

19/12/2022

RAP/RCha/IRL/20(2023)

EUROPEAN SOCIAL CHARTER

20th National Report on the implementation of the European
Social Charter

submitted by

THE GOVERNMENT OF IRELAND

Follow-up to Collective Complaints No. 83/2012, 100/2013,
110/2014, 112/2014 and 132/2016

Report registered by the Secretariat on
19 December 2022

REPORT FOR FINDINGS 2023



Rialtas na hÉireann
Government of Ireland

IRELAND'S 2022 SIMPLIFIED REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE REVISED EUROPEAN SOCIAL CHARTER

19th December 2022

IRELAND'S 2022 SIMPLIFIED REPORT ON THE REVISED EUROPEAN SOCIAL CHARTER

This is Ireland's simplified National Report under the revised European Social Charter (Charter) for 2022. As invited, Ireland submits its report based on information on the follow-up given to the decisions of the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR), relating to collective complaints.

The Report sets out the response to the decisions relating to the 5 specified collective complaints, summarised in the table of contents below.

Table of Contents

Collective Complaint 83/2012: European Confederation of Police (EuroCOP) v. Ireland ...	3
Collective Complaint 100/2013: European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC) v. Ireland	5
Collective Complaint 110/2014: International Federation for Human Rights (FIDH) v. Ireland	11
Collective Complaint 112/2014: European Organisation of Military Associations (EUROMIL) v. Ireland	19
Collective Complaint 132/2016: University Women of Europe (UWE) v. Ireland	21

Collective Complaint 83/2012: European Confederation of Police (EuroCOP) v. Ireland

Violation of Articles 5 (right to organise), 6§2 (right to bargain collectively - negotiation procedures) and 6§4 (the right to bargain collectively - collective action), decision on admissibility and the merits of 2nd December 2013.

In its decision of the 2nd December 2013, the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) concluded that Ireland was in violation of:

- A.** Article 5 of the Charter on the grounds of the prohibition against police representative associations from joining national employees' organisations, having the factual effect of depriving them to negotiate on pay, pensions and service conditions represented by national organisations.

- B.** Article 6§2 of the Charter on the ground that the police representative associations were not provided with a means to effectively represent their members in all matters concerning their material and moral interests.

- C.** Article 6§4 of the Charter on the ground that the domestic legislation amounted to a complete abolition of the right to strike as far as the police is concerned.

In its 2021 findings on Ireland's 18th National Report, the ECSR found that the situation in Ireland has been brought into conformity with Articles 5 and 6§2, but not with Article 6§4 of the Charter.

As regards the violation of Article 6§4 of the Charter on the ground that the domestic legislation amounted to a complete abolition of the right to strike as far as the police is concerned, the Committee found that "*the domestic legislation still provides for a complete prohibition of the right to strike as far as the police is concerned. Accordingly, the situation has not been remedied*".

The Committee also asked for information to be included in Ireland's next report on "*the development and implementation of all the measures needed to ensure that the*

police representative associations are provided with a means to effectively represent their members in all matters and also asks for information on the measures taken to address the prohibition of the right to strike”.

Please see our response below regarding non-conformity with Article 6§4 of the Charter.

Response

Ireland notes and welcomes that in its most recent findings on Ireland’s 18th National Report the European Committee of Social Rights found that Ireland is now in compliance with both Article 5 and Article 6§2 of the Charter.

The Industrial Relations (Amendment) Act 2019 which came into force on the 1st February 2020, provides that An Garda Síochána (AGS) members have, from that date, access to the services of the Workplace Relations Commission and the Labour Court to facilitate resolution of collective matters and to assist in resolving industrial relations disputes.

The Garda Associations have direct access to national pay negotiations and took an active role in the most recent such talks which concluded in August 2022.

In parallel, there are internal Garda dispute resolution mechanisms in place which support ongoing engagement between Garda management and the various representative associations on relevant industrial relations matters. Specialist staff have been recruited to support this work and they are based in a variety of regional locations under the supervision of an Employee Relations Bureau based within AGS Human Resources.

Ireland’s view is that the procedures that have been instituted, as outlined above, demonstrates that police representative associations are provided with a means to effectively represent their members in all industrial relations matters.

Collective Complaint 100/2013: European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC) v. Ireland

Violation of Article E (non-discrimination) taken in conjunction with Article 16 (right of the family to social, legal and economic protection), decision on the merits of 1st December 2015.

