



Declassified¹

AS/Soc/NCP (2022) PV05add

31 January 2023

Asocncppv05add_2022

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Network of Contact Parliamentarians for a healthy environment

Minutes of public hearings

Held in İzmir (Türkiye) on 23 September 2022

(Concerns points 4 and 5 of the agenda)

1. Mitigating the climate crisis: municipal action for the sustainability of energy and water supplies

The President welcomed the guests, recalling that the city of İzmir was the winner of the Europe Prize 2022 and that a prize-giving ceremony was scheduled for the following day. İzmir was one of the largest cities among the member States of the Council of Europe, with a population as large as that of the Flanders region.

Before giving the floor to Mr Soyer, Mayor of İzmir, he explained that he had had an exchange with Mr Bart Sommers, the current Federal Minister of the Interior of Belgium and former Mayor of Malines/Mechelen, who had been recognised in 2016 as the best mayor in the world by the City Mayors foundation. Mr Sommers was interested in co-operation between the city of İzmir and his municipality of Malines/Mechelen.

Mr Soyer explained that it was a huge honour to welcome the members in İzmir and to have the opportunity to present what had been achieved by his city in the last four years. Each municipality had to prepare a strategic plan aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). His first objective was to create parks accessible by public transport. The total area of green spaces had increased from 16 to 50 ha. The municipal strategy, distributed to members, applied the concepts of “Natural Green” aiming to use native plants and of “Sponge City” to recover and recycle water. 5000 buildings had already been equipped for that. The city had been able to develop public transport with the launch of tramway lines and the optimisation of riverbeds. İzmir was a modern city where neither the poor nor the rich needed cars. Waste was treated as raw materials, which could also help create jobs. The preservation of the environment was a high priority to allow the city to develop in harmony with nature.

Mr Gümrükçü, Mayor of Çiğli, was also a member of ICLEI. Çiğli was a green city, crossed by a river where 300 species of wild bird nested, including flamingos. The city had a tram and a sailing boat service for transportation.

Mr Tugay, Mayor of Karşıyaka, explained that his city, which worked with six other municipalities, was committed to fighting against the Anthropocene. The city had identified areas to store carbon and created positive energy zones.

Ms Estrela thanked the mayors and shared her admiration for the work accomplished within the framework of their mandates. She had been mayor for eight years and knew the difficulties faced by local elected officials. She asked how mayors approached the environmental education.

Mr Grin congratulated the mayors for their accomplishments and asked them about the origin of the municipalities' drinking water.

Mr Moutquin also congratulated the mayors for their ambitions in terms of access to green spaces. He asked if, as in Catalonia, they had already considered the creation of refuge areas to escape the strong summer heat and enquired about the state of relations with neighbouring Greek municipalities.

Ms Arslan paid tribute to the mayors for the use of police officers near schools. The diversification of their tasks was beneficial to the local community.

¹ The minutes were declassified by the Network of Contact Parliamentarians for a healthy environment at its meeting on 25 January 2023.

Mr Özsoy noted that the central government had poor relations with opposition mayors, including in South-eastern Türkiye, but not only there. There were also pressures on municipalities. His question concerned relations with the central administration.

Mr Famellos questioned the mayors on the balance between local economy and ecology.

Ms Ovchynnykova asked about the proportion of protected areas in Türkiye, which, in comparison, was only 7% in Ukraine.

Mr Schennach questioned the relationship between tourism and sustainable development.

The Mayor of İzmir responded by insisting on the need to protect the land and nature. It was necessary to redefine the rights of nature, to understand them and to respect them. Environmental education must be linked to the definition of democracy. İzmir was part of an alliance of Mediterranean cities. Regarding technical questions, he explained that most of the answers could be found in the strategy “İzmir's nature-based living strategy 2021–2030” which had been distributed to the members.

The Mayor of Çiğli explained that the cities of the region had put in place environmental services long time ago. There were some problems with water, especially because of the salinity of the soils. Cities often clashed with national authorities. His municipality, for example, opposed the construction of a bridge imposed by the national authorities; this had been replaced by a ferry service.

The Mayor of Karşıyaka called for direct exchanges between opposition cities and Europe. He insisted on the desire to take care of everything and cited the situation of stray dogs (who are identified and tagged).

Finally, **the Mayor of İzmir** explained that three hours would not be enough to describe the relations between the cities in opposition and the central government. He always sought the best solutions for his fellow citizens, above all.

