

Committee of experts on the integrity of online information (MSI-INF)**MSI-INF(2022)004
30 March 2022****1st meeting, 15-16 March 2022****Online meeting via KUDO****MEETING REPORT****Opening, agenda, elections**

1. Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society - Action against Crime Directorate, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law, opened the meeting. Underlining the importance attached by the [Council of Europe](#) to the standard-setting work carried out by Steering and Expert Committees, he pointed out that the [MSI-INF](#) was starting its work in a particularly complex context. In parallel with the MSI-INF meeting, the [PACE](#) is holding an extraordinary session to debate the consequences of the aggression of the Russian Federation against Ukraine. Just after the recent 'infodemic' around COVID, we see dis- and mis-information being used as warfare. This aggravates threats to the freedom of the media and further diminishes access to truthful and reliable information. Against this background, the task before the MSI-INF is urgent and important as ever. He further provided information about the work of other Council of Europe Committees of immediate relevance for the MSI-INF: the [Council of Europe Committee on Artificial intelligence \(CAI\)](#), [Consultative Committee to the Convention 108](#)¹ and the [Cybercrime Convention Committee](#)², and also mentioned the [Council of Europe's partnership with business](#), which allows internet companies and their representative associations to take part in committee meetings and make valuable input in their work. He encouraged cooperation between the Committees and with relevant partners.

Mr Taavo Lumiste, Chair of the [Steering Committee on Media and Information Society \(CDMSI\)](#), welcomed members and participants and provided information on the [CDMSI](#), to which the MSI-INF is a sub-ordinate body, as well as on its activities and priorities within the current biennium and beyond. He once again stressed the importance of the task before the MSI-INF and asked the Committee to ensure that the future guidance note contains clear, implementable and human rights oriented guidance for policymakers, as well as for other relevant stakeholders. He further encouraged

¹ Consultative Committee to the Council of Europe Convention for the protection of individuals with regard to the processing of personal data (as amended by its Amending Protocol CETS.223).

² Committee to the Council of Europe Convention on Cybercrime.

the MSI-INF to work, where necessary, in cooperation with its sister-committees: [Committee of Experts on Increasing Resilience of Media \(MSI-RES\)](#) and [Committee of Experts on Strategic Lawsuits against Public Participation \(MSI-SLP\)](#).

2. The MSI-INF members adopted the [meeting agenda](#) (Appendix 1) without amendment. The list of meeting participants appears in Appendix 2. Of the total of 51 participants, there were 30 women (59%) and 21 men (41%).

3. Ms Elena Dodonova, Secretary to the MSI-INF, introduced the main objectives of Council of Europe standard-setting work and presented the working methods of expert committees, in line with [Resolution CM/Res\(2021\)3](#) on intergovernmental committees and subordinate bodies, their terms of reference and working methods. She also provided some background to the [MSI-INF's Terms of Reference](#) and the expected deliverable, as well as a brief overview of the Council of Europe standard-setting and other documents of relevance for the MSI-INF (the list of reference documents is available on the [MSI-INF website](#)).

4. In a *tour de table*, members of the MSI-INF introduced themselves, and the Committee proceeded to elections. With only one candidate proposed for each of the functions, the MSI-INF unanimously elected Ms Elizabeth Lambert (the United Kingdom) as its Chair and Mr Hrvoje Lisičar (Croatia) as its Vice-chair. Ms Malgorzata Pek (Poland) was appointed Gender Equality Rapporteur. The elections were conducted using the messaging function in the KUDO videoconferencing system, since no member requested a secret ballot.

5. The meeting was further chaired by Ms Elizabeth Lambert. Members of the MSI-INF presented their initial views on the most important challenges to be addressed by the Committee. The ensuing discussion focused on the scope, form and structure of the deliverable that it is expected to finalise by the end of its mandate in December 2023.

Conclusions and decisions

6. As to the draft *guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner*, the MSI-INF agreed to build the initial structure of the document around three main themes: (i) recommendations on fact checking, its potential, limitations and role in countering dis- and mis-information, including recommendations on the emerging technologies used to support it; (ii) recommendations on platform design solutions for countering dis- and mis-information, including the necessary degree of state regulation to ensure due transparency and accountability; (iii) recommendations on the empowerment of users, including addressing language barriers. The human rights based approach shall be streamlined as a cross-cutting perspective throughout the document. It was further suggested that the terms 'disinformation' and 'misinformation' would need to be clarified, taking into account existing legal definitions. The guidance note should clearly build on previous Council of Europe standard-setting work, drawing also from related work of other international organisations.