In its decision of 1st December 2015, the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) found that Ireland was in violation of Article 16 of the Charter on the following grounds:

- A. insufficient provision of accommodation for Travellers;
- B. many Traveller sites are in an inadequate condition;
- C. the Criminal Justice (Public Order) Act 1994 (as amended) provides for inadequate safeguards for Travellers threatened with eviction;
- D. the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1992 (as amended) provides for inadequate safeguards for Travellers threatened with eviction;
- E. evictions are carried out in practice without the necessary safeguards.

In its 2021 findings on Ireland's 18th National Report, the ECSR noted, *inter alia*, that while "Ireland has made progress in the provision of accommodation for Travellers, access to housing and refurbishment of Traveller accommodation" there was still a substantial shortfall in terms of the provision and adequacy of Traveller accommodation and, inadequate safeguards for Travellers threatened with eviction.

Therefore, the Committee found that the situation has not yet been brought into conformity with Article 16 of the Charter in relation to any of the grounds above.

The Committee asked for information to be included in Ireland's next report on the adoption and implementation of all the measures envisaged in order to remedy the situation.

Please see our response below.

Response

1. Measures undertaken to increase the provision and standard of Traveller accommodation

The Government's [Housing for All](#) (published in September 2021), which provides a new housing plan for Ireland to 2030, contains a specific policy objective to increase and improve accommodation for the Traveller community.

Providing more and improved Traveller-specific accommodation is also a priority and the commitment to the implementation of the recommendations from the Expert Group Report on Traveller Accommodation will support the objective of increasing accommodation for Travellers. The Expert Group was established in 2018 to review the Traveller Accommodation Act, 1998, and other legislation that impacts on the provision and delivery of accommodation for Travellers.

Funding for Traveller-specific accommodation continues to increase with provisions for a budget of €20 million being made available in 2023, an increase of €2 million on the 2022 provision. The Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage continues to work with local authorities to ensure that full use is made of the increasing level of funding available. Full spend of the Traveller-specific accommodation budget has been achieved in both 2020 and 2021.

Accommodation for Travellers is provided across a range of options, including standard local authority housing, which is financed from capital allocations for social housing, and Traveller-specific accommodation, which is also funded by means of 100% capital funding from the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage.

Accommodation is also provided through private housing assisted by the local authority or voluntary organisations' accommodation. Local authorities are also funded to facilitate the refurbishment of Traveller-specific accommodation.

Local authority Traveller Accommodation Plans are prepared on a five-year basis and provide for both new accommodation and improved accommodation provision.

During 2022, a Pilot Caravan Loan Scheme was expanded on a nationwide basis (to end 2022) to provide 100% funding to local authorities for the provision of preferential rate loans to members of the Traveller community for the purchase of caravans. The pilot scheme provides Travellers with improved standards of accommodation and access to credit at a significantly discounted rate. A review of the operation of the pilot will be undertaken informing consideration of an enduring scheme.

Travellers can opt for any form of accommodation and local authority Traveller Accommodation Programmes (TAPs) are intended to reflect these preferences. The TAPs are currently in place across all 31 Local Authority areas and cover the period 2019-2024.

The assessment of housing needs carried out by local authorities' points to a general preference among Travellers for standard housing. Traveller applicants can express a preference for any form of accommodation through the assessment of needs process when applying for social housing. The results of the [2021 Social Housing Needs Assessment](#) revealed that there were 996 households identifying as members of the Travelling Community (1.6% of households).

Local authorities continue to support the Traveller community through Traveller Accommodation Liaison Officers and Social Worker posts, and the management and maintenance of existing halting sites – the financial support for which increased by 50% in 2021.

In order to establish the accommodation position of Traveller families throughout the 31 local authority areas, each local authority conducts an “Annual Estimate” of Traveller families living in their area.

The [2021 Annual Estimate of Accommodation of Traveller Families](#) indicates that there are 11,680 Traveller households in the State (an increase of 562 families on 2020). A total 80% (9,273) of families are in standard accommodation, while the remaining 20% (2,407) are in Traveller-specific accommodation.

Of the 9,273 households in standard accommodation in 2021 there were 4,594 Travellers accommodated in standard social housing by local authorities (an increase of 7% on 2020) and 645 families accommodated in social housing by [Approved Housing Bodies](#) (an increase of 20% on 2020).

The remaining 4,034 households in standard accommodation were housed in the following categories: 'own resources' 876; private rented sector 1,882; sharing housing 828; local authority assisted 448.

