



**2nd meeting, 5-6 October 2022
Hybrid meeting via KUDO**

MEETING REPORT

Opening of the meeting

1. Mr Patrick Penninckx, Head of Information Society Department of the Council of Europe opened the meeting and welcomed members and participants, stressing the importance of the MSI-INF work, also in the light of the Organisation's priorities which include freedom of expression, media and internet governance and other information society issues. Mr Penninckx further elaborated on the complexity of the task before the Committee as there is no single solution to stop disinformation and invited the Committee to ensure that the future Guidance note contains clear, implementable and human rights-oriented guidance for policymakers, as well as for other relevant stakeholders.
2. The agenda of the meeting (Appendix 1), chaired by Ms Elisabeth Lambert (MSI-INF Chair) was adopted without amendment. Of the 38 participants (Appendix 2), there were 21 women (55%) and 17 men (45%). The meeting was attended by 12 members; Ms Marie MASDUPUY (France) had to step down as expert committee member.

Information by the Secretariat

3. Ms Emma Gruden, ad interim Secretary of the MSI-INF, provided additional information about the relevant developments in the standard-setting and other work of the Council of Europe bodies and structure. In particular, the Committee of Ministers adopted a number of relevant recommendations in early 2022: [CM/Rec\(2022\)11](#) on principles for media and communication governance, [CM/Rec\(2022\)12](#) on electoral communication and media coverage of election campaigns, [CM/Rec\(2022\)13](#) on the impacts of digital technologies on freedom of expression, [CM/Rec\(2022\)16](#) on combatting hate speech and [CM/Rec\(2022\)4](#) on promoting a favourable environment for quality journalism in the digital age. Regarding upcoming events of interests, the secretariat informed the members of an informal exchange of views between civil society representatives and the Committee of Ministers' GR-H (Group of Rapporteurs on Human Rights) on the topic of "addressing disinformation and propaganda within a human rights framework". The members were further informed of the holding of other events of potential interest:

the [European Anti-Slapp Conference 2022](#), organised by The European Centre for Press and Media Freedom (ECPMF) and the Coalition Against SLAPPs in Europe (CASE) and taking place on 20 October 2022; the [Public Service Media for Democracy conference](#) co-organised by COE and the EBU; and the [17th Internet Governance Forum \(IGF\)](#) in which the Council of Europe will organise and participate in a number of sessions.

Discussion of the draft Guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights' compliant manner

4. The ensuing discussion focused on the structure and content of the deliverable under the MSI-INF mandate - a future draft Guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights' compliant manner- that is expected to be finalised and submitted to the CDMSI for approval before the end of December 2023.
5. The rapporteurs - Mr Ronan Ó Fathaigh, Ms Sophie Lecheler and Mr Cristian Vaccari - started the discussion with a general presentation of the draft, developing on the general structure, scope and objectives of the document. The MSI-INF members welcomed the first draft, as prepared by the rapporteurs, commending the rapporteurs' effort to follow the agreed outline, elaborate on the issues discussed at the first meeting and integrate as many comments as possible.
6. The experts discussed the draft Guidance note section by section (fact-checking, platform design solutions, empowerment of users). They commented first on the Preamble and then the Guidelines to be provided by the future Guidance note in its Appendix, focusing especially on the elements that were still to be included or further elaborated.

Conclusions and decisions

7. **Regarding the overall text**, the experts agreed to focus discussions on practical aspects and collaboration between all stakeholders involved, while making sure there is no conflict of interest. They also agreed to underline principles of human rights and freedom of expression across each pillar of the future Guidance note and refer in the preamble to other rights that might be impacted by disinformation.
8. **Regarding the section on fact-checking**, the discussions focused among others, on clarifying what is feasible given the current regulatory landscape, the stakeholders involved in fact-checking (including the role of journalists), and the conditions that fact-checkers and fact-checking organisations require in order to operate most efficiently.
9. **On the section on platform design solutions**, the experts held lively debates on what actions States and platforms can undertake to encourage and support this ecosystem. They also raised the need for platforms to improve transparent data access on the effectiveness of different platform's counter-disinformation measures with researchers, particularly for researchers, and also ensure there are clear and effective appeal procedures for users.
10. **Regarding the last section on empowerment of users**, the experts exchanged on the need to put an emphasis on media and information literacy strategies and for digital tools to be developed and used in an accessible way for their ultimate beneficiaries, the users. This includes platforms developing safety by design features and also the role of other organisations working on safety tech to mitigate online

harms including misinformation and disinformation.

