



Declassified<sup>1</sup>

AS/Soc (2023) PV02add2

22 May 2023

Asocpv02add2\_2023

## Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

### Minutes

#### of the public hearing on “Public health emergency: the need for a holistic approach to multilateralism and health care” held in Marrakech on 16 March

In the framework of the report currently in preparation on “Public health emergency: the need for a holistic approach to multilateralism and health care” by **Ms Selin Sayek Böke** (Türkiye, SOC), the Committee held a public hearing with the participation of:

- ✓ **Ms Latifa Belakhel**, head of division: non transmissible diseases, Ministry of Health and Social protection
- ✓ **Mr Chakib Nejjari**, professor of epidemiology & public health, vice-president health pole, Euromed University (Fez)

**Ms Olena Khomenko** (Ukraine, EC/DA), Second Vice-Chairperson of the Committee, opened the hearing and introduced the guest speakers.

**Mr Nejjari** noted that global problems had to be met with global responses, and referred to environmental challenges, demographics, and relations between animal and human health. The world had suffered five other public health emergencies since 2005. All of them demonstrated the importance of rapid reaction by states and WHO. Global reaction had to be evaluated and decisions had to be taken based on the expertise of WHO. This applied to all health risks covered by WHO's mandate.

A holistic approach was needed within and between countries, and building resilience was important. Moreover, states had to anticipate risks under the “One Health” approach. Mr Nejjari underlined that medicines and healthcare services had to be considered as public goods. The ongoing public research at international level was highly important for developing and manufacturing medicines and vaccines. However, commercialisation of research should be avoided. Moreover, accessibility to and classification of treatments and vaccines as rights and public goods were highly pertinent.

**Ms Belakhel** spoke about Morocco's management of the Covid-19 pandemic, which was consistent with the International Health Regulations of 2005 and WHO recommendations. Morocco had a multisectoral and holistic approach, ensuring equity between population groups. The multisectoral approach to public health emergencies consisted of a crisis management committee, regional health safety centres and co-ordination facilities between central and local committees. Decisions were made by the Ministry of Health, local units that worked together within the ministry and at regional level.

The Central Co-ordination Unit (*Poste Central de Coordination* – PCC) ensured the continuity of the operational conduct of government action in crisis management. It had powers to pre-position means of intervention in high-risk areas, to allocate resources to prefectures and provinces (PCP), to centralise reports that came from PCPs and produce national reports, to organise simultaneous operations, to define needs for international help desired by Morocco in the event of a major crisis, and to co-ordinate the activities of NGOs that wished to contribute to the national efforts.

The national strategy also reached out to the foreign population in Morocco through specifically designed communication and awareness raising. This included information leaflets in Arabic, French and English, as well as information helplines. Covid-19 vaccines were free of charge to migrants, refugees, and asylum seekers.

**The Chairperson** then opened the floor for discussion.

<sup>1</sup> The minutes were approved and declassified by the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development at its meeting on 22 May 2023.

**Ms Günay** welcomed an important and timely report. Reaction was slow at the beginning of the Covid-19 pandemic, and it revealed the failures of WHO and the UN. The collapse of the international trade system had led to the hoarding of masks and vaccines by some countries and thus undermined access for other nations. This had created inequities between low- and middle-income countries and rich countries. In paragraph 13, WHO's response to the earthquakes in Türkiye and Syria was given as an example of an emergency response. The world should be better prepared for natural disasters and for a sustainable response; a holistic approach was urgently needed at international and national levels, because public health disasters did not know any borders.

**Mr Arsenis** thanked the guest speakers. Over the last two years, the pandemic had made one thing clear: multilateral co-operation of governments and regions in the health sector was crucial. No country or region, not even the most powerful, could tackle such a public health emergency on its own. International health organisations, such as WHO, had to be strengthened and rendered more inclusive and transparent in terms of decision-making processes. Other regional mechanisms could also be established, and national health care systems should be strengthened. In addition to a holistic approach in the provision of health systems, the unique characteristics of every country should be considered. Health care ought to be considered a public good that all citizens had access to, and public policies should provide essential healthcare to every citizen.

