Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF)



MSI-INF(2023)16 4 October 2023

4th meeting, 18-19 September 2023 In-person meeting

MEETING REPORT

Opening of the meeting

- 1. Ms Artemiza-Tatiana Chisca, Head of the Media and Internet Division, Information Society Department and Secretary to CDMSI opened the meeting and welcomed members and participants, thanking them for their continued commitment in the process of elaboration of the Expert Committee's deliverable, the Guidance Note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner. Ms Chisca highlighted the importance of the MSI-INF work providing guidelines for States, platforms and other stakeholders in order to tackle contemporary challenges related to the integrity of online information. She further informed the Committee about the recent developments in the Council of Europe, notably the expected adoption of new terms of reference of the CDMSI and its future expert committees for the period 2024-2027. She explained that the work of those Committees will address topics of particular interest for the Council of Europe in the field of the media and digital governance, new but also in continuity with the existing standards and activities, including the work of current expert committees. Ms Chisca also stressed that the topics of future Committees are among the priorities decided for the Organization during the recent Summit of the Council of Europe in Reykjavik, in May 2023.
- 2. The MSI-INF members adopted the meeting agenda (Appendix 1) without amendment. The list of meeting participants appears in Appendix 2. Of the total of 27 participants, there were 12 women (44,5%) and 15 (55,5%) men. The meeting was attended by 12 members.
- 3. The Chair, Mr Andrin Eichin, recalled that the main objective of the meeting was to finalise and agree on the two documents that the Expert Committee was called upon to prepare, the Draft Guidance Note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner and its Draft Explanatory Memorandum.

Information by the Secretariat

4. Ms Evangelia Vasalou, *ad interim* Secretary of the MSI-INF, presented the work of the drafting group pointing out the main topics discussed and addressed, in the light of the inputs received at

the last CDMSI, which took place on 14-15 June 2024. She also provided additional information about significant new initiatives against the dissemination of mis- and disinformation at the level of the European Union and at international level. The members were also informed that the two other expert Committees of the CDMSI, will hold their last meetings in the upcoming weeks - MSI-RES, the Committee of Experts on Increasing Resilience of Media, working on the Guidelines on the use of digital tools including artificial intelligence for journalism/by journalists, as well as on best practices regarding sustainable media funding in member states, and MSI-SLP, the Committee of Experts on Strategic Lawsuits Against Public Participation, working on a draft future recommendation on countering SLAPPs.

Discussion and finalisation of the Draft Guidance Note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner.

- 5. The Chair, Mr Andrin Eichin, invited the Rapporteurs Mr Ronan Ó Fathaigh, Ms Sophie Lecheler and Mr Cristian Vaccari to present the deliverables section by section (fact-checking, platform design solutions, empowerment of users), providing more information about the latest modifications of the documents following the received comments and suggestions.
- 6. The MSI-INF welcomed the revised documents and then examined thoroughly each document to make sure that the main concepts and ideas were adequately analysed and checked for coherence between the Draft Guidance Note and the Draft Explanatory Memorandum. Based on constructive discussion and concrete suggestions from the members and participants, the expert Committee revised the documents.
- 7. The Expert Committee deliberated and revised at first the Draft Guidance Note. This document has undergone adjustments with the purpose to align core definitions of the Guidance Note with the content of other legal instruments of the Council of Europe, including with the concepts and terms used in the drafting process of the future Al Convention of the Council of Europe. A few additional references to Recommendations adopted by the Committee of Ministers on relevant topics have been added in the text for that purpose. Moreover, other minor linguistic revisions have been made.

Discussion and finalisation of the Explanatory Memorandum complementing the Guidance Note

8. Subsequently, the Expert Committee deliberated and revised the Explanatory Memorandum. The rapporteurs introduced the sections of this document presenting the modifications of each subsection. They highlighted that each subsection was based on the same logic (current situation, key challenges, addressing the challenges), they explained the intention to identify similarities and differences between them. Moreover, the Committee appreciated the concrete examples included in the analysis to outline best practices, for instance: the initiatives of the International Fact-Checking Network (IFCN) and the European Fact-Checking Standards Network (EFCSN). The Expert Committee integrated also comments regarding the working conditions of fact-checkers and discussed thoroughly about the empowerment of the most vulnerable groups.

