



G R E T A

Group of Experts on Action
against Trafficking in Human Beings

GRETA(2010)1rev_ISR_rep

Reply from Israel to the Questionnaire for the evaluation of the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by the Parties

First evaluation round

Reply submitted on 1 August 2023



**Israel's reply to Questionnaire for the evaluation
of the implementation
of the Council of Europe Convention
on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by the Parties**

First evaluation round

Adopted by the Group of Experts
on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings
(GRETA)
on 1 February 2010

Preliminary Questions

- **Question 1:** Please specify which State body/agency was responsible for co-ordinating and collecting the replies to this questionnaire. Please specify the name and professional title of the person heading this State body/agency. Please indicate if this person is the “contact person” appointed by your country to liaise with GRETA or a different person.

The replies to this questionnaire were coordinated and collected by the National Anti-Trafficking Unit (NATU) in the Ministry of Justice. The unit is headed by the National Anti-Trafficking Coordinator, Adv. Dina Dominitz, who is the GRETA contact person for Israel.

- **Question 2:** Which State bodies/agencies contributed to responding to this questionnaire? Please indicate the main responsibilities and/or fields of competence of each of these bodies/agencies.

The Ministry of National Security

Contains the Police and the Israeli Prison Service, and heads the implementation team on prosecution efforts.

The Police

The Police Anti-Trafficking Coordinating Unit (hereinafter: the "PTC") is in charge of examining cases referred to it by different authorities and identifying victims of trafficking, as well as being a guiding body in investigations and training.

The Police Prosecution Unit (Lahav)

The criminal prosecution unit within the Police is responsible for the prosecution of certain offences against foreign workers such as restrictions on movement, false imprisonment, exploitation, fraud, withholding a passport, sexual harassment and other sexual offenses, violent offenses and forgery, which fall under the jurisdiction of the Magistrate Court (the court of first instance for certain criminal offenses).

The Ministry of Justice

The State Attorney's Office

The State Attorney's Office is The State of Israel's principal civil and criminal prosecuting authority.

The Legal Aid Administration (LAA)

The Legal Aid Administration is a unit within the MOJ. It provides free legal aid to victims of trafficking in civil procedures and in certain administrative procedures. While it is part of the GOI, it enjoys independence and files suits or petitions against the GOI on behalf of the victims, when necessary.

The Deputy Attorney General (International Law)

The Deputy Attorney General (International Law) in the MOJ, is, *inter alia*, responsible for providing government authorities with legal counsel on matters of international human rights law and certain aspects of international criminal law standards, including trafficking in persons. In this capacity, the division participates in decision-making governmental forums with regard to immigration, trafficking in persons and related issues.

The Deputy Attorney General (Criminal Law)

The office of the deputy Attorney General (Criminal Law) in the MOJ is in charge, *inter alia*, of legislation and interpretation related to the offences of trafficking in persons.

The Administrator General

The Forfeiture Unit under the Administrator General manages the dedicated forfeiture fund for victims of trafficking and slavery.

The Population and Immigration Authority (PIBA)

PIBA is a body operating within the Ministry of Interior, and the bodies involved in anti-trafficking work include:

- (1) The Border Control Administration** is responsible for monitoring exits and entrances to Israel
- (2) Special Populations Unit:** responsible for deciding upon the issuance of special visas for victims of trafficking, as well as organizing training for all PIBA officials on their role in recognizing and fighting trafficking in persons.
- (3) The Employer and Foreign Worker Service Administration (hereinafter: the "Permits Unit")** is in charge of issuing, denying and suspending permits for the employment or recruitment of foreign workers. The Permits Unit is also in charge of revoking or limiting such permits where there have been violations of labor regulations or other arrangements.
- (4) The PIBA Enforcement Unit** is responsible for detaining illegal foreigners and conducting hearings consequent to which they are released or placed in a detention facility prior to removal from Israel. It is also in charge of supervising compliance with the legal requirements relating to the labor conditions of foreign workers investigating violations. The PIBA enforcement unit includes the **Refugee Status Determination Unit (RSD)** which reviews applications for refugee status. **(4) The Prosecution Unit** is in charge of the prosecution of criminal offenses that involve labor violations and, in certain cases, the living conditions of foreign workers.

(5) The Bilateral Agreements Unit - once such agreements are signed and ratified, this unit is responsible for implementing them *vis a vis* the relevant country of origin.

(6) The PIBA Supervisors of Social Workers: These PIBA officials are in charge of supervising the social workers who are employed by the licensed manpower companies permitted to recruit foreign workers in the caregiving field. The Supervisors conduct periodic review visits to the homes of elderly and disabled persons who employ foreign caregivers or wish to employ such persons, in order to monitor employment conditions and match employers to foreign caregivers.

The Ministry of Labour

The Ministry of Labour (MoL) is responsible for monitoring, investigating and prosecuting violations of the labour laws that apply to all workers in Israel, including foreign workers, such as: Minimum Wage Law 5747-1987, Work and Rest Hours Law 5711-1951, Protection of Wages Law 5718-1958, etc.

Furthermore, both the MoL Enforcement Division and the PIBA Enforcement and Prosecution Units are responsible for the enforcement of the Foreign Workers Law, which includes provisions requiring that foreign workers be given proper labor and living conditions including, for example, health insurance etc.

The enforcement is conducted either by means of criminal indictments or by imposing administrative fines. The MoL Enforcement Division conducts routine training sessions for labor inspectors and operates according to the guiding principles provided by the NATU. It also collaborates with other enforcement authorities in investigations of cases of trafficking in persons.

• *The Commissioner for Foreign Workers' Labor Rights*

The Commissioner is responsible for receiving complaints and inquiries from foreign workers regarding violations of labor laws, monitoring employment conditions, providing foreign workers with information and advice on the application of various laws, providing information regarding their status as indicated in the records of the Ministry of Interior and providing general information on labor rights.

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs (the MFA)

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs is responsible for Israel's consulates and embassies abroad, and is also responsible for coordinating Israel's bilateral labor agreements for foreign workers.

- Question 3: Did any non-governmental organisations (NGOs) or other entities of civil society contribute to responding to this questionnaire? If so, please indicate the main activities of each of the NGOs and/or other entities of civil society which contributed.

CIMI

CIMI operates the PIBA Call Center for Foreign Workers. The PIBA has contracted CIMI to administer a call center for the workers who arrive in Israel as part of these agreements (as well as those coming in via the foreign construction companies and other workers), whose purpose is to reply and take care of their questions and complaints. Upon their arrival to Israel, every foreign worker receives a card which includes the contact details of the call center and the various officials that they may contact whenever necessary. The call center receives complaints, in various foreign languages spoken by the workers employed in Israel.

Keshet

The dedicated shelters for victims of trafficking (hereinafter referred to as "the shelters" or "the shelters for victims of trafficking"), are operated by an independent, non-profit NGO (Keshet), while receiving their funding from the GOI and operating under the supervision of the MWSS. The Ma'agan Shelter houses female victims of trafficking and the Atlas Center houses male victims. Family apartments are also available for victims with children.

Mesila

The National Center for survivors of slavery and human trafficking was established on August 25, 2013 by the MLSS and it provides state-funded services for victims while they are staying in the community – either before entering the shelter, as an alternative to the shelter, or as a follow-up service after their term in the shelter has ended.

I: Integration of the core concepts and definitions contained in the Convention in the internal law of the parties

Section I.1. Integration of the Human Rights approach to action against trafficking in human beings

As stipulated in the Convention, trafficking in human beings (hereinafter "THB") "constitutes a violation of human rights and an offence to the dignity and the integrity of the human being" (third paragraph of the Preamble of the Convention). Therefore in the letter and in the spirit of the Convention, THB is a violation of human rights and not just a criminal offence.

- **Question 4:** Please indicate if, in your internal law, THB is considered as a human rights violation (or only a criminal offence, see Section II.3. below).

The Israeli law sees trafficking in persons as a violation of the principle of human dignity. This can be seen in many guidelines, judicial decisions and publications. For example, the State Attorney Guideline 2.2 says that "Law enforcement must combat trafficking in persons or brokerage for trafficking for prostitution [...]"

based on the acknowledgement of human dignity and the central tenets of the Israeli judicial system". See also the Supreme Court decision in [Criminal Appeal 1196/02](#):

" Gone are the dark days when it was possible to view a person as the property of someone else. A human being's humanity prevents him/her from being used as an object in which property rights may be acquired. People are born free, and their right to liberty is protected by fundamental human rights, those that they are enacted into legislation and those about which not a single word has been written. The amendment to the Penal Law is based on those values which our legal system has now grounded in the Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty. These fundamental principles do not allow "business transactions" in a person's body, and a human being cannot be the subject of another person's property."

We would also note that the trafficking offences are in the Israeli Penal Law under the section "deprivation of liberty".

In addition, Israel is party to several conventions that see the commission of trafficking in persons as a violation of fundamental rights, including Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), the Convention for the Eradication of Racial Discrimination (CERD) and the Convention of the Rights of the Child (CRC) and its Optional Protocol on the Sale, Prostitution and Pornography of Children (CRC-OP-SC).

- *Question 5*: Please indicate what special legal protection exists under your internal law (including case law, if any) in cases of violations of human rights, which would apply in cases of THB (for example, constitutional protection, positive obligation of the state, priority examination, etc.).

Under Israeli Law, violations of the [Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty](#) are permitted only if they meet the conditions in Article 8:

One is not to violate the rights accorded by this Basic Law save by means of a law that corresponds to the values of the State of Israel, which serves an appropriate purpose, and to an extent that does not exceed what is required, or on the basis of a law, as aforementioned, by force of an explicit authorization therein.

The basic law protects the preservation and protection of life, body and dignity, the protection of property, intimacy and privacy and personal liberty. Those affected by an act or policy who they believe infringes on their rights according to the Law may petition the Supreme Court and request the violating law be struck down. This right is also extended to "public petitioners" such as NGOs, who may also have standing to file such a petition.

Section I.2. Comprehensive approach to THB, co-ordination of all actors and actions to prevent and combat THB and to protect its victims, and international co-operation

Questions in this section aim to obtain information concerning the comprehensive nature of the legal framework and policies on action against THB established by the parties to the Convention covering

measures on prevention, protection and prosecution (Article 1) as well as on partnerships (Articles 29, 32 and 35).

- These partnerships should comprise:
- national co-ordination and co-operation among all national actors involved in action against THB (Article 29-2). Any national action to combat THB must be comprehensive and multi-sectorial, and take on board the required multidisciplinary expertise. This comprehensive national action must be co-ordinated through a specific governmental body or entity. These are the “co-ordinating bodies” referred to in Article 29 of the Convention which are distinct from “National Rapporteurs”. In accordance with the Convention it is compulsory to ensure co-ordination of the national policies and actions (“shall”), whereas the appointment of National Rapporteurs is optional (“shall consider appointing ...”).
- international co-operation among all actors from different parties (Chapter VI of the Convention). Article 32 sets out the general principles which are to govern international co-operation. Firstly the parties must co-operate with one another “to the widest extent possible”. This principle requires them to provide extensive co-operation to one another and to minimise impediments to the smooth and rapid flow of information and evidence internationally. Article 32 contains the general part of the obligation to co-operate: co-operation must include the prevention of and combat against THB (first indent), the protection of and assistance to victims (second indent) and to investigations or proceedings concerning criminal offences established in accordance with the Convention (third indent), i.e. the offences established in conformity with Articles 18, 20 and 21.
- co-operation and partnership with civil society (Article 35). The strategic partnership referred to in Article 35 between State authorities and public officials and civil society means the setting-up of co-operative frameworks through which state actors fulfil their obligations under the Convention, by co-ordinating their efforts with civil society. Co-operation with international non-governmental organisations active in the field of prevention and protection of the victims of THB is also needed.

Questions concerning the comprehensive approach to THB (Article 1):

- *Question 6:* Please indicate the titles of the main internal legal provisions and/or regulations containing measures to prevent THB, to protect and assist its victims, and to criminalise THB and prosecute traffickers.

The main provisions include:

Legislation

[The Anti-Trafficking Law \(Legislative Amendments\) 5766-2006](#)

Penal Law 5737-1977

Legal Aid Law, 5732-1972

Criminal Procedure Law 5742-1982

Criminal Procedure Amendment Law (Examination of Witnesses) 5718-1957

International Legal Assistance Law, 5758-1998

Limiting Use of Premises in order to prevent the Commission of Crime Law, 5765-2005

Crime Victims' Rights Law, 5761-2001

[Prohibition on Money Laundering Law, 5760-2000](#)

Courts (Consolidated Version) Law, 5744-1984

Law Prohibiting the Consumption of Prostitution (Temporary Provision and Legislative Amendment) 5779-2019

Regulations

The Penal Regulations (the Methods of Managing the Special Fund for dealing with forfeited property and fines imposed in cases of trafficking and holding in conditions of slavery), 5769-2009

Government Resolutions

Government Resolution No. 1886 of 2.10.2022: Promoting the Rights of Victims of Crimes and Improving the Government Response

Government Resolution No. 1862 of 18.9.2022: Multi-year Implementation Plan for Combatting Trafficking in Persons, and Amending Previous Resolutions

Government Resolution No. 956 of 13.4.2021: Approval of the State of Israel's accession to the Council of Europe Convention on Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings

Government Resolution No. 4463 of 13.1.2019: National Plan to Combat Human Trafficking 2019 - 2024 and Amending Previous Resolutions

Government Resolution No. 4462 of 13.1.2019: Adopting the Recommendations of the Inter-ministerial Team for the Reduction of the Consumption of Prostitution

Government Resolution no. 3709 of 3.7.2008: Ratification of the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Human Beings, Mainly Women and Children, which supplements the United Nations Convention against Transborder Organized Crime.

Government Resolution No. 4671 of 02.12.2007: Official Award for combatting human trafficking.

Government Resolution No. 2670 of 02.12.2007: National plans to combat human trafficking - and determining housing solutions for victims of slavery, trafficking for slavery and trafficking for forced labor.

Government Resolution No. 63 of 21.5.2006: establishment of a Committee of Directors General and appointment of a coordinator in the field of the fight against trafficking in persons.

Government Resolution No. 2806 of 1.12.2002: Government resolution on the establishment of a shelter

for victims of trafficking in persons for prostitution.

Internal Procedures and Guidelines (all links are in Hebrew)

Victim Recognition

[Procedure 300.25.02 of the Investigations and Intelligence Division of the Israel Police: **Submitting a request to recognize a person as a victim of human trafficking or being held in slavery conditions** \(4.10.2021\)](#)

Enforcement policy

- [State Attorney Guidance 2.32: **The policy of prosecuting victims of human trafficking, holding under conditions of slavery, and forced labor** \(2017\)](#)
- [State Attorney Guidance 2.2: **Increasing enforcement in offenses related to the practice of prostitution** \(last updated in April 2019\)](#)

Visas and status

- [Procedure 6.3.0007 of the Population and Immigration Authority: **Handling the granting of status to victims of trafficking in women for humanitarian reasons** \(June 1, 2006\)](#)
- [Procedure 6.3.0006 of the Population and Immigration Authority: **the treatment of victims of trafficking who wish to testify** \(last updated in October 2019\)](#)
- [Procedure 6.3.0008 of the Population and Immigration Authority: **Handling the granting of status to victims of slavery and human trafficking for slavery and forced labor** \(15.06.2010\)](#)

Other subjects

- [The work procedure of the committee for awarding state decoration for the fight against human trafficking \(01.01.2008\)](#)
- [The working procedure of the Advisory Committee to the Administrator Generak for the Special Fund for Crimes of Trafficking in Human Beings and Holding in Slavery Conditions \(2022\)](#)

- *Question 7:* Does your country have a comprehensive national policy and/or a National Action Plan to combat THB? If so, please indicate its title, date of adoption and duration, main fields of action and the body/bodies responsible for its implementation.

The Israeli Government has recently (September 2022) approved a five-year National Implementation Plan in Government Resolution No. 1862, included as an annex at the end of our reply. This resolution is an operative and detailed working plan that encompasses fourteen (14) Government Ministries, and many other State Authorities and bodies, including major points of action and setting sustainable goals, aimed at adapting and enhancing the tools and ability of the GOI to better tackle the current patterns of trafficking, both in the realms of increased effective and integrated enforcement, efficient and determined prevention mechanisms targeted at the vulnerable populations and structural programs that have proven susceptible in the past, and tailored streamlined array of protection and rehabilitation services for victims. The recommendations cover four main areas: prosecution, protection, prevention, and a general section of recommendations on trainings. All the recommendations in the Resolution incorporate and emphasize the victim-centered and trauma-informed approach.

The Resolution also includes a five-year research plan (budgeted at 1.5 million NIS, equivalent to approximately 370,000 Euro) to follow and monitor its implementation. The plan includes for the first time in Israel, research as to the scope and characteristics of the various patterns of TIP, and also in depth research on evaluation of protection services, on child forced labor, and other crucial areas.

Questions concerning specialised authorities, co-ordination of actors and actions against THB and international co-operation (Articles 29, 32 to 35):

- *Question 8:* In your country are there persons or entities specialised in the fight against THB and the protection of victims? If so, please describe the type and the periodicity of the training provided for these persons or the staff of these entities? Please specify the financial resources (in euros) allocated to this training.

Many of the relevant offices described above have dedicated coordinators or focal points who participate in trainings and policy discussions on trafficking. Several examples include:

- The State Attorney's Office and the Districts' Attorneys' Offices has appointed **key coordinators on a national and district level**, from the various departments – Criminal, Civil, International, Cybercrime - who specialize in the topic of trafficking in persons. These coordinators are active participants in various seminars, training sessions and international forums on the subject, and act as a focal point within their district for all trafficking and trafficking-related cases.
- **The Police Trafficking Unit (PTC)** mentioned above is a dedicated Police unit involved in directing all trafficking and trafficking related investigations, as well as coordinating Police training on these offences. The Police runs a dedicated weekly training on trafficking for Police officers and other officials annually, at least, which includes speakers from NGOs, trafficking survivors, prosecutors, NATU and more.
- **The LAA** has a dedicated coordinator on trafficking in persons, who guides policy on all LAA cases involving victims of trafficking
- Joint Task Force Police-Prosecution on TIP cases: In 2022, a new joint task force was launched to promote collaboration between the State Attorney's Office and the Police. The purpose of the task force is to strengthen the interfaces and collaboration between the investigation units, the focal points in each district as well as national Police focal points on relevant subjects, and the coordinators in the State Attorney's Office. The forum took part in training on the effects of trauma on victims from a psychiatrist, visited the shelters and heard the testimony of two victims, and learned about money laundering, financial investigations and administrative measures in trafficking cases. To facilitate the task force's work, on the 2nd of February, 2022, new guidelines were issued by the Deputy State Attorney (Criminal Matters) outlining policy for the prosecution regarding

victims of labor trafficking, outlining the indicators and red flags that characterize labor trafficking and Slavery cases. The guidelines were distributed to all the districts of the Prosecution and the Police, and to the new task force.

- **The MWSS has a dedicated coordinator** in charge of oversight of the shelters and their operations, who sets policy and addresses issues with victim placement, shelter running and other professional dilemmas.
- **The MOH has a dedicated coordinator** who similarly works with the health service providers to ensure appropriate health response for victims, and works with the shelters and the Government actors to address challenges on the individual and systematic levels.

Routine training on trafficking in persons is also widely provided to officials in all roles and ministries that may encounter victims or cases of trafficking in persons. Those include labor inspectors, border officials, social workers, cadets training for diplomatic roles and more.

- *Question 9:* Is there, within your governmental structure, a national body responsible for coordinating all national actors and actions against THB (regardless of the denomination and whether it was set up for this specific purpose or whether this responsibility was assigned to an already existing governmental body)? If so, please specify its name, administrative status, annual budget (in euros), human resources, composition and competences. If there is currently no such co-ordinating body, are there any plans to set one up in the near future? If so, please give details.

The National Anti-Trafficking Unit (NATU), headed by the National Coordinator, is the primary government agency to coordinate anti-trafficking efforts on a national scale. NATU was established according to a 2006 Government Resolution and it operates independently, under the MOJ, and reports to the CDG. All government agencies take an active part in anti-trafficking efforts, and NATU is the leading government agency in the realms of prosecution, protection and prevention. NATU serves both as a coordinating function and as a leader in policy development. Its mission is to promote cooperation between all relevant government authorities and to serve as a bridge between government authorities and non-governmental organizations, as well as with relevant international bodies. NATU's staff currently comprises ten (10) members: the NC, three legal advisors, one intern, four law students and an office manager. Its budget is approximately three million NIS (750,617 EURO).

