



3rd meeting, 27-28 March 2023

Hybrid meeting via KUDO

MEETING REPORT

Opening of the meeting

1. Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department of the Council of Europe opened the meeting and welcomed members and participants, stressing the importance of the MSI-INF work, also in the light of the Organisation's priorities which include freedom of expression, media and internet governance and other information society issues. Mr Penninckx elaborated on the importance of the task before the Committee, given the current weaponization of disinformation and centrality of fact-checking in the process of providing access to reliable information, in particular in the context of the pandemic and Russian war in Ukraine. He invited the Committee to ensure that the future Guidance note contains globally oriented, implementable and human rights-centric guidance for policymakers, as well as for other relevant stakeholders.
2. The MSI-INF members adopted the meeting agenda (Appendix 1) without amendment. The list of meeting participants appears in Appendix 2. Of the total of 54 participants, there were 28 women (52%) and 26 men (48%). The meeting was attended by 13 members (12 in person, 1 hybrid via Kudo).

Information by the Secretariat

3. Ms Katarzyna Szwed, *ad interim* Secretary of the MSI-INF, provided additional information about the relevant standard-setting and other work of the Council of Europe bodies and structure. In particular, she brought attention of the members and participants to a number of recommendations adopted in 2022: [CM/Rec\(2022\)11](#) on principles for media and communication governance, [CM/Rec\(2022\)12](#) on electoral communication and media coverage of election campaigns, [CM/Rec\(2022\)13](#) on the impacts of digital technologies on freedom of expression, [CM/Rec\(2022\)16](#) on combatting hate speech and [CM/Rec\(2022\)4](#) on promoting a favourable environment for quality journalism in the digital age. Regarding upcoming events of interests, the secretariat informed the members that two other expert committees of the CDMSI will hold their meetings in the upcoming days - Committee of Experts on Increasing Resilience of Media, working on the Guidelines on the use of digital tools including artificial intelligence for journalism/by journalists, and Committee of Experts on Strategic Lawsuits Against Public Participation, working on a draft future recommendation on countering SLAPPs.

Elections

4. The Committee proceeded to elections. With only one candidate proposed for each of the functions, the MSI-INF unanimously elected Mr Andrin Eichin (Switzerland) as its Chair and Mr Hrvoje Lisičar (Croatia) as its Vice-chair. The elections were conducted by a show of hands since no member requested a secret ballot.
5. The meeting was further chaired by Mr Andrin Eichin.

Discussion of the draft Guidance Note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights' compliant manner

6. The ensuing discussion focused on the content of the deliverable under the MSI-INF mandate - a future draft Guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights' compliant manner- that is expected to be finalised and submitted to the CDMSI for approval before the end of December 2023.
7. The Rapporteurs - Mr Ronan Ó Fathaigh, Ms Sophie Lecheler and Mr Cristian Vaccari - started the discussion with a general presentation of the advanced draft. The MSI-INF members commended the rapporteurs' effort to follow the agreed outline, to elaborate on the issues discussed during the previous meetings and integrate as many comments as possible.
8. The MSI-INF discussed the draft Guidance Note section by section (fact-checking, platform design solutions, empowerment of users), offering valuable comments, useful suggestions and enlightening clarifications.

Discussion of explanatory memorandum accompanying the draft Guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights' compliant manner

9. The Rapporteurs started the discussion with a presentation of the proposed outline of the memorandum, developing on the general structure, thematic scope and the supplementary role of the document.
10. The Committee discussed the proposed outline of the Memorandum section by section (setting of the problem, fact-checking, platform design solutions, empowerment of users), agreed on the said outline and reminded the Rapporteurs that the purpose of the document is to be an interpretative support tool, not a report or a study. The Committee also stressed that given the purpose of the document, it should remain as brief as possible.

Conclusions and decisions

11. **As to the draft Guidance Note** on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner, the MSI-INF agreed that the draft is currently in its highly advanced stage and requires only minor corrections in the wording of certain phrases. The Rapporteurs appreciated and accepted the Committee's input in that matter.
12. **As to the Explanatory Memorandum** accompanying the draft guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner, it was agreed for the Rapporteurs to continue the work in line with the received comments and suggestions.
13. As to the **timelines and follow-up**, a deadline of 16th April 2023 was set for written comments on the draft guidance note, whereupon the rapporteurs will revise the text. A deadline of 31st May 2023 was set for proposing the draft of explanatory memorandum, followed by the deadline of 15th June for submitting written comments. A deadline of 20th August was set for presentation of the final drafts of both the Guidance Note and the Explanatory Memorandum.

