

Լեզու

limbă

FOURTH EVALUATION REPORT ON POLAND

nyelv

γλώσσα

Committee of Experts of
the European Charter
for Regional or
Minority Languages

ЯЗИК

cànan

ķiõll

språk

Adopted on 14 June 2023

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a state party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the state and, where appropriate, to encourage the party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the state to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the state concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the state in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each state for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the state, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the state in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the state concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective state party for possible comments within a given deadline. A confidential dialogue may, at this stage, be requested by this state party. The final evaluation report is made public, together with the comments, if any, which the authorities of the state party may have made. This document is then transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for the adoption of its recommendations to the state party, on the basis of the proposals for recommendations contained in the evaluation report.

MIN-LANG(2023)11

Published on 31 August 2023

Secretariat of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages
Council of Europe
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex
France

www.coe.int/minlang

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	5
Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Poland – Recent developments and trends.....	6
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Poland	7
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Poland	18
Chapter 2 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations	24
2.1 Armenian	24
2.1.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Armenian.....	24
2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Armenian in Poland.....	26
2.2 Belarusian.....	28
2.2.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Belarusian	28
2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Belarusian in Poland	30
2.3 Czech	32
2.3.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Czech.....	32
2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Czech in Poland	34
2.4 German	36
2.4.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German	36
2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Poland	38
2.5 Karaim.....	40
2.5.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Karaim.....	40
2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Karaim in Poland.....	42
2.6 Kashub.....	44
2.6.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Kashub	44
2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Kashub in Poland	46
2.7 Lemko	48
2.7.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Lemko	48
2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Lemko in Poland	50
2.8 Lithuanian.....	52
2.8.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Lithuanian.....	52

2.8.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Lithuanian in Poland	54
2.9	Romani.....	56
2.9.1	Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani.....	56
2.9.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Poland.....	58
2.10	Russian	60
2.10.1	Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian	60
2.10.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Poland	62
2.11	Slovak	64
2.11.1	Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak	64
2.11.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Poland	66
2.12	Tatar	68
2.12.1	Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Tatar	68
2.12.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Tatar in Poland.....	70
2.13	Ukrainian.....	72
2.13.1	Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian	72
2.13.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Poland.....	74
2.14	Yiddish	76
2.14.1	Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yiddish	76
2.14.2	Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yiddish in Poland	78
Chapter 3	[Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe	80
	Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification	81
	Appendix II: Comments from the Polish authorities	83

Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Poland in 2009 and applies to the following languages: Armenian, Belarusian, Czech, German, Karaim, Kashub, Lemko, Lithuanian, Romani, Russian, Slovak, Tatar, Ukrainian and Yiddish. The situation of these languages varies considerably and the choice made by Poland to apply the same undertakings to all leads to challenges for the implementation of the Charter.

The Polish legislation continues to provide a framework for the use of regional or minority languages in fields such as education, administration, media, culture and different forms of financial support are made available by the authorities for activities and initiatives in the mentioned languages. Nevertheless, the situation of the regional or minority languages and the implementation of the Charter show little progress since the entry into force of the treaty in respect of Poland. Bearing in mind the commitments undertaken by Poland, further steps are needed. A more proactive stance from the authorities and a structured approach are essential to ensure compliance with the undertakings ratified and an adequate protection and promotion of regional or minority languages. A strategy to implement the undertakings ratified to each language should be developed without delay, in co-operation with the speakers, and where needed, amend the national legal framework accordingly.

The current monitoring cycle is marked by the reduction of the education subsidy and the lowered number of teaching hours for German. As of 1 September 2022, the teaching of German as a minority language has been lowered to one hour per week, unlike the three hours for the other regional or minority languages. This measure should be reversed without delay and steps should be taken to provide education in German, i.e., with German as the language of instruction, as ratified. Besides the obvious negative consequences for German, this measure had a general impact for the protection and promotion of the regional or minority languages in Poland as a whole, putting into question the existing principles and achievements.

As for the other languages, education in regional or minority languages, as ratified, remains the exception and teaching them only as a subject is the most common model. Even in this case, continuity from pre-school to secondary education is missing for some languages. Other languages are not taught at all in schools. The availability of an adequate number of teachers and the provision of textbooks remain problematic issue. The education subsidy from national authorities to local authorities, an important means to promoting regional or minority language education, continues to be provided. However, there is a clear need to improve the system and make the subsidy more effective and transparent, in close co-operation with the speakers.

The use of regional or minority languages in administration remains scarce. There have been no legal or practical developments in this domain, where the situation has practically come to a standstill. A 20% threshold is hampering the implementation of Article 10 of the Charter concerning the use of regional or minority languages in administration. Only four languages meet the legal requirements for their use in relation with municipalities, but even in these cases the implementation is not consistent and there is hardly any use of them in practice. Bilingual place name signs, where the legislation is more flexible, exist in only five languages. However, applications by municipalities to use new bilingual place name signs have not been addressed for several years. No measures have been taken to mitigate the negative consequences for the use of German as a result of the 2017 enlargement of the city of Opole. Legal and practical measures are needed to ensure the implementation of the Charter in the administrative field.

In media, where the undertaking refers to setting up public radio stations and television channels in regional or minority languages, only programmes in some of the regional or minority languages are broadcast. However, their duration and frequency are insufficient. Only a few languages are present in private media. There are very few newspapers in regional or minority languages published at least weekly. Further measures are needed in this respect.

Activities promoting regional or minority languages or cultures generally receive support from the authorities. However, the annual project-based application system has known disadvantages, including for the sustainability and capacity to plan the activities of the minority associations. In addition, according to the representatives of the speakers many projects and initiatives of the associations, including in the field of media, are facing financial difficulties. Due to the inflation and the high costs, especially of electricity, in 2022-2023 the funding became insufficient.

Further and immediate steps are needed to raise awareness in the Polish society about the regional or minority languages and the cultures they represent, as part of the cultural heritage of the country. This fourth evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Poland in March 2023.

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Poland – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its states parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional regional or minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. Poland signed the Charter in 2003 and ratified it in 2009. The Charter entered into force in Poland on 1 June 2009 and applies to the following languages: Armenian, Belarusian, Czech, German, Karaim, Kashub, Lemko, Lithuanian, Romani, Russian, Slovak, Tartar, Ukrainian and Yiddish. These languages receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).
2. States parties are required to submit reports every five years¹ on the implementation of the Charter. The Polish authorities submitted their fourth periodical report on 5 January 2023. This fourth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report, additional information received from the authorities and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (27-31 March 2023) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter.
3. The Committee of Experts reminds the authorities to draft their next periodical report in line with the outline developed for this purpose², which provides for the submission of detailed information for each language and each undertaking covered by the Charter.
4. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in Poland and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the Polish authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the third monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of Poland in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the Polish authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Poland, as provided for in Article 16 (4) of the Charter. The Committee of Experts welcomes that the Polish authorities translate the evaluation reports into Polish. It encourages them to also translate this evaluation report into Polish as well as in the regional or minority languages with a view to supporting the authorities, organisations, advisory bodies and persons concerned in the process of fully implementing the Charter, in accordance with Articles 6 and 7.4.
5. As far as the detailed legal examination of each undertaking is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its **second evaluation report on the application of the Charter in Poland**.³
6. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to Poland in March 2023. It was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 14 June 2023.

¹ Article 15.1 of the Charter provides that States Parties submit periodical reports every three years. However, following the entry into force of the reform of the monitoring mechanism of the ECRML on 1 July 2019, States Parties are now to submit their reports every five years instead of every three years. See Committee of Ministers Decisions “Strengthening the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages” ([CM/Del/Dec\(2018\)1330/10.4e](#), para. 1.a.).

² Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties, [CM\(2019\)69 final](#).

³ [ECRML\(2015\)7](#).

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Poland

7. The Polish legislation provides for the legal protection of national and ethnic minorities – with effect on the minority languages, as well as of Kashub, as the regional language. The use of regional or minority languages in education is possible and an education subsidy⁴ for local authorities generally supports this. Regional or minority languages may be used in administration, under certain conditions. Radio and television programmes are broadcast in some of these languages. Finally, funding is provided for the associations and their cultural activities, as well as for publications.

8. Nevertheless, beyond this framework, the situation of the regional or minority languages in practice and the implementation of the Charter shows little progress over the 14 years since its entry into force in respect of Poland and has even regressed in the recent period. Whilst acknowledging the high level of the commitments undertaken by Poland, the Committee of Experts has also recommended ways in all the previous evaluation reports to gradually advance in their implementation, taking into account the situation of the individual languages. It regrets that too few recommendations have been taken into account by the Polish authorities. Moreover, the reduction of the education subsidy⁵ and the lowered number of teaching hours for German in 2022 (see below) was a major negative development in the current monitoring cycle. Its consequences go beyond the protection of German in Poland. They have had a chilling effect on the other regional or minority language speakers, casting doubts on the existing principles and achievements and creating an atmosphere where many fear that further measures against any of their languages may be taken.

9. The Committee of Experts underlines that the ratification of provisions under the Charter entails a commitment to implement them. Bearing in mind the provisions of Article 7.1.c and Article 7.1.d, a more proactive stance is needed from the national authorities to ensure Poland's compliance with its undertakings ensuing from the Charter and an adequate protection and promotion of regional or minority languages. Therefore, a strategy to implement the Charter's provisions for each language, in each domain, based on the undertakings ratified, should be developed without delay in co-operation with the speakers. The adoption of such a language policy and corresponding specific legislation or measures in certain areas (education, administration, media, etc.) - going beyond the existing provisions where needed - together with the establishment or designation of bodies which have responsibility in the given field, would promote the effective implementation of the Charter's provisions in Poland.⁶ The exchanges with the representatives of the regional or minority speakers also indicated a lack of structured approach in the domains covered by Charter. At present responsibility remains placed to a too large extent on the minority associations or local authorities. Moreover, in practice, minority associations sometimes do not find dialogue or support at the local or regional levels. In the case of local authorities, some are not aware of the Charter and their obligations. The national authorities should approach the relevant local authorities, inform and support them in the implementation of the undertakings at local level. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the implementation should not depend on whether local authorities or other stakeholders take the initiative as the responsibility for the Charter obligations lies with the State authorities.

10. The Committee of Experts recalls that in 2014 a campaign promoting the use of regional or minority languages in public life was carried out by the authorities.⁷ The Polish authorities are encouraged to put in place a follow-up campaign, in co-operation with the speakers, taking also into account the undertakings under the Charter.

11. As already indicated in previous reports,⁸ the application of Part III to some of the languages requires, in light of their low number of speakers, special and flexible measures in order to implement the legal obligations entered into by Poland. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Polish authorities **establish, in close co-operation with the speakers concerned, a structured**

⁴ Local authorities receive additional funds, in the framework of a general subsidy and its education part, if regional or minority language education is provided.

⁵ Although initially it was thought that the reduction would apply to all regional or minority languages, it became soon clear that this would concern only German. It should also be noted that the Senate voted an amendment reverting the education subsidy to the initial amount, but the Sejm finally confirmed the reduction. A proposal to further cut the funding for teaching German as a minority language was made during the discussion on the 2023 budget but was rejected.

⁶ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15 paragraph 8, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 54.

⁷ See 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 50.

⁸ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15 paragraph 6, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 26.

(generally, one hour), but this largely depends on their good will and financial resources. It is not a sustainable measure and does not solve the unjustified different treatment for German.

18. The consequences for German as a minority language are very serious in the immediate and medium term. Apart from the legal and financial issues, practical problems affect schools teaching German. Schools are reassigning teachers of German to other subjects or tasks, to avoid dismissing them. In the long run, however, there is a risk that these teachers will no longer be available for German language education. The number of pupils taking German as a minority language is expected to decrease. Coupled with its weak position at secondary level¹⁵, there is a real danger that the subject German as a minority language will cease to exist.

19. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the measures taken cannot be justified in any way. It urges the Polish authorities to reverse the measures reducing the teaching of German as a minority language, as an immediate step, and to start making available teaching in German as required by Poland's instrument of ratification.

2021 census

20. A census was carried out in 2021 in Poland. Questions about the national or ethnic affiliation, allowing for multiple identification (two nationalities) and language usually used at home (allowing for Polish only, Polish and two other languages or two other languages only to be declared) were asked. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the regional or minority language speakers expressed concerns about the delay in the publication of the results in this respect and the possible effects of a decrease in numbers on the implementation of Article 10. The authorities referred to the complexity of analysing the data on the ethnic affiliation and language as a reason for the later publication. They have also indicated that preliminary data would be available in April 2023, containing information on the languages with a higher number of speakers, and in autumn 2023, with information on the languages with a lower number of speakers.

21. The preliminary and partial results of the 2021 census concerning the "nationality-ethnic structure and the language used in the household" were made available in mid-April 2023.¹⁶ From the languages covered by the Charter, data is available only for Belarusian, German, Kashub, Russian, Ukrainian, while in terms of "national or ethnic origin" data is available also for the Lemko, Lithuanian, Jewish and Roma minorities. The Committee of Experts notes that compared to the 2011 census, it appears that, as far as the total figures for all questions and the language are concerned there has been an increase for German (199 000 compared to 96 461), Russian (59 900 compared to 19 805)¹⁷ and Ukrainian (53 000 compared to 24 539), but a decrease for Belarusian (16 900 compared to 26 448) and Kashub (87 600 compared to 108 140). In terms of national or ethnic affiliation, however, the figures have decreased for German (132 000 compared to 144 236) and Romani (11 800 compared to 16 723) but have increased for Belarusian (54 300 compared to 43 878), Lemko (12 700 compared to 9 640), Lithuanian (9 700 compared to 7 376), Russian (14 800 compared to 8 796), Ukrainian (79 400 compared to 38 795) and Jewish (15 700 compared to 7 353). The Committee of Experts notes also that 176 900 persons declared a Kashub identification. It is clear that in some cases the increase is due to immigration, such as from Belarus or Ukraine.

22. While waiting for the complete and final results, the Committee of Experts reiterates that the results of the census should be complemented by collecting and assessing, in co-operation with the speakers, other data concerning the number of users of the regional or minority languages and their geographic distribution. Complete data on the use of regional or minority languages is difficult to reflect in the census only. This is due *inter alia* to the fact that some people may be still hesitant in declaring a regional or minority language or they no longer use such a language at home.¹⁸

23. As to its effects on the application of Article 10 of the Charter, the Committee of Experts underlines that the census should not be used in any case to justify a reduction of the existing protection. For example,

¹⁵ According to a new interpretation issued by the Ministry of National Education in 2016, students learning a minority language are not allowed to choose the same language as their second foreign language in the 7th grade. Before, taking German as a minority language and a foreign language enabled the pupils to study the language for five hours per week, instead of three as a minority language or two as a foreign language. Since the foreign language may be chosen as a subject for the final examination at the end of secondary education, many pupils give up German as a minority language as of the 7th grade and choose German as a foreign language instead.

¹⁶ [Główny Urząd Statystyczny / Spisy Powszechne / NSP 2021 / NSP 2021 - wyniki wstępne / Wstępne wyniki Narodowego Spisu Powszechnego Ludności i Mieszkań 2021 w zakresie struktury narodowo-etnicznej oraz języka kontaktów domowych](#)

¹⁷ Only a small part of the Russian speakers lives in the settlements of the Old Believers in the Augustów district (villages of Bór and Gabowe Grądy) and the Suwałki district (Wodziałki) of the Podlaskie voivodship as well as in the Pisz district (Wojnowo) of the Warmia-Masuria voivodship, where Russian has a traditional presence within the meaning of Article 1.a of the Charter. See 1st report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2011) 5, paragraph 18.

¹⁸ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15 paragraph 14.

by removing entries from the registers on municipalities where regional or minority languages are “auxiliary languages” or where bilingual place names are used, if the 20% threshold is no longer met.

Awareness and tolerance vis-à-vis regional or minority languages and cultures

24. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Polish authorities **strengthen efforts to promote awareness and tolerance in Polish society as a whole in relation to the regional or minority languages and the cultures they represent.**

25. The Committee of Experts received very little information from the authorities in this respect. Public radio and television programmes *about* regional or minority language speakers or presenting different aspects of their lives and culture continue to be broadcast. While such programmes contribute to raising awareness of the regional or minority language speakers, in particular in the regions where they live, the Committee of Experts reiterates that reporting about regional or minority languages and cultures should also be part of the mainstream media throughout the country¹⁹ on a regular basis and reflecting more diverse topics. In education, the subject “Knowledge about society”, taught in the last year of primary school and secondary education, gives the opportunity to pupils to learn about the regional or minority languages speakers and their rights in the Polish legal system. The Committee of Experts reiterates that this should be developed to cover younger pupils in ways that are adjusted to their age.²⁰

26. According to the representatives of the regional or minority language speakers, little information about their languages, culture and history is provided in practice in education. Beyond this, incidents such as vandalization of bilingual place-name signs continue to be reported, for example, for Lemko. In the case of Lemko, obstacles to installing memorial signs have also been reported. The German-speakers referred to comments on social media considering that even the one-hour of language teaching should be cancelled. Political public statements refer to abolishing the exemption from the 5% threshold for minorities in the parliamentary elections, cutting funding to the German minority organisations and removal of place name signs in German at train stations.²¹ Romani-speakers raised concerns about the stereotypes they are still facing. There is also hesitance from some of the Russian-speakers in identifying as such. Moreover, cases of antisemitic nature have been noted by the Commissioner for Human Rights.²² In the case of Ukrainian, however, the minority language speakers feel that the atmosphere has improved after 2022 and negative reporting in the media or negative references to the past have almost disappeared. A recent survey²³ shows negative attitudes and deterioration in this respect over the past year towards Russians, Belarusians, Germans and improvements in attitudes towards Ukrainians. While these were most likely influenced by Russia's aggression against Ukraine and the actions of the respective states, it has an impact on the speakers of these minority languages. The survey also shows high levels of antipathy towards the Romani speakers.