Conclusions and decisions

Following their careful examination and considering the last revisions made to the texts during the
meeting, the Committee agreed to transmit the Guidance Note and its Explanatory Memorandum
to the CDMSI for consideration and final approval at its forthcoming plenary session (29
November-1 December 2023).

- 10. The members expressed their satisfaction with the work carried out by the Committee, thanking the rapporteurs Mr Ronan Ó Fathaigh, Ms Sophie Lecheler and Mr Cristian Vaccari for their engagement and the high quality of the future Guidance Note, and the Chair, Mr Andrin Eichin, for his guidance.
- 11. In line with established practice, the Secretariat was instructed to prepare a draft meeting report to be sent to the Chair and Vice-Chair for consideration. Thereafter, the Secretariat will send the draft report to all MSI-INF members. In the absence of comments within five full working days, the report will be deemed approved and will be transmitted to the CDMSI for information.

4th Meeting of the Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information

Agenda

18-19 September 2023, 10:00-12:30, 14:00-17:30

Meeting in-person, Strasbourg, Agora, room G06

Day 1 - 18 September

10:00 - 11:00

- 1. Opening of the meeting
- 2. Adoption of the agenda and order of business
- 3. Information by the Secretariat

11:00 - 11:15 - coffee break

11:15 - 12:30

4. Discussion and finalisation of the Draft Guidance Note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner

12:30 - 14:00 - lunch break

14:00 - 15:00

5. Discussion - continued

15:00 - 15:15 - coffee break

<u>15:15 – 17:30</u>

5. Discussion - continued

Day 2 - 19 September

10:00 - 11:00

6. Discussion and finalisation of the Explanatory Memorandum complementing the Guidance Note

<u>11:15 – 12:30</u>

7. Discussion - continued

12:30 - 14:00 - lunch break

<u>14:00 – 15:00</u>

8. Discussion – continued

15:00 - 15:15 - break

<u>15:15 - 17:30</u>

- 9. Discussion continued
- 10. Other business

Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) /

Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF)

4th Meeting –18-19 September 2023 (in-person) / 4^e réunion – 18-19 septembre 2023 (en présentielle)

List of participants / Liste de participant.e.s

COMMITTEE MEMBERS / MEMBRES DU COMITE

Ms/Mme Roxana CLINCIU

Deputy Director / Directrice adjointe

Public Diplomacy and Strategic Communication Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs /

Direction de la diplomatie publique et de la communication stratégique, Ministère des affaires étrangères Romania / Roumanie

Mr/M Andrin EICHIN

Senior Policy Advisor, Swiss Federal Office of Communications (OFCOM) /

Conseiller politique principal pour les relations internationales, Bureau fédéral suisse de la communication (OFCOM)

Switzerland / Suisse

Ms/Mme Puck GORRISSEN

Policy Officer – Democracy, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations of the Netherlands / Résponsable des politiques de la d*émocratie* , *Ministère des Affaires intérieures et des Relations au sein du Royaume*

The Netherlands / Pays-Bas

Ms/Mme Sophie LECHELER

Professor of Political Communication, Department of Communication, University of Vienna / Professeur de communication politique, Département de communication, Université de Vienne Austria / Autriche

Mr/M Hrvoje LISIČAR

Chair of Information Technology Law, Faculty of Law, University of Zagreb / Président du droit des technologies de l'information, Faculté de droit, Université de Zagreb Croatia / Croatie

Mr/M Giacomo MAZZONE

Member of the Advisory board of the European Digital Media Observatory (EDMO), Expert of the EAC High Level panel in charge of digital literacy /

Membre du conseil consultatif de l'Observatoire européen des médias numériques (EDMO), expert du panel de haut niveau de l'EAC en charge de la culture numérique ltaly / Italie