The Traveller Accommodation Expert Group's 32 recommendations (across four topics¹) range from changes to procedure and policy, to changes to legislation.

Delivery and implementation will involve several areas within the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage as well as input from other Departments, local authorities and other external stakeholders. This ensures active consultation with the key stakeholders including Traveller representatives.

The Department publishes [updates on its website](#) of progress being made on the recommendations contained in the Expert Group's Review. Work is already underway or complete on 24 of the Expert Group's 32 recommendations.

2. Eviction

Criminal Justice (Public Order) Act 1994

Section 24 of the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002 amends the Criminal Justice (Public Order) Act 1994 by insertions of Part 11A, Offences Relating to Entering and Occupying Land without Consent.

The Public Order Act is a finely balanced instrument designed to protect the property rights of landowners. The legislation is of general application and does not discriminate against Travellers. The legislation concerns itself only with situations where the entry or occupation of land is likely to: cause damage to the land or

¹ Delivery reflecting need; Planning; Capacity/Resources; Governance

substantially interfere with the land or its use of any amenity thereon: or render the land or any amenity there unsafe or unsanitary.

The legislation does not hinder Travellers in genuine need of accommodation but rather, it emerged in response to problems with large-scale commercial trader encampments causing damage and interference to the land. The Act can apply to any entrant to, or occupier of, land in circumstances where the same is likely to have deleterious effects.

A requirement for Travellers to secure the consent of a landowner to enter and occupy part of their land is not an unduly onerous requirement.

As previously reported, this process will also be looked at in light of the Expert Group recommendations. The Department of Justice have been consulted with regard to this procedure. Further engagement with the Department of Justice has been initiated under the auspices of the Programme Board set up to oversee the implementation of the Expert Group recommendations.

Section 10 of the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1992

As previously reported, Section 10 of the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1992, as amended by Section 21 of the Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002, sets out the powers of local authorities in respect of unauthorised Traveller sites. It provides that:

- local authorities have the power to remove an unauthorised Traveller encampment from a public place where it is located within five miles of an approved halting site, provided alternative accommodation is available on any approved site to which the unauthorised encampment can be moved;
- subject to the same proviso regarding available alternative accommodation, local authorities have the power to remove an unauthorised encampment from a public place where this is unfit for human habitation, or is likely to interfere with public or private amenities, or constitutes a health hazard; and

- where an unauthorised encampment is located in a public place within one mile of approved Traveller accommodation, it may be removed to a location which is not less than one mile from such approved accommodation, whether or not alternative accommodation is available.

While there is no statutory obligation to do so, in practice, local authorities seek to consult and negotiate with affected persons and families in advance of using legislative means.

The Department is currently engaging with stakeholders through a newly established sub-group of the Programme Board to consider a protocol on an eviction procedure to issue to local authorities.

Collective Complaint 110/2014: International Federation for Human Rights (FIDH) v. Ireland

Violation Article 16 (right of the family to social, legal and economic protection), decision on the merits of 12th May 2017.

In its decision of the 12th May 2017, the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) found that Ireland was in violation of Article 16 of the Charter on the following grounds:

- A.** a significant number of local authority tenants reside in poor housing conditions amounting to housing that is inadequate in nature.
- B.** persistent conditions like sewage invasions, contaminated water, dampness and mould went “to the core of what adequate housing means”.
- C.** Although many local authority estates were ear-marked for regeneration in 2002, a significant number of regeneration programmes adopted by the Government for local authority had not been completed.
- D.** Finally, despite a large number of people remaining in substandard housing conditions, no complete statistics on the condition of local authority housing had been collected since 2002 by the Irish authorities. No national timetable existed for the refurbishment of local authority housing stock.

In its 2021 findings, the ECSR has stated that the situation has not been brought into conformity with Article 16 of the Charter and has found the following:

“ A. As regards the fact that a significant number of local authority tenants reside in poor housing conditions amounting to housing that is inadequate in nature.

The Committee had previously found that Ireland has made progress in the adoption of measures to ensure an adequate standard of living in local authority housing. However, despite this progress there were still substantial limitations in providing adequate accommodation to a large number of families, who continue living in substandard local authority housing conditions. The situation is still not in conformity

B. *As regards persistent conditions like sewage invasions, contaminated water, dampness and mould went “to the core of what adequate housing means”.*

The Committee further notes unsatisfactory management and maintenance issues in housing conditions for tenants, who do not often have safe houses. Tenants report long waiting periods for basic repairs and poor housing conditions for number of local authority households. The Commission identified evidence provided by tenants, architects and engineers on persistent issues with mould, dampness and sewage invasions, rat infestations, etc.

