials are used (grammar teaching textbooks, worksheets, interactive tables, etc.). In addition, summer courses and camps are organised. UER also offers classes in Greek for adults who wish to learn the language. Regarding higher education, the University of Bucharest offers academic training in Greek and the University of Iași has a lectureship in teaching Greek. Continuous training is offered to the teaching staff by trainers from the Democritus University of Thrace (Greece).

89. There is a strong collaboration between UER and Greece. UER also cooperates with Greek organisations worldwide. At local level, the municipality of Ploiesti is twinned with the Greek municipality of Aspropyrgos. Links between Romania and Greece are maintained through numerous co-operation activities in culture, education or economic exchanges.

Hungarian – Part II and Part III language

90. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 1,002,151 persons belong to the Hungarian "ethnic group" in Romania and 1,038,806 declared Hungarian as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the

[71] See for instance the *Dr. Carl Wolff Retirement Home* in Sibiu; the *Adam Müller -Guttenbrunn House* in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar; the *Altenheim Schweischer*; the *Altenheim Blumenau.*

[72] See Uniunea Elenă din România – Minoritatea elenilor și a filoelenilor din România (uniunea-elena.ro). UER has 20 territorial branches. UER organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UER also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UER in 2022 was of 7,755,280 Lei. It should be noted that the UER does not include the ELPIS union of Constanța.

[73] According to the information provided in the state periodical report, in 2018, a total of 812 children were enrolled in Greek courses overall. There are also a total of 23 teachers teaching in Greek for all ages and level of study, including six teachers from Greece.

Hungarian minority represent the majority in the counties of Harghita/Hargita and Covasna/Kovászna. Significant proportions of persons belonging to the Hungarian minority also live in several counties. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Hungarian Democratic Union of Romania (UDMR).[74]

Education

91. The school network with teaching in Hungarian is dynamic and well-developed throughout the areas where Hungarian is traditionally used, as well as in Bucharest. Education in Hungarian is provided to 140,425 pupils[75] in 18 counties. The study of Hungarian is also provided in 11 counties for 1,931 pupils in total.[76] Vocational education with teaching in Hungarian language is provided in 11 counties, with more than 15,000 pupils/students, covering more than 70 specialisations.[77] The shortage of teachers, including at the technical and vocational level, remains a source of concern and significantly hampers the educational system, in particular the continuity between the different levels of education in some territorial units.[78] At university level, the study of several specialties in Hungarian is carried out in different university centres. The Babeş-Bolyai University has the highest number of Hungarian students.[79] Initial training of teachers teaching in Hungarian is carried out by specialised pedagogical high schools. The continuous training of teachers is carried out through the *Centre for Ongoing Training in Hungarian*,[80] and through activities organised by the school inspectorates and the centres for further training of the teachers (*Teaching Staff Houses*), as well as through training courses organised by the *Union of Hungarian Teachers* in partnerships with prestigious universities in Romania and Hungary. There are about 85 school inspectors in county school inspectorates who monitor the progress achieved in the teaching of Hungarian. County's school inspectorates release on a regular basis public reports (quarterly and annual reports) which can be found on official websites.

Administrative authorities and public services

92. At county level, persons belonging to the Hungarian minority represent more than 20% of the population in six counties. At local level, persons belonging to the Hungarian minority represent more than 20% of the population in many municipalities of the Cluj, Bihor, Braşov, Sălaj, Sibiu counties. Yet, a significant number of Hungarian speakers also live in other counties and municipalities without meeting the 20% threshold. There are officers of local branches of the national authorities able to use Hungarian in their relations with persons applying to them in Hungarian.[81] However, the Romanian authorities have not made available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Hungarian or in bilingual versions.

93. At local level, it is possible to submit oral and written applications in Hungarian in places where the Hungarian minority represents more than 20% of the population,[82] but also in some places where this threshold is not met. However, only few councils and municipalities publish their official documents in Hungarian or bilingual forms.[83] Only two counties seem to use Hungarian in their meetings (Covasna/Kovászna and Harghita/Hargita counties). A high number of municipalities (including those where the Hungarian minority does not meet the 20% threshold or has recently met but no longer meets it) have bilingual placename signs (Romanian - Hungarian) and placenames are also used in other domains, for example on street name signs, inscriptions on public buildings, train stations, cultural sites and tourist signposts. The provision of public services in Hungarian is also linked to the 20% threshold but is not always applied in practice. Recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Hungarian is limited to the territorial-administrative units where the 20% threshold is met. Overall,

[74] See Uniunea Democrată Maghiară din România (udmr.ro). UDMR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UDMR has also a parliamentary group composed of 20 members in Parliament. The budget allocated to UDMR in 2022 was of 43,479,860 Lei.
[75] 31,275 at pre-school level; 48,233 at primary school level, 38,117 in gymnasium and 22,800 in high schools.
[76] 1,009 at primary education level; 844 at the gymnasium level and 78 in high schools.
[77] Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that there is an issue concerning the edition of specialised textbooks in Hungarian due to the small number of students.
[78] The underlying structural problems seem to be the very low salaries of teachers and the lack of incentives for students to become teachers teaching in minority languages.
[79] Out of the 21 faculties of the Babeş-Bolyai University, 17 offer at present courses in Romanian and Hungarian.
[80] The *Centre for Ongoing Training in Hungarian* is a subordinated body to the Ministry of Education established in 2018 in Oradea (Bihor county).
[81] In the Prefects' Offices of several counties, in public deconcentrated services, in the Emergency Situations General Inspectorate, in the Romanian Gendarmerie, the National Archives, the Police General Inspectorate, the Romanian Border Police or in social services.
[82] Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that in a situational testing through phone calls targeting the Mayors' Offices of the 323 municipalities where the 20% threshold was met, 87% of the offices offered Hungarian as a possible language of oral communication.
[83] Information collected during the on-the-spot visit suggests that less than 5% of local authorities provide forms in bilingual version and only 23% publish their decisions in Hungarian or upload announcements in Hungarian.

there are more than 5,000 Hungarian speaking public servants employed in the territorial offices of the local administration offices (mayors' offices).

Media

94. One public radio station broadcasts exclusively in Hungarian (*Radio Târgu Mureș)*, unlike public television channels. Nevertheless, there are many programmes in Hungarian on public radio and television (informative bulletin; infotainment; art and culture; entertainment; science and education), in addition to nationwide television programmes such as *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. Furthermore, there are several private television channels broadcasting in Hungarian (e.g. Csík TV, Erdély TV, Szatmár TV, …). There are more than 20 daily or weekly newspapers in Hungarian language, as well as magazines or web pages. The *Union of Hungarian Journalists in Romania*, depending on the funds available at the organisational level, ensure the ongoing training of journalists.[84] The Journalism Department of Babeș-Bolyai University provides graduation diplomas in this field in Hungarian. There are also several audio and video materials produced and distributed in Hungarian.[85]

Cultural activities and facilities

95. Romanian authorities support a high number of cultural activities related to Hungarian (publications; exhibitions; festivals; etc.).[86] Several institutions organise and support cultural activities related to Hungarian such as Hungarian theatres, state operas, cultural centres.[87] Furthermore, major cultural sites have also inscriptions with historical/cultural information in Hungarian. Many cultural projects in Hungarian are translated into Romanian and simultaneous translation is provided at conferences, meetings and other cultural events. Movies and TV shows are usually subtitled, by local television or studios, which may also have co-financing from local/central authorities, as needed. Hungarian translations of books and publications are supported and co-financed by the *Communitas Foundation*. There are libraries which collect and keep copies of works written and published in Hungarian.[88] Most cultural activities promoting Hungarian are carried out by UDMR. In addition to the permanent acquisition of volumes or works in Hungarian by the National Library of Romania, several other institutions keep copies of documents, photos and other commemorative objects.[89]

Economic and social life

96. There are some private and public institutions providing services in healthcare in Hungarian, primarily in areas mostly inhabited by the Hungarian minority. However, information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that in order to have access to social assistance and/or medical care from the state, all the necessary forms to be filled in are written in Romanian.

97. Information material on health and safety requirements at work is also available in Hungarian. In addition, materials aimed at promoting civil protection activities and fire prevention are published both in Romanian and Hungarian by the *Emergency Situations General Inspectorate*. Information about consumer rights is provided in Hungarian.

Transfrontier exchanges

98. Several twinning agreements have been concluded between Romanian and Hungarian counties and municipalities.[90]

Italian – Part II language

99. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 4,039 persons belong to the Italian "ethnic group" in Romania and 4,105 declared Italian as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Italian minority

[84] The Association also conducts studies on the correct use of the Hungarian language in the Hungarian-language media in Romania.
[85] For example, DRI financed the *Intercultural Story Machine* project, which aimed at producing bilingual mini-documentary films.
[86] For instance, the *Hungarian Language Day*; the *Hungarian Diaspora Day*; the *Hungarian Drama Day*; the *Hungarian Culture Day*; the *Târgu Mureș/Marosvásárhely/Neumarkt International Book Fair*; etc.
[87] For instance, the Hungarian theatres of Cluj-Napoca/Kolozsvár/Klausenburg and Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar, the *Hungarian Cultural Centres* in Sibiu/Hermannstadt and Brașov/Kronstadt/Brassó, the *Balassi Institute* in Bucharest, the Harghita/Hargita *county culture centre*, the Covasna/Kovászna *county culture centre*.
[88] See the *Teleki-Bolyai* library; the *Bód Péter* library; the *Kájoni János* library.
[89] See the Hungarian Theatre's documentary archive of Cluj-Napoca/Kolozsvár/Klausenburg; the *Brukenthal Museum*; the *Székely Museum* of Ciuc; etc.
[90] Most of the municipalities from Harghita/Hargita county have set twinning agreements with municipalities from Hungary. A collaboration has been established between Bihor and Hajdu-Bihar counties (Hungary).

live mainly in urban areas – Bucharest, Galați, Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar, Oradea, Iași etc. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Association of Italians in Romania (RO.AS.IT).[91]

100. There are many cultural activities involving the Italian culture and tradition, such as feasts (for instance the Saint Lucia Day), exhibitions, festivals (for example the international interethnic festival Confluence, organised in Iași), conferences, etc. RO.AS.IT has established libraries in its headquarters in Bucharest and Suceava and provides information on major events of the national minority life in its bilingual three-monthly publication Siamo di nuovo insieme. It also financially supports publications of books. In Greci, there is an information and exhibition centre dedicated to the Italian national minority in Romania. Italian is present in nationwide television programmes Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună. Radio Timişoara, Radio România Internaţional, Mozaic have an Italian broadcast (Italiani in Romania) of one hour per month (with re-runs).

101. Italian is taught at all levels of education, with more than 50 teachers employed. There are kindergartens in Suceava and Bucharest using Italian. In Bucharest, the *Dante Alighieri Theoretical High School* provides education for more than 1,300 pupils in Italian (with more than 700 pupils studying Italian as a mother tongue 5 hours per week).[92] RO.AS.IT, which is trying to set up Italian mother tongue classes in several cities (Bacău, Galaţi, Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar), distributes bilingual publications and books to facilitate and would like a stronger support from the authorities to set up Italian classes.[93] At higher education level, Italian university studies are *inter alia* organised at the Universities of Bucharest, Iași, Constanța, Craiova, Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar, Cluj-Napoca, at the Conservatories in Bucharest, Brașov/Kronstadt/Brassó, Iași, and at the Academy of Economic Studies in Bucharest. The Department of Italian Language and Literature of the University of Bucharest provides courses in translation and language studies and carries out research on Italian. In addition to the opportunity to study Italian in institutional schools, RO.AS.IT is organising beginner and intermediate language learning courses for those who have passed the school age and are interested in the study of Italian.

102. RO.AS.IT and the *Dante Alighieri High School* participate in many exchange programmes with Italy. Italian departments of Romanian universities as well as cultural institutions hold regular exchanges with similar institutions in Italy.

Macedonian – Part II language

103. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 1,089 persons belong to the Macedonian “ethnic group” in Romania and 201 declared Macedonian as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Macedonian minority are dispersed throughout Romania. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Association of Macedonians in Romania (AMR).[94]

104. Macedonian is promoted through the cultural activities of AMR (publication of audio books, participation of musical ensembles in shows and festivals, opening of a museum of Macedonian culture and folklore, celebrations of major holidays and customs). AMR is furthermore publishing several bilingual quarterly magazines, bilingual books and audio productions in Macedonian. Macedonian is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. *Radio Oltenia* presents monthly reports and interviews about the Macedonian national minority in Oltenia. Recently, an administrative procedure for signing a co-operation protocol between the national television channels of Romania and the Republic of North Macedonia has been initiated.

105. Macedonian is not included in the general curriculum in mainstream education. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that this situation is due to the fact that Macedonian speakers are dispersed through Romania and the fact that there are too few pupils of the same age group to organise Macedonian teaching courses in any municipality. However, AMR has published children's story books, dictionaries and offers weekly Macedonian language classes in three municipalities, including for adults. At higher education level, Macedonian can be studied at the Department for Russian and Slavic philology

[91] See Asociația Italienilor din România – RO.AS.IT. – . (roasit.ro). RO.AS.IT organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. RO.AS.IT also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to RO.AS.IT in 2022 was of 4,323,180 Lei.
[92] For 364 pupils at primary education level, 413 pupils in gymnasium and 525 pupils in high school.
[93] RO.AS.IT is for instance trying to set classes in Greci (Tulcea county), a traditional stronghold of the Italian speakers, as well as in the *Ion Neculce* school in Bucarest.
[94] See Asociatia Macedonenilor din Romania – Asociatia Macedonenilor din Romania (asociatia-macedonenilor.ro). AMR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. AMR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to AMR in 2022 was of 4.883.960,00 Lei.

of the University of Bucharest. A Macedonian lecturer has been appointed and financed by the Republic of North Macedonia.

106. The Romanian and Macedonian authorities are implementing a programme on exchanges in the field of minority protection (co-operation of book publishers and editorial boards of cultural journals, publication of translations of literary works, co-operation between libraries, participation in events). AMR is promoting Macedonian in several transnational programmes (Macedonian language, culture and traditions camps in Ohrid; participation at the *Skrb i uteha* and *Zlatno Slaveice* festivals in Skopje).

Polish – Part II language

107. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 2,137 persons belong to the Polish "ethnic group" in Romania and 1,539 declared Polish as their mother tongue. Most persons belonging to the Polish minority live in Bucovina (Suceava county), mainly in villages, in compact community. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Union of Poles in Romania (UPR).[95]

108. There are many cultural activities involving the Polish culture and tradition organised by the UPR, which place a particular emphasis on Polish-speaking children and young people in order to encourage the preservation and transmission of the Polish language. UPR publishes the monthly bilingual publication *Polonus* and the quarterly publication *Micul Polonus* (for children). Some libraries, including school libraries, have books in Polish. Several song and dance bands promote the traditions and customs of persons belonging to the Polish minority. For 15 years, UPR has been organising the *Polish Culture Days*, which include cultural activities but also conferences with scientists and scholars from the most important university centres in Poland, Romania, the Republic of Moldova and Ukraine.

109. Polish is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. *Radio Iași* broadcast 30 minutes per week the programme *Intercultural dialogue*, in which the Polish language is also used. Local stations as *Bukovina TV Plus*, I*ntermedia TV, Nest TV, Plus TV, Radio Iaşi, Radio Târgu-Mureş* present aspects of the cultural life of persons belonging to the Polish minority.

110. Polish is taught at 11 schools in Suceava county by 6 teachers for more than 600 pupils at all levels of education.[96] Sometimes, the number of pupils is below the minimum threshold set in the law which requires to set classes in application of Article 63 of the National Education Law. As explained in paragraph 20 of this report, this presents an obstacle for organisation of the classes. Furthermore, UPR is organising on-demand Polish courses, with visiting teachers from Poland offering support to all those who want to study Polish.[97] Polish classes are held every week, 3-4 hours per week.[98] Collaboration projects were signed between these schools and schools from Poland. Textbooks are provided from Poland. At the Suceava county school inspectorate, a school inspector is monitoring Polish and is actively involved in supporting schools where Polish is studied. In this context, the *Children of Bukovina* project aims at improving the level of education and the conditions of teaching activities in Polish. UPR together with the Embassy of Poland, the Centre for the Development of Polish Education Abroad in Warsaw and the Suceava county school inspectorate organise annual methodology workshops for Polish language teachers, educators and teachers in Polish language schools and kindergartens. Exchanges of experience regarding the teaching of Polish are held between schools in the Suceava county and schools in Poland. At higher education level, Polish can be studied at the Department of Slavic Languages and Literature of the University of Bucharest, at the University Al. I. Cuza and at the Babeș-Bolyai University.

111. UPR participates in international congresses, regional meetings, educational, scientific and cultural programmes in Polish. For the Polish national minority children, UPR organises during summer holidays poetry contests and summer camps in Polish in Romania and Poland. It regularly participates in the Bucovina Meetings Festival, which takes place in several countries in turn. Different song and dance bands participate regularly to international folklore festivals.

---

[95] See Uniunea Poloneziilor din Romania — Dompolski. UPR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UPR in 2022 was of 5,251,220 Lei.

[96] Children studying Polish come from 30 different schools to attend these classes. There are 108 pupils using Polish at pre-school level; 271 pupils at primary school level; 146 pupils in Gymnasium and 89 pupils in High school. 2 teachers, who work as visiting teachers in the context of an intergovernmental agreement, come from Poland. In the *Henryk Sienkiewicz Secondary School* of Solonețu Nou, the *Cacica Secondary School* and the *Krystyna Bochenek Secondary School* of Poiana Micului, all pupils do study Polish.

[97] Courses are organised in Suceava, Bucharest, Iași and Cluj-Napoca/Kolozsvár/Klausenburg at the headquarters of the Polish Institute, but also at the headquarters of UPR.

[98] At pre-school level, Polish is used one hour per day, mainly through games, songs and poems.

