



**4<sup>th</sup> meeting, 5-6 October 2023  
(Strasbourg, Palais de l'Europe, Room 7 and online)**

MSI-RES(2021)13  
23 November 2023

**Meeting report**

**Opening and agenda**

1. The meeting was opened by the Chair of the MSI-RES Mr Ramón Salaverría Aliaga. Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department, welcomed the members and participants and informed them about the recent developments in the Council of Europe.
2. Focusing on the issues related to the work of the MSI-RES, the 4<sup>th</sup> Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe (Reykjavík, 16-17 May 2023) reaffirmed the vision and values of the Organisation and set its priorities for the coming years. In addition to its focus on Ukraine and the establishment of a Register of damaged caused by the Russian Federation's aggression, the [Reykjavik Principles for Democracy](#) acknowledge the importance of the Council of Europe's standard-setting work on freedom of expression and commit to ensure a leading role for the Organisation in developing standards in the digital era. In this context, the negotiations on a new framework convention on artificial intelligence (AI) are entering their final phase. Review and revision of the [Consolidated Working Draft](#) is being finalised and a new draft will be prepared, foreseen for adoption in the spring 2024. Finally, under the new CDMSI work programme, two new expert committees of experts will be established. The Committee of Experts on online safety and empowerment of content creators and users (MSI-eSEC) will focus on online harms and elaborate a recommendation to improve the safety of those participating in the digital communication environment, and the Committee of Experts on the implications of generative AI for freedom of expression (MSI-AI) will develop guidelines on how to avoid the risks posed by the new technologies while capitalising on their potential.
3. The agenda (Appendix I) was adopted without change. According to the list of participants (Appendix II), of 20 members and participants, there were 10 women and an equal number of men (50% of each). The meeting was attended by all thirteen members (eight in person and five online).

## Conclusions and decisions

4. The main objective of the meeting was to decide on the open questions, reach agreement on the proposed amendments and finalise, to the extent possible, the wording of the two deliverables of the Expert Committee. Both the Draft Guidelines on the responsible implementation of artificial intelligence (AI) in journalism (MSI-RES(2022)07) and the Good practices for sustainable media financing (MSI-RES(2022)08) have undergone two revisions since the third meeting of the expert committee in March 2023, one before the CDMSI plenary meeting in June 2023 and another before the final meeting of the MSI-RES in October. For the June revision, the rapporteurs took note of the discussion and comments to the texts made in the March meeting of the MSI-RES and incorporated the conclusions of the said meeting into the drafts. Furthermore, the CDMSI members provided orientations to the Expert Committee on the Draft Guidelines, focusing on issues of transparency, AI bias, editorial oversight over the use of AI and its role as facilitator of journalistic processes, the respect for the rights of third parties, etc.
5. The MSI-RES welcomed the amended documents and proceeded to a careful review of the texts paragraph by paragraph, to ensure that the key ideas and concepts were adequately reflected and clearly communicated. The Expert Committee discussed and reformulated where necessary, based on constructive and concrete suggestions from the members and observers.
6. Regarding the Draft Guidelines, the Expert Committee made several decisions on substance as well as wording to improve the conciseness and flow of the text. Regarding the new guideline on risk assessment, it was deemed that the focus should be on media companies' and stakeholders' proactive consideration of potential risks associated with the implementation of AI systems. The members acknowledged that in procurement, at least part of the risk lies in not having full control over processes such as data management and training methods. The consensus was to clarify that risk assessment does not necessarily solve all issues but should be a thoughtful consideration.
7. Many AI systems are trained on copyright-protected data, thus copyright issues and other rights of third parties were included in the section on the acquisition of AI systems. These issues were also included in the guideline on the risk assessment; however, it was stressed that fully addressing copyright would go beyond the scope of the text. Moreover, the question of AI bias was considered, with the decision to maintain the text in the two guidelines where the issue was addressed, without going into further detail. Discussion also focused on balancing the concerns about public service media (PSM) sharing their technology with other (private) media with the PSM's significant public mission, and the guideline concerned was adjusted to explain that such sharing was recommended only where feasible.
8. A general consensus emerged that Section 5 should offer broad guidance for platforms, referring to their existing obligations laid down in several previous Committee of Ministers' recommendations without delving into detailed specifics. The members and observers agreed that platforms' gatekeeper role and involvement in the distribution of media content required their inclusion in the text. However, it was also considered that a distinction should be maintained between AI systems used for journalistic purposes and those used by platforms, and, more generally, that the existing standards on platforms' role and responsibilities in the media and communication environment provided sufficient guidance for the purpose of this text. The text was thus shortened to outline the main responsibilities and refer to the relevant standards for details.
9. Regarding the collection of Good practices for sustainable media financing, the MSI-RES members and observers made several final proposals for textual amendments and