Any other business

14. In line with established practice, the Secretariat will prepare a draft meeting report to be sent to the Chair and Vice-Chair for consideration. Thereafter, the draft report will be sent to MSI-INF members, allowing for comments within five full working days. In the absence of comments, the report will be deemed finalised and will be transmitted to the CDMSI for information.

Date and place of next meeting

15. The fourth MSI-INF meeting will take place on 18-19 September 2023. The meeting will be held onsite in Strasbourg, in person.

**3rd Meeting of the
Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information**

Agenda

27-28 March 2023, 10:00-12:30, 14:00-16:30

Hybrid meeting

(Strasbourg, Palais de l'Europe, Room 6 / online via the KUDO platform)

Day 1 – 27 March

09:30-10:00 – *KUDO tests*

10:00 – 11:00

1. Opening of the meeting

Patrick PENNINCKX, Head of information Society Department

2. Adoption of the agenda and order of business

[MSI-INF\(2023\)09](#)

3. Information by the Secretariat

Information on relevant developments in the standard-setting and other work of the Council of Europe bodies and structures

4. Elections

- Election of the Chair and the vice-Chair

11:00 – 11:15 - coffee break

11:15 – 12:30

5. Discussion of the Draft Guidance Note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner

12:30 – 14:00 - lunch break

14:00 – 15:00

5. Discussion – continued

15:00 – 15:15 - coffee break

15:15 – 16:30

5. Discussion – continued

Day 2 – 28 March

09:30-10:00 – *KUDO tests*

10:00 – 11:00

6. Proposals for the Explanatory Memorandum complementing the Guidance Note

11:00 – 11:15 - coffee break

11:15 – 12:30

7. Discussion

12:30 - 14:00 - lunch break

14:00 – 16:30

7. Discussion - continued

8. Further actions

9. Any other business

10. Date and place of the next meeting

Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) /*Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF)*3rd Meeting –27-28 March 2023 (hybrid) /
3^e réunion – 27-28 mars 2023 (hybride)**List of participants / Liste de participant.e.s****COMMITTEE MEMBERS / MEMBRES DU COMITE****Ms/Mme Roxana CLINCIU**Deputy Director / *Directrice adjointe*

Public Diplomacy and Strategic Communication Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs /

Direction de la diplomatie publique et de la communication stratégique, Ministère des affaires étrangères

Romania / Roumanie

Mr/M Andrin EICHIN

Senior Policy Advisor, Swiss Federal Office of Communications (OFCOM) /

Conseiller politique principal pour les relations internationales, Bureau fédéral suisse de la communication (OFCOM)

Switzerland / Suisse

Ms/Mme Paula FRAGA-LAMAS

IEEE Senior Member, Senior researcher and lecturer, Department of computer engineering, University of A Coruña (UDC) /

Membre senior de l'IEEE, chercheur principal et conférencier, Département de génie informatique, Université de la Corogne (UDC)

Spain / Espagne

Ms/Mme Puck GORRISSEN

Policy Officer – Democracy, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations of the Netherlands /

Résponsable des politiques de la démocratie, Ministère des Affaires intérieures et des Relations au sein du Royaume

The Netherlands / Pays-Bas

Ms/Mme Sophie LECHLER

Professor of Political Communication, Department of Communication, University of Vienna /

Professeur de communication politique, Département de communication, Université de Vienne

Austria / Autriche

Mr/M Hrvoje LISIČAR

Chair of Information Technology Law, Faculty of Law, University of Zagreb /

Président du droit des technologies de l'information, Faculté de droit, Université de Zagreb

Croatia / Croatie

Mr/M Giacomo MAZZONE

Member of the Advisory board of the European Digital Media Observatory (EDMO), Expert of the EAC High Level panel in charge of digital literacy /

Membre du conseil consultatif de l'Observatoire européen des médias numériques (EDMO), expert du panel de haut niveau de l'EAC en charge de la culture numérique

Italy / Italie

Mr/M Ronan Ó FATHAIGH

Senior researcher, Institute for Information Law (IViR), Faculty of Law, University of Amsterdam

Chercheur principal, Institut de droit de l'information (IViR), Faculté de droit, Université d'Amsterdam

The Netherlands / Pays-Bas

Ms/Mme Malgorzata PEK

Expert, Strategy Department, National Broadcasting Council's Office /

Expert, Département Conseil de la stratégie, Bureau du national de l'audiovisuel

Poland / Pologne

Mr/M Declan SHAW

Head of Team, Online Media Literacy and Analysis Team, Online Harms Directorate /

UK Department for Digital, Culture, Media, and Sport

Chef d'équipe, Équipe d'éducation et d'analyse des médias en ligne, Direction des préjudices en ligne,