Romani – Part II language

112. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 569,477 persons belong to the Roma "ethnic group" in Romania and 199,050 declared Romani as their mother tongue. However, the *National Agency for the Roma*[99] itself acknowledges that this number does not reflect reality.[100] Persons belonging to the Roma minority are present in all counties of Romania. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to Pro-Europa (PRPE).[101]

113. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that Romani is sometimes used by the administration in some municipalities where there is a significant presence of speakers, with persons having a knowledge of Romani being recruited to respond to requests. In some cases, official documents are also published in Romani. In several of these municipalities, there are bilingual placename signs and Romani is beginning to be used in wedding ceremonies. The Romanian police has also recruited Romani speakers to ensure the possibility for users of Romani to submit oral or written requests. However, considering the number of Romani speakers, more efforts are expected from the authorities to promote Romani in public life. Since 2010, the Centre for Professional Training in Culture, subordinated to the Ministry of Culture, is certifying legal translators for Romani. Furthermore, in the framework of the *Strategy of the Romanian Government on inclusion of Romanian citizens belonging to the Roma minority for the period 2022-2027*, the *National Agency for Roma* annually conducts a call for projects that are meant to stimulate the participation of Roma in the economic, social, educational, cultural and political life of the country.

114. There are many cultural activities relating to the Roma culture and tradition, many of which are addressed to children and students (*LinguaFest*; *In the footsteps of national minorities* project).[102] The Ministry of Culture and National Heritage includes in its structures the *National Centre for Roma Culture Romano-Kher* (CNCR-RK), whose central aim is to preserve and promote the Roma culture and language.[103] CNCR-RK promotes traditional Roma arts, but also cultivates the development of theatre plays, arts and literature, and publishes books, periodicals and specialised works.[104] CNCR-RK collaborates regularly with the Department of Romani Language and Literature of the University of Bucharest. Along with governmental and non-governmental institutions, CNCR-RK has developed series of editorial projects to support the educational process.[105] Furthermore, the first film ever written and directed by a female Roma filmmaker, *Bilet de iertare,* has been screened recently. Pro-Europa (PRPE) publishes every two months the magazine *Asul de trefla,* a news magazine dedicated to the social, economic and cultural life of the Roma.

115. Romani is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. *National TV*, a private channel, broadcast the show *I was born in Romania*, funded by PRPE. *Radio Timişoara* and *Radio Reşiţa* produce and broadcast programmes in Romani 30 minutes per week. *Radio Iași* broadcasts a programme in Romanian with inserts in Romani for the Roma national minority (30 minutes per week). *Radio Târgu-Mureş* broadcasts programmes dedicated to the Roma national minority, 120 minutes per week, mostly in Romanian, occasionally in Romani.

116. Romani is used at all levels of education and taught in 39 counties (out of 41) in Romania, despite a systemic shortage of teachers.[106] Education with full teaching in Romani is attended by about 800 pupils. Romani is more often taught through bilingual teaching methods (Romanian-Romani and Romani-Hungarian), 4 hours per week. Overall, it is estimated that only 20,000 pupils are taught Romani. Local varieties of Romani are used in Romani-language education, along with bilingual textbooks.[107] DRI and

---

[99] See Agentia Nationala pentru Romi (gov.ro) is a specialised body of the central public administration in charge of developing the Government's policy and strategy in the field of respect, promotion and affirmation of the rights of the Roma minority.

[100] Information collected during the meeting with the authorities during the February 2023 on-the-spot visit. A large number of Roma do not identify themselves as Roma and Romani speakers in censuses, thus displaying a tendency of language shift. It is estimated that the number of Roma range from 1.2 million to 2.5 million. Furthermore, the number of persons declaring Romani as their mother tongue, compared to the number of persons identifying themselves as Roma is rather low. Less than half of the ethnic Roma declared Romani as their mother tongue (i.e. approximately 40%).

[101] See Asociația Partida Romilor Pro-Europa. PRPE organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. PRPE also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to PRPE in 2022 was of 28.329.950,00 Lei.

[102] In 2019, the Romanian Parliament adopted Law no. 20/2019 for the establishment of the Romani Language Day (June 16th).

[103] National Center for Roma Culture - Romano Kher (romarchive.eu).

[104] See for instance the Romani-Romanian-English trilingual dictionary; the Dialectal dictionary of the Romani language; the *Amare Barvalimata* anthology of literary texts or the book for children *Tiro, Miro și Tiro.*

[105] See for instance Roma in Romania and the Holocaust. History, theory, culture project, launched by the *Romanian Cultural and Social Research Centre Rodimata*; the Roma perspectives: Collection of Romani literary creation project, launched by the *Amare Rromentza Roma Centre*.

[106] It is estimated that there are only 300 teachers teaching in Romani.

[107] Romania has also published a complete set of textbooks in Romani, in partnership with UNICEF (from grades 1 to 12).

the Ministry of Education organise every year summer and autumn courses on Romani, teaching methodology dedicated to teachers, as well as the training of Roma school mediators which focuses on the inclusive schooling of Roma and on the teaching of Romani. These courses are attended by pre-school, primary and secondary education schoolteachers, as well as by school inspectors. At higher education level, Romani can be studied at the Romani Language and Literature Department of the University of Bucharest (Bachelor, Master and PhD). Since 2016, an optional Romani language course is open to both Roma and non-Roma students at the Babeș-Bolyai University.

117. PRPE is represented in the European Roma and Travelers Forum (ERTF). The Romani Language and Literature Department at the University of Bucharest holds regular exchanges with similar institutions abroad.

Russian – Part II and Part III language

118. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 19,394 persons belong to the Lipovan Russian "ethnic group" and 14,414 declared Russian as their mother tongue. The Lipovan Russian minority is concentrated mainly in Dobrogea. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Community of Lipovan Russians in Romania (CRLR).[108]

Education

119. The teaching of Russian is provided as an integral part of the curriculum for more than 1,350 pupils.[109] Russian is taught 3-4 hours per week. The shortage of teachers hampers the educational system. No vocational education with teaching in Russian is provided. Russian is studied in higher education, as an optional subject, in six universities. There are inspectors in county school inspectorates who monitor the progress achieved in the teaching of Russian. In Tulcea county there is a specialised inspector for monitoring education in Russian.

Administrative authorities and public services

120. Persons belonging to the Lipovan Russian minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the Lipovan Russian minority represent more than 20% of the population in several municipalities in Tulcea and Constanța counties. Yet, a significant number of Russian speakers also live in other counties and municipalities without meeting the 20% threshold. In Tulcea county, the local public administration authorities indicated that they reply to petitions addressed to them in Russian if requested. It is not clear in local branches of the national authorities whether officers are able to use Russian in their interactions with persons applying to them in Russian.

121. Russian speakers have the right to address oral or written requests to local authorities in places where the 20% threshold is met. Russian speaking civil servants are employed in territorial offices of the local administration in Tulcea, Constanța and Suceava Counties. There are examples where Russian is also used in municipalities that fall below the 20% threshold. However, local authorities' official documents do not seem to be published in Russian, even in places where the 20% threshold is met. Russian is sometimes used in some local council assemblies. Municipalities which meet the 20% threshold have bilingual placename signs (Romanian-Russian). The name of public institutions is also displayed bilingually. Russian is not used in the provision of public services, including in municipalities where the 20% threshold is met.

Media

122. Russian is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Russian is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. Programmes in Russian are also broadcast weekly in *Radio Constanța, Radio International* and *Radio Iași.* There are no private radio or television programmes where Russian is used. Several audio and video material are produced and distributed in Russian.[110] There is no weekly or daily newspaper in Russian. However, CRLR financially supports the monthly bilingual periodical *Zorile* and culture and history magazine *Kitej-Grad*.

---

[108] See Lipovan Russians Community in Romania (crlr.ro). CRLR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. CRLR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to CRLR in 2022 was of 11,118,510 Lei.
[109] 160 pupils at pre-school level; 533 pupils at primary education level, 457 pupils in gymnasium and 226 pupils in high schools.
[110] For instance, CRLR printed audio CDs with traditional folk music in Russian performed by the folk ensembles *Verba and Ivușka*, *Slaveanka*, *Tihii Dunai* and *Lodka*.

Cultural activities and facilities

123. Cultural activities related to Russian are mainly supported by CRLR, which promotes traditions and customs events. CRLR Publishing House publishes works considered as reference documentation for the study of the history, culture, language, and religion of the persons belonging to the Lipovan Russian minority. At *Panait Cerna*, a local library in Tulcea, writings in Russian, including from persons belonging to the Lipovan Russian minority, are collected. The promotion of Russian is also done through camps organised in local national minority centres or events to mark the *World Education Day*, the *Mother Tongue Day*, or the *International Russian Language Day*. Regularly, *Russian Film Days* are organised, with subtitles in Romanian.

Ruthenian – Part II language

124. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 834 persons belong to the Ruthenian "ethnic group" and 594 declared Ruthenian as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Ruthenian minority represent a slightly higher number in Bistra (Maramureş county), Dărmăneşti (Suceava county), Peregu Mare (Arad county). Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Cultural Union of Ruthenians of Romania (UCRR).[111]

125. The Cultural Union of Ruthenians of Romania promotes Ruthenian at local level and organises some events, such as the "*Days of Ruthenian Culture*" (Pojoga [Hunedoara county]; Peregu Mare [Arad county]). UCRR runs its own library and has edited books presenting the history of persons belonging to the Ruthenian minority. UCRR has a folk ensemble which participates in different events, along with other ethnic communities.[112] UCRR publishes the bilingual monthly publication *Jurnal Rutean*.

126. Ruthenian is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. On *servushdtv,* the minority organises the weekly show *Culture and History.* It also participates monthly to *the Thorny Chair* on *Kapital TV*. In the written press, the Ruthenian national minority promotes its activities at *Servus Hunedoara*. As for online publications, articles are published at *Mesagerul hunedorean* and *Gazeta de Maramureș*.

127. Ruthenian is not included in the general curriculum in mainstream education. However, UCRR has set up weekend study groups in Ruthenian in the municipalities of Peregu Mare (Arad county) and Dărmăneşti (Suceava county). UCRR has contributed to the elaboration of a Ruthenian *abecedar* along with the World Ruthenian Council and a *Romanian-Ruthenian-Ukrainian Conversation Guide*. At the same time, materials published by organisations from the *World Congress of Ruthenians* are also used. At higher education level, there is no study or research on Ruthenian. However, UCRR consults, in its activity, studies and research from relevant institutions in other countries. Linguists specialising in Ruthenian also participate in international congresses dedicated to Ruthenian.

128. UCRR is member of the *World Ruthenian Council* and has a permanent collaboration with this forum. An international conference on the Ruthenian language in society, covering history and language, will be organised in 2023 at the *Aleksander Dukhnovici centre* of Peregu Mare. UCRR also participates to the Ruthenian congresses of linguistics, which are held regularly. UCRR regularly participates to cultural events organised abroad.

Serbian – Part II and Part III language

129. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 12,026 persons belong to the Serbian "ethnic group" and 10,058 declared Serbian as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Serbian minority are concentrated mainly in Arad, Timiş, Caraș-Severin, and Mehedinți counties. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Union of Serbs of Romania (USR).[113]

[111] Home - U.C.R.R. (rutenii.ro). The Cultural Union of Ruthenians of Romania has offices in the counties of Hunedoara, Alba, Suceava, Maramureş, and Arad. UCRR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UCRR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UCRR in 2022 was of 3,084,880 Lei.
[112] For instance, at the *Days of the Peregu Mare (*Arad county).
[113] See Savez Srba (RO) – Uniunea Sarbilor din Romania. USR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. USR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to USR in 2022 was of 7,937,460 Lei.

Education

130. Education in Serbian is provided at pre-school, primary and secondary education level for 341 children in total in three counties.[114] However, it is not clear to the Committee of Experts whether there are places where the education is not provided in Serbian.[115] The teaching of Serbian is provided for 751 pupils in total in three counties.[116] At pre-school level, activities are carried out in 13 institutions, while there are six different schools for the study in/of Serbian at primary education level. At secondary education level, teaching in/of Serbian takes place mainly at the *Dositei Obradovici* high school in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar. Furthermore, 50 children learn the language in Serbian language learning centres. No vocational education with teaching in Serbian is provided. Serbian is studied in two universities. The basic training for teachers is carried out at university level. Continuous training is carried out through the centres for further training of the teachers (*Teaching Staff Houses*), universities and other providers accredited by the Ministry of Education. The Ministry of Education has concluded a bilateral co-operation agreement with the Ministry of Education in Serbia, which contains provisions on the initial and continuing training of teachers in Serbian, but also on the sending of teachers of Serbian to Romania. The Timiş county school inspectorate has an inspector dedicated to monitoring Serbian. The Arad, Caraș-Severin and Mehedinți county school inspectorates have inspectors responsible for all minority languages, including Serbian.

Administrative authorities and public services

131. Persons belonging to the Serbian minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the Serbian minority represent more than 20% of the population in several municipalities in the Banat area. Yet, a significant number of Serbian speakers also live in other counties and municipalities without meeting the 20% threshold. The authorities have indicated that prefect's institutions in Caraş-Severin and Timiș counties have Serbian speaking employees who can receive and answer requests addressed by citizens in Serbian. At the level of territorial structures (gendarmerie, police, clerks, firefighters, social assistants), there are officers having a knowledge of Serbian in regions traditionally inhabited by persons belonging to the Serbian minority.

132. Serbian speakers have the right to address oral or written requests to local authorities in places where the 20% threshold is met. Although some individuals working in these local authorities might be able to provide answers in Serbian, there is no general policy regarding the use of Serbian. There are examples where Serbian can also be used in municipalities that fall below the 20% threshold. According to USR, however, Serbian speakers rarely speak to the authorities in their mother tongue. Local authorities' official documents are not published in Serbian, even in places where the 20% threshold is met. Serbian is sometimes used by the local authorities in debates in their assemblies. Municipalities which meet the 20% threshold have bilingual placename signs (Romanian-Serbian). Some of these municipalities also use Serbian in inscriptions on public buildings (town hall, kindergarten, medical office, police). Some bilingual placenames are also used in municipalities where the share is beneath 20%. Serbian is not used in the provision of public services, including in municipalities where the 20% threshold is met.

Media

133. In addition to nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*, Serbian is also present in *TVR Timişoara*, which weekly broadcasts a 20-minutes programme. However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Serbian is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. *Radio Timişoara* broadcasts a 60-minutes daily programme in Serbian (with re-runs). *Radio Banat Link* in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar broadcasts a private radio programme in Serbian. The newspaper *Naşa Reci* is published weekly by USR. Furthermore, USR also publishes twice per year *Knjiyevni Jivot* and *Novi Temisvarski vesnik,* two literary magazines. Three television channels from Serbia (TVR Serbia, RTSAT and Pink+) have been included in the RCS-RDS TV cable network in Romania and can be received in places where Serbians traditionally live. Furthermore, radio programmes from Serbia can be received in that area.

[114] 166 pupils at pre-school level, 81 pupils at primary school level, 37 pupils in gymnasium and 57 pupils in high school.
[115] For instance, teaching in Serbian is only available in Arad county at primary education level and at pre-school and primary education levels in Caraș-Severin county.
[116] 373 pupils at primary school level, 315 pupils in gymnasium and 63 pupils in high school.

Cultural activities and facilities

134. There are many cultural activities to promote Serbian. Such activities include musical, choral, choreographic, instrumental activities, but also symposia, exhibitions and book launches, film screenings and theatre performances. Besides these programmes, USR publishes dozens of books in Serbian every year. Recently, the Serbian State Theatre was inaugurated in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar. Every year in November, USR organises the *Days of Serbian Culture* in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar, a large event that includes a series of activities designed to present and highlight the cultural, spiritual and folkloric heritage of the Serbian ethnic group in its most authentic forms.

Transfrontier exchanges

135. Several twinning agreements have been concluded between Romanian and Serbian municipalities, leading to many co-operation activities.[117]

Slovak – Part II and Part III language

136. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 10,232 persons belong to the Slovak "ethnic group" and 9,241 declared Slovak as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Slovak minority are concentrated mainly in Arad, Bihor, Timiş and Sălaj counties.[118] Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Democratic Union of Slovaks and Czechs of Romania (UDSCR).[119]

Education

137. Slovak is an integral part of the national education system and is supported and promoted by a stable school network consisting of kindergartens, primary schools, gymnasium schools and 2 high schools.[120] In total, more than 612 children and pupils attend classes in Slovak at all levels of education in four counties.[121] It should however be noted that there is no teaching in Slovak at primary and secondary education level in Timiş county. There are 103 teachers of Slovak language. Slovak is taught the same number of hours as Romanian (5 to 7 hours per week at primary and secondary education level). All other subjects are also taught in Slovak. According to the speakers, textbooks translated into Slovak are outdated.[122] Furthermore, other education units with teaching in Romanian offer the possibility to study Slovak in three counties. No vocational education with teaching in Slovak is provided. Slovak language and literature can be studied in two universities. All teachers teaching various subjects in the Slovak section have the opportunity to attend continuous training at the Matej Bel University in Banská Bystrica (Slovakia). The School Inspectorates in Arad, Bihor and Sălaj have inspectors for Slovak.[123]

Administrative authorities and public services

138. Persons belonging to the Slovak minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the Slovak minority represent more than 20% of the population in several municipalities. Yet, a significant number of Slovak speakers also live in other counties and municipalities without meeting the 20% threshold. The authorities have indicated that the prefects' offices of Arad, Bihor and Sălaj counties have Slovak speaking employees, including in their public relations department.[124] At the level of territorial structures (gendarmerie, police, clerks, firemen, social workers), there are some officers having knowledge of Slovak. However, this situation does not result from specific language and human resources policies.

---

[117] See for instance the twinning agreements between the municipalities of Calarasi and Zaiecear; Orşova and Kladovo; Deta and Coka; Băile Herculane and Veliko Gradiste; Drobeta Turnu Severin and Negotin; Băile Herculane and Zagubica or between the county of Mehedinti and the Autonomous Province of Voivodina; the prefect's institution of Caraş Severin and the District of Central Banat; the prefect's institutions of Mehedinti and Bor; the county of Alba and the Autonomous Province of Voivodina.