examples of good practices, but focused mostly on the report's conclusions and recommendations. It was decided that all recommendations should draw on the review of media business models and especially good practices outlined in the preceding sections of the report. However, the MSI-RES members also agreed that recommendations could include, in addition to the practices known to produce positive results, those recommended by media experts which have, however, not yet been put in place in the Council of Europe member states (e.g., voucher programmes for subscribers).

10. As regards the recommendations to states, the Expert Committee agreed to clarify that direct funding should be granted on the basis of clear, objective, predictable and fair criteria, that it should not favour incumbents and should be technology neutral. It was also agreed to recommend to member states to tax digital advertising and use the proceeds to provide (further) support to news organisations. As for news media organisations, the MSI-RES members agreed that the media sector is experimenting with various business models, and companies are better equipped to decide on their own about their business strategies, so the recommendations should avoid stating the obvious. Instead, a few specific and targeted recommendations were maintained, especially as regards investments in professional education and training of journalists, collaboration initiatives and ethical principles for accepting or declining funding from either public or private sources. It was also decided to add a few recommendations to philanthropic donors and one to the Council of Europe.
11. In view of several amendments agreed in the meeting, it was agreed that the rapporteurs would finalise both deliverables after the meeting. It was also agreed that the Secretariat would verify whether it is possible for the CDMSI to endorse the recommendations made in the Good practices for sustainable media financing and thereby strengthen their force. Both texts were thus revised in line with the meeting's conclusions and submitted for approval to the Expert Committee in written procedure, which ended on 16 November 2023, with a few further minor changes to both documents.

### Any other business

12. The fourth meeting having been the last meeting of the MSI-RES, the members expressed their satisfaction with the work carried out by the Expert Committee, thanking the rapporteurs – Ms Natali Helberger, Mr Richard Fletcher, Ms Elda Brogi and Ms Helle Sjøvaag – for their dedication and commitment, and their Chair, Mr Ramón Salaverría Aliaga, for his attentive guidance. The members and observers also discussed the possible follow-up to the work of the Expert Committee, committing to promote the future instruments among their networks and enhance their visibility amongst the relevant stakeholders.
13. In line with established practice, the Secretariat will prepare a draft meeting report to be sent to the Chair and Vice-Chair for consideration. Thereafter, the Secretariat will send the draft report to the MSI-RES, allowing for comments within five full working days. In the absence of comments, the report will be deemed finalised and will be transmitted to the CDMSI for information.

## **Appendix I**

### **Agenda**

MSI-RES(2023)12  
3 October 2023

#### **4<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Committee of Experts on Increasing Resilience of Media**

**Draft Agenda**  
5-6 October 2023

Hybrid meeting  
(Strasbourg, Palais de l'Europe, Room 7 / online via Zoom)

#### **5 October 2023**

9.00 – 9.30 Zoom testing

#### **9:30 – 11:00**

1. Opening of the meeting by the Chair
2. Welcoming address by Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department of the Council of Europe
3. Adoption of the agenda
4. Discussion and finalisation of the Draft Good practices for sustainable news media financing (*MSI-RES(2022)08*)

#### **11.00 – 11.30**

*Coffee break*

#### **11.30 – 13.00**

5. Continuation of point 4

#### **13.00 – 14.30**

*Lunch break*

#### **14.30 – 16.00**

6. Continuation of point 4

#### **16.00 – 16.30**

*Coffee break*

**16.30 – 18.00**

7. Discussion and finalisation of the Draft Guidelines on the responsible implementation of artificial intelligence (AI) in journalism (*MSI-RES(2022)07*)