Committee of Directors General (CDG)

The CDG is a policy-making committee established by Government Resolution. The Committee members include the Directors General or senior representatives of all the key Government Ministries that are involved in the anti-trafficking efforts, including the MOJ, MOI, the MPS, MOH, MOE, MFA, MLSS, the

Ministry of Tourism, the Ministry of Finance and the Police. The Chairperson of the Committee is the Director General of the MOJ. The CDG is assisted by four dedicated teams, on prosecution, protection, prevention and research, who formulated the recommendations in the National Plan and continue to monitor and promote its implementation.

- **Question 10:** Is this co-ordinating body also responsible for the co-ordination of the collection of administrative data or population survey data on THB? If not, please specify which body/entity has this responsibility.

NATU coordinates data collection from the relevant authorities, including victim recognition, investigation data and case numbers. It publishes the information in an [annual report to the public](#) (Hebrew link).

- **Question 11:** Do NGOs have full membership status in your national co-ordinating body? If so, how many? Please describe the criteria for NGO membership.

While NGOs are not members of NATU or the CDG, NGOs are always included and consulted with when forming anti-trafficking policy. NGOs were part of the process of building the recent Government Resolution 1862, which was formulated by four teams – Prosecution, Prevention, Protection and Research. NGOs participated as members of these teams or were invited to participate and be heard in the teams' discussions. They are also consulted and invited to provide feedback at different decision-making intersections – for example, when formulating the format of NATU's annual Report, or when considering changes to the victim recognition mechanism. In addition, in the new recognition and identification model authorized in the GOI resolution, the new advisory committee to the NC in requests for recognition as victims of THB, includes members of NGO's alongside THB survivors and GOI members. The forfeiture fund committee (see below in our response to Question #42 below) also includes representatives of the public as well as government officials.

- **Question 12:** Are there any other national or international entities or bodies participating in your national co-ordinating body? If so, please specify.

As listed above, the Directors General of many government ministries are formal members of the CDG, and others (for example, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Tourism) are invited to participate as the subject matter requires.

- **Question 13:** Please describe the legal basis for international co-operation between your country and other countries in the fight against THB:
 - national legislation;
 - international instruments/agreements (bilateral and/or multilateral).

Please indicate the title of the legal instruments.

International co-operation in the criminal realm is carried out in two major channels: legal assistance and extradition:

Extradition

The framework for **Extradition** is the **Extradition Law, 5714-1954**, as well as multilateral and bilateral treaties. Israel is a party to the **European Convention on Extradition (ETS No. 024)**, and has **bilateral extradition treaties** with the United States, Canada, Fiji, Australia, South Africa and Swaziland. The **United Nation Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime (UNTOC)** and the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (Hereinafter: the Trafficking Protocol), which Israel ratified in 2008, allows for extradition for offences of organized crime, as broadly defined in Article 3, including those who began in one country and were completed in another, with Parties that are party to UNTOC, even if without the existence of a bilateral or multilateral extradition treaty with Israel, in offences that include trafficking in persons as defined in the Trafficking Protocol.

Extradition is also possible through an ad-hoc agreement, in the absence of other instruments. Article 2A(3) to the Extradition Law requires reciprocity – meaning that countries may only request what they can provide, and other countries also apply this principle.

Legal Assistance

Israel is party to the **European Convention on Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters (ETS No. 30)**, and also holds bilateral legal assistance agreements with the United States, Canada and Australia. Legal Assistance may also be provided and requested based on goodwill and reciprocity, even in cases where there is no existing treaty; thus, statements may be collected from victims abroad or other witnesses in trafficking cases, evidence may be sought related to the investigations in Israel and more.

The Money Laundering and Terror Financing Prohibition Authority collaborates with foreign FIUs, receiving and transferring information to FIUs. This is based on Article 30(6) of the Anti-Money Laundering Law of 2000. The Authority is also a member of the Egmont Group, which has also formulated [Principles for Information Exchange](#) among its members.

Public Security Agreements

Israel's Public Security agreements with several countries include language on cooperation between the countries through the competent authorities on various subjects, including specifically law enforcement in the fight against trafficking in persons. Recent examples include the agreements with Lithuania, Cyprus and Croatia.

- *Question 14:* What steps have been taken by your country to ensure that the requesting party is promptly informed of the final results of action taken in the framework of international co-operation on action against THB, as provided for in Article 34 of the Convention?

The State of Israel works through its central authorities on legal assistance and extradition (see below) to provide final results and materials to the requesting party as soon as possible and promptly after they are received.

- **Question 15:** Do the relevant authorities of your country have the possibility to spontaneously provide information, without prior request, to authorities of another country if the disclosure of such information might assist the receiving country in initiating or carrying out investigations or proceedings concerning criminal offences established in accordance with the Convention? If so, please indicate how such information is transmitted and which authorities are involved.

Israeli authorities may provide information to authorities in other countries via requests for legal assistance, as elaborated above. The central agency dealing with outgoing requests for legal assistance is the International Department in the State Attorney's Office. Incoming requests for legal assistance are processed by the Courts' Authority and the Legal Assistance Unit in the Israeli Police. If the requesting state has provided an email address, a copy of the response is also sent by email.

For investigation purposes, information may also be transmitted in Police-to-Police interactions via Interpol: intelligence information is transmitted through the Interpol unit – whether through the Interpol system or through the relevant representative. Information related to legal proceedings or to assistance in an investigation is transmitted and received via requests for legal assistance in the legal assistance between countries unit.

The Money Laundering and Terror Financing Prohibition Authority is able to spontaneously provide information to foreign FIUs via the Egmont Group's Principles for Information Exchange. Information is transmitted via the Egmont Secure Web channel.

- **Question 16:** Do your police forces carry out joint actions, on a bilateral and/or a multilateral legal basis, with the police forces from other parties to fight THB? If so, please describe the action taken and provide an assessment of its impact. If not, please describe any plans for joint action or obstacles to joint action.

Israel carries out joint actions with Police forces in other countries, on a regular basis. A recent example is a case where a Police agent from Belarus travelled to Israel through a sex trafficking network and helped collect evidence which led to the arrest of the perpetrators.

Section I.3. Definition of “THB” and of “victim” in the internal law of the parties

In accordance with Article 4a of the Convention, trafficking in human beings consists of a combination of three basic components, each to be found in a list given in the definition:

- the action of: “recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons”;

- by means of: “the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person”;
- for the purpose of exploitation, which includes “at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal or organs”.

Article 4b of the Convention follows European Court of Human Rights case-law in that it states that the consent of a victim of THB to a form of exploitation listed in Article 4a is irrelevant if any of the means referred to in Article 4a has been used.

Under Article 4c recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation is to be regarded as trafficking in human beings even if it does not involve any of the means listed in Article 4a. It is also immaterial whether or not the child consents to be exploited. Under Article 4d the word “child” means any person under 18 years of age.

Article 4e defines “victim” as “any natural person who is subject to trafficking in human beings as defined in this article”. A victim is anyone subjected to a combination of components (action – means – purpose) specified in Article 4a of the Convention.

Questions:

- Question 17: Are all the elements of the three components (action, means and purpose) contained in Article 4a of the Convention included in the legal definition of THB established by your internal law? Please describe how they have been integrated in your internal law.

The definition of 'trafficking' under Israeli law is not identical to that of the Convention. Nevertheless, it does comply with the Convention's underlying principles and purposes. Section 377A(a) of the *Penal Law* includes the core elements of trafficking. It requires purposes of exploitation; the specific purposes enumerated closely follow those described in the Protocol; it requires an 'act', though different from the series of 'acts' in the Protocol.

The absence of 'means' derives from both practical and theoretical considerations, and it facilitates the investigation, prosecution and adjudication of trafficking cases.

Israeli legislators view the "mischief" of the crime of trafficking as objectification of the human being, who is treated as a commodity. For this reason, the 'act' element is a "*transaction in a person*", rather than **with** a person, as the trafficker treats the human being as an object, rather than a subject of rights. It is also for this reason, that the crime of trafficking is classified as a "*crime in violation of freedom*".

Once a person is objectified, 'means' are seen as irrelevant, just as they are in the similar crime of 'slavery', as defined in the 1926 Slavery Convention:

"Slavery is the status or condition of a person over whom any or all of the powers attaching to the right of

ownership are exercised."

By not requiring 'means' in the trafficking crime, the legislator is making a powerful statement that, as in the crime of slavery, society will not allow a human being to be treated like a commodity, even if this is done without overt violence or pressure.

The use of the term '*transaction*' instead of the series of 'acts' enumerated in the Protocol, both reflects the approach of the legislator that the core evil of trafficking is objectification, and also carries with it practical benefits. The term "*transaction*" appears in other Israeli criminal sections addressing drugs and weapons.¹ This allows trafficking practitioners to use existing case law to interpret this term in trafficking cases as well.

The offence of trafficking in persons is one of several offences meant to cover the different modalities of trafficking and the spectrum of exploitation – see our reply to Question #46 below.

- Question 18: Please indicate which of the following forms of THB are recognised under your internal law:
 - national;
 - transnational;
 - linked to organised crime;
 - not linked to organised crime.

All four of those forms, without limitation, are recognized in Israel's internal law. The definition is not limited by any of those elements, and the legislation allows for both trafficking linked or unlinked to organized crime.

- Question 19: Under your internal law, is a "victim of THB" any natural person who is subject to THB as defined in Article 4e of the Convention? Please provide the definition of a "victim of THB" under your internal law. Please provide (a translation of) the legal text(s) in English or in French.

Yes. The definition is included in Government Resolution No. 1862. The Resolution stipulates that a requirement for the obtaining of protection and rehabilitation within the assistance programs for human trafficking victims would be the determination in writing by the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator, that there is *prima facie* evidence that the person is a victim of one of these four offences: trafficking in persons, holding under conditions of slavery, forced labor or causing to leave the country for prostitution or slavery purposes (sections 377a, 375a, 376, 376b of the Penal Law, 5737-1977).

- Question 20: Does your internal law recognise as victims of THB:
 - women;
 - men;
 - children?

¹ See for example the Drugs Ordinance [New Version] 5733 – 1973; article 144 of the Penal Law regarding weapons.

Yes. The definitions allow for victims of all ages and genders, and all ages and genders have been in practice recognized as victims.

- *Question 21:* To what extent does the consent of a person to intended or actual exploitation determine if that person will be recognised as a victim of THB under your internal law? Please specify if your internal law contemplates the consent of the three categories of victims: women, men, children. Please provide examples.

In accordance with the language of the offences of trafficking in persons, the consent of a person is irrelevant to the recognition of the victim, as the offences of trafficking in persons, holding under conditions of slavery and causing a person to leave their country for slavery or prostitution do not include lack of consent as a requirement. The offence of forced labor refers to a person being "forced" to work, but also includes the alternative of "consent elicited by fraudulent means" – thus also allowing for situations where victims have in practice consented to perform the labor. The offences apply equally to women, men and children.

II: Implementation by the parties of measures aimed to prevent THB, protect and promote the rights of victims of THB and prosecute traffickers

Section II.1. Implementation of measures to prevent THB

Questions in this section aim to obtain information on the implementation by the parties of the preventive measures contained in Chapter II of the Convention (Articles 5 to 9). Implementation of preventive measures concerns all countries: countries of origin, transit and destination. Preventive measures to be implemented can vary depending on the type of country, but all countries should implement measures to prevent THB.

Questions:

- *Question 22:* Has a national/regional/local campaign or programme to alert the potential victims of THB to the various forms of exploitation been carried out in your country during the last two years? If so, was it based on research for determining effective prevention methods? Was it addressed to a particular group of potential victims? Which bodies, governmental or non-governmental, were in charge of implementing it? Please describe the material used for the campaign/programme and its dissemination. If possible, please provide an assessment of the impact of the campaign/programme. If more than one campaign or programme was carried out please provide the details for each of them. If there are currently plans for launching a new campaign or programme, please provide details.

In early 2022, shortly after the war in the Ukraine broke out, NATU, in collaboration with NGO's Lo Omdot Mineged, AZUM and others, initiated the publication of brochures, roll-up signs and digital screens, in Ukrainian, setting out warning signs for exploitation or attempts that may be made for TIP, and referring to a **state funded hotline** established specifically by the MWSS to help and protect Ukrainian persons fleeing

from the war to Israel, in all fields: housing, food, clothing, education for children, employment and emergency situations and more. These brochures and other measures were printed (funded by the MOJ) and distributed at relevant points at the airports, at all 54 medical services points that provided medical care for Ukrainians (TEREM) around the country, and in all Hospital ER's and other relevant places. All calls concerning suspicions of exploitation were rapidly dealt with by the enforcement agencies. Furthermore, the police heightened awareness and physical attendance in relevant locales and added training to the appropriate units. The MOH Levinsky mobile Clinic, also raised vigilance and presence in vulnerable locations, distributing the brochures and offering counselling, medical tests and assistance in appropriate cases.

- **Question 23:** Please describe the social and economic empowerment measures for disadvantaged groups vulnerable to THB which have been implemented or are planned.

Israel places specific importance on the prevention of trafficking in persons, and has worked on several areas to reduce vulnerability to trafficking in persons. The following section lists such initiatives in various fields:

Recruitment fees: Israeli legislation limits worker-paid recruitment fees, and as detailed above, the bilateral agreements contain strong mechanisms to prevent those fees. The sums workers are allowed to pay in the recruitment process are strictly and narrowly limited by law, and the legislation limits the fields, the services for which the sums may be charged, and the sums themselves – charging prohibited recruitment fees is a criminal offence².

Bilateral Agreements with Countries of Origin *General*

The GOI allows foreign worker recruitment in most fields exclusively through regulated bilateral agreements or arrangements with countries of origins. These agreements serve as a safeguard against TIP, by regulating

² This has two exceptions, in both cases the payment is limited and regulated by law: In the agricultural field, Israeli private recruitment agencies may charge recruited foreign workers a one-time fee of 2814 NIS plus VAT, as set out in relevant regulations, for services which the Recruitment Agency is required to supply the agricultural workers during and after they arrival in Israel. Foreign Agricultural Workers who chose to leave Israel permanently before completing 36 months of work in Israel, are eligible for a partial refund of the above sum, as per the above regulations.

In the caregiving field, fees are limited to a total of 5,220 NIS a year, plus VAT, to be paid to the recruitment agency in three payments over 38 months since the worker's arrival. The regulations were approved as a temporary order for three (3) years – from October 14th 2022 to October 15th 2025, to review the legal arrangement. The Regulations also require the relevant ministries to report to the Government at the end of every year the Regulations are in place, including by providing information on the oversight and enforcement, complaints from workers, information about the sums charged to workers and the impact of the arrangement on workers coming through the bilateral agreements.

the procedure of recruiting foreign workers, in a transparent, formal and comprehensive way, reducing the possibility that potential traffickers will create or abuse vulnerability in the workers by charging exorbitant and illegal recruitment fees.

Workers recruited under the bilateral framework arrive in Israel without the unreasonable debts incurred by workers who have paid illegal fees. They are well informed of legal work conditions and of their ability to file complaints – reducing the likelihood of their suffering severe exploitation.

The bilateral agreements contain various mechanisms to provide for such recruitment, and to ensure workers are informed of their rights and obligations. A public announcement (the wording is agreed upon between the two countries) is published in the country of origin, with the type and number of the available positions for work in Israel, the preconditions for them and the application process. The announcement also specifies the working conditions in Israel, including the minimum wage after permitted deductions, and the random selection process for choosing candidates among those qualified, the legal fees to be, and a number for lodging complaints.

After the applications are received, the eligible candidates are chosen and matched to eligible employers by way of a random process, devised to reduce the possibility of the illegal charging of fees. The chosen workers and their employers sign a standard employment contract in three languages (Hebrew, English and the language of the country of origin) which has been approved by both Governments, and the workers receive a labor rights booklet in their language.

Upon arriving in Israel, PIBA representatives ensure that the workers have their contracts and labor rights booklets, as well as a card setting out the phone number and hours of the PIBA Call Center – state funded and operated by NGO CIMI - in their language for complaints and information. They also make sure that the workers are met at the airport by authorized employer representatives, who provide the workers with a medical insurance policy in their language.

These mechanisms ensure both direct communication and cooperation between the governments of the sending and receiving countries, and supervision by both countries of the recruitment process. The detailed information and the widespread publication process are aimed to reduce the possibility that illegal brokers will charge illegal fees from applicants, and ensures that the applicants are clearly informed of the work conditions in Israel and the fees they must pay for the costs of the recruitment process. The random selection of workers also ensures that brokers cannot promise jobs to applicants who pay illegal fees, and the standard contract, call center and supervised meeting of each worker with his/her employer upon arrival in Israel, ensures that there will be no phenomenon of "flying visa" (where workers arrive in Israel only to find out there is no job for them) or related abuses.

The Inter-Ministerial Committee for Bilateral Agreements

The Inter-Ministerial Committee for Bilateral Agreements, headed by the Director General of the PIBA, and which includes representatives from PIBA, the MOJ, MFA, MOEI, MOCH, MOF, MOAG and NATU, continued its meetings throughout 2022, mainly via online platforms. The Inter-Ministerial Committee directs the different Ministries as to the implementation process of the existing bilateral agreements and promotes negotiation of additional bilateral agreements as necessary and in accordance with Government Resolutions.

Israel is currently engaged in the following bilateral agreements/arrangements

- Agriculture: Thailand (2010)³.
- Construction: Bulgaria (2011), Moldova (2012), Romania (2014), the Ukraine (2016), China (2017).
- Caregiving: The Philippines (signed 2018, ratified 2019, and implementation began in 2021), Sri Lanka (2020) (implementation due for 2022).
- Tourism: The Philippines (signed 2018, ratified 2019).
- Caregiving in Institutions: Georgia (2020), Nepal (signed 2020).

In October 2022 the Government of Israel ratified an Agreement with the Government of Uzbekistan on the temporary employment of Uzbek workers in specific labor market fields in the State of Israel. This Agreement has lately entered into force and its implementation is expected to begin soon. In addition to this framework agreement, an implementation arrangement was signed with Uzbekistan for the domestic caregiving field.

Social and Economic Empowerment for People in Prostitution

The MWSS operates a wide range of programs for people in commercial sexual exploitation – children, youth and adults, of different genders and sexual orientation, and with a wide geographical distribution. Those centers, funded in part or in whole through the budget established in the Government Resolution, provide a wide range of services to address the needs of those in commercial sexual exploitation, to assist them and to help create sustainable exit options.

³ A new agreement was signed, in connection to the procedure of recruitments and training of the workers, and came into force in 2020.

Programs for Minors and Young Adults:

"The Heart" and Open Centers for Girls and Young Women in Commercial Sexual Exploitation

Ha'Lev ("The Heart") Care Settings program is aimed to provide a safe space to girls and young women aged 13–25 who are on the continuum of prostitution and in situations of sexual exploitation for consideration.

Response provided in the care settings includes initial assistance, such as shelter, food, shower, hygiene products and clothing; assistance with exhaustion of rights vis-a-vis state entities such as the National Insurance Institute and the Ministry of Construction and Housing; in-depth treatment of coping with the sexual exploitation trauma; assistance with integration into studies or vocational training and integrating into work for a friend employer aiming to exit the cycle of prostitution.

Currently, there are 14 care settings operated nationwide for girls and young women under three models:

The Limited Model – runs three days a week, ten hours a day – in six cities, at a total cost of 4.1 million NIS;

The Extended Model – runs five days a week, ten hours a day – operated in five cities, at a total cost of 4.8 million NIS; The 24/7 Model – constant activity – operated in two cities at a total cost of 3.6 million NIS.

The center in Tel Aviv-Jaffa operates **continuously (24/7)**, and accepts people aged 13–21 **of all genders**. In addition to the services provided in all care settings, the Tel Aviv-Jaffa Care Setting also runs a program for individual support of service recipients. The program includes additional staff as well as a dedicated budget to provide individual assistance of 1,900 NIS per month for each service recipient in accordance with their needs. The cost of operating the Tel Aviv-Jaffa Care Setting (including the individual assistance Program) is 5.8 million NIS per year, of which approximately 1.5 million NIS are from the government resolution budget.

2022 Developments

- **A new HaLev center is being established in the Arab municipality of Iksal – to provide services to youth from the surrounding Arab villages.**
- **In 2022, following a mapping of current needs, two (2) additional HaLev centers opened in the cities of Hadera and Eilat under the limited model – adding up to two centers in this model in each of these cities.**
- **From September 2022, the budgeting for the Haifa and Petah Tiquva centers was increased – by about 1 million NIS (240,000 Euro) for Petah Tiquva and 1.5 (370,000 Euro) million NIS for Haifa**

Overall, the 14 centers assisted 723 children and young adults in 2022.