[118] There is also a small Slovak minority present in Satu Mare county revitalizing the Slovak culture and tradition.

[119] See footnote 62.

[120] The *Jozef Gregor Tajovský School Group* in Nădlac (Arad county) and the *Jozef Kozáček General Education High School* in Budoi (Bihor county).

[121] 231 pupils at pre-school level; 179 pupils at primary school level; 91 pupils in Gymnasium, 111 pupils at high school level.

[122] Textbooks exist for the teaching of history (in grades 6, 9 and 10), geography (grade 9), biology, mathematics, informatics, counselling and personal development (grade 6) but they are outdated according to the speakers. As a consequence, UDSCR provides every year textbooks and workbooks from Slovakia, as well as various manuals, dictionaries, maps, posters and bulletin boards in Slovak.

[123] In addition, the Arad county school administration has one methodology teacher for Slovak language and literature who carries out inspections necessary for obtaining the qualification degrees.

[124] In Timiş county, there is an employee from the Serbian minority also representing the interests of the Slovak minority.

139. Where the 20% threshold is met, Slovak speakers have the right to address oral or written requests to local authorities in Slovak.[125] It is not clear for the Committee of Experts whether, in local authorities where the 20% threshold is not met, officers are able to use Slovak in their interactions with persons applying to them in Slovak. Local authorities' official documents are made available to citizens belonging to the Slovak minority in bilingual format (Romanian/Slovak).[126] It is also unclear for the Committee of Experts whether Slovak is used by local authorities in debates in their assembly. Municipalities have bilingual placename signs (nameplates of municipalities entrance-exit; Town Hall and Town Council; schools, libraries and kindergartens, etc.). However, Slovak is not used in the provision of public services.

Media

140. Slovak is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. *TVR Timişoara* broadcasts a monthly one-hour programme in Slovak. However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Slovak is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. *Radio Reşiţa* (30 minutes weekly) and *Radio Timişoara* (one hour each Sunday) have radio programmes in Slovak. UDSCR is providing an online free radio, *Radio N 1803*, which broadcasts every day. There is no newspaper published in Slovak. UDSCR publishes the monthly literary and culture magazine *Naše snahy* and its quarterly supplement *Naše snahy plus.* In addition, a scientific magazine for persons belonging to the Slovak minorities in Romania, Hungary and Serbia – *Dolnozemský Slovák* – is published monthly. However, information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that television stations from the Slovak Republic are not retransmitted anymore.

Cultural activities and facilities

141. UDSCR supports cultural activities promoting Slovak and organises many events, such as the *Slovak Language Day*, the *Cez Nadlak je* festival or the *Mládežnícky Folklórny Čerpotok* festival. Several books in Slovak are published every year and local libraries have books in Slovak. In Nădlac, there is a theatre with performances in Slovak. Nădlac also hosts a Slovak ethnographic museum. The Library of Nădlac and the school libraries have books in Slovak.

Transfrontier exchanges

142. Cross-border co-operation is promoted/facilitated between regional or local authorities in areas where Slovak is used through twin cities in the Slovak Republic.[127] The cross-border co-operation between the Slovaks of the Lower Lands – from Serbia, Romania, and Hungary should also be highlighted.[128]

Tatar – Part II language

143. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 18,156 persons belong to the Tatar "ethnic group" and 13,805 declared Tatar as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Tatar minority live in the counties of Constanța and Tulcea, as well as in Bucharest. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Democratic Union of Turkish Muslim Tatars of Romania (UDTTMR).[129]

144. In public life, Tatar is used in cultural and artistic events organised by UDTTMR, such as the *Mehmet Niyazi* and *Yaşar Memedemin* awards or the *TOI* project. Several books have been published about Tatar history and tradition. The Virtual Museum of Turks and Tatars *Miras* harness on the historical and cultural heritage of Turks and Tatars in Dobruja.[130] The Tatar Cultural Institute of Romania *Sebat Husein* was also created to promote the culture of the Tatars in Romania. The Popular Art Museum of Constanta displays a collection of ethnography related to the Tatar minority. The magazine *Karadeniz* is published monthly (in Tatar, Turkish and Romanian), as well as the youth magazine *Caş*.

[125] Slovak is for instance used by the administrative authorities of Nădlac (Arad county).
[126] For instance, the draft agenda of the council of the municipality of Nădlac (Arad county) is made public in Slovak.
[127] See for instance the twinning agreements between the municipalities of Nădlac and Krompachy; Sebiş and Kapusany; Nădlac and Brezno; Nădlac and Jelsava; Jimbolia and Dunajska Streda.
[128] Persons belonging to the Slovak minorities in the Lower Lands have the common magazine *Dolnozemský Slovák* and regularly organise conferences, workshops or festivals together.
[129] See UDTTMR – Uniunea Democrata a Turco-Tatarilor Musulmani din Romania | Bine ati venit! (uniuneatatara.ro).UDTTMR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UDTTMR in 2022 was of 8,019,620 Lei. It should be noted that during the 2016-2020 legislature, the Democratic Union of Turkish Muslim Tatars in Romania (UDTTMR) did not participate to the elections and was not entitled to participate to the Council of National Minorities.
[130] MIRAS - The virtual museum of Turks and Tatars of Romania (gov.ro).

145. Some municipalities display bilingual signs, and it seems that there is the possibility to submit applications in Tatar in Independența. In certain public administration services, there are employees able to provide assistance in Tatar.

146. The Tatar minority in Romania continues to benefit from the promotion of their mother tongue in radio and television programmes. A 60-minutes bilingual television programme is broadcast by the private local TV channel *Litoral TV*. The private radio station Constanța *Radio T* broadcasts news in Tatar. There is also a one-hour programme on *Radio Constanța* for the Tatars of Constanța and a radio programme broadcasting in Tatar and Romanian on *Radio Litoral.* UDTTMR also signed a media partnership with the *Ziua de Constanța* newspaper to promote the Tatar minority.

147. Tatar is taught during weekends at the *UDTTMR Community School* to more than 450 pupils, by four teachers. In addition, UDTTMR organises school camps, where children also practice traditional cultural and sport activities. Although Tatar has been introduced in five public schools,[131] the teaching of Tatar is not yet included in the general curriculum in mainstream education. There is no school inspector responsible for monitoring the language, and teachers do not receive an official qualification to teach it.[132] Classes for adults are provided by UDTTMR. At higher education level, the Institute for Turkish Sciences and Eastern Sciences of the Babes-Bolyai University offers a course on Tatar history and culture. However, there is no university department for Tatar in Romania and consequently no regular teacher training. Representatives of the speakers have suggested to set up a Tatar language department at the Constanța University.

148. UDTTMR has strong ties with the Tatar communities in countries such as Turkey, Ukraine or Bulgaria. The Romanian Government encourages and supports these connections. Due to the illegal annexation of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea by the Russian Federation, the co-operation with representatives of the Technical University of Simferopol (Crimea) has been interrupted.

Turkish – *Part II and Part III language*

149. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 20,945 persons belong to the Turkish "ethnic group" and 17,101 declared Turkish as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Turkish minority are concentrated in Dobrogea (Constanța and Tulcea counties). Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Turkish Democratic Union of Romania (UDTR).[133]

Education

150. There are two bilingual kindergartens in Constanța and Medgidia, organising a substantial part of pre-school education in Turkish. Given the number of Turkish speakers, the existence of only two kindergartens does not seem sufficient. The teaching of Turkish is provided by 62 teachers for 4,237 pupils in total at primary and secondary level.[134] The main establishment is the *Kemal Atatürk National College* of Medgidia. Turkish is taught 3-4 hours per week in grades 1 to 12. There is also a private educational institution in Constanța where Turkish is studied as a foreign language (1-2 hours/week).[135] Turkish is studied in four universities. With the opening of the *Turkish Education and Culture Center* in 2019, UDTR has organised Turkish language courses for both children and adults. The courses are offered with different levels of difficulty (beginners to advanced) in both physical and online formats.[136]

151. UDTR organises teacher training in Romania and Türkiye.[137] Teachers participate in courses organised by the *Centre for Continuous Development* and the Turkish Cultural Institute *Yunus Emre* in Bucharest and Constanța. Within the Constanța county school inspectorate, there is a specialised Turkish language school inspector, who monitors and coordinates the activity of Turkish language teachers and pupils.

Administrative authorities and public services

[131] In the framework of partnerships between UDTTMR, local authorities and the county school inspectorates.
[132] Teachers receive a small financial compensation but not a salary.
[133] See Uniunea Democrata Turca din Romania (rdtb.ro). UDTR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UDTR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UDTR in 2022 was of 7,831,740 Lei.
[134] For 2,392 pupils at primary school level, 1,432 pupils in gymnasium and 413 pupils in high school in Constanța and Tulcea counties.
[135] By 462 pupils at the lower secondary school level and 305 pupils at high school level.
[136] According to the speakers, the courses have been very successful and have attracted over 100 people annually.
[137] In 2022, teachers participated in an exchange of experiences organised by UDTR in Bursa, Izmit and Samsun (Türkiye).

152. Persons belonging to the Turkish minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the Turkish minority represent more than 20% of the population in several municipalities. Yet, a significant number of Turkish speakers also live in other counties and municipalities without meeting the 20% threshold. As a consequence, the use of Turkish with respect to administrative authorities is limited. The authorities have indicated that the prefect institution of Constanța county has employees who speak Turkish and who can take over requests and formulate answers in Turkish. In some local branches of the national authorities,[138] there are officers having a knowledge of Turkish in regions traditionally inhabited by persons belonging to the Turkish minority. It is, however, not clear whether this is the result of a specific human resources policy. Turkish is not used in the provision of public services.

153. Turkish speakers have the right to address oral or written requests in Turkish to local authorities in places where the 20% threshold is met. However, the application of this right is not systematic. There are examples where Turkish can also be used in municipalities that fall below the 20% threshold. Local authorities' official documents are not published in Turkish, even in places where the 20% threshold is met. Turkish is not used in local councils during debates in their assemblies. In all municipalities where the Turkish minority exceeds 20%, Turkish is used for signs and placenames. There are Turkish names of municipalities that are still preserved today and are used as official names in Romanian.

Media

154. In addition to nationwide television programmes *Europolis* on *TVR1, Identities* on *TVR2* or *Ethnic Info* on *TVR Info*, Turkish is promoted through the programme *Learning Turkish and Turkish History, Culture and Spirit*, broadcast in Galați every two weeks and which can also be watched on social media. However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Turkish is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. *Kanal D* broadcasts programmes and films in Turkish. *Radio Constanța* broadcasts a one-hour programme in Turkish every week and *Radio Romania* also broadcasts news about UDTR activities to promote identity values. *Radio T* (private, regional radio), a radio station dedicated to the Turkish and Tatar communities in Romania, broadcasts daily (from 5am to 2pm) and on the internet 24 hours a day. Turkish channels are no longer picked up by cable companies recently. The *Balkan Newspaper* and *Hayat* are weekly publications in Turkish but are financed by private initiatives. There are also other online publications in Turkish such as *Ay Media*. The bilingual magazine *Hakses* is published monthly by UDTR.

Cultural activities and facilities

155. UDTR and its Centre for Education and Culture organises cultural events on regular basis, such as festivals (e.g. *Primăvara Comunitară*–- *Nevruz; Diversitate culturală*) or seminars (*Mărturii ale culturii turce*), including in places where Turkish speakers do not traditionally live. There are also cultural institutions that organise and support cultural activities for the knowledge and use of Turkish, such as the Turkish Cultural Centres *Yunus Emre* in Constanța and Bucharest. Turkish speakers are often involved in cultural activities organised by local authorities of areas where Turkish is traditionally spoken (Constanța Day, Dobrogea Day, etc.). It should also be noted that Romanian television stations broadcast series in Turkish language with Romanian language subtitles. There are two libraries in Constanța which have books in Turkish. Most of the publications printed by UDTR are bilingual, Turkish - Romanian, in order to reach as many readers as possible. Various cultural exchanges between Romania and Türkiye have taken place. UDTR folkloric ensembles attend on a yearly basis *the International Folklore Festival* of Yalova (Türkiye). In partnership with the *Popular Culture Research Society* in Ankara a symposium on the Turkish civilisation and culture is organised every year. The *Romanian Cultural Institute Dimitrie Cantemir* in Istanbul[139] carries out a series of cultural projects in Turkish and the capitalisation of the spiritual heritage of the persons belonging to the Turkish minority in Romania.

Transfrontier exchanges

156. Cross-border co-operation is promoted between regional or local authorities in areas where Turkish is used through twinning agreements. Co-operation agreements and twinning arrangements have also been signed between several schools in Romania and schools in Türkiye.

[138] In the gendarmerie, general inspectorate for emergency situations, social services.
[139] See Institutul Cultural Român Istanbul (icr.ro).

Ukrainian – *Part II and Part III language*

157. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 45,835 persons belong to the Ukrainian "ethnic group" and 40,861 declared Ukrainian as their mother tongue. Persons belonging to the Ukrainian minority are compactly settled in rural areas in Maramureş, Suceava, Caraș-Severin, Timiş, Tulcea, Arad, Botoșani, and Satu Mare counties. Financial support is provided by the Romanian authorities to the Union of Ukrainians of Romania (UUR).[140]

Education

158. Ukrainian language teaching has a stable network of kindergartens, primary schools, gymnasiums, and a high school with teaching in/of Ukrainian. Teaching in Ukrainian is offered for 991 pupils,[141] while the teaching of Ukrainian as a subject is offered 3-4 hours per week to 5, 644 pupils.[142] It is unclear for the Committee of Experts whether there is sufficient offer of updated textbooks. There exists a technical and vocational education offer in Ukrainian in three counties. The study of Ukrainian is also offered to adults by the UUR. Ukrainian is studied in three universities. Within the Maramureș, Suceava and Timiș county school inspectorates there are specialised Ukrainian language school inspectors, who monitor and coordinate the activity of Ukrainian language teachers and pupils.

Administrative authorities and public services

159. Persons belonging to the Ukrainian minority do not reach the 20% threshold at county level. At local level, persons belonging to the Ukrainian minority represent more than 20% of the population in several municipalities. The authorities have indicated that the prefect institution of Arad, Maramureș and Suceava have Ukrainian speaking employees. In some local branches of the national authorities,[143] there are officers having knowledge of Ukrainian in four counties. However, the Committee of Experts has not received sufficient information to whether this is the result of a specific human resources policy.

160. Ukrainian speakers have the right to address oral or written requests to local authorities in places where the 20% threshold is met. Several individuals proficient in Ukrainian are employed in these local authorities and are able to provide answers in Ukrainian. There are examples of Ukrainian being used in municipalities that fall below the 20% threshold. Local authorities' official documents are not published in Ukrainian. In some municipalities, Ukrainian is used in debates in the municipal assembly. Municipalities which meet the 20% threshold have bilingual placename signs (Romanian-Ukrainian). Furthermore, in 12 municipalities, the names of public institutions are also displayed bilingually, in Romanian and Ukrainian. The authorities have indicated that Ukrainian is used in the provision of local public services, namely in the field of communication and transport, social assistance and health, education and culture. Ukrainian is also occasionally used, on request, in public ceremonies organised by the local authorities (including in wedding ceremonies).

Media

161. Ukrainian is present in nationwide television programmes *Convieţuiri, Europolis, Toți împreună*. *TVR Cluj* produces and broadcasts a program for persons belonging to the Ukrainian minority called "*Ucraineni*", 30 minutes per week. *TVR Timişoara* and *TVR* broadcast *Cununa ucrainenilor din Banat*, 24 min. monthly. However, the duration and regularity of public television programmes in Ukrainian is not sufficient taking into account the size of the national minority. In the context of the aggression of the Russian Federation against Ukraine, *Espreso* and *Rada TV* program services are also retransmitted. Public radio programmes in Ukrainian are broadcast by *Radio Cluj* (15 minutes per week), *Radio Sighet* (100 minutes per week), *Radio Timişoara* (60 minutes per week), *Radio Reşiţa* (30 minutes per week) and *Radio Iași* (30 minutes per week). Recently, a new radio station broadcasting in Ukrainian has been created in Mureș/Maros. However, there are no private radio and television programmes in Ukrainian. There is no daily newspaper published in Ukrainian. However, UUR publishes three periodicals per month in Ukrainian (*Ucrainskei Visnek*; *Vilne Slovo*; *Nas Hollos*) and one in Romanian (*Curierul ucrainean*). The Union publishes also a magazine for children in Ukrainian (*Dzvonik*).

[140] See Home - UUR. UUR organises several promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. UUR also has a reserved seat in Parliament. The budget allocated to UUR in 2022 was of 14,199,070 Lei.
[141] 441 pupils at pre-school level; 155 pupils at primary school level; 81 pupils in gymnasium and 314 pupils in high school.
[142] 2,695 pupils at primary school level; 2,570 pupils in gymnasium and 379 pupils in high school.
[143] In the gendarmerie, police, clerks, firefighters, social services.

Cultural activities and facilities

162. Each year UUR organises a series of festivals, scientific symposia, roundtable meetings, exhibitions of paintings and graphics, book presentations. A dozen of books are annually published in Ukrainian or translated from Ukrainian. Folk music ensembles and craftsmen belonging to the Ukrainian minority attend the most important fairs and festivals in the country and in Bucharest. The Ukrainian Film Days are another way of promoting Ukrainian.

Transfrontier exchanges

163. Following the Russian Federation's aggression against Ukraine, approximately 107,000 Ukrainian refugees were present in Romania in January 2023. There is a large support given by UUR, and local, county and national authorities to arriving refugees, but also to the more than 47,800 children already present in the Romanian territory to facilitate the distance learning project currently in place. UUR has been member of the *World Congress of Ukrainians*, of the *European Congress of the Ukrainians* and the *World Ukrainian Coordination Council* in Kiev. Cross-border co-operation is promoted/facilitated between regional or local authorities in areas where Ukrainian is used through twin cities in Ukraine.

