

Strasbourg, 10 October 2024

PC-ENV(2024)06

COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON THE PROTECTION OF THE ENVIRONMENT THROUGH CRIMINAL LAW

5th meeting

7-9 October 2024

Strasbourg, Council of Europe

MEETING REPORT

Document prepared by the Secretariat Directorate General I – Human Rights and Rule of Law

www.coe.int/cdpc | DGI-CDPC@coe.int

Opening of the meeting

The 5th and last meeting of the PC-ENV took place on 7-9 October 2024 at the Council of Europe in Strasbourg, under the Chairmanship of Mr Šimon Pepřík (Czechia). Having agreed on the text of the draft Convention on the Protection of the Environment through Criminal Law during its 4th meeting, the Committee examined and discussed the text of the draft Explanatory Report prepared by the Secretariat on the basis of the discussions held during the four previous meetings, and other Council of Europe documents, in this 5th meeting.

The meeting was opened by the Chair of the PC-ENV, who welcomed all participants and expressed his appreciation for the written contributions received. The Secretary to the PC-ENV, Mr Carlo Chiaromonte, welcomed the participants on behalf of the Council of Europe and expressed his satisfaction with the pro-active co-operation with the delegations when preparing the draft Explanatory Report.

General comments on the draft Explanatory Report

The Chair opened the floor for delegations to provide comments on the draft Explanatory Report. Several delegations thanked the Secretariat and expressed their general satisfaction with the text of the draft Explanatory Report. The Chair explained the purpose of the draft Explanatory Report, which is to serve as a commentary on the Convention and facilitate the understanding of the Convention's provisions.

Delegations affirmed the importance of drafting the Explanatory Report in a way to ensure, to the widest extent possible, the interpretation of the Convention as a living instrument, taking into account presentday conditions and upcoming developments in the field of environmental protection.

Introduction of the draft Explanatory Report

The introduction of the draft Explanatory Report explains the phenomenon of environmental crime and highlights the many forms it may take. Criminal networks that engage in environmental crime additionally engage in other types of crimes, such as corruption, money laundering or trafficking, including in people, weapons, and drugs. The Committee considered it important to highlight the fact that environmental crime requires a global, collaborative effort and that it cannot be countered effectively in isolation. The introduction also explains the aim of the Convention which is to protect the environment in a wide sense, encompassing all natural resources, such as air, soil, and water, ecosystems, including the services and functions of those ecosystems, as well as wild fauna or flora and habitats. The introduction of the draft Explanatory Report further highlights previous action taken by the Council of Europe in this field.

Commentary on the Preamble and the provisions of the Convention

The group agreed on the explanation of the Preamble and the three first chapters ("Purposes, scope, definitions and non-discrimination"; "Integrated policies and data collection"; and "Prevention") with minor changes.

The chapter on substantive criminal law was in general well-received by delegations. The Committee agreed to provide examples of some of the terms related to the definition of offences for illustrative purposes and to better clarify their meaning. Articles 27 and 28 ("Offences related to the unlawful killing, destruction, taking and possession of protected wild fauna or flora"; and "Offences related to the unlawful killing in protected wild fauna or flora") were subject to lengthier discussions. It was agreed to include an explanation that both of these offences can be committed in the course of any economic and private activities and provide for a non-exhaustive list of fauna and flora species covered by these criminal offences.

The remaining content of the draft Explanatory Report was agreed on with minor changes.

Next steps and closing of the meeting

Following fruitful debates, the PC-ENV agreed on the text of the draft Explanatory Report. The Chair congratulated the Committee on finalising its work on the Convention on the Protection of the Environment through Criminal Law and its Explanatory Report and congratulated all participants of States, the European Commission, international organisations, NGOs, civil society and relevant bodies of the Council of Europe, including the Parliamentary Assembly, the Standing Committee of the Bern Convention, and the European Court of Human Rights, on this historical achievement. The Chair also thanked the Committee for their commitment and the valuable contribution of their expertise and dedication to the important issue of protecting the environment. Delegations also highlighted the excellent results achieved in such a short time, emphasising that this draft Convention has been finalised in a very short space of time after the Reykjavik Declaration, adopted at the 4th Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe (Reykjavik, 16-17 May 2023), in which the Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe declared their commitment to strengthen their work at the Council of Europe on the human rights aspects of the environment, to identify the challenges raised by the triple planetary crisis of pollution, climate change and loss of biodiversity for human rights, and to contribute to the development of common responses thereto.