11. The idea of creating **a rolling list of best practices** and concrete examples emerged from several members, and it was agreed that the secretariat would inform the CDMSI of this proposal of a separate dynamic document, aimed at ensuring that respective recommendations are time-proof and take into account emerging and existing counter-disinformation initiatives that are proving to be effective.
12. The experts agreed to leave a number of detailed measures and references for **the future explanatory memorandum**, a brief accompanying text aimed at being as concrete as possible while also providing context and background to the complex challenge at issue in the main text.
13. As to the **timelines and follow-up**, a deadline of 31st October 2022 was set for written comments on the draft guidance note, whereupon the rapporteurs will revise the text, to be then sent to the Expert Committee for comments alongside with presenting it to the CDMSI for discussion at the next Plenary meeting. The work on the future explanatory memorandum will start after the discussion of the first draft Guidance note by the CDMSI, with the aim of proposing a preliminary draft explanatory memorandum to the expert committee at its 3rd meeting in March 2023, together with the draft Guidance note, as revised in the light of the feedback received from the CDMSI and MSI-INF members.

Any other business

14. In line with established practice, the Secretariat will prepare a draft meeting report to be sent to the Chair and Vice-Chair for consideration. Thereafter, the draft report will be sent to MSI-INF members, allowing for comments within five full working days. In the absence of comments, the report will be deemed finalised and will be transmitted to the CDMSI for information.

Date and place of next meeting

15. The third MSI-INF meeting will take place on 27-28 march, in a hybrid format.

COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON THE INTEGRITY OF ONLINE INFORMATION
(MSI-INF)

2nd Meeting Draft Agenda

5-6 October 2022, 10:00-12:30, 14:00-16:30

Hybrid meeting
(Strasbourg, Palais de l'Europe, Room 8 / online via the KUDO platform)

Day 1 – 5 October

09:30-10:00 – KUDO tests

1. Opening of the meeting

Patrick PENNINCKX, Head of information Society Department

2. Adoption of the agenda and order of business

MSI-INF (2022)05

Information by the Secretariat

3. Information on relevant developments in the standard-setting and other work of the Council of Europe bodies and structures

4. Discussion of the draft Guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights' compliant manner

Day 2 – 6 October

09:30-10:00 – KUDO tests

4. Discussion of the draft Guidance note - Continued

5. Any other business

6. Date and place of next meeting

Appendix 2

MSI-INF(2022)006
6 October 2022

Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) /

Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF)

2nd Meeting – 5-6 October 2022 (hybrid) /

2^e réunion – 5-6 octobre 2022 (hybride)

List of participants / Liste de participant.e.s

COMMITTEE MEMBERS / MEMBRES DU COMITE

Ms./Mme Roxana CLINCIU

Deputy Director / *Directrice adjointe*

Public Diplomacy and Strategic Communication Directorate / *Direction de la diplomatie publique et de la communication stratégique*

Ministry of Foreign Affairs / *Ministère des affaires étrangères*

Romania / *Roumanie*

Mr/M Andrin EICHIN

Senior Policy Advisor / *Conseiller politique principal pour les relations internationales*

Swiss Federal Office of Communications (OFCOM) / *Bureau fédéral suisse de la communication (OFCOM)*

Switzerland / *Suisse*

Ms./Mme Paula FRAGA-LAMAS

IEEE Senior Member, Senior researcher and lecturer / *Membre senior de l'IEEE, chercheur principal et conférencier*

Department of computer engineering, University of A Coruña (UDC) / *Département de génie informatique, Université de la Corogne (UDC)*

Spain / *Espagne*

Ms./Mme Puck GORRISEN

Policy Officer – Democracy / *Résponsable des politiques de la démocratie*

Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations of the Netherlands / *Ministère des Affaires intérieures et des Relations au sein du Royaume*

The Netherlands / *Pays-Bas*

Ms./Mme Beth LAMBERT

Head of Counter Online Manipulation / *Chef de la lutte contre la manipulation en ligne*

Department for Digital, Culture, media and Sport / *Service du numérique, de la culture, des médias et du sport*