Yiddish – Part II language

164. According to the provisional results of the 2021 Census, 2,378 persons belong to the Jewish "ethnic group". The Federation of Jewish Communities of Romania (FCER)[144] indicated that Yiddish is spoken by a very limited number of persons in Romania, essentially elderly persons living across Transylvania, Moldova and in Bucharest.

165. FCER provides support to research centres, libraries, museums or cultural activities and projects relating to Yiddish. The Jewish State Theatre in Bucharest, which offers a variety of performances in Yiddish, also organises the *International Yiddish Theatre Festival TESFEST*. The publishing house *Hasefer* publishes translations of classical Yiddish literature and documentation on Yiddish history in Romanian. The main magazine/newspaper of the Jewish minority, *Jewish Reality*, contains sometimes articles in Yiddish, although the publication is mainly in Romanian.

166. Although Yiddish is not present in the broadcast media, the shows "*Evreii azi*" on *Radio Iași* and the programme "*Transilvania Policromă*" wich is broadcast by *TVR Cluj*, include information about persons belonging to the Jewish minority.

167. Yiddish is not included in the general curriculum in mainstream education. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that this situation is due to a reported lack of interest from the minority itself to learn the language, despite language promotion campaigns. In addition, there would be too few pupils of the same age group to organise Yiddish teaching courses in any municipality. At university level, Yiddish is not studied, but there is a program for Hebrew language and Jewish studies at the Faculty of Letters of Babeş-Bolyai University, as well as a program of Jewish studies at the University of Bucharest, where some research is carried out about the Yiddish culture.

168. FCER maintains links with Jewish communities and organisations in Europe, Israel and the U.S., by participating in various events. Furthermore, the Romanian authorities have repeatedly supported the participation of the Jewish State Theatre to various international festivals of Yiddish theatre.

[144] See Acasa (jewishfed.ro). FCER, which has a reserved seat in Parliament, receives financial assistance from the Romanian authorities to cover the costs of promotional activities and projects on ethnicity and culture. The budget allocated to FCER in 2022 was of 6,660,120 Lei.

Chapter 2 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Albanian

2.1.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Albanian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Albanian[145]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Albanian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Albanian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Albanian		↗			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Albanian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Albanian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Albanian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Albanian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Albanian at universities or equivalent institutions				↙	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Albanian	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Albanian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Albanian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Albanian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Albanian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Albanian	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is partly fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. However, there is no strategy to provide for the teaching and study of Albanian in mainstream education. **Article 7.1.h** is not fulfilled since no study and research on

[145] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Albanian at universities takes place any longer. **Article 7.1.i** is fulfilled given the strong connections developed by ALAR with several partners from the Republic of Albania, especially in the cultural field, as well as with Albanian-speaking communities in Italy and Croatia. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Albanian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Albanian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[146] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Include Albanian in the general curriculum of mainstream education.

II. Further recommendations

b. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Albanian in mainstream education, and carry out a promotional campaign to encourage a sufficient number of pupils to enrol in classes teaching Albanian.

c. Take actions to re-establish the study of Albanian at university level.

d. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

[146] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.2 Armenian

2.2.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Armenian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Armenian[147]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Armenian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Armenian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Armenian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Armenian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Armenian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Armenian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Armenian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Armenian at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Armenian	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Armenian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Armenian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Armenian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Armenian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Armenian	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled since UAR is offering different possibilities to learn Armenian in the framework of educational and training processes organised and governed by the objectives contained in the national curriculum (3 hours classes per week for pupils of all age groups; e-learning programmes; textbook for self-study, a Romanian-Armenian conversation guide). **Article 7.1.h** is fulfilled since there is a Department of Armenian Studies at the Babeş-Bolyai University and a Department of Armenian Language at the University of Bucharest. **Article 7.1.i** is fulfilled given the strong connections developed by

[147] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

UAR with several partners abroad. Such links are facilitated by the Romanian authorities in the culture, educational and science fields. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Armenian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Armenian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[148] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

The Committee of Experts has no recommendations for immediate action at present.

II. Further recommendations

a. Extend the teaching offer in/of Armenian, including at pre-school level, taking into account the needs and wishes of the speakers.

b. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

[148] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.3 Bulgarian

2.3.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Bulgarian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Bulgarian[149]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Bulgarian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Bulgarian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Bulgarian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Bulgarian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Bulgarian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	↗				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Bulgarian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Bulgarian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Bulgarian at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Bulgarian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Bulgarian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Bulgarian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Bulgarian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Bulgarian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Bulgarian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aii	make available a substantial part of pre-school education in Bulgarian		↙			
8.1.bii	make available a substantial part of primary education in Bulgarian			↙		
8.1.ciii	provide, within secondary education, for the teaching of Bulgarian as an integral part of the curriculum	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Bulgarian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Bulgarian or teaching of Bulgarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				↙	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Bulgarian as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Bulgarian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Bulgarian	↗				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Bulgarian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Bulgarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Bulgarian at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Bulgarian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		

[149] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Bulgarian**[149]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Bulgarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Bulgarian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Bulgarian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Bulgarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Bulgarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Bulgarian and the related use of documents and evidence in Bulgarian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Bulgarian	=				
9.3	make available in Bulgarian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Bulgarian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Bulgarian in their relations with persons applying to them in Bulgarian				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Bulgarian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Bulgarian[150]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Bulgarian may submit oral or written applications in Bulgarian to local branches of the national authorities[151]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Bulgarian may validly submit a document in Bulgarian to local branches of the national authorities[152]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Bulgarian to submit oral or written applications in Bulgarian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Bulgarian				↙	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Bulgarian		↗			
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Bulgarian in debates in their assemblies				↙	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Bulgarian in debates in their assemblies		=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Bulgarian	↗				
10.3.a	ensure that Bulgarian is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Bulgarian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Bulgarian[153]					
10.3.c	allow users of Bulgarian to submit a request in Bulgarian to public service providers[154]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Bulgarian		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Bulgarian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Bulgarian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Bulgarian		= [155]		↙ [156]	

[150] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[151] See footnote 152.
[152] See footnote 152.
[153] Undertaking **10.3.a** covers **10.3.b** and **10.3.c**, the three constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.3.b**, and **10.3.c**.
[154] See footnote 155.
[155] For radio.
[156] For television.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Bulgarian**[149]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Bulgarian on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Bulgarian on a regular basis			↙		
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Bulgarian		=			
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Bulgarian				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Bulgarian		=			
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Bulgarian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Bulgarian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Bulgarian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Bulgarian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Bulgarian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Bulgarian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.c	foster access in Bulgarian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Bulgarian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12. 1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Bulgarian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Bulgarian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Bulgarian	↗				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Bulgarian	↗				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Bulgarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Bulgarian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Bulgarian and the culture it reflects	↗				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Bulgarian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Bulgarian	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Bulgarian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Bulgarian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Bulgarian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Bulgarian is used in identical or similar form	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.e** is fulfilled as there are many cultural activities involving Bulgarian speakers organised at the national and local level in Romania. In this context, members of national minorities also regularly invite each other to events that they organise or organise activities jointly. **Articles 7.1.f and 7.1.h** are fulfilled as the Romanian authorities provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Bulgarian from pre-school to university, in accordance with the wishes of the speakers. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Bulgarian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Articles 8.1.aii is partly fulfilled as education in Bulgarian is only offered at pre-school level in Timiş county for a limited number of pupils. Regarding **Article 8.1.bii**, the Committee of Experts was informed by the Bulgarian speakers met during the on-the-spot visit that – based on their wish – Bulgarian is taught four hours per week at the primary school level. This setup does not fully correspond to the undertaking ratified by Romania which is to make available a substantial part of primary education in Bulgarian. Having noted that the legal framework as well as the human and material conditions (teachers, textbooks, premises) for teaching in Bulgarian are met, the Committee of Experts considers this undertaking formally fulfilled only. However, it strongly encourages the Romanian authorities to raise awareness about the possibility for the speakers to receive a substantial part of primary education in Bulgarian. **Article 8.1.div** is not fulfilled, despite the existence of the legal framework, as there are no infrastructure nor human resources to offer Bulgarian as an integral part of the curriculum in technical or vocational education. **Article 8.1.h** is fulfilled as the initial training of teachers teaching in minority languages is carried out at university level and teachers teaching Bulgarian receive regular training in the context of activities carried out by the competent School Inspectorates. While one inspector and one methodical teacher are responsible for monitoring the educational process on the study of Bulgarian, it seems however that no periodic reports on measures taken, and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Bulgarian have been published. Therefore, **Article 8.1.i** is partly fulfilled.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expenses for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. **Articles 10.2.c** and **10.2.e** are not fulfilled since this provision is hampered by the 20% threshold and Bulgarian is consequently not used at county level. Despite the fact that **Article 10.2.d** is hampered by the 20% threshold (which has an impact in the municipality of Denta for instance), some local authorities (such as the municipality of Dudeştii Vechi) publish some of their official documents in Bulgarian. Therefore, **Article 10.2.d** is considered partly fulfilled. **Article 10.2.g** is fulfilled as there are traditional and correct forms of placenames in Bulgarian used in Dudeştii Vechi, Breştea and Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar. Signs with the name of the municipalities at the entrance and exit of the commune are bilingual, Romanian and Bulgarian, as well as in several public services (post office, local house of culture, local library, local doctor’s office). **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Bulgarian language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Bulgarian minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Bulgarian are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. Concerning **Articles 11.1.bii** and **11.1.cii**, the state is allocating budgets for associations of minority speakers which they can use on their own consideration and offers a structure for media developments and training of national minority journalists. As

this support has not led to the creation or keeping of private radio and television stations broadcasting in Bulgarian, the undertakings can be considered as only formally fulfilled.

Articles 12.1.b and 12.1.c are fulfilled since there is dissemination of work through translation and dubbing. This is particularly true in the context of the Timişoara 2023 European Capital of Culture. **Article 12.1.g** is fulfilled as the National Library of Romania keeps copies of documents published by Bulgarians in Romania. Furthermore, each branch of UBB-R has a small library. **Article 12.1.h** is fulfilled as the close relations between Romania and Bulgaria facilitate the realisation of translation and terminological research activities, for the development of adequate administrative, commercial, economic, social, technological or legal terminology in Bulgarian. **Article 12.3** is fulfilled since Bulgarian is promoted at the international level in the context of the Timişoara 2023 European Capital of Culture.

Article 13.1.b is fulfilled as the Romanian legislation in force prohibits any criterion that has the purpose or effect of excluding or restricting the use of minority languages. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that such legislation is applied in practice.

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Bulgarian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[157] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level, and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Bulgarian.

b. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

c. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

d. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Bulgarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

e. Publish a collection in Bulgarian of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Bulgarian minority speakers.

f. Ensure the use of Bulgarian in the provision of local public services.

g. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Bulgarian to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

[157] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.4 Croatian

2.4.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Croatian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Croatian**[158]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Croatian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Croatian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Croatian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Croatian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Croatian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	↗				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Croatian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Croatian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Croatian at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Croatian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Croatian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Croatian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Croatian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Croatian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Croatian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aii	make available a substantial part of pre-school education in Croatian	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Croatian	=				
8.1.cii	make available a substantial part of secondary education in Croatian	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Croatian or of facilities for the study of Croatian as a university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Croatian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Croatian	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Croatian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Croatian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Croatian at all the appropriate stages of education	↗				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Croatian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		

[158] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Croatian[158]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Croatian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Croatian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Croatian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Croatian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Croatian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Croatian and the related use of documents and evidence in Croatian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Croatian	=				
9.3	make available in Croatian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Croatian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Croatian in their relations with persons applying to them in Croatian				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Croatian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Croatian[159]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Croatian may submit oral or written applications in Croatian to local branches of the national authorities[160]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Croatian may validly submit a document in Croatian to local branches of the national authorities[161]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Croatian to submit oral or written applications in Croatian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Croatian	↗				
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Croatian in debates in their assemblies	↗				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Croatian	↗				
10.3.a	ensure that Croatian is used in the provision of public services	↗				
10.3.b	allow users of Croatian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Croatian[162]					
10.3.c	allow users of Croatian to submit a request in Croatian to public service providers[163]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Croatian		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Croatian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Croatian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Croatian	=[164]			↙[165]	
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Croatian on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Croatian	↗				

[159] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[160] See footnote 161.
[161] See footnote 161.
[162] Undertaking **10.3.a** covers **10.3.b** and **10.3.c**, the three constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.3.b**, and **10.3.c**.
[163] See footnote 164.
[164] For radio.
[165] For television.

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Croatian[158]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Croatian				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Croatian		=			
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Croatian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Croatian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Croatian	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Croatian	↗				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Croatian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling					=
12.1.c	foster access in Croatian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling					=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Croatian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Croatian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Croatian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Croatian	↗				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Croatian	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Croatian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Croatian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Croatian and the culture it reflects	↗				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Croatian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Croatian	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Croatian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Croatian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Croatian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Croatian is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.e** is fulfilled as there are many cultural activities involving Croatian speakers organised at the national and local level in Romania. In this context, members of national minorities also regularly invite each other to events that they organise or organise activities jointly. **Articles 7.1.f and 7.1.h** are fulfilled as Romanian authorities provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Croatian from pre-school to university, in accordance with the wishes of the speakers. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Croatian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Although the Caraş-Severin school inspectorate has appointed, since 2021, one inspector dedicating half of his/her time to monitor the progress achieved in the teaching of all minority languages (including Croatian) in the county (which represents an improvement compared to the previous situation), periodic reports do not seem to be made public. Therefore, **Article 8.1.i** is partly fulfilled. **Article 8.2** is fulfilled since UCR offers classes of Croatian and the possibility to participate in several activities where children are entitled to communicate in their mother tongue.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expenses for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. Despite the fact that **Articles 10.2.d and 10.2.f** are hampered by the 20% threshold, this does not have a concrete impact on Croatian speakers as they are compactly settled and live in municipalities that reach this threshold. In practice, there are Croatian speakers employed in mayors’ offices, councils and specialised services subordinated to these. Croatian can be used in the local public administration and speakers can submit oral or written applications in Croatian. Croatian is used in all local activities, including debates in the council meetings of the local assembly. The minutes are being recorded in Romanian, and the decisions translated into Croatian. Official documents are published in Croatian. Therefore, the requirements are fulfilled. **Article 10.2.g** is fulfilled as traditional and correct forms of placenames in Croatian are used in practice. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that Croatian is used in the provision of public services in health services, post offices, cable providers, etc. Therefore, **Article 10.3.a** is fulfilled. **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Croatian language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Croatian minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Croatian are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. Concerning **Article 11.1.cii**, the state is allocating budgets for associations of minority speakers which they can use on their own consideration and offers a structure for media developments and training of national minority journalists. As this support has not led to the creation or keeping of a private television station broadcasting in Croatian, the undertakings can be considered as only formally fulfilled. **Article 11.1.d** is fulfilled as the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Croatian is put into practice through the weekly show *Convieţuiri* on *TVR 1*, a monthly show in Croatian with a duration of 25-30 minutes, made with the support of UCR on *TVR 3 Timişoara* and by *Radio Resita*, on a weekly basis.

Article 12.1.a is fulfilled as many cultural activities promoting Croatian are carried out by UCR (publication of textbooks, promotion of artistic, folklore, sport competitions). UCR has also opened a traditional house acting as a documentation centre. Currently, a cultural and sport centre is being launched for the Croatian minority. **Article 12.1.g** is fulfilled as the National Library of Romania keeps copies of documents of the national minorities and receives annually four titles as part of the Exchange Program with the Croatian National Library of Zagreb. UCR collects and keeps copies of works published in Croatian. **Article 12.3** is fulfilled as UCR, with the support of the authorities, participates in cultural activities abroad (e.g., the annual Croatian Language and Literature Seminar in Croatia).

Article 13.1.b is fulfilled as the Romanian legislation in force prohibits any criterion that has the purpose or effect of excluding or restricting the use of minority languages. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that such legislation is applied in practice.

Article 14.b is fulfilled as cross-border co-operation is promoted between regional or local authorities in areas where Croatian is used through twinning agreements concluded between Romanian and Croatian municipalities.

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Croatian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[166] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Ensure that classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold complete the full cycle of education without the need for an annual approval.

b. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level, and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Croatian.

c. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

d. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

e. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Croatian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

f. Publish a collection in Croatian of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Croatian minority speakers.

g. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Croatian to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

[166] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.5 Czech

2.5.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Czech

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Czech**[167]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Czech as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Czech	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Czech	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Czech, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Czech • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Czech at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Czech to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Czech at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Czech	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Czech	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Czech among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Czech among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Czech • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Czech	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aii	make available a substantial part of pre-school education in Czech		↙			
8.1.bii	make available a substantial part of primary education in Czech		↙			
8.1.ciii	provide, within secondary education, for the teaching of Czech as an integral part of the curriculum		↙			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Czech, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Czech or teaching of Czech as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				↙	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Czech		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Czech and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Czech is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Czech at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Czech in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		

[167] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Czech[167]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Czech, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Czech in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Czech in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Czech in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Czech in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Czech and the related use of documents and evidence in Czech, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Czech	=				
9.3	make available in Czech the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Czech				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Czech in their relations with persons applying to them in Czech				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Czech may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Czech[168]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Czech may submit oral or written applications in Czech to local branches of the national authorities[169]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Czech may validly submit a document in Czech to local branches of the national authorities[170]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Czech to submit oral or written applications in Czech to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Czech				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Czech				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Czech in debates in their assemblies				↙	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Czech in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Czech	↗				
10.3.a	ensure that Czech is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Czech to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Czech[171]					
10.3.c	allow users of Czech to submit a request in Czech to public service providers[172]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Czech		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Czech to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Czech	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Czech		= 173		↙ 174	
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Czech on a regular basis			↗		

[168] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[169] See footnote 170.
[170] See footnote 170.
[171] Undertaking **10.3.a** covers **10.3.b** and **10.3.c**, the three constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.3.b**, and **10.3.c**.
[172] See footnote 173.
[173] For radio.
[174] For television.

