



METHODOLOGY FOR MONITORING AND EVALUATION ANNEX 1

Toolkit

Delivering Good Governance

METHODOLOGY FOR
MONITORING AND EVALUATION
OF TRAINING PROGRAMMES
FOR PROFESSIONAL
DEVELOPMENT FOR LOCAL
GOVERNMENT

ANNEX 1

Toolkit

The Toolkit contributes to the enhancement of Human Resources Management by providing concrete tools and procedures to be implemented within the Monitoring and Evaluation of the training programmes delivered to public employees.

**CENTRE OF EXPERTISE
FOR LOCAL
GOVERNMENT
REFORM**

in cooperation with

ISIG
Institute of
International Sociology
of Gorizia

April 2018



CENTRE OF EXPERTISE
FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT REFORM

© 2018



COUNCIL OF EUROPE



SET OF INDICATORS	INDICATORS	DESCRIPTION OF INDICATOR		RELATED CRITERIA
		<i>Ex-ante</i>	<i>Ex-post</i>	
1. Financial resources	1.1 Costs for the implementation of the professional training	The indicator shows the planned budget for the implementation of the professional training.	The indicator shows the real budget for the implementation of the professional training.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Efficiency
	1.2 Costs for travel and accommodation of trainers and participants	The indicator shows the planned budget for travel and accommodation of trainers and participants.	The indicator shows the real budget for travel and accommodation of trainers and participants.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Efficiency
	1.3 Different sources of financing (e.g. own funds, contribution from public, private, international bodies, etc.)	The indicator shows if the planned budget foresees different sources of financing.	The indicator shows if the real budget engaged different sources of financing and what was the distribution of different sources of financing within the real/effective budget.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Efficiency
	1.4 Dedicated heading for potential extra expenses	The indicator shows if the planned budget foresees a dedicated heading for potential extra expenses.	The indicator shows if there was a need for extra funds to cover unforeseen expenses during course implementation, if the real budget provided coverage for unforeseen expenses and what was the amount of unforeseen expenses.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Efficiency
2. Competence of administrative staff	2.1 Administrative staff preparation (i.e. education)	The indicators show if the administrative staff has adequate education/professional qualification.	The indicator shows the real competencies and skills of engaged administrative staff.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Efficiency
	2.2 Administrative staff experience in organising/coordinating professional trainings	The indicators show if the administrative staff has adequate education/professional qualification.	The indicator shows the real competencies and skills of engaged administrative staff.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Efficiency
3. Competence of trainers	3.1 Trainers knowledge and preparation on the topic of the course (i.e. education)	The indicator shows level of education/preparation/qualification of trainers for the topic at stake.	The indicator shows if trainers met the expectations/needs of participants in terms of knowledge and preparation on the topic of the course.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Reliability

4. Infrastructure and equipment

3.2 Trainers teaching skills and techniques	The indicator shows what teaching skills selected trainers have and which teaching techniques trainers envisage to implement.	The indicator shows if trainers met the expectations/needs of participants in terms of teaching skills and techniques.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Reliability
3.5 Accreditation of trainers	The indicator shows if selected trainers have accreditation to deliver professional training courses.	The indicator shows if the training was delivered by trainers with accreditation to deliver professional training courses.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Reliability
3.7 Accreditation of implementing organisation	The indicator shows if selected implementing organisation is accredited for the training.	The indicator shows if the training was completed by/within an accredited implementing organisation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Reliability
4.1 Class – rooms (e.g. size per number of participants)	The indicator shows what are the spaces allocated for the implementation of the course.	The indicator shows what were the spaces used for the implementation of the course.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
4.2 Furniture (e.g. tables, chairs)	The indicator shows what is the available furniture for the implementation of the course.	The indicator shows what was the available furniture for the implementation of the course and if the available furniture met the participants’ and trainers’ need/expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
4.3 Accessibility (e.g. for physically impaired participants)	The indicator shows if the venue complies with accessibility requirements.	The indicator shows if the venue complied with accessibility requirements and if it satisfied trainers’ and participants’ accessibility needs and expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
4.4 Security and safety requirements (e.g. emergency plan)	The indicator shows if the venue is compliant with security and safety requirements.	The indicator verifies compliance with <i>ex-ante</i> information.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
4.5 Venue equipped with video terminals, projector, etc	The indicator shows if the venue is equipped with video terminals, beamer, etc.	The indicator shows if the equipment of the venue was compliant with the participants’/trainers’ needs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
4.6 Venue with Wi-Fi access	The indicator shows if the venue is equipped with Wi-Fi.	The indicator shows if the Wi-Fi worked during the entire duration of the course and if the Wi-Fi provisions complied with the participant’s/trainer’s needs.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input