27. The Committee of Experts recalls that the way a regional or minority language is protected and promoted is also linked to its perception among majority language speakers. Therefore, awareness raising among the majority is of the utmost importance and requires constant efforts in both education and the media. The aim is for the majority population not only to be informed about, but to value the fact that regional or minority language speakers form part of the linguistic and cultural heritage of the state with their different languages and cultures. From this perspective, further steps are needed to promote awareness and tolerance toward the regional or minority languages in Poland. The authorities should continue to raise the awareness of the general public in mainstream education, notably in the curricula, teaching materials and teacher training, regarding the regional or minority languages and the contribution of their speakers to the Polish society. Media should be encouraged, while respecting their independence, to pay more attention to these languages and cultures as integral parts of Poland's history and culture. In addition, awareness of regional or minority languages should be raised as a component and as an expected result of journalist training, as well as of teacher training.²⁴ In this context, the Committee of Experts invites the authorities to consider the possibility of joining the Observatory on History Teaching in Europe of the Council of Europe.²⁵

¹⁹ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15 paragraph 16.

²⁰ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15 paragraphs 17 -19.

²¹ [Janusz Kowalski atakuje – Wochenblatt – Gazeta Niemców w Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej.](#)

²² See [Informacja RPO nt. mniejszości narodowych i etnicznych w Polsce tematem obrad sejmowej komisji \(brpo.gov.pl\)](#)

²³ See *Attitudes towards Other Nations One Year After the War Outbreak in Ukraine*, [CBOS Foundation - publications - research reports.](#)

²⁴ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15 paragraph 19, See 5th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final, paragraphs 13, 18.

²⁵ [The Observatory on History Teaching in Europe - Observatory on History Teaching in Europe \(coe.int\).](#)

Consultation

28. The Joint Commission, comprising representatives of the national authorities, as well as of the regional or minority language speakers, is a consultative body to the Prime Minister, set up pursuant to the 2005 Act on national and ethnic minorities and on the regional language. Its tasks are to provide opinions, assessments and proposals on matters related to the exercise of minority rights and the needs of minorities, to give opinions on programmes related to national and ethnic minorities and the regional language, on minority related draft legislation, on the funding for national and ethnic minorities and the regional language, and to take measures to combat discrimination.²⁶

29. Problems concerning a real and adequate consultation and dialogue of the representatives on the regional or minority language speakers were already highlighted in the previous evaluation report.²⁷ They became particularly evident in the case of the reductions concerning German language education. This issue was not discussed in the Joint Commission and the needs and wishes expressed by the German speakers have not been taken into account when the measures were taken, and again when they asked the authorities to reverse the steps taken.²⁸ Moreover, in this context, the Joint Commission was dysfunctional most of the year 2022. Most representatives of the regional or minority language speakers suspended their participation in this body in June 2022 as a protest against the measures taken against German and the lack of steps to correct it.²⁹ The representatives of the German speakers had already suspended their participation in April 2022 and continue not to participate in its work.

30. In addition, during the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that dialogue is missing also at local or regional level. The regional or minority language speakers do not feel that they are listened to or have their needs and wishes taken into account by the authorities.

31. The Committee of Experts regrets to note that the Joint Commission can no longer be considered as a body “advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to regional or minority languages” and that “the needs and wishes” of the regional or minority languages are not taken into account when policies concerning these languages are devised, as required by Article 7.4.

Other issues

32. In the previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts noted that proposals had been made in the Polish Parliament to amend the Act on National and Ethnic Minorities and on the Regional Language in order to grant Silesian the status of regional language. There have been no developments in this respect. The Polish authorities consider Silesian a dialect of Polish. Nevertheless, the Committee of Experts notes that some representatives of the speakers still wish to recognise Silesian as a regional or minority language and protect it under the Charter. In the 2021 census, 585 700 persons declared a Silesian identity and 457 900 declared that they speak Silesian at home. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities and the representatives of the speakers to continue dialogue in this respect.

33. In the current monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts was informed of a wish to recognize Vilamovian (Wymysorys) as a regional language in Poland. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities to provide more information in respect of Vilamovian (Wymysorys) in the next periodical report.

Use of the regional or minority languages in education

34. Poland has undertaken to make available pre-school, primary and secondary education in the regional or minority languages (Article 8.1.a i, b i, c i), a choice which implies the provision of education with the regional or minority language as the language of instruction. Teaching the regional or minority language only as a subject or bilingual education, which would correspond to other options in the Charter, is not sufficient to fulfil the ratified undertakings. In addition, education in the regional or minority language must be made available irrespective of prior requests by families.³⁰

²⁶ See 1st report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2011) 5, paragraph 45.

²⁷ See 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 45.

²⁸ It should also be noted that the German speakers have developed a position paper containing their needs and wishes with respect to the implementation of the Charter to German, which had been sent to the authorities in December 2021.

²⁹ [Przedstawiciele mniejszości narodowych zawieszają udział w pracach Komisji Wspólnej \(vdg.pl\).](#)

³⁰ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15 paragraph 25, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 75, 1st report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2011) 5, for example paragraphs 50, 53, 56.

35. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Polish authorities **make available education with Belarusian, German, Kashub, Lemko and Ukrainian as the medium of instruction at pre-school, primary and secondary levels.**

36. Education in Lithuanian continues to be organised. There is also some teaching in as well as a bilingual model for Ukrainian, in very few schools and outside the area where the language is traditionally used.³¹ For most regional or minority languages (Armenian, Belarusian, German, Kashub, Lemko, Russian, Slovak and Ukrainian), teaching them as a subject (generally for three hours per week, except for German) remains the main model. However, teaching is not provided continuously from pre-school to secondary education for all languages. For other languages (Czech, Karaim, Yiddish) language courses are organised as a result of NGO initiatives. It is not clear whether this is still the case for Tatar.

37. Bearing in mind the undertakings ratified, the Committee of Experts reiterates that the Polish authorities must take resolute measures leading to a gradual development of education *in* regional or minority languages. Rather than having the requests of the parents as a basis, education *in* regional or minority languages has to be offered (“make available”) by kindergartens and schools. This implies that it has to be developed in advance, including by preparing educational materials, training teachers and actively promoting it among parents, pupils as well as competent authorities. This is all the more important since this model of education does not have a tradition in Poland, except for Lithuanian, and therefore it is not self-evident to those interested. According to the information received during the visit, even if parents now submitted requests for education in regional or minority languages, there would be no trained teachers and no textbooks.

38. In this context, the Committee of Experts reiterates the importance of the very early age in the process of language learning. However, for the pre-school level no education subsidy is provided, and the number of applications required for organising education *in* the regional or minority language remains higher than for only teaching the language, and also higher than the corresponding threshold for primary and secondary education.³²

39. During the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts was told about the case of a school in Hajnówka, where Belarusian used to be taught to all pupils, based on the school statutes. However, this is no longer the case and the authorities have indicated that in accordance with the relevant regulations, regional or minority language education is only provided based on requests from parents. While the Committee of Experts understands that this approach is based on the regulations in force, it reiterates that the ratification by Poland implies that education in the regional or minority language is “made available”. Therefore, even when this model is not offered, the principle should be followed and reflected in the national legislation, making it possible for a school to provide teaching of a regional or minority language to all pupils on its own initiative.

40. During the on-the-spot visit, the issue of access to regional or minority language education of pupils who are foreign citizens and for those who do not belong to a national or ethnic minority or community speaking a regional language was raised. This issue had already been raised in the previous monitoring cycle, with schools having been reportedly asked to return parts of the education subsidy.³³ The issue of access of foreign citizens to regional or minority language education became more important with the arrival children from Ukraine and Belarus. Moreover, the Committee of Experts was informed about recent attempts of the representatives of the authorities to verify whether pupils enrolled in regional or minority language education belong to the respective group. The regional or minority language speakers are concerned about this. The Committee of Experts shares this concern and highlights that in accordance with the spirit of the Charter, regional or minority language education should be available for all who wish to take part without the necessity to prove or confirm their ethnic or national affiliation.

41. The Polish authorities confirmed that only Polish citizens may join regional or minority language education. They also referred to audit reports highlighting that only pupils belonging to a national or ethnic minority or community speaking a regional language may join the respective language classes.

42. The approach taken by the Polish authorities is problematic from the perspective of the Charter. The Committee of Experts reiterates³⁴ that the Charter protects and promotes “regional or minority *languages*”, not linguistic minorities. Obviously, the measures taken by the parties will have primarily an effect on the

³¹ See 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 650.

³² See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, paragraph 28: 14 applications for pre-school education in a regional or minority language compared to 3 for teaching the language as a subject; in primary and secondary education the number is 7, irrespective of the educational model.

³³ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, paragraph 29.

³⁴ See 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 29.

communities concerned and their individual members.³⁵ However, once a language is protected by the Charter and measures for its protection and promotion are in place, everyone should benefit from them – irrespective of ethnic affiliation or citizenship – and, for example, be able to join regional or minority language education, if they are interested. Moreover, knowledge of regional or minority languages by people living in a certain area irrespective of their background contributes to language maintenance and revitalisation, as well as understanding and social cohesion of the local community.

43. As Poland is party to the Charter, its national legislation should reflect the principles of this convention in order to provide a basis for its implementation. The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to take the necessary legal measures to address these issues. All regional or minority languages are part of the common European heritage, whose protection and promotion lies at the heart of the Charter that Poland declared to follow in its policy and legislation by ratifying it.

44. The subsidy for regional or minority language education for local authorities has been in place for many years in Poland and remains a key tool in supporting it. Several shortcomings in the subsidy system's functioning have been raised in the previous evaluation reports³⁶, with the Committee of Experts underlining the need for more clarity and transparency on the calculation method, as well as on the rules the local authorities are subject to with respect to its use.

45. The regional or minority language speakers continue to highlight the complexity of the system and its lack of transparency, in particular as regards the possibility to monitor how the local authorities use the allocated funds. They highlight that some local authorities allocate only a small part for the regional or minority language education. Moreover, with the subsidy being higher when the number of pupils is low³⁷, it has the opposite effect of preventing regional or minority language education to develop further as schools tend to keep the number of pupils under the thresholds over which the subsidy decreases. In addition, there is no consultation with the representatives of the regional or minority language speakers before the subsidy is decided and the calculation methods have been changed in the past also without consultation.

46. The Committee of Experts regrets that some of these issues have been repeatedly raised in the previous evaluation reports and remain unaddressed. Moreover, the Committee of Experts notes that, according to the information received from the authorities, the education subsidy has decreased not only in 2022, but also in 2023. The Committee of Experts shares the concerns of the regional or minority language speakers about discussions on limiting the education subsidy only to those pupils who belong to a minority and learn the respective language. Ruling out the access to learning regional or minority languages also for other pupils goes against the Charter. While considering that the idea of the education subsidy is commendable and can be an effective way to promote these languages, the Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to develop, in close co-operation with the speakers, ways to improve the system and make the subsidy more effective and transparent. The Committee of Experts underlines that the education subsidy should encourage teaching in/of regional or minority language education for everyone interested in any of these languages. It should also include support for the pre-school level.

47. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Polish authorities **provide the basic and further training of a sufficient number of teachers for regional or minority language education, as well as updated textbooks and other teaching materials**. Availability of teachers, as well as of textbooks and other teaching materials remain concerns for the regional or minority language speakers.

48. According to the information provided by the authorities, the development of textbooks and teaching materials has been financed (after 2021) for Belarusian, German, Kashub, Lithuanian, Lemko, Slovak and Ukrainian. There are one to several titles, but not for each language annually. It is unclear from the information received whether they concern textbooks or other teaching materials, for which subjects and which grades. Overall, from 2017, the only other language for which a textbook or educational material was produced was Armenian.³⁸ Information about materials for Lemko appears only in 2022, and for Slovak in 2019 and 2022. According to the representatives of the speakers, the existing textbooks and teaching materials do not cover the needs of minority language education. In particular, in the context of the education reform (2017), many

³⁵ See the Explanatory Report to the ECRML, paragraph 11.

³⁶ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 32, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 82, 1st report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2011) 5, paragraph 48.

³⁷ Different, decreasing weights apply for less than 80 pupils, 80–112 pupils and above 112 pupils (for primary level) and for less than 30 pupils, 30–42 pupils and above 42 pupils (for secondary level); see the 4th periodical report, p.31, for the weights applicable in 2021.

³⁸ See previous evaluation report: As far as Armenian is concerned, the material produced is an auxiliary material about the Armenians in Poland.

existing textbooks became outdated. According to the Lithuanian speakers textbooks for subject teaching in the language are missing, after the third grade. Publishers are most often the minority associations, their publishing houses or foundations and they have limited human resource capacities in developing teaching materials. Some speakers suggested that special agreements with universities should be concluded, as it has been done for Ukrainian.³⁹ Ukrainian speakers underlined nevertheless, that the university is preparing a textbook for secondary education even though the priority for Ukrainian language education is primary school. The Committee of Experts reiterates that further measures are needed to ensure that textbooks for teaching regional or minority languages, as well as other subjects in these languages are available.

49. There is no training for teachers who would teach in regional or minority languages, in accordance with the undertakings ratified (Article 8.1.h). As far as teaching the language as a subject is concerned, according to the information provided by the authorities, languages such as Czech, German, Lithuanian, Russian, Slovak and Ukrainian are studied at university level; the necessary teacher qualifications may be obtained through language studies at university level.⁴⁰ In the case of Kashub, the “ethno-philology” at the University of Gdansk is meant to lead to teaching qualification. The Committee of Experts has been informed that Belarusian is offered at the University of Warsaw, however there are serious problems with the availability of teachers. It has no information about Karaim, Yiddish, Romani and Tatar. According to the speakers, Lemko is only offered as an optional language course in the framework of “Carpathian philology” at the Pedagogical University of Kraków and some research is carried out, but this does not lead to a qualification for teachers⁴¹ and trained teachers of Lemko are lacking. It is also insufficient with respect to Article 8.1. e ii. As far as Kashub “ethno-philology” is concerned, it is unclear how many of the students actually graduate from this specialisation; according to the information from the authorities, their number is approximately reduced by a half in the summer semester compared to the winter semester. The Committee of Expert would like to emphasise again that the Polish authorities have undertaken to “provide facilities for the study” of regional or minority languages “as university and higher education subjects” (8.1.e ii) and to “provide the basic and further training of teachers required to implement” the ratified undertakings. Therefore, they should identify ways to implement these provisions, in consultation with higher education institutions and with due respect to their autonomy. Since Article 7.1.h refers to “the promotion of study and research on regional or minority languages”, the Committee of Experts invites the authorities to provide specific information on research carried out in respect to each of these languages.

50. As noted in the previous evaluation report, since 2020, a master’s degree has been needed to work as a teacher, including for pre-school level. This applies to newly hired teachers, not to those already employed. For regional or minority languages it poses serious problems, bearing the mind the insufficient number of teachers. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to provide exceptions from this regulation for regional or minority languages.

51. As far as further training is concerned, the representatives of the speakers informed the Committee of Experts that advice on teaching methods is in general available. The Committee of Experts reiterates that such advice does not ensure the basic or further training of the teachers required to teach *in* regional or minority languages at various levels of education.⁴²

52. With respect to the teaching of the history and culture reflected by the regional or minority language (8.1.g), the main provisions have not changed. Pupils learning the regional or minority language study the respective “history and culture” as a subject, but this rather concerns the history, geography and culture of the “kin-state”, except for Kashub. It is still unclear whether the history and culture reflected by Lemko is taught. It is also unclear to which extent the teaching of the history and culture reflected by German is possible within the one-hour per week lesson. The Committee of Experts reiterates that pupils should also learn about the history and culture linked with the respective minority language in Poland. As far as the other pupils in the area where a language is traditionally used are concerned, they are learning about national and ethnic minorities, as well as the regional language only in the framework of subjects such as “Knowledge of society”. This is not sufficient in order to learn about the history and culture linked to a minority language in Poland, as required by Article 8.1.g. This approach of the Charter under Article 8.1.g is meant to contribute to understanding and valuing the respective regional or minority languages and the contributions made by their speakers as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Poland.

³⁹ For Ukrainian, a targeted subsidy is granted by the Ministry of Education to the John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin for the preparation of a Ukrainian language textbook for students of general and technical secondary schools in 2019-2022.

⁴⁰ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 36.

⁴¹ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 36.

⁴² See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 38, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 130.

53. As regards the monitoring of regional or minority language education (8.1.i), the current mechanisms in place do not meet the requirements of the undertaking. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the Charter requires a mechanism that monitors progress achieved in regional or minority language education and publishes periodical reports. Such monitoring should evaluate and analyse the measures taken and the progress achieved regarding regional or minority language education, with the purpose to identify effective methods, and areas where additional efforts are needed. Reports should contain inter alia information on the extent and availability of education, developments in language proficiency, teacher supply and the provision of teaching materials. They should be regular in order to provide an assessment of regional or minority language education over time, thereby making it possible to adjust methods and measures according to the experiences acquired. Their publication makes the system transparent and creates opportunities for representatives of regional or minority language speakers and civil society to take part in a public discussion on the development of minority language education, based on the measures taken and progress achieved. Existing supervisory bodies may carry out these monitoring functions and integrate them into existing administrative structures.⁴³

54. The Committee of Experts has received no updated information regarding the facilities for non-speakers to learn regional or minority languages. It invites the authorities to provide such information in the next periodical report.

Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities

55. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Polish authorities **reconsider the application of the 20% threshold with regard to the undertakings in Article 10 of the Charter and create the legal possibility of submitting oral or written applications in regional or minority languages, also in districts and voivodships.**

56. There have been no legal changes in the current monitoring cycle. Regional or minority languages may be used in contacts with local authorities in municipalities where the 20% threshold is met, and which are included in the official register of municipalities where an “auxiliary language” is used.⁴⁴ There is no legal provision for the submission of oral or written applications in regional or minority languages to districts (*powiaty*, local authorities) and voivodships (regional authorities). Additional place names in regional or minority languages may be introduced in municipalities where the 20% threshold is met or where it is not met, but a consultation with residents on this topic is organised; in this case, additional place names may be limited to certain parts of the municipality (e.g. villages) where a majority of the voters was in favour. They are all entered into a register of municipalities where place names in minority language are used. Districts (local authorities) and voivodships (regional authorities) may not use or adopt place names in the regional or minority languages, as required by Article 10.2 which concerns “the local and regional authorities”.⁴⁵

57. There have not been any developments in practice either. Only Belarusian, German, Kashub and Lithuanian are “auxiliary languages”. As far as place names are concerned, in addition to these four languages, place names in Lemko also exist. According to the two registers⁴⁶ - which are updated until spring 2021 - the most recent entries go back to 2014 for “auxiliary language” and to 2019 for place names.⁴⁷

58. According to the information received by the Committee of Experts, in practice, even in the municipalities where regional or minority languages can be used, this is hardly the case. As far as place names are concerned, there has been no results from the years-long applications submitted by municipalities for place names in German and Kashub. The authorities argue that the interest has decreased over time, which is reflected by the lower number of applications and indicate that some of these are still being processed, but the local authorities do not always reply to the requests for further information or documentation to complete the file. The Committee of Experts considers that rather the long delays in the procedure and a perceived reluctance of the authorities might discourage municipalities to further try to use minority languages. The Committee of Experts notes that the place name signs in German removed as a result of the enlargement of the city of Opole have not been reintroduced, nor have measures been taken to ensure that German may be used in contacts with the administrative authorities

⁴³ See See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 40, 7th report of the Committee of Experts on Germany, MIN-LANG(2022)7, paragraph 19, 5th report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final Slovenia, paragraph 23.

⁴⁴ See 1st report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2011) 5, paragraph 75.

⁴⁵ See 1st report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2011) 5, paragraph 80.

⁴⁶ [Rejestr gmin, na których obszarze są używane nazwy w języku mniejszości - Mniejszości Narodowe i Etniczne - Portal Gov.pl \(www.gov.pl\)](http://www.gov.pl), [Urzędowy Rejestr Gmin, w których jest używany język pomocniczy - Mniejszości Narodowe i Etniczne - Portal Gov.pl \(www.gov.pl\)](http://www.gov.pl).

⁴⁷ See the two registers and also the 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 45.

in charge of the respective localities.⁴⁸ The Committee of Experts has also been made aware that, more recently, place names in Kashub have not been reinstalled after road works, the authorities reportedly citing safety concerns. Similarly, an information sign in Lemko reportedly had to be removed, due to its proximity to the road.

59. The Committee of Experts reiterates⁴⁹ that the Polish authorities should determine, in co-operation with the regional or minority language speakers, in what areas these are traditionally present in sufficient numbers for the purpose of the undertakings entered into by Poland and apply Article 10 regarding the local and regional authorities concerned, irrespective of thresholds. Moreover, the local and regional authorities should be allowed and supported in using these languages, particularly in official topographic signage and other municipal signage (welcome signs, tourist information boards, museums, etc.), irrespective of thresholds. The Committee of Experts underlines that place names signs are a relatively simple but effective, promotional measure, which increases the visibility and prestige of a regional or minority language, raises awareness among the majority population and contributes to maintaining the local cultural and linguistic heritage. It can be easily applied even for those languages where the number of speakers is low. Organisational measures and actions encouraging speakers of regional or minority languages to use these languages in relations with administrative authorities are also needed. Regional or minority language speakers should be able to submit oral or written applications in their languages also in relation to districts and voivodships, in accordance with the Charter obligations selected by Poland.

60. The Committee of Experts recalls that for languages identified by Poland as non-territorial languages (Armenian, Karaim, Romani and Yiddish), the application of Article 10.2.b and 10.2.g raises particular issues. It invites the Polish authorities to clarify where the users are present in sufficient numbers for the measures specified under Article 10.2.b and if there are any traditional place names in these languages.

Use of the regional or minority languages in the media

61. In the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Polish authorities **take measures to strengthen the offer of broadcasting in all regional or minority languages.**

62. Poland has undertaken to facilitate the creation of one public radio station and one public television channel in each regional or minority language. There are still no such radio stations and television channels. Only programmes and only in some of the regional or minority languages are broadcast by local branches of the public radio and of the public television. The existing offer, which is particularly reduced as regards television programme, is not sufficient to comply with the undertakings ratified by Poland. Their implementation requires further action, including funding and possibly regulatory requirements on the part of the authorities, in order to set up the required television channels and radio stations.⁵⁰

63. According to the information from the authorities, private radio stations broadcast programmes only in Belarusian, German, Kashub and Lemko. As far as television channels are concerned, information is only provided with respect to programmes on the language and culture of Kashubians. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the Polish authorities should consider subsidies, technical and other support, as well as licensing requirements for radio stations or television channels in the areas where the regional or minority speakers live, in order to extend the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in regional or minority languages.

64. The Committee of Experts has been again informed by the representatives of the regional or minority language speakers that in some of the programmes regional or minority languages are not used or used only to a limited extent. The Committee of Experts indeed notes that some programmes are described by the authorities as being *about* several minorities or *presenting* different aspects of their lives and culture. Such programmes in which regional or minority languages may be occasionally used, are an awareness raising instrument (Article 7.3.) and deserve support. However, they cannot be considered programmes in regional or minority languages. These should have a sufficient duration and frequency, as well as sufficiently diverse content to really have an impact on the promotion of the language. The Committee of Experts also notes, both from the information from the authorities and from the speakers, that unlike for the other languages, programmes in German are mainly produced by the associations, not by the public radio station or television channel broadcasting them.

⁴⁸ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 68.

⁴⁹ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 47, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraphs 96-99.

⁵⁰ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 51, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, para 102.

65. The Committee of Experts received hardly any updated information with respect to audiovisual works produced in regional or minority languages. It recalls that Poland has ratified Article 11.1. d, which requires the authorities to encourage and/or facilitate the production of audiovisual works in regional or minority languages, and Article 11.1.f ii, which refers to general schemes for providing financial assistance to all audiovisual productions in Poland; these have to be designed in such a way that productions in regional or minority languages can qualify for them in practice and have to be actually applied also to such audiovisual productions

66. As far as newspapers in regional or minority languages are concerned, the Committee of Experts reiterates that in order to be considered as newspapers within the meaning of Article 11.1. e i, a publication has to be published at least weekly and in the regional or minority language.⁵¹ This is the case only for Belarusian and Ukrainian. However, in both cases the Committee of Experts has been informed of financial difficulties, with the funding received not sufficient to cover the significant costs increased due to the inflation. Other publications in regional or minority languages or containing articles in these languages also exist and receive financial support from the authorities. The Committee of Experts recommends the Polish authorities to seek ways to support online newspapers in the regional or minority languages covered by the Charter.

67. According to the available information, there has been no training of journalists and other staff for media using regional or minority languages.

68. According to the information available, there are no mechanisms in place ensuring that the interests of the regional or minority language speakers are represented or taken into account in the bodies responsible for guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media, as required by Article 11.3.⁵²

Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

69. Various cultural activities are organised by associations of the regional or minority language speakers and receive financial support from the Polish authorities. In addition to the subsidies from Ministry of Interior and Administration, financial support has also been provided, for some languages by the Ministry of Culture and National Heritage. Some institutions, museums, libraries, the State Archives, also organise activities which include some regional or minority languages and cultures, from a historical perspective or current creations. In some cases, the regional or minority language speakers indicated that in fact the associations are those organising the respective activity, which is then hosted by the museum. The Digital National Library Polona.pl makes available historical documents in or about some of the regional or minority languages.

70. Nevertheless, the Committee of Experts notes that it is often unclear from the information provided by the authorities to which extent the cultural activities organised by various Polish institutions reflect the regional or minority languages of Poland and their cultures. It appears that in some contexts they are simply used as foreign languages, or as languages of neighbouring countries, for example when events concern bilateral relations. In very few cases these cultural activities actually take place in the areas where the regional or minority language are traditionally used. Therefore, the Committee of Experts invites the authorities to provide detailed and specific information for each regional or minority language, in particular on how, in the areas where these languages are traditionally used, they *ensure* that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the regional or minority languages and culture in their activities and that such bodies have at their disposal staff who speak these language, as well as on how they encourage direct participation by representatives of the speakers in providing facilities and planning cultural activities. Similar information is needed with respect to foster access in other languages to works produced in regional or minority languages, and vice-versa. With respect to bodies collecting, keeping a copy and presenting or publishing works in regional or minority languages (Article 12.1.g), the National Library and other institutions collect such works. Nevertheless, for some regional or minority languages, information on the existence of a dedicated body, in the area where the languages are traditionally used, is missing. More detailed information is needed, for some languages, with respect to cultural activities outside the areas where they are traditionally used (Article 12.2.) As far as Article 12.3 is concerned, the information available is not sufficient to allow the Committee of Experts to conclude in some cases that the Polish authorities make *appropriate provision* for these languages and the cultures they reflect in their cultural policy abroad.

71. Representatives of the regional or minority language speakers emphasised the difficulties linked to the annual project-based funding by the Ministry of the Interior and Administration on the sustainability and

⁵¹ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 54, 7th report on Germany, MIN-LANG (2022) 7, paragraph 36, 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on Serbia, ECRML(2009)2, 2nd Report of the Committee of Experts on Slovak Republic, ECRML(2009)8, paragraph 136, 2nd report on Armenia, ECRML (2009) 6, paragraph 186.

⁵² See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 56.

capacity to plan the activities. They indicated that the Ministry of Culture and National Heritage, for example, provides three-year grants, which allow for better planning. Moreover, the amount granted by the Ministry of the Interior and Administration may vary each year and often associations are requested to return parts of these amounts once the project is over, as various documents are not accepted as justification. Funding is also received very late. Concerns have been expressed about the increasing complexity and bureaucratisation, which discourages some smaller associations to even apply for funding.

72. In addition, according to the representatives of the speakers many projects and initiatives of the associations, including in the field of media, are facing financial difficulties. Due to the inflation and the high costs, especially of electricity, in 2022-2023 the funding became insufficient. At the time of the on-the-spot visit, several representatives highlighted that the financing agreements for 2023 had not yet been signed (for example, for publications in Slovak and Belarusian), leaving them in a situation of funding activities from their own resources, taking loans, or negotiating later payments with the providers. Bearing in mind the increased costs, the project-based financing of cultural activities is clearly hampering cultural activities dedicated to regional or minority languages.

73. Although the authorities indicated that funding has increased in order to take the inflation into account, and that recipients are announced in advance about the funding that they will receive, it appears from the exchanges with the regional or minority language speakers that this is not sufficient to ensure adequate funding and sustainability for the activities promoting regional or minority languages.

74. The Committee of Experts reiterates that a more stable foundation and permanent funding are essential for minorities' cultures.⁵³ In this context, the Committee of Experts recalls its recommendations to arrange for the functioning of minority cultural institutions in close co-operation with the regional or minority language speakers.⁵⁴

Use of the regional or minority languages in economic and social life

75. The Committee of Experts has received practically no information with respect to the use of regional or minority languages in economic and social life. The authorities acknowledge that further steps are needed in this respect. The Committee of Experts underlines, that, under Article 13.1.d, which applies "within the whole country", relevant measures could consist, for example, of facilitating the use of regional or minority languages in the tourism sector or during international fairs, giving rewards to companies that are using the regional or minority language or initiating a bilingualism campaign. With respect to 13.2.b, this concerns, in the areas where the regional or minority languages are traditionally used, the promotion of these languages in a wide range of social and economic activities carried out by enterprises under public control such as railway, urban transport, electricity, water and gas, refuse collection and disposal.

Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges

76. Co-operation agreements exist with several states.⁵⁵ However, the Committee of Experts lacks sufficient information as to whether similar agreements cover Lemko, Karaim, Romani, Tatar and Yiddish. Cross-border exchanges continue to be carried out on the initiative of associations. Co-operation with organisations from Lithuania, including on online language courses, is essential for the Karaim speakers. Russian-speaking Old Believers co-operate and are interested in further development of cultural exchanges with the community in Latvia. Finally, for Belarusian, there are initiatives to develop co-operation with the speakers in Lithuania. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities to support these initiatives and foster their realisation.

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Poland

77. In the area of education, **Armenian** is only taught at primary level. At university level only research on the Armenian culture is carried out. There is no presence of Armenian in administration; Armenian is not an "auxiliary language" in any municipality (Article 10.2.b), nor are there any place names in Armenian in use (Article 10.2.g). As far as broadcasting media is concerned, the information from the authorities refer to a weekly public radio programme and one public television programme, twice per week - for several minorities; it remains unclear if and to which extent Armenian is in fact used in these programmes. The bilingual *Awedis*

⁵³ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 59.

⁵⁴ See 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraph 107.

⁵⁵ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 64: Armenia, Czech Republic, Germany, Lithuania, Russian Federation, Slovak Republic and Ukraine.

quarterly magazine continues to be published and receives subsidies from the authorities (Ministry of the Interior and Administration). The Armenian associations, such as the *Foundation for the Culture and Heritage of The Polish Armenians*, prepare and publish books, bilingual calendars and wall maps on historical and cultural topics, with financial support from the authorities. Some volumes include historical sources in Armenian, accompanied by their translations. A bilingual brochure for the Armenian Catholic mass has been published. The Foundation plans to publish in Armenian the award-winning monography of the history of Polish Armenians.

78. **Belarusian** continues to be taught as a subject at pre-school, primary and secondary school levels. However, the existing offer does not meet the requirements of the undertakings ratified for these education levels, which are to make available education with Belarusian as the language of instruction. The access of children from Belarus to Belarusian language education remains a challenge. According to the speakers, kindergartens are underfunded. There is no teaching of Belarusian in technical or vocational education. Belarusian can be studied at university level in Warsaw, but not in Białystok, in the area where Belarusian is traditionally used. According to the speakers, the availability of teachers is a serious problem. Belarusian has not been introduced as an “auxiliary language” in any additional municipality. It is an auxiliary language in five of the nine municipalities where the 20% threshold was met according to the 2011 census. Place names in Belarusian, but no street names or other topographical names, remain in use only in the municipality of Orla/Орля.⁵⁶ There is still no public radio station or television channel broadcasting mainly or exclusively in Belarusian. According to the available information, two radio programmes in Belarusian, with a daily and a weekly frequency, below 30 minutes each, and two weekly programmes in Belarusian and Ukrainian, below 30 minutes each, are broadcast by the public station *Radio Białystok*. The public channel *TVP3 Białystok*, broadcasts twice per week a 20-minute programme in Belarusian. The existing radio and television offer is, however, not sufficient to comply with the undertaking and does not correspond to the situation of the Belarusian language. The private station, *Radio Racja*, which receives support from the authorities, broadcasts in Belarusian (Article 11.1.bii). There are still no private TV programmes in Belarusian (Article 11.1.c.ii). The weekly *Niwa* is published in Belarusian (Article 11.1.e i). The Belarusian speakers were seriously concerned for the future of the newspaper, due to insufficient financial resources, which become more serious over the past year.⁵⁷ They indicated that the authorities had suggested to turn the weekly into a fortnightly or a monthly, a solution which they did not favour. This would also go against the commitment to encourage/facilitate the creation/maintenance of a newspaper in Belarusian. Financial difficulties also lead to the discontinuation of the colourful insert for children in *Niwa* and the impossibility to develop a proper online version. The associations organise cultural extra-curricular activities in schools (theatre, dance), funded by the authorities. The Belarusian speakers indicated that there is no co-operation with Belarus, including at the level of local authorities. They are interested in developing exchanges with Lithuania, where Belarusian speakers are also present. In 2022 several associations of the Podlaskie Voivodship set up a new NGO called “Centre of Belarusian Culture” (as a foundation), but, according to the speakers, thus far has not received support from the authorities. Financial support is provided for cultural activities.

79. There is no teaching in or of **Czech** at pre-school, primary, secondary, technical or vocational education, in the regular school system. Czech lessons for pre-school children are offered by the church-run kindergarten in Żelów (one lesson per week, as part of a project funded by the Ministry of the Interior and Administration), as well as by the Association of Czechs in Poland, as part of the Czech Club. In this framework, regular meetings are also organised for children of primary school age and for adults, where they learn Czech or come in contact with the Czech culture. Some meetings try to follow a “language nest” model, bringing together the elderly Czech-speakers and the pre-school children. A four-week intensive course is also organised once per year in Czech Republic. The association receives subsidies from the Ministry of the Interior and Administration, but the Czech Republic also provides important support (textbooks, various cultural materials, the organisation of the intensive course). Czech can be studied at several universities. Czech is not used in administration, as it is not “auxiliary language” in any municipality, nor are place names in Czech in use (Article 10). There are no public or private radio or television programmes in Czech, nor any daily or weekly newspaper (Article 11). The association and the church organise several other activities, to promote the Czech language and culture, such as the Czech Day, the Czech fairy tales review, to which all children in Żelów participate, or the children's theatre festival.