The Committee considered that the guidance should be as concrete as possible and noted at the same time the importance of enhancing the problem identification and providing context and background to the complex challenge at issue. It was therefore agreed to complement the future guidance note with an explanatory memorandum as an interpretative support tool.

7. Commending their readiness to take up the commitment, the MSI-INF appointed Mr Ronan Ó Fathaigh, Ms Sophie Lecheler and Mr Cristian Vaccari as rapporteurs for the draft guidance note and its explanatory memorandum.

8. The MSI-INF agreed to continue its work in line with the draft roadmap (Appendix 3). Deadlines were set at the meeting for the rapporteurs to prepare an outline of the draft guidance note (second half of May 2022) and for the Committee to provide written feedback on the outline (early June 2022).

9. The MSI-INF agreed to hold its second meeting on 5-6 October 2022. Should the public health situation permit, the meeting will be held onsite in Strasbourg, with a possibility for online participation.

Any other business

10. The Secretariat will prepare a draft meeting report, to be sent to the Chair and Vice-Chair for consideration. Thereafter, the Secretariat will send the draft report to the MSI-INF, allowing for comments within five full working days. In the absence of comments, the report will be deemed finalised and will be transmitted to the CDMSI for information. The progress of work of the MSI-INF will be reflected in its draft documents and the reports of its meetings.

Appendix 1**1st Meeting Agenda**

15-16 March 2022, 10:00-12:30, 14:00-16:30

Online via the Kudo platform

Day 1 – 15 March

09:30-10:00 – KUDO tests

Opening of the meeting

1. Jan KLEIJSEN, Director, Information Society - Action against Crime Directorate, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law

Taavo LUMISTE, Chair of the Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI)

-
- | | | |
|----|---|-----------------|
| 2. | Adoption of the agenda and order of business | MSI-INF (2022)1 |
|----|---|-----------------|
-

Information by the Secretariat

3.
 - Introduction to the working methods and procedures of intergovernmental committees and subordinate bodies [CM/Res\(2021\)3](#)
 - Information on the aims and working methods of the Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information [Extract from CM\(2021\)131-addfinal](#)
-

4. **Tour de table**
Brief self-introduction by the Committee Members
-

Elections

5. Election of the Chair and Vice-Chair and appointment of the Gender Equality Rapporteur
-

Discussion of the Terms of Reference of the MSI-INF

6. The Committee of Experts will discuss the structure and scope of the text which it is expected to deliver at the end of its mandate: *Guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner*, and will designate the drafting rapporteur(s).

[Terms of Reference of the MSI-INF](#), extracted from [CM\(2021\)131-addfinal](#)

Lunch Break

-
6. **Discussion of the Terms of Reference - Continued**

[Terms of Reference of the MSI-INF](#), extracted from [CM\(2021\)131-addfinal](#)

Day 2 – 16 March

09:30-10:00 – KUDO tests

6. **Discussion of the Terms of Reference - Continued**

Lunch Break

-
6. **Discussion of the Terms of Reference - Continued**

-
7. **Discussion of the timeline for the MSI-INF (2022-2023)**

-
8. **Any other business**

-
9. **Date and place of next meeting**
-

Appendix 2

1st Meeting – 15-16 March 2022 (online) /*1^e réunion – 15-16 mars 2022 (en ligne)***List of participants / Liste de participant.e.s****COMMITTEE MEMBERS / MEMBRES DU COMITE**

<p>Ms/Mme Roxana CLINCIU Deputy Director, Public Diplomacy and Strategic Communication Directorate, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (ROMANIA) <i>Directrice adjointe, Direction de la diplomatie publique et de la communication stratégique, Ministère des affaires étrangères (ROUMANIE)</i></p>
<p>Mr/M Andrin EICHIN Senior Policy Advisor, Swiss Federal Office of Communications (OFCOM) (SWITZERLAND) <i>Conseiller politique principal pour les relations internationales, Bureau fédéral suisse de la communication (OFCOM), (SUISSE)</i></p>
<p>Ms/Mme Puck GORRISEN Policy Officer – Democracy, Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations of the Netherlands (THE NETHERLANDS) <i>Chargée de mission Démocratie, Ministère des Affaires intérieures et des Relations au sein du Royaume (PAYS-BAS)</i></p>
<p>Ms/Mme Beth LAMBERT Head of Counter Online Manipulation, Department for Digital, Culture, media and Sport (UNITED KINGDOM) <i>Chef de la lutte contre la manipulation en ligne, Département du numérique, de la culture, des médias et du sport (ROYAUME-UNI)</i></p>
<p>Mr/M Hrvoje LISIČAR Chair of Information Technology Law, Faculty of Law, University of Zagreb (CROATIA) <i>Président du droit des technologies de l'information, Faculté de droit, Université de Zagreb (CROATIE)</i></p>
<p>Ms/Mme Marie MASDUPUY Ambassador for the fight against the manipulation of information, Ministry for Europe and Foreign Affairs, (FRANCE) <i>Ambassadrice pour la lutte contre la manipulation de l'information, Ministère de l'Europe et des Affaires étrangères (FRANCE)</i></p>
<p>Ms/Mme Malgorzata PEK Expert, Strategy Department, National Broadcasting Council's Office (POLAND) <i>Expert, Département Conseil de la stratégie, Bureau du national de l'audiovisuel (POLOGNE)</i></p>