Département britannique du numérique, de la culture, des médias et du sport

United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

Ms/Mme Nicole Sapfo STELLOU

Media Policy expert, Presidency of Government

Expert en politique des médias, Présidence du gouvernement

Greece / Grèce

Mr/M Cristian VACCARI

Professor of Political Communication and Co-Director of the Centre for Research in Communication and Culture, Loughborough University

Professeur de communication politique et codirecteur du Centre de recherche en communication et culture, Université de Loughborough

United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

Mr/M Giovanni ZAGNI

Director, Pagella Politica / Facta.news

Directeur, Pagella Politica / Facta.news

Italy / Italie

PARTICIPANTS AND OBSERVERS / PARTICIPANTS ET OBSERVATEURS

| | |
|---|--|
| BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA / BOSNIE ET HERZÉGOVINE | Mr/M Danko LUPI Senior Associate for Informatization, Ministry of Communications and Transport / <i>Associé principal pour l'informatisation, ministère des communications et des transports</i> |
| GREECE / GRÈCE | Ms/Mme Katerina POLYZOU Head of Department for Audiovisual Media & Internet Presidency of the Government / |

| | |
|----------------------------|---|
| | <i>Chef du département des médias audiovisuels et de l'internet, Présidence du gouvernement</i> |
| ITALY / ITALIE | Ms/Mme Alessandra PIERUCCI Italian Data Protection Authority / <i>Autorité italienne de protection des données</i> |
| POLAND / POLOGNE | Iwona PIÓRKOWSKA-KAPICA Senior Specialist, International Cooperation and Education Department, Personal Data Protection Office / <i>Spécialiste principale, Département de la coopération internationale et de l'éducation, Bureau de la protection des données personnelles</i> |
| PORTUGAL / PORTUGAL | Ms/Mme Maria DA LUZ RODRIGUES DO Ó Legal advisor; Ministry of Justice General Secretariat, Data Protection Officer for the Ministry of Justice / <i>Conseiller juridique ; Ministère de la Justice Secrétariat général, Bureau de protection des données du ministère de la Justice</i> |
| SERBIA / SERBIE | Ms/Mme Gordana MOHOROVIC Assistant General Secretary, Sector for International Relations, Domestic Cooperation and Projects, Commissioner for Information of Public Importance and Personal Data Protection / <i>Secrétaire général adjoint, Secteur des relations internationales, de la coopération interne et des projets, Commissaire à l'information d'intérêt public et de la protection des données personnelles</i> |
| TÜRKIYE / TÜRKIYE | Mr/M Yusuf DEMIRTAŞ Vice Head of Department, Radio and Television Supreme Council / <i>Chef de service adjoint, Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision</i> Mr/M Atakan ERDEM Expert, Radio and Television Supreme Council / <i>Expert, Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision</i> Mr/M Muhammet GÖK Expert, Radio and Television Supreme Council / <i>Expert, Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision</i> Mr/M Salih KARABULUT Expert, Radio and Television Supreme Council / <i>Expert, Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision</i> |

NON-MEMBER STATES / ETATS NON-MEMBRES

| | |
|------------------------|--|
| MOROCCO / MAROC | Ms/Mme Chanaz EL AKRICH Head of Division of Cooperation, Department of Communication, Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports / |
|------------------------|--|

| | |
|--|--|
| | <p><i>Cheffe de Division de la Coopération, Département de la Communication, / Ministère de la Culture, de la Jeunesse et des Sports</i></p> <p>Ms/Mme Meriem KHATOURI Director of Studies and Media Development, Department of Communication, Ministry of Youth, Culture and Communication / <i>Directrice des Études et du Développement des Médias, Département de la Communication, Ministère de la Jeunesse, de la Culture et de la Communication</i></p> <p>Mr/Mr El Mahdi AROUSSI IDRISSE Director of Legal Studies, High Authority for Audiovisual Communication <i>Directeur des études juridiques, Haute autorité de la communication audiovisuelle</i></p> <p>Mr/M Othmane ALAMI LAKTIB Executive, Legal Studies Department, High Authority for Audiovisual Communication / <i>Cadre, Département des études juridiques Haute autorité de la communication audiovisuelle</i></p> |
|--|--|