80. **German** is taught at pre-school, primary and secondary school levels. However, the existing offer does not meet the requirements of the undertakings ratified for these education levels, which are to make

⁵⁶ See Wykaz gmin, w których nie mniej niż 20% mieszkańców należy do mniejszości narodowych lub etnicznych, albo posługuje się językiem regionalnym available at <https://www.gov.pl/web/mniejszosci-narodowe-i-etniczne/wyniki-narodowego-spisu-powszechnego-ludnosci-i-mieszkan-2011---mniejszosci-narodowe-i-etniczne-oraz-jezyk-regionalny>, the two municipalities' registers, as well as 3rd periodical report of Poland MIN-LANG (2019) PR 8, page 51.

⁵⁷ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 66, 2nd report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2015) 7, paragraphs 163-164.

available education with German as the language of instruction. Moreover, as of 1 September 2022, the number of hours per week has been reduced (see paragraphs 14-19). German is taught as a subject in technical and vocational education, but the number of pupils is very low (35 in 2021/2022 and 48 in 2022/2023). German can be studied at university level. As far as the administrative authorities are concerned, German has not been introduced as an “auxiliary language” in any additional municipality during the monitoring period. It remains auxiliary in the 22 municipalities where the 20% threshold was met according to the 2011 census.⁵⁸ However, after the 2017 enlargement of the city of Opole⁵⁹, inhabitants in parts of three of these municipalities lost the possibility to use German in contacts with the authorities. Place names in German are in use in about 30 municipalities.⁶⁰ However, place name signs in German have been removed after the enlargement of the city of Opole. The four municipalities which had submitted in recent years applications to the Ministry of the Interior and Administration in order to have German names of localities registered have not yet received a reply.⁶¹ As already indicated, the place name signs in German removed as a result of the enlargement of the city of Opole have not been reintroduced, nor have measures been taken to ensure that German may be used in contacts with the administrative authorities in charge of the respective localities, as recommended by the Committee of Experts.⁶² As far as place names are concerned, the authorities should find flexible ways to reintroduce the bilingual place name for localities which are now parts of the city of Opole. The effects of the enlargement go beyond the use of language in administration. The Committee of Experts was informed that, for example, it has become more complicated to obtain premises for cultural activities, as applications need to be submitted to the city of Opole; reportedly, school premises can no longer be used for Saturday language classes. Regarding the calls to remove German place name signs at railway stations, the Committee of Experts reiterates that these signs have been installed in conformity with Articles 10.2.g and 13.2.b (promotion of the use of regional or minority languages in the public economic sector) and should not be removed.⁶³ As far as the media are concerned, there is still no public radio station or television channel broadcasting in German, as required by the undertaking. The public stations *Radio Opole*, *Radio Katowice* and *Radio Olsztyn* broadcast programmes in German. These are daily news and weekly programmes of about 50 minutes (*Radio Opole*), a weekly programme below 30 minutes (*Radio Olsztyn*) or two programmes of about 50 minutes twice per month (*Radio Katowice*). As far as television is concerned, the public channel *TVP3 Opole* broadcasts one programme, in German and Polish, with subtitles. As noted above, many of the programmes described above are produced by the German minority and associations. Two private radio stations broadcast programmes in German (11.1. bii). As far as print media are concerned (Article 11.1.e.i), the *Wochenblatt* continues to be published weekly in German and Polish. There is an interest from the minority to further develop the online version, as a daily online newspaper. Financial support is provided for cultural activities.

81. There is no offer of **Karaim** at pre-school, primary, secondary or technical and vocational education (Article 8). Its only presence in the educational system is at university level, where, however, research is carried out rather than language teaching. Those wishing to learn Karaim may participate in online lessons organised in Lithuania, for which, however, they have to pay, or take a self-learning online course. The self-learning platform⁶⁴ is the initiative of the Karaim association, with the financial support from the authorities. It offers language learning courses for adults and children, as well as information on the Karaim culture. Karaim is not used in administration, as it is not an “auxiliary language” in any municipality, nor are any place names in Karaim in use in any municipality (Article 10). There are no public or private radio or television programmes in Karaim (Article 11). According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit, a documentary about the Karaim minority is under preparation. The biannual magazine *Awazymyz* and the annual *Almanach Karaimski* (scientific profile) are not fully published in Karaim, but contain single articles or texts in Karaim. The Karaim association is very active in promoting the Karaim culture and language, through activities such as the “music map” (a collection of Karaim songs, online and as album), concerts, a digital archive⁶⁵, which receive support from the authorities. The Committee of Experts reiterates that further support is needed for the revitalisation of this language and decisive steps should be taken in this sense, including by developing and supporting co-operation with Lithuania.

⁵⁸ See *Wykaz gmin, w których nie mniej niż 20% mieszkańców należy do mniejszości narodowych lub etnicznych, albo posługuje się językiem regionalnym* available at <https://www.gov.pl/web/mniejszosci-narodowe-i-etniczne/wyniki-narodowego-spisu-powszechnego-ludnosci-i-mieszkan-2011---mniejszosci-narodowe-i-etniczne-oraz-jezyk-regionalny>, the municipalities’ register, as well as 3rd periodical report of Poland MIN-LANG (2019) PR 8, page 51.

⁵⁹ For the enlargement of the city of Opole, see 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 68: As of 1 January 2017, localities in the municipalities of Dąbrowa/ Dombrau, Dobrzeń Wielki/Groß Döbern, Komprachcice/Comprachtschütz and Prószków/Proskau have been included into Opole. Three of the four municipalities belonged to the municipalities where German is an “auxiliary language” that may be used in contacts with the authorities, unlike Opole.

⁶⁰ See Register of Municipalities.

⁶¹ See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 68: the municipalities are Rudnik, Pietrowice Wielkie/Groß Peterwitz (both in Silesia Voivodship), Zawadzkie/Zawadzki and Strzelce Opolskie/Groß Strehlitz (both in Opole Voivodship)

⁶² See 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 68.

⁶³ 3rd report on the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2021) 15, paragraph 68.

⁶⁴ [Kurs języka karaimskiego | Kurs języka karaimskiego \(karaimi.org\)](https://kursy.karaimi.org/).

⁶⁵ [e-Jazyszlur \(karaimi.org\)](https://e-jazyszlur.karaimi.org/).

82. **Kashub** is taught at pre-school, primary, secondary school levels. However, the existing offer does not meet the requirements of the undertakings ratified for these education levels, which are to make available education with Kashub as the language of instruction. Kashub is as well taught in technical and vocational education. Kashub is studied at university level, with the University of Gdańsk offering Kashub “ethno-philology”, which plays a role also for training teachers. Since the Kashub speakers are concerned about the lack of a sufficient number of teachers, the Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to provide exceptions from the rule requiring master studies in order to be employed as a teacher with respect to regional or minority languages. Kashub is auxiliary language in five of the 19 municipalities where the 20% threshold was met according to the 2011 census, while place names in Kashub are in use in over 20 municipalities.⁶⁶ Recently, the introduction of new signs in Kashub has nearly stopped, with applications not receiving replies for long periods of time. There are no public radio stations or television channels broadcasting mainly or exclusively in Kashub, as required by the undertaking. According to the information from the authorities, radio programmes are broadcast by the public stations *Radio Gdańsk* (several times per week) and *Radio Koszalin* (weekly). According to the speakers, however, they are not necessarily in Kashub. This is confirmed by the information from the authorities, as some programmes are described as being *about* a region or in several languages, leaving it unclear if and to which extent they are in Kashub. On television, *TVP3 Gdańsk* broadcasts two programmes of approximately 15 minutes each, several times per month; one of the programmes is bilingual. According to the information from the authorities, as far as private radio programmes are concerned, two private radio stations broadcasts programmes in Kashub (11.1 b ii). As far as private television (Article 11.1.cii) is concerned, the information from the authorities refers to programmes *about* the Kashub culture and language. The monthly *Pomerania* is published partly in Kashub. Cultural activities receive support from the Polish authorities.

83. **Lemko** is taught at pre-school, primary and secondary school levels. However, the existing offer does not meet the requirements of the undertakings ratified for these education levels, which are to make available education with Lemko as the language of instruction. In technical and vocational education, there is teaching of Lemko, but the number of pupils is very low (3 both in the 2021/2022 and in 2022/2023 school years). Lemko is only offered as an optional language course in the framework of “Carpathian philology” at the Pedagogical University of Krakow. However, this is not sufficient for training teachers for Lemko. Lemko is not “auxiliary language” in any municipality. Place name signs in Lemko are in use in the rural municipalities of Gorlice and of Uście Gorlickie (Article 10), but, according to the speakers, they are often vandalised. As far as media is concerned (Article 11), there is still no public radio station or television channel broadcasting mainly or exclusively in Lemko, as required by the undertaking. There is only one weekly 20 minutes programme on *Radio Kraków*, but it is unclear to which extent it is in Lemko. The private radio *LEM.FM* broadcasts programmes in Lemko. There are no public or private television programmes in Lemko. The bimonthly *Besida* is published in Lemko. There is, however, no newspaper in Lemko, as required by the undertaking. Financial support is provided by the authorities to cultural activities.

84. Education in **Lithuanian** takes place at pre-school, primary and secondary school levels. However, the Lithuanian-speakers reiterated the fact that textbooks for subject teaching in Lithuanian are missing, especially after the third grade and lessons take place in Lithuanian while the textbooks are in Polish. Lithuanian may be studied at university level only at the Adam Mickiewicz University in Poznań, as part of Baltic studies within ethnolinguistics major. Teacher training takes place mainly in Lithuania and at the educational centre in Suwałki. It is however unclear if and how the Polish authorities provide support to students training in Lithuania. Lithuanian remains an auxiliary language in one municipality, Puńsk/Punskas, where place names in Lithuanian are also in use. As far as the media is concerned, there is still no public radio station or television channel broadcasting mainly or exclusively in Lithuanian, as required by the undertaking. One radio programme in Lithuanian, below 30 minutes, is broadcast by *Radio Białystok* three times per week. One television programme, below 10 minutes, is broadcast weekly by *TVP3 Białystok*. There are no private radio or television programmes in Lithuanian. There is no newspaper in Lithuanian, as required by the undertaking. The fortnightly *Aušra* is published in Lithuanian, with support from the authorities. Cultural activities have received financial support from the authorities.

85. The information provided by the authorities with respect to **Romani** refers to 89 children at pre-school level in the 2021/2022 school year. Based on this information, it is not possible to determine if they received education in Romani. Romani is not used in administration. There are a few public radio and television programmes about the Roma minority and Romani culture, or about several minorities, including Roma. The

⁶⁶ See Wykaz gmin, w których nie mniej niż 20% mieszkańców należy do mniejszości narodowych lub etnicznych, albo posługuje się językiem regionalnym available at <https://www.gov.pl/web/mniejszosci-narodowe-i-etniczne/wyniki-narodowego-spisu-powszechnego-ludnosci-i-mieszkancow-2011---mniejszosci-narodowe-i-etniczne-oraz-jezyk-regionalny>, the municipalities' register, as well as 3rd periodical report of Poland MIN-LANG (2019) PR 8, page 51.

Committee of Experts however, does not have sufficient information as to whether and to which extent the Romani language is used in these programmes. There are no private radio and television programmes broadcast in Romani. There is also no newspaper or weekly publication in Romani or using Romani. The publications *Romano Atmo* (bimonthly), *Dialog Pheniben* (quarterly) and *Studia Romologica* (yearly) hardly use Romani. Financial support is provided to the cultural activities.

86. **Russian** is taught at pre-school (2021/2022 school year) and primary school level. There is, however, no use of Russian as the language of instruction, nor a presence in education in the area where it is traditionally used.⁶⁷ It can be studied at university level. Russian is not used in administration; it is not “auxiliary language” in any municipality, nor are any place names in Russian in use (Article 10). The public channel *TVP3 Białystok* broadcasts a 10-minute programme in Russian, twice per month, although it is unclear whether it is still available. There are no public or private radio programmes in Russian, nor private television programmes in Russian (Article 11 b ii, c ii). The quarterly *Zdrawstujcie* is published in Russian, but there is no newspaper in Russian in the sense of the Charter. Cultural initiatives have received financial support from the authorities, but it is unclear whether these cover activities in the areas where the language is traditionally used. There is an interest from the Russian-speaking Old Believers in maintaining the language and some are participating in online courses organised in Latvia. There is also an interest in audio recording and in collecting and reprinting old documents or manuscripts. Co-operation and exchanges with an important documentation centre in Riga would be important in this sense.

87. At pre-university level, **Slovak** is only taught in primary school. However, the existing offer does not meet the requirements of the undertaking ratified for this education level, which are to make available education with Slovak as the language of instruction. The association of the Slovak-speakers organises Slovak lessons in five day-care centres. There are, according to the speakers, no textbooks and no teacher training. One school had even discontinued teaching in the 2021/2022 school year due to lack of teachers. It can also be studied at university level in several universities. Slovak is not used in administration, as it is not an “auxiliary language” in any municipality, nor are there any place names in Slovak in use in any municipality (Article 10). The only presence of Slovak in the broadcasting media is a 25-minute weekly programme by the regional public station *Radio Kraków*. There are no private radio or television programmes in Slovak, nor public television programmes. The monthly *Život* is published in Slovak, however, the funding is insufficient according to the speakers. Cultural activities are organised by the association and have received support from the Polish authorities. There are, however, concerns about the future of the Slovak association, due to recent legal and financial problems.

88. **Tatar** is not present at any level of education (Article 8.1 ai, bi, ci, d iii, e ii). It is not used in administration; it is not “auxiliary language” in any municipality, nor are any place names in Tatar in use in any municipality (Article 10). *TVP3 Białystok* broadcasts twice per month a short programme about the Tatar minority, in Polish. There are no public or private radio or television programmes in Tatar, nor any newspaper published at least weekly. A quarterly (*Tatar Review*) and a yearly publication (*Yearbook of Polish Tatars*) of and about the Tatar minority is published in Polish. Cultural activities received support from the Polish authorities. The Committee of Experts underlines that efforts are needed for the revitalisation of this language and decisive steps should be taken in this sense.

89. **Ukrainian** is taught at pre-school, primary and secondary levels. There is also some teaching in as well as a bilingual model, in very few schools and outside the area where the language is traditionally used. However, the existing offer does not meet the requirements of the undertakings ratified for these education levels, which are to make available education with Ukrainian as the language of instruction. The access of refugee children from Ukraine to education in Ukrainian remains a challenge (see paragraphs 40-43). Ukrainian is taught in technical and vocational education, but the number of pupils is very low (2 in 2021/2022 and 8 in 2022/2023). Ukrainian can be studied at university level. Textbooks remain a concern for the speakers. Ukrainian is not an “auxiliary language” in any municipality, nor are there any officially registered place names in Ukrainian in use in any municipality (Article 10). There is no public radio station or television channel broadcasting mainly or exclusively in Ukrainian, as required by the undertaking. Programmes in Ukrainian are broadcast by a few regional public radio and television channels. *TV3 Regionalna* also broadcasts a programme in Ukrainian. According to the speakers, *TV Rzeszów* broadcasts a new programme in Ukrainian as of 2022. There are no private radio and television programmes in Ukrainian. *Nasze Slovo* is published weekly in Ukrainian, however, according to the speakers funding is insufficient. The newspaper in Ukrainian has reduced its format and volume to be able to manage the high costs. According to the speakers, the presence of Ukrainian in the media has to some extent increased after the arrival of refugees, with private media, including online portals, offering information in Ukrainian, especially in 2022. This is now less the case, and the focus is on news from Ukraine. The same is true to some extent for the public space, with the use of

⁶⁷ See 1st report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML (2011) 5, paragraph 18.

Ukrainian for announcements in transport, for example. These are not systematic measures aimed at promoting Ukrainian as a minority language in Poland. They could however be further developed to other domains and to other regional or minority languages, as an example of their promotion in economic and social life. The Polish authorities provide support to cultural activities. Cultural and other activities in Ukrainian were organised in 2022 by several Polish institutions, although rather for the refugees from Ukraine.

90. **Yiddish** is not present at any level of education (Article 8.1 ai, bi, ci, d iii), except university level. Yiddish is not used in administration; it is not an “auxiliary language” in any municipality, nor are place names in Yiddish in use (Art. 10). There are no public or private radio or television programmes in Yiddish (Article 11 a ii, b ii, c ii). As far as print media is concerned, the monthly *Słowo Żydowskie - Dos Jidisze Wort* has sections published in Yiddish in addition to Polish; this does not meet the requirements of the undertaking 11.1.e i. There are various cultural activities where Yiddish is used, and which receive support from the Polish authorities. These include festivals, theatre plays, song workshops, film screenings. The Ester Rachel and Ida Kamińska Jewish Theatre - Centre for Yiddish Culture organises Yiddish language courses, at different levels and for different age groups, as well as activities promoting the Jewish history and culture. An international summer seminar of Yiddish language and Jewish culture is also organised, in co-operation with the Shalom Foundation. The POLIN Museum of the History of Polish Jews is carrying out two programmes, which include inter alia, the digitisation and online accessibility of documents in Yiddish. The Committee of Experts reiterates the need to support the revitalisation of Yiddish and to take further steps to include teaching of Yiddish in education and to use it in the broadcasting media, including online.