<p>Ms/Mme Paula FRAGA-LAMAS IEEE Senior Member, Senior researcher and lecturer, University of A Coruña (UDC), Department of computer engineering <i>Membre senior de l'IEEE, chercheur principal et conférencier, Université de la Corogne (UDC), Département de génie informatique</i></p>
<p>Ms/Mme Sophie LECHERER Professor of Political Communication, Department of Communication, University of Vienna <i>Professeur de communication politique, Département de communication, Université de Vienne</i></p>
<p>Mr/M Giacomo MAZZONE Member of the Advisory board of the European Digital Media Observatory (EDMO) <i>Membre du conseil consultatif de l'Observatoire européen des médias numériques (EDMO), expert du panel de haut niveau de l'EAC en charge de la culture numérique</i></p>
<p>Mr/M Ronan Ó FATHAIGH Senior researcher, Institute for Information Law (IViR), Faculty of Law, University of Amsterdam <i>Chercheur principal, Institut de droit de l'information (IViR), Faculté de droit, Université d'Amsterdam</i></p>
<p>Mr/M Cristian VACCARI Professor of Political Communication and Co-Director of the Centre for Research in Communication and Culture, Loughborough University <i>Professeur de communication politique et codirecteur du Centre de recherche en communication et culture, Université de Loughborough</i></p>
<p>Mr/M Giovanni ZAGNI Director, Pagella Politica / Facta.news <i>Directeur, Pagella Politica / Facta.news</i></p>

COUNCIL OF EUROPE MEMBER STATES / ÉTATS MEMBRES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

ESTONIA / ESTONIE	<p>Mr/M Taavo LUMISTE Chair of the CDMSI - Steering committee on media and information society <i>Président du CDMSI - comité directeur sur les médias et la société de l'information</i></p>
POLAND / POLOGNE	<p>Ms/Mme Iwona PIÓRKOWSKA-KAPICA Senior Specialist, International Cooperation and Education Department, Personal Data Protection Office <i>Spécialiste principal, département de la coopération internationale et de l'éducation, Office de la protection des données à caractère personnel</i></p>
PORTUGAL / PORTUGAL	<p>Ms/Mme Inês OLIVEIRA Legislative Policy Consultant, Data protection office of the Ministry of justice <i>Consultant en politique législative, Bureau de protection des données du ministère de la Justice</i></p>

SPAIN / ESPAGNE	Mr/M José FERRER
------------------------	-------------------------

NON-MEMBER STATES REPRESENTATIVES / REPRESENTANT.E.S DES ETATS NON-MEMBRES

MOROCCO / MAROC	<p>Ms/Mme Meriem KHATOURI Director of Studies and Media Development – Communication Department, Ministry of Youth, Culture and Communication <i>Directrice des Études et du Développement des Médias- Département de la Communication, Ministère de la Jeunesse, de la Culture et de la Communication</i></p> <p>Ms/Mme Chanaz EL AKRICH Head of the Cooperation Division, Ministry of Youth, Culture and Communication <i>Cheffe de Division de la Coopération, Ministère de la Jeunesse, de la Culture et de la Communication</i></p>
------------------------	---

OTHER PARTICIPANTS / AUTRES PARTICIPANT.E.S

ANDORRAN DATA PROTECTION AGENCY / AGENCE ANDORRANE DE PROTECTION DES DONNÉES	Ms/Mme Reshma HARISH PUNJABI Head of the Andorran Data Protection Agency <i>Chef de l'Agence andorrane de protection des données</i>
ARTICLE 19/ ARTICLE 19	Ms/Mme Chantal JORIS Legal Officer <i>Responsable juridique</i>
DELEGATION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION TO THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE / DÉLÉGATION DE L'UNION EUROPÉENNE AUPRES LE CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE	Ms/Mme Aurelia BEIKÜFNER Legal Affairs Trainee <i>Stagiaire en affaires juridiques</i>
EUROPEAN AUDIOVISUAL OBSERVATORY / OBSERVATOIRE EUROPEEN DE L'AUDIOVISUEL	<p>Ms/Mme Maja CAPPELLO Head of the Department for Legal Information <i>Chef du département de l'information juridique</i></p> <p>Ms/Mme Sophie VALAIS Senior Legal Adviser <i>Conseiller juridique principal</i></p>
COMMISSIONER FOR INFORMATION OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE AND	Ms/Mme Gordana MOHOROVIC Assistant General Secretary, Sector for Cooperation and Reporting <i>Secrétaire général adjoint, Secteur de la coopération et des rapports</i>