Centers for adult women

In Tel Aviv-Jaffa, Haifa and Be'er-Sheva, there are therapeutic complexes operated jointly with the municipalities and designated to women in the cycle of prostitution, where the following services are

provided:

- Emergency housing for several months, until a long-term solution is found.
- Hostel - Long-term out-of-home solution, including integration into an intensive treatment program.
- A day center that provides services such as group therapy, employment workshops, assistance in realizing rights. There is also an evening center operating in Tel Aviv-Jaffa.

"Sal'it", the center in Tel Aviv-Jaffa, has been providing service for women in the cycle of prostitution since 2014. The project's budget is approximately 7.1 million NIS (1,740,000 Euro) per year.

Ofek Nashi (Feminine Horizon) the center in Haifa, has been operating since 2014. The project's budget is approximately 5.2 million NIS (1,270,000 Euro) per year, of which about 1.2 million NIS (290,000 Euro) were budgeted in the Government Resolution.

Harduf (formerly Bishvilech, For You), the center in Be'er-Sheva has been operating since 2016. At first, the project operated with a budget of about 1 million NIS (240,000 Euro), and following an additional budget as part of the Government Resolution, the project's budget is now about 3.7 million NIS (910,000 Euro) per year.

Apartments for mothers exiting the cycle of prostitution and their children

As part of the implementation of the anti-prostitution program, there is a joint venture formulated with the Women's Wisdom Center to open three designated apartments for mothers in the process of exiting the cycle of prostitution and their children. Alongside a place for residence provided to them, mothers will receive support in an individual therapeutic process, aiming to help them cope with the complex traumas and act to improve parenting skills and integrate optimally in the labor market and in society as a whole. The children will receive support in therapy as well, with an emphasis on improving the mother's relation with her children. The budget of the MWSS for the project (to finance three apartments) is about 800 thousand NIS. As a joint venture, 'Women's Wisdom' Center is matching those funds.

A holistic consulting center

As part of the implementation of the anti-prostitution program, a **joint venture** conducted with the Turning the Tables NGO began in December 2020, for the establishment of a holistic consulting center for women in the cycle of prostitution in the central area. The center is designated to provide response to five hundred (500) women a year, who will receive a hot meal, individual or group therapy, psychologist and psychiatric counseling, legal aid and assistance in realizing rights, as well as other programs, such as one on financial planning. The MWSS funded the program by about 500,000 NIS in 2022, with matching funds from the NGO.

Programs for men in prostitution

As part of the implementation of the anti-prostitution program, the NGO Keshet was chosen to operate the first MWSS center for men in prostitution, in the central region, including a day and evening center for sixty five (65) men, a hostel for fourteen (14) men and a transitional apartment for four (4) men. The hostel opened in July 2022, and currently houses six (6) men. The day and evening center are in advanced stages and will open in Tel Aviv-Jaffa, to provide services for men from across the country along the spectrum of prostitution. Those programs are budgeted at 2.1 million NIS in 2022.

Programs for transgender people

According to the MSWA regulations, transgender women may be received and treated in all programs for adult women, and transgender men may be received and treated in the programs for men in prostitution. As stated, HaLev Care setting in Tel Aviv-Jaffa is designated to those aged 13 to 21 of all genders. In addition, there are dedicated solutions for trans people:

- **Over the Rainbow** - Program to provide solutions tailored to the unique needs of trans spectrum populations, through Ma'avarim ("Crossings") NGO. The program includes a nationwide assistance and counseling system, using social workers who will provide response to people on the trans spectrum, or to professionals who seek advice on meeting the needs of trans people in a sensitive and appropriate way. The program's budget for 2022 is about 1.1 million NIS.
- **"Beit Lina" Center for Transgender women:** A company was selected to create a center for transgender women in the Central Region, including emergency housing (12 beds), four transitional apartments and four intensive transitional apartments. The center opened in 2022. The program's budget for 2022 is 2.2 million NIS (540,000 Euro).

Material assistance

- **Flexible financial aid:** the flexible basket, as part of which the assistance is provided through the departments of social services in the municipalities, enables provision of financial assistance for the benefit of a wide range of needs, for up to 10,500 NIS per person a year. Those needs include: Purchase of household equipment and furniture, temporary assistance in rent, home repairs, legal aid, per diem and clothing expenditure, medical expenses, assistance in funding educational and vocational training programs, participation in travel expenses. This program is funded at 2.2 million NIS (540,000 Euro) a year.
- **Complementary material assistance:** In order to help populations in prostitution that do not fit into a rehabilitative process and therefore are not eligible for assistance as part of the flexible basket, or those not seeking assistance as part of the flexible basket because they avoid contact with the

social services in the local authority, there is a complementary assistance system formulated with "Lo Omdot MiNeged" NGO. The system offers assistance in various areas, including: assistance with food baskets and cooked food; basic furniture and appliances, assistance in funding studies and rent, dental care, individual support and psychiatric opinion. The program budget for 2022 is approximately 1.1 million NIS (270,000 Euro).

- As part of joint venture between the MWSS and the Friendship Fund, a flexible financial basket is offered to groups that are at risk or struggling, including those in prostitution. The program is budgeted at 2.2 million NIS (540,000 Euro).

In 2022, the MOH issued a directive that persons with **no legal status in Israel, who are in the cycle of prostitution, are also entitled to flexible financial aid and complementary material assistance** and set out a simple and fast procedure for dealing with these requests.

Promoting Employment

- **Beneficial employment:** A beneficial employment program was formulated as a joint venture with Hope Center NGO, aiming to provide a tailored response to people in prostitution who wish to reintegrate into the labor market. This program will provide, inter alia, individual and group accompaniment and preparatory workshops for labor market for three months, after which the women will be employed with "friendly employers", with the continued support of the program, until they achieve stable employment and exit the cycle of prostitution. The MWSS funded the program by 360,000 NIS (88,130 Euro) in 2022, with matching funds from the NGO.
- **Vocational training – Ha-Michlala (Her Academy):** Vocational school for women exiting prostitution, aimed at acquiring a profession and integrating into the labor market. The school operates around 62 focused courses that last about ten 10 weeks, including administrative management and web development cooking and pastry, interior design, and fashion-related sales. MWSS contracted "Her Academy" NGO in December 2020, and in 2022 the Ministry allocated a budget for the project in an amount of about 850 thousand NIS.

- **Question 24:** What preventive measures to discourage demand leading to THB, as provided for in Article 6 of the Convention, has your country adopted or is considering adopting?

Prohibition of Consumption of Prostitution

The Law Prohibiting the Consumption of Prostitution (Temporary Provision and Legislative Amendment) 5779-2019, that was published in the Official Gazette on January 10, 2019, entered into force on July 10,

2020⁴.

The law prescribes a criminal prohibition on consumption of prostitution and on being in a location that serves for acts of prostitution for the purpose of consuming prostitution. A rebuttable presumption was laid down with the offense, according to which whoever is in a location used primarily for acts of prostitution (such as a brothel) as a person who intends to consume an act of prostitution. The law states that an offense of the consumption of prostitution is an administrative offense for which the police is entitled to impose a fine in the amount of 2,000 NIS (490 Euro), and in a recurring offense within a period of three years – double of the said amount of the fine. Nevertheless, the prosecution is entitled, in extraordinary circumstances, to file an indictment in an offense through the ordinary criminal proceeding, and then the maximum penalty will be a fine in the amount of 75,300 NIS (18,430 Euro).

The Law is accompanied by the **Attorney General's Directive 4.1115** on enforcement policy, detailing the principles for the application of the law, and including the cases in which the offender will be indicted rather than fined.

The directive further addresses the sensitivity that should be in enforcement against the populations that are within the cycle of prostitution, seeks to ensure that the enforcement actions will not worsen their condition, and all while placing an emphasis on the need to protect their autonomy. The directive further clarifies that officers who enforce this offense will undergo a unique training that will include, *inter alia*, emphasis on the difficulties that accompany the populations that are in the cycle of prostitution, including the stigma that they often face.

In addition, the law provides for an alternative mechanism to a fine – detailed in the **Regulations Prohibiting the Consumption of Prostitution (Alternative Measures to Impose a Fine) 5780-2020**. The mechanism created in the regulations enables the consumer of prostitution to select a program as an alternative to the fine, operated by the Probation Service for Adults in the MWSS. The regulations state that the program includes a psycho-educational workshop or a series of individual meetings (according to the decision of the probation officer) totaling 6- 10 hours. The purpose of the program is to provide information and to develop the understanding of the damage and the negative impact of the consumption of prostitution on all those involved in the cycle of prostitution.

Receiving an act of prostitution from a minor is separately criminalized, and carries a penalty of five (5) years' imprisonment (which was raised in 2016 – it had previously been three years).

⁴ Note that the law includes a period of a year between its passing and entering into force, to allow support mechanisms and exit programs to be put into place

Prevention of Trafficking in Supply Chains

The Implementation Plan in Government Resolution No. 1862 establishes a team on **preventing trafficking in supply chains**. According to the resolution, the CDG must report the team's findings to the Knesset within a year of the Resolution. The team, which is to involve members of NATU, the MOJ, the MOL and the MOF, as well as members of Academia, NGOs and Industry, had its first meeting on January 29th, 2023.

Information on Surrogacy Procedures in Northern Cyprus, Albania and Kenya

In June 2023, NATU published on its website [a document with information and warning to the public considering using surrogacy procedures outside of Israel, relevant information and a warning against carrying out these procedures in the countries of Northern Cyprus, Albania and Kenya](#). The information collected by the National Anti-Trafficking raises concerns that in some of the destinations where Israelis carry out surrogacy procedures, the procedures are carried out in ways that may consist of a violation of the dignity of women and their basic rights, an objectification of them and a limitation to their freedom, and in severe cases even rise to the point of suspicion of human trafficking - both in the surrogates and in the babies born.

- **Question 25:** Please specify the measures taken by your country to ensure quality, security and integrity of travel and identity documents in order to prevent their unlawful creation and issuance as well as to ensure that they cannot easily forged.

In accordance with the Law on the Inclusion of Biometric Identification Means and Biometric Identification Data in Identification Documents and Databases, 579-2009, the State of Israel issues identity cards and biometric travel documents. The biometric identification documents were issued starting in July 2013 as part of a voluntary pilot period, and since June 2017 the issuance of biometric documentation is mandatory.

The identity cards and the biometric travel documents include a chip with biometric means of identification of the citizens and residents; The biometric identification documents cannot be forged easily, and also ensure safe identification due to the electronic chip that includes biometric information that can be used to verify the identity of the holder of the document. In addition, documents are only issued after identity verification checks are performed in a central database, to prevent identity theft and issuing false documentation.

- **Question 26:** Please specify the measures taken by your country to detect cases of THB at its borders, *inter alia* by means of border surveillance teams and intelligence measures.

In early 2022, after the war in Ukraine broke out, the GOI introduced a **New Identification model at the national Ben-Gurion Airport**. This was due to a rising concern, backed by a spike in demand observed online, that attempts will be made by traffickers to recruit to Israel, women and minors fleeing from the war, for

purposes of sexual and labor exploitation. It established a **proactive, rapid inter-ministerial cooperation for identification of TIP victims**, wherein border control officials were trained to identify cases in which there was a suspicion of trafficking. If such a suspicion arises, NATU and Police are contacted and a dedicated Police investigator is sent to interview the Potential victim. In addition, a dedicated trained social worker from the NGO "Lo Omdot Meneged" is invited to the airport to meet with the victim. The social worker is there to provide support and context for the victim, and to explain that the goal is to protect them and prevent exploitation in Israel, that they are not suspected of any wrongdoing, and explain the rights available to victims. After this initial meeting, the social worker also accompanies the potential victim to the Police investigation and support them during the investigation.

If there is sufficient evidence to determine victim status, the victim can choose if they want to remain in Israel – if so, recognition is granted and rights are available. In any case, the information collected is retained in the Police, and cases have been launched based on information collected at the airport.

Training is being provided to border officials throughout the country, including indicators for victim recognition, through the PIBA and in stages, by NATU.

- Question 27: Please describe any measures taken to provide information, through consulates and embassies, about legal entry and stay on the territory of your country in order to ensure informed and legal immigration.

The framework of the bilateral agreements described above includes many mechanisms to ensure that workers interested in working in Israel receive full and accurate information about what that possibility entails. As the recruitment process begins, authorities in the sending country publish information to the public on the terms, duration and recruitment mechanism – including the lottery mechanism included in the bilateral agreements, so that there is no one that can guarantee job placement. Workers may also access the **PIBA Call Center** in their language for inquires, including during the recruitment process.

Comprehensive worker right booklets, including immigration and status terms, were also composed and are distributed to workers in 12 languages⁵ – [see English version here](#). The Israeli consulate or embassy gives the worker a copy of the booklet when issuing the visa, and the recipient signs that they have received it and understand its content. The same framework has been implemented in the agricultural training program run by the MFA, where trainees receive a detailed rights booklet explaining the terms of the program and their rights under Israeli law.

- Question 28: Please describe any measures taken to avoid issuing visas (tourist, working, student visas, etc.) when there are reasonable grounds to believe that a person may be a victim of THB or implicated in THB. In such cases, please describe any specific measures which your law enforcement authorities have instructions to apply.

⁵ Hebrew, English, Russian, Romanian, Bulgarian, Thai, Spanish, Ukrainian, Chinese, Turkish, Georgian and Nepali.

Where a visa is required for coming to Israel: if it was submitted in the embassy, the consul is authorized to refuse it on their own authority, without consulting with PIBA.

When visa requests reach PIBA, it has the authority to review and authorize those requests, and screen for the relevant indicators and conditions. If the request does not meet the conditions, or suspicion arises that that the person may be a victim of trafficking or implicated in trafficking – visas are not granted. If, after being instructed by PIBA to grant a visa, the consul finds reason to refuse it, he consults with PIBA by writing and explains their reasons to refuse the visa – in those cases, the final authority lies with PIBA.

Where visas are not required (for examples, for countries with which Israel has a visa exemption agreement), screening is conducted at the border crossing by PIBA officials. If there is suspicion that a person might be a victim of trafficking or implicated in trafficking, the identification model described in our reply to Question #26 is initiated – if evidence is found that a person is a victim, they may enter the shelter in Israel and receive a visa under the terms described in our reply to questions 40-41 below; if they are not interested in doing so – their entry is typically refused.

- *Question 29:* Do any specific measures exist for preventing national THB, including THB taking place on the territory of parties with special agreements establishing common borders (Schengen Agreement for example)? If so, please specify.

Many or most of the steps described in our reply to Question #23 are aimed at preventing trafficking occurring within the borders of Israel (which does not have agreements with its neighboring countries in the nature of the Schengen Agreements). Israel also has several other methods of making sure vulnerable populations within its borders are given adequate protection and have robust mechanisms who can address violations, including:

The Commissioner of Foreign Workers' Labor Rights (CFWLR)

The **Commissioner for Foreign Workers' Labor Rights Unit** is charged with protecting the labor rights of the foreigners employed in Israel (as distinct from the Ministry's Regulation and Enforcement Administration, which deals with the enforcement of labor laws on the criminal level; and as distinct from PIBA, which deals with foreign workers' employment permits and residence permits). Assistance is provided regardless of the worker's legal status in Israel. The Commissioner is authorized to represent in Labor Courts or participate in legal proceedings with permission of the court.

Workers can apply to CFWLR via email, land line, mobile phone or WhatsApp, with the support of translation services various languages. It should be noted that the Unit has seen continual increase in the number of queries it receives from workers.

2022 Highlights:

- As of December 20th 2022, approximately 1,897 queries were received – up from 1,600 queries in 2021, and to 1,400 queries in 2020. The average response time to queries was 1.7 days, for an average of 5.3 daily queries. The unit was contacted by workers from twenty (20) countries, including Eritrea, Ethiopia, China, Moldova, the Philippines, India, Thailand, the Ukraine, Nigeria, Uzbekistan, Nepal, Ghana, Rwanda and Botswana.
- Several queries from workers have developed into investigation cases and forwarded to the enforcement unit.
- In-person visits to talk to workers, including to trainees in the Agriculture Training Program, to barriers with the Palestinian Authority and to the Giv'on immigration detention facility.
- Reaching vulnerable populations:
 - One of the Unit's goals for 2022 was to extend its reach in the asylum seeker community, and thus formed collaborations with NGOs and international bodies, including ARDC, ASSAF, UNHCR, HIAS and JACC – resulting in a **quadrupling** of the queries from that group – from 27 in 2021 to 112.
 - Queries from Palestinian workers also increased, going from 112 in 2021 to 200 in 2022.

The Unit operates a Facebook page – The Commissioner for Foreign Workers' Labor Rights. Posts are posted twice a week on this Facebook page, on various issues relevant to foreign workers' rights in the various industries, in different languages as necessary. Such posts are shared hundreds of times, and as of today the page has over 11,000 followers (up from about 9,700 in 2021), and analytics indicate some posts have reached tens of thousands of users. The unit conducted a Facebook Live session for Russian speakers on its Facebook page with an interpreter, and one for Tigrinya speakers – the events were attended by hundreds of workers.

The Commissioner's Unit publishes an annual Report of its activities, also available [in English](#).

The Child Protection Bureau Hotline (105)

The Child Online Protection Bureau is a national program for the prevention of violence and crime against children and teenagers online. The program includes a hotline providing toll-free calls from all over the country and from any phone. The hotline deals with all offense and abuse behaviors against children committed in the online realm, including sexual abuse and prostitution. The calls are received by Police officers who received specific training, and is supported by an inter-ministerial desk with experts on online

child abuse from the Ministry of Education, the MLSS, the MOH, the MPS and the MOJ, who are able to intervene and ensure that every call receives an appropriate and comprehensive response.

In 2022, the Bureau received 33,000 calls, and handled over 7,000 events. One-third of incidents (30%) are sexual harassment or abuse (sexual offenses, solicitation and harassment, distribution of images and videos, and threats and extortion). The platforms where most of the incidents took place are Instagram and WhatsApp.

Alongside its enforcement activity, the Bureau also collaborates with NGOs that are active in the field of commercial sexual exploitation of minors, and participates in local and national roundtables on the subject. The Investigation of child online prostitution is set as a goal for the Bureau.

Efforts to Prevent Exploitation of Palestinian Workers

Construction Field:

PIBA, the Ministry of Construction and Housing and the Civil Administration initiated a reform process in the work permit system for Palestinian workers in the construction field. Prior to the reform, a Palestinian worker who wanted to work in Israel needed to find an employer with an available permit, a process in which mediators were often involved, charging recruitment fees. A new process came into force through the PIBA procedure from December 6th, 2020, titled [The Procedure for Employment of Palestinian Workers in Israel in the Construction Field](#) (Hebrew link).

Under the revised model, the Israeli employer receives a permit to employ Palestinian workers in a specific field, without a numerical allocation or specific quota as before, and the Palestinian worker will receive a permit to work in a specific field in Israel. **This enables the employees to change employers more easily, and cause the Israeli employers to compete for Palestinian workers instead of workers competing for employers.** The reform has been implemented in the construction and the industry and services sector.

Rights Awareness Campaign for Palestinian Workers

The campaign commenced on the 6th of February, 2023, and it is aimed at raising the awareness of the Palestinian workers to their rights in the context of labor in Israel, and is a joint cooperation between the Civil Administration of the Ministry of Defense, and CFWLR. The measures of publication are both physical – distribution of information brochures and explanations to the workers who may ask questions, at all of the crossings – and digital – on relevant social media such as Facebook, and on the dedicated App.

- *Question 30:* What funds have been allocated to the above-mentioned preventive measures in the state budget (central and/or regional/local)? Please specify amounts in euros.

While we listed some budget information in our reply to Question #23, we cannot provide a complete accounting of all the fund allocated to prevention efforts, as they are in large part integrated into the GOI's

work.

- *Question 31:* Has an assessment of the impact of the above-mentioned preventive measures taken by your country been carried out? If so, please specify the results of the assessment.

- The Bilateral Labor Recruitment framework has included a bi-annual accompanying research since its inception – the researchers reach out to the workers and record the impact of the agreements on recruitment fees payment, working conditions, hours and wages.

The latest report of the research was published in [August 2021](#) (Hebrew link), and a comprehensive 2011-2018 report is [available in English](#). The research demonstrates that the bilateral agreements are an effective form of eliminating private recruitment, and drastically reducing the cost of migration.

- The implementation of The Law Prohibiting the Consumption of Prostitution is also accompanied by a five-year research plan, conducted by the Brookdale institute. The research published its [interim results](#) in 2022 (Hebrew link). They demonstrate that the law enjoys broad public support, and there is evidence that it has reduced the consumption of prostitution.