Chapter 2 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Armenian

2.1.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Armenian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Armenian ⁶⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Armenian as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Armenian				= 69
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Armenian				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Armenian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Armenian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Armenian at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Armenian to learn it		=		
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Armenian at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Armenian		=		
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Armenian	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Armenian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Armenian among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Armenian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Armenian 				✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Armenian				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Armenian				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Armenian				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Armenian as an integral part of the curriculum				=

⁶⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

⁶⁹ As Armenian is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Armenian ⁶⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Armenian as a university and higher education subject				✓
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Armenian		=		
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Armenian				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Armenian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=
8.2	in territories other than those in which Armenian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Armenian at all the appropriate stages of education				= 70
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Armenian	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Armenian to submit oral or written applications in Armenian to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Armenian				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Armenian	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.ail	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Armenian				=
11.1.aili	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Armenian ⁷¹				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Armenian on a regular basis				=
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Armenian on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Armenian				=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Armenian				=
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Armenian				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Armenian				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Armenian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Armenian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Armenian 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Armenian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Armenian	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Armenian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=			
12.1.c	foster access in Armenian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=			
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Armenian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing		=		

⁷⁰ As Armenian is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

⁷¹ As Articles 11.1.ail and 11.1.aili constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.aili.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Armenian ⁶⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Armenian				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Armenian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Armenian	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Armenian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Armenian				= 72
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Armenian and the culture it reflects				=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Armenian	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Armenian in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Armenian in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Armenian in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Armenian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Armenian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education		=		
14.b	for the benefit of Armenian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Armenian is used in identical or similar form				=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

91. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Armenian speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. It is unclear whether there is any offer to study Armenian as university and higher education subject. The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 8.1.e ii.

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Armenian in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers

⁷² As Armenian is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁷³ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Armenian.**
- b. **Take steps to develop teaching in/of Armenian at all levels, including by providing the adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- c. **Take measures to increase the use of Armenian in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audio-visual works).**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Armenian speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Armenian, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- e. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Armenian speakers.
- f. Encourage/facilitate the use of Armenian in economic and social life.

⁷³ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

2.2 Belarusian

2.2.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Belarusian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Poland concerning Belarusian ⁷⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Belarusian as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Belarusian	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Belarusian		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Belarusian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Belarusian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Belarusian at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Belarusian to learn it				✓
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Belarusian at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Belarusian		=		
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Belarusian	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Belarusian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Belarusian among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Belarusian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Belarusian 				✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Belarusian				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Belarusian				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Belarusian				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Belarusian as an integral part of the curriculum				=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Belarusian as a university and higher education subject		=		
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Belarusian		=		
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Belarusian				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Belarusian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=

⁷⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Belarusian ⁷⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.2	in territories other than those in which Belarusian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Belarusian at all the appropriate stages of education		=			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Belarusian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.b	possibility for users of Belarusian to submit oral or written applications in Belarusian to the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Belarusian		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Belarusian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Belarusian				=	
11.1.iiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Belarusian ⁷⁵					
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Belarusian on a regular basis	=				
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Belarusian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Belarusian					=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Belarusian		✓			
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Belarusian					=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Belarusian				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Belarusian• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Belarusian• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Belarusian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Belarusian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Belarusian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Belarusian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=				
12.1.c	foster access in Belarusian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Belarusian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing		=			
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Belarusian					=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Belarusian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities					=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Belarusian	=				
12.2	in territories other than those in which Belarusian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Belarusian					=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Belarusian and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						

⁷⁵ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iiii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Belarusian ⁷⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Belarusian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Belarusian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Belarusian in economic and social life					=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Belarusian in economic and social life					=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Belarusian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Belarusian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education					=
14.b	for the benefit of Belarusian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Belarusian is used in identical or similar form					=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

92. In light of the repeated lack of information, the undertaking under Article 7.1.g is considered not fulfilled. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Belarusian speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. Although there is financial support for the newspaper in Belarusian, this is insufficient bearing in mind the recent increase in costs. The newspaper had to give up the insert for children and cannot develop a proper online version. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 11.1.e.i partly fulfilled.

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Belarusian in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁷⁶ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

⁷⁶ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Make education in Belarusian available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels, including by providing adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- b. **Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Belarusian in all those local and regional administrative units where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, irrespective of the 20% threshold.**
- c. **Ensure sufficient funding for the maintenance and development of a weekly newspaper in Belarusian.**
- d. **Draw-up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Belarusian.**

II. Further recommendations

- e. Promote awareness and tolerance in Polish society as a whole vis-à-vis the Belarusian language and the culture it represents, as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Poland.
- f. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Belarusian speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Belarusian, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- g. Provide for the teaching of Belarusian as an integral part of the curriculum within technical and vocational education.
- h. Take concrete measures to facilitate the creation of one public radio station and one public television channel in Belarusian covering the territories in which Belarusian is spoken.
- i. Facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Belarusian on a regular basis.
- j. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Belarusian-speakers.
- k. Encourage/facilitate the use of Belarusian in economic and social life.

2.3 Czech

2.3.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Czech

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Poland concerning Czech ⁷⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter (Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Czech as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Czech	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Czech				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Czech, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Czech • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Czech at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Czech to learn it		=		
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Czech at universities or equivalent institutions	=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Czech	=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Czech	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Czech among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Czech among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Czech • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Czech 				✓
Part III of the Charter (Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Czech				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Czech				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Czech				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Czech as an integral part of the curriculum				=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Czech as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Czech				=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Czech				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Czech and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=
8.2	in territories other than those in which Czech is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Czech at all the appropriate stages of education				=
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Czech	=			

⁷⁷ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Czech ⁷⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Czech to submit oral or written applications in Czech to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Czech				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Czech	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Czech				=
11.1.ii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Czech ⁷⁸				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Czech on a regular basis				=
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Czech on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Czech				=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Czech				=
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Czech				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Czech				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Czech • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Czech • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Czech 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Czech are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Czech	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Czech by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Czech to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Czech language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Czech				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Czech in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Czech	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Czech is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Czech				=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Czech and the culture it reflects				=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Czech	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Czech in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Czech in economic and social life				=

⁷⁸ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.ii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Czech ⁷⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Czech in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Czech is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Czech in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=			
14.b	for the benefit of Czech, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Czech is used in identical or similar form				=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

93. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Czech speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4.

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Czech in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁷⁹ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- Take steps to develop teaching in/of Czech at all levels, including by providing the adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- Take measures to encourage the use of Czech in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audio-visual works).**
- Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Czech.**

⁷⁹ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

II. Further recommendations

- d. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Czech speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Czech, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- e. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Czech speakers.
- f. Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Czech in at least one local and regional administrative unit where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, even if they do not attain the 20% threshold.
- g. Encourage/facilitate the use of Czech in economic and social life.

2.4 German

2.4.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Poland concerning German ⁸⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of German as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of German				=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote German				✓
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of German, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using German • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of German at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of German to learn it		=		
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on German at universities or equivalent institutions	=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of German	=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of German				✓
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among their objectives 				✓
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses German • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to German 				✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in German				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in German				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in German				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of German as an integral part of the curriculum		=		
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of German as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by German				✓
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) German				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of German and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=

⁸⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning German ⁸⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.2	in territories other than those in which German is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of German at all the appropriate stages of education				=
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in German	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of German to submit oral or written applications in German to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in German		=		
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in German	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in German				=
11.1.iiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in German ⁸¹				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in German on a regular basis		=		
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in German on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in German	=			
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in German		=		
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in German				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using German				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in German • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in German • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in German 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of German are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in German	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in German by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=			
12.1.c	foster access in German to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the German language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of German				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of German in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in German	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which German is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using German				=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for German and the culture it reflects				=

⁸¹ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iiii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning German ⁸⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of German	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of German in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of German in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of German in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which German is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of German in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=			
14.b	for the benefit of German, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory German is used in identical or similar form				=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

94. Bearing in mind the measures with respect to German in education, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 7.1.c, which requires the authorities to take “resolute action to promote German in order to safeguard it” not fulfilled. In light of the unjustified distinction with respect to German in education, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 7.2 not fulfilled. Bearing in mind the recent measures taken by the authorities with respect to German in education as well as the general climate towards German, also as it is perceived by the speakers, the Committee of Experts must revise its conclusion and consider the undertaking under Article 7.3 not fulfilled. Since the measures in the field of education have not taken into account the needs and wishes of the German speakers, who have also suspended their participation in the Joint Commission, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 7.4 not fulfilled. It is unclear to which extent the history and culture reflected by German can be still taught, within the one-hour lesson per week. The Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 8.1.g.

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁸² remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

⁸² [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Reverse the measures reducing the teaching of German as a minority language and make education in German available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels, including by providing adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- b. **Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding German in all those local and regional administrative units where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, irrespective of the 20% threshold.**
- c. **Identify ways to reintroduce bilingual place name signs in the localities merged with the city of Opole and ensure that German may be used in contacts with the administrative authorities in charge of the respective localities.**
- d. **Promote awareness and tolerance in Polish society as a whole vis-à-vis the German language and the culture it represents, as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Poland.**
- e. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for German.**

II. Further recommendations

- f. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the German speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning German, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- g. Extend the teaching of German as an integral part of the curriculum within technical and vocational education.
- h. Take concrete measures to facilitate the creation of one public radio station and one public television channel in German covering the territories in which German is spoken.
- i. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in German on a regular basis.
- j. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the German speakers.
- k. Encourage/facilitate the use of German in economic and social life.

2.5 Karaim

2.5.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Karaim

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Karaim ⁸³	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Karaim as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Karaim					= 84
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Karaim				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Karaim, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Karaim • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Karaim at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Karaim to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Karaim at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Karaim	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Karaim	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Karaim among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Karaim among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Karaim • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Karaim 					✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Karaim				=	
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Karaim				=	
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Karaim				=	
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Karaim as an integral part of the curriculum				=	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Karaim as a university and higher education subject				=	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Karaim				=	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Karaim				=	
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Karaim and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=	

⁸³ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

⁸⁴ As Karaim is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Karaim ⁸³	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.2	in territories other than those in which Karaim is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Karaim at all the appropriate stages of education				= 85
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Karaim	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Karaim to submit oral or written applications in Karaim to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Karaim				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Karaim	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Karaim				=
11.1.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Karaim ⁸⁶				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Karaim on a regular basis				=
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Karaim on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Karaim		=		
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Karaim				=
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Karaim				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Karaim				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Karaim • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Karaim • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Karaim 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Karaim are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Karaim	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Karaim by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Karaim to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Karaim language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Karaim				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Karaim in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Karaim	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Karaim is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Karaim				= 87
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Karaim and the culture it reflects				=

⁸⁵ As Karaim is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

⁸⁶ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iii.

⁸⁷ As Karaim is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Karaim ⁸³	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Karaim	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Karaim in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Karaim in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Karaim in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Karaim is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Karaim in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				=
14.b	for the benefit of Karaim, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Karaim is used in identical or similar form			=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

95. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Karaim speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4.

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Karaim in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁸⁸ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- Draw up, in co-operation with the minority, an action plan on the revitalisation of Karaim and for the implementation of the Charter for this language.
- Take steps to develop teaching in/of Karaim, based on the existing initiatives.

⁸⁸ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

II. Further recommendations

- c. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Karaim minority are taken into account in all matters concerning Karaim, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation in the Joint Commission.
- d. Take measures to increase the presence of Karaim in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audiovisual works).
- e. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Karaim minority.

2.6 Kashub

2.6.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Kashub

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Kashub ⁸⁹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter					
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Kashub as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Kashub	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Kashub		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Kashub, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Kashub • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Kashub at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Kashub to learn it				=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Kashub at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Kashub				=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Kashub	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Kashub among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Kashub among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Kashub • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Kashub 				✓
Part III of the Charter					
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Kashub				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Kashub				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Kashub				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Kashub as an integral part of the curriculum	↗			
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Kashub as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Kashub		=		
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Kashub				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Kashub and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=

⁸⁹ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Kashub ⁸⁹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.2	in territories other than those in which Kashub is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Kashub at all the appropriate stages of education				=
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Kashub	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Kashub to submit oral or written applications in Kashub to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Kashub		=		
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Kashub	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Kashub				=
11.1.iiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Kashub ⁹⁰				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Kashub on a regular basis	=			
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Kashub on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Kashub				=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Kashub				=
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Kashub				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Kashub				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Kashub • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Kashub • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Kashub 				=
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Kashub are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Kashub	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Kashub by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Kashub to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Kashub language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=			
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Kashub				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Kashub in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=			
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Kashub	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Kashub is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Kashub				=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Kashub and the culture it reflects	=			

⁹⁰ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iiii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Kashub ⁸⁹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Kashub	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Kashub in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Kashub in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Kashub in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Kashub is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Kashub in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				= 91
14.b	for the benefit of Kashub, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Kashub is used in identical or similar form				= 92

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

96. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Kashub speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. Bearing in mind the relatively high and stable number of pupils in technical or vocational education, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 8.1.d iii fulfilled.

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Kashub in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁹³ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

⁹¹ Kashub is a regional language traditionally spoken only in Poland, therefore the undertaking is not applicable.

⁹² Kashub is a regional language traditionally spoken only in Poland, therefore the undertaking is not applicable.

⁹³ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Make education in Kashub available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels, including by providing adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- b. **Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Kashub in all those local and regional administrative units where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, irrespective of the 20% threshold.**
- c. **Take concrete measures to facilitate the creation of one public radio station and one public television channel in Kashub covering the territories in which Kashub is spoken.**
- d. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Kashub.**

II. Further recommendations

- e. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Kashub speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Kashub, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- f. Facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Kashub on a regular basis.
- g. Facilitate the creation of one weekly or daily newspaper in Kashub.
- h. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Kashub speakers.
- i. Encourage/facilitate the use of Kashub in economic and social life.

2.7 Lemko

2.7.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Lemko

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Poland concerning Lemko ⁹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter					
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Lemko as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Lemko	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Lemko		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Lemko, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Lemko • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Lemko at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Lemko to learn it		=		
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Lemko at universities or equivalent institutions				=
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Lemko				=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Lemko	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Lemko among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Lemko among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Lemko • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Lemko 				✓
Part III of the Charter					
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Lemko				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Lemko				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Lemko				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Lemko as an integral part of the curriculum				=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Lemko as a university and higher education subject				=
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Lemko				=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Lemko				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Lemko and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=

⁹⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Lemko ⁹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.2	in territories other than those in which Lemko is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Lemko at all the appropriate stages of education		=		
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Lemko	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Lemko to submit oral or written applications in Lemko to the regional or local authority			=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Lemko		=		
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Lemko	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Lemko			=	
11.1.iiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Lemko ⁹⁵				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Lemko on a regular basis	=			
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Lemko on a regular basis			=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Lemko	=			
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Lemko			=	
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Lemko				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Lemko			=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Lemko • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Lemko • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Lemko 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Lemko are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media			=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Lemko	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Lemko by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Lemko to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				✓
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Lemko language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Lemko				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Lemko in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Lemko	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Lemko is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Lemko		=		
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Lemko and the culture it reflects			=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					

⁹⁵ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iiii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Lemko ⁹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Lemko	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Lemko in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Lemko in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Lemko in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Lemko is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Lemko in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				=
14.b	for the benefit of Lemko, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Lemko is used in identical or similar form				=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

97. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Lemko speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. The Committee of Experts does not have sufficient information to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 12.1.c.

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Lemko in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁹⁶ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

⁹⁶ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Make education in Lemko available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels, including by providing adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- b. **Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Lemko in all those local and regional administrative units where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, irrespective of the 20% threshold.**
- c. **Promote awareness and tolerance in Polish society as a whole vis-à-vis Lemko and the culture it represents, as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Poland.**
- d. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Lemko.**

II. Further recommendations

- e. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Lemko speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Lemko, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- f. Further develop the offer of Lemko language education outside the territories where the language is traditionally used, at all appropriate stages.
- g. Provide facilities for the study of Lemko as a university or higher education subject.
- h. Extend the presence of Lemko in broadcasting media.
- i. Facilitate the creation of a weekly newspaper in Lemko.
- j. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Lemko speakers.
- k. Encourage/facilitate the use of Lemko in economic and social life.

2.8 Lithuanian

2.8.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Lithuanian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Poland concerning Lithuanian ⁹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter					
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Lithuanian as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Lithuanian	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Lithuanian		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Lithuanian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Lithuanian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Lithuanian at all appropriate stages		=		
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Lithuanian to learn it				✓
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Lithuanian at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Lithuanian	=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Lithuanian	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Lithuanian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Lithuanian among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Lithuanian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Lithuanian 				✓
Part III of the Charter					
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Lithuanian	=			
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Lithuanian	=			
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Lithuanian	=			
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Lithuanian as an integral part of the curriculum				✓
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Lithuanian as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Lithuanian		=		
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Lithuanian				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Lithuanian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings			=	

⁹⁷ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Lithuanian ⁹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.2	in territories other than those in which Lithuanian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Lithuanian at all the appropriate stages of education					=
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Lithuanian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.b	possibility for users of Lithuanian to submit oral or written applications in Lithuanian to the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Lithuanian		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Lithuanian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Lithuanian				=	
11.1.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Lithuanian ⁹⁸					
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Lithuanian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Lithuanian on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Lithuanian					=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Lithuanian				=	
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Lithuanian					=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Lithuanian				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Lithuanian• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Lithuanian• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Lithuanian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Lithuanian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Lithuanian	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Lithuanian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Lithuanian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Lithuanian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing		=			
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Lithuanian					=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Lithuanian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities					=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Lithuanian		=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Lithuanian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Lithuanian					=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Lithuanian and the culture it reflects				=	
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						

⁹⁸ As Articles 11.1.ii and 11.1.iii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Lithuanian ⁹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Lithuanian	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Lithuanian in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Lithuanian in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Lithuanian in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Lithuanian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Lithuanian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=			
14.b	for the benefit of Lithuanian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Lithuanian is used in identical or similar form				=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

98. In light of the repeated lack of information, the undertaking under Article 7.1.g is considered not fulfilled. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Lithuanian speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. There is no teaching of Lithuanian in technical and vocational education. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking under Article 8.1.d iii not fulfilled.