**Mr Amraoui** thanked his colleagues for their excellent presentations and contributions to the discussion. He criticised the multilateral response to the Covid-19 pandemic under the authority of WHO. There had been much hesitation by WHO in the beginning of the pandemic, and the decision to declare the virus a public health emergency of international concern had come too late. There was a need to discuss ways of making WHO more efficient and equipping it with powers to have better access to information. WHO had not had sufficient information about the virus.

**Ms Ovchynnykova** wanted to draw the attention of her colleagues to the impact of war on health and the environment in her country. There were also many global challenges that affected public health. Health and the environment were closely interconnected. The war in Ukraine had already affected all of Europe and had impacts well beyond the continent. Discussions around the protection of health systems needed an interdisciplinary approach to IT systems, housing, environmental hazards to health, and so on.

**Mr Davies** welcomed the preliminary draft report and highlighted the challenge of air pollution. There had been much research during the pandemic showing a direct link between air pollution and the number of infections. People from poor households were more exposed to air pollution in their local communities and homes. As for the access to medicines, vaccines, and treatments, these should be accessible to everyone as public goods.

**The Chairperson** then thanked the participants for their contributions and closed the hearing.

## Presence at the hearing

<b>Members / Membres</b>	<b>Country / Pays</b>	<b>Alternates / Remplaçant(e)s</b>
Ms Jorida Tabaku	Albania / <i>Albanie</i>	Zz...
M. Pere López	Andorra / <i>Andorre</i>	Mme Mònica Bonell
<b>Mr Armen Gevorgyan</b>	Armenia / <i>Arménie</i>	Ms Hripsime Grigoryan
<b>Mr Franz Leonhard Essl</b>	Austria / <i>Autriche</i>	Mr Michel Reimon
<b>Mr Stefan Schennach</b>	Austria / <i>Autriche</i>	Ms Doris Bures
Ms Nigar Arpadarai	Azerbaijan / <i>Azerbaïdjan</i>	Ms Parvin Karimzada
<b>Ms Sevinj Fataliyeva</b>	Azerbaijan / <i>Azerbaïdjan</i>	Ms Konul Nurullayeva
Mr Bob De Brabandere	Belgium / <i>Belgique</i>	Ms Els Van Hoof
<b>M. Simon Moutquin</b>	Belgium / <i>Belgique</i>	Mme Latifa Gahouchi
Zz...	Bosnia and Herzegovina / <i>Bosnie-Herzégovine</i>	Zz...
Ms Ekaterina Zaharieva	Bulgaria / <i>Bulgarie</i>	Zz...
Ms Denitsa Sacheva	Bulgaria / <i>Bulgarie</i>	Mr Vasil Pandov
Ms Zdravka Bušić	Croatia / <i>Croatie</i>	Ms Ivana Kekin
Ms Christiana Erotokritou	Cyprus / <i>Chypre</i>	Mr Constantinos Efstathiou
Mr Aleš Juchelka	Czech Republic / <i>République tchèque</i>	Mr Ondřej Šimetka
Ms Michaela Šebelová	Czech Republic / <i>République tchèque</i>	Mr Jiří Strýček
Ms Camilla Fabricius	Denmark / <i>Danemark</i>	Ms Karin Liltorp
Mr Urmas Reitelmann	Estonia / <i>Estonie</i>	Ms Maria Jufereva-Skuratovski
Ms Minna Reijonen	Finland / <i>Finlande</i>	Ms Tarja Filatov
M. Alain Milon	France	M. Christian Klinger
Mme Isabelle Santiago	France	<b>Mme Liliana Tanguy</b>
Mme Anne Stambach-Terrenoir	France	Mme Mireille Clapot
M. Philippe Vigier	France	Mme Nathalie Serre
<b>Ms Eka Sepashvili</b>	Georgia / <i>Géorgie</i>	Mr Levan Ioseliani
Ms Heike Engelhardt	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Franziska Kersten
Mr Andrej Hunko	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Catarina Dos Santos-Wintz
<b>Mr Christian Petry</b>	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Martina Stamm-Fibich
Mr Harald Weyel	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Katrin Staffler
Ms Nina Kasimati	Greece / <i>Grèce</i>	Ms Foteini Pipili
<b>Ms Theodora Tzakri</b>	Greece / <i>Grèce</i>	<b>Mr Kriton-Ilias Arsenis</b>
Ms Mónika Bartos	Hungary / <i>Hongrie</i>	Mme Katalin Csöbör
Ms Boglárka Illés	Hungary / <i>Hongrie</i>	Ms Zita Gurmai
Mr Bjarni Jónsson	Iceland / <i>Islande</i>	Ms Jódís Skúladóttir
Mr Joseph O'Reilly	Ireland / <i>Irlande</i>	Ms Reada Cronin
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...

Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
M. Andris Bērziņš	Latvia / <i>Lettonie</i>	Mr Edmunds Cepurītis
Ms Franziska Hoop	Liechtenstein	Mr Peter Frick
Mr Kęstutis Masiulis	Lithuania / <i>Lituanie</i>	Ms Rasa Budbergytė
<b>M. Max Hengel</b>	Luxembourg	<b>M. Paul Galles</b>
Ms Romilda Baldacchino Zarb	Malta / <i>Malte</i>	Mr Joseph Beppe Fenech Adami
Mr Ion Groza	Republic of Moldova / <i>République de Moldova</i>	Ms Reghina Ȃpostolova
M. José Badia	Monaco	Mme Béatrice Fresko-Rolfo
<b>Mr Miloš Konatar</b>	Montenegro / <i>Monténégro</i>	Zz...
Ms Reina De Bruijn-Wezeman	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Mr Bob Van Pareren
Ms Ria Oomen-Ruijten	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Ms Agnes Mulder
Ms Artina Qazimi	North Macedonia / <i>Macédoine du Nord</i>	Mr Vlado Misajlovski
Ms Lisa Marie Ness Klungland	Norway / <i>Norvège</i>	Ms Linda Hofstad Helleland
Ms Danuta Jazłowiecka	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	<b>Mr Tomasz Latos</b>
Mr Bolesław Piecha	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Marta Kubiak
Mr Andrzej Szejna	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Mirosława Nykiel
Mr Nuno Carvalho	Portugal	Ms Mónica Quintela
<b>Mr Pedro Cegonho</b>	Portugal	Ms Jamila Madeira
Mr Andi-Lucian Cristea	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	M. Ion Prioteasa
<b>Ms Alina-Ştefania Gorghiu</b>	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	<b>Mr Cristian-Augustin Niculescu-Țăgârlaş</b>
<b>Ms Diana Stoica</b>	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	<b>Ms Daniela Oteşanu</b>
Ms Marica Montemaggi	San Marino / <i>Saint-Marin</i>	Mr Marco Nicolini
Ms Tatjana Pašić	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Ms Jelena Milošević
Ms Dunja Simonović Bratić	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Mr Uglješa Marković
Mme Anna Záborská	Slovak Republic / <i>République Slovaque</i>	Mr Juraj Šeliga
<b>Mr Dean Premik</b>	Slovenia / <i>Slovénie</i>	Ms Iva Dimic
<b>Ms María Fernández</b>	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	<i>Mr José Latorre</i>
Mr Antón Gómez-Reino	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Ms Belén Hoyo
<b>Ms Carmen Leyte</b>	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Mr Salvador Vidal
Mr Mattias Jonsson	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Yasmine Bladelius
Ms Beatrice Timgren	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Boriana Åberg
Ms Sibel Arslan	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	M. Pierre-Alain Fridez
<b>M. Jean-Pierre Grin</b>	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	Mme Ada Marra
<b>Ms Emine Nur Günay</b>	Türkiye	Mr Mehmet Mehdi Eker
<b>Mr Halil Özşavli</b>	Türkiye	Ms Sena Nur Çelik
<b>Mr Hişyar Özsoy</b>	Türkiye	Ms Feleknaş Uca
Ms Selin Sayek Böke	Türkiye	M. Haluk Koç
Mr Artem Dubnov	Ukraine	Ms Lesia Zaburanna

<b>Ms Olena Khomenko</b>	Ukraine	Ms Larysa Bilozir
<b>Ms Yuliia Ovchynnykova</b>	Ukraine	Mr Andrii Lopushanskyi
<b>Mr Geraint Davies</b>	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Kate Osamor
Ms Sally-Ann Hart	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Mr Richard Bacon
Baroness Doreen E. Massey	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	<b>Ms Ruth Jones</b>
<b>Mr David Morris</b>	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Sheryll Murray