- In 2022, A broad in-depth survey was sent by COGAT (Coordination of Government Activities in the Territories) to all the Palestinian workers, from all branches of employment in Israel, and thousands of replies were received, constituting around 10% of this population. The survey including many questions pertaining to the conditions of employment, the quality of the services in the crossings between the PA and Israel, the process of receiving a work permit and finding employment, salaries and many other issues relevant to labor rights and their fulfillment. The results and conclusions from the survey were shared with all relevant stakeholders, and are being studied for the purpose of deciding on future steps to improve the protection of the workers' rights and prevention of exploitation in the labor context.

Section II.2. Implementation of measures to protect and promote the rights of victims of trafficking in human beings

Questions in this section aim to obtain information on the implementation by the parties of measures to protect and promote the rights of victims contained in Chapter III of the Convention (Articles 10 to 17). This part of the questionnaire concerns the ways and procedures to identify victims (Article 10), measures to assist victims (Article 12), the recovery and reflection period (Article 13) and residence permits (Article 14). In addition some questions concerning repatriation and return of victims (Article 16) and reintegration of victims into society (Article 16-5) as well as questions about compensation (Article 15) are addressed.

Questions:

- **Question 32:** At what moment and by whom is the process to identify a potential victim of THB initiated (for example, declaration of the potential victim, statement by a police officer, statement by a NGO etc.)?

The process may be initiated by any actor – the victim themselves, an NGO, the LAA, Police or Border officials, or any other person who suspects a person may be a victim. This can occur whenever the suspicion first arises, whether near the events or not.

- **Question 33:** Have any common criteria been defined in your internal law for granting the legal status of victim of THB? If so, please specify.

Government Resolution No. 1862 (as well as others that preceded it) stipulates that victim protections will be granted whenever there is *prima facie* evidence that a person is a victim of one of four offences: **trafficking in persons** (article 377A of the Penal Law), **holding under conditions of slavery** (article 375A of the Penal Law), forced labor (article 376 of the Penal Law) and causing a person to leave their country for slavery or prostitution (article 376B of the Penal Law).

The Supreme Court, in its decision in [Jane Doe v. the Minister of Justice](#) (HCJ 1591/18, Hebrew link) determined that the threshold of evidence for this determination is a low one, lower than that required for a criminal prosecution, and may be based on any type of evidence that a reasonable person would see as being of determinative value, and place some level of trust in.

- **Question 34:** Which national authority(ies) grant(s) the legal status of victim of THB (for example, police forces, public prosecutor, judge, etc.)? Can such a decision be appealed?

According to Government Resolution No. 1862, the authorized body is the National Anti-Trafficking coordinator, in consultation with a consultative committee, comprising of representative of PIBA, the MWSS, the Ministry of Labor and the Police, as well as an NGO representative and a survivor of trafficking in persons.

This change is currently pending the publication of a procedure governing the operation method of this mechanism, which will also include an appeal mechanism. While the change is pending, the authority is held by the PTC unit within the Israeli Police, which operates according to the [Police Procedure for Filing a Request for Recognition as a Victim of Trafficking in Persons or Holding Under Conditions of Slavery](#) (Hebrew link). The procedure stipulates an internal appeal to the Head of the Investigations Division who has legal training⁶ but NATU has already begun implementing the new mechanism, through a pilot framework.

⁶ The procedure stipulates that if the Head of Investigations does not hold legal training, the decision will be appealed to a Commander with legal training working in investigations. This is following the HCJ decision 1591/18 above, which determined that since the test is a legal one, the person making the decision ought to have legal training

- **Question 35:** Can a person be removed from your country during the process of identification as a victim of THB (for example, if he/she is present illegally)?

While the identification process is initiated, the removal process is halted immediately, and the person is not removed from the country until an evidence-based decision is completed.

- **Question 36:** Does your country recognise the status of victim of THB granted by another party when the victim is on your territory?

We have not had experience with such cases – typically victims are recognized in Israel, regardless of where the exploitation occurred, and have not been recognized before. If such cases come up, the decision will be made based on the facts of the individual case.

- **Question 37:** Please indicate which types of assistance described in Article 12 of the Convention are provided to victims of THB in your country. Please specify who provides the different types of assistance.

1. **Standards of living capable of ensuring their subsistence, through such measures as: appropriate and secure accommodation, psychological and material assistance:** Victims receive fully state funded **accommodation including food, basic necessities and pocket money** at dedicated shelters for victims of trafficking, operated by the Keshet NGO with full oversight and funding by the Ministry of Welfare and Social Security). Two shelters are available – the Ma'agan shelter for women and the Atlas shelter for men, each have 35 beds⁷. In addition, there are dedicated family apartments for women victims with children. The shelters also provide food for residents and psychosocial services and support, with dedicated social workers at each shelter who receive training in dealing with trafficking and trauma.

The National Center for the Survival of Slavery and Human Trafficking, which operates under MESILA (Foreign Community Assistance and Treatment Center, Tel Aviv-Jaffa Municipality) and is funded by the MWSS, was established in 2013. It provides assistance to victims of trafficking who chose not to stay at the shelter and those who have completed their stay at the shelters but remain in Israel. The day center performs psychosocial work - medical, mental, legal, occupational, material / economic and socio-group – for victims residing in the community, who visit the center as needed.

2. **Medical treatment:**
 - a. **Access to Emergency Medical Treatment:** according to the *Patients Rights Law 5756-1996*, **all** persons in an emergency medical situation may receive emergency medical treatment

⁷ The capacity of each shelter may be doubled if necessary

without conditions. This includes of course trafficking victims, but they are also entitled to more comprehensive medical services, as follows:

- b. Medical treatment to victims lawfully residing in Israel who do not have adequate resources: medical treatment** is provided at the shelters by the Ministry of Health, including a primary care physician and a psychiatrist working with the shelters, and including more complex medical care if needed, including surgery, in collaboration with hospitals near the shelter.
- 3. Translation and interpretation services, when appropriate:** translation and interpretation are provided at the shelters as needed, including support for deaf sign language when it was required. Interpretation services are also available during victim recognition interviews, if required, and in medical proceedings. They are also provided by State Attorney's office, and in legal proceedings, when necessary, a translator may be requested on behalf of the Court.
- 4. Counselling and information, in particular as regards their legal rights and the services available to them, in a language that they can understand:**

 - a. The Legal Aid Administration in the Ministry of Justice** provides victims with **legal counselling and representations** in civil matters stemming from their trafficking and in procedures according to the *Entry into Israel Law 5712-1952* - see full details in our reply to Question #42 below. The Shelter and National Center staff also communicate the services available at the shelter and outside of it, using interpreters if necessary.
 - b.** In 2022, the GOI launched an initiative in collaboration with NGO "Lo Omdot Mineged", wherein in the recognition process, suspected victims meet with a specialized social worker, who provides support and communicates the available options to them. Recently, the social worker also began participating in Police interviews with potential victims discovered in Police operations.
 - c.** The Israeli Police operates an information system for victims of offences (the MENA system), in the following languages: Hebrew, Arabic, English, Russian and Amharic, allowing them to view the case and receive updates through several channels:

 - (1) Telephone system (IVR):** a telephone system for delivering information and messages. The system sends an SMS/initiated call (recorded voice message) to victims who requested it whenever there is a change in the status of the case or the suspect/accused. The victim identifies using the user code and password and receives the information and notification relevant to the proceedings in their case.

(2) **Hotline with human operators:** The hotline operates five days a week, Sunday-Thursday, between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 4:30 p.m. and is staffed by 3 operators who are police officers. The hotline provides allows victims of offences to receive explanations, clarifications and information that was not provided to them by the system.

(3) **Website:** victims may receive the information they are entitled to via the [Mena website](#). The system is entered using a personal ID code and password that the victim of the crime received when submitting the complaint and/or through identification on the government services website.

5. **Assistance to enable their rights and interests to be presented and considered at appropriate stages of criminal proceedings against offenders:**

In criminal proceedings the Victims' Rights Law of 2001 allows for the victims' position to be heard at critical stages of the criminal proceedings:

Before a conviction: they are allowed to voice their position when there has been a decision to suspend criminal proceedings; in cases where a plea bargain is considered, the prosecutor must notify the victims before a decision is made; they may submit any relevant information to the prosecution and make their position known, and it will be considered in making the decision.

After the conviction, during the sentencing process, victims may submit a written impact statement, which the prosecution must submit to the Court; the Court may also order the preparation of a victim assessment brief, which is written by a social worker trained in trauma.

If an appeal is filed by the accused, and the sentence included compensation, the victim must be added as a respondent to the appeal – allowing them to represent their interest as a party.

In criminal proceedings involving serious sex offences, victims are assisted by the LAA in the criminal proceedings from the point the indictment was filed; some victims of sex trafficking receive aid in the criminal proceedings in this manner. GR 1862 plan includes a recommendation to amend the Legal Aid Law to expand this aid to all victims of trafficking, starting at the investigation phase – to support them and to better ensure their representation.

In addition, **Government Resolution No. 1886** from October 2022, focuses promoting the rights of crime victims in legal proceedings and improving government response. The decision pertains to various aspects of the State Attorney's Office and all relevant legal processes concerning crime victims. It includes measures such as:

- Expanding the assistance units in the State Attorney's Office and including social advisors and victimologists to provide counseling. Additionally, ensuring there is Arabic speaker in each assistance unit.
- Enhancing accessibility to information and rights for crime victims through the "Online Prosecution" application.
- Establishing a team led by the State Attorney's Office to examine ways to improve access to law enforcement authorities for victims of sexual and domestic violence in the Arab society.
- Continuing the improvement of the process transferring court-ordered compensation to victims.

The implementation of this decision will take into account the unique needs of victims of trafficking, paying special attention to their concerns.

6. **Access to education for children:** All children residing in Israel receive access to **education** in the Israeli education system, which starts at age three, regardless of their immigration status. Children of victims residing at the shelters are typically placed in schools in the shelter's area.
7. **Victim Safety and protection:** the shelters are protected by a guard in all hours of the day. Where specific protection is needed, a specific assessment is conducted accordingly.
8. **Access to the labor market, vocational training and education:** the B1 visas given to victims allow work in all fields in Israel, and shelter staff assists victims in finding employment. Victims may also apply for and receive funding for various needs, including vocational training, language lessons and others via the **dedicated forfeiture fund** (see in detail in our reply to Question #42 below).

- Question 38: Please describe the differences in the assistance and protection measures envisaged for victims of transnational trafficking and those envisaged for victims of national trafficking.

There is no difference in the rights granted that is dependent on the nature of trafficking. As a rule, all victims are eligible to all assistance and protection measures. However, some mechanisms, the notable example being work visas, and free medical treatment, were designed with the needs of a non-citizen victim in mind, and victims who are citizens do not require them. Other mechanisms, most notably the dedicated forfeiture fund and the legal aid, have been widely used by victims who are Israeli citizens as well as by foreign victims.

- Question 39: Does your state budget allocate specific funding for these assistance and protection measures? Please indicate the amount (in euros), the criteria for receiving such funding and who receives it. Please specify the bodies/agencies/NGOs which actually cover the costs of the different types of assistance?

As mentioned above, the shelters, family apartments and the National Center are funded and supervised by the MWSS. The yearly operating budget of the shelters and family apartments is 7,780,776 NIS (1,953,545 Euro). The budget for the National Center is 1,106,959 NIS (78,788 Euro) – all of which are from the MWSS budget.

The MOH budget for primary medical care to the occupants at the shelter is 695,000 NIS (174,515 Euro). That includes: buying medication, health insurance for minors who stay with the occupants, the physician salary, payments for ambulance, and hospital services when needed (such as hospitalization, visits to the ER etc.)

The LAA has four (4) officials coordinating the LAA's assistance to victims of TIP and people in commercial sexual exploitation, at an annual budget of 700,000 NIS (175,770 Euro). It also contracts with eight (8) lawyers who handle the cases of TIP victims – the State paid them 92,000 NIS (27,335 USD) in lawyer fees in 2022.

- **Question 40:** Please describe how the recovery and reflection period provided for in Article 13 of the Convention is defined in your internal law. Please indicate the minimum and maximum duration of the recovery and reflection period and how your internal law foresees it being adapted to the particular circumstances of victims.

PIBA procedure 6.3.0008 on Victims of Slavery and Trafficking states that from the point for determination that there is *prima facie* evidence that a person is a victim of trafficking (see above in our reply to Question #19), they will be entitled to a temporary B1 working visa for a period of three months. If victims are recognized in detention, they are released and transferred into the shelter.

After that period, victims who are participating in legal proceedings receive a witness visas until the end of those proceedings (see Question #41 below), or they may apply to receive a rehabilitation visa – which they may request up to one month before the expiry of the initial temporary visa. This is usually done with the assistance of the shelter social workers, who provide an assessment of the victim and their situation as they have come to know them, and potential sources of support.

- **Question 41:** What are the grounds (personal situation and/or co-operation with the law enforcement authorities) for issuing residence permits to victims of THB provided for in Article 14 of the Convention? Please indicate the different types of residence permits which can be issued to victims of THB, their minimum and maximum duration, if any, and the grounds for their renewal.

Victim visas are B1 (or equivalent) visas, which allow victims to work in any employment field in Israel. They are available through two main mechanisms:

1. Victims who are participating in legal proceedings may receive **witness visas** for the duration of the

legal proceedings. Witness visas are issued based on the existence of an investigation, or the statement of the Prosecution that the victim will be a witness in criminal proceedings.

2. Victims who completed the legal proceedings or those who did not participate in legal proceedings (whether because they chose not to, or because different reasons made such proceedings irrelevant) may receive **rehabilitation visas** for a period of one year, which may be extended if the circumstances require it, subject to an extensions committee where cases are discussed with the shelter, the MWSS and PIBA.

- **Question 42:** Please describe how your internal law provides for the right of victims of THB to compensation. Please specify if your country has adopted any specific measures to guarantee compensation for victims of THB as provided for in Article 15 of the Convention.

Israeli legislation provides the same monetary compensation regime and relevant rules for all victims of offences, and also includes specific provisions for victims of trafficking.

Section 77 of the *Penal Law* authorizes the courts to include as part of sentencing, monetary compensation to the victim of an offence, up to the limit of 258,000 NIS (64,339 EUR). The victim has a right to write a Victim Impact Statement which describes their damages including relevant documentation according to Section 18 of the *Rights of Victims of Crime Law*. Furthermore, the prosecutor may, when necessary, inform the victim as to ways to obtain the documentation and evidence required for determining the damages.

Specifically for trafficking victims, Section 377C of the *Penal Law* stipulates that for the Offences of TIP and Holding a Person Under Conditions of Slavery, the Court must explain its decision to **abstain** from awarding compensation in the verdict – making compensation the default.

A convicted person can be required to pay compensation for the damage or suffering caused to the victim, depending on the offences committed, the extent of damage or injuries caused and other relevant circumstantial factors of the case. The amount of compensation to be provided will be either the value of the damage or suffering caused on the day the offence was committed, or alternatively the value of such damage and suffering on the day the decision of compensation is rendered, whichever is greater. For purposes of collection, compensation under this Section is treated like a fine. Furthermore, any amount paid or collected on account of a fine when compensation is also due, shall first be allocated to compensation.

It should be noted that a convicted person who is required to pay compensation according to Section 77 of the *Penal Law* does not pay directly to the victim of the crime, but rather through the court. Hence, there is no direct contact created between the perpetrator and the victim. If the convicted person fails to pay the compensation on schedule, the Center for Collection of Fines, Fees, and Expenses, an auxiliary unit of the

Ministry of Justice, proceeds to collect the relevant sum and the victim is not required to take action through the Executions Office.

According to section 3A of the *Center for Collection of Fines, Fees, and Expenses Law* 5755-1995, if the court includes compensation under section 77 of the *Penal Law* to a victim who is a minor, the Center for Collection of Fines, Fees, and Expenses will pay up to 10,000 NIS (2,624 USD) immediately to the victim, regardless of whether the offender paid the money.

Compensation available under Section 77 of the *Penal Law* does not restrict the victim's right to seek compensation under any other laws, such as under the *Tort Ordinance [New Version]* 5728-1968. Moreover, Section 77 does not restrict a victim from receiving representation from the LAA in such civil suits. If a victim of an offence believes that the amount of compensation the court awarded under Section 77 of the *Penal Law* is inadequate, and wishes to file a civil lawsuit against the convicted person, with or without others, they are entitled to do so through two different procedures:

1. A civil lawsuit according to Section 77 of the *Courts Law*. Such a lawsuit can be filed only against the convicted person and is submitted to the court that convicted the perpetrator and to the same judge. All factual determinations made during the criminal proceedings are admissible in the civil case without the need for the victim to prove them.
2. An ordinary and independent civil lawsuit, whether against the convicted person or against him/her and others parties who might also be liable for compensation to the victim⁸.

THE LEGAL AID ADMINISTRATION

The LAA, operating under the auspices of the MOJ, represents TIP victims (Section 377A of the *Penal Law*) and victims of slavery ("holding a person under conditions of slavery" offense, (according to Section 375A of the *Penal Law*). Its services to the victims are provided in civil proceedings, including damages and monetary claims against the offenders and in procedures in accordance with the *Entry into Israel Law* 5712-1952 (hereinafter: *the "Entry into Israel Law"*) (which includes requests for a one (1) year staying permit for the purpose of rehabilitation, and requests for release from detention and for receiving a legal status in Israel).

In addition, since 2017 the LAA has represented **victims of sex offences in criminal proceedings** – assisting them in realizing their rights in the criminal process, and in related administrative processes – in some cases, this has meant victims of TIP also received representation in the criminal process (as explained above in our reply to Question #37.

⁸ Note that victims who were awarded compensation by the court but were not able to collect it, may apply to the forfeiture fund and request an allocation for that reason

Victims need not travel to the LAA Offices; the LAA staff regularly visited the detention facilities and the shelters. Legal aid is granted free of charge, and the victims are **exempted from the economic eligibility test** as set by the *Legal Aid Law 5732-1972*, usually required in order to prove one's entitlement for free legal aid services. Furthermore, those assisted by the LAA are also **exempted from all filing fees that apply to legal proceedings in every instance**, including the Immigration and Labor Courts⁹.

DEDICATED FORFEITURE FUND

The Anti-Trafficking Law (Legislation Amendments) 5767-2006 established a special Forfeiture Fund (hereafter: The forfeiture fund), where forfeited property and fines from trafficking and slavery offenses are deposited and are dedicated to various causes in combating TIP – with a special emphasis on victim protection and compensation. Institutions, government bodies and NGOs may apply for funds, as well as – uniquely – victims of the offences, who may ask for funds for the purposes of rehabilitation, as well as to request court ordered compensation which they have been unable to collect from the offenders. The law gives precedence to victim protection, ordering that at least half of the funds each year be allocated to that purpose.

The fund allows special use of forfeiture funds and fines imposed for the commission of crimes of human trafficking or holding in conditions of slavery for purposes related to the fight against these crimes and protection of the victims:

1. Rehabilitation of the victims of these crimes, their care and protection. As a precedent, the law states that not less than half of the fund's assets be allocated each year for this purpose in one year;
2. Payment of compensation (in whole or in part) to a victim of human trafficking for whom compensation was awarded, whether in a civil or criminal proceeding, if they were able to show that they were not reasonably able to collect the judgment.
3. Prevention of the commission of human trafficking offenses;
4. Performing the duties of law enforcement authorities to enforce the provisions of the law regarding human trafficking offenses.

The methods of operating the fund, including the method of allocating the fund monies, were determined in the *Penal Regulations (the Methods of Managing the Special Fund for dealing with forfeited property and fines imposed in cases of trafficking and holding in conditions of slavery)*, 5769-2009 (hereinafter: "The

⁹ According to article 19(8) of the Courts Regulation (Fees), and adopted into the legislation for the labor and immigration courts

Regulations").

The Regulations determine the methods of managing the fund, including a committee to make recommendations to the Administrator General in regard to the allocation of assets from the fund for the purposes specified in the law (hereinafter: the Forfeiture Fund Committee). The Forfeiture Fund Committee is comprised of nine members: a lawyer qualified to be a judge as chairman, a representative of the Minister of Justice who serves as coordinator of the inter-ministerial body for the fight against human trafficking, a representative of the Ministry of Finance, a representative of the Ministry of the Interior, a representative of the Ministry of Welfare and Social Services, a representative of the Ministry of National Security, to be appointed from among the Israel Police staff, two public representatives appointed by the Minister of Justice with academic, professional or practical background and experience in the field of combating human trafficking, and a public representative appointed by the Minister of Justice with an academic, professional or practical background and experience in the field of human rights.

Although the fund was already established in 2006 and the regulations were put in place in 2009, the start of the fund's activities and the recommending committee in its case was delayed, due to a lack of resources in the fund in such a way that it was not possible to distribute its assets. Starting in 2014, additional funds were deposited into the confiscation fund, which enabled the start of its activities, following a conviction in a major case of trafficking in women.