C. *Concerning the fact that a significant number of regeneration programmes adopted by the Government for local authority had not been completed.*

and

D. *As regards the lack of complete statistics and of a national timetable. As indicated in the comments provided by the Irish Human Rights and Equality Commission and by CAN, the Government report does not state any specific progress since the last report submitted in 2020.*

The only updated information appears in the appendix and states that programs and projects continue to be implemented and there are regeneration programs and construction of new sites and houses.

However, the legal framework for the right to housing for families in Ireland is still insufficient, local authority housing tenants continue to live with inadequate housing standards and there are no national statistics on the conditions of local authority housing stock.”

The Committee has asked for information on the adoption and implementation of all the measures envisaged in order to remedy the situation outlined above to be included in Ireland’s next report.

Please see our response below.

Response

Ireland is committed to ensuring that tenants in social housing are provided with adequate housing that meets the standards laid down in the [Housing \(Standards for Rented Houses\) Regulations 2019](#). These Regulations updated the minimum standards for rental accommodation that local authorities are required to adhere to in respect of social housing.

There are approximately 140,000 local authority owned social housing properties in the State which have an estimated market value of €25 billion. The proper maintenance of this valuable State asset is very important. Of equal importance, however, is the requirement that the local authority tenants who are occupying those properties are living in homes which provide good comfort levels for occupants.

The Government continues to actively engage with the local authority sector to promote the preventative maintenance of local authority housing stock and provide significant funding for stock improvement works. Details of the various actions taken by the State since the findings were made are included below and work will be ongoing into the future.

1. Preventative maintenance

Local authorities are responsible, in the first instance, for the management and maintenance of their own housing stock under Section 58 of the Housing Act 1966. This includes responsive and planned maintenance and the identification of housing in need of upgrade, regeneration or adaptation.

Increasing numbers of local authorities have undertaken stock condition surveys. However, the absence of regular and standardised surveys by local authorities of their housing stock and a national asset management database to capture the survey information gives rise to a data gap.

The Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage is keenly aware of the importance of this information and has therefore been engaging with the local authority sector to ensure that full and standardised stock condition surveys are completed on the entire local authority housing stock over the next 4 to 5 years.

To this end, a national standardised stock condition survey template has been agreed by the Local Government Management Agency (LGMA). Procurement of a centrally hosted asset management system to capture the results of the surveys and inform future work programmes is being advanced. It is expected that the LGMA will commence a pilot of the ICT infrastructure in late 2022/early 2023 with subsequent rollout to all local authorities in the second half of 2023.

The completion of full stock condition surveys on the entire local authority owned social housing stock will provide reliable baseline data on the overall stock condition. Thereafter the works necessary to ensure that all dwellings are brought up to a good standard can be identified and prioritised through strategic and informed work programmes with funding programmes targeted accordingly.

Funding has been provided for new staff in the Housing Delivery Coordination Office (HDCO) contained within the LGMA as part of a strategic partnership to rollout and implement the transition to Planned Maintenance and also the Energy Efficiency Retrofit Programme.

Furthermore, as part of Ireland's national plan, [Housing for All](#), there is a commitment (policy objective 20.6) that all local authorities commence the move to a planned management and maintenance approach to housing stock management by Q1 2024.

To that end, €5 million in Exchequer funding has been ring-fenced for planned maintenance under this years Planned Maintenance/Voids Programme to support the implementation of an ICT asset management system for the local authority sector and to provide a funding contribution for the commencement of stock condition surveys utilising the standardised template across all 31 local authorities.

2. Stock Improvement Works

In addition to funding provided by the local authorities themselves in respect of their own housing stock (c. €350m per annum), the Irish Government provides funding across a number of programmes to support the local authority work to maintain and

improve their social housing stock but, in all cases, it is the local authorities that identify priorities.

Equally, the continued work of local authorities in undertaking stock condition surveys, their responsive and planned maintenance programmes, as well as important programmes such as the Energy Retrofitting and Voids Programmes, also address the issues raised by the European Committee of Social Rights.

The Energy Efficiency Retrofitting Programme (EERP) was launched in 2013 with the aim of funding the retrofit of social homes requiring insulation and energy upgrade works. Since the programme commenced, up to the end of 2021, over 75,000 units of social housing stock have been retrofitted with a total exchequer spend of €183 million.