**6 October 2023**

**9.30 – 11.00**

8. Continuation of point 7

**11.00 – 11.30**

*Coffee break*

**11.30 – 13.00**

9. Continuation of point 7

**13.00 – 14.30**

*Lunch break*

**14.30 – 17.00**

10. Continuation of point 7
11. Evaluation of completed activities and follow-up
12. Other business

## Appendix II

### List of participants / liste de participants

5 October 2023

#### **Committee of Experts on Increasing Resilience of Media (MSI-RES)**

#### **Comité d'experts sur le renforcement de la résilience des médias (MSI-RES)**

4<sup>th</sup> meeting, 5-6 October 2023  
Hybrid meeting, Council of Europe, Strasbourg

4<sup>e</sup> réunion, 5-6 octobre 2023  
Réunion hybride, Conseil de l'Europe, Strasbourg

### List of participants / liste de participants

#### **COMMITTEE MEMBERS / MEMBRES DU COMITÉ**

**Ms / Mme Ludmila ANDRONIC**

Lecturer / Conférencière

Department of Journalism and Communication Sciences / Département de journalisme et des sciences de la communication

Moldova State University / Université d'État de Moldavie

Republic of Moldova / République de Moldavie

**Ms / Mme Eida BROGI (online / en ligne)**

Scientific Coordinator at the Centre for Media Pluralism Media Freedom / Coordinatrice scientifique au Centre pour le pluralisme des médias et la liberté des médias

Professor (part-time) at the European University Institute / Professeur (à temps partiel) à l'Institut universitaire européen

Florence

Italy / Italie

**Ms / Mme Roxana CLINCIU (online/ en ligne)**

Deputy director / Directrice adjointe

Public Diplomacy and Strategic Communication Directorate / Direction de la diplomatie publique et de la communication stratégique

Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Ministère des affaires étrangères

Romania / Roumanie

**Ms / Mme Solvita DENISA–LIEPNIECE (online/ en ligne)**

Principal media literacy advisor (disinformation resilience), Baltic Centre for media excellence / Conseillère principale en éducation aux médias (résilience à la désinformation), Centre balte pour l'excellence des médias

Latvia / Lettonie

**Ms / Mme Maria DONDE**

Head of International Content Policy / *Chef de la politique de contenu international*  
Office of Communication (OFCOM) / *Bureau de la Communication (OFCOM)*  
United Kingdom / *Royaume-Uni*

**Ms / Mme Céline FLAMMANG**

Senior policy advisor / *Conseillère*  
Department of Media, Connectivity and Digital Policy / *Service des médias, de la connectivité et de la politique numérique*  
Ministry of State / *Ministère d'État*  
Luxembourg

**Mr / M. Richard FLETCHER**

Senior Research Fellow / *Chercheur principal*  
Reuters Institute of the Study of Journalism / *Institut Reuters d'étude du journalisme*  
United Kingdom / *Royaume-Uni*

**Ms / Mme Natali HELBERGER** (online / en ligne)

Professor in information law / *Professeur de droit de l'information*  
Institute for Information Law / *Institut du droit de l'information*  
University of Amsterdam / *Université d'Amsterdam*  
Netherlands / *Pays-Bas*

**Mr / M. Marko MILOSAVLJEVIĆ**

Professor, Head of Communication Department / *Professeur, Chef du département de la communication*  
Faculty of Social Sciences / *Faculté des sciences sociales*  
University of Ljubljana / *Université de Ljubljana*  
Slovenia / *Slovénie*

**Mr / M. Manuel PUPPIS (Vice-Chair)**

Professor in Media Systems and Media Structures / *Professeur en systèmes et structures médiatiques*  
University of Fribourg / *Université de Fribourg*  
Switzerland / *Suisse*

**Mr / M. Ramón SALAVERRÍA ALIAGA (Chair)**

Professor of Journalism / *Professeur de journalisme*  
Center for Internet Studies & Digital Life / *Centre d'études de l'Internet et de la vie numérique*  
University of Navarra / *Université de Navarre*  
Spain / *Espagne*

**Ms / Mme Helle SJØVAAG**

Professor of Journalism / *Professeur de journalisme*  
University of Stavanger / *Université de Stavanger*  
Norway / *Norvège*

