Report of the Committee on Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence of the Conference of INGOs
General Assembly of 25 and 26 April 2023

Name of the Committee: "Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence

Date of the report: March 28, 2023

- Name and contact information of the author of the report:

Gilbert FLAM
gflam@licra.org

1- Name and e-mail address of the Committee Chairman

Gilbert FLAM
gflam@licra.org

2- Name and address of the Committee secretaries

Manuèle Amar
manuele.amar@gmail.com
Jean-Pierre Gonon
jeanclaude.gonon@gmail.com

3- INGOs represented in the Committee

International League against Racism and Anti-Semitism (LICRA),
European Forum for Urban Security, European Association of Judges (AEM),
Robert Schuman Institute for Europe (IRSE),
University Women of Europe (UWE),
Association Française des Femmes Diplômées des Universités(AFFDU), French branch of UWE,
European Federation of Research and Information Centers on Sectarianism, FECRIS,
European Observatory for non-discrimination and fundamental rights (OENDDF),
Reporters Without Borders (RSF),
International Council of Jewish Women (ICJW),
EUROGEO,
Federation for Education in Europe / Fédération Européenne Des Ecoles, FEDE,
Robert Schuman European Centre ECWF,
International Confederation of Intellectual Workers, CITI,

Association of Economic and Technical Cybernetics, AFCET
European Association of Teachers, AEDE,
Simon Wiesenthal Center-Europe,
AVE-Europe,
Lifelong Learning Platform,
European Social Action Network, ESAN,

4- In which committees and other activities of the Council of Europe is this Committee mainly involved?

The Committee maintains, through the activity of its members or directly, relations with :

CDEDU, CDCPP, OHTE, the European HISTOLAB project and GRECO through FEDE,

CDADI, CDCP and the expert committees on hate speech and hate crime through LICRA,

The expert committee on building media resilience (MSI-RES)

Moreover, during a General Assembly of the Conference of INGOs, the President of the Conference informed us that the representative of the Conference of INGOs in the "Commission on Artificial Intelligence" of the Council of Europe had expressed her interest in the work of the Committee on Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence and that she wished to participate in the work of our Committee. The President of the Committee "Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence" and the INGO members of this Committee will welcome her and her INGO with interest as soon as she wishes to participate in our work.
For the sake of coherence, it seems very useful that she allows us to be informed of the work carried out within the "Commission on Artificial Intelligence" (CAI), which succeeded the CAHAI, and to know the positions she defends on behalf of the Conference.

5- How can new members join the Committee?

They can do so by contacting the three email addresses below:

gflam@licra.org
manuele.amar@gmail.com
jeanclaude.gonon@gmail.com

6- What else can the Standing Committee and the Conference Secretariat do to support the work of the Committee and communications between the Committee and the Conference Secretariat?

The Standing Committee and the Secretariat of the Conference of INGOs should obtain from the Secretariat of the Council of Europe that the webinars organized by the Committee "Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence" and the other accounts of the INGOs be supported, especially in terms of interpretation, when representatives of the bodies of the Council of Europe are invited (Secretariat General, Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, Congress of Regions and Local Authorities) and when European and international organizations are involved in the organization of the webinars or are invited to participate.

7- Projects for next year (2023/2024)

The Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence Committee wishes to extend its activity for another year.
The reflection carried out by our Committee is in line with the concerns of the Committee of Ministers and the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe. These two bodies have noted the decisive character of artificial intelligence for the future of humanity and, at the same time, have expressed their concern about the poorly understood effects of the growing use of artificial intelligence technologies on human beings and on the functioning of our societies.

Two years ago, we proposed to you to conduct our own reflection within the Conference and to question ourselves on the positive and negative effects of the methods of construction of algorithms and the impact of the uses of artificial intelligence on the functioning of institutions, on democratic processes as well as on the social and political behavior of citizens. We are, indeed, all confronted with these questions in our professional and associative practices which cover many fields, in particular education, health, security, disinformation or information manipulation...

We organized a first webinar to learn about and compare the approaches of the European Union, the Council of Europe and UNESCO. Our second bilingual French-English webinar entitled "Use of Artificial Intelligence in Education and Education to Artificial Intelligence" allowed us to address the following topics:
AI for equitable and inclusive education management and implementation ;
AI in the service of empowering teachers and their teaching ;
AI for learning and assessment of learning;
Developing the values and skills needed in life and work in the AI era;
AI as a means to provide lifelong learning opportunities for all ;
The possible contribution of INGOs to ensure the right to education as a public responsibility, in a world increasingly impacted by digital technologies.

A 51-minute podcast in VO has been produced by the FEDE to allow those interested to listen or listen again to the best moments of this webinar by clicking on this link: https://www.fede.education/journee-detudes/

We wish to continue the work started in two other particularly sensitive areas, information and security. The Committee proposes to organize in 2023 and 2024: two initiatives, in the form of a webinar or a "face-to-face" seminar if possible:
"Artificial Intelligence and Media",
"Artificial Intelligence and Security".

