



Declassified¹

AS/Soc (2023) PV02add4

22 May 2023

Asocpv02add4_2023

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Minutes

of the public hearing on “Analysis and guidelines to guarantee the right to housing and to decent housing” held in Marrakech on 17 March

In the framework of the report currently in preparation on “Analysis and guidelines to guarantee the right to housing and to decent housing” by **Ms Selin Sayek Böke** (Türkiye, SOC), the Committee **held** a public hearing with the participation of:

- ✓ **Mr Hassan Radoine**, Director of the School of Architecture, Planning & Design (SAP+D) at Mohammed VI Polytechnic University
- ✓ **Ms Hind Benzha**, Director of property development, Ministry of Development of the national territory, Urban development, Housing and City policy

Ms Olena Khomenko (Ukraine, EC/DA), Second Vice-Chairperson of the Committee, opened the hearing and introduced the guest speakers.

Mr Radoine noted that in Morocco, the number of housing units in poor sanitary conditions had increased from 1994 to 2002, reaching as high as a total of 1.24 million. The Government thus came up with an Action Plan aiming to provide 100,000 social housing units per year. It was important for Morocco that these housing units were of decent (or adequate) standard, as enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Prioritising decent housing would also promote well-being, social equity, sustainability and resilient housing. Mr Radoine laid out the key parameters of decent housing, as defined by the UN Habitat and NGOs.

The housing programs in Morocco had been effective but had had some limitations, particularly from the perspective of “metropolisation and building mushrooming”. In cities with more than 500,000 habitants, rapid urbanisation had led to uncontrolled expansion of settlements on the outskirts of urban areas. Community involvement was needed to ensure that specific needs and preferences of local residents were met. This also promoted a sense of ownership and pride in the housing. Morocco had studied the urban policies of Brazil and Singapore. It was important to design sustainable and resilient housing to reduce environmental impacts. Lastly, building codes and regulations that promoted housing quality, as well as tenant protections, ensured a fair treatment of residents. Not a single building should be built without official permission.

Ms Benzha stressed the challenges linked to the rapid demographic growth in Morocco. The authorities sought to ensure adequate consideration of the social dimension through decent housing policies and cross-sector mobilisation of relevant actors, in particular so as to replace slums with more adequate housing. Slums had been eliminated in 59 out of 85 urban areas.

The Chairperson then opened the floor for debate.

Mr Schennach congratulated Morocco on the various initiatives. Vienna, where he was from, was the world capital for low-cost social housing. Local authorities sponsored to a large extent low-cost and social housing. There were different possibilities of ownership for low-cost and social housing. The owners could be municipalities or local government, and the State could provide low-cost loans. There was also a possibility to become co-owner of property. It was important to ensure there was a mix of governing structures and housing units that belonged to the State. In terms of housing development, there was a need for clear building regulations. Car-free areas were becoming increasingly popular. It was also important to preserve cultural heritage in urban planning. Moreover, it was necessary to ensure that schools, kindergartens, work opportunities, public transport, and infrastructure were put into place.

Mr Moutquin thanked the speakers for their presentations. He pointed out the links between housing, climate legislation, natural disasters, and precariousness. Public housing, especially in low-income countries, was not

¹ The minutes were approved and declassified by the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development at its meeting on 22 May 2023.

well insulated and this affected poor people the most. Non-governmental organisations negatively viewed the deforestation in the Atlas region and criticised the local Berber community, which nonetheless needed to cut these trees to keep warm. Mr Moutquin agreed with Mr Schennach on the need for strong regulations for the housing market. Lastly, he noted that many housing units had turned into Airbnb rental units because of tourism and wondered what impact tourism had on rental costs and access to housing in general in Morocco.

Ms Benzha reacted to the questions and appreciated having heard examples of housing policy from Europe. There were differences between Europe and Morocco, in particular the fact that social housing was often rental in Europe, whereas in Morocco it was owned. However, mentalities could be changed towards more rental units. At the moment, 96% of social housing units were built by the private sector. There was only a 13% demand for social housing as rentals, she noted.