So far, there have been five allocation rounds to the fund, in 2016, 2017, 2019, 2021 and 2022. In total, the fund allocated over 2 million NIS (about half a million euros) – the large majority of which were allocated directly to victims for purposes such as vocational training, mental care, dental care, housing assistance (particularly during the Covid-19 pandemic) and more.

In 2022, 112 requests were submitted, and 105 were approved. The total amount allocated in 2022 was 807,463 NIS (approximately 201,119 EUR), of which:

- 72,000 NIS (approximately 18,000 EUR) were allocated to non-governmental organizations (NGOs).
 - 735,463 NIS (approximately 183,000 EUR) were allocated to victims of human trafficking and slavery.
- Question 43: Please describe the procedure established under your internal law for the repatriation and return of victims of THB.

According to Government resolution No. 1862, toward the date of the victims' leaving the State of Israel back to their country of origin, and insofar as the victims agree to do so, the entity treating the victims shall refer to the International Department at the Ministry of Welfare and Social Security, which would act, to

the extent possible, for contacting the welfare authorities or organizations engaging in accompaniment and treatment of trafficking victims in the country of origin, in order to inform them of the victims' return and coordinate their reception and further accompaniment and treatment upon their return.

At the same time, the treating body shall contact the Voluntary Departure Unit at PIBA to coordinate the date of the victim's return and purchase the flight ticket for them. The purpose of these measures is to help the victim to return to their country in a supervised and safe manner, as well as their reception, while maintaining continuity of care to the extent possible, increasing their prospects of reintegrating into society in their country of origin and preventing re-victimization.

The Police is responsible for the assessment of threats and danger in the country of origin prior to the date of the victims' return, in cases where concern arises of the victims' wellbeing upon their departure from Israel back to their country.

- **Question 44:** Does a person, repatriated to your country as a victim of THB, continue having victim status? If so, please specify on which grounds such recognition is made (for example, declaration of the victim). What assistance measures are envisaged for such persons after repatriation?

If a person is repatriated to the country, the same rules apply as other victims – *prima facie* evidence will be determined, and they will be eligible for all the victim protection rights. Shelter rehabilitation is an option but usually an Israeli national would not choose it. The victim may apply for assistance to the Forfeiture Fund, and may also receive assistance from the LAA as needed. In specific cases, the MWSS and other relevant ministries have examined the individual circumstances and determined the assistance needed.

- **Question 45:** What are the grounds for the victim status to come to an end:
 - victim status claimed improperly;
 - victim's refusal to co-operate with the authorities;
 - return to the country of origin;
 - request of the victim;
 - other, please specify.

Victim status, once a determination of *prima facie* evidence is made, **does not come to an end unless it is found it was claimed improperly, or based on facts that were clearly refuted**. Victim protections, naturally, end as they become irrelevant – for example, victims who return to the country of origin no longer receive shelter protection in Israel, but victim status continues, and past victims or victims who have returned to their countries of origin may still, for example, apply to assistance from the forfeiture fund.

Section II.3. Implementation of measures concerning substantive criminal law, investigation, prosecution and procedural law

Questions in this section aim to obtain information on the implementation by parties of measures concerning substantive criminal law contained in Chapter IV of the Convention (Articles 18 to 26) as well as measures concerning investigation, prosecution and procedural law contained in Chapter V of the Convention (Articles 27 to 31).

Questions:

- *Question 46:* Is THB subject to a single criminal offence in your internal law? If so, please provide (a translation of) the legal text(s) in English or French. If not, please specify the combination of criminal offences, covering as minimum all conducts falling within the definition of THB as contained in Article 4 of the Convention, used under your internal law to prosecute for THB.

Trafficking in Persons (article 377A¹⁰)

(a) He who carries on a transaction in a person for the following purposes or carries on a transaction in a person and places him in danger of one of the following – is subject to imprisonment for a term of sixteen years:

- (1) removal of an organ;
- (2) giving birth to a child and taking away said child;
- (3) subjecting him to slavery;
- (4) subjecting him to forced labor;
- (5) subjecting him to an act of prostitution;
- (6) subjecting him to participation in a pornographic publication or show;
- (7) committing a sexual offense against him;

(b) If a crime is committed according to subsection (a) against a minor – the perpetrator is subject to imprisonment for a term of 20 years.

(c) He who functions as a middleman in a transaction in a person, as detailed in subsection (a), whether for consideration (recompense) or lack of consideration, shall be considered as perpetrating a transaction in such a person.

(d) In this Section, "transaction in a person" – selling or purchasing a person or carrying out another kind of transaction in a person, whether for consideration (recompense) or lack of consideration."

Kidnapping for Purposes of Trafficking (article 374A)

He who kidnaps a person for one of the purposes enumerated in section 377A or in order to place him in one of the dangers enumerated in that section – is subject to imprisonment for a term of 20 years.

¹⁰ All articles cited in the reply to this question are in the Penal Law

Holding a Person under Conditions of Slavery (article 375A)

(a) He who holds a person under conditions of slavery for work or services, including sexual services – is subject to imprisonment for a term of 16 years.

(b) If a crime, according to subsection (a) is committed against a minor – the perpetrator is subject to imprisonment for 20 years.

In this section, "slavery" – a condition under which the powers generally exercised towards property, are exercised over a person; In this context, substantive control over the life of a person or deprivation of his freedom will be considered the exercise of such powers as aforementioned.

Forced Labor (article 376)

He who unlawfully forces a person to work, by means of force, other means of pressure or a threat of force or pressure, or by consent elicited by fraudulent means, whether for consideration (recompense) or lack of consideration – is subject to a term of 7 years imprisonment.

Causing a Person to Leave their Country for Prostitution or Slavery (article 376B)

(a) He who causes a person to leave their country of residence in order to employ him in prostitution or hold him under conditions of slavery – is subject to imprisonment for a term of 10 years.

(b) If a crime according to subsection (a) is committed against a minor – the perpetrator is subject to imprisonment for a term of 15 years.

Other offences that might apply in cases of trafficking in persons include:

Taking a person outside the Country (Article 370)

He who takes a person outside the borders of the country in which that person is staying without his own consent or that of the person authorized by law to consent for him, is subject to ten years imprisonment.

Holding a Passport (Article 376A)

He who unlawfully holds a passport, travel document, or identity card of another person is subject to three years imprisonment; He who does so for the purpose of one of the purposes listed in section 377a(a) or who thereby exposes the person to one of the dangers listed in that section – is subject to five years imprisonment.

- *Question 47:* Does your internal law establish as a criminal offence the use of services of a victim of THB with the knowledge that the person is a victim of THB as provided for in Article 19 of the Convention?¹¹

While not an individual offence, **Attorney General's Directive 4.1115** on enforcement policy of the prohibition on consumption of prostitution, mentioned above, details the principles for the application of the law, and lists aggravating circumstances under which an indictment may be filed (rather than a fine). Those circumstances include receiving prostitution from a victim of trafficking in persons.

- *Question 48:* Does your internal law establish as a specific criminal offence retaining, removing, concealing, damaging or destroying a travel or identity document of another person committed intentionally and for the purpose of enabling THB as provided for in Article 20c of the Convention?

The Israeli law does not contain a specific offence, but the *Penal Law* contains general offences of forgery and use of a forged document, as follows:

Forgery (Article 418)

If a person forges a document, then he is liable to one year imprisonment; if a person forges a document with intent to obtain anything by it, then he is liable to three years imprisonment; if the offense is committed under aggravating circumstances, then he is liable to five years imprisonment.

Use of forged document (Article 420)

If a person submits or issues a forged document or uses it in some other manner in the knowledge that it is forged, then he shall be treated like the person who forged it.

It is likely that committing these offences in the context of THB or for the purpose of THB would count as an aggravating circumstance as described above.

- *Question 49:* Does your internal law ensure that a legal person can be held liable for criminal offences established in accordance with the Convention as provided for in its Article 22? What types of legal persons are subject to corporate liability for such offences?

Israel's law allows for legal persons to be held liable for trafficking offences. This applies to any entity defined in Israeli law as a corporation, including companies, associations, partnerships, cooperative societies, Ottoman societies and governmental companies.

Article 23(a)(2) of the Penal Law establishes that corporate liability will apply in offences of criminal thought (such as trafficking offences) if under the circumstances and considering the role of the person, their

¹¹ Article 19 of the Convention does not concern using the services of a prostitute as such and the criminalisation of her/his client (see paragraphs 229 to 236 of the Explanatory Report of the Convention).

authority and responsibility in the conduct of the corporation's affairs, their act establishing the offence and their criminal thought is to be seen as the act and thought of the corporation. This condition is interpreted by the Court examining the hierarchical status of the natural person within the corporation, as well as the functions that they fill – to determine whether they constitute an organ of the corporation. Natural persons who hold a managerial position within the corporation are always considered organs.

Note that this means that under Israeli law, holding power of representation from the corporation is not in itself sufficient to establish corporate liability, nor does lack of supervision or control by a natural person within the corporation holding a leading position which enables an employee or agent, who does not hold a leading position, to commit a criminal offence.

- *Question 50*: Which sanctions does your internal law provide for criminal offences established in accordance with the Convention? Please specify the criminal, civil and administrative sanctions.

Criminal Sanctions

Penalties

See above – the **criminal** penalty for trafficking in persons and holding under conditions of slavery is sixteen (16) years imprisonment, and twenty (20) years if the victim is a minor. The legislation also sets out a minimum penalty of a quarter of the maximum punishment, unless the Court has decided on a lighter punishment for special reasons that must be written, and the law also separately stipulates that the punishment may not be entirely suspended in the absence of special reasons. As mentioned above, Article 377C of the Penal Law also sets compensation in the offences of trafficking in persons and holding under conditions of slavery as the default – and stipulates that the Court must explain in its sentencing decision its reasons for abstaining to include compensation in the sentence.

Punishments for other offences according to the convention:

- Abduction for the purposes of trafficking (article 374a): twenty (20) years
- Causing a person to leave their country for prostitution or slavery (article 376b): ten (10) years, fifteen (15) if the victim is a minor
- Forced labor (Article 376): seven (7) years.

Forfeiture of assets

Assets associated with trafficking in persons and holding under conditions of slavery are subject to forfeiture

by the State. As explained in our reply to Question #42, forfeited assets under those offences go into a dedicated anti-trafficking forfeiture fund.

Money Laundering

All trafficking and trafficking-related offences are predicate offences under the Prohibition on Money Laundering Law, 5760-2000.

Administrative Sanctions

License to employ foreign workers

According to article 1(15)(A2) of the *Foreign Workers Law* 5751-1991, the Supervisor of Foreign Workers has the authority to revoke an employer's license to employ foreign workers in cases that the applicant was convicted in a severe crime. Among those crimes are trafficking in persons (Article 377A of the Penal Law); holding under conditions of slavery (Article 375A of the Penal Law); and forced labor (Article 376 of the Penal Law). Whenever the Supervisor is informed about an investigation regarding those crimes, they are authorized to delay their decision until a decision regarding filing an indictment would be made (to accommodate cases where a criminal investigation is still under way). While those powers were implicitly available to the Supervisor before, this article, amended in 2017, makes them explicit and guides the decision-making process.

PIBA is authorized to refuse licenses for employment of foreign workers if the employer did not pay financial sanctions, whereas beforehand it could refuse a license only in cases the employer did not pay an administrative fine or a fine imposed in a verdict of a criminal proceeding.

The Amendment lays out in explicit detail the powers and authorities of Supervisor of Foreign Workers: noting their authority to set rules for providing the license, even in cases they are not specified in the regulations; their authority to add conditions to the license, before the decision to revoke it; their authority to refuse to extend the license; and their authority to demand the deposit of financial guarantees for either giving the license or extending it.

Licenses of recruitment agencies may also be revoked if violations are discovered. Corporations must also deposit a guarantee for the protection of workers' rights, which might be activated if violations are discovered.

Closing of Premises

The Limiting Use of Premises in order to Prevent the Commission of Crime Law 5765-2005 allows the closure of premises by the Police for a total of up to 30 days, where there are reasonable grounds to believe that

those premises were used for the commission of offences – including trafficking in persons. The Court may issue an order extending that period for up to 60 days, with additional extensions if needed, at the request of the officer in charge of the investigation or that prosecution.

Removing access to websites

The Authorities for Prevention of Internet Use for the Commission of Offenses Law 5777-2017 allows the District Court, upon the request of a prosecutor from the Cybercrime Department in the State Attorney's Office, to issue an order limiting access to websites used for the commission of prostitution, gambling and drug offences, including for example the advertising of a prostitution of a minor.

Sanctions for violations of labor laws

The *Law for the Enhanced Enforcement of the Labor Laws* 5772 - 2011 includes several mechanisms designed to enhance the enforcement of labor laws. It allows for effective enforcement and differential punishments that correspond with the severity of the offense and the employment history of the employer. The Law creates a very powerful deterrence effect and provides the employees with greater protection.

The Law and its enforcement procedures include mechanisms for **incentivizing the employer to correct the violation**, for example, regulations which state that a condition to lowering the amount of the financial sanction for most violations is the correction of the violation.

The MoL Enforcement Division, which is responsible for the investigation and prosecution of violations of labor laws, **employs two hundred and ten (210) labor inspectors** for the enforcement and regulation of workers' rights in the entire Israeli economy. The inspectors conduct review visits on a daily basis, at different arenas where foreign workers are employed. As it does every year, a tender was held for the procurement of translation services in all languages, and the interpreters join the investigators on the performance of enforcement audits, as needed.

Civil Sanctions:

See above in our reply to other questions above: victims may sue traffickers in the civil courts for compensation, with the assistance of the LAA. Victims may (and do) file suit, with the assistance of the legal aid, under various torts.

Victims, with the assistance of the LAA, may also sue in the Labor Courts: In several rulings, most notably in the case of Anonymous v. Sofia Kuchik (Labor Appeal (National) 247/07), the High Labor Court decreed that while the relationship between a sex trafficking victim and the perpetrator is not and cannot be a labor relationship, since the law does not legitimize and protect the exploitative relationship, the labor Courts must still protect the rights and protections of the victims, and will not allow traffickers to be evade the law by power of the exploitative relationship. Thus, traffickers were ordered to pay full minimum wage, severance pay and other labor rights to victims.

Civil suits, in all courts, are often filed in cases where the evidence did not reach the threshold for a criminal conviction in trafficking offences. They are thus an important mechanism through which victims can receive compensation and traffickers are held accountable.

- **Question 51:** Does your internal law provide for the possibility to take into account previous convictions in another party when determining the penalty in relation to offences established in accordance with the Convention?

Article 40(11) to the *Penal Law* lists the circumstances the Court may consider when determining the Penalty, outside of those related to the commission of the offence itself. The list includes the existence or absence of a criminal past. The list does not explicitly state that such a past is limited to convictions under Israeli law, and thus may also apply to convictions in other countries. In practice, Courts do sometimes consider convictions in other countries¹².

- **Question 52:** Please describe how your internal law provides for the possibility of not imposing penalties on victims of THB for their involvement in unlawful activities, to the extent that they were compelled to do so, as provided for in Article 26 of the Convention.

State Attorney Guideline 2.32

[State Attorney Guideline 2.32](#) (Hebrew link) deals with TIP, Slavery, and Forced Labor, and implements the non-criminalization principle. It states that as a rule, if the offence is found to be related, by its nature, to the suspect being a victim of the aforementioned offences, and the following conditions are met, that will be a consideration against indicting them for the offence:

1. There is *prima facie* evidence that the person is a victim of said offences
2. The offence is inherently related to the person's status as a victim of the said offences
3. The totality of the circumstances does not indicate substantial public interest in indictment. Examples of such cases are offences of less acute severity, cases of a victim who is a minor, and more.

The Guideline joins State Attorney Guideline 2.2, which outlined similar policy for victims of TIP for the purpose of prostitution. Since its publication it was widely circulated among relevant enforcement bodies, including bodies who administer administrative sanctions like PIBA, and has been integrated into trainings.

Police policy is that victims may not be questioned on offences related to irregular stay and similar offences,

¹² Even if article 40(11) were understood as applying exclusively to convictions under Israeli Law, article 40(12) clarifies that the Court is allowed to consider additional circumstances to the ones listed in 40(11) – and thus allows for considering convictions in other jurisdictions

and units were instructed not to open investigations on those offences if they are related to the trafficking in the victim or prostitution related offence. The PTC runs on-the-spot checks on investigation cases to ensure this policy is maintained in practice, and sends periodic reminders on this to the units.

The Police works to encourage victims to complain, and investigates complaints regardless of status, and without turning complainants over to PIBA, and when contacted by PIBA about a potential victim in detention, will investigate and if recognized – the victim will be removed from detention and released to the shelters.

Enforcement in the Context of the Prohibition of Consumption of Prostitution

Section 7 of the **Attorney General Directive 4.1115 on The Law Prohibiting the Consumption of Prostitution (Temporary Provision and Legislative Amendment) 5779-2019** clarifies that the purpose of the offence is to protect those in prostitution, who are seen as victims in the offense, and that enforcement should be conducted accordingly:

As a general rule, the treatment of populations involved in prostitution, during law enforcement operations, will be conducted with the necessary sensitivity, emphasizing the need to preserve the autonomy those in the cycle in the cycle of prostitution. In this framework, these populations will not, to the extent possible, be brought to the police station for the purpose of giving evidence regarding the offense of prohibiting the consumption of prostitution. Taking note of the above, the Israel Police will regulate in a procedure the conduct of police officers towards populations in the cycle of prostitution, in order to ensure as much as possible that the enforcement actions in themselves will not aggravate the harm to them. In addition to this, the officials who will be authorized to enforce the Prostitution Prohibition Law in the Israel Police will receive dedicated training, which will include, among other things, reference to the difficulties faced by those in the cycle of prostitution, including the shame and stigmas they face.

In cases where the person who provided prostitution services was interrogated at the Police station, and their testimony revealed that they were harmed during the consumption of prostitution services, the investigator will inform them of their rights in accordance with the Crime Victims' Rights Law, 5761- 2001 and will enquire whether they wish to receive information about the continuation of the procedure.

Enforcement Against Brothels

Since concern was raised that enforcement of this section could be harmful to women in prostitution and target an already vulnerable population, the Police examined the use of the section in the criminal law

allowing enforcement against brothels creating a public nuisance. The Police have reviewed past cases opened under this section, and instructions have been passed on to the relevant unit, requesting that irregularities be corrected. Guidelines were also written to the units, **instructing this section not be enforced except under specific circumstances**. This resulted in as cases opened under this offence going down by two thirds compared to 2017 – as ninety-three (93) cases were opened in 2017 and only thirty-one (31) cases were opened in 2019, in 2020, sixteen (16) cases were opened. **In 2021, only thirteen (13) cases were opened, and in 2022 only one (1) case.**

- **Question 53:** Does your internal law provide for the initiation of legal proceedings by the victim and/or *ex officio* (for example, by the public prosecutor)?

Criminal legal proceedings may not be initiated by the victim, but the victim may initiate administrative and civil proceedings and is also eligible for legal aid to support them in doing so, as described above.

- **Question 54:** Please describe how your internal law allows for NGOs or associations/groups assisting or supporting victims to participate in legal proceedings (for example, as third parties)? Please specify the conditions for this participation as well as their legal status during these proceedings.

NGOs and other groups or associations may file **administrative** petitions to the Courts, or join as parties to such petitions. In individual administrative petitions, NGOs and others may also file to join as *amicus curiae* – both of these methods have been employed in practice in cases in recent years.

- **Question 55:** Please describe the measures taken in your internal law to protect the identity and safety of victims before, during and after investigations and legal proceedings.

Evidence not in the presence of the accused

The Court Procedure Amendment Law (Witness Interrogation) 5718- 1958 states that with regard to the offense of TIP, the Court may order that the victim testify not in the presence of the accused. In such cases, the victims may testify behind a screen or via video.

Court Hearings under closed doors

While Court hearings are as a rule open to the public, article 68(b)(9) to the Courts Law allows the Court to hold its hearings under closed doors in cases of trafficking in persons (article 377A of the Penal Law). The law also allows hearings under closed doors to protect the interests of a minor or a disabled person.

The Chief Justice Procedure for the Testimony of Victims of Sex Offences

The procedure implements several steps to address the special difficulties criminal proceedings pose for victims of sex offenses, including sex trafficking. It came into effect March 1st, 2021, and was recently also

adopted for **civil** proceedings. Among others, the procedure stipulates:

1. Every Court will have a designated contact person for sex offences, and they will ensure the victim is accompanied by a Court security person from the moment they enter the Court until they leave. The victim will also receive a room to wait in until giving their testimony.
2. To the extent possible, a testimony of a sex offences victim will be scheduled to be first in the day; to the extent possible, and when it is in line with the victim's best interest, the victim will give their testimony in one session.
3. In a District Court criminal hearing on sex offences, the panel hearing the case will be of both genders.
4. Every courtroom will have a functional and available video-conference system, and the victim may, upon request and to the extent possible, watch the courtroom proceedings from a separate room through a closed-circuit system.
5. Efforts will be made to give the verdict as soon as possible after the end of the hearings – acknowledging the victim's anticipation of the results and the possible therapeutic benefits.