The Committee decided to keep its president

8- Activity report

Our initial work shows that :

AI is a technology in constant and rapid mutation and progress and that it penetrates, with a strong impact, all sectors of social, economic, cultural and informational life.

The computing power of computers is increasing rapidly and considerably, allowing the processing of increasingly large amounts of data and making it very difficult to draw up legal rules to protect the rights of citizens.

The biases developed by the algorithms can lead to discriminations reinforcing the inequality of sex and gender and the social determinism of education.

Finally, it appears that the reflections carried out in the different institutions, especially in terms of AI regulation, only marginally integrate the place and role of civil society and its representative organizations.

The continuation of our work in 2023/2024 must allow us to make proposals to the Conference to specify:

What the place and role of civil society can be in the elaboration and implementation of legal rules regulating the development and uses of AI;

How to enrich the actions and programs of the Council of Europe, especially in terms of digital citizenship education;

How to address teachers and students to return to a rational and critical approach and make them aware that AI is not a magical and neutral tool, which would be able to provide solutions to all problems;

How to foster inclusion in the information and communication technologies sector, providing education and training opportunities for women and people from marginalized groups. This will help create a more inclusive and egalitarian digital environment and prevent gender inequalities in the online world.

Please find attached the elements of the first two webinars organized by the Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence Committee

Summary note
Webinar of January 10, 2022 organized by the Committee "Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence" of the Conference of INGOs of the Council of Europe

The Committee on Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence (CHRAI) of the Conference of INGOs (COING) of the Council of Europe (CoE) aims to propose a common position to the INGOs of the Conference on artificial intelligence (AI).

The aim is to address the issue of its use and its effects, both positive and negative, as well as its impact on human rights in the various fields of activity of INGOs, including education, health, justice, security, the fight against hate speech on the Internet, information and its manipulation. In fine, the aim is to propose a Resolution or a Declaration to be adopted by the members of the INGO during a plenary session at the end of the work of the Committee " human rights and artificial intelligence ".

*. *
*

To advance on these various reflections, the DHIA Committee organized this webinar to present the work of three international bodies on artificial intelligence (AI).

The European Commission's proposal for a regulation,
the latest conclusions of the Ad Hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAHAI) of the Council of Europe,
the Recommendation on the ethics of AI adopted in 2021 by UNESCO.

Three speakers gave participants a better understanding of how these three organizations analyze and define AI. They also showed how, and with what instruments, their organizations plan to protect human rights and regulate the research, development and applications of these new technologies.

First, Kilian Gross (Head of the Artificial Intelligence Policy Development and Coordination Unit at the European Commission's DG CONNECT) presented the European Commission's proposal for a regulation to regulate artificial intelligence. This proposal aims to build a set of harmonized rules in the EU applicable to the design, marketing and use of AI systems; to build confidence and minimize risks before AI systems can be used in the EU; to create innovation-friendly regulation to intervene only when risks to safety and fundamental rights arise; to provide legal clarity and certainty for individuals and businesses; and to create a level playing field for both operators and users. Overall, this proposal aims to provide a framework in the EU for the development of the AI market and to anticipate the problems arising from the use of these new technologies. In the coming months, this proposal will be discussed and amended by the European Parliament and the European Council.

In a second step, Thomas Schneider (Swiss Ambassador to the CoE and member of the CAHAI Bureau) presented the latest CAHAI conclusions. The Ad Hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAHAI) of the CoE was established in 2019 under the authority of the Committee of Ministers. It is tasked with examining, on the basis of broad multi-stakeholder consultations, the feasibility and potential elements of a legal framework for the development, design and application of AI, based on CoE standards in the field of human rights, democracy and the rule of law. The objective is to create an appropriate legal framework combining binding and non-binding legal instruments, as well as a cross-cutting binding instrument that can set out common general principles contextualized to apply

to the AI environment and using a risk-based approach. This instrument could be combined with other sectoral instruments to address the challenges posed by AI systems in specific sectors. The Committee of Ministers will review and take note of the results of the CAHAI's work in early 2022, with a view to launching negotiations on the legal framework in May 2022.

Finally, Mariagrazia Squicciarini (Head of the Executive Office of UNESCO's Social and Human Sciences Sector) represented by one of her collaborators, outlined the Recommendation on the Ethics of AI adopted in November 2021 by 193 UNESCO Member States. As decisions in the public and private sectors are increasingly made based on analytics provided by AI, this Recommendation aims to ensure that these technologies have more inclusive, diverse and equitable outcomes. The document calls on member countries to put in place robust enforcement mechanisms and remedies to ensure that human rights and fundamental freedoms are respected in the digital world, as they are in the physical world. The position paper rests on a solid ethical foundation, recognizing that ethical governance encompasses both existing human rights, anchored in binding international law, and moral obligations that have yet to be codified.

Appendix II

Proceedings of the webinar "Education and Artificial Intelligence (AI)"
November 22, 2022 from 2:00 to 4:00 p.m.

The Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence (HRAI) Committee of the Conference of INGOs of the Council of Europe (CoE) and the European Federation of Schools (FEDE) organized a two-hour webinar with simultaneous interpretation in French and English on November 22, 2022 on the topic "Education and Artificial Intelligence (AI): Use of Artificial Intelligence in Education and Artificial Intelligence Education".