As far as tourism was concerned, housing was closely linked to it and affected by it. For instance, during the pandemic lockdowns, real estate indicators dropped significantly and there were many empty houses and little revenue. Concerning the impact of Airbnb, Ms Benzha noted that Morocco was starting to see some impact, and that it was getting worse, but it was not yet as bad as in Europe. Against this background, the Ministry of Tourism was drawing up regulations on tourist rentals, as part of a wider series of regulations on tourism. Regarding energy consumption and mobility in cities, Morocco had increased investment in public transportation. Moreover, urban authorities had organised days and weekends without the use of private cars, in order to see a drop in emissions and heat.

The Chairperson then thanked the participants for their contributions and closed the hearing.

Presence at the hearing

Members / Membres	Country / Pays	Alternates / Remplaçant(e)s
Ms Jorida Tabaku	Albania / <i>Albanie</i>	Zz...
M. Pere López	Andorra / <i>Andorre</i>	Mme Mònica Bonell
Mr Armen Gevorgyan	Armenia / <i>Arménie</i>	Ms Hripsime Grigoryan
Mr Franz Leonhard Essl	Austria / <i>Autriche</i>	Mr Michel Reimon
Mr Stefan Schennach	Austria / <i>Autriche</i>	Ms Doris Bures
Ms Nigar Arpadarai	Azerbaijan / <i>Azerbaïdjan</i>	Ms Parvin Karimzada
Ms Sevinj Fataliyeva	Azerbaijan / <i>Azerbaïdjan</i>	Ms Konul Nurullayeva
Mr Bob De Brabandere	Belgium / <i>Belgique</i>	Ms Els Van Hoof
M. Simon Moutquin	Belgium / <i>Belgique</i>	Mme Latifa Gahouchi
Zz...	Bosnia and Herzegovina / <i>Bosnie-Herzégovine</i>	Zz...
Ms Ekaterina Zaharieva	Bulgaria / <i>Bulgarie</i>	Zz...
Ms Denitsa Sacheva	Bulgaria / <i>Bulgarie</i>	Mr Vasil Pandov
Ms Zdravka Bušić	Croatia / <i>Croatie</i>	Ms Ivana Kekin
Ms Christiana Erotokritou	Cyprus / <i>Chypre</i>	Mr Constantinos Efstathiou
Mr Aleš Juchelka	Czech Republic / <i>République tchèque</i>	Mr Ondřej Šimetka
Ms Michaela Šebelová	Czech Republic / <i>République tchèque</i>	Mr Jiří Strýček
Ms Camilla Fabricius	Denmark / <i>Danemark</i>	Ms Karin Liltorp
Mr Urmas Reitelmann	Estonia / <i>Estonie</i>	Ms Maria Jufereva-Skuratovski
Ms Minna Reijonen	Finland / <i>Finlande</i>	Ms Tarja Filatov
M. Alain Milon	France	M. Christian Klinger
Mme Isabelle Santiago	France	Mme Liliana Tanguy
Mme Anne Stambach-Terrenoir	France	Mme Mireille Clapot
M. Philippe Vigier	France	Mme Nathalie Serre
Ms Eka Sepashvili	Georgia / <i>Géorgie</i>	Mr Levan Ioseliani
Ms Heike Engelhardt	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Franziska Kersten
Mr Andrej Hunko	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Catarina Dos Santos-Wintz
Mr Christian Petry	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Martina Stamm-Fibich
Mr Harald Weyel	Germany / <i>Allemagne</i>	Ms Katrin Staffler
Ms Nina Kasimati	Greece / <i>Grèce</i>	Ms Foteini Pipili
Ms Theodora Tzakri	Greece / <i>Grèce</i>	Mr Kriton-Ilias Arsenis
Ms Mónika Bartos	Hungary / <i>Hongrie</i>	Mme Katalin Csöbör
Ms Boglárka Illés	Hungary / <i>Hongrie</i>	Ms Zita Gurmai
Mr Bjarni Jónsson	Iceland / <i>Islande</i>	Ms Jódís Skúladóttir
Mr Joseph O'Reilly	Ireland / <i>Irlande</i>	Ms Reada Cronin
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...

Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
M. Andris Bērziņš	Latvia / <i>Lettonie</i>	Mr Edmunds Cepurītis
Ms Franziska Hoop	Liechtenstein	Mr Peter Frick
Mr Kęstutis Masiulis	Lithuania / <i>Lituanie</i>	Ms Rasa Budbergytė
M. Max Hengel	Luxembourg	M. Paul Galles
Ms Romilda Baldacchino Zarb	Malta / <i>Malte</i>	Mr Joseph Beppe Fenech Adami
Mr Ion Groza	Republic of Moldova / <i>République de Moldova</i>	Ms Reghina Ȃpostolova
M. José Badia	Monaco	Mme Béatrice Fresko-Rolfo
Mr Miloš Konatar	Montenegro / <i>Monténégro</i>	Zz...
Ms Reina De Bruijn-Wezeman	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Mr Bob Van Pareren
Ms Ria Oomen-Ruijten	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Ms Agnes Mulder
Ms Artina Qazimi	North Macedonia / <i>Macédoine du Nord</i>	Mr Vlado Misajlovski
Ms Lisa Marie Ness Klungland	Norway / <i>Norvège</i>	Ms Linda Hofstad Helleland
Ms Danuta Jazłowiecka	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Mr Tomasz Latos
Mr Bolesław Piecha	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Marta Kubiak
Mr Andrzej Szejna	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Mirosława Nykiel
Mr Nuno Carvalho	Portugal	Ms Mónica Quintela
Mr Pedro Cegonho	Portugal	Ms Jamila Madeira
Mr Andi-Lucian Cristea	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	M. Ion Prioteasa
Ms Alina-Ştefania Gorghiu	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Mr Cristian-Augustin Niculescu-Țăgârlaş
Ms Diana Stoica	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Ms Daniela Oteşanu
Ms Marica Montemaggi	San Marino / <i>Saint-Marin</i>	Mr Marco Nicolini
Ms Tatjana Pašić	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Ms Jelena Milošević
Ms Dunja Simonović Bratić	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Mr Uglješa Marković
Mme Anna Záborská	Slovak Republic / <i>République Slovaque</i>	Mr Juraj Šeliga
Mr Dean Premik	Slovenia / <i>Slovénie</i>	Ms Iva Dimic
Ms María Fernández	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	<i>Mr José Latorre</i>
Mr Antón Gómez-Reino	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Ms Belén Hoyo
Ms Carmen Leyte	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Mr Salvador Vidal
Mr Mattias Jonsson	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Yasmine Bladelius
Ms Beatrice Timgren	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Borianna Åberg
Ms Sibel Arslan	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	M. Pierre-Alain Fridez
M. Jean-Pierre Grin	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	Mme Ada Marra
Ms Emine Nur Günay	Türkiye	Mr Mehmet Mehdi Eker
Mr Halil Özşavli	Türkiye	Ms Sena Nur Çelik
Mr Hişyar Özsoy	Türkiye	Ms Feleknaş Uca
Ms Selin Sayek Böke	Türkiye	M. Haluk Koç
Mr Artem Dubnov	Ukraine	Ms Lesia Zaburanna

Ms Olena Khomenko	Ukraine	Ms Larysa Bilozir
Ms Yuliia Ovchynnykova	Ukraine	Mr Andrii Lopushanskyi
Mr Geraint Davies	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Kate Osamor
Ms Sally-Ann Hart	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Mr Richard Bacon
Baroness Doreen E. Massey	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Ruth Jones
Mr David Morris	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Sheryll Murray

Other Parliamentarians present / Autres Parlementaires present.e.s

Ms/Mme Salma Benaziz, Chairperson of the Moroccan delegation to PACE / *Président de la délégation marocaine auprès de l'APCE*