Enabling early testimony

The Courts Law (Amendment No. 94), 5778 – 2018 concerns offenses heard by a single judge rather than a panel of three, although the penalty for the offense is ten years' imprisonment or more. The amendment included the offense of inducing a person to engage in prostitution under aggravated circumstances under Section 203 of the Penal Law, and the offense of causing a person to leave their country for prostitution or slavery under Section 376B of the Penal Law. The legislation enables the hearing of these offenses before a single judge, and aims to allow for prompt pre-trial testimony before the victim's return to their country of origin, thus enabling effective prosecution of trafficking cases.

Protecting the privilege of therapy materials

The Privilege of Evidence Law (Psychotherapy in Criminal Proceedings concerning Sexual offenses or Serious Violence Offenses in the Family) (Legislative Amendments), 5782-2022, which came into **force in April 2023**, amends the requirements regarding the lifting of privilege of psychotherapy (for therapists, social workers and doctors), for offences that include the trafficking offence. The amendment revises the balancing formula according to which the court will determine whether to lift the privilege, in such manner that the number of cases and the therapeutic materials that will be referred to the review of the defense will be reduced. The amendment also stipulates that the privilege will be restored and be subject to the Court's balancing formula even in cases where it had been lifted in the investigation stage. In any event in which

privilege is lifted during the stage of the investigation or in trial, after the indictment was filed, the victim of the offense is entitled to present their position to the court, before making a decision. The victim of the offense may also request that the position of the professional who treated them will also be heard.

1. Provisions that will guide the police investigator in anything related to explanations and rights to the victim of the crime before asking them to waive privilege, and prior to the hearing that will be held in court, if the victim of the offense refuses to waive the privilege.
2. Additional specific provisions adapting the procedure for victims who are minors.

III: Statistics on THB

Question	Table 1: Victims of THB	2020				2021				2022			
		women	men	children ¹	total	women	men	children ¹	total	women	men	children ¹	total
Article 10 – Identification of the victims													
T1	Number of victims identified ² during the year	53	16	0	69	28	22	1	51	77 ³	8	2	87
T2	Types of exploitation identified victims of THB were subject to:												
	- sexual exploitation	8	0	0	8	16	0	1	17	66	0	0	66
	- forced labour or services	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1
	- slavery or practices similar to slavery	5	16	0	21	12 ⁴	22	0	34	10	8	2	20
	- servitude ⁵	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	- removal of organs	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
	- other, please specify: abusive cults	39	0	0	39	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
T3	Number of persons whom the competent authorities had reasonable grounds to believe were victims of ⁶ :												
	- national trafficking	44	15	0	59	12	22	1	35	7	5	2	14
	- transnational trafficking	9	1	0	10	16	0	0	16	70	3	0	73
Article 12 – Assistance to victims													

¹ “Child” shall mean any person under eighteen years of age (Article 4-d of the Convention).

² “Identified” within the meaning of the Convention.

³ Including one transgender woman

⁴ Including one transgender woman

⁵ Servitude is not an individual offence under Israeli law, and may be prosecuted under the offence of holding under conditions of slavery

⁶ In replying to this questionnaire and after consulting with the Secretariat, we understood transnational trafficking to refer to trafficking where the act of exploitation included movement between countries, and national trafficking to refer to trafficking where all acts occurred within the country, even if victims were foreign. We have thus included the reported numbers herein.

T4	Number of victims of THB who received assistance of any type ¹				396 ²				478 ³				⁴ 439
T5	Number of victims of THB who refused assistance which was offered to them ⁵												50
T6	Number of shelters for victims of THB in your country	1	1	0	2	1	1	0	2	1	1	0	2
T7	Total number of places in shelters for victims of THB ⁶	35	35	0	70	35	35	0	70	35	35	0	70
T8	Number of victims of THB accommodated in shelters ⁷	49	32	0	72	30	21	0	41	48	26	0	74

¹ This number was calculated as the sum of the victims who received assistance at the shelters and family apartments, victims who received assistance at the National Center, victims who received legal aid and victims who received financial allocations for the forfeiture fund. As these records were aggregated rather than individual, it is highly likely that many victims were counted more than once, since many victims receive more than one type of assistance in a given year. Numbers for medical care were not included in these sums since it is assumed all victims who received medical assistance also received another type of assistance, typically at the shelters. Work and residence visas were also not included since they are not included under article 12 – they are reported separately under the number for article 14.

² This is comprised of: 76 referrals to the LAA, 49 women and 32 men treated at the shelters and family apartments; 106 women and 133 men treated at the National Center.

³ This is comprised of: 135 referrals to the LAA, 30 women and 21 men treated at the shelters and family apartments; 99 women and 113 men treated at the National Center, and 80 victims who received allocations from the forfeiture fund

⁴ This is comprised of: 69 referrals to the LAA, 48 women and 26 men treated at the shelters and family apartments; 97 women and 101 men treated at the National Center, and 98 victims who received allocations from the forfeiture fund

⁵ We do not have that data for most years – data is only available for 2022

⁶ The tender for the shelters allows to double the beds in each shelter as needed

⁷ Those numbers do not include children of victims who were accommodated – usually at the family apartments – with their parents. It also does **not** include the number of victims who were treated by the National Center while residing in the community

Question	Table 1: Victims of THB (continued)	2020				2021				2022			
		women	men	children ¹	total	women	men	children ¹	total	women	men	children ¹	total
	Article 13 – Recovery and reflection period												
T9	Number of victims of THB (including persons whom the competent authorities had reasonable grounds to believe were victims of THB) who were granted a recovery and reflection period ²	9	17		26	24	16		40	17	5		22
	Article 14 – Residence permit												
T10	Number of victims of THB who were issued a residence permit ³												
	- owing to their personal situation				30				40				62
	- for the purpose of their co-operation with the competent authorities				128				133				107
	Article 15 – Compensation and legal redress⁴												
T11	Number of victims of THB who obtained compensation	9	0	2	11	1	4	0	5	10	4	0	14
T12	Compensation awarded to victims of THB:												
	- minimum amount awarded to a victim (in euros)	552		2456		19900	6480			859	4913		
	- maximum amount awarded to a victim (in euros)	2948		4913		19900	6480			14740	5241		
	Article 16 – Repatriation and return of victims												

¹ “Child” shall mean any person under eighteen years of age (Article 4-d of the Convention).

² These numbers refer to all victims who entered the shelters in a given year

³ The data available in this category is listed by the category of visa given (for example, the number of rehabilitation visas and the number of visa extensions), so some victims have been counted more than once; gender breakdown was not available, but as a rule all foreign victims in the time period were adults

⁴ Figures under questions T11-12 refer to Court-ordered compensation in criminal and civil proceedings. We have **not** included the number of victims who received compensation from the Forfeiture fund – but would note that the fund is an important mechanism that allows victims to receive compensation they have been awarded, but not been able to collect from the perpetrators.

T13	Number victims of THB who were repatriated to your country	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
T14	Number of victims of THB who were repatriated from your country to another country ¹	6	1	0	7	21	21	0	42 ²	8	0	0	8

Question	Table 2: Criminal Proceedings and Sanctions	2020	2021	2022
		Article 18 – Criminalisation of trafficking in human beings		
T15	Number of criminal proceedings initiated on grounds of THB ³	3	1	3
T16	Number of convictions for THB	8	1	1
Article 19 – Criminalisation of the use of services of a victim				
T17	Number of convictions for the use of services of a victim of THB	0	0	0
Article 23 – Sanctions and measures				
T18	Number of convictions for THB resulting in penalties involving deprivation of liberty	6	1	1
T19	Duration of penalties on grounds of THB involving deprivation of liberty			
	- minimum duration	6 months	4 years	20 months
	- maximum duration	5.5 years	4 years	20 months
T20	Number of judgements resulting in the confiscation of assets	1	1	1
T21	Number of judgements resulting in the closure of a business or an establishment which was being used to carry out THB ⁴	0	0	1
Article 26 – Non-punishment provision				

¹ These numbers are shelter statistics for those leaving the shelters to other countries – they may not include victims who chose not to stay in the shelter at all and were repatriated soon after being recognized, or those who were resettled in other countries as refugees after leaving the shelter.

² The data on victims leaving the shelter in 2021 did not include the context in which they left – so this number refers to all victims leaving the shelters, including those who left to stay in the community or resumed work in Israel – for other years, the numbers include only those who left the shelter to return to their country or under a resettlement program

³ These numbers refer to prosecutions initiated in a given year

⁴ The numbers refer only to closures in cases in offences under the convention, but many closures are conducted on a preventative basis for prostitution-related offences

T22	Number of victims of THB who benefitted from the non-punishment provision ¹			
-----	--	--	--	--

¹ Data is unavailable on this, since the decision to refrain from a sanction is not systematically recorded

Question	Table 3: Country of origin of victims of THB		2020	2021	2022
T23	Number of victims of THB originating from:				
	- Council of Europe Member States:	Albania	0	0	0
Andorra		0	0	0	
Armenia		0	0	0	
Austria		0	0	0	
Azerbaijan		0	0	0	
Belgium		0	0	0	
Bosnia and Herzegovina		0	0	0	
Bulgaria		0	0	0	
Croatia		0	0	0	
Cyprus		0	0	0	
Czech Republic		0	0	0	
Denmark		0	0	0	
Estonia		0	0	0	
Finland		0	0	0	
France		0	0	0	
Georgia		0	0	0	
Germany		0	0	0	
Greece		0	0	0	
Hungary		0	0	2	
Iceland		0	0	0	
Ireland	0	0	0		
Italy	0	0	0		
Latvia	0	0	0		
Liechtenstein	0	0	0		
Lithuania	0	0	0		

	Luxembourg	0	0	0
	Malta	0	0	0
	Republic of Moldova	1	1	2
	Monaco	0	0	0
	Montenegro	0	0	0
	Netherlands	0	0	0
	Norway	0	0	0
	Poland	0	0	0
	Portugal	0	0	0
	Romania	0	0	3
	Russian Federation	4	9	29
	San Marino	0	0	0
	Serbia	0	0	0
	Slovak Republic	0	0	0
	Slovenia	0	0	0
	Spain	0	0	1
	Sweden	0	0	0
	Switzerland	0	0	0
	“the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”	0	0	0
	Turkey	1	0	0
	Ukraine	4	4	18
	United Kingdom	0	0	0
	- other, please specify			
	Israel	39	1	4
	Belarus	1	2	1
	Nigeria	1	0	1
	Palestinian Authority	1	3	7
	Ethiopia	0	7	12
	Thailand	12	0	0
	China	0	11	2

	Eritrea	3	4	3
	Rwanda	0	1	0
	Honduras	1	0	0
	Vietnam	0	8	0
	Sudan	1	0	2
	Argentina	0	0	2
	Brazil	0	0	6
	Chile	0	0	1
	Colombia	0	0	4
	Kazakhstan	0	0	2
	Central African Republic	0	0	1

Annex: Multi-Year Plan for Implementation of the National Plan for the Elimination of Human Trafficking, 2022-2026

Further to Government Resolution No. 4463 dated 13.1.2019, the Permanent CEO Committee on Human Trafficking (hereinafter: the **CEO Committee**) established by the inter-ministerial coordinator on the issue of the elimination of human trafficking at the Ministry of Justice, in accordance with Government Resolution No. 63 dated 21.5.2006 (hereinafter: the “**Inter-Ministerial Coordinator**”) was tasked with the formulation of an implementation plan based on the multi-year plan for the elimination of the phenomenon of human trafficking and modern slavery (hereinafter: the “**Multi-Year Plan**”), and pursuant to the CEO Committee’s resolution dated 28.2.2022 (hereinafter: the “**CEO Committee’s Resolution**”), to recommend that the government approve the implementation plan it had established (hereinafter: the “**Implementation Plan**”);

Resolve,

1. To adopt in principle the Implementation Plan established by the CEO Committee, as detailed in Appendix “A” to this Resolution, and in accordance with the following:
2. A. Instruct the government ministers enumerated in the Implementation Plan to continue execution of the Implementation Plan, as detailed in the table in Appendix A, and according to the resources assigned to this as part of the Government Resolutions specified in Appendix A.
B. Empower the sub-teams on whose recommendations the Implementation Plan had been based, as tracking and monitoring teams over the execution of the Implementation Plan - prevention team, enforcement and locating team, victim protection team and research team.
3. Section 2 above shall not apply to the sections of the Plan in respect of which it is required to take balancing action pursuant to section 40a of the Budget Foundations Law, 5745-1985, to be specified below, which would be examined by the ministers as detailed below, and promotion thereof is contingent upon passing an individual government resolution, which would approve the balancing actions required for financing the costs required for them.

- a) Increase enforcement of offenses towards foreign workers pursuant to the objectives to be set (recommendation number 2 in Appendix A) – the Minister of the Interior, the Minister of Public Security and the Minister of the Economy and Industry;
 - b) Reinforcement of the manners of informing the foreign workers of their rights and the possibility to refer to the Israeli authorities in the case of complaints, as well as expansion of the manners of the workers' referral to the authorities (recommendation number 3 in Appendix "A") - the Minister of the Interior and the Minister of the Economy and Industry;
 - c) Promotion of dedicated campaigns regarding the rights of foreign workers (recommendation number 5 in Appendix "A") – the Minister of the Economy and Industry and the Minister of the Interior;
 - d) Reinforcement of the personnel of the National Supervisor of Social Workers within the Caregiving Sector (recommendation number 6 in Appendix "A") – the Minister of the Interior;
 - e) Adaptation of the personnel positions of the criminal and civil enforcement agencies for the enforcement of the human trafficking phenomena (recommendation number 20 in Appendix "A") – the Minister of Public Security, the Minister of Justice, the Minister of the Interior, the Minister of the Economy and Industry;
 - f) Enforcement improvement - Cyber space (recommendation number 21 in Appendix "A") – the Minister of Justice and the Minister of Public Security;
 - g) Providing access to information in the victims' information systems (recommendation number 35 in Appendix "A") – the Minister of Public Security;
4. Recording the Minister of Justice's announcement that the Ministry of Justice, in collaboration with the relevant government ministries, would be responsible for conducting a study accompanying the execution of the Implementation Plan, as stated in recommendation number 1 in Appendix "A" and as specified in Appendix "B" to this resolution. For this purpose, the Ministry of Justice shall allocate from its budget, a one-time sum of NIS 1.5 million for the years 2022-2026.

5. Recording the CEO Committee's statement which establishes special teams as specified in Appendix "C" to this resolution, for formulating solutions for the fields requiring special adaptation. The CEO Committee shall report to the government on the teams' recommendations within one year following the passing of this resolution.

6. Mechanism for the identification and official recognition of victims:

a) Pursuant to the CEO Committee's resolution dated 28.2.2033, to amend government resolution no. 2860 dated 1.12.2002 and government resolution No. 2670 dated 02.12.2007, regarding the Police's authority to officially recognize human trafficking victims, and regarding the relevant offenses for such recognition, and determine that a requirement for the obtaining of protection and rehabilitation within the assistance programs for human trafficking victims would be the determination in writing by the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator, that there is *prima facie* evidence that the person is a victim of human trafficking, being held in slavery conditions, forced labor or being forced to leave the country for prostitution or slavery purposes (sections 377a, 375a, 376, 376b of the Penal Law, 5737-1977).

Regarding the existence of *prima facie* evidence as aforementioned, the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator shall consult with an Advisory Committee, except for the types of cases specified in the procedure to be set out pursuant to sub-section (C), in respect of which the Coordinator's decisions shall be made following consultation with a representative of the Israel police.

The composition of the Advisory Committee shall be as follows:

- (1) An employee of the Population and Immigration Authority appointed by the Director of the Population and Immigration Authority;
- (2) A representative on behalf of the Israel Police, of the Human Trafficking Squad, to be appointed by the Police Commissioner;
- (3) A representative on behalf of the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry, to be appointed by the commissioner of the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry;
- (4) A representative on behalf of the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs appointed by the Director General of the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs. In the event the applicant for recognition is a minor, this representative shall determine the manners of care and supervision over the minor, in accordance with the minor's condition, age and needs.

- (5) A representative on behalf of the non-governmental organizations in the field of the elimination of trafficking in human beings, who have experience and a background in locating human trafficking victims and/or rehabilitating victims, to be appointed by the Director General of the Ministry of Justice, from a list proposed by the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator;
- (6) A member of the public who is a survivor of human trafficking or holding under conditions of slavery, to be appointed by the Director General of the Ministry of Justice, from a list proposed by the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator.

The Inter-Ministerial Coordinator shall appoint a coordinator for the Committee from among the employees of the National Anti-Trafficking Unit in the Ministry of Justice.

- b) Granting the Director General of the Ministry of Justice the power to appoint a senior legal entity at the Ministry of Justice to whom one seeking recognition could file an objection to a decision not to recognize them as a victim of one of the offenses listed in sub-section (A).
- c) Granting the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator the power to establish, within 45 days following the date of passing this resolution, a procedure that will regulate the official recognition mechanism, in coordination with the relevant Government Ministries, and as detailed below.

The procedure is to prescribe, *inter alia*, the manners available to one seeking recognition as a victim to object to a decision not to recognize them as a victim of one of the offenses listed in sub-section (A); criteria for cases that will not be brought before the Advisory Committee; a mechanism for ruling on the application of an Advisory Committee member who was appointed pursuant to section 6(a)(1), section 6(a)(2), section 6(A)(3) or section 6(A)(4), to modify the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator's decision regarding official recognition - this part of the procedure shall be determined with the agreement of the Director General of the Population and Immigration Authority and the Director General of the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs.

The procedure shall be published on the Inter-Ministerial Coordinator's website, and shall be translated into languages relevant to the victims of the offenses listed in sub-section (A).

- d) Amendment of the government's resolutions as stated in sub-section (A) should take effect upon publication of such a procedure.