Mr/M Ronan Ó FATHAIGH

Senior researcher, Institute for Information Law (IVIR), Faculty of Law, University of Amsterdam Chercheur principal, Institut de droit de l'information (IVIR), Faculté de droit, Université d'Amsterdam The Netherlands / Pays-Bas

Ms/Mme Malgorzata PEK

Expert, Strategy Department, National Broadcasting Council's Office /

Expert, Département Conseil de la stratégie, Bureau du national de l'audiovisuel

Poland / Pologne

Mr/M Declan SHAW

Head of Team, Online Media Literacy and Analysis Team, Online Harms Directorate /

UK Department for Digital, Culture, Media, and Sport

Chef d'équipe, Équipe d'éducation et d'analyse des médias en ligne, Direction des préjudices en ligne,

Département britannique du numérique, de la culture, des médias et du sport

United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

Ms/Mme Nicole Sapfo STELLOU

Media Policy expert, Presidency of Government

Expert en politique des médias, Présidence du gouvernement

Greece / Grèce

Mr/M Cristian VACCARI

Professor of Political Communication and Co-Director of the Centre for Research in Communication and Culture, Loughborough University

Professeur de communication politique et codirecteur du Centre de recherche en communication et

culture, Université de Loughborough United Kingdom / Royaume-Uni

Mr/M Giovanni ZAGNI

Director, Pagella Politica / Facta.news Directeur, Pagella Politica / Facta.news Italy / Italie

PARTICIPANTS AND OBSERVERS / PARTICIPANTS ET OBSERVATEURS

ALBANIA /	Mr/M Andi MEÇI
ALBANIE	Inspector on the right to information, Right to Information Directorate-
	General, Information and Data Protection Commissioner /
	Inspecteur du droit à l'information, Direction générale du droit à
	l'information, Commissaire à l'information et à la protection des
	données
TÜRKİYE I TÜRKİYE	Mr/M Osman ARVAS
	Head of Department, Radio and Television Supreme Council /
	Chef de service, Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision
	Mr/M Atakan ERDEM
	Expert, Radio and Television Supreme Council /
	Expert, Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision

NON-MEMBER STATES / ETATS NON-MEMBRES

MOROCCO / MAROC	Mr/Mr El Mahdi AROUSSI IDRISSI
	Director of Legal Studies, High Authority for Audiovisual
	Communication /
	Directeur des études juridiques, Haute autorité de la
	communication audiovisuelle

OTHER INSTITUTIONS / AUTRES INSTUTIONS

EUROPEAN BROADCASTING UNION (EBU) / UNION EUROPEENNE DE RADIO-TELEVISION (UER)	Ms/Mme Sophia WISTEHUBE Legal Counsel / Conseiller juridique
KU LEUVEN CENTER FOR IT AND IP LAW	Ms/Mme Emine OZGE YILDIRIM-VRANCKAERT Doctoral Researcher / Chercheuse doctorante
REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS / REPORTERS SANS FRONTIÈRES	Mr/M Paul POUCHOUX Advocacy Officer/ Responsable du plaidoyer

SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT

INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION	Ms/Mme Artemiza-Tatiana CHISCA Head of Media and Internet Division, Secretary to the Steering committee on media and information society (CDMSI) / Chef de la Division médias et internet, Secrétaire du Comité directeur sur les médias et la société d'information (CDMSI)
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION	Ms/Mme Evangelia VASALOU Secretary to the Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) - Media and Internet Division / Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF), Division médias et internet
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION	Ms/Mme Irina TOMOVA Administrative Assistant, Media and Internet Division Assistante administrative, Division médias et internet
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION	Ms/Mme Hélène EIDENWEIL Administrative Assistant, Media and Internet Division Assistante administrative, Division médias et internet

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES

Mr/M Gillian WAKENHUT Ms/Mme Morgane LAMOTHE Mr/M Gregoire DEVICTOR