Up to 2020, the EERP was carried out in two Phases:

- **Phase 1** of the programme provided funding targeted at the less intrusive cavity wall/attic insulation.
- **Phase 2** focused on fabric upgrade works to those dwellings with solid/hollow block wall construction and included the provision of heating upgrades.

The Phase 1 and Phase 2 approach to retrofitting is now withdrawn with the introduction in 2021 of a 'deeper' retrofit programme designed around the Programme for Government commitment that calls for the 'retrofit' of 500,000 homes to a B2/Cost Optimal Equivalent (BER) standard by 2030, of which, approximately 36,500 are expected to be local authority owned homes.

In 2022, the EERP has seen a significant increase in funding support to €85 million, allowing approximately 2,400 social homes nationally to be upgraded to a B2 or cost optimal equivalent (BER).

Notwithstanding the legal obligation on local authorities to manage and maintain their own housing stock, the Department also funds a voids programme. The funding provided by the Government is additional to the investment that local authorities provide themselves towards such work.

Since 2014, exchequer investment of some €261m has been provided to local authorities to refurbish / upgrade over 18,000 social homes. The funding provided over the last two years has been particularly significant as outlined below;

- 3,607 units returned to active use in 2020 utilising €56.4 million Exchequer funding
- 2,425 units returned to active use in 2021 utilising €32.1 million of Exchequer funding

3. Regeneration

The Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage continues to support a programme of large-scale regeneration projects in Dublin, Cork and Limerick. In addition, smaller projects in Tralee, Sligo and Dundalk are funded under the Programme.

The Programme seeks to deliver a significant number of new homes and the upgrading of existing homes in these areas. Further to this, funding is provided for additional physical, social and economic projects. This ensures that the regeneration in these areas goes beyond the built environment and addresses the social side to regeneration and the causes of disadvantage in these communities.

Projects being funded under the Programme target the country's most disadvantaged communities, including those defined by the most extreme social exclusion, unemployment and anti-social behaviour. From 2016 to date, over 668 units were delivered, supported by funding in excess of €323 million. Currently, the regeneration projects in the national pipeline have the potential to deliver in excess of a further 639 new units out to 2027, at an estimated cost of €212 million.

Dublin City

In the case of Dublin City, the Council is tasked with and planning for the provision of quality, appropriate and affordable housing. This is essential to meet the needs of the growing population and provide for the development of sustainable, inclusive and vibrant communities in the city.

As part of this target, a strategic regeneration capital plan for the next 20 years is constantly evolving and is being implemented in an iterative fashion building on sustainable developments in a structured complex specific fashion.

This will lead to an ultimate delivery of the regeneration of homes across over 200 complexes in the city.

All of the over 200 complexes are in the process of being assessed and categorised using the following criteria:

- Age
- Development potential
- Stock condition and maintenance perspective
- Practical sequencing solutions

The Council's objective is to build more and better homes and to increase public housing on public lands. Higher densities are a pre-requisite to achieving this.

Protected structures and structures of historical significance need a customised positive intervention solution which ensures an improvement in quality of life for residents whilst also respecting the architectural heritage of the building.

The Council continues to create and deliver on a strategic plan for every complex to ensure the delivery of quality, safe, warm, sustainable and energy efficient homes including taking into account the needs of the elderly and disabled.

The ultimate objective is that these regeneration projects will act as a catalyst for improving neighbourhoods: the renewal of underutilised areas by strengthening the fabric of urban centres; bringing back a mixture of uses to urban areas and locating people where services are available; reducing anti-social behaviour and future proofing homes.

Priorities for each of the city's electoral areas will be identified in conjunction with local area representatives and these will inform the future regeneration programme for the next 20 years.

This plan will contribute to Ireland's climate action commitments. Dublin City Council is working towards a commitment to upgrade their social housing stock so that at least 30% of dwellings will be B2 equivalent BER by 2030. Any retrofit or refurbishment project will achieve at least a B2 equivalent rating and all new buildings will achieve the Nearly Zero Energy Building (NZEB) requirements which equate to an A2 BER.

Significant progress has been made over the last two years with a number of regeneration projects near completion.

See Appendix for additional updates on a number of schemes specifically mentioned in the original complaint.

Collective Complaint 112/2014: European Organisation of Military Associations (EUROMIL) v. Ireland

Violation of Articles 5 (right to organise) and 6§2 (right to bargain collectively - negotiation procedures), decision on the merits of 12th September 2017.