United Kingdom / *Royaume-Uni*

Ms./Mme Sophie LECHERER

Professor of Political Communication / *Professeur de communication politique*
Department of Communication, University of Vienna / *Département de communication,*
Université de Vienne
Austria / *Autriche*

Mr/M Hrvoje LISIČAR

Chair of Information Technology Law / *Président du droit des technologies de l'information*
Faculty of Law, University of Zagreb / *Faculté de droit, Université de Zagreb*
Croatia / *Croatie*

Mr/M Giacomo MAZZONE

Member of the Advisory board of the European Digital Media Observatory (EDMO) / *Membre du conseil consultatif de l'Observatoire européen des médias numériques (EDMO)*
Expert of the EAC High Level panel in charge of digital literacy / *expert du panel de haut niveau de l'EAC en charge de la culture numérique*
Italy / *Italie*

Mr/M Ronan Ó FATHAIGH

Senior researcher, Institute for Information Law (IViR), Faculty of Law, University of Amsterdam
Chercheur principal, Institut de droit de l'information (IViR), Faculté de droit, Université d'Amsterdam
The Netherlands / *Pays-Bas*

Ms./Mme Malgorzata PEK

Expert / *Expert*
Strategy Department, National Broadcasting Council's Office / *Département Conseil de la stratégie, Bureau du national de l'audiovisuel*
Poland / *Pologne*

Mr/M Cristian VACCARI

Professor of Political Communication and Co-Director of the Centre for Research in Communication and Culture, Loughborough University
Professeur de communication politique et codirecteur du Centre de recherche en communication et culture, Université de Loughborough
United Kingdom / *Royaume-Uni*

Mr/M Giovanni ZAGNI

Director, Pagella Politica / *Facta.news*
Directeur, Pagella Politica / Facta.news
Italy / *Italie*

PARTICIPANTS AND OBSERVERS / PARTICIPANTS ET OBSERVATEURS

CYPRUS / CHYPRE	Ms./Mme Natassa AVRAAMIDES-HARATSI Press and Information Officer / <i>Attaché de presse et d'information</i> Ministry of Interior / <i>Ministère de l'intérieur</i>
GREECE / GRÈCE	Ms./Mme Nicole STELLOU Media Policy expert / <i>Expert en politique des médias</i> General Secretariat of Communications and Media / <i>Secrétariat général de la communication et des médias</i> Ministry of Digital Governance / <i>Ministère de la Gouvernance numérique</i>
ITALY / ITALIE	Ms./Mme Alessandra PIERUCCI Chair of the Consultative Committee of Convention 108 / <i>Président du Comité Consultatif de la Convention 108</i> Italian Data Protection Authority / <i>Autorité italienne de protection des données</i>
POLAND / POLOGNE	Iwona PIORKOWSKA-KAPICA Senior Specialist / <i>Spécialiste principale</i> International Cooperation Division / <i>Division de la coopération internationale</i> International Cooperation and Education Department / <i>Département de la coopération internationale et de l'éducation</i> Personal Data Protection Office / <i>Bureau de la protection des données personnelles</i>
PORTUGAL / PORTUGAL	Ms./Mme Inés OLIVEIRA Legislative Policy Consultant / <i>Consultant en politique législative</i> Data protection office of the Ministry of justice / <i>Bureau de protection des données du ministère de la Justice</i>
SERBIA / SERBIE	Ms./Mme Gordana MOHOROVIC Assistant General Secretary / <i>Secrétaire général adjoint</i> Sector for Cooperation and Reporting / <i>Secteur de la coopération et des rapports</i> Commissioner for Information of Public Importance and Personal Data Protection / <i>Commissaire à l'information d'intérêt public et de la protection des données personnelles</i>
TÜRKIYE / TÜRKIYE	Mr/M Muhammet GÖK Expert / <i>Expert</i> Radio and Television Supreme Council / <i>Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision</i> Mr/M Salih KARABULUT Expert / <i>Expert</i> Radio and Television Supreme Council / <i>Conseil suprême de la radio et de la télévision</i>
UKRAINE / UKRAINE	Mr/M Hordii RUMIANTSEV Expert of Online-safety Group / <i>Expert du groupe de sécurité en ligne</i> Ministry of Digital Transformation / <i>Ministère de la transformation numérique</i>