2. Public governance of environmental policies: interplay between local authorities and national parliaments

Mr Bozoğlu, President of the Environmental Policy and Research Association, Deputy Director General of Ankara Municipality Water Services, was working on the implementation of the Paris Agreement. He had worked in a local community and explained that some laws were not applicable at the local level. Dialogue was needed for the law to be effective. Unfortunately, on waste, water, and energy transition there was no help from central authorities and cities were falling behind in deploying their plans.

Mr Bas, thematic spokesperson on environment and climate of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe, underlined that consultation was a central subject in the work of the Congress. Cities were at the heart of the solutions.

Mr Arikan, ICLEI Global Advocacy Manager, explained that many taboos had been broken. Cities dealt with a wide spectrum of issues, but environmental challenges were also the responsibility of national authorities.

Ms Tanguy returned to the issue of water and spoke about the means to reduce waste.

Mr Cegonho, as a former member of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities, spoke in favour of enhanced co-operation between the Assembly and the Congress.

ATTENDANCE LIST / LISTE DE PRESENCE

(The names of members who took part in the meeting are marked in bold / *Les noms des membres ayant pris part à la réunion sont en caractères gras*)

MEMBER STATES / ÉTATS MEMBRES

Albania / *Albanie*

Andorra / *Andorre*

Armenia/ *Arménie*

Mr Armen GEVORGYAN EC/DA

Austria / *Autriche*

Mr Stefan SCHENNACH SOC
Mr Michel REIMON SOC

Azerbaijan / *Azerbaïdjan*

Ms Sevinj FATALIYEVA EC/DA

Belgium / *Belgique*

Mr Rik DAEMS ALDE

Bosnia and Herzegovina

Ms Marina PENDEŠ EPP/CD
Mr Saša MAGAZINOVIĆ SOC

Bulgaria / *Bulgarie*

Croatia / *Croatie*

Ms Zdravka BUŠIĆ EPP/CD

Cyprus / *Chypre*

Czech Republic / *République tchèque*

Denmark / *Danemark*

Estonia / *Estonie*

Mr Urmas REITELMANN EC/DA

Finland / *Finlande*

Ms Minna REIJONEN EC/DA

France

Ms Liliana TANGUY ALDE

Georgia / *Géorgie*

Germany / *Allemagne*

Ms Franziska KERSTEN SOC

Greece / *Grèce*

Mr George PAPANDREOU SOC

Hungary / *Hongrie*

Iceland / *Islande*

Mr Bjarni JÓNSSON UEL

Ireland / *Irlande*

Mr Thomas PRINGLE UEL
Ms Róisín GARVEY SOC

Italy / *Italie*

Ms Maria RIZZOTTI EPP/CD

Latvia / *Lettonie*

Liechtenstein

Mr Peter FRICK ALDE

Lithuania / *Lituanie*

Luxembourg

M. Paul GALLES EPP/CD

Malta / *Malte*

Republic of Moldova / *République de Moldova*

Monaco	Mr José BADIA	EPP/CD
--------	---------------	--------

Montenegro / <i>Monténégro</i>	Mr Miloš KONATAR	SOC
--------------------------------	------------------	-----

Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Ms Margreet DE BOER	SOC
	Ms Agnes MULDER	EPP/CD

North Macedonia / *Macédoine du Nord*

Norway / <i>Norvège</i>	Ms Linda HOFSTAD HELLELAND	EPP/CD
-------------------------	----------------------------	--------

Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Marta KUBIAK	EC/DA
	Ms Danuta JAZLOWIECKA	EPP/CD

Portugal	Mr Pedro CEGONHO	SOC
----------	-------------------------	-----

Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Ms Maria Gabriela HORGA	EPP/CD
	Mr Viorel Riceard BADEA	EPP/CD

San Marino / *Saint-Marin*

Serbia / *Serbie*

Slovak Republic / *République slovaque*

Slovenia / *Slovénie*

Spain / *Espagne*

Sweden / *Suède*

Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	Mr Jean-Pierre GRIN	ALDE
	Mr Olivier FRANÇAIS	ALDE

Türkiye	Ms Emine Nur GÜNAY	NR
---------	--------------------	----

Ukraine	Ms Yuliia OVCHYNNYKOVA	ALDE
---------	------------------------	------

United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Baroness Doreen E. MASSEY	SOC
-------------------------------------	---------------------------	-----

OBSERVERS / OBSERVATEURS

Canada

Israel / <i>Israël</i>	Mr Yorai Lahav HERTZANU
------------------------	-------------------------