In its decision of 12th September 2017, the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) concluded that Ireland was in violation of:

- Article 5 of the Charter on the grounds that the complete prohibition against military representative associations from joining national employees' organisations was not necessary and proportionate.
- Article 6§2 of the Charter as military representative associations were unable to meaningfully participate in national pay agreement discussions. This was considered to be brought in conformity in Findings 2020, for which reason the follow-up was terminated in this respect.

In its 2020 findings, the ECSR found that the violation in relation Article 6§2 regarding military representative associations being unable to meaningfully participate in national pay agreement discussions has been brought into conformity and as such there is no need to report on this Article in this report.

Regarding Article 5, in its 2021 findings, the ECSR noted that: *"Ireland has not removed the complete prohibition against military representative associations from joining national employees' organisations. There is no information submitted by the Government. Therefore, the situation has not been brought in conformity with Article 5 of the Charter"*.

Please see our response below in relation to Article 5.

Response

By law (Defence Act 1990 as amended), the Permanent Defence Force Representative Associations are prohibited from being associated with, or affiliated with, any trade unions or any other body without the consent of the Minister for Defence. Ireland is not unique in imposing limitations on the rights of association for military personnel.

Both Permanent Defence Forces Representative Associations ([PDFORRA](#) & [RACO](#)) sought associate membership with the Irish Congress of Trade Unions (ICTU) for the purpose of being involved in central public sector pay negotiations.

As provided for in the Defence Acts, conditional temporary consent for this purpose was provided to both organisations in late May and early June 2022, respectively. This associate membership is temporary until the appropriate legislative provision is put in place.

The [Report of the Commission on the Defence Forces](#) - published on 9th February 2022 - noted the complex nature of the issue, as well as the requirement for a range of matters to be resolved before this could be facilitated in the longer term by the Government. The Department of Defence is now proceeding with developing the necessary legislative provision in this regard.

It is the role of the Minister for Defence to ensure that ultimately, the State's ability to control and direct its Armed Forces remains absolute, and that any eventual solution in this regard definitively retains that certainty.

Collective Complaint 132/2016: University Women of Europe (UWE) v. Ireland

Violation of Articles 4§3 (non-discrimination between women and men with respect to remuneration) and 20.c as well as 20.d (equal opportunities and treatment in employment and occupation without sex discrimination), decision on the merits of 5th December 2019.

In its decision of 5th December 2019, the European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR) found that the situation in Ireland is in violation of:

- Article 20.c: on the ground that there is an absence of indicators showing measurable progress in promoting equal opportunities between women and men in respect of equal pay;
- Article 20.d: on the ground that there has been insufficient progress in ensuring a balanced representation of women in decision-making positions within private companies.

Further to this, in [Recommendation CM/RecChS\(2021\)9](#), which was adopted on 17th March 2021 the Committee of Ministers recommended that Ireland:

- review and reinforce existing measures aimed at reducing and eliminating the gender pay gap and consider adopting any new measures that may bring about measurable progress within reasonable time in this respect;
- indicate the decisions and actions taken to comply with this recommendation in the next report on follow-up to decisions in collective complaint

Please see below our response below.

Response

The unadjusted Gender Pay Gap in hourly pay in Ireland (as measured according to the common Eurostat definition) has fluctuated over the past decade from 12.2% in 2012 to 14.4% in 2017, before falling to 11.3% in 2018 - the latest date for which figures are currently published.

Recently published analysis by Ireland's Economic and Social Research Institute (ESRI²) of the gender pay gap in Ireland found a consistently high unexplained gap at the upper-end of the wage distribution, which suggests that efforts to tackle the pay gap should address the glass ceiling in the private sector.

Obstacles and factors involved which disadvantage women are persisting gender stereotypes (unconscious biases); unequal caring responsibilities; lack of flexibility and long-hours cultures in higher positions; and inequalities in access to training opportunities, networks and assignments.

The over-representation of women in minimum wage employment means the rate at which it is set remains crucial for the economy-wide Gender Pay Gap.

Actions being taken by Government

Additional paid and unpaid leave has been introduced for employees with parental responsibilities. The Work Life Balance and Miscellaneous Provisions Bill, which will transpose elements of Directive (EU) 2019/1158, known as the EU Work Life Balance Directive, is currently before the Oireachtas (Ireland's national parliament) and will provide for new and extended rights to parents and carers, including a right to request flexible working and the right to request compressed or reduced hours.