	<p>4.7 Availability of consumables (e.g. Flip-chart, post-it, markers, etc.)</p>	<p>The indicator shows what are the needed consumables and materials.</p>	<p>The indicator shows if consumables were made available throughout the training course, if they were made available by default or upon request and if provided consumables met trainers' and participants needs and expectations.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
<p>6. Participants' expectation/satisfaction</p>	<p>6.1 Expectation/satisfaction about outcome</p>	<p>The indicator shows what are participants' expectations regarding the outcome of the course.</p>	<p>The indicator shows what is the level of participants' satisfaction with the outcome of the course.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input (for expectations) • Outcome (for satisfaction) • Efficiency • Compliance
	<p>6.2 Expectation/satisfaction about training activities</p>	<p>The indicator shows what are participants' expectations with regards to the foreseen training activities.</p>	<p>The indicator shows what is the level of participants' satisfaction with training activities.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input (for expectations) • Outcome (for satisfaction) • Efficiency • Compliance
	<p>6.3 Expectation/satisfaction about content</p>	<p>The indicator shows what are the expectations of participants regarding the foreseen training contents.</p>	<p>The indicator shows what is the level of participants' satisfaction with the delivered training content.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input (for expectations) • Outcome (for satisfaction) • Efficiency • Compliance
	<p>6.4 Expectation/satisfaction about the applicability of the training issues to the specific work context</p>	<p>The indicator shows if participants expect to apply the foreseen training skills in their specific work context.</p>	<p>The indicator shows what is the level of participants' satisfaction with the applicability of the delivered training in their specific work context.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input (for expectations) • Outcome (for satisfaction) • Efficiency • Compliance • Effectiveness
<p>7. Participants' preparation/learning</p>	<p>7.1 Level of knowledge/learning</p>	<p>The indicator shows the level of knowledge of participants on the training topic, prior to the training course.</p>	<p>The indicator shows the level of improved knowledge of participants on the training topic gained on the training course.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input (for knowledge) • Outcome (for learning)

				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compliance • Effectiveness
	7.2 Level of experience on the topic	The indicator shows the level of experience of participants on the training topic, prior to the training course.	/	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Compliance
	7.3 Context of participants' job/activity (info about the context/Local Administration where the participants are employed)		Ex-ante information	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compliance
8. Participants' motivation	8.1 Interest about content	The indicator shows if participants are interested in the topics of the training course/programme.	The indicator shows if the course/programme was interesting for the participants, in term of contents.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compliance
	8.2 Interest in participation (e.g. were they present at all sessions, if they interacted with the trainer, etc.)	The indicator shows if participants show interest in participating prior to the course.	The indicator shows if participants showed interest in the course and if the course was interesting for the participants, in terms of networking, context, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compliance
10. Compliance with the strategic and regulatory framework	10.1 Compliance with the strategic and regulatory framework objectives	The indicator shows if the planned objectives of the course are compliant with the strategic and regulatory framework objectives.	The indicator shows if the objectives of the course were compliant with the strategic and regulatory framework objectives.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • External consistency
	10.2 Compliance with the strategic and regulatory framework topics/contents	The indicator shows if the topics of the course are compliant with the strategic and regulatory framework topic/contents.	The indicator shows if the topics of the course were compliant with the strategic and regulatory framework topic/contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • External consistency
	10.3 Compliance with the strategic and regulatory framework target groups	The indicator shows if the target groups of the course are compliant with the strategic and regulatory framework target groups.	The indicator shows if the target groups of the course were compliant with the strategic and regulatory framework target groups.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • External consistency
11. Logistic organisation	11.1 Hosting environment	The indicator shows what characteristics that could influence the implementation and the outcome of the course the hosting environment has (e.g. little city –	The indicator shows what were the characteristics of the hosting environment that supposedly had influenced the implementation of the course and the outcome.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input

12. Didactic organisation

		easier to concentrate; big city – more opportunities of learning). It also shows if the hosting environment is easily reachable.		
11.2 Accommodation		The indicator shows if the implementing organisation provides assistance to trainers and participants in accommodation arrangements.	The indicator shows if the implementing organisation assisted the trainers and participants in accommodation arrangements and if the accommodation arrangements satisfied trainers and participants' needs and expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
11.3 Travel arrangement		The indicator shows if the implementing organisation provides assistance to trainers and participants in travel arrangements.	The indicator shows if the implementing organisation assisted the trainers and participants in travel arrangements and if the travel arrangements satisfied trainers' and participants' needs and expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input
12.2 trainers/participants	Ratio	The indicator shows how many trainers per participant are envisaged to be engaged for the course.	The indicator shows how many trainers per participant were engaged for the course.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Output • Effectiveness
12.5 Testing procedure to assess the outcome		The indicator shows if the course foresees the implementation of a testing procedure to assess the learning outcome.	The indicator shows if the trainers assessed the learning outcome, what were the results, what was the difference (e.g. improvement) in scoring, with reference to the entrance test (e.g. per participant/average/etc.).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Output • Outcome • Efficiency • Effectiveness
12.6 Testing procedure to assess participant initial preparation level		The indicator shows if the course foresees the implementation of testing procedures to assess participants' initial preparation level.	The indicator shows if the trainers assessed participants' initial preparation level, how many participants were assessed, and what were the results.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Input • Outcome • Efficiency • Effectiveness •