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Czech[167]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Czech on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Czech	↗				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Czech				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Czech		=			
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Czech • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Czech • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Czech	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Czech are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Czech	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Czech by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.c	foster access in Czech to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Czech language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Czech	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Czech in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Czech	↗				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Czech	↗				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Czech is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Czech	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Czech and the culture it reflects	↗				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Czech in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Czech	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Czech is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Czech in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Czech, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Czech is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.h** is fulfilled since Czech can be studied at the Czech Language and Literature Department of the Faculty of Foreign Languages and Literatures of the University of Bucharest. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Czech minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Considering that education in Czech is only offered at pre-school and primary school level in Caraș-Severin county for a limited number of pupils, the undertakings under **Articles 8.1.aii** and **8.1.bii** are partly fulfilled. **Article 8.1.ciii** is partly fulfilled since the teaching of Czech is only an integral part of the gymnasium level and is absent at the high school level. **Article 8.1.div** is not fulfilled, despite the existence of the legal framework, as there are no infrastructure nor human resources to offer Czech as an integral part of the curriculum in technical or vocational education. **Article 8.1.i** is partly fulfilled since two inspectors are responsible for monitoring the educational process on the study of Czech in Caraș-Severin and Mehedinți counties, respectively. However, no periodic reports on measures taken and progress achieved in establishing or developing the teaching of Czech seem to have been published.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. At county level, Czech is not used in debates. Therefore, **Article 10.2.e** is not fulfilled. **Article 10.2.g** is fulfilled as traditional and correct forms of placenames in Czech are used in practice in all municipalities where the Czech minority traditionally lives. **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Czech language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Czech minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Czech are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. Concerning **Articles 11.1.bii** and **11.1.cii**, the state is allocating budgets for associations of minority speakers which they can use on their own consideration and offers a structure for media developments and training of national minority journalists. As this support has not led to the creation or keeping of private radio and television stations broadcasting in Czech, the undertakings can be considered as only formally fulfilled. **Article 11.1.d** is fulfilled as audio and audiovisual works in Czech are produced and distributed in the context of a bilateral co-operation agreement between the Romanian Broadcasting Company and the Czech Broadcasting Company (participation in radio festivals, cultural performances, production of musical and spoken programmes).

Articles 12.1.b and 12.1.c are fulfilled since audio and audiovisual works in Czech are produced and distributed in the context of a bilateral co-operation agreement between the Romanian Broadcasting Company and the Czech Broadcasting Company (participation in radio festivals, cultural performances, production of musical and spoken programmes). **Article 12.1.g** is fulfilled as the National Library of Romania keeps copies of documents of the national minorities and developed annually an exchange of 84 book titles and publications with the National Library of the Czech Republic. In addition, works produced in Czech are kept in the Moldova Nouă branch of the Union of Slovaks and Czech of Romania. **Article 12.1.h** is fulfilled as the Centre for Professional Training in culture facilitate the realisation of translation and terminological research activities, for the development of adequate administrative, commercial, economic, social, technological or legal terminology in Czech.

Article 12.3 is fulfilled as there are regular activities and cultural policies developed by the Ministry of Culture externally. The provisions ensure cultural exchanges, such as facilitating the access to libraries, translating

and promoting books in their respective languages, participating to book fairs, establishing cultural institutes, organising conferences and minority languages seminars.

Article 13.1.b is fulfilled as the Romanian legislation in force prohibits any criterion that has the purpose or effect of excluding or restricting the use of minority languages. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that such legislation is applied in practice.

Article 14.b is fulfilled since several twinning agreements have been concluded between Romanian and Czech municipalities.

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Czech in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[175] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Provide training of a sufficient number of teachers able to teach in Czech.

b. Ensure that classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold complete the full cycle of education without the need for an annual approval.

c. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level, and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Czech.

d. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

e. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

f. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Czech, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

g. Publish a collection in Czech of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Czech minority speakers.

h. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Czech to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

i. Ensure the use of Czech in the provision of local public services.

[175] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.6 German

2.6.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning German**[176]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of German as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of German	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote German	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of German, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using German • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of German at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of German to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on German at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of German	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of German	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses German • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to German	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in German	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in German	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in German	=				
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in German	=				
8.1.ei	make available university and other higher education in German	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of German as a subject of adult and continuing education	↗				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by German		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) German		=			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of German and for drawing up public periodic reports of its finding		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which German is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of German at all the appropriate stages of education	↗				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use German in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		

[176] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning German[176]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in German, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use German in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in German in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use German in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in German in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in German and the related use of documents and evidence in German, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in German	=				
9.3	make available in German the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of German				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use German in their relations with persons applying to them in German				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of German may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in German[177]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of German may submit oral or written applications in German to local branches of the national authorities[178]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of German may validly submit a document in German to local branches of the national authorities[179]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in German or in bilingual versions				=	
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in German				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of German to submit oral or written applications in German to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in German				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in German				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of German in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of German in debates in their assemblies				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in German	↗				
10.3.a	ensure that German is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of German to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in German[180]					
10.3.c	allow users of German to submit a request in German to public service providers[181]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking German		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of German to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in German	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in German	=				

[177] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[178] See footnote 179.
[179] See footnote 179.
[180] Undertaking **10.3.a** covers **10.3.b** and **10.3.c**, the three constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.3.b**, and **10.3.c**.
[181] See footnote 182.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning German**[176]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in German on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in German on a regular basis	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in German	↗				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in German	=				
11.1.fi	cover the additional costs of those media which use German	↗				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using German	↗				
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in German • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in German • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in German	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of German are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in German	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in German by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in German to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling					=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the German language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12. 1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of German	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of German in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in German	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in German	↗				
12.2	In territories other than those in which German is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using German	↗				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for German and the culture it reflects	↗				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of German in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of German	↗				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of German in connection with economic or social activities	↗				
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of German		=			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in German	↗				
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in German				=	
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which German is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of German in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning German**[176]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.b	for the benefit of German, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory German is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled, despite the continued shortage of teachers, as German traditionally benefits from a well-developed and geographically diversified offer. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the German minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Article 8.1.fiii is fulfilled since German language courses are offered in Romania for adults by German Cultural Centres. Furthermore, at the level of private institutions and entities (economic companies, non-governmental organisations), there are numerous modules of adult education in German, these courses being generated by the socio-economic realities in Romania. **Article 8.1.i** is partly fulfilled as there are inspectors in charge of monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of German in the county school inspectorates that organise teaching in German (Brașov, Sibiu, Timiș and Cluj). However, periodic reports do not seem to be made public. In territories other than those in which German is traditionally used, it is possible to learn German throughout the country. Therefore, **Article 8.2** is fulfilled.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled as this provision is still hampered by the 20% threshold. **Article 10.2.g** is fulfilled as several municipalities (including those where the German minority has met the 20% threshold in the recent past but no longer meets it) have bilingual placename signs (Romanian-German) and placenames are also used in other domains, for example on street name signs, inscriptions on public buildings, train stations, cultural sites and tourist signposts. No changes to the existing situation have been reported as a consequence of the entry into force of the new administrative code. **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there is a regulation that requires a knowledge of German in the recruitment and training of local civil servants in areas where the German minority traditionally lives.

Article 11.1.bii is fulfilled since the association of editors of German-language media from Central and South-Eastern Europe, based in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar, has launched a joint radio station and TV channel in German called *Funkforum*. **Article 11.1.d** is fulfilled as the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in German is ensured through different materials, including online. Furthermore, these works are subtitled in Romanian, thus enabling the Romanian public to better understand the contemporary culture, traditions and issues of persons belonging to national minorities. **Article 11.1.fi** is fulfilled because

programmes in the languages of national minorities, including those in German, are supported by public funds. **Article 11.1.g** is fulfilled since the journalism department of the Babeș-Bolyai university provides graduation diplomas in this field in German.

Article 12.1.h is fulfilled since the Centre for Professional Training in Culture, which reports to the Ministry of Culture, organises exams to obtain Romanian-German translation certificates for various subjects in the fields of humanities, sciences and economics. Furthermore, there are several institutions dealing with linguistic/terminological research in German, such as the *Sibiu Institute for Socio-Human Research*. **Article 12.2** is fulfilled since the Romanian authorities regularly support cultural activities which bring together some or all national minorities and where German is promoted (National Minorities Day, the Minority Theatre Festival, the Interethnic Film Festival, the *Dimitrie Gusti National Village Museum* or to the national festival *ProEtnica)*. **Article 12.3** is fulfilled since German is promoted abroad by the Ministry of Culture in its international policy and several cultural activities take place abroad (e.g. work of the Sibiu/Hermannstadt and Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar theatres).

Articles 13.1.b and **13.1.c** are fulfilled since the Romanian legislation in force prohibiting discrimination applies accordingly. **Article 13.2.d** is fulfilled as safety instructions the aim of which it is to prevent accidents, including at the workplace, are also drawn up in German.

Article 14.b is fulfilled as cross-border co-operation is promoted/facilitated between regional or local authorities in areas where German is used through twin cities in Germany and Austria. Several cross-border activities are taking place.

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[182] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Taking into account the demand for classes taught in German, provide training of a sufficient number of teachers able to teach in German.

b. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for German.

c. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

d. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture, and history in the general curriculum.

e. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in German, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

f. Publish a collection in German of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to German minority speakers.

g. Ensure the use of German in the provision of local public services.

[182] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

h. Adopt the secondary legislation needed to strengthen the use of German in social care facilities and healthcare.

2.7 Greek

2.7.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Greek

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Greek[183]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Greek as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Greek	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Greek	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Greek, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Greek • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Greek at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Greek to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Greek at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Greek	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Greek	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Greek among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Greek among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Greek • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Greek	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

[183] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled as UER provides forms and means for the teaching and study of Greek at all appropriate stages, with the support of the Ministry of Education and school inspectorates. Dedicated teaching materials are used and there is a sufficient number of teachers for all ages and levels of study. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Greek minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Greek in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[184] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

The Committee of Experts has no recommendations for immediate action at present.

II. Further recommendations

a. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

[184] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.8 Hungarian

2.8.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Hungarian**[185]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Hungarian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Hungarian	↗				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Hungarian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Hungarian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Hungarian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Hungarian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Hungarian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Hungarian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Hungarian	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Hungarian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Hungarian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Hungarian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Hungarian	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Hungarian	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Hungarian	=				
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Hungarian	↗				
8.1.ei	make available university and other higher education in Hungarian	=				
8.1.fi	provision of adult and continuing education courses taught mainly or wholly in Hungarian		=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Hungarian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Hungarian		=			

[185] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Hungarian[185]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Hungarian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its finding	↗				
8.2	in territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Hungarian at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Hungarian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↙		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Hungarian and the related use of documents and evidence in Hungarian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Hungarian	=				
9.3	make available in Hungarian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Hungarian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Hungarian in their relations with persons applying to them in Hungarian		=			
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Hungarian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Hungarian[186]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Hungarian may submit oral or written applications in Hungarian to local branches of the national authorities[187]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Hungarian may validly submit a document in Hungarian to local branches of the national authorities[188]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Hungarian or in bilingual versions				↙	
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Hungarian	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Hungarian to submit oral or written applications in Hungarian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian		↗			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian		=			
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies		↗			
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies		↙			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Hungarian	↗				
10.3.a	ensure that Hungarian is used in the provision of public services		↗			
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Hungarian		=			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Hungarian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Hungarian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						

[186] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[187] See footnote 188.
[188] See footnote 188.

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Hungarian[185]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.1.aii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Hungarian	= [189]			= [190]	
11.1.bi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private radio station in Hungarian	=				
11.1.ci	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one private television channel in Hungarian	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Hungarian	↗				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Hungarian	=				
11.1.fi	cover the additional costs of those media which use Hungarian	↗				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Hungarian	=				
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Hungarian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Hungarian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Hungarian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Hungarian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.c	foster access in Hungarian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Hungarian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12. 1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Hungarian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Hungarian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Hungarian	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Hungarian	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Hungarian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Hungarian and the culture it reflects	↗				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Hungarian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Hungarian	↗				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Hungarian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Hungarian in economic and social life					=
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Hungarian		↗			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Hungarian	↗				
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Hungarian	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						

[189] For radio.
[190] For television.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Hungarian**[185]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Hungarian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Hungarian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Hungarian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Hungarian is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

There is no evidence that the existing administrative divisions constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Hungarian. Therefore **Article 7.1.b** is fulfilled. **Article 7.1.c** is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled, despite the continued shortage of teachers, as Hungarian traditionally benefits from a well-developed and geographically diversified offer and there is a strong school network in Hungarian at all appropriate levels and in all areas where Hungarian is traditionally used. **Article 7.1.i** is fulfilled as there are many transnational exchanges and activities taking place and encouraged by the Romanian authorities in the fields of education, information, science and culture, border co-operation programmes. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Hungarian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Article 8.1.di is fulfilled, since vocational education is provided in Hungarian in 11 counties. It is attended by more than 15,000 pupils/students and covers more than 70 specialisations. **Article 8.1.i** is fulfilled as there are inspectors in charge of monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Hungarian in the county school inspectorates that organise teaching in Hungarian.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. Therefore, Articles **9.1.aii, 9.1.aiii** and **9.1.bii** are formally fulfilled. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.b is not fulfilled as speakers are still not entitled to use forms and types of administrative texts in common use in minority languages in the absence of a list established by Government Decision to implement Article 195 (4) of the administrative code. **Article 10.2.c** is partly fulfilled as county councils do not always publish in practice their official documents in Hungarian or bilingual forms. **Articles 10.2.e and 10.2.f** are partly fulfilled as Hungarian is used in debates of county councils and municipalities’ assemblies only in places where the 20% threshold is met. **Article 10.2.g** is fulfilled as several municipalities (including those where the Hungarian minority has met the 20% threshold in the recent past but no longer meets it) have bilingual placename signs (Romanian-Hungarian) and placenames are also used in other domains, for example on street name signs, inscriptions on public buildings, train stations, cultural sites and tourist signposts. No changes to the existing situation have been reported as a consequence of the entry into force of the new

administrative code. **Article 10.3.a** is partly fulfilled because although the provision of public services in Hungarian is also linked to the 20% threshold, it is not always consistently applied.

Article 11.1.aii is fulfilled as existing national television channels and their regional branches provide for news; infotainment; art and culture; entertainment; science and education programmes in Hungarian and fulfil the public service mission requirement under this undertaking. **Article 11.1.d** is fulfilled since many audio and audiovisual works are produced and distributed in Hungarian, through DRI which finances multimedia productions, including online. Furthermore, these works are subtitled in Romanian, thus enabling the Romanian public to better understand the contemporary culture, traditions and issues of persons belonging to national minorities. **11.1.fi** is fulfilled because programmes in the languages of national minorities, including those in Hungarian, are supported by public funds.

Articles 12.1.b and 12.1.c are fulfilled as the periodical report provides information about translation and simultaneous translation of work from Hungarian into Romanian and from other languages into Hungarian at conferences, meetings and other cultural events. The Romanian authorities facilitate the dissemination of Hungarian through cultural activities abroad (example of the Hungarian State Theatre in Cluj-Napoca/Kolozsvár/Klausenburg). Therefore, **Article 12.3** is fulfilled.

Article 13.1.b is fulfilled since the Romanian legislation in force prohibiting discrimination applies accordingly. Although Hungarian can be used in hospitals, **Article 13.2.c** is partly fulfilled as healthcare institutions do not seem to have developed a Hungarian language policy. There is no secondary legislation to implement in practice the existing legislation, the numerical threshold of which is in any case considered too high. Information collected during the on-the-spot visit indicates that **Articles 13.2.d** and **13.2.e** are fulfilled.

Article 14.b is fulfilled as there are many twinning agreements which have been concluded between Romanian and Hungarian counties and municipalities.

2.8.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.8.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[191] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Provide training of a sufficient number of teachers able to teach in Hungarian, ensuring continuity from pre-school to higher education.

b. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level, and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Hungarian.

c. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

d. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

e. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

[191] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

f. Ensure the use of Hungarian in the provision of local public services.

g. Adopt the secondary legislation needed to strengthen the use of Hungarian in social care facilities and healthcare.

2.9 Italian

2.9.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Italian[192]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Italian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Italian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Italian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Italian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Italian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Italian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Italian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Italian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Italian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Italian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Italian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Italian	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

[192] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled as Italian is taught at all appropriate stages, with the support of the Ministry of Education and school inspectorates, for a growing number of pupils. Dedicated teaching materials are used and there is a sufficient number of teachers for all ages and levels of study. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Italian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.9.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.9.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[193] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

The Committee of Experts has no recommendations for immediate action at present.

II. Further recommendations

a. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

[193] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.10 Macedonian

2.10.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Macedonian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Macedonian[194]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Macedonian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Macedonian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Macedonian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Macedonian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Macedonian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Macedonian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Macedonian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Macedonian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Macedonian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Macedonian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Macedonian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Macedonian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Macedonian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Macedonian	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

[194] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.3 is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Macedonian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.10.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Macedonian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.10.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[195] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Include Macedonian in the general curriculum of mainstream education.

II. Further recommendations

b. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Macedonian in mainstream education and carry out a promotional campaign to encourage a sufficient number of pupils to enrol in classes teaching Macedonian.

c. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

[195] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.11 Polish

2.11.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Polish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Polish**[196]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Polish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Polish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Polish	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Polish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Polish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Polish at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Polish to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Polish at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Polish	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Polish	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Polish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Polish among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Polish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Polish	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

[196] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.3 is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Polish minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.11.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Polish in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.11.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[197] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Ensure that classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold complete the full cycle of education without the need for an annual approval.

II. Further recommendations

b. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

c. Encourage local authorities to use Polish in their administrative activities.