Mr/M. Nicos Tornaritis, Chairperson of the delegation of Cyprus to PACE / *Président de la délégation chypriote auprès de l'APCE*

Ms/Mme Edite Estrela.....Portugal

Mr/M. Thomas Pringle.....Ireland / *Irlande*

Partners for Democracy / Partenaires pour la Démocratie

Mr / M. Rachid Talbi El Alami	Speaker of the House of Representatives / <i>Président de la Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Allal Amraoui	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Abdellah Bouanou	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Arif Hassan	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Ms/Mme Imane Lamaoui	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Hassan Oumribte	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Driss Sentissi	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Ahmed Akhchichine	Councillor, House of Councillors / <i>Conseiller, Chambre des conseillers</i>
Mr / M. Abid Badil	Councillor, House of Councillors / <i>Conseiller, Chambre des conseillers</i>

Secretariat of Delegation or of Political Group / Secrétariat de Délégation ou de Groupe politique

Ms / Mme Sonja Langenhaeck, Delegation Secretary, Belgian delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation belge auprès de l'APCE*

Mr / M. Razvan Tanase, Delegation Secretary, Romanian delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation de la Roumaine auprès de l'APCE*

Mr / M. Kenan Arpacioğlu, Delegation Secretary, Turkish delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation turque auprès de l'APCE*

Ms/Mme Handan Karakas Demir, Delegation Secretary, Turkish delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation, délégation turque auprès de l'APCE*

Ms / Mme Francesca Arbogast, Executive Secretary of the Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) / *Secrétaire exécutive du Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)*

Mr / M. Saad Ghazi, Head of the Multilateral Relations Department, Morocco / *Chef du Service des relations multilatérales, Maroc*

Mr / M. Saad Ghazi, Director of External Relations and Communications / *Directeur des relations extérieures et de la communication*

Experts / Expert.e.s

Ms/Mme Hind Benzha, Director of Property Development, Ministry of Development of the national territory, Urban development, Housing and City policy, *Directrice de la promotion immobilière, Ministère d'Aménagement du Territoire National, de l'Urbanisme, du logement et de la politique de la ville*

Mr / M. Hassan Radoine, Director of the School of Architecture, Planning and Design (SAP+D) at Mohammed VI Polytechnic University, *Directeur de l'École d'architecture, Université polytechnique Mohammed VI*

Council of Europe staff / Secrétariat du Conseil de l'Europe

Ms / Mme Carmen Morte Gomez, Head of the Council of Europe Office in Rabat / *Cheffe du Bureau du Conseil de l'Europe à Rabat*

Mr / M. Stéphane Gignoux, Project manager / *Gestionnaire du projet*

Ms / Mme Hafsa Mekouar, Project Communication Officer / *Chargée de communication*

Ms / Mme Meryem Assibaiy, Project assistant / *Assistante du projet*

Secretariat of the Parliamentary Assembly / Secrétariat de l'Assemblée Parlementaire

Ms / Mme Louise Barton, Director, Directorate II – Human Dignity and Sustainable Development / *Directrice, Direction II – Dignité humaine et développement durable*

Mr / M. Alessandro Mancini, Assistant to the Head of Secretariat, Parliamentary Projects Support Division / *Adjoint au Chef de Secrétariat, Division de soutien des projets parlementaires*

Mr / M. Mustafa Arabul, Project assistant / *Assistant du projet*

**Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development /
Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable**

Ms / Mme Tanja Kleinsorge Head of the Secretariat / *Cheffe du Secrétariat*

Ms / Mme Aiste Ramanauskaite Secretary to the Committee / *Secrétaire de la commission*

Ms / Mme Anita Gholami Co-Secretary/ *Co-Secrétaire*

Mr / M. Guillaume Parent..... Co-Secretary/ *Co-Secrétaire*

Ms / Mme Prisca Barthel.....Europe Prize section / *Section Prix de l'Europe*

Ms / Mme Sylvie Elter Assistant / *Assistante*