Since 1st January 2022, the national minimum wage has been €10.50 per hour, meeting a Government commitment in the [National Strategy for Women and Girls](#)

² Doorley, Karina; Privalko, Ivan; Russell, Helen; Tuda, Dora (2021) : The Gender Pay Gap in Ireland from Austerity through Recovery, IZA Discussion Papers, No. 14441, Institute of Labor Economics (IZA), Bonn, available at <https://www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/236472/1/dp14441.pdf>

[2017-2020](#) (Action 1.14). [Ireland's minimum wage](#) will increase to €11.30 from 1st January 2023.

The [Gender Pay Gap Information Act 2021](#) introduced the legislative basis for gender pay gap reporting in Ireland. The Act, along with [Regulations](#) which set out the detail on how these calculations will be made, commenced on 31st May 2022.

The Regulations require organisations to choose a 'snapshot' date of their employees in June 2022 and to report back on the same date in December 2022. For this year, organisations with 250+ employees are required to report. The reporting obligation will be extended to organisations with 150+ employees from 2024 and to organisations with 50+ employees from 2025.

Organisations to which the Regulations apply are asked to prepare a report annually on the mean and median hourly wage gap, data on bonus pay and employees in receipt of benefits in kind, the mean and median pay gaps for part-time and temporary contracted employees and proportions of male and female employees in the lower, lower middle, upper middle and upper quartiles pay bands.

Ireland plans to develop an online reporting system for the 2023 reporting cycle which will consist of a central portal where all employer reports will be uploaded and can be accessed publicly.

Significant advances have been made towards greater gender balance in business leadership in Ireland. As noted in the [European Gender Equality Index 2022](#), which was published by European Institute for Gender Equality (EIGE), women now account for at least a third of board members of the largest listed companies in Ireland.

[Balance for Better Business](#) (B4BB) is a Government sponsored, business led group whose aim it is to ensure that more women play a role at board level and in senior leadership teams. The Balance for Better Business review group was established by Government in July 2018 under actions 4.1 and 4.2 of the National Strategy for

Women and Girls 2017-2020, with the aim of promoting better gender-balance leadership in Ireland.

The Review Group set actionable and progressive targets for gender balance on listed companies in Ireland in its first report published in May 2019.

The Review Group has since issued three further reports, in November 2019, November 2020, and November 2021, and set additional targets for the senior leadership teams of listed companies, for the directors and leadership teams of large Irish-owned private companies, and for senior leadership roles in large multinational companies with operations in Ireland.

In 2018, the average representation of women on the boards of the largest Irish-listed companies was 8 percentage points lower than the EU-28 average. As of September 2021, this gap had reduced to 0.4 percentage points, with an average of 30.2% women directors on the Irish-listed companies, as compared to 30.6% for the EU-27 on average.

The most [recent report](#) highlighted the continued progress being achieved against the targets for female representation on boards and leadership teams of Ireland's 39 listed companies, 19 of which had met the 2022 interim targets of 30% female representation for the ISEQ20³ and 22% for the other listed companies.

³ The ISEQ 20 is a benchmark stock market index composed of companies that trade on Euronext Dublin. The index comprises the 20 companies with the highest trading volume and market capitalisation contained within the ISEQ Overall Index.

Appendix

Update on Dublin City Council (DCC) regeneration projects. This includes but is not restricted to complexes that were originally referred to.

Please note that there is a four-stage approval process that is complimentary to all of the requirements of the Public Spending Code. The stages are as follows:

1. Pre-Stage 1. This is centred on a preliminary discussion. Typically, a period to informally consult to explore suitability, potential issues and strategies (at quarterly technical meetings).
2. Pre-Statutory Approval. Typically, this is a period to informally consult. Good practice is that at earliest design stage the project owners consult with Advisors to confirm general consistency with design guidelines.
3. Stage 3 Pre-Tender Approval. This is required before going for tender.
4. Stage 4 Tender Approval. This is the green light for the project.

Following on from that the project moves to the “on-site” stage which means the project is live and building has begun.