OTHER INSTITUTIONS / AUTRES INSTUTIONS

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>EUROPEAN BROADCASTING UNION (EBU) / UNION EUROPEENNE DE RADIO-TELEVISION (UER)</p> | <p>Ms/Mme Nicola FRANK Head of Institutional and International Relations Director General's office / <i>Chef des relations institutionnelles et internationales Bureau du directeur général</i></p> <p>Ms/Mme Sophia WISTEHUBE Legal Counsel / <i>Conseiller juridique</i></p> |
| <p>EUROPEAN AUDIOVISUAL OBSERVATORY / OBSERVATOIRE EUROPÉEN DE L'AUDIOVISUEL</p> | <p>Ms/Mme Maja CAPPELLO Head of the Department for Legal Information / <i>Cheffe du département de l'information juridique</i></p> <p>Ms/Mme Amélie LACOURT Junior Legal Analyst / <i>Analyste juridique junior</i></p> <p>Mr/M Eric MUNCH Legal Analyst / <i>Analyste juridique</i></p> |
| <p>IEEE</p> | <p>Mr/M Sean LA ROQUE-DOHERTY, Esq Attorney & Counsellor at Law, IEEE member / <i>Avocat et conseiller juridique, membre du IEEE</i></p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| MEDIACLAN | Mr/M Michael EISENRIEGLER <i>Partner / Partenaire</i> |
| META | Ms/Mme Kathleen STEWART Public Policy Manager Content Regulation (Europe and AMET)/ <i>Responsable politiques publiques Règlement sur le contenu (Europe et AMET)</i> |
| MICROSOFT | Mr/M Tjade STROBAND Director - European Government Affairs / <i>Directeur - Affaires gouvernementales européennes</i> |
| RANKING DIGITAL RIGHTS | Mr/M Zak ROGOFF Research Manager / <i>Responsable de la recherche</i> |
| REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS / REPORTERS SANS FRONTIÈRES (RSF) | Mr/M Paul POUCHOUX Advocacy Officer/ <i>Responsable du plaidoyer</i> |
| UNESCO | Ms/Mme Xianhong HU Program Specialist at the Sector of Communication and the Secretariat of Information and the Information for All Programme (IFAP) / <i>Spécialiste de programme au Secteur de la Communication et au Secrétariat de l'Information and the Information for All Programme (IFAP)</i> Ms/Mme Ana Cristina RUELAS SERNA Senior Programme Specialist, UNESCO - Freedom of Expression and Safety of Journalist Section / <i>Spécialiste de programme principal, UNESCO - Section de la liberté d'expression et de la sécurité des journalistes</i> Mr/M Lucas NOVAES FERREIRA Consultant / <i>Conseiller</i> |
| VDE ASSOCIATION FOR ELECTRICAL, ELECTRONIC & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGIES / VDE ASSOCIATION POUR LES TECHNOLOGIES ÉLECTRIQUES, ÉLECTRONIQUES ET DE L'INFORMATION | Mr/M Sebastian HALLENSLEBEN Head of Digitalisation and AI, Chair CEN-CENELEC JTC 21 AI / <i>Responsable de la numérisation et de l'IAM Président CEN-CENELEC JTC 21 AI</i> |

SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT

| | |
|--|--|
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Mr/M Patrick PENNINCKX Head of Department / <i>Chef du service</i> |
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Ms/Mme Artemiza-Tatiana CHISCA Head of Media and Internet Division, Secretary to the Steering committee on media and information society (CDMSI) / <i>Chef de la Division médias et internet, Secrétaire du Comité directeur sur les médias et la société d'information (CDMSI)</i> |
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Ms/Mme Urška UMEK Head of Media Unit, Media and Internet Division, Secretary to the Committee of Experts on Increasing the Resilience of Media <i>Chef d'unité médias, Division médias et internet, Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur le renforcement de la résilience des médias</i> |
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Ms/Mme Katarzyna SZWED Secretary to the Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) - Media and Internet Division <i>Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF), Division médias et internet</i> |
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Ms/Mme Giulia LUCHESE Secretary to the Committee of Experts on Strategic Lawsuits against Public Participation (MSI-SLP), Administrator, Media and Internet Division <i>Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur les poursuites stratégiques contre la participation publique (MSI-SLP), Administratrice, Division médias et internet</i> |
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Ms/Mme Rodica CIOCHINA Administrator, Media and Internet Division <i>Administratrice, Division médias et internet</i> |
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Ms/Mme Irina TOMOVA Administrative Assistant, Media and Internet Division <i>Assistante administrative, Division médias et internet</i> |
| INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION | Ms/Mme Magdalena PENEVA Administrative Assistant, Media and Internet Division <i>Assistante administrative, Division médias et internet</i> |

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES

Ms/Mme Barbara GRUT
Mr/M Grégoire DEVICTOR

Mr/M Jean-Jacques PEDUSSAUD
Ms/Mme Sally BAILEY-RAVET

KUDO technician / *Technicien KUDO*

Mr/M Hugo ROHM