Mexico / *Mexique*

PARTNERS FOR DEMOCRACY / PARTENAIRES POUR LA DÉMOCRATIE

Jordan / *Jordanie*

Kyrgyzstan / *Kirghizstan*

Morocco / <i>Maroc</i>	Mr Allal AMRAOUI
------------------------	-------------------------

Palestine

PRESIDENT OF THE ASSEMBLY / PRÉSIDENT·E DE L'ASSEMBLÉE EX-OFFICIO MEMBER / MEMBRE D'OFFICE

Mr Tiny KOX	UEL
-------------	-----

**PRESIDENTS OF POLITICAL GROUPS / PRÉSIDENTS DES GROUPES POLITIQUES
EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS / MEMBRES D'OFFICE**

SOC	Mr Frank SCHWABE
EPP/ CD	Mr Aleksander POCIEJ
EC/DA	Mr Ian LIDDELL-GRAINGER
ALDE	Mr Iulian BULAI
UEL	Mr George KATROUGALOS

PACE COMMITTEES CONCERNED / COMMISSIONS DE L'APCE CONCERNÉES

Political Affairs / Questions politiques	M. Simon MOUTQUIN	SOC
Legal Affairs / Questions juridiques	Mr Ziya ALTUNYALDIZ	NR
Migration / Migrations	M. Pierre-Alain FRIDEZ	SOC
Equality / Égalité	Ms Edite ESTRELA	SOC
Culture	Ms Inka HOPUSU	SOC

**BUREAU OF THE COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL AFFAIRS /
BUREAU DE LA COMMISSION DES QUESTIONS SOCIALES
EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS / MEMBRES D'OFFICE**

Ms Selin SAYEK BÖKE , Chairperson / présidente	SOC
Mr Alain MILON , First Vice-Chairperson / premier vice-président	EPP/CD
Ms Olena KHOMENKO, Second Vice-Chairperson / deuxième vice-présidente	EC/DA
Ms Sibel ARSLAN , Third Vice-Chairperson / troisième vice-présidente	SOC

**CONGRESS OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL AUTHORITIES /
CONGRES DES POUVOIRS LOCAUX ET REGIONAUX**

Mr Cemal BAS, Spokesperson on Environment and Climate Change/ Porte-Parole sur l'environnement et le changement climatique

OTHER PARLIAMENTARIANS PRESENT / AUTRES PARLEMENTAIRES PRESENTS

Mr / M. Christian Petry	Germany / Allemagne
Mr / M. Sokratis Famellos	Greece / Grèce
Mr / M. Joseph O'Reilly	Ireland / Irlande
Mr / M. Antón Gómez-Reino	Spain / Espagne
Ms/ Mme Carmen Leyte	Spain / Espagne
Mr / M. Hişyar Özsoy	Türkiye

EXPERTS / EXPERT(E)S

Mr Tunç Soyer, Mayor of İzmir / Maire d'Izmir (Türkiye)
Mr Utku Gümrükçü, Mayor of Çiğli / Maire de Çiğli (Türkiye)
Mr Cemil Tugay, Mayor of Karşıyaka / Maire de Karşıyaka (Türkiye)

Mr Yunus Arikan, Director of Global Advocacy, ICLEI - Local Governments for Sustainability / *Directeur du plaidoyer mondial ICLEI ("Local Governments for Sustainability")*

Mr Baran Bozoğlu, Chair of Climate Policies and Research Association & Deputy Director of Water and Sewerage Administration, Ankara Municipality (Türkiye) / *Président de l'association des politiques et de la recherche environnementales, Directeur général adjoint des services des eaux de la municipalité d'Ankara (Türkiye)*

SECRETARIAT OF THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY /
SECRETARIAT DE L'ASSEMBLÉE PARLEMENTAIRE

Ms / Mme Despina Chatzivassiliou-Tsovilis, Secretary General of PACE / *Secrétaire générale de l'APCE*

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development /
Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

Ms / Mme Tanja Kleinsorge Head of the Secretariat / *Cheffe du Secrétariat*
Ms / Mme Aiste Ramanauskaite Secretary to the Committee / *Secrétaire de la commission*
Mr / M. Guillaume Parent Co-Secretary/ *Co-Secrétaire*
Ms / Mme Prisca Barthel Responsible for the Europe Prize / *Responsable du Prix de l'Europe*
Ms / Mme Bozhena Boriak Assistant / *Assistante*