[197] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.12 Romani

2.12.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Romani**[198]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Romani as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romani	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romani	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romani, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Romani • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romani at all appropriate stages		↙			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romani to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romani at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romani	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romani	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romani • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romani	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

[198] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.f is partly fulfilled as the teaching offer of Romani should be further extended. Currently, Romani is only taught to a rather small number of children from the Roma minority and there is a systemic shortage of teachers. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Romani minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum. In addition, despite the existing legal framework, the existence of a National Commission for Desegregation and Inclusive Education (established in 2019) and the *Strategy of the Romanian Government on inclusion of Romanian citizens belonging to the Roma minority for the period 2022-2027*, cases of segregation in education were still identified by NCCD during the period of reference.

2.12.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.12.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[199] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Extend the teaching offer of Romani, including at pre-school level, taking into account the needs and wishes of the speakers.

b. Provide training of a sufficient number of teachers able to teach in Romani.

II. Further recommendations

c. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

d. Encourage local authorities to use Romani in their administrative activities.

[199] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.13 Russian

2.13.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Russian**[200]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Russian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Russian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Russian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Russian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Russian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Russian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Russian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Russian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Russian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Russian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Russian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Russian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Russian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Russian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			
8.1.biii	provide, within primary education, for the teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum	=				
8.1.ciii	provide, within secondary education, for the teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Russian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Russian or teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Russian as a university and higher education subject	=				

[200] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Undertakings of Romania concerning Russian[200]	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Russian as a subject of adult and continuing education	↗				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Russian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Russian	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Russian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its finding		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Russian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Russian at all the appropriate stages of education					=
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Russian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Russian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Russian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Russian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Russian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Russian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Russian and the related use of documents and evidence in Russian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Russian	=				
9.3	make available in Russian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Russian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Russian in their relations with persons applying to them in Russian				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Russian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Russian[201]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Russian may submit oral or written applications in Russian to local branches of the national authorities[202]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Russian may validly submit a document in Russian to local branches of the national authorities[203]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Russian to submit oral or written applications in Russian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Russian				=	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Russian in debates in their assemblies		=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Russian		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Russian is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Russian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Russian[204]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Russian		↗			
10.4.c	compliance with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Russian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Russian	=				

[201] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[202] See footnote 203.
[203] See footnote 203.
[204] Undertaking 10.3.a covers 10.3.b, the two constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertaking 10.3.b.

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Russian[200]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Russian		= 205		↙ 206	
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Russian on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Russian on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Russian		=			
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Russian				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Russian		↗			
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Russian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Russian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Russian	↗				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Russian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			
12.1.c	foster access in Russian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling					=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Russian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Russian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Russian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Russian	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Russian	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Russian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Russian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Russian and the culture it reflects					=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Russian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Russian	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Russian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Russian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Russian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Russian is used in identical or similar form					=

[205] For radio.
[206] For television.

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled as Russian traditionally benefits from a well-developed and geographically diversified offer at all levels of education. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Lipovan Russian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Article 8.1.fiii is fulfilled as CRLR organises Russian classes for adults. **Article 8.1.i** is partly fulfilled as there are inspectors in charge of monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Russian in the county school inspectorates that organise teaching of Russian. However, periodic reports do not seem to be made public.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Russian language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Lipovan Russian minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Russian are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. Concerning **Articles 11.1.bii** and **11.1.cii**, the state is allocating budgets for associations of minority speakers which they can use on their own consideration and offers a structure for media developments and training of national minority journalists. As this support has not led to the creation or keeping of private radio and television stations broadcasting in Russian, the undertakings can be considered as only formally fulfilled. **Article 11.1.g** is partly fulfilled as information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that public broadcasters regularly organise trainings for their employees speaking minority languages.

Article 12.1.a is fulfilled as CLCR organises many events promoting traditions and customs of the Lipovan Russian minority (festivals, publication of books, fairs, etc).

Articles 13.1.b is fulfilled since the Romanian legislation in force prohibiting discrimination applies accordingly.

2.13.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.13.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[207] remain valid in their own right.

[207] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Russian.

b. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

c. Take steps to expand the use of Russian at pre-school level.

d. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

e. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Russian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

f. Publish a collection in Russian of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Russian minority speakers.

g. Ensure the use of Russian in the provision of local public services.

h. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Russian to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

2.14 Ruthenian

2.14.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ruthenian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Ruthenian[208]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Ruthenian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ruthenian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ruthenian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ruthenian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Ruthenian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ruthenian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ruthenian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ruthenian at universities or equivalent institutions				↙	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ruthenian	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ruthenian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ruthenian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ruthenian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ruthenian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ruthenian	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

[208] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article 7.1.h is not fulfilled as there is no study or research on Ruthenian at universities or equivalent institutions. **Article 7.1.i** is fulfilled as UCRR takes part to different transnational exchanges. For instance, the Romanian authorities are supporting the organisation by UCRR of an international conference on the Ruthenian language. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Ruthenian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.14.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ruthenian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.14.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[209] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Include Ruthenian in the general curriculum of mainstream education.

II. Further recommendations

b. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Ruthenian in mainstream education and carry out a promotional campaign to encourage a sufficient number of pupils to enroll in classes teaching Ruthenian.

c. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

[209] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

2.15 Serbian

2.15.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Serbian**[210]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Serbian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Serbian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Serbian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Serbian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Serbian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	↗				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Serbian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Serbian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Serbian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Serbian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Serbian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Serbian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Serbian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aii	make available a substantial part of pre-school education in Serbian	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Serbian	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Serbian	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Serbian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Serbian or teaching of Serbian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Serbian as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Serbian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Serbian	↗				

[210] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Undertakings of Romania concerning Serbian[210]	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Serbian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		↗			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Serbian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Serbian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Serbian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Serbian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Serbian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Serbian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Serbian and the related use of documents and evidence in Serbian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Serbian	=				
9.3	make available in Serbian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Serbian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Serbian in their relations with persons applying to them in Serbian				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Serbian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Serbian[211]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Serbian may submit oral or written applications in Serbian to local branches of the national authorities[212]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Serbian may validly submit a document in Serbian to local branches of the national authorities[213]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Serbian to submit oral or written applications in Serbian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Serbian		=			
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Serbian in debates in their assemblies		=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Serbian		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Serbian is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Serbian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Serbian[214]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Serbian		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Serbian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Serbian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Serbian	=[215]			↙[216]	

[211] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[212] See footnote 213.
[213] See footnote 213.
[214] Undertaking **10.3.a** covers **10.3.b** and **10.3.c**, the three constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.3.b**, and **10.3.c**.
[215] For radio.
[216] For television.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Serbian**[210]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Serbian on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Serbian on a regular basis	=				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Serbian					=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Serbian	=				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Serbian	↗				
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Serbian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Serbian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Serbian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Serbian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Serbian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Serbian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			
12.1.c	foster access in Serbian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling					=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Serbian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12. 1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Serbian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Serbian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Serbian	↗				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Serbian	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Serbian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Serbian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Serbian and the culture it reflects					=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Serbian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Serbian	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Serbian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Serbian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Serbian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Serbian is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.e** is fulfilled as Serbian speakers regularly participate to cultural activities carried out with speakers of other linguistic groups. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled, as Serbian is taught from kindergarten to upper secondary school in all the places where Serbian speakers traditionally live. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Serbian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Article 8.1.i is partly fulfilled as there are inspectors in charge of monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Serbian in the county school inspectorates that organise teaching of Serbian. However, periodic reports do not seem to be made public.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Serbian language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Serbian minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Serbian are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. Since *Radio Banat Link* in Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar broadcasts a private radio programme in Serbian, **Article 11.1.bii** is fulfilled. **Article 11.1.g** is fulfilled as information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that public broadcasters regularly organise trainings for their employees speaking minority languages. Training programmes for journalists and media staffl seem also to be carried out in co-operation with Serbia.

Article 12.1.g is fulfilled as the National Library of Romania ensures a permanent acquisition of written volumes in Serbian, in particular through international publications exchange programmes with the *National Library of Serbia*, with the *Matica Srpska Library* and with the *Svetozar Markovic University Library*. Furthermore, the West University of Timișoara/Temeswar/Temesvár/Temišvar and the University of Bucharest have developed projects to support access to works produced in Serbian.

Article 13.1.b is fulfilled since the Romanian legislation in force prohibiting discrimination applies accordingly.

Article 14.b is fulfilled as there are many cross-border exchanges organised at the local level between regional or local authorities for the promotion of Serbian. In addition, several twinning agreements have been concluded between Romanian and Serbian municipalities, leading to many co-operation activities.

2.15.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.15.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[217] remain valid in their own right.

[217] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Reconsider the thresholds for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level, and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Serbian.

b. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

c. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Serbian to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

d. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

e. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Serbian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

f. Publish a collection in Serbian of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Serbian minority speakers.

g. Ensure the use of Serbian in the provision of local public services.

2.16 Slovak

2.16.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Slovak**[218]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Slovak as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Slovak	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Slovak	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Slovak, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Slovak • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				

[218] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Slovak[218]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Slovak at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Slovak to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Slovak at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Slovak	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Slovak	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Slovak • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Slovak	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Slovak	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Slovak	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Slovak	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Slovak, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Slovak or teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Slovak as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Slovak		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Slovak	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Slovak and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Slovak is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Slovak at all the appropriate stages of education				=	
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Slovak in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Slovak, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Slovak in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Slovak in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Slovak in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Slovak in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Slovak and the related use of documents and evidence in Slovak, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Slovak	=				
9.3	make available in Slovak the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Slovak				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Slovak in their relations with persons applying to them in Slovak				↙	

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Slovak[218]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Slovak may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Slovak[219]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Slovak may submit oral or written applications in Slovak to local branches of the national authorities[220]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Slovak may validly submit a document in Slovak to local branches of the national authorities[221]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Slovak to submit oral or written applications in Slovak to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Slovak		=			
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Slovak in debates in their assemblies		=			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Slovak		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Slovak is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Slovak to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Slovak[222]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Slovak		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Slovak to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Slovak	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Slovak		= [223]		↙ [224]	
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Slovak on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Slovak on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Slovak		=			
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Slovak				↙	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Slovak		=			
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Slovak	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Slovak are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Slovak	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Slovak by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.c	foster access in Slovak to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Slovak language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Slovak	=				

[219] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[220] See footnote 221.
[221] See footnote 221.
[222] Undertaking **10.3.a** covers **10.3.b** and **10.3.c**, the three constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.3.b**, and **10.3.c**.
[223] For radio.
[224] For television.

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Slovak[218]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Slovak in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Slovak	↗				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Slovak	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Slovak is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Slovak	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Slovak and the culture it reflects					=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Slovak in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Slovak	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Slovak is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Slovak in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Slovak, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Slovak is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled, despite the fact that it is sometimes not possible for children from Slovak-speaking families to receive education in Slovak from kindergarten to upper secondary school in all the places where Slovak speakers traditionally live. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Slovak minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Article 8.1.i is partly fulfilled as there are inspectors in charge of monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Slovak in the county school inspectorates that organise teaching of Slovak. However, periodic reports do not seem to be made public.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must

bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Slovak language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Slovak minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Slovak are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. **Article 11.1.bii** is fulfilled as UDSCR is providing an online free radio, *Radio N 1803*, which broadcasts every day. Concerning **Article 11.1.cii**, the state is allocating budgets for associations of minority speakers which they can use on their own consideration and offers a structure for media developments and training of national minority journalists. If this support has not led to a creation or keeping of a private television station broadcasting in Slovak, the undertakings can be considered as only formally fulfilled. Although UDSCR publishes the monthly literary and culture magazine *Naše snahy*, its quarterly supplement *Naše snahy plus* and the monthly scientific magazine *Dolnozemský Slovák*, such publications cannot be considered newspapers in the sense of the present undertaking, which advocates at least for a weekly publication. Therefore, **Article 11.1.ei** is not fulfilled.

Articles 12.1.b and **12.1.c** are fulfilled since there is dissemination of work through translation and dubbing. There are more than 20 common projects in Slovak from Romania, Serbia and Hungary carried out in the context of cross-border co-operation. **Article 12.1.g** is fulfilled since the National Library of Romania annually exchanges an average of 11 titles of publications with the Slovak National Library and Comenius University in Bratislava. UDSCR and the Cultural and Scientific Society *Ivan Krasko* from Nădlac also collect and keep copies of works produced in Slovak.

Articles 13.1.b is fulfilled since the Romanian legislation in force prohibiting discrimination applies accordingly.

Article 14.b is fulfilled as there are many twinning agreements which have been concluded between municipalities of Romania and the Slovak Republic. Furthermore, there is a cross-border co-operation between the Slovaks of the Lower Lands – from Serbia, Romania, and Hungary.

2.16.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.16.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[225] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Ensure that classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold complete the full cycle of education without the need for an annual approval.

b. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level, and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Slovak.

c. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

d. Provide up-to-date textbooks for teaching in Slovak at all appropriate levels.

[225] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

e. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

f. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Slovak, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

g. Publish a collection in Slovak of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Slovak minority speakers.

h. Ensure the use of Slovak in the provision of local public services.

i. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Slovak to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

2.17 Tatar

2.17.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Tatar

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Romania concerning Tatar**[226]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						

[226] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Tatar[226]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Tatar as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Tatar	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Tatar		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Tatar, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Tatar • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Tatar at all appropriate stages				↙	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Tatar to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Tatar at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Tatar	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Tatar	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Tatar among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Tatar among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Tatar • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Tatar	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.f is not fulfilled despite the existence of weekends teaching classes given by UDTTMR as Tatar is not recognised in the national curriculum, there is no school inspector in charge of monitoring the language, and teachers do not receive official qualifications to teach it. **Article 7.1.i** is fulfilled since the Romanian authorities encourage UDTTMR to establish ties among the Tatar communities in countries such as Turkey, Ukraine or Bulgaria. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Tatar minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.17.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Tatar in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.17.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[227] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

[227] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Include Tatar in the general curriculum and provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Tatar in mainstream education.

II. Further recommendations

b. Promote the study and research on Tatar by setting up a dedicated Tatar language Department at university level.

c. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

2.18 Turkish

2.18.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Turkish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Turkish[228]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Turkish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Turkish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Turkish	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Turkish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Turkish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Turkish at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Turkish to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Turkish at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Turkish	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Turkish	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Turkish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Turkish among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Turkish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Turkish	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Turkish				=	
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Turkish				=	
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Turkish				=	
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Turkish, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Turkish or teaching of Turkish as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient					=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Turkish as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Turkish as a subject of adult and continuing education	↗				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Turkish		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Turkish	↗				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Turkish and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Turkish is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Turkish at all the appropriate stages of education	↗				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Turkish in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Turkish, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Turkish in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Turkish in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	

[228] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Turkish[228]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Turkish in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Turkish in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Turkish and the related use of documents and evidence in Turkish, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Turkish	=				
9.3	make available in Turkish the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Turkish				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Turkish in their relations with persons applying to them in Turkish				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Turkish may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Turkish[229]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Turkish may submit oral or written applications in Turkish to local branches of the national authorities[230]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Turkish may validly submit a document in Turkish to local branches of the national authorities[231]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Turkish to submit oral or written applications in Turkish to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Turkish			↙		
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Turkish in debates in their assemblies				↙	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Turkish in debates in their assemblies			↙		
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Turkish	↗				
10.3.a	ensure that Turkish is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Turkish		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Turkish to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Turkish	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Turkish		= [232]		↙ [233]	
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Turkish on a regular basis	=				
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Turkish on a regular basis	↗				
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Turkish	↗				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Turkish	↗				
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Turkish		=			
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Turkish • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Turkish • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Turkish	=				

[229] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[230] See footnote 231.
[231] See footnote 231.
[232] For radio.
[233] For television.

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Turkish[228]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Turkish are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Turkish	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Turkish by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.c	foster access in Turkish to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling		=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Turkish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12. 1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Turkish	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Turkish in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Turkish	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Turkish	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Turkish is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Turkish	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Turkish and the culture it reflects	↗				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Turkish	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Turkish is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Turkish in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Turkish, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Turkish is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled, since the teaching of Turkish is guaranteed at all educational levels. **Article 7.1.i** is fulfilled as there are many transnational exchanges and activities taking place, encouraged by the Romanian authorities, in education, science sport and culture. Moreover, cross-border co-operation is promoted between regional or local authorities in areas where Turkish is used through twinning agreements concluded between Romanian and Turkish municipalities and schools in Romania and in Türkiye. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Turkish minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Article 8.1.fiii is fulfilled since UDTR is organising Turkish language courses for adults, for different levels (beginner to advanced) in both physical and online formats. **Article 8.1.h** is fulfilled as the initial training of teachers teaching in minority languages is carried out at the *Kemal Atatürk National College* and at the universities of Bucharest and Constanța. Continuous training is carried out through the centres for further training of the teachers (*Teaching Staff Houses*), universities and other providers accredited by the Ministry of Education. **Article 8.1.i** is partly fulfilled as there are inspectors in charge of monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Turkish in the county school inspectorates that organise teaching of Turkish. However, periodic reports do not seem to be made public. **Article 8.2** is fulfilled as Turkish is studied in Bucharest in two private schools as a foreign language.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. **Articles 10.2.d** and **10.2.f** are formally fulfilled as Turkish is not used in practice by local authorities in their publication or in debates of their assemblies. **Article 10.2.e** is not fulfilled as the existing threshold is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. **Article 10.2.g** is fulfilled as Turkish is used for signs and placenames. Some Turkish names of municipalities are used as official names in Romanian and the Turkish form of the names of several municipalities has been recognised alongside the Romanian form of the names. **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Turkish language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Turkish minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled for television because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Turkish are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. **Article 11.1.cii** is fulfilled since a television channel (Kanal D) broadcasts programmes and films in Turkish. **Article 11.1.d** is fulfilled as Romanian television stations regularly broadcast series in Turkish with subtitles in Romanian. **Article 11.1.ei** is fulfilled as the *Balkan Newspaper* and *Hayat* are weekly publications in Turkish (they are financed by private initiatives). There are also other online publications in Turkish such as *Ay Media*. The bilingual magazine *Hakses* is published monthly (100 copies) by UDTR.