The Secretariat explained that the draft Convention and the draft Explanatory Report will be sent to the European Committee on Crime Problems (CDPC) for evaluation and approval at its Plenary meeting on 20-22 November 2024. The Convention will thereafter undergo editorial and legal checks by the Council of Europe Editorial Unit, SPDP, and the Directorate of Legal Advice and Public International Law (DLAPIL) before being transmitted to the Secretariat of the Council of Europe Committee of Ministers and put on the agenda of the relevant rapporteur group, in this case the GR-J (Rapporteur Group - Legal Cooperation), for transmission to the Parliamentary Assembly (PACE) for an opinion. The opinion and the draft Convention will then be on the agenda of the next GR-J session for further examination. When the GR-J approves the text, it will be transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for adoption, or if a Ministerial Session is coming up, it will be transmitted to the Ministers for adoption after approval by the Deputies.

APPENDIX I – Agenda

7 October 2024		
	Opening of the meeting	
10:00 a.m.	Welcome and opening remarks by Mr Šimon Pepřík, Chair of the PC-ENV, and Mr Carlo Chiaromonte, Secretary to the PC-ENV	
	Adoption of the agenda	
	Background information and aim of the fifth meeting	
	Examination of the text of the draft Explanatory Report to the draft Convention on the Protection of the Environment through Criminal Law	
11:00 a.m.	Coffee break	
	Continued	
12:30 – 2:00 p.m.	Lunch break	
	Continued	
3:30 p.m.	Coffee break	
	Continued	
5:30 p.m.	End of day one	

8 October 2024		
9:30 a.m.	Examination of the text of the draft Explanatory Report to the draft Convention on the Protection of the Environment through Criminal Law	
11:00 a.m.	Coffee break	
	Continued	
12:30 – 2:00 p.m.	Lunch break	
	Continued	
3:30 p.m.	Coffee break	
	Continued	
5:30 p.m.	End of day two	

9 October 2024		
9:30 a.m.	Completion of the text of the draft Explanatory Report	
12:00 – 2:00 p.m.	Reception Lunch break	
	Approval of the text of the draft Explanatory Report	
	Summary of discussions and outcomes	
4:00 p.m.	Concluding remarks and close of the meeting	

APPENDIX II – List of participants

MEMBER STATES / ETATS MEMBRES

ARMENIA / ARMENIE

Mr Rafayel MOVSESYAN

Head of Division Department of International Treaties and Law Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Armenia

AUSTRIA / AUTRICHE

Ms Manuela TROPPACHER Federal Ministry of Justice

BELGIUM / BELGIQUE

Mme Sonja RUIJTERS Attachée juridique Direction de la Législation du SPF Justice

M. Jean-Sébastien JAMART

<u>Apologised / Excusé</u> Legal advisor Criminal Law Department Federal Public Service Justice

BULGARIA / BULGARIE

Ms Tea PENEVA Apologised / Excusée

Chief expert Cooperation in Criminal matters Department International legal cooperation and European affairs Directorate Ministry of Justice

CYPRUS / CHYPRE

Ms Lina CHATZIATHANASIOU Counsel of the Republic A

CZECHIA / TCHÉQUIE

Mr Šimon PEPŘÍK

<u>Chair of the PC-ENV / Président du PC-ENV</u> Senior legal consellor Legislative Department Ministry of Justice

Ms Eva ŠALPLACHTOVÁ

Senior officer Multilateral Relations Unit International Relations Department Ministry of the Environment

ESTONIA / ESTONIE

Mr Andreas KANGUR

<u>Apologised / Excusé</u> Criminal Policy Department Ministry of Justice

Ms Mare TANNBERG

<u>Apologised / Excusée</u> Adviser Criminal Policy Department Ministry of Justice

