



Declassified¹

AS/Soc (2023) PV02add3

27 April 2023

Asocpv02add3_2023

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development

Minutes

Of the public hearing on “Analysis and guidelines for a sustainable and socially fair energy transition” held in Marrakech on 16 March

In the framework of the report currently in preparation on “Analysis and guidelines for a sustainable and socially fair energy transition” by **Mr Antón Gómez-Reino** (Spain, UEL), the Committee **held** a public hearing with the participation of:

- ✓ **Ms Rajae Chafil**, Climate Change Competence Centre of Morocco (4C Maroc), member of the special Commission on the New Development Model
- ✓ **Mr Radouan Yessouf**, Assistant Director of the Centre for Strategy and Development of the Moroccan Agency for Energy Efficiency

Ms Olena Khomenko (Ukraine, EC/DA), Second Vice-Chairperson of the Committee, opened the hearing and introduced the guest speakers. She then presented the introductory memorandum prepared by Mr Gómez-Reino who had been unable to attend the meeting.

The rapporteur highlighted the challenge of fighting the climate crisis, preserving the integrity of ecosystems and protecting biodiversity. Economic transformation, in particular the transition to a more sustainable energy system, was central to this endeavour. However, this quest for green, clean, and renewable energies should not collide with natural ecosystems, nor with the social realities of various countries. There were both risks and opportunities in this transition. For example, the exploitation of rare minerals to produce electric batteries entailed high environmental risks. Yet, a move to the green economy had the potential for creating well-paying jobs in the sector which was positive. It was important to consider additional costs for many households and industries from using cleaner, but more expensive energy sources.

In this context, the launch of the European Green Deal in 2019 and a proposal to establish a Social Climate Fund were highly pertinent developments. The International Labour Organisation had published “Guidelines for a just transition towards environmentally sustainable economies and societies for all”. Moreover, the Conference of Parties to the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change adopted, in 2021, the Declaration on “Supporting the Conditions for a Just Transition Internationally”, with a focus on transition to clean, sustainable, affordable, and reliable energy supplies. The Energy Transition Council was set up on the same occasion.

In addition, geopolitical circumstances – Russia's war of aggression against Ukraine – were pushing Europe to reduce its dependence on Russia's fossil fuels in a very tight timeframe. The PACE had debated issues of Europe's energy security, energy diversification, nuclear safety, climate change, non-conventional fuels, and renewable energy sources. The rapporteur would build his report on that basis and would try to assess the strong and the weak points of transition to clean energy for all. He will aim to formulate recommendations to member States to mainstream good practices in the matter of sustainable and socially fair energy transition into their policy making.

Ms Chafil started her presentation by explaining the effects of climate change in Morocco: the country suffered from draughts alternating with floods, the heat and cold waves, and the reduction of water resources for human consumption. Although Morocco's share of global greenhouse gas emissions was only 0.2%, the country lost up to 8% of its GDP as a result of climate change. Morocco was therefore very active in global negotiations on action against climate change and had hosted two conferences of parties (COP22 and COP7). National legal framework comprised laws (such as on water resources, air pollution, etc.), programmes and strategies (such as on solid waste treatment). The New Development Model sought to enhance prosperity, ensure water and food security, strengthen resilience to climate change, preserve

¹ The minutes were approved and declassified by the Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development at its meeting on 27 April 2023.

natural resources while developing agriculture and other sectors with high added value production. The 4C centre therefore worked on policy development in Morocco and Africa, capacity building of different actors, information and know-how sharing with the general public and developing expert networks under the South-South co-operation axis. This work fed into action through territorial planning. The centre also prepared a guide for policy makers before each COP.

Mr Yessouf described Morocco's efforts of transition to clean and sustainable energy. They had several dimensions covering construction, industry, public lighting, transportation and agriculture sectors. Over 90% of energy consumption needs had to be covered through imports, and annual national energy consumption was growing by 2-3%. The New Development Model provided for the strengthening of energy efficiency and the reduction of energy intensity, notably for economic activities. It moreover sought to boost national competitiveness while decreasing energy consumption. The national climate action plan aimed to reduce emissions by 45% by 2030 and the national energy efficiency strategy foresaw to achieve energy savings of 20% by 2030. This would require massive transversal measures and investment in low-carbon development under the strategic plans for 2050.

Further to a question by **Ms Ovchynnykova** regarding a balance to be found between national strategies and business strategies, **Ms Chafil** explained that Moroccan enterprises were well aware of national strategies and were directly impacted by climate change. With energy prices hiking, local energy production from renewable energy sources was becoming highly pertinent. This gave an impulse to developing circular economy and all action in that direction was seen as investment into the future rather than as expenditure. **Mr Yessouf** also felt that constraints should be seen as opportunities. Thus, the EU's carbon border adjustment mechanism was actually creating opportunities for green development in Morocco.