Articles 12.1.b is fulfilled since several activities are carried out to foster access in other languages to works produced in Turkish, such as the broadcast of series in Turkish with Romanian language subtitles on Romanian television channels. Most of the publications printed by UDTR are bilingual, Turkish - Romanian, in order to reach as many readers as possible. **Article 12.3** is fulfilled as the culture is promoted through folkloric ensembles which attend on a yearly basis the International Folklore Festival of Yalova (Türkiye), but also through a symposium on the Turkish civilisation and culture organised every year which is attended by UDTR. Furthermore, the Romanian Cultural Institute Dimitrie Cantemir in Istanbul carries out a series of cultural projects in Turkish and the capitalisation of the spiritual heritage of the persons belonging to the Turkish minority in Romania.

Articles 13.1.b is fulfilled since the Romanian legislation in force prohibiting discrimination applies accordingly.

Article 14.b is fulfilled as cross-border co-operation is promoted between regional or local authorities in areas where Turkish is used through twinning agreements concluded between Romanian and Turkish municipalities. Co-operation agreements and twinning arrangements have also been signed between several schools in Romania and in Türkiye.

2.18.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Turkish in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.18.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take

particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[234] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Reconsider the thresholds for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Turkish.

b. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

c. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

d. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Turkish, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

e. Publish a collection in Turkish of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Turkish minority speakers.

f. Ensure the use of Turkish in the provision of local public services.

g. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Turkish to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

2.19 Ukrainian

2.19.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian

[234] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Ukrainian[235]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Ukrainian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ukrainian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ukrainian	↗				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ukrainian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Ukrainian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	↗				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ukrainian at all appropriate stages	↗				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ukrainian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ukrainian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ukrainian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ukrainian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ukrainian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ukrainian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Ukrainian	↗				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Ukrainian	↗				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Ukrainian	↗				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Ukrainian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Ukrainian or teaching of Ukrainian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Ukrainian or of facilities for the study of Ukrainian as a university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Ukrainian as a subject of adult and continuing education	↗				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Ukrainian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Ukrainian	=				
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Ukrainian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings		↗			
8.2	in territories other than those in which Ukrainian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Ukrainian at all the appropriate stages of education	↗				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Ukrainian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			↙		
9.1.aiii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Ukrainian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		

[235] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Ukrainian[235]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Ukrainian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Ukrainian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Ukrainian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Ukrainian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Ukrainian and the related use of documents and evidence in Ukrainian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				↙	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Ukrainian	=				
9.3	make available in Ukrainian the most important national statutory texts and those relating particularly to users of Ukrainian				=	
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aii	ensure that officers of local branches of the national authorities use Ukrainian in their relations with persons applying to them in Ukrainian				↙	
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Ukrainian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Ukrainian[236]					
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Ukrainian may submit oral or written applications in Ukrainian to local branches of the national authorities[237]					
10.1.av	ensure that users of Ukrainian may validly submit a document in Ukrainian to local branches of the national authorities[238]					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Ukrainian to submit oral or written applications in Ukrainian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Ukrainian				=	
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Ukrainian in debates in their assemblies				↙	
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Ukrainian in debates in their assemblies		↗			
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Ukrainian	↗				
10.3.a	ensure that Ukrainian is used in the provision of public services	↗				
10.3.b	allow users of Ukrainian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Ukrainian[239]					
10.3.c	allow users of Ukrainian to submit a request in Ukrainian to public service providers[240]					
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Ukrainian		↗			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Ukrainian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Ukrainian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Ukrainian	=[241]			↙[242]	
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Ukrainian on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Ukrainian on a regular basis			↗		
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Ukrainian		=			

[236] Undertaking **10.1.aii** covers **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**, the four constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.1.aiii**, **10.1.aiv** and **10.1.av**.
[237] See footnote 238.
[238] See footnote 238.
[239] Undertaking **10.3.a** covers **10.3.b** and **10.3.c**, the three constituting alternative options. Therefore, the Committee of Experts will not monitor the implementation of the redundant undertakings **10.3.b**, and **10.3.c**.
[240] See footnote 241.
[241] For radio.
[242] For television.

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: Undertakings of Romania concerning Ukrainian[235]	Fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Ukrainian				=	
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Ukrainian		↗			
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ukrainian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ukrainian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Ukrainian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Ukrainian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Ukrainian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Ukrainian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.c	foster access in Ukrainian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	↗				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Ukrainian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12. 1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Ukrainian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Ukrainian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Ukrainian	=				
12.1.h	create and/or promote and finance translation and terminological research services, particularly with a view to maintaining and developing administrative, commercial, economic, social, technical or legal terminology in Ukrainian	↗				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Ukrainian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Ukrainian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Ukrainian and the culture it reflects	↗				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Ukrainian	↗				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Ukrainian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Ukrainian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Ukrainian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Ukrainian is used in identical or similar form	↗				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.c is partly fulfilled as there is a general legal and financial framework guaranteeing the protection and promotion of minority languages in Romania. **Article 7.1.e** is fulfilled as there are many cultural activities involving Ukrainian speakers organised at national and local level in Romania. In this context, members of

national minorities also regularly invite each other to events that they organise or organise activities jointly. **Article 7.1.f** is fulfilled, since the teaching of Ukrainian is guaranteed at all educational levels. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Ukrainian minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

Articles 8.1.ai, **8.1.bi** and **8.1.ci** are fulfilled, as the teaching in/of Ukrainian is provided at all appropriate levels, in conformity with the wish of the speakers. **Article 8.1.fiii** is fulfilled since UUR is organising Ukrainian language courses for adults in its headquarters. **Article 8.1.i** is partly fulfilled as there are inspectors in charge of monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Ukrainian in the county school inspectorates that organise teaching of Ukrainian. However, periodic reports do not seem to be made public. **Article 8.2** is fulfilled as Ukrainian is also taught outside the traditional areas where it is traditionally spoken.

Despite the lack of relevant data, the Committee of Experts notes that in criminal, civil and administrative proceedings, speakers of minority languages are entitled to use their language, if necessary by the use of interpreters, and that such right does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned. Furthermore, requests and evidence, whether written or oral, are not considered inadmissible solely because they are formulated in minority languages. However, concerning documents and evidence in civil and administrative proceedings, the existing legislations specify that they shall be “drawn up in Romanian”, and speakers must bear the extra costs of translation. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers that **Articles 9.1.biii, 9.1.ciii** and **9.1.d** are not fulfilled.

Article 10.1.aii is not fulfilled since the existing 20% threshold set in the national legislation is too high and deprives speakers of minority languages of the full protection of this provision. **Article 10.2.e** is not fulfilled as Ukrainian is not used at county level during debates of their assemblies. However, **Article 10.2.f** is partly fulfilled as Ukrainian is used in debates of some municipalities’ assemblies where the Ukrainian minority represents more than 20% of the population. **Article 10.2.g** is fulfilled as bilingual placename signs (Romanian-Ukrainian) are used in municipalities which meet the 20% threshold. Furthermore, in 12 municipalities, the names of public institutions (name of City Hall, educational units) are also displayed bilingually, in Romanian and Ukrainian (in Cyrillic alphabet as well). **Article 10.3.a** is fulfilled as information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that Ukrainian is used in the provision of public services, namely in the field of communication and transport, social assistance and health, education and culture. Ukrainian is also occasionally used, on request, in public ceremonies organised by the local authorities (including in wedding ceremonies). **Article 10.4.b** is partly fulfilled as there seems to be no Ukrainian language policy for the recruitment and training of local civil servants in several areas where the Ukrainian minority traditionally lives, especially in localities where the 20% threshold is not met.

Article 11.1.aiii is not fulfilled for television because the criteria of duration and regularity of public television programmes broadcast in Ukrainian are not met. In their current form, the existing programmes are unlikely to have an impact on the situation of minority languages and are merely symbolic. Concerning **Articles 11.1.bii** and **11.1.cii**, the state is allocating budgets for associations of minority speakers which they can use on their own consideration and offers a structure for media developments and training of national minority journalists. If this support has not led to a creation or keeping of a private radio and television stations broadcasting in Ukrainian, the undertakings can be considered as only formally fulfilled. **Article 11.1.g** is partly fulfilled as information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that public broadcasters regularly organise trainings for their employees speaking minority languages.

Articles 12.1.b and 12.1.c are fulfilled as the periodical report provides information about translation and simultaneous translation of work from Ukrainian to Romanian and from other languages into Ukrainian at conferences, meetings and other cultural events. Dozens of books are annually published in Ukrainian or translated from Ukrainian. **Article 12.1.h** is fulfilled as the close relations between Romania and Ukraine facilitate the realisation of translation and terminological research activities, for the development of adequate administrative, commercial, economic, social, technological or legal terminology in Ukrainian. In addition, UUR and the Faculty of Letters at Babeș-Bolyai University are engaged in linguistic/terminological research in order to maintain and develop administrative, commercial, economic, social and technical terminology in Ukrainian. **Article 12.3** is fulfilled considering that Romania and Ukraine have signed several agreements concerning the collaboration in the field of culture and several twinning agreements have been concluded between Romanian and Ukrainian municipalities, resulting in different collaborations in the field of culture.

Articles 13.1.b is fulfilled since the Romanian legislation in force prohibiting discrimination applies accordingly.

Article 14.b is fulfilled as cross-border co-operation is promoted between regional or local authorities in areas where Ukrainian is used through twinning agreements concluded between Romanian and Ukrainian

municipalities. Co-operation agreements and twinning arrangements have also been signed between several schools in Romania and schools in Ukraine. The Romanian authorities and UUR are very active in supporting arriving refugees and in providing assistance to the 47,800 refugee children already present on the Romanian territory.

2.19.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.19.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[243] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Reconsider the thresholds and take a flexible approach for the use of minority languages in administration at county and local level, and ensure the implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 for Ukrainian.

b. Adopt and publish the list of bilingual formats of standardised certified administrative forms proposed by the Department of Interethnic Relations, both in printed and online form.

II. Further recommendations

c. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

d. Guarantee the right for all minority language speakers to use their language in civil and administrative proceedings and provide that evidence or any other document can be submitted in Ukrainian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned.

e. Publish a collection in Ukrainian of the most important national legal texts and those of particular relevance to Ukrainian minority speakers.

f. Allocate adequate time slots for public television programmes in Ukrainian to be broadcast at regular intervals and of sufficient duration.

2.20 Yiddish

2.20.1 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yiddish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

[243] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

Article	Undertakings of Romania concerning Yiddish[244]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Yiddish as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Yiddish	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Yiddish		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Yiddish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Yiddish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Yiddish at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Yiddish to learn it				↙	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Yiddish at universities or equivalent institutions		↙			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Yiddish	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Yiddish	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yiddish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yiddish among their objectives		↙			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Yiddish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Yiddish	=				

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

Article 7.1.g is not fulfilled as there are no courses for non-speakers of Yiddish to learn it. **Article 7.1.h** is partly fulfilled as Yiddish is not studied at university level. **Article 7.1.i** is fulfilled since FCER participates to regular events with other Jewish communities and organisations in Europe, Israel and the USA on Yiddish. Furthermore, the Jewish State Theatre participates in various international festivals of Yiddish theatre. **Article 7.3** is partly fulfilled as the teaching of history and culture of the Jewish minority is included only to a limited extent in the general curriculum.

2.20.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yiddish in Romania

The Committee of Experts recommends that the authorities of Romania comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.20.1 above), as well as continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers

[244] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Romania[245] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. Draw up, in co-operation with the minority, an action plan for the revitalisation of Yiddish.

II. Further recommendations

b. Provide forms and means for the teaching and study of Yiddish in mainstream education and carry out a promotional campaign to encourage a sufficient number of pupils to enrol in classes teaching Yiddish.

c. Take actions to re-establish the study of Yiddish at university level.

d. Raise awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum.

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Romanian authorities have undertaken to protect the regional or minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate

[245] CM/RecChL(2012)3; CM/RecChL(2018)3.

on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Romania.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Bearing in mind the instrument of ratification deposited by Romania on 29 January 2008;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Romania;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Romania in its third periodic report, supplementary information given by the Romanian authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Romania and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Romanian authorities on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;

Recommends that the Romanian authorities take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. reconsider the thresholds for the official use of minority languages in administration;

2. ensure that classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold complete the full cycle of education without the need for an annual approval;

3. provide training of a sufficient number of teachers able to teach in Czech, German, Hungarian and Romani;

4. extend the teaching offer of Romani, introduce the teaching of Tatar in mainstream education and draw up an action plan for the revitalisation of Yiddish, in co-operation with the speakers;

The Committee of Ministers invites the Romanian authorities to submit their next periodic report by 1 February 2024.[246]

Appendix I: Instrument of ratification



Romania:

[246] See Committee of Ministers' Decisions CM/Del/Dec(2018)1330/10.4e - CM-Public, and "Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties", CM(2019)69 final.

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that:

1. The provisions of the Charter shall apply to the following minority languages used on the territory of Romania:

a) Albanian language;
b) Armenian language;
c) Bulgarian language;
d) Czech language;
e) Croatian language;
f) German language;
g) Greek language;
h) Italian language;
i) Yiddish language;
j) Macedonian language;
k) Hungarian language;
l) Polish language;
m) Romany language;
n) Russian language;
o) Ruthenian language;
p) Serbian language;
q) Slovak language;
r) Tatar language;
s) Turkish language;
s) Ukrainian language.

2. For the purpose of the Romanian law, the regional or minority languages refer to the languages of the national minorities.
Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 3

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 1, of the Charter, the provisions of Part II of the Charter shall apply to the following regional or minority languages:

a) Albanian language;
b) Armenian language;
c) Greek language;
d) Italian language;
e) Yiddish language;
f) Macedonian language;
g) Polish language;
h) Romany language;
i) Ruthenian language;
j) Tatar language.
Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 2

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, and Article 3, paragraph 1, of the Charter, the following provisions included in Part III of the Charter shall apply to the following national minorities languages:

a) Bulgarian language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), b(ii), c(iii), d(iv), e(ii), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, c, d, e, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b, c;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

b) Czech language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), b(ii), c(iii), d(iv), g, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, c, d, e, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b, c;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:

- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

c) Croatian language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(ii), e(iii), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, d, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

d) German language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(i), d(i), e(i), f(iii), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v), b, c;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, c, d, e, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b, c;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), d, e(i), f(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs c, d, e;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

e) Hungarian language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(i), d(i), e(i), f(i), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v), b, c;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, c, d, e, f, g;
- paragraph 3;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), b(i), c(i), d, e(i), f(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs c, d, e;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:

- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

f) Russian language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(iii), c(iii), d(iv), e(ii), f(iii), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, d, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

g) Serbian language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), b(i), c(i), d(iv), e(ii), g, h, i;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, d, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

h) Slovak language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(i), d(iv), e(ii), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, d, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

i) Turkish language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(i), d(iv), e(ii), f(iii), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);

- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, d, e, f, g;
- paragraph 3;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraph b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b;

j) Ukrainian language:
. Article 8 - Education:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(i), b(i), c(i), d(iv), e(iii), f(iii), g, h, i;
- paragraph 2;

. Article 9 - Justice:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), b(ii), b(iii), c(ii), c(iii), d;
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 10 - Administrative authorities and public services:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(ii), a(iii), a(iv), a(v);
- paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs b, d, e, f, g;
- paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b, c;
- paragraph 4, sub-paragraphs b, c;
- paragraph 5;

. Article 11 - Media:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a(iii), b(ii), c(ii), d, e(i), g;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 12 - Cultural activities and facilities:
- paragraph 1;
- paragraph 2;
- paragraph 3;

. Article 13 - Economic and social life:
- paragraph 1, sub-paragraph b;

. Article 14 - Transfrontier exchanges:
- paragraph a;
- paragraph b.

Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 2, 3

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that the phrase "*number considered sufficient*" provided for by Article 8, paragraph 1, sub-paragraph a(iii), of the Charter, means the minimum number of pupils necessary to establish a classroom or group, according to the provisions of Article 158 of the Educational Law no. 84 of 1995, republished with subsequent completions and modifications.
Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 8

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that the phrase "*territory in which the regional or minority languages is used*" provided for by Article 1, paragraph b, of the Charter, means the administrative-territorial units in which a regional or minority language is used by at least 20% of the population of these administrative-territorial units.
Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 1

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that the provisions of Article 9 of the Charter shall apply according to the stipulations of Article 128 of the Romanian Constitution, republished, as well as of Article 14 of the Law on the judicial organization no. 304 of 2004, republished with subsequent completions and modifications.
Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 9

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that the provisions of Article 10 of the Charter shall apply according to the stipulations of the Romanian Constitution, republished, and the Local Public Administration Law no. 215 of 2001, republished, as well as of the Framework Convention on the Protection of National Minorities, adopted at Strasbourg, on 1 February 1995, ratified by Romania by the Law no. 33 of 1995.
Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 10

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 29 January 2008 - Or. Engl.

Romania declares that the provisions of Article 11, paragraph 1, sub-paragraph f(i), of the Charter shall apply according to the provisions of the Law on the organization and functioning of the Romanian Radio Compagy and the Romanian Television Company no. 41 of 1994.
Period covered: 1/5/2008 -

The preceding statement concerns Article(s) : 11

Appendix II: Comments from the Romanian authorities

Comments of the Government of Romania to the third evaluation report on Romania, adopted on 15 June 2023

I. Important aspects concerning the protection of the rights of persons belonging to national minorities in Romania

Romania signed the *European Charter for Regional or Minority languages* (hereinafter referred to as ECRML/the Charter) on 17 July 1995 and ratified it on 29 January 2008 and was among the first States that signed the *Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities* on the very day of its adoption (1 February 1995) and the first State to ratify it on 29 April 1995.

The commitment assumed by the Romanian political spectrum and by the Romanian authorities towards the protection and promotion of the rights of persons belonging to national minorities proved strong and was reflected in the significant legislative measures and the important financial allocations in favour of persons belonging to national minorities living in Romania. The said commitment and the measures adopted by the Romanian authorities in favour of persons belonging to national minorities were noted by the Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereinafter referred to as COMEX) in its evaluation reports on Romania.