Appendix A – The Implementation Plan

Recommendation No.	Recommendation	Details	Ministry responsible for implementation	Government Ministries and additional units
Research				
1.	Conducting an accompanying study Budgetary allocation granted in accordance with the Minister of Justice's statement pursuant to section 4 of this Resolution	Conducting studies accompanying the Plan as specified in Appendix "B" below	The Ministry of Justice	
Prevention				
2.	Increasing enforcement of offenses towards foreign workers, according to the objectives to be set	Increasing enforcement of labor laws regarding the populations of foreign and Palestinian workers in Israel by the enforcement agencies at the Ministry of the Economy (the Directorate General of Labor) and at the Population and Immigration Authority, in accordance with the powers of these Ministries	The Population and Immigration Authority, the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of Economy and Industry as well as the Israel Police	
3.	Reinforcing the manners of informing the foreign workers of their rights and the	1. Increasing and expanding the methods of informing	The Population and Immigration Authority, the	

	<p>possibility to contact the Israeli authorities in the case of complaints, as well as expansion of the methods of contacting the authorities</p>	<p>foreign workers regarding their rights pursuant to labor laws, as well as in respect of the possibility and manners of contacting the authorities, including the Commissioner of foreign workers' rights at the Directorate General of Labor of the Ministry of the Economy; and concerning workers who arrived through bilateral agreements, workers of foreign construction companies, and unique technology companies - to the Call Center for Foreign Workers at the Population and Immigration Authority.</p> <p>2. Considering adding the possibility of expansion of</p>	<p>Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry</p>	
--	---	--	--	--

		<p>methods for foreign workers to contact the authorities, which would include a convenient option for online application government initiated contact, maintaining contact with employees and responding to their enquiries, expansion of the computerized informative system, including a language-accessible web interface as well as the ability to obtain information and data analysis received from the workers themselves as part of monitoring their rights</p> <p>3. Adjusting the budgeting of the Call Center for Foreign Workers to the</p>		
--	--	--	--	--

		numbers and languages of the workers arriving in Israel, in accordance with the established quotas		
4.	Examining the manners for increasing awareness of the population of foreign workers regarding rights and linguistic accessibility	a) Examining the possibility of expanding the extent of trainings for workers regarding their rights, sexual harassment, etc., similar to the trainings currently conducted as part of the orientation days for workers arriving through bilateral agreements, as well as to the rest of the population of foreign workers, and this, under the responsibility of the relevant Ministries in respect of this type of workers and in collaboration with the commissioner of foreign	The Population and Immigration Authority, the Coordinator of Government Activities in the Territories, the Ministry of Construction and Housing and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs	The Commissioner of foreign workers' labor rights at the Directorate General of Labor

		workers' rights: Workers arriving through foreign construction companies (under the responsibility of the Ministry of Construction and Housing), experts or workers arriving for the execution of special projects that require automation and unique technology, etc. (under the responsibility of the relevant Ministries that invite the workers), trainees in the training programs (under the responsibility of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs)		
		b) Ensuring that at the Israeli agencies abroad, all foreign workers, including foreign caregiving	Ministry of Foreign Affairs	The Population and Immigration Authority, the Directorate General of Labor at the

		workers currently arriving in Israel privately, obtain a link to the worker's rights leaflets (and as these are translated into all relevant languages), prior to arriving in Israel		Ministry of Economy and Industry
		c) Each relevant government ministry is required to examine the possibility of translating into the relevant languages information on behalf of the State distributed to all foreign workers concerning their rights, safety, health, prevention of sexual harassment, paychecks, etc., and lectures and training sessions conducted for foreign workers and additional relevant populations	The Population and Immigration Authority, the Coordinator of Government Activities in the Territories, the Ministry of Construction and Housing the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry, the Ministry of Justice	

		d) As part of the app for foreign workers currently developed by the Population and Immigration Authority, all foreign workers shall be provided with links to worker's rights leaflets, translated into the workers' languages	The Israel Population and Immigration Authority	
5.	Promotion of dedicated campaigns regarding the rights of foreign workers	The campaigns shall focus on the workers' rights and the Governmental entities one may contact in any event of infringement of those rights, while providing the workers with linguistic and cultural accessibility	The Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry, the Population and Immigration Authority	The Ministry of Justice and other ministries
6.	Reinforcement of the personnel of the National Supervisor of Social Workers in the Caregiving Sector at the Population and Immigration Authority	In the caregiving sector, it is required to consider reinforcement of the social workers staff of the National Supervisor of Social Workers in the Caregiving Sector at the Population and Immigration Authority in order to enable	The Israel Population and Immigration Authority	

		closer accompaniment of the social workers at the private offices, as well as to enable additional visits by the Supervisor's personnel in cases of claims of events of special concern and per the National Supervisor's discretion and prioritization, according to the resources available to her		
7.	Improving the handling and prevention of sexual offenses and sexual harassment against foreign workers	The issue of sexual harassment of foreign workers should be discussed as part of the administrative work currently conducted at the Ministry of Justice to amend the Prevention of Sexual Harassment Law. As part of this examination, it is possible to examine the option of empowering another entity with the authority to handle the issue, in coordination with the Ministries concerned, as listed in this table.	The Ministry of Justice	The Population and Immigration Authority, the Israel Police, the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry
8.	Bringing in foreign workers through bilateral agreements	a) Since bringing in employees through	The Israel Population and Immigration Authority and the	The Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of

		<p>bilateral agreements between the State of Israel and the workers' countries of origin has been proven as an effective measure in preventing illegal collection of brokerage fees, it is required to promote as a general rule and as the main method, the recruitment and employment of foreign workers through bilateral agreements, without prejudice to other arrangements, and act for completing the transfer to bilateral agreements as aforementioned, also in the caregiving sector, including "closing the sky" to the entry of caregiving workers under private</p>	<p>Ministry of Foreign Affairs</p>	<p>Economy and Industry and the Ministry of Justice</p>
--	--	--	---	--

		<p>arrangements following the signing, ratification and implementation of an additional agreement, provided that the countries of origin with which implementation of the agreements that had been ratified commenced, are able to provide the required number of new foreign caregiving workers and send them to Israel in accordance with the outlines that were agreed upon and in accordance with the caregiving patients' needs.</p>		
		<p>b) As part of the discussions for determining the countries of origin with which negotiations would be conducted regarding a</p>	<p>The Ministry of Justice National Anti-Trafficking Coordinator, Deputy Attorney General's</p>	

		<p>bilateral agreement with a new country for bringing workers at the Bilateral Committee headed by the Director General of the Population and Immigration Authority, the Ministry of Justice (National Anti-Trafficking Unit), Deputy Attorney General (international law) Department shall provide at the request of the Head of the Bilateral Committee, an opinion regarding the human rights and human trafficking in that country, placing an emphasis on slavery and forced labor, which would be presented to the Committee members.</p>	<p>Office (international law)</p>	
--	--	--	-----------------------------------	--

		Providing an opinion as stated in this section shall not delay signing an agreement.		
9.	Improving protection of the rights of those training in the agriculture trainees program Budgetary allocation granted in accordance with Government Resolution No. 621 dated 6.12.2020.	A call for reinforcing the efforts of the new administration established at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs regarding foreign agriculture trainees to act and handle the trainees' complaints and the civil society regarding the manner of bringing the trainees through the sending countries, as well as to act for examining their complaints in respect of their employment in Israel. Additionally, it is required to act for informing the coordinators and employing agriculturists, as well as the staff at the relevant foreign agencies of the trainees' rights and the manner of examining their inquiries.	The Ministry of Foreign Affairs	The Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of Economy and Industry and the Ministry of Justice
10.	Preventing exploitation at work as part of volunteer programs	To amend the relevant procedures in order to prevent the arrival of foreign volunteers from developing countries to	The Israel Population and Immigration Authority	The Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of Economy and

		industries in which foreign workers/for non-professional work are employed, except in special cases in accordance with reasons to be recorded and subject to tight control mechanisms concerning the manner of bringing volunteers and their stay in Israel.		Industry and the Ministry of Justice
Enforcement				
11.	Conducting proactive enforcement actions	Conducting joint proactive enforcement by all law enforcement agencies, also against regulatory violations, while defining joint annual enforcement objectives, which shall be set out each year of the Implementation Plan, all subject to and in accordance with the resources available to the law enforcement agencies	The Israel Police	The Ministry of Justice, the State Attorney's Office, the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry, the Population and Immigration Authority, the Israel Money Laundering and Terror Financing Prohibition Authority, the Tax Authority

<p>12.</p>	<p>Enhancing collaboration among the criminal and civil enforcement agencies</p>	<p>Structuring a mechanism for joint work and transferring information between the criminal and civil enforcement agencies in complex cases</p>	<p>The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice</p>	<p>The Israel Police, the Ministry of Public Security, the State Attorney's Office, the Tax Authority, the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry, the Israel Money Laundering and Terror Financing Prohibition Authority, the Population and Immigration Authority, and other relevant entities</p>
<p>13.</p>	<p>Strengthening the use of economic enforcement</p>	<p>Examining the manners for strengthening the use of economic enforcement in relevant cases, to be identified by the Israel Police – forfeiture, money laundering, taxation and economic investigations for all types of trafficking and the accompanying offenses, such as illegal collection of brokerage</p>	<p>The State Attorney's Office and the Israel Police</p>	<p>The Ministry of Justice, the Israel Money Laundering and Terror Financing Prohibition Authority, the Tax Authority</p>

		fees or guarantees by foreign workers and the like, while defining joint annual enforcement objectives, to be set out every year of the Implementation Plan.		
14.	Establishment of a team on the issue of the involvement of children and adolescents as trafficking victims and promotion of preventive education	Collaboration between the Ministry of Education and the criminal and civil enforcement agencies in order to raise expand the identification and treatment of the phenomena of abuse of children and adolescents	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice, the State Attorney's Office, the Ministry of Education	
15.	Strengthening the work interfaces between the Israel Police and the State Attorney's Office	Establishing a joint work forum for the State Attorney's Office and the Israel Police to promote policies for handling trafficking, slavery and forced labor cases, which will be regularly attended by the coordinators at the State Attorney's Office, the relevant staff members at the Police, as well as the relevant contact points at the Israel Police in each district	The State's Attorney Office, the Israel Police	The Ministry of Justice, Consultation and Legislation, the Ministry of Public Security
16.	Establishment of an inter-ministerial team dedicated to	Reinforcing the technological means and capabilities in the	The Israel Police	The Ministry of Justice, the State

	the subject of collaboration and R&D (research and development)	areas of detection and identification, intelligence and extraction of evidence in criminal enforcement of trafficking offenses and related offenses in cyberspace and physical space		Attorney's Office (Cyber Department), the Israel Innovation Authority, the Population and Immigration Authority, the Tax Authority
17.	Strengthening international collaboration with the relevant enforcement agencies in the countries of origin	Including conducting joint activities, conferences, locating information from major countries of origin regarding trafficking	The Israel Police	The State Attorney's Office
18.	Increasing the rate of inquiries to the Public Contact Center of the National Anti-Trafficking Unit	Expanding the extent of reporting and inquiries to the Public Contact Center operated by the National Anti-Trafficking Unit, an online center that collects information regarding the phenomenon of human trafficking and referral to treatment and enforcement agencies where necessary. This, including by: a) Establishment of an inter-sectoral work	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice	The Israel Police, the Ministry of Public Security, the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs, the Population and Immigration Authority, the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of Economy and Industry and the Ministry of Health

		<p>team to accompany the operation of the Call Center and expansion thereof</p> <p>b) Formulation of a plan to launch public campaign/s concerning the Center for the general population and the unique sectors</p> <p>c) Tracking the manner of handling enquiries</p> <p>d) Formulation and distribution of an annual activity report</p>		
19.	Bettering the outline for the proactive monitoring and enforcement as well as locating human trafficking victims	Bettering the outline for locating human trafficking victims among foreign workers in the various industries (caregiving, agriculture, construction, etc.), <i>inter alia</i> by proactive oversight and enforcement	The Israel Police, the Israel Population and Immigration Authority	The Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of Economy and Industry

20.	Modifying the number of officials at the criminal and civil enforcement agencies to enforce the human trafficking phenomena	a) Modifying the number of officials criminal and civil enforcement agencies for the enforcement of the human trafficking phenomena, including establishment of an inter-ministerial round table and sections specializing in the trafficking issue at every Central Unit	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit, the State Attorney's Office, the Israel Police	The Ministry of Justice, the Enforcement and Regulation Administration of the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry
		b) Examination of the activity and additional modification of the number of officials if necessary	The Israel Police, the Enforcement and Regulation Administration of the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry	The Ministry of Justice
21.	Improving enforcement in cyber space	The online arena at the present time has become a major platform for advertisement regarding provision of prostitution services, and for locating and recruiting people for engaging in prostitution. Actions	The State's Attorney Office and the Israel Police	

		to block access from Israel to websites that publish ads as aforementioned in order to reduce the supply of trafficking content and advertising prostitution services accessible through the Internet and social networks.		
22.	Treatment of the phenomenon of beggar children	Promoting treatment of the phenomenon by holding district round tables on the issue, strengthening the ties between the various detection and enforcement agencies, establishing a joint inter-ministerial action outline and strengthening enforcement capabilities against the offenders.	The Israel Police	The Ministry of Public Security, the Ministry of Justice, the State Attorney's Office, the Ministry of Social Affairs
Protection				
23.	Adoption of the new model of the Ministry of Social Affairs in the programs for protection of trafficking victims. Budgetary allocation granted in accordance with Government Resolution No. 2670 dated 2.12.2007	According to the model, rehabilitation would be separated into two stages: Initial reception and diagnosis period at a shelter, where patients obtain protection subject to the guidance of the Israel Police, diagnosis, crisis intervention and establishing a plan for	The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs	

		<p>rehabilitation in the community. Upon the expiration of this period, the victims would be treated within the community, where they would receive all the services and rights until the expiration of the period of the rehabilitation year. In cases where an intensive therapy envelope is required, the patients shall continue to obtain the care service at the shelter. (Unlike the current model according to which protection, as a rule, is provided only as part of the stay at the shelter). As part of the tender for modification of the model, an option will be entered, which shall enable, if necessary, examination of the possibility of opening treatment services at other geographical locations.</p>		
24.	Transportation to shelters	<p>It is required to establish a procedure that would determine, after official recognition, the responsible authority for transporting the victim to the protection facilities as well as to</p>	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice	The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs, the Israel Police

		essential locations as part of the criminal proceedings and their testimony, noting the need to protect the victim at these sensitive points in time.		
25.	Admission at a shelter	It is required to regulate procedures for admission at a shelter, which include, <i>inter alia</i> regulation of the interfaces with all parties related to the victim, including assessment of danger or threats in Israel, which the Israel Police is required to deliver upon referral of the victim to the shelter, assessment of the medical condition and acute medical needs. In cases where an investigation or criminal proceedings are conducted, it is required to ensure that the victims are aware of their rights and are provided with alternative means in cases where personal items are collected from them as evidence (for example a phone), and more. Additionally, it is required to maintain to the extent possible	The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs	The Israel Police and the Ministry of Health

		continuous accompaniment of a victim by a specific social worker (case manager) treating the victim and setting out the treatment plan throughout the way, including contact <i>vis-à-vis</i> the other government partners.		
26.	Adapting shelter staff to the changing pattern of trafficking and victims at shelters. Budgetary allocation granted in accordance with Government Resolution No. 2670 dated 2.12.2007	It is required to encourage the employment of a diverse team, to the extent possible, and ensure periodic training sessions on cultural and gender competence for the treatment team in order to reduce cultural gaps between the team and the victims. It is required to continue ensuring full access to interpreters, gender-appropriate, in order to ensure linguistic accessibility of the victims, and conducting training sessions on cultural accessibility for interpreters as well.	The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs	
27.	Adapting medical services to populations without Israeli citizenship Budgetary allocation granted in accordance with Government	Adapting medical and mental health services to the unique characteristics of the victims, who belong to culturally diverse groups, with language difficulties	The Ministry of Health	The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs

	Resolution No. 2670 dated 2.12.2007	and the severe experiences they have undergone, including attendance of the shelter's medical staff in the shelter's staff meetings and ensuring the continuation of the therapy continuum as part of the rehabilitation year and the testimony period.		
28.	Adjusting solutions for trafficking and slavery victims who are Israeli citizens	It is proposed to raise awareness among practitioners of the trafficking victims' rights, and ensure that assistance and accompaniment are provided that would assure exhaustion of the rights given to them under law (for example, legal aid, the possibility of submitting applications to the forfeiture fund dedicated to trafficking victims, etc.).	The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs	The Ministry of Justice
29.	Safe return of trafficking victims to their countries of origin	a) Toward the date of the victims' leaving the State of Israel back to their country of origin, and insofar as the victims agree to do so, the entity treating the victims	The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs and the Population and Immigration Authority	

		<p>shall refer to the International Department at the Ministry of Welfare and Social Security, which would act, to the extent possible, for contacting the welfare authorities or organizations engaging in accompaniment and treatment of trafficking victims in the country of origin, in order to inform them of the victims' return and coordinate their reception and further accompaniment and treatment upon their return. At the same time, the victim's caretaker shall contact the Voluntary Departure Unit at the Population and Immigration Authority in order to coordinate the date of the victim's return and purchase</p>		
--	--	---	--	--

		<p>the flight ticket for him. The purpose of these measures is to help the victim to return to his country in an accompanying and safe manner, as well as his reception while maintaining therapy continuity to the extent possible, increasing his prospects of reintegrating into society in his country of origin and preventing repeated victimization</p>		
		<p>b) Arranging a procedure for assessment of threats and danger in the country of origin prior to the date of the victims' return, in cases where concern arises of the victims' wellbeing upon their departure from Israel back to their country.</p>	<p>The Israel Police</p>	<p>The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs</p>

<p>30.</p>	<p>Assistance by the National Insurance Institute to victims who are Israeli residents</p>	<p>The National Insurance Institute shall act for assisting and integrating the professionals treating trafficking victims in training sessions for exhausting the rights of the latter at the National Insurance Institute, including their right to occupational rehabilitation by the Rehabilitation Wing at the Institute to those recognized as generally disabled. Acknowledgment of centers and care communities as "rehabilitation under the supervision of a government ministry" should be considered, for entitlement to an income assurance allowance during the period in which the victims (Israeli residents) are treated at the center.</p>	<p>The National Insurance Institution</p>	
<p>31.</p>	<p>Protection of victims who are witnesses in criminal proceedings: Budgetary allocation granted under subsection (a) – in</p>	<p>a) Expanding legal assistance to victims of trafficking and slavery offenses for accompaniment during the criminal proceedings against</p>	<p>The Legal Aid Department at the Ministry of Justice</p>	<p>The Ministry of Justice (the Consulting and Legislation Department)</p>

	<p>accordance with Government Resolution No. 972 dated 13.1.22. Budgetary allocation granted under subsection (b) - in accordance with Government Resolution No. 2670 dated 2.12.2007. Budgetary allocation granted under subsection (c) - in accordance with Government Resolution No. 551 dated 24.10.2021. Budgetary allocation granted under subsection (d) – in accordance with the Offense Victims’ Rights Law, 5761-2001</p>	<p>the defendant, including providing assistance commencing the criminal investigation stage in accordance with the text of the Government Bill (Government Bills 5782, p. 574), subject to completion of the legislative process.</p>		
		<p>b) Emotional support for victims as part of the criminal proceedings conducted against the defendant – there is a need for emotional and therapy support by the treating staff at protection facilities, both at shelters as well as at the assistance center, commencing the moment of opening the criminal investigation, during the victim's testimony in court, until the verdict and the compensation in the</p>	<p>The Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs</p>	<p>The Legal Aid Department at the Ministry of Justice, the State Attorney’s Office and the Israel Police.</p>

		<p>proceedings are given. It is required to ensure continued appropriate emotional support, as currently provided in the programs, which mediates <i>vis-à-vis</i> the legal entities the victims' condition and wishes, and constitutes a safe place for the victims during this sensitive period. In order to ensure optimal and holistic accompaniment of the victim, it is required to conduct joint training sessions for the State Attorney's Office, the Police, the Legal Aid (should such be required) and the treating staff at the protection facilities, training sessions in which, <i>inter alia</i>, contents would be relayed regarding the nature of the proceedings, the victims' rights by virtue of their status</p>		
--	--	--	--	--

		<p>as offense victims in the criminal proceedings, what may be expected and required of the victim, and conducting ongoing dialog between the care entities and the legal and investigative entities throughout the proceedings.</p>		
		<p>c) Adaptations in the testimonial proceedings</p> <p>1. Where victims wish to leave Israel and their testimony is required for the proceedings, it is required to promote under law their possibility to provide early testimony so that they could return to their country as soon as possible without the State Attorney's Office being required to</p>	<p>The State Attorney's Office</p>	<p>The Courts Administration</p>

		<p>leave them in the country or bring them especially.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">2. It is required to examine the possibility of testifying through a visual conference call in cases where the victims returned to the country of origin and their testimony is required.3. In the appropriate cases where one of the relevant offenses had been committed pursuant to the existing legislation, it is required to implement through training sessions for judges, legal assistants and attorneys, the		
--	--	--	--	--

		<p>possibility to testify not before the defendant pursuant to section 2b of the Amendment of Legal Procedures Law (Interrogation of Suspects), 5718-1958, and additional rights and protections as part of the criminal proceedings, <i>inter alia</i>, following the recommendations of the Inter-Ministerial Committee for Examining the Care of Sexual Offense Victims as Part of the Criminal Proceedings Report, December 2019 (the Berliner Committee), in order to make it easier for</p>		
--	--	---	--	--

		<p>the trafficking victim to the extent possible during the criminal proceedings, as part of the testimony in court, in order to avoid repeating the trauma or making the rehabilitation process more difficult.</p>		
		<p>d) Ensuring the rights of trafficking victims and victims of the offense in accordance with the Rights of Victims of Crime Law – obtaining information on the stages of the proceedings, the rights during the investigation, upon closing the case on the grounds under law, it is required to ensure exercising the rights of the offense victim pursuant to the Rights of</p>	<p>The State Attorney's Office, the Israel Police</p>	