FINLAND / FINLANDE

Ms Sonja SJÖMAN

Senior Specialist Ministry of Justice

FRANCE

Mme Marie-Charlotte AUBRY

Adjointe à la cheffe de bureau Bureau de la négociation pénale européenne et internationale (BNPEI) Sous-direction de la négociation et de la législation pénales Ministère de la justice

Mme Cristina MAURO

<u>Apologised / Excusée</u> <u>Vice-Chair of the PC-ENV / Vice-Présidente du</u> <u>PC-ENV</u> Cheffe du bureau de la négociation pénale européenne et internationale (BNPEI) Sous-direction de la négociation et de la législation pénales Ministère de la justice

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Mr Grigol PHOCHKHIDZE

Deputy Head of the Legal Service Department of Environmental Supervision Ministry of Environment Protection and Agriculture

GERMANY / ALLEMAGNE

Ms Lena HARTUNG

Judge at the district court of Munich Criminal law suppression of economic crime, computer crime, corruption-related crime and environmental crime Division Federal Ministry of Justice

Dr Monika BECKER

<u>Apologised / Excusée</u> Head of Division Criminal law suppression of economic crime, computer crime, corruption-related crime and environmental crime Federal Ministry of Justice

GREECE / GRECE

Ms Kalliopi THEOLOGITOU

Deputy Prosecutor of the Appeals Court of Athens

HUNGARY / HONGRIE

Ms Éva GRÜNWALD

Deputy to the Permanent Representative Permanent Representation of Hungary to the Council of Europe

ITALY / ITALIE

Mr Pasquale FIMIANI

<u>Apologised / Excusé</u> Advocate general Supreme Court of Cassation Rome

Mr Pietro MOLINO

<u>Apologised / Excusé</u> Deputy Prosecutor General General Prosecutor's Office Court of Cassation

LATVIA / LETTONIE

Ms leva Kristiāna BLEIVE

Lawyer Criminal Justice Department Ministry of Justice

LUXEMBOURG

M. Dylan SIRY Chargé de Mission Représentation Permanente du Luxembourg auprès du Conseil de l'Europe Consulat général du Luxembourg à Strasbourg

<u>MALTA / MALTE</u>

Mr Gary CAUCHI Lawyer EU Affairs I Legal Research Unit Office of the Attorney General

NETHERLANDS / PAYS-BAS

Ms Miriam VAN DER OUW Law Enforcement Department Ministry of Justice

NORTH MACEDONIA / MACEDOINE DU NORD

Mr Nikola PROKOPENKO State Counsellor in criminal matters Ministry of Justice

NORWAY / NORVEGE

Ms OkKyong PARK-BHASIN Head of Delegation Senior adviser

Norwegian Ministry of Justice and Public Security

POLAND / POLOGNE

Mr Jakub KALBARCZYK

Deputy Director Department for Criminal Law Ministry of Justice

PORTUGAL

Mr Pedro ALMEIDA Directorate-General for Justice Policy Ministry of Justice

SLOVAK REPUBLIC / REPUBLIQUE SLOVAQUE

Mr Martin LIPTÁK Legislation Department Criminal Law Legislation Division Ministry of Justice

SLOVENIA / SLOVENIE

Ms Irena VOGRINCIC PUC

Criminal law expert International Cooperation Office Ministry of Justice

SWEDEN / SUEDE

Mr Claes BERGDAHL

Deputy Permanent Representative Permanent Representation of Sweden to the Council of Europe

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Mme Georgina HOWE, LL.M., MLaw <u>Apologised / Excusée</u> Département fédéral de justice et police DFJP Office fédéral de la justice OFJ Domaine de direction droit pénal Unité Droit pénal international

EUROPEAN UNION / UNION EUROPEENNE

EUROPEAN COMMISSION / COMMISSION EUROPEENNE

Mr Miroslav ANGELOV Legal and policy officer - lead expert on environmental crime Unit ENV.E4 Environmental rule of law & governance Directorate-General Environment