**NON-MEMBER STATES HAVING OBSERVER STATUS WITH THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE /
ETATS NON MEMBRES AYANT LE STATUT D'OBSERVATEUR AUPRES DU CONSEIL DE
L'EUROPE**

MEXICO / MEXIQUE	Mr/M José Alfonso SUÁREZ DEL REAL Y AGUILERA Ambassador Plenipotentiary - Permanent Observer / <i>Ambassadeur Plénipotentiaire - Observateur Permanent</i> Permanent Representation of Mexico to the Council of Europe / Mission Permanente du Mexique auprès du Conseil de l'Europe
-------------------------	--

NON-MEMBER STATES / ETATS NON-MEMBRES

MOROCCO / MAROC	Mr/M Othmane ALAMI LAKTIB Executive, Legal Studies Department / <i>Cadre, Département des études juridiques</i> High Authority for Audiovisual Communication / <i>Haute autorité de la communication audiovisuelle</i>
------------------------	---

OTHER INSTITUTIONS / AUTRES INSTITUTIONS

IEEE	Mr/M Sean LA ROQUE-DOHERTY, Esq Attorney & Counsellor at Law, IEEE member / <i>Avocat et conseiller juridique, membre du IEEE</i>
MEDIACLAN	Mr/M Michael EISENRIEGLER Partner / Partenaire
META	Ms./Mme Lara Levet Public Policy Manager EU Affairs / <i>Responsable politiques publiques Affaires européennes</i>
MICROSOFT	Ms/Mme Catalina GEMANARI Assistant to Tjade STROBAND, Director - European Government Affairs / <i>Assistante de Tjade STROBAND, Directeur - Affaires gouvernementales européennes</i>
REPORTERS SANS FRONTIÈRES (RSF) / REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS (RSF)	Mr/M Paul COPPIN Legal Officer / <i>Responsable juridique</i>
VDE ASSOCIATION FOR ELECTRICAL, ELECTRONIC & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGIES / VDE ASSOCIATION POUR LES TECHNOLOGIES ÉLECTRIQUES, ÉLECTRONIQUES ET DE L'INFORMATION	Mr/M Sebastian HALLENSLEBEN Head of Digitalisation and AI, Chair CEN-CENELEC JTC 21 AI / <i>Responsable de la numérisation et de l'IAm Président CEN- CENELEC JTC 21 AI</i>

SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT

<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY - ACTION AGAINST CRIME DIRECTORATE – <i>DIRECTION DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION - LUTTE CONTRE LA CRIMINALITE</i></p>	<p>Mr / M. Jan KLEIJSEN <i>Director / Directeur</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Mr/M Patrick PENNINGCKX <i>Head of Department / Chef du service</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Ms./Mme Artemiza-Tatiana CHISCA <i>Head of Media and Internet Division, Secretary to the Steering committee on media and information society (CDMSI) / Chef de la Division médias et internet, Secrétaire du Comité directeur sur les médias et la société d'information (CDMSI)</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Ms./Mme Urška UMEK <i>Head of Media Unit, Media and Internet Division, Secretary to the Committee of Experts on Increasing the Resilience of Media / Chef d'unité médias, Division médias et internet, Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur le renforcement de la résilience des médias</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Ms./Mme Emma GRUDEN <i>Secretary to the Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) - Media and Internet Division / Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF), Division médias et internet</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Ms./Mme Giulia LUCCHESI <i>Secretary to the Committee of Experts on Strategic Lawsuits against Public Participation (MSI-SLP), Administrator, Media and Internet Division / Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur les poursuites stratégiques contre la participation publique (MSI-SLP), Administratrice, Division médias et internet</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Ms./Mme Rodica CIOCHINA <i>Administrator, Media and Internet Division / Administratrice, Division médias et internet</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Ms./Mme Irina TODOROVA-TOMOVA <i>Assistant, Media and Internet Division / Assistante, Division médias et internet</i></p>
<p>INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</p>	<p>Ms./Mme Marie GASSER <i>Trainee, Media and Internet Division / Stagiaire, Division médias et internet</i></p>

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES
Ms./Mme Clarissa WORSDALE
Ms./Mme Sara WEBSTER

KUDO technician / Technicien KUDO
Ms./Mme Sarah LINDER