		<p>Victims of Crime Law, including providing notice thereof, updates in respect of the possibility to file an appeal per the victim's wish, and the possibility to file an application for obtaining material required for filing a civil suit in accordance with the directives and law. Insofar as there is an intention to reach a plea bargain in the proceeding, it is required to ensure compliance with the Law regarding notifying the victim and the possibility to express their position before the prosecution attorney, in the appropriate cases and pursuant to the Rights of Victims of Crime Law. And additional rights, all pursuant to the Law.</p>		
--	--	---	--	--

		e) Strengthening protection and safeguarding of the offense victim's rights as part of the criminal proceedings, <i>inter alia</i> , by improving the interface between the human trafficking coordinators and the offense victims at the State Attorney's Office, as well as improving collaboration with the Police, social workers in the protection facilities and the Population and Immigration Authority for exhausting the victim's rights and protecting them as part of the criminal proceedings.	The State Attorney's Office, the Israel Police, the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs, the Population and Immigration Authority	
32.	Refunding compensation funds for trafficking victims that were received at the Penalty Collection Center and were not located	In locating compensation funds collected and not transferred to trafficking victims, should such compensation funds be found, an attempt shall be made to locate	The State Attorney's Office	The Fines Collection Center and the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs

		the trafficking victims and deliver the compensation funds to them.		
33.	Promoting expansion of the offenses relevant to the forfeiture fund	Amendment of the definition of "offense" under section 377d of the Penal Law and addition of the relevant offenses: Forced labor (section 376 of the Penal Law, 5733-1973) and causing departure from the State for prostitution or slavery purposes (section 376b of the Penal Law)	The Ministry of Justice	
34.	Conducting periodic meetings for bettering the work interfaces	Conducting periodic meetings of Police representatives, the Legal Aid Department, the Population and Immigration Authority, the Ministry of Social Affairs and the rehabilitation programs' staff for bettering the work interfaces, discussion of issues and finding solutions; it is required to ensure involving civil society organizations, the academia and trafficking victims. As part of this it is required to define and distinguish between the meetings' mechanisms and objectives - meetings for	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice	

		establishing policies would be conducted by the administration officials, and meetings for bettering, removal of barriers and raising difficulties that need to be attended to with the professionals in the field.		
35.	Providing access to information in the victims' information systems	Adding additional languages (placing an emphasis on Tigrinya) and providing access to the information systems for delivery of information to offense victims on behalf of the Israel Police, so that the information would be accessible to trafficking victims, who are not Israeli citizens. This is in addition to development of dedicated information brochures for trafficking victims, regarding all their rights, in all relevant languages.	The Israel Police	The State Attorney's Office
36.	Examination of a model for granting work visas to victims for the rehabilitation and testimony period.	It is required to adapt the Population and Immigration Authority's procedures in respect of trafficking victims so that the work visas of all trafficking victims of all types would be extended every six months, as	The Israel Population and Immigration Authority	

		well as striving to find a solution that does not require physical arrival for such extension while the victim is staying at a shelter. Insofar as this is a victim living in the community, it is required to arrange a response at the Population Administration office close to their place of residence.		
Training				
37.	Establishing an annual inter-ministerial training program at the ministerial level addressing the current patterns of trafficking and prostitution as well as characterization thereof	The training sessions shall include addressing suspicious indicators of the trafficking and prostitution phenomena and providing solutions adapted to the challenges raised by the offenses, as well as involving civil society members and academia staff in conducting the training sessions. As part of this, annual inter-ministerial simulation led by the National Anti-Trafficking Unit	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit	The Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Public Security – the Police and the Israel Prison Service, the Ministry of the Economy - the Directorate General of Labor, the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs, the Ministry of Health, the Population and Immigration Authority, the State Attorney's Office

38.	Training sessions for the staff of protection and care of trafficking victims facilities, regarding the legal proceedings	The purpose of the training sessions is that the staff would be familiar with the characteristics of the proceedings and interfaces with victims who are witnesses in the criminal proceedings as well as the offense victims	The State Attorney's Office	
39.	Conducting joint periodic training sessions for the relevant prosecution offices and the Police in the field of the rights of crime victims and human trafficking.	Conducting training sessions for bettering the solutions for the difficulties and challenges arising in investigations and managing these cases, due to the unique characteristics of trafficking victims.	The State Attorney's Office, the Israel Police	
40.	Trainings sessions on the rights of trafficking victims in criminal proceedings	It is required to conduct training sessions for all the entities relevant to the criminal proceedings, including judges, prosecuting attorneys, the Police and the Legal Aid Department, regarding the rights of trafficking victims in criminal proceedings, the adapted gender, cultural and emotional approach towards the offense victim who is at the center, the characteristics and type of trauma they had	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice	The State Attorney's Office and the Courts Administration

		undergone, and its impact on the offense victim.		
41.	Establishment of a plan to increase training sessions on the prevention of human trafficking for relevant entities for prevention of human trafficking	<p>These entities include, <i>inter alia</i>:</p> <p>(a) Employers of foreign workers including private employers (as needed), corporations, bureaus;</p> <p>(b) Relevant entities who come into contact with foreign workers or their employers: Directorate General of Labor supervisors, safety at work supervisors, the Population and Immigration Authority's inspectors and border controllers, employees of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Israel and at agencies abroad, the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Tourism, the Population Authority, the Police, the Israel Prison Service, judges, prosecution attorneys, welfare entities at local authorities, etc.</p> <p>(c) Non-governmental entities that may encounter relevant populations: HMOs staff and</p>	All ministries in the CEO Committee	The Courts Administration

		other medical service providers, hotels, the public, etc.		
42.	Implementation of the principle of non-punishment and prosecution of trafficking victims for trafficking-related offenses	Implementation of the principle among the various enforcement agencies through specialized training sessions and as part of the joint work processes on the issue of elimination of human trafficking	The National Anti-Trafficking Unit at the Ministry of Justice, the State Attorney's Office	The Israel Police, the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of the Economy and Industry, the Population and Immigration Authority

Appendix B: Proposed Research – Research Steering Team

1. Estimation of the volume of human trafficking in Israel

Lateral research for establishing an updated database regarding the current scope and patterns of the trafficking phenomenon in Israel, including the economic scopes of the various aspects of the phenomenon. Currently the Government and the entities involved in elimination of trafficking have data only on the number of victims the State locates each year, a number that the professional entities estimate is much lower than the actual number of victims. This type of lateral research could assist the Israeli Government to base its policy and priorities in the field of the elimination of human trafficking on more reliable data than that we currently have, and thus, better Israel's success in eliminating the phenomenon and in locating and addressing a greater number of victims as well as revealing new patterns.

It is proposed that the estimate to be established would be subsequently updated annually in such a manner that would enable monitoring and analyzing the change in data following interventions and policy changes, which are made, *inter alia*, as part of the implementation teams of the national plan.

It should be noted that there are methodological difficulties in establishing this type of estimate, and that studies conducted in other countries have also found it difficult to establish an agreed index in terms of research. The difficulty arises, *inter alia*, from the lack of uniformity in the phenomenon's definition and identity of the victims, and from the characteristics of the crime in this field, where the offenses are committed against the most vulnerable and weakest populations in society, and in many cases the victims are exploited as they are unseen by society and far from the public space. These characteristics make crime in the field a 'concealed' crime that makes it difficult for the State, as well as the research parties to expose and locate the victims who mostly are too vulnerable to turn to the authorities for assistance. Additionally, the trafficking patterns evolve and change frequently, and monitoring them is very difficult yet necessary for locating the victims and adapting the manners of the combat against the phenomenon to the changing reality.

At the same time, there are recommended models in this area, so for example in 2017 the Netherlands, in collaboration with the UNODC, established the "first reliable estimate of the number of trafficking victims in the Netherlands" where an estimation of the actual number of human trafficking victims was made, segmented by age, gender, nationality and type of exploitation (per year).³⁵ Exposure of the actual extent of the phenomenon was made by using a dedicated and advanced research methodology, which the United Nations recommends additional countries to adopt and even offers its support for this type of research process as part of Indicator 16.2.2.

A proposed research methodology is the adoption of the methodology developed in the Netherlands, and its implementation in Israel, while examining collaboration with and guidance by the United Nations.

2. Mapping and evaluating the process of locating and treating trafficking and slavery victims in Israel and comparison with the world

³⁵Originally: https://www.unodc.org/documents/research/UNODC-DNR_research_brief.pdf

One of the key issues as part of implementation of the National Plan for Elimination of Trafficking is bettering the processes for identifying trafficking victims in Israel. As part of this, the possibility of establishing a national referral mechanism is examined – a mechanism that accompanies the entire process of caring for the victim, from locating through the provision of the relevant protection solutions, while mapping the fields of responsibility of all relevant officials. In terms of research, this process may be supported by mapping the identification process currently in Israel – which points exist, the number of victims located each year at each point of identification, and through which “filtering” tools the identification is made. In addition, as part of this study, it is possible to examine how the process of identifying and treating victims is carried out in other parts of the world and whether there are models that could be implemented also in Israel. This study would be a study accompanying the work of the implementation teams of the National Plan, would examine the existing situation and assist in assessing the planned reform in the field and measuring the impact of the planned changes.

As part of the study, mapping the interfacing points of the authorities with trafficking victims in Israel would be conducted, including the Custody Review Tribunals, the Custody Facilities, the Appeals Tribunals, border controllers, associations, the Israel Police, workplaces supervised by the Ministry of Labor and more. Following, the existing “filters” at each entity for locating victims would be examined. Additionally, the study will track the closure of the State with that victim, the destination of their referrals, by whom they are cared for and the therapy solution provided to them. At the same time, a comparison will be made with different models of this process worldwide. As part of the study, it is proposed to conduct interviews with the entities in the field - the trafficking victims, associations and handling entities, border controllers, judges at the specialized courts, etc. Alongside the quantitative mapping and collection of data in respect of the identification process, it is possible to add screening questions to the processes currently conducted at these entities that would assist both in the identification itself as well as in collection of the data concerning the trafficking phenomenon.

3. Prostitution of Minors - measurement and assessment of the round tables project

Enforcement and protection of minors is a key objective of the National Plan for the years 2019-2024. Currently, no official entity in Israel holds data regarding the extent of minors’ prostitution in Israel due to several reasons, including the tendency of minors who are sexually exploited in prostitution not to report their situation or seek assistance due to their lack of trust in adults and the authorities, a sense of lack of choice and no way out, dependency on the person harming them and at times since they do not identify themselves as victims.

In 2019, the pilot of the Inter-Ministerial Round tables plan on minors’ prostitution commenced, led by the Ministry of Public Security and the Ministry of Labor, Welfare and Social Services and accompanied by the National Anti-Trafficking Unit. The round tables are held at the municipal level, and include representatives of the Ministry of Social Affairs, the State Attorney's Office, the Ministry of Public Security, the Israel Police, the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Education and entities from the relevant social services at the same local authority. The concept leading the project is that prevention and treatment of this severe and elusive phenomenon requires inter-ministerial collaboration and a holistic and comprehensive pooling of efforts by the practitioners on the local level.

In the national survey on the phenomenon of prostitution in Israel published in 2016, the researchers reported difficulty in researching and assessing the extent of the phenomenon

This case constitutes a harbinger in combating this phenomenon within the criminal field as part of offenses where the protected value is the violation of freedom.

Currently, the authorities do not know the actual extent of the minors' slavery phenomenon. Most of the information concerning the extent of the phenomenon and its characteristics, originates from intelligence collected by the Enforcement Administration of the Directorate General of Labor at the Ministry of Economy and Industry, enforcement operations and raids conducted. Comprehensive collection of information is essential for developing and adapting the combat against the phenomenon. A U.S. Department of State Report notes that child trafficking for work is a phenomenon that often suffers from disregard or misunderstanding, one of the key recommendations in the Report is increasing the efforts to identify victims of the phenomenon, *inter alia* by gathering information in respect thereof.

The research objective: Development of a data-driven solution for the combat against and elimination of the phenomenon by basing it on an actual estimate of its extent and data concerning its up-to-date characteristics in the field, as well as research accompaniment by the dedicated team that was established for combating the phenomenon as part of implementation of the National Plan.

Proposed research methodology - establishing a database at the Ministry of Justice, to be shared with the relevant parties subject to the provisions of Chapter IV of the Privacy Protection Law and its Regulations, which would enable detection of trafficking phenomena by analyzing the data and finding statistical links, and from there going to the field for examining the findings.

5. Employment structures in the labor sectors of foreign workers and their impact on the phenomena of modern slavery

In the various sectors of the economy where foreign workers work in Israel (agriculture, construction, home caregiving, institutional caregiving and hotels) various employment structures are customary – corporations, private bureaus, bilateral agreements, construction companies, training arrangements and more. A study on the issue would examine the differences among the employment structures, the justifications for the differences in these structures, and the impact of the various employment structures on the workers and their vulnerability to exploitation, and would be able to support the establishment of reforms in the employment structures that establish convenient settings for trafficking in persons or holding under conditions of slavery. This study could be based also on the data collected as part of the joint survey by CIMI and the Population Authority on the implementation of the bilateral agreements, as well as on additional sources concerning the other employment structures and focus on the structural impacts on the human trafficking phenomenon. Also in this study it is possible to integrate discourse with the end interfaces – the workers themselves, the Government officials responsible for placement of the workers, shelters and associations caring for workers who had been injured (the Refugees and Migrants Hotline, Kav LaOved, etc.).

6. Bilateral agreements: Partnership in designing the research of the Population and Immigration Authority in collaboration with CIMI in respect of bilateral agreements, as well as considering a separate study on the construction companies in the construction sector

There is agreement among the team members that this is a key issue for the combat against trafficking that requires accompanying research. However, in view of the fact that

the subject is in joint research by the Population and Immigration Authority and CIMI and is expected to continue in the coming years and accompany also the new agreements, it has been proposed not to establish an additional research in the field, but rather to include the members of the research steering team in the designing of the questions and topics of the existing research conducted by the Population and Immigration Authority and CIMI, so as to enable accurate monitoring and collection of information on issues related to human trafficking. Additionally, a possibility was raised for conducting a survey on the issue of the construction companies within the construction sector - the representative on behalf of the Population and Immigration Authority updated that they are conducting a study on this issue.

Other topics discussed:

1. Establishment of an open database of existing data held by the Government Ministries to facilitate conducting additional studies in the field

Due to the techno-bureaucratic difficulties, and the substantial difficulties in the field of privacy protection, in establishing digital data pooling of the Government Ministries, it was proposed as an alternative to generate a quarterly/annual updating report with set data regarding the combat against human trafficking. These data would include the information collected for the State Department Report which may be disclosed, as well as other data available at the Government to assist civil society entities, academia and the Unit in promoting data-driven policies. The data in the database would not contain information, including information regarding a person's private affairs, as defined in the Privacy Protection Law, which are identified or could be identified, but rather only statistical information. Establishment of a fixed list of data that would be updated at set out intervals would enable tracking trends, and measuring the impact of various interventions on the trafficking phenomenon.

2. Measurement and evaluation of training in the field of the combat against trafficking

As part of the American State Department's 2018 report, it was recommended to Israel: "To increase the use of methods for assessing the effectiveness of training provided to law enforcement agencies, including police and prison guards; in identifying victims and enforcing laws in respect of trafficking for prostitution and work."³⁷ Training is an area where great efforts are being made in order to increase awareness and identification and ensure that the response given to the phenomenon in the field is indeed adequate, and therefore its effectiveness is of great importance. To this end, various tools may be used, including Kirkpatrick's Four Level Training Module for training evaluation³⁸. Measuring training, at the same time as mapping the identification process proposed above, would enable a significant improvement of the quality of identification and treatment of trafficking victims by the various parties in the system.

³⁷ The recommendations for Israel as part of the 2018 State Department Report: <https://www.state.gov/reports/2019-trafficking-in-persons-report-2/israel/>

³⁸ Originally: [Kirkpatrick's Four Level Training Module](#)

Appendix C: Establishment of Special Teams

1. **Protection of minors:** A team will be established to examine the development and the updating of solutions tailored to the needs of the minor victims, addressing the principle of the child's best interests, their rehabilitation and prevention of repeated victimization, including the need to maintain contact with the minor's family in relevant cases, as indicated by the provisions of the Convention on the Rights of the Child. **Leading Ministries - the Ministry of Justice and the Ministry of Welfare and Social Affairs, in collaboration with the Government Coordinator for Children and Youth Rights, the State Attorney's Office, the Department of Consultation and Legislation and additional Ministries that would be determined at the time of composition of the team.**

2. **Establishing a team for reviewing and bettering the model of bringing workers through foreign construction companies (construction)** - it is recommended to establish a dedicated team headed by the Ministry of Construction and Housing that would examine manners to improve supervision and control of the rights of workers arriving in Israel through the executing companies. This is in order to prevent exploitation, unsuitable employment and living conditions, prevent situations that may lead to binding the employees to a particular employer as well as examine additional aspects of these arrangements, etc. This team has already been established and met for the first time in July 2022. **The Population and Immigration Authority shall consider adoption of the recommendations regarding foreign companies carrying out unique mechanization and technology projects, *mutatis mutandis*.**
Leading Ministry - the Ministry of Construction and Housing, in collaboration with the Ministry of Justice, the Population and Immigration Authority, the Ministry of Economy and Industry – the Directorate General of Labor.

3. **Establishing a team to examine the employment of foreign workers in the agriculture and rural development industry through placement contractors** - establishing a specialized team headed by the Population Authority in collaboration with the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development and the Directorate General of Labor that will examine a pilot of employment of workers in the agriculture industry through placement contractors dedicated to the agriculture industry, similar to the existing situation in the construction industry, in order to promote mobility (and seasonal adjustment in the agriculture industry), reduce dependency on the employer, facilitate linguistic accessibility as well as enforcement and supervision.
Leading Ministries - the Population and Immigration Authority and the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, in collaboration with the Ministry of Economy and Industry - the Directorate General of Labor, the Ministry of Justice.

4. **Establishing a team that will engage in prevention of exploitation in respect of Palestinian workers** - establishment of a dedicated team headed by the Population Authority, and in collaboration with the Ministry of Construction and Housing, the Coordinator of Government Activities in the Territories, the Ministry of Agriculture, the Ministry of Economy, the Directorate General of Labor, the Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Public Security and the Israel Police, the Tax Authority and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, which will be able to add relevant representatives, that will engage in the manners for preventing exploitation of Palestinian workers

in Israel, that would obtain *inter alia*, updated and timely information from all relevant parties regarding Palestinian workers in Israel (without information, including information regarding the private affairs of a person, as defined in the Privacy Protection Law, that are identified or could be identified). The team's objectives: To prevent the phenomenon of misuse (trafficking) of worker visas and collection of brokerage fees - which could lead to binding and exploitation of workers, to accompany the reform in the construction industry in the field of employee mobility and to promote reforms in additional industries, to anchor supervision mechanisms over the accommodation conditions and medical insurance for employees who duly stay in Israel insofar as a legal obligation is imposed on the employer to insure them, and insofar as obtaining medical treatment is not possible in the Authority's territory under the circumstances in accordance with the decision of a competent authority, as well as to promote the exhaustion of rights and information among the workers in an adapted language as well as through online means. The team was established and commenced its operation.

Leading Ministries - the Population and Immigration Authority, in collaboration with the Ministry of Construction and Housing, and the Coordinator of Government Activities in the Territories at the Ministry of Defense, the Ministry of Agriculture, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Israel Police, the Tax Authority, the Ministry of Economy and Industry - the Directorate General of Labor, and the Ministry of Justice.

5. **Establishing a team that will deal with the aspects of entry into Israel - exemption from visa agreements and border controllers** - establishing a dedicated inter-ministerial team that would report to the Government, aimed at reviewing existing agreements for exemption from visas in order to recommend changes where necessary and possibly suspension/cancellation, as well as in respect of new agreements - to ensure that a section that allows cancellation or a section that sets out automatic expiration will be added and the possibility of renewal given the parties' consent and after examination. This team will review in an orderly and fixed manner prior to entering into negotiations, the concern that these agreements would be abused, and could also be assisted by the Police's opinion. Additionally, the team will act for establishing an inter-ministerial procedure for its activities, which would include issues such as delivery of the required information, such as periodic reporting of concerns that arose and refusals of entry regarding tourists from countries with which there is an agreement for exemption from visas. The inter-ministerial procedure will also include manners of regulating delivery of information in real-time from border controls to the Police/the National Anti-Trafficking Unit, when suspicion arises that one is a trafficking victim, who an attempt is made to bring into Israel as a tourist, as well as delivery of information such as intelligence on behalf of the Police to the relevant parties, including an alert regarding appearing trends (such as: a suspicious increase in the number of trafficking victims in a particular industry or from a particular country). For doing so it is required to consider placing a Police investigator on call, who could "cover" all the border controls in Israel, by technological tools suited for this. The team commenced operations in early 2022.

Leading Ministry - the Ministry of Justice, in collaboration with the Population and Immigration Authority and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

6. **Establishing a team that would examine the issue of prevention of trafficking in supply chains, i.e. addressing the issue of reducing demand and supervising the supply chains of products and services as an additional channel for preventing human trafficking** - it is proposed to establish a team that would include representatives on behalf of the Ministries of Finance, Economy, Justice and Foreign Affairs, that will examine manners of promoting the issue including granting positive incentives for companies, anchoring requirements regarding the prevention of human trafficking and protection of workers' rights, as well as measures for reducing the demand for inexpensive labor force and especially for minors' work, in order to prevent the phenomena of slavery and forced labor. This, in accordance with the international obligations imposed on Israel pursuant to the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, and the Palermo Protocol accompanying the Convention on Organized Crime.
- Leading ministry** - the Ministry of Justice, **in collaboration with** the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Economy and Industry (the Directorate General of Labor), the Prime Minister's Office, the Director of Government Procurement.