2.8.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Lithuanian in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.8.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland⁹⁹ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

⁹⁹ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Lithuanian.**
- b. **Ensure the necessary textbooks for teaching in Lithuanian at all levels.**
- c. **Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Lithuanian in all those local and regional administrative units where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, irrespective of the 20% threshold.**
- d. **Take concrete measures to facilitate the creation of one public radio station and one public television channel in Lithuanian covering the territories in which Lithuanian is spoken.**

II. Further recommendations

- e. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Lithuanian speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Lithuanian, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- f. Take steps to provide the basic and further training of teachers for teaching in Lithuanian.
- g. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Lithuanian on a regular basis.
- h. Facilitate the creation of one weekly newspaper in Lithuanian.
- i. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Lithuanian speakers.
- j. Encourage/facilitate the use of Lithuanian in economic and social life.

2.9 Romani

2.9.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Romani ¹⁰⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Romani as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romani				= 101
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romani		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romani, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Romani • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romani at all appropriate stages			=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romani to learn it			=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romani at universities or equivalent institutions			=	
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romani				=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romani	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romani • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romani 				✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Romani				✓
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Romani			=	
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Romani			=	
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Romani as an integral part of the curriculum			=	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Romani as a university and higher education subject			=	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Romani			=	
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Romani			=	
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Romani and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings			=	

¹⁰⁰ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

¹⁰¹ As Romani is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Romani ¹⁰⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.2	in territories other than those in which Romani is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Romani at all the appropriate stages of education					= 102
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Romani	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.2.b	possibility for users of Romani to submit oral or written applications in Romani to the regional or local authority					=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Romani					=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Romani	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.a.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Romani				=	
11.1.a.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Romani ¹⁰³					
11.1.b.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Romani on a regular basis				=	
11.1.c.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Romani on a regular basis				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Romani					=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Romani				=	
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Romani					=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Romani				=	
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Romani• do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Romani• ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Romani	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Romani are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=	
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Romani	=				
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Romani by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.c	foster access in Romani to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=	
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Romani language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing		=			
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Romani					=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Romani in providing facilities and planning cultural activities					=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Romani		=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Romani is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Romani					= 104

¹⁰² As Romani is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

¹⁰³ As Articles 11.1.a.ii and 11.1.a.iii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.a.iii.

¹⁰⁴ As Romani is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, this undertaking is not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Romani ¹⁰⁰	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Romani and the culture it reflects	=			
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Romani	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Romani in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Romani in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Romani in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Romani is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Romani in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				=
14.b	for the benefit of Romani, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Romani is used in identical or similar form			=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

99. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Romani speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. The information provided by the authorities with respect to Romani refers to 89 children at pre-school level in the 2021/2022 school year. However, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts to what extent the teaching is done through the medium of Romani. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 8.1.a i.

2.9.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.9.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland¹⁰⁵ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

¹⁰⁵ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Romani.**
- b. **Promote awareness and tolerance in Polish society as a whole vis-à-vis the Romani language and the culture it represents, as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Poland.**

II. Further recommendations

- c. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Romani speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Romani, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- d. Take steps to develop teaching in/of Romani at all levels, in co-operation with the speakers.
- e. Take measures to increase the use of Romani in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audiovisual works).
- f. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Romani speakers.

2.10 Russian

2.10.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Russian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Russian ¹⁰⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Russian as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Russian	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Russian				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Russian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Russian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Russian at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Russian to learn it				=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Russian at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Russian				=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Russian	=			
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Russian among their objectives		=		
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Russian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Russian				✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Russian				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Russian				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Russian				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Russian as an integral part of the curriculum				=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Russian as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Russian		=		
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Russian				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Russian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=
8.2	in territories other than those in which Russian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Russian at all the appropriate stages of education	=			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Russian	=			

¹⁰⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty+No.+148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty+No.+148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Russian ¹⁰⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled no conclusion
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Russian to submit oral or written applications in Russian to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Russian				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Russian	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.ii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Russian				=
11.1.iii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Russian				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Russian on a regular basis				=
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Russian on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Russian				=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Russian				=
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Russian				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Russian				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Russian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Russian 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Russian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Russian				✓
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Russian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Russian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Russian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Russian				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Russian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Russian		=		
12.2	in territories other than those in which Russian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Russian				=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Russian and the culture it reflects				=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Russian	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Russian in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Russian in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Russian in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Russian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Russian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=			

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Russian ¹⁰⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
14.b	for the benefit of Russian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Russian is used in identical or similar form				=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

100. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Russian speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. It is unclear whether there is any support for cultural activities carried out in the area where Russian is traditionally used. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 12.1.a.

2.10.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Russian in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.10.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland¹⁰⁷ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- Take steps to develop teaching in/of Russian at all levels, in the area where the language is traditionally spoken including by providing adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- Take measures to increase the use of Russian in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audiovisual works).**
- Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Russian.**

II. Further recommendations

- Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Russian speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Russian, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Russian in at least one local and regional administrative unit where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, even if they do not attain the 20% threshold.

¹⁰⁷ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

- f. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Russian speakers.
- g. Encourage/facilitate the use of Russian in economic and social life.

2.11 Slovak

2.11.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Poland concerning Slovak ¹⁰⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Slovak as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Slovak	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Slovak				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Slovak, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Slovak • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Slovak at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Slovak to learn it				=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Slovak at universities or equivalent institutions		=		
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Slovak		=		
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Slovak	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Slovak • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Slovak 				↗
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Slovak				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Slovak				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Slovak				=
8.1.dii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum				=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Slovak as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Slovak		=		
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Slovak				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Slovak and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=
8.2	in territories other than those in which Slovak is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Slovak at all the appropriate stages of education				↗

¹⁰⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Slovak ¹⁰⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Slovak	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Slovak to submit oral or written applications in Slovak to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Slovak				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Slovak	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1. aii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Slovak				=
11.1. aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Slovak ¹⁰⁹				
11.1. bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Slovak on a regular basis				=
11.1.c ii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Slovak on a regular basis				=
11.1. d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Slovak				✓
11.1. ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Slovak				=
11.1. fi i	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Slovak				=
11.1. g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Slovak				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Slovak 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Slovak are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1. a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Slovak	=			
12.1. b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Slovak by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Slovak to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1. d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Slovak language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1. e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Slovak				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Slovak in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1. g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Slovak	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Slovak is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Slovak				=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Slovak and the culture it reflects				=
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1. b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Slovak	=			

¹⁰⁹ As Articles 11.1. aii and 11.1. aiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1. aiii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Slovak ¹⁰⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Slovak in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Slovak in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Slovak in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Slovak is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Slovak in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=			
14.b	for the benefit of Slovak, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Slovak is used in identical or similar form				=

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

101. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Slovak speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. The Committee of Experts does not have sufficient information on Slovak language education in territories other than those in which Slovak is traditionally used. It therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 8.2. The Committee of Experts does not have sufficient information on how the authorities have encouraged the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Slovak. It therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 11.1.d.

2.11.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.11.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland¹¹⁰ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

¹¹⁰ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Take steps to develop teaching in/of Slovak at all levels, including by providing adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- b. **Take measures to increase the use of Slovak in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audiovisual works).**
- c. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Slovak.**

II. Further recommendations

- d. Promote awareness and tolerance in Polish society as a whole vis-à-vis Slovak language and the culture it represents, as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Poland.
- e. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Slovak speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Slovak, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- f. Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Slovak in at least one local and regional administrative unit where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, even if they do not attain the 20% threshold.
- g. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Slovak speakers.
- h. Encourage/facilitate the use of Slovak in economic and social life.

2.12 Tatar

2.12.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Tatar

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Tatar ¹¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Tatar as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Tatar	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Tatar				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Tatar, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Tatar • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Tatar at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Tatar to learn it				=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Tatar at universities or equivalent institutions				=
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Tatar		=		
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Tatar	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Tatar among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Tatar among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Tatar • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Tatar 				✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Tatar				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Tatar				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Tatar				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Tatar as an integral part of the curriculum				=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Tatar as a university and higher education subject				=
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Tatar				=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Tatar				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Tatar and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=
8.2	in territories other than those in which Tatar is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Tatar at all the appropriate stages of education				=
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					

¹¹¹ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Tatar ¹¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Tatar	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Tatar to submit oral or written applications in Tatar to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Tatar				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Tatar	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Tatar				=
11.1.iiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Tatar ¹¹²				
11.1.vii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Tatar on a regular basis				=
11.1.viii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Tatar on a regular basis				=
11.1.x	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Tatar				=
11.1.xi	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Tatar				=
11.1.xii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Tatar				=
11.1.xiii	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Tatar				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Tatar • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Tatar • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Tatar 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Tatar are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Tatar				=
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Tatar by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Tatar to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Tatar language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Tatar				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Tatar in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Tatar		=		
12.2	in territories other than those in which Tatar is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Tatar				=
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Tatar and the culture it reflects	=			
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Tatar	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Tatar in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Tatar in economic and social life				=

¹¹² As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iiii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Tatar ¹¹¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Tatar in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Tatar is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Tatar in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				=
14.b	for the benefit of Tatar, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Tatar is used in identical or similar form			=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

102. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Tatar speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4.

2.12.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Tatar in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.12.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland¹¹³ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- | |
|--|
| a. Draw up, in co-operation with the minority, an action plan on the revitalisation of Tatar and for the implementation of the Charter for this language. |
|--|

II. Further recommendations

- Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Tatar speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Tatar, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- Take measures to develop teaching in/of Tatar.

¹¹³ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

- d. Take measures to facilitate the use of Tatar in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audio-visual works).
- e. Encourage the use of Tatar in public signage.
- f. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Tatar minority.

2.13 Ukrainian

2.13.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Ukrainian ¹¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Part II of the Charter					
(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Ukrainian as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ukrainian	=			
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ukrainian		=		
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ukrainian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Ukrainian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ukrainian at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ukrainian to learn it				=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ukrainian at universities or equivalent institutions	=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ukrainian	=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ukrainian	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among their objectives 	↗			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ukrainian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ukrainian 				✓
Part III of the Charter					
(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Ukrainian				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Ukrainian				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Ukrainian				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Ukrainian as an integral part of the curriculum		=		
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Ukrainian as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Ukrainian		=		
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Ukrainian				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Ukrainian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=

¹¹⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Ukrainian ¹¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.2	in territories other than those in which Ukrainian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Ukrainian at all the appropriate stages of education	=			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Ukrainian	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Ukrainian to submit oral or written applications in Ukrainian to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Ukrainian				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Ukrainian	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Ukrainian				=
11.1.iiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Ukrainian ¹¹⁵				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Ukrainian on a regular basis				✓
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Ukrainian on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Ukrainian				=
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Ukrainian		✓		
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Ukrainian				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Ukrainian				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ukrainian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ukrainian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Ukrainian 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Ukrainian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Ukrainian	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Ukrainian by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.c	foster access in Ukrainian to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Ukrainian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing				=
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Ukrainian				=
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Ukrainian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities				=
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Ukrainian		=		
12.2	in territories other than those in which Ukrainian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Ukrainian	=			
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Ukrainian and the culture it reflects				=

¹¹⁵ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iiii.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Ukrainian ¹¹⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Ukrainian	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Ukrainian in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Ukrainian in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Ukrainian in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Ukrainian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Ukrainian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=			
14.b	for the benefit of Ukrainian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Ukrainian is used in identical or similar form	↗			

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

103. The Ukrainian speakers indicated that the general climate in their respect has improved after 2022 and negative reporting in the media or negative references to the past have almost disappeared. In light of this, the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 7.3. fulfilled. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Ukrainian speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. There are no private radio programmes in Ukrainian. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 11.1.bii not fulfilled. The financial support provided for the newspaper in Ukrainian is insufficient at present. The newspaper has reduced its format and volume to be able to manage the high costs. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking under Article 11.1.ei partly fulfilled. There is co-operation between local and regional authorities in Poland and Ukraine (e.g. between Wrocław - Kyiv, Lublin - Kryvyj Rih, Chorzów and Tarnów - Ternopil) which benefits the Ukrainian language. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking under Article 14.b fulfilled.

2.13.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.13.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland¹¹⁶ remain valid in their own right.

¹¹⁶ [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Make education in Ukrainian available at pre-school, primary and secondary levels, including by providing adequate teacher training and textbooks.**
- b. **Take concrete measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 regarding Ukrainian in all those local and regional administrative units where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, irrespective of the 20% threshold.**
- c. **Ensure sufficient funding for the maintenance and development of a weekly newspaper in Ukrainian.**
- d. **Draw-up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the implementation of the Charter for Ukrainian.**

II. Further recommendations

- e. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Ukrainian speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Ukrainian, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- f. Extend the teaching of Ukrainian as an integral part of the curriculum within technical and vocational education.
- g. Take concrete measures to facilitate the creation of one public radio station and one public television channel in Ukrainian covering the territories in which Ukrainian is spoken.
- h. Facilitate the broadcasting of private radio and television programmes in Ukrainian on a regular basis.
- i. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions of the Ukrainian speakers.
- j. Encourage/facilitate the use of Ukrainian in economic and social life.

2.14 Yiddish

2.14.1 Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Yiddish

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
	Undertakings of Poland concerning Yiddish ¹¹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>					
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles					
7.1.a	recognition of Yiddish as an expression of cultural wealth	=			
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Yiddish				= 118
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Yiddish				=
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Yiddish, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=		
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Yiddish • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 	=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Yiddish at all appropriate stages				=
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Yiddish to learn it		=		
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Yiddish at universities or equivalent institutions	=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Yiddish				=
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Yiddish	=			
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yiddish among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Yiddish among their objectives 		=		
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Yiddish • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Yiddish 				✓
Part III of the Charter <i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>					
Art. 8 – Education					
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Yiddish				=
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Yiddish				=
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Yiddish				=
8.1.diii	provide, within technical and vocational education, for the teaching of Yiddish as an integral part of the curriculum				=
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Yiddish as a university and higher education subject	=			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Yiddish				=
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Yiddish				=
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Yiddish and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings				=

¹¹⁷ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

¹¹⁸ As Yiddish is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, the undertaking is not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Yiddish ¹¹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
8.2	in territories other than those in which Yiddish is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Yiddish at all the appropriate stages of education				= 119
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities					
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Yiddish	=			
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services					
10.2.b	possibility for users of Yiddish to submit oral or written applications in Yiddish to the regional or local authority				=
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Yiddish				=
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Yiddish	=			
Art. 11 – Media					
11.1.iii	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Yiddish				=
11.1.iiiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Yiddish ¹²⁰				
11.1.bii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private radio programmes in Yiddish on a regular basis				=
11.1.cii	encourage and/or facilitate the broadcasting of private television programmes in Yiddish on a regular basis				=
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Yiddish		↗		
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Yiddish				=
11.1.fii	apply existing measures for financial assistance also to audiovisual productions in Yiddish				=
11.1.g	support the training of journalists and other staff for media using Yiddish				=
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Yiddish • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Yiddish • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Yiddish 	=			
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Yiddish are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media				=
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities					
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Yiddish	=			
12.1.b	foster access in other languages to works produced in Yiddish by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	=			
12.1.c	foster access in Yiddish to works produced in other languages by aiding and developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling				=
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Yiddish language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing		=		
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Yiddish	=			
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Yiddish in providing facilities and planning cultural activities		=		
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Yiddish	=			
12.2	in territories other than those in which Yiddish is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Yiddish				= 121

¹¹⁹ As Yiddish is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, the undertaking is not applicable.

¹²⁰ As Articles 11.1.iii and 11.1.iiiii constitute alternative options, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 11.1.iiiii.

¹²¹ As Yiddish is a non-territorial language according to the ratification by Poland, the undertaking is not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	Undertakings of Poland concerning Yiddish ¹¹⁷	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Yiddish and the culture it reflects	=			
Art. 13 – Economic and social life					
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Yiddish	=			
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Yiddish in connection with economic or social activities	=			
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Yiddish in economic and social life				=
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Yiddish in economic and social life				=
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges					
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Yiddish is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Yiddish in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education				=
14.b	for the benefit of Yiddish, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Yiddish is used in identical or similar form			=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

104. Bearing in mind the problems with the functioning of the Joint Commission as of 2022, it is unclear to the Committee of Experts how the needs and wishes of the Yiddish speakers have been taken into account. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking under Article 7.4. The Institute of Music and Dance supported the production and release, including in 2021, of albums with Yiddish songs (*Yiddishland*). The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking under Article 11.1.d partly fulfilled.

2.14.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Yiddish in Poland

The Committee of Experts encourages the Polish authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.14.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Poland¹²² remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

¹²² [CM/RecChL\(2011\)4](#); [CM/RecChL\(2015\)6](#); [CM/RecChL\(2022\)2](#).