Ms Ingrid BREİT

Deputy Head Unit A4 – general criminal justice

<u>TÜRKİYE</u>

Ms Yüksel YILDIRIM

Lawyer Ministry of Environment, Urbanization and Climate Change

UKRAINE

Mr Viacheslav AVRAMENKO

Leading Expert Unit for Conclusion of International Treaties on Legal Assistance Department of International Cooperation and Representation Ministry of Justice

UNITED KINGDOM

Mr Nicholas PAINES, KC Former Law Commissioner

DELEGATION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION TO THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / DELEGATION DE L'UNION EUROPEENNE AUPRES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Ms Dora SCHAFFRIN Legal Adviser

STATES HAVING OBSERVER STATUS WITH THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / ETATS AYANT LE STATUT D'OBSERVATEURS AUPRES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

* * * *

HOLY SEE / SAINT-SIEGE

Maître Jean PAILLOT

* * * *

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANTS

UNITED NATIONS OFFICE ON DRUGS AND CRIME / OFFICE DES NATIONS UNIES CONTRE LA DROGUE ET LE CRIME (UNODC)

Ms Emilie VAN DER HENST Apologised / Excusée Global Programme on Crimes that Affect the Environment Border Management Branch

Ms Lejda TOCI

Apologised / Excusée Programme Officer Global Programme on Crimes that Affect the Environment Border Management Branch

GLOBAL INITIATIVE TO END WILDLIFE CRIME (EWC)

Ms Ana MOTAMAYOR Policy Officer

WILD LEGAL

M. Vincent DELBOS Magistrat honoraire Chargé d'enseignement à Sciences Po Paris

WILDLIFE JUSTICE COMMISSION

Ms Joanna Salomé CHOBLET External Relations Officer

* * * *

COUNCIL OF EUROPE BODIES AND INSTITUTIONS / ORGANES ET INSTITUTIONS DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE (PACE) / ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE (APCE)

Mr Constantinos EFSTATHIOU

(Cyprus) <u>Apologised / Excusé</u> PACE Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights

Mr George STAFFORD

Secretariat of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights

Ms Justine MUELEMANS

Trainee Secretariat of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights

Ms Yuliia OVCHYNNYKOVA

(Ukraine) PACE Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development of the Parliamentary Assembly

Ms Aiste RAMANAUSKAITE

Secretary of the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

Ms Claire DUBOIS-HAMDI

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

STANDING COMMITTEE OF THE BERN CONVENTION / COMITÉ PERMANENT DE LA CONVENTION DE BERNE

Ms Ardita ABDIU

Pompidou Group/International Cooperation Group on Drugs and Addictions Social Rights, Health and Environment Directorate

Ms Marta MEDLINSKA

Mr Mikaël POUTIERS

<u>Apologised / Excusé</u> Secretary of the Bern Convention on the Conservation of European Wildlife and Natural Habitats

EUROPEAN COMMITTEE ON CRIME PROBLEMS / COMITE EUROPEEN POUR LES PROBLEMES CRIMINELS (CDPC)

Ms Eva PASTRANA

Secretary to the CDPC / Secrétaire du CDPC

POMPIDOU GROUP / GROUPE POMPIDOU

Ms Ardita ABDIU

Pompidou Group/International Cooperation Group on Drugs and Addictions Social Rights, Health and Environment Directorate * * * *

SECRETARIAT OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Directorate General of Human Rights and Rule of Law / Direction Générale des droits de l'Homme et Etat de Droit

Criminal Law Division / Division du droit pénal

Mr Carlo CHIAROMONTE	Secretary to the PC-ENV / Secrétaire du PC-ENV			
Ms Eva PASTRANA	Head of the Criminal Law Division and Secretary to the CDPC / Cheffe de la Division du droit pénal et Secrétaire du CDPC			
Ms Vanessa LAUKKANEN	Criminal Law Division / Division du droit pénal			
Ms Lucy ANCELIN	Assistant / Assistante			
Ms Claire ROBINS	Assistant / Assistante			
Ms Maeve BUCHIGNANI	Trainee / Stagiaire			
Ms Abdea COOMARASAMY	Trainee / Stagiaire			
Interpreters / Interprètes				
Mme Lucie DEBURLET-SUTER				
Mr Gregoire DEVICTOR				

Ms Barbara GRUT