Mr Schennach recalled his past work as the President of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Mediterranean. He praised Morocco's visionary policies of putting in place a tram network in Rabat, which could serve as an example for other regional capitals, as well as a massive deployment of photovoltaic power stations, a zero-emissions car factory and Casablanca's airport which had the lowest emissions in the world.

Ms Tanguy appreciated Morocco's position as an avant-garde player in the field of sustainable energy production based on solar energy. Morocco had all reasons to seek compensation through the Loss and Damage Mechanism put in place by the climate change conferences. A summit on the matter was planned to take place in May 2023 in Paris.

Ms Chafil agreed with Ms Tanguy about the relevance of the Loss and Damage Mechanism put in place by COP27. However, the definition of 'extremely vulnerable countries' under that mechanism was still unclear and therefore it was not clear which economic sectors could claim compensation. Africa was waiting for climate financing.

Mr Yessouf noted that economic policy adjustments were necessary to reduce global energy use. Morocco should seek to sell abroad its excess electricity produced from renewable energy sources.

In this context, **the Chairperson** recalled vast damages to Ukraine's energy sector due to Russia's war of aggression. Investment in energy resilience was thus annihilated by war and even the nuclear energy sector was threatened. It was time for Europe to be creative and develop new energy storage solutions.

The Chairperson then thanked all the participants for their contributions and closed the hearing.

List of presence

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development
Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

Members / Membres	Country / Pays	Alternates / Remplaçant(e)s
Ms Jorida Tabaku	Albania / Albanie	Zz...
M. Pere López	Andorra / Andorre	Mme Mònica Bonell
Mr Armen Gevorgyan	Armenia / Arménie	Ms Hripsime Grigoryan
Mr Franz Leonhard Essl	Austria / Autriche	Mr Michel Reimon
Mr Stefan Schennach	Austria / Autriche	Ms Doris Bures
Ms Nigar Arpadarai	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan	Ms Parvin Karimzada
Ms Sevinj Fataliyeva	Azerbaijan / Azerbaïdjan	Ms Konul Nurullayeva
Mr Bob De Brabandere	Belgium / Belgique	Ms Els Van Hoof
M. Simon Moutquin	Belgium / Belgique	Mme Latifa Gahouchi
Zz...	Bosnia and Herzegovina / Bosnie-Herzégovine	Zz...
Ms Ekaterina Zaharieva	Bulgaria / Bulgarie	Zz...
Ms Denitsa Sacheva	Bulgaria / Bulgarie	Mr Vasil Pandov
Ms Zdravka Bušić	Croatia / Croatie	Ms Ivana Kekin
Ms Christiana Erotokritou	Cyprus / Chypre	Mr Constantinos Efstathiou
Mr Aleš Juchelka	Czech Republic / République tchèque	Mr Ondřej Šimetka
Ms Michaela Šebelová	Czech Republic / République tchèque	Mr Jiří Strýček
Ms Camilla Fabricius	Denmark / Danemark	Ms Karin Liltorp
Mr Urmas Reitelmann	Estonia / Estonie	Ms Maria Jufereva-Skuratovski
Ms Minna Reijonen	Finland / Finlande	Ms Tarja Filatov
M. Alain Milon	France	M. Christian Klinger
Mme Isabelle Santiago	France	Mme Liliana Tanguy
Mme Anne Stambach-Terrenoir	France	Mme Mireille Clapot
M. Philippe Vigier	France	Mme Nathalie Serre
Ms Eka Sepashvili	Georgia / Géorgie	Mr Levan Ioseliani
Ms Heike Engelhardt	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Franziska Kersten
Mr Andrej Hunko	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Catarina Dos Santos-Wintz
Mr Christian Petry	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Martina Stamm-Fibich
Mr Harald Weyel	Germany / Allemagne	Ms Katrin Staffler
Ms Nina Kasimati	Greece / Grèce	Ms Foteini Pipili
Ms Theodora Tzakri	Greece / Grèce	Mr Kriton-Ilias Arsenis
Ms Mónika Bartos	Hungary / Hongrie	Mme Katalin Csöbör
Ms Boglárka Illés	Hungary / Hongrie	Ms Zita Gurmai
Mr Bjarni Jónsson	Iceland / Islande	Ms Jódís Skúladóttir
Mr Joseph O'Reilly	Ireland / Irlande	Ms Reada Cronin
Zz...	Italy / Italie	Zz...

Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
Zz...	Italy / <i>Italie</i>	Zz...
M. Andris Bērziņš	Latvia / <i>Lettonie</i>	Mr Edmunds Cepurītis
Ms Franziska Hoop	Liechtenstein	Mr Peter Frick
Mr Kęstutis Masiulis	Lithuania / <i>Lituanie</i>	Ms Rasa Budbergytė
M. Max Hengel	Luxembourg	M. Paul Galles
Ms Romilda Baldacchino Zarb	Malta / <i>Malte</i>	Mr Joseph Beppe Fenech Adami
Mr Ion Groza	Republic of Moldova / <i>République de Moldova</i>	Ms Reghina Ȃpostolova
M. José Badia	Monaco	Mme Béatrice Fresko-Rolfo
Mr Miloš Konatar	Montenegro / <i>Monténégro</i>	Zz...
Ms Reina De Bruijn-Wezeman	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Mr Bob Van Pareren
Ms Ria Oomen-Ruijten	Netherlands / <i>Pays-Bas</i>	Ms Agnes Mulder
Ms Artina Qazimi	North Macedonia / <i>Macédoine du Nord</i>	Mr Vlado Misajlovski
Ms Lisa Marie Ness Klungland	Norway / <i>Norvège</i>	Ms Linda Hofstad Helleland
Ms Danuta Jazłowiecka	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Mr Tomasz Latos
Mr Bolesław Piecha	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Marta Kubiak
Mr Andrzej Szejna	Poland / <i>Pologne</i>	Ms Mirosława Nykiel
Mr Nuno Carvalho	Portugal	Ms Mónica Quintela
Mr Pedro Cegonho	Portugal	Ms Jamila Madeira
Mr Andi-Lucian Cristea	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	M. Ion Prioteasa
Ms Alina-Ştefania Gorghiu	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Mr Cristian-Augustin Niculescu-Țăgârlaş
Ms Diana Stoica	Romania / <i>Roumanie</i>	Ms Daniela Oteşanu
Ms Marica Montemaggi	San Marino / <i>Saint-Marin</i>	Mr Marco Nicolini
Ms Tatjana Pašić	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Ms Jelena Milošević
Ms Dunja Simonović Bratić	Serbia / <i>Serbie</i>	Mr Uglješa Marković
Mme Anna Záborská	Slovak Republic / <i>République Slovaque</i>	Mr Juraj Šeliga
Mr Dean Premik	Slovenia / <i>Slovénie</i>	Ms Iva Dimic
Ms María Fernández	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	<i>Mr José Latorre</i>
Mr Antón Gómez-Reino	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Ms Belén Hoyo
Ms Carmen Leyte	Spain / <i>Espagne</i>	Mr Salvador Vidal
Mr Mattias Jonsson	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Yasmine Bladelius
Ms Beatrice Timgren	Sweden / <i>Suède</i>	Ms Borianna Åberg
Ms Sibel Arslan	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	M. Pierre-Alain Fridez
M. Jean-Pierre Grin	Switzerland / <i>Suisse</i>	Mme Ada Marra
Ms Emine Nur Günay	Türkiye	Mr Mehmet Mehdi Eker
Mr Halil Özşavli	Türkiye	Ms Sena Nur Çelik
Mr Hişyar Özsoy	Türkiye	Ms Feleknaş Uca
Ms Selin Sayek Böke	Türkiye	M. Haluk Koç

Mr Artem Dubnov	Ukraine	Ms Lesia Zaburanna
Ms Olena Khomenko	Ukraine	Ms Larysa Bilozir
Ms Yuliia Ovchynnykova	Ukraine	Mr Andrii Lopushanskyi
Mr Geraint Davies	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Kate Osamor
Ms Sally-Ann Hart	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Mr Richard Bacon
Baroness Doreen E. Massey	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Ruth Jones
Mr David Morris	United Kingdom / <i>Royaume-Uni</i>	Ms Sheryll Murray

Other Parliamentarians present / Autres Parlementaires present.e.s

Ms/Mme Salma Benaziz, Chairperson of the Moroccan delegation to PACE / *Président de la délégation marocaine auprès de l'APCE*

Mr/M. Nicos Tournaritis, Chairperson of the delegation of Cyprus to PACE / *Président de la délégation chypriote auprès de l'APCE*

Ms/Mme Edite Estrela.....Portugal

Mr/M. Thomas Pringle.....Ireland / *Irlande*

Partners for Democracy / Partenaires pour la Démocratie

Mr / M. Rachid Talbi El Alami	Speaker of the House of Representatives / <i>Président de la Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Allal Amraoui	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Abdellah Bouanou	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Arif Hassan	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Ms/Mme Imane Lamaoui	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Hassan Oumribte	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Driss Sentissi	Deputy, House of Representatives / <i>Député, Chambre des représentants</i>
Mr / M. Ahmed Akhchichine	Councillor, House of Councillors / <i>Conseiller, Chambre des conseillers</i>
Mr / M. Abid Badil	Councillor, House of Councillors / <i>Conseiller, Chambre des conseillers</i>

Secretariat of Delegation or of Political Group / Secretariat de Délégation ou de Groupe politique