- a. **Draw up, in co-operation with the speakers, an action plan on the revitalisation of Yiddish and for the implementation of the Charter for this language.**
- b. **Take steps to develop teaching in/of Yiddish at pre-university level.**

II. Further recommendations

- c. Ensure that the needs and wishes of the Yiddish speakers are taken into account in all matters concerning Yiddish, including by providing a continued dialogue and an effective and meaningful consultation within the Joint Commission.
- d. Take measures to facilitate the use of Yiddish in the media (broadcasting media, online and print media, audiovisual works).
- e. Encourage the use of Yiddish in public signage.
- f. Ensure the long-term sustainable funding for the cultural activities and institutions promoting Yiddish.
- g. Encourage/facilitate the use of Yiddish in economic and social life.

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Polish authorities have undertaken to protect the regional or minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Poland.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Bearing in mind the instrument of ratification deposited by Poland on 12 February 2009;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Poland;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Poland in its fourth periodical report, supplementary information given by the Polish authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Poland and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Polish authorities on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;

Recommends that the Polish authorities take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. reverse the measures reducing the teaching of German as a minority language in education and make available education in Belarusian, German, Kashub, Lemko and Ukrainian at pre-school, primary and secondary levels;
2. adopt a structured policy for the application of the Charter to each regional or minority language, including flexible measures facilitating its implementation to Armenian, Czech, Karaim, Romani, Russian, Slovak, Tatar and Yiddish, in co-operation with the speakers;
3. provide the basic and further training of a sufficient number of teachers for regional or minority language education, as well as updated textbooks and other educational materials;
4. strengthen efforts to promote awareness and tolerance in Polish society as a whole in relation to the regional or minority languages and the cultures they represent;
5. take legal and practical measures to implement the ratified provisions of Article 10 in all those local and regional administrative units where the speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers, irrespective of the 20% threshold;
6. take measures to extend radio and television broadcasting in all regional or minority languages.

The Committee of Ministers invites the Polish authorities to submit the information on the recommendations for immediate action by 1 December 2024 and the next periodical report by 1 June 2027.¹²³

¹²³ See Committee of Ministers' Decisions [CM/Del/Dec\(2018\)1330/10.4e - CM-Public](#), and "Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties", [CM\(2019\)69 final](#).

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification



Poland

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 12 February 2009 - Or. Engl.

The Republic of Poland declares that it shall apply the Charter in accordance with the Act on national and ethnic minorities and on regional language, dated 6 January 2005.

Period covered: 01/06/2009 -

Articles concerned : 1

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 12 February 2009 - Or. Engl.

The Republic of Poland declares, in accordance with Article 3, paragraph 1, of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages that, within the meaning of the Charter, minorities languages in the Republic of Poland are: Belorussian, Czech, Hebrew, Yiddish, Karaim, Kashub, Lithuanian, Lemko, German, Armenian, Romani, Russian, Slovak, Tatar and Ukrainian.

The regional language is the Kashub language. The national minorities languages are Belorussian, Czech, Hebrew, Yiddish, Lithuanian, German, Armenian, Russian, Slovak and Ukrainian. The ethnic minorities languages are Karaim, Lemko, Romani and Tatar. The non-territorial languages are Hebrew, Yiddish, Karaim, Armenian and Romani.

Period covered: 01/06/2009 -

Articles concerned : 3

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification deposited on 12 February 2009 - Or. Engl.

The Republic of Poland declares, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2 of the Charter, that the following provisions of Part III of the Charter will be applied for the languages listed above:

Article 8

Paragraph 1 a (i), b (i), c (i), d (iii), e (ii), g, h, i,
Paragraph 2;

Article 9

Paragraph 2 a;

Article 10

Paragraph 2 b, g,
Paragraph 5;

Article 11

Paragraph 1 a (ii), (iii), b (ii), c (ii), d, e (i), f (ii), g,
Paragraph 2,
Paragraph 3;

Article 12

Paragraph 1 a, b, c, d, e, f, g,
Paragraph 2,
Paragraph 3;

Article 13

Paragraph 1 b, c, d,

Paragraph 2 b;

Article 14

Subparagraphs a, b.

Period covered: 01/06/2009 -

Articles concerned : 2

Appendix II: Comments from the Polish authorities

Poland's comments to the Fourth Opinion of the Committee of Experts for the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

Warsaw 2023

Guided by its centuries-old tradition of tolerance and multi-ethnicity of groups that comprise the Polish people, which in the Polish tradition has never had an ethnic character, the Republic of Poland adopted all solutions of international law that protect cultural individuality of groups categorised as national and ethnic minorities according to the *Act of 6 January 2005 on national and ethnic minorities and on the regional language*.¹²⁴

The *European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages* (hereinafter "the Charter") is one of those instruments. Poland appreciates collaboration with the Council of Europe and the Committee of Experts for the Charter (hereinafter "COMEX" or "the Committee"), and attaches great importance to comments and recommendations made by COMEX.

First and foremost, it must be noted that the mechanism in Article 2 of the Charter provides for application of the Charter's provisions to all regional or minority languages. Therefore, the mechanism does not fully reflect the true situation and practical possibilities concerning the implementation of the Charter. The current situation of a given minority or regional language is determined by such characteristics as the size of the minority population that uses it, the conservation status of that language, the demographic forecast for the minority concerned, the level of education of its members, dense or dispersed residence, the level of codification of the language etc.

The aforementioned characteristics translate directly into how the language is used by a given community, and thus into practical language teaching possibilities at all levels of formal education. It must be underlined that while applicable legal regulations concerning national minorities, ethnic minorities and the group using the regional language (Kashubian) are universal, it does not mean that practical possibilities of exercising the language rights of these groups are - for objective reasons - the same. In fact, it is particularly difficult to ensure - with respect to certain languages - the continuity of education, beginning from preschool up to secondary education, due to the small population of users (e.g. Tatar) or dispersion of the group (e.g. users of Karaim).

Here, one must refer to the comment made by the Committee in the introduction to the Opinion that its (the Committee's) principle purpose is to evaluate the compliance with Charter undertakings as well as to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages and actual practices applied in each State with respect to those languages. The Committee points out further in the Fourth Opinion that the situation of those languages varies considerably, and the choice made by Poland leads to challenges for the implementation of the Charter.

In view of the above, it seems that the mechanisms in place, including financial and organisational ones, relating to the preservation of the language identity of national minorities, ethnic minorities and the group using the regional language provide for a positive assessment of the actual practice applied in Poland to regional or minority languages.

The IV COMEX Opinion was translated into Polish and, like the previous Reports and Opinions, will be published on the MIA's website after its publication on the website of the Council of Europe.

As regards the matter of changes in the number of teaching hours for German as a mother tongue, it must be noted that the necessity to adapt the organisational conditions of teaching German as a minority language to the budgetary capacities of local authorities came as a consequence of a budget amendment, and therefore

¹²⁴ Journal of Laws No. 17 of 2005, item 141.

required a legislative intervention. The teaching time for own history and culture as well as the number of hours of German teaching in other forms of education remained unchanged.

The change in funding and teaching time of a minority language applies only to German as a mother tongue. Therefore, COMEX's claim that the situation "had a general impact for the protection and promotion of the regional or minority languages in Poland as a whole, putting into question the existing principles and achievements" is not reflected in facts.

Article 13 of the *Act of 7 September 1991 on the system of education*¹²⁵ gives pupils the right to preserve their national identity, and in particular to learn their own language, history and culture. Arrangements for teaching German as a national minority language (own language) are based on the provisions of Regulations of the Minister competent for education and training issued under Article 13(3) of the said Act. If a pupil attends national minority language classes they must not learn the language as a foreign language at school at the same time. Any attempts to interpret the provisions of the broadly understood educational law as permitting parallel teaching of a given language as a national minority language and as a modern foreign language will only lead to illogical conclusions that are in conflict with the aims of education.

Despite difficulties in establishing a true dialogue, efforts are being made to resolve this situation.

Educational tasks relating to maintenance of schools and education establishments by local government units are financed from the incomes of those local government units, including the education part of the general subsidy. In accordance with Article 27 of the *Act on the income of local government units*¹²⁶, the amount of the education part of the general subsidy for all government units is established annually in the Budget Act.

The education part of the general subsidy – reduced by the statutory reserve – is divided between local government units in accordance with the rules laid out annually in a Regulation of the Minister competent for education and training.

The education part of the general subsidy allocated to every local government unit is a single amount, and how it is spent is decided by the decision-making authority of the local government unit concerned in accordance with Article 7(3) of the *Act on the income of local government units*.

The amount of the education subsidy cannot be related directly to education tasks imposed on local government units. There is no rule in the current legal system that would provide that the State budget guarantees, within the education part of the general subsidy, funds to cover all expenses on execution of educational tasks by local government units.

It must be highlighted that the mechanism of the so-called increased education subsidy for financing additional educational tasks with respect to pupils from national minorities, ethnic minorities and the group using the regional language has been improved systematically in order to meet requests made by representatives of national and ethnic minorities, representatives of users of the regional language, as well as local government. This can be seen in a clear increase in funding allocated to tasks that provide for preserving the sense of national, ethnic and language identity of pupils from national and ethnic minorities and the community using the regional language.

The said mechanism has been described in detail, but the decision concerning the ultimate choice of specific educational aims remains within the exclusive competence of local authorities, in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity.

The additional names referred to in Article 12(1) of the Act may be used only within municipalities entered in the Register of municipalities where names in a minority language are used, kept by the Minister competent for religious denominations and national and ethnic minorities. At the same time, one must invoke Article 12(4)

¹²⁵ Journal of Laws of 2019, item 1481, as amended

¹²⁶ Journal of Laws of 2022, item 2267.

of the *Act on national and ethnic minorities and on the regional language*¹²⁷, under which additional traditional names in a minority language may be introduced across the municipality concerned or in respective localities.

However, it must be underlined that the Act does not impose an obligation to use additional traditional names in a minority language, but rather provides for such a possibility. Furthermore, the Act expressly and comprehensively enumerates cases where such additional names may be used (official names of localities, physiographic objects, streets).

Regulations in place in Poland ensure that TV and radio audience from national and ethnic minorities as well as users of the regional language have access to programmes addressed to them and aired by public radio and television. Providing and including programmes that address the needs of national and ethnic minorities and the community using the regional language is among tasks of public radio and television that arise directly from their public mission. That obligation was formulated in Article 21(1a)(8a) of the *Broadcasting Act*, which puts special emphasis on "broadcasting news programmes" in the languages of those minorities. Since the needs of national and ethnic minority communities are much broader than just news programmes, the KRRiT proposed a definition of programmes addressed to national and ethnic minority and programmes in the regional language. The proposed method of defining such programming was accepted by the Joint Commission of the Government and National and Ethnic Minorities (the position of Joint Commission of the Government and National and Ethnic Minorities of 24 February 2010).

The diverse presence of minority languages in public media is a consequence of the aforementioned differences in the situation of the minorities, including their population, dense or dispersed residence, the state of preservation of their languages etc., which makes it impossible to pursue the same actions with respect to all minorities. Indeed, it is difficult to compare practical possibilities or producing programmes for groups of such different factual situations as e.g. the Ukrainian and Tatar minorities.

In accordance with the definition, programmes addressed to national and ethnic minorities should meet jointly the following requirements:

- be entirely dedicated to issues concerning national and ethnic minorities and the community using the regional language;
- allow representatives of national or ethnic minorities to not only participate, but also discuss themselves and their matters;
- be clearly addressed to a particular national or ethnic minority or the community using the regional language;
- be produced in the language of a national or ethnic minority or in the regional language;
- be edited by a team composed of representatives of the national or ethnic minority or the community using the regional language concerned.

It must be remembered, however, that the number of programmes in minority languages does not reflect their actual presence in the sphere of media communications. It must be highlighted, both for public and private media, that minority history and culture are present in their broadcasts in various forms, though not necessarily in minority languages, and serve the promotion of the minorities' contribution to the cultural heritage of Poland. An example of the presence of programmes in minority languages is the commercial radio WNET (not affiliated to the minority community), whose programming includes cyclical broadcasts in Belarusian (3 hours per day, Monday-Friday) <https://radiounet.fm/program/>.

Due to the relatively small size of minority populations, most tasks organised by Minority organisations, involving primarily artistic events, are addressed to also audiences coming from the majority society. The number of events addressed mainly to representatives of minorities is small. One should also emphasise the presence of transmissions/retransmissions from many minority events in nationwide public media (e.g. the

¹²⁷ Journal of Laws No. 17 of 2005, item 141.

Romane Dyvesa Festival, the Jewish Culture Festival, *Biesiada Cygańsko-Słowiańska*). In response to the need for promotion of knowledge of minorities raised on numerous occasions by representatives of national and ethnic minorities and users of the regional language, the Minister competent for religious denominations and national and ethnic minorities decided to announce an additional, supplementary call for tasks executed in 2021. Socio-cultural organisations of national and ethnic minorities, organisations of the Kashubian community, as well as entities and organisations operating for their benefit, could submit their bids for the execution of a public task in 2021 concerning actions for national and ethnic minorities and the regional language.

In March 2020, the state of epidemic threat was announced in Poland, followed by the state of epidemic in connection with the spread of the infectious disease caused by the SARS-CoV-2 virus, known as the COVID-19. Furthermore, the global economic crisis caused by inter alia the war in Ukraine had affected consumer price indexes.

In the view of the foregoing, in addition to general instruments available to the whole of entities, the Minister competent for religious denominations and national and ethnic minorities and actively engaged in activities aimed to counter the negative effects of the pandemic. Among key actions undertaken in this respect were:

- an increase in the budget funds for execution of public tasks in this area in 2022 by PLN 2,000,000 compared to the funds allocated to that purpose in the 2021 State Budget. It must also be noted that it had been the largest increase in budget funds allocated to that purpose since 2008;
- an option of a 10% increase in the amount of earmarked subsidies in 2022 that either provide for or facilitate activities of entities that pursue tasks for the benefit of national and ethnic minorities.

Point-by-point comments:

Ad 9.

COMEX draws attention to insufficient awareness of national and ethnic minority rights and of the related solutions and possibilities in place at the local level. In order to address the Committee's suggestions, the MIA will develop an information package for Voivode Plenipotentiaries for minorities to be provided to local government units. The package will recall applicable regulations aimed at protecting the rights of minorities and promote their culture. The subject will also be raised at a meeting of the Joint Government and Local Government Commission.

Ad 11.

The Committee rightly indicates that as regards certain languages (Armenian, Czech, Karaim, Romani, Russian, Slovak, Tatar and Yiddish), the implementation of the Charter obligations requires special and flexible measures. It must be noted that the tasks proposed by minority organisations relating to preservation and/or promotion of their languages are implemented. However, it is extremely difficult to effectively apply the provisions of the Charter with respect to all languages, e.g. language teaching at all levels of education, due to the lack of sufficient numbers of pupils/students or their dispersion, lack of language codification, loss of spoken language. As regards Yiddish, it must be highlighted that among the consequences of World War II was the extermination of the Yiddish culture and language community in Poland. It must also be added that users of the aforementioned languages expect fulfilment of all the Charter obligations concerning their languages while at the same time being aware that Poland is unable to do so for objective reasons.

Ad 20.

Narodowy spis powszechny ludności i mieszkań 2021 (the National Census of Population and Housing 2021) - this is the full and correct name in accordance with the *Act of 9 August 2021 on the national census of population and housing in 2021*. (Journal of Laws of 2019, item 1775).

As regards the statement: "They have also indicated that preliminary data would be available in April 2023, containing information on the languages with a higher number of speakers, and in autumn 2023, with

information on the languages with a lower number of speakers", it must be noted that the statement is imprecise.

Representatives of Statistics Poland indicated that in April 2023 preliminary NSP 2021 data will be available on languages spoken during home interactions and on the national and ethnic structure by the most frequently chosen languages used in home interactions and by the most numerous national and ethnic identifications. The final results for that area will be presented in autumn 2023 - as regards the language spoken during home interactions, it will be a full list of all languages declared.

Ad 21.

It may be advisable to consider modifying the content of Footnote 16, where an incorrect source was provided. Instead "Główny Urząd Statystyczny / Spisy Powszechne / NSP 2021 / NSP 2021 - wyniki wstępne / Rodziny – wyniki wstępne NSP 2021", the link to the official Statistics Poland website should be provided: <https://stat.gov.pl/spisy-powszechne/nsp-2021/nsp-2021-wyniki-wstepne/wstepne-wyniki-narodowego-spisu-powszechnego-ludnosci-i-mieszkan-2021-w-zakresie-struktury-narodowo-etnicznej-oraz-jezyka-kontaktow-domowych,10,1.html>.

It also seems advisable to note that as regards preliminary results concerning national and ethnic identification, a decrease can be observed in comparison with the NSP 2011 for the following identifications (in total - irrespective of the number and order in the first and second questions): German (132,500 in the NSP 2021 preliminary data as compared to 144,200 in NSP 2011 final data), Romani (12,700 as compared to 9,600). Furthermore, there was an increase in the following identifications: Belarusian (54,300 as compared to 43,900), Lemko (12,700 as compared to 9,600), Lithuanian (9,700 as compared to 7,400), Russian (14,800 as compared to 8,800), Ukrainian (79,400 as compared to 38,800), and Jewish (15,700 as compared to 7,400).