**Mr / M. R. L. VREEKAMP** (online / en ligne)

Founder of Future Journalism Today Academy / *Fondateur de l'Académie Future Journalism Today*  
Netherlands / *Pays-Bas*

**PARTICIPANTS AND OBSERVERS / PARTICIPANTS ET OBSERVATEURS**

<b>COMMUNITY MEDIA FORUM EUROPE (CMFE)</b>	<b>Mr/M Nicolas HORBER</b> Observer to the MSI-RES on behalf of CDMFE / <i>Observateur MSI-RES pour le compte de CMFE</i>
--	---

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE MEMBER STATES /**

<b>TÜRKIYE / TURQUIE</b>	<b>Mr/M. Yusuf DEMİRTAŞ</b> Vice Head of International Relations Department/Expert / Vice-Chef du département des relations internationales Radio and Television Supreme Council (RTÜK) / Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision (RTUK)  <b>Mr/M. Muhammet Salih KARABULUT</b> Expert / Expert Radio and Television Supreme Council (RTÜK) / Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision (RTUK) International Relations Department / Département des relations internationales
--------------------------	--

**NON-MEMBER STATES / ÉTATS NON-MEMBRES**

<b>MOROCCO / MAROC</b>	<b>Mr/Mr EI Mahdi AROUSSI IDRISSE</b> (online / en ligne) Director of Legal Studies, High Authority for Audiovisual Communication / <i>Directeur des études juridiques, Haute autorité de la communication audiovisuelle</i>  <b>Mr / M. Othmane ALAMI LAKTIB</b> (online / en ligne) Executive, Legal Studies Department, High Authority for Audio-visual Communication (HACA) <i>Cadre, Département des études juridiques, Haute Autorité de la Communication Audiovisuelle (HACA)</i>
------------------------	--

**COUNCIL OF EUROPE DEPARTMENTS AND BODIES / DÉPARTEMENTS ET ORGANES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

<b>EUROPEAN AUDIOVISUAL OBSERVATORY/ OBSERVATOIRE EUROPEEN DE L'AUDIOVISUEL</b>	<b>No representative / Pas de représentant</b>
<b>Conference of INGOs/ Conférence des OING</b>	<b>No representative / Pas de représentant</b>



## OTHER INSTITUTIONS / AUTRES INSTITUTIONS

<b>ARTICLE 19</b>	<b>Ms / Mme Maria Luisa STASI</b> (online / en ligne) Head of Law & Policy for digital markets / <i>Responsable du droit et de la politique des marchés numériques</i>
<b>EUROPEAN COMMISSION / COMMISSION EUROPEENNE DG CNECT</b>	<b>No representative / Pas de représentant</b>
<b>EUROPEAN BROADCASTING UNION</b>	<b>No representative / Pas de représentant</b>
<b>REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS (RSF) / REPORTERS SANS FRONTIÈRES</b>	<b>Ms / Mme Chloé FIODIERE</b> Development Manager - Journalism Trust Initiative /
<b>Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe / Organisation pour la sécurité et la coopération en Europe</b>	<b>No representative / Pas de représentant</b>

## SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT

<b>Information Society Department, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law / Service de la société de l'information, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de droit</b>	<b>Mr / M Patrick PENNINCKX</b> Head of Department / <i>Chef de Service</i>
<b>Information Society Department / Service</b>	<b>Ms / Mme Urška UMEK</b>

<i>de la société de l'information</i>	Secretary of MSI-RES committee, Head of Media Unit, Media and Internet Division / <i>Secrétaire du Comité MSI-RES, Chef de l'unité médias, Division médias et internet</i>
<b>Information Society Department</b> / <i>Service de la société de l'information</i>	<b>Ms/Mme Evangelia VASALOU</b> Secretary to the Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) / <i>Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF)</i>
<b>Information Society Department</b> / <i>Service de la société de l'information</i>	<b>Ms/Mme Hélène EIDENWEIL</b> Assistant / Assistante  <b>Ms/Mme Caroline LAVOUE</b> Assistant / Assistante

#### **INTERPRETERS / INTERPRETES**

**Mr / M Luke TILDEN**  
**Mr / M Gregoire DEVICTOR**  
**Ms / Mme Sylvie BOUX**