In 2020, pandemic-related school closures triggered a rush to adopt educational technologies, including AI-assisted teaching tools. According to UNESCO's 2021 report "Artificial Intelligence (AI) and Education: a guide for policymakers," AI will be worth an estimated US$6 billion in education by 2024. AI is increasingly impacting education, generating opportunities but also many challenges. Yet AI education is not only about teaching and learning with AI, but also about teaching and learning about AI (the ability to understand AI, i.e., AI literacy), addressing both the technological dimension and the human dimension, which is often overlooked in AI. Indeed, AI has an impact on privacy, and this aspect has not yet been fully explored.

This webinar presented a critical analysis of the academic evidence, myths and hype around AI, and addressed both teaching with AI, but also learning from AI. The discussions aimed to answer several questions of interest to education stakeholders, students, and INGO representatives working on these issues, including these:

- Is the development of AI and its uses disrupting the education sector?

- What is the impact of AI on the pedagogical triangle "teachers, learners and knowledge"?

- Knowing that the law is a long-term process while technology evolves in immediacy, what recommendations should policy makers make to regulate the use of AI in education?

To address these various issues, the following experts presented their views:

- Mr. Ahmet-Murat KILIC, Program Director, Education Department, Council of Europe;

- Mr. Wayne HOLMES, Associate Professor at University College London, lead author of the Council of Europe report "AI and Education: A Critical View through the Lens of Human Rights, Democracy and the Rule of Law" (October 2022), co-editor of "The Ethics of Artificial Intelligence. Practices, Challenges and Debates" (August 2022), and co-author of the UNESCO report "AI and Education - A Guide for Policy Makers" (2021);

- Mr. Jean-Noël VALLEE, University Professor - Hospital Practitioner, Head of the Neuro Imaging and Brain Stimulation Department, Vision Neurosciences, 15-20 Hôpital National de la Vision, Vision Institute, IHU FOReSIGHT, Université Paris-Saclay - UVSQ, American Institute of Mathematical Sciences;

- Ms. Janice RICHARDSON, Expert at Insight SA in digital citizenship education, member of the advisory boards of social networking companies SnapChat, Meta (Facebook & Instagram), Twitter. Author of the Handbook on Digital Citizenship Education (Council of Europe) and the Guidelines on Global Citizenship for Teachers (UNESCO) ;

- Mr. Ross CREELMAN, Head of Public Policy at the European Telecommunications Network Operators Association (ETNO), following the work of the EU AI policy;

- Mr. Manuel FEREIRA and Mr. Abdelhalim RAFRAFI, PhDs in artificial intelligence and professors at the French school Nextech (member of the FEDE).

Ahmet-Murat KILIC introduced the topic by presenting the Council of Europe (CoE) programs on AI and digital citizenship education from a policy perspective. He questioned how INGOs can contribute to ensuring the right to education as a public responsibility, in a digitally or technologically enriched world. In addition, he summarized the findings of the CoE Report entitled "Artificial Intelligence and Education: a critical view through the lens of human rights, democracy and the rule of law". You can download this CoE report published in October 2022 by clicking here: https://www.coe.int/fr/web/education/-/new-isbn-publication-artificial-intelligence-and-education

This report was written in large part by Wayne HOLMES, one of the world's most recognized specialists on these issues. Believing that AI-assisted tools are increasingly being used in classrooms without any independent evidence of their effectiveness, he presented some thoughts on how to ensure that young people are properly protected when interacting with AI-assisted business tools.

Janice RICHARDSON presented the links between AI and education, then the issues related to the use of AI in education and the many challenges that the generalization of AI could imply, especially on youth. She insisted on the fact that education can enable learners to understand and fully respect their rights and responsibilities in an increasingly rich and rapidly changing digital world.

Then, Jean-Noël VALLEE addressed the issue from a scientific point of view and presented his research work in neuroscience, under the following angle: "From the digital twin of living systems in health to the hypothesis of the digital twin of cognitive learning processes for a personalized education".

Then Ross CREELMAN presented the work of the European Telecommunications Network Operators Association (ETNO), a European federation of employers in the sector that is recognized by the EU institutions. He addressed the issue of skills, including the shortage of skilled AI workers in telecom companies in Europe.

To conclude, Manuel FEREIRA and Abdelhalim RAFRAFI gave an overview of the acculturation to AI and presented their vision of AI pedagogy, especially with students at the end of their university studies who will create future AI tools and participate in their dissemination in many areas.

This webinar was a great success with many professors, learners and INGO representatives. 350 registrations were validated by actual webinar tracking but many schools had organized the viewing in classrooms containing several dozen students. In this context, it is estimated that between 500 and 600 people were made aware of this complex issue that is still little known to the general public.

You can find all the PowerPoint presentations of the 7 experts who spoke and watch the video recording of the webinar in French or in English at this link: https://www.fede.education/journee-detudes/

**The Human Rights and Artificial Intelligence (HRAI) Committee
of the Conference of INGOs of the Council of Europe**