The minority-related data from the previous censuses (2002 and 2011) was published some two years later due to the complexity of the data. In each case, representatives of Statistics Poland would inform in advance that the census results concerning minorities should be expected on such dates because the census results were elaborated according to specific priorities and that the data on minorities are characterised by great complexity. Therefore, in the case of the 2021 Census, the results could be expected in April 2023, as mentioned in the Fourth Report. Because of the pandemic, post-pandemic economic crisis around the world, the outbreak of the war in Ukraine, mass influx of war refugees, and support provided by Poland to Ukraine, also the Polish statistics faced extraordinary challenges, which affected the elaboration of detailed and complex data from the latest census. It must be noted that Poland is among countries that produce a relatively exhaustive socio-demographic characteristic of minorities. The concern formulated by some representatives of minorities that the subsequent publication of the census results will affect the implementation of Article 10 of the Charter (concerning *inter alia* auxiliary languages) is unreasonable because the implementation of Article 10 is determined by the number of self-declarations and compared to the previous publication dates the delay (counted from April 2023) is not very significant.

Ad 22.

Poland cannot accept COMEX suggestion concerning "the results of the census should be complemented by collecting and assessing, in co-operation with the speakers, other data concerning the number of users of the regional or minority languages and their geographic distribution". Referring to the census results, representatives of the government administration highlighted on numerous occasions that the results of successive censuses reflected the number of self-declarations made by minority representatives, not the actual number of representatives of minorities in Poland. Indeed, under the legal system in Poland, it is not allowed to acquire data on belonging to a minority or requiring anyone to prove their belonging to a given minority. Information acquired during censuses is therefore based on the said self-declarations. Nothing prevents minorities from presenting estimates, but census results are official data.

Ad 26.

According to statistics of the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights, Poland has for years been listed as a country with a relatively low number of anti-Semitic incidents.¹²⁸

The survey to which the Committee refers concerning Romani: "The survey also shows high levels of antipathy towards the Romani speakers", should be interpreted dynamically, as it is a cyclical opinion poll carried out annually since 1994, which – despite certain shifts in public sentiments year to year - in fact shows a quality change in the attitude of the public opinion towards the Roma communities over the last three decades. One must also note the high percentage of liking/indifference/lack of opinion expressed by respondents towards that minority, and the dynamics of changes in dislike towards Roma in the long run (a clear decrease).

Ad 29.

The opinion of COMEX that the Joint Commission of the Government and National and Ethnic Minorities was dysfunctional must be shared. The MIA has called many times upon members of the Joint Commission who represent the minority side to change their decision regarding the so-called suspension of their participation in the Joint Commission's work. The "suspension" took place despite repeated efforts made by the Minister of Interior and Administration to convince the representatives of national and ethnic minorities and the community using the regional language to continue their work in the Joint Commission, both for substantive and formal reasons, as the institution of "suspension" of the membership in the Joint Commission is not provided by any provision that regulates operations of that important consultative and advisory body at the Prime Minister.

Ad 31.

Poland does not share the Committee's claim that "the Joint Commission can no longer be considered as a body 'advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to regional or minority languages'". The formula of the Joint Commission of the Government and National and Ethnic Minorities is an original Polish contribution to the international system of minority rights protection. The Joint Commission is a world-unique body because seats on it are taken, on equal rights, by representatives of minorities and of the Government. It continues to be a platform for developing joint positions of the Government and representatives of the communities that represent nine national minorities, four ethnic minorities and users of the regional language, concerning such matters as the amount and distribution of state budget funds allocated to supporting actions aimed to protect, preserve and develop the cultural identity of the minorities, and to preserve and develop the regional language.

Ad 32.

In accordance with Article 1, the Charter does not cover dialects of the official language(s) of the State. The Silesian ethnolect is one of the four main dialects of Polish, in addition to Lesser-Polish (*małopolski*), Greater-Polish (*wielkopolskiego*) and Masovian (*mazowiecki*). Such a position was acknowledged in the opinion of the Council for the Polish Language at the Presidium of the Polish Academy of Sciences of 20 May 2011 which, under Article 12(1) of the *Act of 7 October 1999 on the Polish language*¹²⁹, is a consultative and advisory institution on matters of using the Polish language.

Ad 37.

In this comment, COMEX used an expression that can cause some communication interference. Education in minority languages in the Polish system of education is not based on "requests of the parents". A parents' declaration (not "a request") obliges the school principal to organise education of a mother tongue (provided that the required number of declarations is submitted), and also a confirmation of the necessity to acquire increased funding. At the same time, it must be highlighted that - contrary to the Committee's opinion that Poland lacks the tradition of teaching minority languages and in minority languages - such a tradition in the formal school system dates back to when Poland regained independence in 1918.

¹²⁸ https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/fra-2022-antisemitism-overview-2011-2021_en.pdf

¹²⁹ Journal of Laws of 2019, item 1480, as amended

Ad 40.

Polish law contains provisions on education of pupils from minorities as well as pupils who are foreign citizens. Education of pupils who are Ukrainian nationals cannot be equivalent to education of pupils who are Polish nationals but declare affiliation to the Ukrainian national minority. The two cases are reflected in the provisions that regulate the funding of specific needs of each of those groups, which are not the same.

Ad 42.

Polish law clearly defines the categories of national and ethnic minorities and the group using the regional language, which is translated into the term "minority languages". Those categories must be distinguished from languages used by other ethnic groups which are not minorities within the meaning of the Act on minorities and the regional language. Not every ethnic group which is in minority belongs to the catalogue of minority groups defined in the legislation.

Ad 45.

The subsidy calculation mechanism is transparent, and its diversity depends on the number of pupils - which is logical from the financing perspective. The lower the number of pupils, the relatively higher the unit costs - and the diversification of the subsidy amount is aimed to compensate local government units for the cost of employment of additional teachers and additional classes. Equalising the subsidy amount would harm the local governments with smaller populations of pupils from minorities. Local authorities' choice of educational tasks to be financed from the subsidy continues to be the actual problem, but it is the exclusive competence of local authorities.

Ad 46.

It must be noted again that pupils who declare the intention to learn a language as their mother tongue can do so, and in the case of languages that are mother tongues of national and ethnic minorities and at the same time a foreign language (e.g. German, Russian, Ukrainian), they can learn those languages as foreign languages - due to the different methodology of teaching a language as a minority language and as a foreign language. Such has for years been the position of minority communities, and that logic underlined the need to appoint foreign language teaching methodologists at the MNIE.

Ad 49.

The difference between the number of Kashubian Ethno-Philology students in the winter and summer semesters may arise from the fact that potential students may treat it as a kind of a "security blanket" in case they fail to qualify for other courses.

The legislation on education, i.e. the *Act of 26 January 1982 on the Teacher's Charter* (Journal of Laws of 2023, item 984), *Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 28 May 2019 on teacher training establishments* (Journal of Laws of 2019, item 1045, as amended), *Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 11 October 2018 on the accreditation of teacher training establishments* (Journal of Laws of 2018, item 2029), *Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 23 August 2019 on the financial contribution to further professional development of teachers, detailed aims of trade training, and on conditions for referring teachers to trade training* (Journal of Laws of 2019, item 1653) did and does guarantee mechanisms which provide for education and further development of teachers, including also teachers of the regional language and minority languages.

Applicable regulations did and do guarantee that teachers can take part in various trainings and other forms of professional development provided by teacher training establishments, universities and other units whose statutory tasks include further professional development of teachers.

Accredited teacher training establishments must adapt their professional development offering to the needs reported by schools and teachers, in accordance with the provisions of the aforementioned *Regulation on the accreditation of teacher training establishments*.

Costs of professional development of teachers can be covered from the funds allocated within the budget of the competent school supervising body, in accordance with Article 70a of the aforementioned *Act on the Teacher's Charter*.

Ad 50.

It must be clarified that both under applicable qualification rules, i.e. the *Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 1 August 2017 on the detailed qualifications required from teachers* (Journal of Laws of 2020, item 1289; and of 2022, item 1769) and the currently drafted new *Regulation of the Minister of Education and Science on the detailed qualifications required from teachers* (which is now at the final stage of legislative work and expected to enter into force on 1 September 2023)¹³⁰, teachers of the regional language and teachers of minority languages do not have to hold only a related Master's diploma to teach and conduct classes in those languages.

In accordance with the current *Regulation on the detailed qualifications required from teachers* (§ 14(1) and (2) of the Regulation), qualifications required to teach or conduct classes at kindergartens, schools, or in groups or units allowing national minority pupils to preserve their national and language identity are held by whoever holds the qualifications required for a teacher, as specified in § 3(1) and § 4 of the said Regulation, and additionally known the national minority, ethnic minority or the regional language in which they will conduct classes. Level of the language of a given national minority or the community using the regional language shall be confirmed by:

- a university-degree diploma of a philology course specialised in the foreign language concerned, or
- a diploma of a teacher training college in the foreign language concerned, or
- the language certificate referred to in regulations issued under Article 11(3) of the Act of 6 January 2005 on national and ethnic minorities and on the regional language (Journal of Laws of 2017, item 823), or
- an attestation issued by a social organisation of a national minority or the community using the regional language.

As transpires from the aforementioned regulations, teaching or conducting classes in a minority language or the regional language requires qualifications to teach any subject or conduct any classes - at the education level concerned - and the command of the minority language concerned or the regional language, which may be confirmed by various documents, and not solely by a Master's diploma in that specific area. Such documents may include inter alia a certificate issued by a social organisation of minority or the community using the regional language.

The currently drafted new *Regulation on the detailed qualifications required from teachers* will contain similar qualification requirements. Furthermore, the new Regulation will also allow graduates of first-cycle, second cycle or long cycle Master's degree studies of the regional language who have pedagogical training to teach the regional language at kindergartens, schools, groups and units.

The Minister of Education and Science decided to implement such a solution taking into account the existing needs to preserve and develop the cultural identity of communities using the regional language.

In connection with that decision, work is being carried out to amend the teacher current education standard (i.e. amendments are being drafted for the Regulation of the Minister of Science and Higher Education of 25 August 2019 on the standard of education preparing for the teaching profession – Journal of Laws of 2019, item 1450, as amended). Under the new regulation, effective in the academic year 2023/2024, higher-education establishments will be allowed to train teachers of the regional language at the first-cycle, second cycle or long cycle Master's studies.

¹³⁰ As of 9 August 2023

Ad 60.

As regards the languages specified (Armenian, Karaim, Romani and Yiddish), there are no traditional names of localities in those languages (except for Yiddish). Those communities are dispersed across the country.

Ad 62. and 63.

The National Broadcasting Council (KRRiT) enhances the process of the development of the programming for national and ethnic minorities and the community using the regional language through financing that programming from subscription fees. The National Broadcasting Council has for many years been providing public media companies with full financing of programmes produced for the said communities. In the case of public radio, the National Broadcasting Council applies the principle of financing 100% of programmes for national and ethnic minorities notified by the broadcasters from subscription fees, which is the simplest method that is also beneficial to national and ethnic minorities and the community using the regional language. In accordance with Article 13 of the *Radio and Television Act*, the broadcasters themselves plan the number of hours and broadcasting frequency of those programmes (public media companies report the number of hours and costs of such programmes in their annual programming and financial plans), and the National Broadcasting Council allocates subscription funds to the production of the programmes in the amount equal to that notified by the broadcasters. After one year, the KRRiT verifies whether the broadcaster has met the declarations made in its plans. If not, the KRRiT, when distributing the subscription funds for the following year, reduces the amount due to that company by the cost of the hours which were included in the plans but not produced. It must be highlighted that there have been very few such cases in the last years.

As for licensed broadcasters (radio as well as television) that operate under a licence, the aforementioned mechanism of programming development support is not possible because the KRRiT has not legal instruments to provide such support. It must be added that programming addressed to minority communities in Poland is produced and aired mainly by Polish public broadcasters, while commercial channels very rarely produce such programmes.

Ad 64.

The Committee's comment that "unlike for the other languages, programmes in German are mainly produced by the associations, not by the public radio station or television channel broadcasting them". In accordance with the adopted manner of defining programmes addressed to national and ethnic minorities (the position of the Joint Commission of the Government and National and Ethnic Minorities of 24 February 2010), such programmes should be edited by a team composed of representatives of the national or ethnic minority concerned or the community using the regional language. Therefore, all public broadcasters - regardless of the minority to which they address their programmes - may produce such programmes while relying on entities whose representatives are members of national and ethnic minorities.

Ad 65.

"The Committee of Experts received hardly any updated information with respect to audiovisual works produced in regional or minority languages."

The Minister of Interior and Administration systematically allocates a specific subsidy amount to the execution of tasks relating to support for audiovisual works in regional or minority languages. In the year of the Committee's visit, the MIA provided support to various entities concerning the execution of the following tasks:

Belarusian minority:

- TUTAKA Foundation, for the execution of the tasks entitled "*Tutaka*" Podcast – grant awarded: PLN 22,280 (podcasts will be published on publicly available YouTube channel of the Tutaka Foundation).

Community using the Kashubian regional language:

- Ziemia Pucka Association, for the execution of the task entitled *Preservation and development of the Kashubian language within the Kashubian minority through broadcasting the radio channel "Radio Kaszebe" (2023)* – grant awarded: PLN 300,000;
- The Kashubian-Pomeranian Association, for the execution of the task entitled *Skarby Kaszub*, grant awarded: PLN 70,000;
- *Dobra Energia* Foundation, for the execution of the task entitled *The documentary film "Kaszubi"*, grant awarded: PLN 50,000.

German minority:

- Pastoral Ministry for National and Ethnic Minorities of the Opole Diocese, for the execution of the task entitled *Multimedialne zamyślenia biblijne*, grant awarded: PLN 12,800;
- Social-Cultural Association of Germans of Silesian Voivodeship in Racibórz, for the execution of the task entitled *Production of radio broadcasts in German*, grant awarded: PLN 78,747;
- Union of German Socio-Cultural Associations in Poland, for the execution of the task entitled *Production of the German-language broadcast Musikschachtel-Abgekanzelt*, grant awarded: PLN 40,600;
- Union of German Socio-Cultural Associations in Poland, for the execution of the task entitled *Production of the German-language broadcast TV Schlesien Journal*, grant awarded: PLN 60,000;

Lemko minority:

- "RUSKA BURSA" Association in Gorlice, for the execution of the task entitled *Lemko radio LEM.fm and news portal www.lem.fm*, grant awarded: PLN 320,000;
- Lemko Tower Association, for the execution of the task entitled *Lemko on-line television LEMKO TV*, grant awarded: PLN 16,000;
- Lemko Tower Association, for the execution of the task entitled *Radio Lemko - a Lemko on-line radio*, grant awarded: PLN 46,000;

Russian minority:

- *Russkij Dom* Association, for the execution of the task entitled *Podcasts in Russian - the audio recording series "Rosyjski akcent w historii Polski"*, grant awarded: PLN 8,500;
- *Russkij Dom* Association, for the execution of the task entitled *Multimedia recordings for the "Historia i kultura Rosjan w Polsce"* - phase three, grant awarded: PLN 9,000.

Ad 68.

The National Broadcasting Council does not have any statutory competence to conduct training for journalists or other media personnel who use regional or minority languages, hence it does not organise such training. Actions of this type are undertaken by respective public media companies as well as licensed broadcasters within their own structures.

Ad 69.

Taking into account the information presented in the Fourth Report, it is proposed to replace the wording "certain institutions, museums, libraries, the State Archives" by "many institutions, museums, libraries, the State Archives". Those institutions organise the said actions in collaboration with minority organisations, which should not be criticised, as it is a good practice of collaboration.

Ad 71.

The returns of a part of the grant arise from the fact that the funds were spent on other purposes than declared in the applications, hence the amounts must be returned in accordance with applicable regulations.

Ad 74.

The stability of funding of the minorities is ensured by means of legal and organisational mechanisms. All events of key importance for the minorities are supported. Taking into account the number of contracts signed each year – a total of 467 in 2023 – it must be considered that the activity of the minorities is not poor, which is reflected in the number of grants awarded.

Ad 78. and Chapter 2 *Compliance of Poland with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations*

As regards the explanations concerning the situation of respective regional or minority languages in Poland, the information on *establishing at least one radio station and one television channel in regional or minority languages* must be modified, as since 2007 the programming of Telewizja Polska S.A., a public broadcaster, has included the *Belsat TV* channel, aired in Belarusian, Russian and partially Ukrainian, addressed to the audience in Belarus and other countries of the region - in response to the demand for independent news and cultural content - and also addressed to viewers from the national minorities and migrant groups concerned in Poland. The channel's key building element includes news and commentary programmes as well as social and intervention feature stories, transmissions and reports from important events, and TV series. The channel is aired via satellite and covers the European part of the former USSR, as well as on-line (on belsat.eu and in YouTube) and in cable television networks (across Poland, in most networks in Ukraine and some in Latvia).

Ad 85.

The Romani ethnolect is not taught at schools at any level of education. This language system has a taboo status in the Romani culture, and Roma do not wish it to be taught. Practical problems include also absence of the standard for its transcription, lack of teachers of Romani descent etc. Nevertheless, occasional projects of teaching of that ethnolect (in non-formal education) receive co-financing aimed at preserving it - particularly among the youngest generation. In 2021, publication of Romani ABC books in the Polish Romani and Bergitka Romani dialects was resumed.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages is an independent body that evaluates the compliance of the States Parties with their undertakings and, where appropriate, encourages them to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on 25 June 1992 and entered into force on 1 March 1998, is the European convention for the protection and promotion of regional and minority languages. It is designed to enable speakers to use them both in private and public life and obliges the States Parties to actively promote the use of these languages in education, courts, administration, media, culture, economic and social life, and cross- border co-operation.

Regional or minority languages are part of Europe's cultural heritage and their protection and promotion contribute to the building of a Europe based on democracy and cultural diversity.

www.coe.int/minlang