Project	Units	Status
North King Street	30	On-site
Dominic East	72	On-site
O'Devaney Gardens	56	On-site
Cornamona	61	On-site
Finbar's Court	46	Stage 3
Glin Court	32	Stage 3
Infirmery	38	Stage 3
Dorset	163	Stage 2
Constitution Hill	124	Stage 1
Matt Talbot	92	Stage 1
St. Anne's	102	Stage 1
Oliver Bond	48	Stage 1
Glover's Court	50	Stage 1

Project	Units	Status
Pearse House	75	Stage 1
School Street/Thomas Bawn	115	Stage 1
Dolphin House	28	Stage 1
Crumlin Rafters	47	<i>Stage 2 Submitted</i>
St. Andrew's Court	37	<i>Stage 2 Submitted</i>
Grand Canal Basin	80	<i>Stage 1 Submitted</i>
Cromcastle Court/Woodville	156	<i>Stage 2 Submitted</i>

Limerick City and County Council area

The Limerick Regeneration Framework Implementation Plan (LRFIP) was adopted in February 2014. This plan sets out a programme of physical, social and economic interventions over a ten-year period from 2014-2023.

The Regeneration Programme continues to deliver substantial progress in the relevant estates, some 333 units have been fully completed to date. The delivery of the remaining envisaged 549 units detailed in the LRFIP will be reviewed on an ongoing basis to reflect the evolving housing need in the area.

In addition, the Thermal Upgrade element of the Programme has been completed in almost 1,140 of the existing houses being retained in the regeneration areas. There are a further 38 on-site at this time, with over 232 at various stages of the assessment and approval process.

When fully completed, the Thermal Upgrade Programme will have improved the thermal performance of over 1,400 houses as well as improving the physical appearance of the estates. The number of units to be retained has increased over time as units are removed from the Council's planned demolition programme.

The Council is also currently reviewing over 50 further properties which will be considered for inclusion in the Thermal Upgrade Programme. In addition, the Council is undertaking a review of any residual eligible properties that have not to date been included in the upgrade process.

Due to mass concrete having been used in the construction of a number of these houses in the 1930s -1950s, there was no external wall insulation, and they were noted as being amongst the poorest performing buildings in the State. In each estate covered under the LRFIP, there were a substantial number of derelict and burned-out properties, which were addressed by either major refurbishment or demolition.

Almost €65.6m has been invested in the refurbishment programme since the introduction of the LRFIP while over €8m has been invested in the strategic demolition programme. While there are still a number of properties to be demolished, the scale of demolition has reduced as the areas have stabilised and demand for accommodation in these parts of the city has increased.

In recognition of the holistic requirements additional to the provision of new houses and the thermal upgrading of existing houses in these areas, the Programme has invested in community facilities such as Community Centres. Approximately €3m funding has been provided for the expansion of the Moyross Community Centre.

In relation to investment in education facilities under the Programme, funding totalling over €1.6 million was provided for the Child and Family Centre at Southill.

The Regeneration Programme has also invested in environmental works including the removal of a historic landfill site in Saint Mary's Park and the replacement of lead water mains also in Saint Mary's Park. CCTV infrastructure has been upgraded and coverage expanded. This infrastructure is important in deterring and solving crime and also citizens' perception of community safety.

The Programme has also provided funding for physical projects that were considered strategic investments in underpinning and strengthening the economic performance of the city, with investments made to refurbish and reuse derelict properties on Nicholas Street (close to Saint Mary's Park and in the heart of the medieval city).

The Council also acquired key sites for economic rejuvenation in the city centre such as the Opera Centre. The Council is currently preparing an update on the progress made to date on the development of Opera Centre to create a new city centre area.

As the Regeneration Programme in Limerick concludes in 2023, the Council has recently tendered to appoint appropriately qualified consultants for the provision of Economic, Social and Spatial Planning led multi-disciplinary consultancy services to carry out a status update and provide recommendations for the future strategic direction of the Limerick Regeneration Programme as set out in the LRFIP. The award of the contract is imminent.

The status update will assess the current position and provide strategic masterplan options, targets and recommendations for the post 2023 period, out to 2030.

Southill

108 units were completed through six different projects since 2014; approval has issued for the construction of 37 new houses at Churchfield Phase 2, Southill, and the project is due for completion in Q3 2023.

Saint Mary's Park

32 units were completed through five different projects since 2014 with many of the new tenants moving from houses scheduled for demolition; a further 35 units are at various stages of approval with the Department (Orchard Site [27 units], Sheep Street [8 units]), all to deliver/complete in 2024.

Ballinacurra Weston

128 units were delivered through six different projects since 2014; the Council continues to review the housing demand in this area, in the context of submitting further projects.

Moyross

57 units were delivered through seven different projects since 2014; a further 95 units are at various stages of approval with the Department, 75 units scheduled to deliver/complete in 2023 and the remaining 20 units scheduled to deliver/complete in 2024.