	12.7	Teaching methods/techniques	The indicator shows if the teaching methods and techniques are clearly stated.	The indicator shows what were the teaching methods and techniques used in the training course and if the teaching methods/techniques were clear and compliant with participants' needs and expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Effectiveness
	12.8	Structure of the course (i.e. calendar, schedule, length, etc.)	The indicator shows what is the foreseen structure of the course and what kind of activities the course foresees.	The indicator shows what was the structure of the course, what kind of activities the course provided and if the structure of the course was compliant with participants' needs and expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Input Output Effectiveness Efficiency
	12.9	Availability of materials/handouts supporting the training	The indicator shows if the course foresees the delivery of materials/handouts supporting the training.	The indicator shows if materials/handouts were delivered to all participants and if the available materials/handouts were compliant with participants' needs and expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Input Efficiency Effectiveness
13. Attendance registration system	13.1	Attendance register	The indicator shows if the course foresees the adoption of an attendance register.	The indicator shows if an attendance register was adopted.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Input Output
	13.2	Minimum attendance requirement	The indicator shows if the course foresees minimum attendance requirements.	The indicator shows if the organisation applied the minimum attendance requirements.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Output Effectiveness
	13.3	Attendance of participants	/	The indicator shows if the participants' attendance levels met minimum requirements set.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Output Effectiveness Efficiency
14. Time management system	14.1	Timetable of training course	The indicator shows if the course foresees the adoption of a time management tool with the indication of deadlines, responsibilities, etc. for each activity foreseen.	The indicator shows if the time management tool (with the indication of deadlines, responsibilities, etc. for each activity foreseen) was adopted.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Input Output
	14.2	Compliance with foreseen deadlines	/	The indicator shows if the implementation of the course was compliant with foreseen deadlines.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Outcome Effectiveness

16. Willingness to apply acquired competences	16.1 Willingness to apply knowledge/information	/	The indicator shows to what extent the acquired knowledge was applied in the work environment.	• Impact
	16.2 Willingness to apply skills	/	The indicator shows to what extent the acquired skills were applied in the work environment by the employee.	• Impact
	16.3 Willingness to apply methods and techniques	/	The indicator shows to what extent the acquired the acquired methods and techniques were applied in the work environment by the employee.	• Impact
17. Applicability of acquired competences	17.1 Applicability of knowledge /information	/	The indicator shows to what extent the acquired knowledge was applicable in the work environment.	• Impact
	17.2 Applicability of skills	/	The indicator shows to what extent the acquired skills were applicable in the work environment.	• Impact
	17.3 Applicability of methods and techniques	/	The indicator shows to what extent the acquired methods and techniques were applicable in the work environment.	• Impact
18. Work environment	18.1 Employees/Ex-Participants performance	/	The indicator shows if the performance of employees changed after the training course.	• Impact
	18.2 Employees/Ex-Participants behaviour	/	The indicator shows if the behavior of employees changed after the training course (e.g. more proactive, more confident with their tasks, etc.).	• Impact
19. Context	19.1 Context of participants' job/activity (pre-training)	The indicator shows specific elements of the work environment of participants (e.g. info about the context/Local Administration where the participants are employed).		<i>Context indicators are not related to criteria. Context indicators are used to "explain" the achieved levels in output and outcome</i>

19.2 Level of visibility of the initiative (pre-training)	The indicator shows if the course foresees a visibility/promotion campaign.	The indicator shows how many targets did the initiative reach?	/
19.3 Compliance with the principles of transparency (pre-training)	The indicator shows if the information regarding selection procedures and criteria are public and clearly explained	The indicator shows if the proceedings/results of the selection were made public and if they were compliant with the announced criteria.	/
19.4 Compliance with the principles of non-discrimination and equal opportunities (pre-training)	The indicator shows if the principles of non-discrimination and equal opportunities are clearly stated in the official documents.	The indicator shows if the selection procedures were compliant with the announced principles of non-discrimination and equal opportunities.	/