**Other Parliamentarians present / Autres Parlementaires present.e.s**

Ms/Mme Salma Benaziz, Chairperson of the Moroccan delegation to PACE / *Président de la délégation marocaine auprès de l'APCE*

Mr/M. Nicos Tornaritis, Chairperson of the delegation of Cyprus to PACE / *Président de la délégation chypriote auprès de l'APCE*

Ms/Mme Edite Estrela.....Portugal

Mr/M. Thomas Pringle.....Ireland / *Irlande*

**Partners for Democracy / Partenaires pour la Démocratie**

Mr / M. Rachid Talbi El Alami	Speaker of the House of Representatives / <i>Président de la Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Allal Amraoui	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Abdellah Bouanou	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Arif Hassan	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Ms/Mme Imane Lamaoui	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Hassan Oumribte	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Driss Sentissi	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Ahmed Akhchichine	Councillor, House of Councillors / <i>Conseiller, Chambre des conseillers</i>
Mr / M. Abid Badil	Councillor, House of Councillors / <i>Conseiller, Chambre des conseillers</i>

**Secretariat of Delegation or of Political Group / Secrétariat de Délégation ou de Groupe politique**

Ms / Mme Sonja Langenhaeck, Delegation Secretary, Belgian delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation belge auprès de l'APCE*

Mr / M. Razvan Tanase, Delegation Secretary, Romanian delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de la Roumaine auprès de l'APCE*

Mr / M. Kenan Arpacioğlu, Delegation Secretary, Turkish delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation turque auprès de l'APCE*

Ms/Mme Handan Karakas Demir, Delegation Secretary, Turkish delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation turque auprès de l'APCE*

Ms / Mme Francesca Arbogast, Executive Secretary of the Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) / *Secrétaire exécutive du Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)*

Mr / M. Saad Ghazi, Head of the Multilateral Relations Department, Morocco / *Chef du Service des relations multilatérales, Maroc*

Mr / M. Saad Ghazi, Director of External Relations and Communications / *Directeur des relations extérieures et de la communication*

**Experts / Expert.e.s**

Ms/Mme Latifa Belakhel, Head of Division of Non-transmissible Diseases, Ministry of Health and Social protection / Chef de la division des maladies non transmissibles, Ministère de la Santé et de la Protection sociale

Mr / M. Chakib Nejari, professor of epidemiology and public health, Vice-President of the Health Pole, Euromed University (Fes) / *professeur d'épidémiologie et de santé publique, vice-président en charge du pôle santé, Université Euromed de Fès*

**Council of Europe staff / Secrétariat du Conseil de l'Europe**

Ms / Mme Carmen Morte Gomez, Head of the Council of Europe Office in Rabat / *Cheffe du Bureau du Conseil de l'Europe à Rabat*

Mr / M. Stéphane Gignoux, Project manager / *Gestionnaire du projet*

Ms / Mme Hafsa Mekouar, Project Communication Officer / *Chargée de communication*

Ms / Mme Meryem Assibaiy, Project assistant / *Assistante du projet*

**Secretariat of the Parliamentary Assembly / Secrétariat de l'Assemblée Parlementaire**

Ms / Mme Louise Barton, Director, Directorate II – Human Dignity and Sustainable Development / *Directrice, Direction II – Dignité humaine et développement durable*

Mr / M. Alessandro Mancini, Assistant to the Head of Secretariat, Parliamentary Projects Support Division / Adjoint au Chef de Secrétariat, Division de soutien des projets parlementaires

Mr / M. Mustafa Arabul, Project assistant / *Assistant du projet*

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development /  
*Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable*

Ms / Mme Tanja Kleinsorge ..... Head of the Secretariat / *Cheffe du Secrétariat*  
Ms / Mme Aiste Ramanauskaite ..... Secretary to the Committee / *Secrétaire de la commission*  
Ms / Mme Anita Gholami ..... Co-Secretary/ *Co-Secrétaire*  
Mr / M. Guillaume Parent ..... Co-Secretary/ *Co-Secrétaire*  
Ms / Mme Prisca Barthel ..... Europe Prize section / *Section Prix de l'Europe*  
Ms / Mme Sylvie Elter ..... Assistant / *Assistante*