<p>PERSONAL DATA PROTECTION – SERBIA / COMMISSAIRE À L'INFORMATION D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC ET DE PROTECTION DES DONNÉES PERSONNELLES</p>	
<p>HIGH AUTHORITY FOR AUDIOVISUAL COMMUNICATION, MOROCCO / HAUTE AUTORITE DE LA COMMUNICATION AUDIOVISUELLE, MAROC</p>	<p>Mr/M El Mahdi AROUSSI IDRISSE Director of the Legal Studies Department <i>Directeur du département des études juridiques</i></p> <p>Mr/M Othmane ALAMI LAKTIB Executive, Legal Studies Department <i>Cadre, Département des études juridiques</i></p>
<p>IEEE</p>	<p>Mr/M Sean LA ROQUE-DOHERTY, Esq Attorney & Counselor at Law, IEEE member <i>Avocat et conseiller juridique, membre du IEEE</i></p>
<p>ITALIAN DATA PROTECTION AUTHORITY / AUTORITÉ ITALIENNE DE PROTECTION DES DONNÉES</p>	<p>Ms/Mme Alessandra PIERUCCI Chair of the Consultative Committee of Convention 108 <i>Président du Comité Consultatif de la Convention 108</i></p>
<p>ISOC</p>	<p>Mr/M Robin WILTON Director - Internet Trust, Internet Society <i>Directeur - Internet Trust, Internet Society</i></p>
<p>MICROSOFT</p>	<p>Ms/Mme Catherine GARCIA-VAN HOOGSTRATEN Director of Responsible Technology- European Government Affairs <i>Directeur de la technologie responsable - Affaires gouvernementales européennes</i></p> <p>Ms/Mme Anahita VALAKCHE Policy Coordinator <i>Coordinateur des politiques</i></p>
<p>OFFICE OF THE ALBANIAN INFORMATION AND DATA PROTECTION COMMISSIONER / BUREAU DU COMMISSAIRE ALBANAIS A L'INFORMATION ET A LA PROTECTION DES DONNEES</p>	<p>Mr/M Segi BERBERI Inspector <i>Inspecteur</i></p>

OSCE REPRESENTATIVE ON FREEDOM OF THE MEDIA / <i>REPRÉSENTANT DE L'OSCE POUR LA LIBERTÉ DES MÉDIAS</i>	Ms/Mme Deniz WAGNER Adviser <i>Conseiller</i>
REPORTERS SANS FRONTIÈRES (RSF) / <i>REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS (RSF)</i>	Mr/M Paul COPPIN Legal Officer <i>Responsable juridique</i>
RADIO AND TELEVISION SUPREME COUNCIL OF TURKEY / <i>CONSEIL SUPRÊME DE LA RADIO ET DE LA TÉLÉVISION DE TURQUIE</i>	Mr/M Muhammet GÖK Expert Mr/M Salih KARABULUT Expert
SPANISH DATA PROTECTION AGENCY / <i>AGENCE ESPAGNOLE DE PROTECTION DES DONNÉES</i>	Mr/M Pablo Manuel MATEOS GASCUEÑA Head of International Relations Service, International Division <i>Chef du Service des relations internationales, Division internationale</i>

MSI-INF SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT DU MSI-INF

INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIÉTÉ DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Ms/Mme Elena DODONOVA Secretary to the Committee of Experts on the Integrity of Online Information (MSI-INF) - Administrator, Media and Internet Division <i>Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur l'intégrité de l'information en ligne (MSI-INF), Administratrice, Division médias et internet</i>
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIÉTÉ DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Ms/Mme Irina TODOROVA-TOMOVA Assistant, Media and Internet Division <i>Assistante, Division médias et internet</i>

COUNCIL OF EUROPE SECRETARIAT / SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

DIRECTORATE GENERAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND RULE OF LAW / DIRECTION <i>GENERALE DROITS DE L'HOMME ET ETAT DE DROIT</i>	Mr/M Jan KLEIJSEN Director, Information Society – Action against Crime Directorate, Directorate General Human Rights and Rule of Law <i>Directeur, Direction de la société de l'information et de la lutte contre la criminalité, Direction générale Droits de l'Homme et Etat de droit</i>
---	--

INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Mr/M Patrick PENNINCKX Head of Information Society Department <i>Chef du Service de la société de l'information</i>
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Ms/Mme Artemiza-Tatiana CHISCA Head of Media and Internet Division, Secretary to the Steering committee on media and information society (CDMSI) <i>Chef de la Division médias et internet, Secrétaire du Comité directeur sur les médias et la société d'information (CDMSI)</i>
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Ms/Mme Urška UMEK Head of Media Unit, Media and Internet Division, Secretary to the Committee of Experts on Increasing the Resilience of Media <i>Chef d'unité médias, Division médias et internet, Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur le renforcement de la résilience des médias</i>
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Ms/Mme Giulia LUCCHESI Secretary to the Committee of Experts on Strategic Lawsuits against Public Participation (MSI-SLP), Administrator, Media and Internet Division <i>Secrétaire du Comité d'experts sur les poursuites stratégiques contre la participation publique (MSI-SLP), Administratrice, Division médias et internet</i>
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Ms Rodica CIOCHINA Administrator, Media and Internet Division <i>Administratrice, Division médias et internet</i>
INFORMATION SOCIETY DEPARTMENT / SERVICE <i>DE LA SOCIETE DE L'INFORMATION</i>	Ms/Mme Emma GRUDEN Assistant, Media and Internet Division <i>Assistante, Division médias et internet</i>

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRÈTES**Ms/Mme Elisabetta BASSU****Mr/M Luke TILDEN****MS/Mme Lucie DE BURLET****KUDO technician / Technicien KUDO****Mr/M Renaud MOREUILLE**

Appendix 3

Roadmap of the MSI-INF

2022

15-16 March - 1st MSI-INF meeting

- Introduction into working methods and processes
- Election of the Chair and Vice-chair, appointment of drafting rapporteur/s
- Discussion of the scope and main issues to be covered in the deliverable

7 April – 22nd CDMSI Bureau meeting

- Report on the 1st MSI-INF meeting

1-3 June - 21st CDMSI Plenary meeting

- Report on the 1st MSI-INF meeting and work progress
- CDMSI orientation on the deliverable and timetable

March – August (intersessional work)

Development of the first draft of the *guidance note on countering the spread of online mis- and disinformation through fact-checking and platform design solutions in a human rights compliant manner* by the drafting rapporteur/s, with assistance from the Secretariat.

September/October - 2nd MSI-INF meeting

- Discussion of the first draft of the guidance note

October/November – 23rd CDMSI Bureau meeting

- Report on the 2nd MSI-INF meeting and overall work progress
- Invitation to CDMSI members to provide feedback on the draft guidance note at the Plenary meeting

November/December – 22nd CDMSI Plenary meeting

- Report on the 2nd MSI-INF meeting and overall work progress
- CDMSI feedback on and input into the draft guidance note

September 2022 – February 2023 (intersessional work)

Integration of feedback and comments received at the 2nd MSI-INF meeting and at the 22nd CDMSI Plenary meeting in the draft guidance note by the drafting rapporteur/s, with assistance from the Secretariat.

2023

March/April - 3rd MSI-INF meeting

- Discussion of the advanced draft of the guidance note
- Agreement to consult with relevant steering and conventional committees

April/May – 24th CDMSI Bureau meeting

- Report on the 3rd MSI-INF meeting and overall work progress
- Invitation to CDMSI members to provide feedback on the advanced draft of the guidance note at the Plenary meeting

May/June – 23rd CDMSI Plenary meeting

- Report on the 3rd MSI-INF meeting and overall work progress
- CDMSI feedback on and input into the draft guidance note

March – August (intersessional work)

Finalisation of the draft guidance note by the drafting rapporteur/s, with assistance from the Secretariat, based on the comments and feedback received at the 3rd MSI-INF meeting, at the 23rd CDMSI Plenary meeting and from consultations with relevant steering and conventional committees.

September/October – 4th MSI-INF meeting

- Discussion and finalisation of the draft guidance note
- Agreement by MSI-INF to submit the finalised draft guidance note to the CDMSI for adoption

October/November – 25th CDMSI Bureau meeting

- Report on the 4th MSI-INF meeting and overall work progress
- Discussion of the draft guidance note
- Agreement by the Bureau to put the item on the draft guidance note on the agenda of the CDMSI Plenary meeting for adoption

November/December – 24th CDMSI Plenary meeting

- Report on the 4th MSI-INF meeting and overall work progress
- Discussion and finalisation of the draft guidance note
- Adoption of the guidance note by the CDMSI