Ms / Mme Sonja Langenhaeck, Secretary of the Belgian delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation belge auprès de l'APCE*

Mr / M. Razvan Tanase, Secretary of the Romanian delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation de la Roumaine auprès de l'APCE*

Mr / M. Kenan Arpacioğlu, Secretary of the Turkish delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation turque auprès de l'APCE*

Ms/Mme Handan Karakas Demir, Secretary of the Turkish delegation to PACE / *Secrétaire de délégation turque auprès de l'APCE*

Ms / Mme Francesca Arbogast, Executive Secretary of the Socialists, Democrats and Greens Group (SOC) / *Secrétaire exécutive du Groupe des socialistes, démocrates et verts (SOC)*

Mr / M. Saad Ghazi, Head of the Multilateral Relations Department, Morocco / *Chef du Service des relations multilatérales, Maroc*

Mr / M. Saad Ghazi, Director of External Relations and Communications / *Directeur des relations extérieures*

et de la communication

Experts / Expert.e.s

Ms/Mme Latifa Belakhel, Head of Division of Non-transmissible Diseases, Ministry of Health and Social protection / Chef de la division des maladies non transmissibles, Ministère de la Santé et de la Protection sociale

Ms/Mme Hind Benzha, Director of Property Development, Ministry of Development of the national territory, Urban development, Housing and City policy, *Directrice de la promotion immobilière, Ministère d'Aménagement du Territoire National, de l'Urbanisme, du logement et de la politique de la ville*

Ms/Mme Rajae Chafil, Climate Change Competence Centre of Morocco (4C Maroc), member of the special Commission on the New Development Model / *Directrice du Centre 4C Maroc, membre de la Commission spéciale sur le nouveau modèle de développement*

Mr / M. Mustafa Merizak, Co-ordinator of the Standing Committee for the Promotion of the Culture of Human Rights and the Consolidation of Democratic Construction / *coordinateur du Comité permanent chargé de la promotion de la culture des droits de l'homme et de la consolidation de la construction démocratique*

Mr / M. Chakib Nejari, professor of epidemiology and public health, Vice-President of the Health Pole, Euromed University (Fes) / *professeur d'épidémiologie et de santé publique, vice-président en charge du pôle santé, Université Euromed de Fès*

Mr / M. Hassan Radoine, Director of the School of Architecture, Planning and Design (SAP+D) at Mohammed VI Polytechnic University, *Directeur de l'École d'architecture, Université polytechnique Mohammed VI*

Mr / M. Abdelouahed Rahal, General Director of Commerce, Ministry of Industry and Commerce / *Directeur Général du commerce, Ministère de l'Industrie et du Commerce*

Mr / M. Radouan Yessouf, Assistant Director of the Centre for Strategy and Development of the Moroccan Agency for Energy Efficiency / *Directeur adjoint du pôle stratégie et du développement, Agence marocaine pour l'efficacité énergétique*

Others / Autres

Mr / M. Spyridon Papadatos, Advisory Council on Youth of the Council of **Europe** / *Conseil consultatif pour la jeunesse du Conseil de l'Europe*

Ms / Mme Emma Pagliarusco, Youth and Environment Europe / *Jeunesse et environnement Europe*

Council of Europe staff / Secrétariat du Conseil de l'Europe

Ms / Mme Carmen Morte Gomez, Head of the Council of Europe Office in Rabat / *Cheffe du Bureau du Conseil de l'Europe à Rabat*

Mr / M. Stéphane Gignoux, Project manager / *Gestionnaire du projet*

Ms / Mme Hafsa Mekouar, Project Communication Officer / *Chargée de communication*

Ms / Mme Meryem Assibaïy, Project assistant / *Assistante du projet*

Secretariat of the Parliamentary Assembly / Secrétariat de l'Assemblée Parlementaire

Ms / Mme Louise Barton, Director, Directorate II – Human Dignity and Sustainable Development / *Directrice, Direction II – Dignité humaine et développement durable*

Mr / M. Alessandro Mancini, Assistant to the Head of Secretariat, Parliamentary Projects Support Division / *Adjoint au Chef de Secrétariat, Division de soutien des projets parlementaires*

Mr / M. Mustafa Arabul, Project assistant / *Assistant du projet*

Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development /
Commission des questions sociales, de la santé et du développement durable

Ms / Mme Tanja Kleinsorge Head of the Secretariat / *Cheffe du Secrétariat*

Ms / Mme Aiste Ramanauskaite Secretary to the Committee / *Secrétaire de la commission*

Ms / Mme Anita Gholami Co-Secretary/ Co-Secrétaire

Mr / M. Guillaume Parent Co-Secretary/ Co-Secrétaire

Ms / Mme Prisca Barthel Europe Prize section / *Section Prix de l'Europe*

Ms / Mme Sylvie Elter Assistant / *Assistante*