Romania has successfully applied the policies of *interculturalism* and managed to develop, with the important and substantial contribution of the members of national minorities that live on its territory, a system for the protection of their rights which stands above international standards in the field. This system is efficient in protecting and promoting the cultural, linguistic and religious identity of persons belonging to national minorities who live on the territory of Romania.

For example, among the principles that regulate undergraduate and graduate education as well as lifelong learning in Romania, listed in Article 3 of the Law no. 1/2011 on National Education, are the principle of guaranteeing the cultural identity of all Romanian citizens and intercultural dialogue; the principle of assuming, promoting and preserving the national identity and cultural values of the Romanian people; the principle of recognizing and guaranteeing the rights of persons belonging to national minorities; the right to maintaining, developing and expressing their ethnical, cultural, linguistic and religious identity.

Still on the subject of education, as this is a vital area for the preservation and development of one's own identity, it is to be stressed that in Romania the right to education in the mother tongue is guaranteed by the Constitution and implemented in practice by the aforementioned Law on National Education. The implementation of the measures that guarantee the education for persons belonging to the national minorities is carried out through the State Secretariat for Education in the Languages of National Minorities, within the Ministry of Education.

In concrete terms, Romania protects the right of every individual belonging to a national minority to the use of the mother tongue, to the learning of the mother tongue, to being educated in the mother tongue, to professing freely and unimpeded his/her religion, to having media (printed and verbal) in the minority languages, to participation in the public life and decision making in problems concerning them and the whole Romanian society.

The Romanian Government permanently carries out activities for the implementation of the provisions of the Charter and there are constant efforts made by public institutions in this sense. As an example, we reiterate some of the activities of the Romanian Government, through the Department for Interethnic Relations/DIR, having this objective:

- raising awareness campaigns on linguistic rights of persons belonging to national minorities;
- promoting the languages of national minorities in Romania through projects;
- interviews with national minority personalities on mother tongue;
- promoting literature in national minority languages and access for all to minority culture.

The system of protection of the rights of persons belonging to national minorities built by the Romanian Government revolves around the right of the individual, as a fundamental right inherent in each person that identifies itself as belonging to a certain minority. Romania does not recognize the concept of collective rights for national minorities. The system of protection of the rights of persons belonging to national minorities has

been considered since its inception as being based on the principle of inviolability of the human person and not intended to transform national minorities into a distinct subject of international law.

As a *disclaimer*, the Government of Romania emphasizes that references in these Comments to "national minorities/minorities" cannot, in any circumstance, be considered as an implied recognition by the Romanian Government of collective rights for national minorities. Additionally, Romania emphasizes that 20 historical national minorities live on its territory, the references in the Framework Convention to national minorities being a reference to these national minorities for the purpose of its application on the territory of Romania.

II. Aspects related to the content of the evaluation report

Under this chapter, we recall the *Reply of the Romanian Government to the Questionnaire and to the Additional questions concerning measures adopted in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic*[247], sent in the context of the on-the-spot visit. These two documents presented, in a detailed manner, relevant and updated information concerning the protection of the rights of persons belonging to national minorities in Romania from the perspective of the rights provided by the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages.

We also consider it relevant to corroborate the information comprised in these comments with that included in the *Comments of the Government of Romania to the Fifth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities*/*ACFC on Romania*, sent in August 2023.

In addition to the information enclosed in the aforementioned documents and in response to the content of the 3rd Report of COMEX on Romania, we underline the following:

Chapter 1 The situation of the minority languages in Romania – Recent developments and trends

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the minority languages in Romania

- ***Census***

Regarding this aspect, we salute the fact that the COMEX welcomed the positive approach followed by the authorities in ensuring the involvement of minority representatives in the census process and in raising awareness of its importance.[248]

In paragraph 9 (footnote 8), COMEX mentions that "Other sources suggest that census takers, who were paid by the number of forms completed, did not fill in the ethnicity questions because they were not compulsory."

Concerning this mention, we stress its inaccuracy given that **all the questions from the Population and Housing Census were mandatory**. In fact, Government Emergency Ordinance no. 19/2020, which represents the basis of the organization of the 2021 Population and Housing Census, stipulates in its Article 25, paragraph 3, that "all questions included in the forms are of a mandatory nature."

Moreover, **payment for census takers was based on the number of questionnaires completed in full, not partially**, and only after the validation process took place. Therefore, the mention that census takers were paid based on the number of questionnaires is not accurate, given that census takers were paid based on the number of questionnaires fully completed.

---

[247] *Reply of the Romanian Government to the Questionnaire* (35 pages, 8 annexes) and to the Additional questions (10 pages), documents sent on 18 April 2023 to the Secretariat of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages.

[248] Paragraph 11 of the evaluation report.

As regards the activities carried out by the Romanian Government through the Department for Interethnic Relations/DIR for the promotion of the census among the persons belonging to minorities, we mention the following:

- logistical support to the National Institute of Statistics in *the translation of the questionnaire used in the census into 16 national minority languages*: Hungarian, Italian, Slovak, Polish, Serbian, Turkish, German, Bulgarian, Russian, Armenian, Albanian, Romani, Greek, Ukrainian, Croatian, Czech, closely cooperating with the organizations of national minorities;
- *meetings with representatives of organizations of citizens belonging to national minorities who are members of the Council of National Minorities with the aim of promoting the participation of national minorities in the census and informing them about the census process*: in Bucharest, with representatives of the Union of Ukrainians in Romania, in Sibiu, with representatives of the Democratic Forum of Germans in Romania, in Bucharest with the representatives of the Community of Russian Lipovans in Romania and the Union of Bulgarians in Romania, in Constanța with representatives of the Turkish and Tatar communities and the Mufti's Office of Muslim Cult of Romania;
- specific events organized by minority organizations, such as "*Youth: part of multiculturalism and intercultural education in Romania*", held by the Union of Ukrainians in Romania in Sinaia, at the beginning of 2022. During the event attention was drawn to the fact that young people can contribute both to exercising their rights and to facilitating the collection of accurate data by helping those in their environment who lack the digital skills needed to complete the online census questionnaire. At the same time, the consequences for the rights of persons belonging to national minorities of non-participation and non-assumption of ethno cultural characteristics were underlined.

From the beginning of the first stage of direct data-collection of the census, the Romanian Government through the DIR developed a series of *activities aiming to promote the census among persons belonging to minorities. 20 interviews were carried out with the representatives of the minorities* (presidents of the organizations or their representatives in the Parliament) in order to give them the possibility not only to address the representatives of their community but also to present their concerns and challenges regarding the census. Issues related to accessibility of the online questionnaire, to the questions concerning ethnicity and mother tongue, issues related to technical difficulties were addressed by the Government through DIR in various communication tools in order to help the public proceed with the census.

➢ *Use of the minority languages in education*

Under this chapter, we salute the mentioning, by the COMEX, that "The Romanian educational system continues to guarantee a high level of support for many minority languages, showing best practices in many cases."[249]

Regarding paragraph 17 on the possibility to develop online education in/of the minority languages, we mention that the recently adopted Law on pre-university education no. 188/2023, which will enter into force on 2 September 2023, provides that the educational process covering teaching, learning and evaluation may be carried out online for a fixed period of time and with the purpose of ensuring the exercise of the fundamental right to education in cases when a state of emergency, alert or siege is established or when the Ministry of Education so orders, at the request of the education unit and with the approval of the County/Bucharest Municipality Directorate for Pre-university Education (former school inspectorates at county/Bucharest Municipality level). Therefore, the legal framework favours face-to-face education and does not provide for a model of online education that could be employed in parallel with face-to-face education, except for force majeure situations.

The mention, in paragraph 22 regarding the actual number of persons belonging to the Roma minority in Romania is, in our view, lacking proper substantiation. The explanation offered in footnote 18, according to which "*information collected during the on-the-spot visit shows that the number of persons belonging to the Roma minority in Romania is two to three times higher than the provisional result of the latest census, with at least 6% of the population in each county*" is not based on official statistical data, used in any official report.

[249] Paragraph 16 of the evaluation report.

In our opinion, such a statement needs to be backed by accurate information from reliable sources, but since no details on the type and nature of such information, nor its sources were provided, **we consider that the respective statement and the corresponding footnote should not have been included in the report**.

In the same paragraph, COMEX encourages the authorities to continue to regularly update textbooks, *with the help of the National Center for Roma Culture - Romano-Kher*. Regarding this aspect, we would like to point out the fact that the school textbooks used in the Romanian pre-university system are approved by the Ministry of Education, after a well-defined procedure regulated by Order of the minister of education, as presented in the context of the on-the-spot visit.

Concerning paragraph 23, we stress that **the monitoring carried out under the Charter should not be linked to the Member States' joining of the Observatory on History Teaching in Europe/OHTE**.

While appreciating the efforts entailed by the creation of the Observatory on History Teaching in Europe/OHTE, Romania had some reservations related to it, which led to the decision of not becoming a founding State of OHTE.

For the time being, Romania maintains its position concerning the Observatory. This does not exclude a possible subsequent accession of Romania to the Partial Agreement if the activity of the Observatory will prove beneficial from the perspective of our country's interests.

Regarding paragraph 26, as well as the evaluation of partial fulfilment of Article 8.1.i in relation to the majority of minority languages covered by Part II and Part III of the Charter, we would like to draw the attention to the fact that school inspectorates include, in their annual reports on the state of education in the respective county and in Bucharest municipality, information or even a standalone section reporting on the state of the education provided for persons belonging to national minorities or relevant information thereof. These reports are public and available on the school inspectorates' websites.

In addition, based on these reports that the school inspectorates must submit to the Ministry of Education, an annual national report on the state of the pre-university education in Romania is drafted by the Ministry of Education and published on its website, which includes a section dedicated to the education provided to persons belonging to national minorities (e.g. https://www.edu.ro/sites/default/files/_fi%C8%99iere/Minister/2022/Transparenta/Starea_invatamantului/Raport-Starea-invatamantului-preuniversitar-2021-2022.pdf http://www.isjiasi.ro/documente/interes%20public/01_Starea%20invatamantului%20preuniversitar%20iesean%202021-2022.pdf).

- ***Use of the regional of minority languages by judicial authorities***

Regarding paragraph 27, in which COMEX mentions "there are no data on the use, free of charge, of minority languages in practice", we remind the Committee that **such data was communicated within the Romanian Government's answer to the questionnaire** sent in the context of the on-the-spot visit (see pages 21 - 24 of said answer).

As concerns paragraph 30, we inform the Committee that we are examining the possibility of amending the legislation for the purposes of the report.

- ***Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities***

COMEX considers that the 20% threshold "is too high and, if applied in an inflexible manner, deprives many speakers of minority languages of the full protection enshrined in the Charter" (pages 6, 11 and 12 - paragraphs 32 and 35).

It is however understood that stipulating such a criterion - in the form of a percentage - is part of the margin of appreciation of the States. Furthermore, it has not been highlighted so far that the threshold established in the Romanian legislation would, in any way, affect the protection regime granted by the Romanian authorities to the national minorities on its territory. Thus, for the Romanian authorities, "the number of residents" that justifies the measures provided in Article 10 of the Charter translates into the threshold of *at least 20%* of the inhabitants of a certain administrative territorial unit.

- ***Use of the regional or minority languages in the media***

Under this chapter, we salute the mentioning, by the COMEX, that "Overall, the offer of radio programmes in minority languages is satisfactory."

Concerning paragraph 41 (second phrase), the accurate information is as follows:
Radio Romania broadcast a national programme in AM, 6.5 hours per week in Hungarian and German respectively. Radio Cluj and Radio Târgu Mureş broadcast full daily programmes in Hungarian. Radio Constanța, Radio Reşiţa, Radio Iași and Radio Timişoara cover together 15 minority languages, with programmes ranging between 30 and 60 minutes per day/ week.

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Romania

The Government of Romania notes that, in the case of some minority languages, the statistical data included in the report **concerning the education field** do not match the data of the Ministry of Education, as reflected below:

- Paragraph 91: According to the statistical data of the Ministry of Education, the number of pupils receiving education in Hungarian in the school year 2021/2022 was 147,197 pupils (31,429 at pre-school level, 48,403 at primary education level, 38,294 in gymnasium, 22,890 pupils in high school and 6,181 in VET) vs. 140,425 mentioned in the report;
- Paragraph 116: According to the statistical data of the Ministry of Education, in 2021/22, 632 children and pupils (vs. approx. 800, as mentioned in the report) studied in mother tongue Romani, while the bilingual teaching methods (Romanian-Romani and Romani-Hungarian) are employed in pre-school education. Also, in the school year 2021/2022, Romani language (including teaching in Romani and the study of the language) was taught in 37 counties and in Bucharest (vs. 39 counties mentioned in the report).
- Paragraph 137: According to the statistical data of the Ministry of Education, the number of pupils receiving education in Slovak in the school year 2021/2022 was of 598 pupils (206 at pre-school level, 157 at primary education level, 123 in gymnasium and 112 pupils in high school) vs. 612 (231 pupils at pre-school level; 179 pupils at primary school level; 91 pupils in Gymnasium, 111 pupils at high school level), mentioned in the report.

We noticed several cases where the experts mentioned the number of teachers employed in the education for the persons belonging to the national minorities (e.g. paragraph 66 regarding **Croatian**, paragraph 72 regarding **Czech**, paragraph 78 regarding **German**, paragraph 101 regarding **Italian**, paragraph 110 regarding **Polish**, paragraph 116 (footnote 107) regarding **Romani**, paragraph 137 regarding **Slovak**, paragraph 150 regarding **Turkish**. However, the Ministry of Education collects data on the statutory teaching hours (in Romanian language "norme didactice") and the situation for the school year 2022/2023 was provided in the Romanian Government's answer to the questionnaire.[250]

Other inaccuracies noticed:

- Paragraph 88 concerning Greek: the teaching of the mother tongue is provided in 5 counties and in Bucharest, as part of the education provided to persons belonging to the national minorities. In this sense, **the Greek language is not "an optional subject" but a compulsory one** for the students that have requested the study of mother tongue and the other minority specific school subjects. In the school year 2021/2022, the number of children that studied Greek mother tongue was that of 181. In addition, lectureships for the teaching of Greek language function in both the „Alexandru Ioan Cuza" University, **as well as in the University of Bucharest**;

[250] See pages 8 and 9 of the Romanian Government's answer to the questionnaire, sent to the Secretariat of the Charter on 18 April 2023.

- Paragraph 158 concerning Ukrainian: the evaluation report mentions that “there exists a technical and vocational education offer in Ukrainian in three counties”, but in reality vocational education is provided in only one county (Maramureș);
- For the weekly number of hours allocated to the teaching of minority language in schools with teaching in the minority language and in schools with a different language of teaching, respectively, please see the abovementioned answer of the Romanian Government to the questionnaire (they differ depending on the language of teaching - mother tongue vs. Romanian or other teaching language), as well as from one cycle of education to another). We found inaccuracies regarding Romani (page 27) and Slovak (page 32).

With regard to the information ***concerning the media field***, please find below some inaccuracies noticed in the evaluation report:

In paragraph 82 (second phrase), the accurate information is as follows:
Radio România (6,5 hours per week at national scale), Radio Târgu Mureș (12 hours per week), Radio Timişoara (14 hours per week), Radio Reșița (30 minutes per week) also provide programmes in German.

In paragraph 94 (first phrase), the accurate data is the following:
Two public radio stations, Radio Târgu Mureș and Radio Cluj broadcast exclusively 2 programmes in Hungarian, 24h/24h. Radio Romania brodcast a national programme in AM, 6,5 hours per week a weekly programmes in Hungarian - Radio Reşiţa and Radio Timişoara (14 hours per week in Hungarian), unlike public television channels.

In paragraph 115 (last phrase), the accurate information is as follows:
Radio Târgu-Mureş broadcasts programmes dedicated to the Roma national minority, 140 minutes per week (vs. 120 minutes, mentioned in the evaluation report), mostly in Romanian, occasionally in Romani.

Chapter 2 Compliance of Romania with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

Under this chapter, we underline that the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by the regional or minority language, as provided by Article 8.1.g. of the Charter, is ensured for the following national minorities: Bulgarian, Czech, Croatian, German, Italian, Hungarian, Greek, Polish, Roma, Russian, Serbian, Slovak, Turkish, and Ukrainian, as part of the national curriculum. Thus, the study of the school subject the History and tradition of the national minorities (for each of the minorities mentioned) is compulsory for all pupils attending education in the corresponding minority language or having requested the study of the respective minority language. The discipline is studied in 6th and 7th grades.

Having this in mind, **we consider that the recommendation on “raising awareness about national minorities of Romania and their language, culture and history in the general curriculum” may be considered fulfilled**.

As regards the *recommendations on providing enough number of teachers*, we would like to inform the Committee of Experts that the level of salaries for the teaching profession has been increased this year and we hope that this measure, as well as the modernisation of the school infrastructure and the reform of the teaching career, will contribute to the increase of the attractiveness of the teaching career, including for the positions in the education for persons belonging to the national minorities.

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

Regarding the *first recommendation* (“reconsider the thresholds for the official use of minority languages in administration”), please see comments presented at pages 6 and 7 on this issue.

Concerning the *second recommendation* (“ensure that classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold complete the full cycle of education without the need for an annual approval”), mentioned with regard to Croatian, Czech, Polish, Serbian and Slovak, we stress the following:

The annual approval of the classes set in derogation to the minimum threshold **has never led to situations affecting the continuation and completion of a full cycle of education in the language of national minorities**. **The procedure** (namely the annual approval) **is applied to the entire education system**, the planning of the educational network being done on an annual basis. The Government Decision on the number of places in the whole educational network is approved annually, based on a comprehensive consultation at the local level. In addition, **the financial allocation is also planned and executed on an annual basis**. The aim of this measure is to ensure compliance with the legal framework and, at the same time, ensure that the schools operating with such classes receive the funding and the human resources necessary for their activity.