



2nd meeting, 24–25 October 2018, Strasbourg

**MSI-JOQ(2018)11
16 October 2018**

MEETING REPORT

Opening and agenda

1. The Committee of experts on quality journalism in the digital age (MSI-JOQ) met in Strasbourg on 24-25 September 2018. The meeting was chaired by Ms Alexandra Borchardt (24 September) and Ms Katharine Sarikakis (25 September). The Committee first adopted the agenda (see Appendix I) without any changes. The draft annotated agenda and the list of participants appear in Appendix II and in Appendix III, respectively. Of the 29 participants, there were 14 women (48%) and 15 men (52%).
2. The meeting was addressed by Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director of the Information Society – Action against Crime Directorate. He provided the MSI-JOQ with information on points of interest related to the mandate of the committee, underlining that a favourable environment for quality journalism is a vital element of a functioning democracy and therefore a keen interest for the Council of Europe, especially in today's media environment challenged by competitive pressures of the digital evolution, a growing distrust in all democratic institutions, proliferation of disinformation and increasing threats to journalists' safety, freedom and working conditions. Mr Kleijssen emphasised the importance of expert committees' expertise and reflection on the current challenges for the development of the organisation's standards and activities, and briefed the group on the recent freedom of expression related activities including a comprehensive approach to human rights-oriented development of artificial intelligence.

MSI-JOQ deliverables

Draft Recommendation on promoting a favourable environment for quality journalism in the digital age

3. The members and participants discussed the first draft of the recommendation as prepared and presented by the rapporteurs, Nadia Bellardi and Darian Pavli. In terms of the structure, the text includes a preamble, an operative part and an appendix with specific guidelines divided into three parts: financial sustainability, quality and ethics and media and information literacy, following an outline that had been approved by the expert committee and taken note of by the CDMSI. The

members and participants welcomed the draft, its direction and goals. The discussion first focused on the very notion of what the draft recommendation aims to protect, namely the concept of “quality journalism”, which was by some members considered to pose definitional problems and by others to potentially exclude all news production that occupies the space between the high-and low-quality journalism. In this context, the group agreed that it was necessary to accentuate that the right to freedom of expression is enjoyed by everyone and protects all types of media, before focusing on quality journalism which warrants special promotion including financial support. Furthermore, it was also pointed out that the object of protection should be formulated with regard to the methods and processes of reporting, as well as the principles, values and purposes involved in the news production, the elements which constitute prerequisites for quality journalism. The members agreed that many such elements were already identifiable from the preamble (in particular from paras. 1 and 2) and should be further fleshed out. In addition, they agreed that the preamble would be somewhat restructured for more clarity, and certain paragraphs could be merged.

4. The recommendation’s essential goal is to identify the preconditions for a favourable environment for quality journalism, in other words, to identify the ways that journalists can be supported to act ethically while seeking “the best obtainable version of the truth” (in the words of Carl Bernstein) in order to serve the public interest. In this connection, the group discussed how to future-proof the text in order to retain its relevance against future changes in the media environment, and a number of terminological and textual amendments were suggested to that end.
5. Financial sustainability was judged to be an issue that member states could really act upon, so as to support not only quality reporting but also democracy. The group discussed a number of possibilities for strengthening the financial sustainability of media outlets, with a focus on enabling regulatory frameworks, financial support of journalist education and training, and redistribution of revenues arising from monetisation of media content between the online platforms and media companies. In this regard, it appears that some MS are considering redistribution mechanisms, but it is unclear whether and when any concrete steps would be made in this direction. A number of experts, however, expressed support for such mechanisms to be put in place. As for the state financial support schemes, they should not be at the expense of the funding of PSM and should be administered and overseen at arm's-length from the State.
6. The remaining two chapters on quality and ethics and media education towards recognition and appreciation of quality journalism are as yet less developed, and the members and participants provided further ideas on issues that could be developed into guidelines. Further contributions were invited by the Secretariat, as well as any valuable practices that could be showcased on the CoE Freedom of expression website for the purposes of implementation of the future recommendation.

Draft Declaration on financial sustainability of quality journalism in the digital age

7. The CDMSI entrusted the expert committee with the task of preparing the Draft declaration in order to address the increasing concerns regarding the financial viability of quality news production. The MSI-JOQ discussed the first draft of the document prepared by the Secretariat, welcoming the initiative and the elements contained in the document. The group contributed a number of ideas and suggestions with a view to tightening the structure of the document, fleshing out some of the points and eliminating possible controversies. A revised draft was prepared following the meeting, to which a few more comments were made and incorporated in the text, which is to be submitted to the CDMSI for further action.

Draft study on media and information literacy in the digital environment

8. The MSI-JOQ discussed the cluster of skills and knowledge necessary for recognising, critically analysing and valuing quality journalism, as well technical skills required for navigating the digital environment and participation skills for successful interaction via digital channels. The members welcomed the amended outline for the study and the questionnaire that will be used for collecting data on case-studies of valuable practices. The group made a number of suggestions regarding the content of the questionnaire (e.g. to include a question on data awareness and privacy), decided to include in the study also projects that did not yield expected results for the purpose of analysing which approaches work best, and emphasised the importance of including a broad enough country sample. The members further decided that some categories of questions in the questionnaire could be merged, and the language should be simplified to facilitate the replies. Once a revised version of the questionnaire will be approved by the group, it will be circulated to the journalists associations (EFJ, RSF), the EBU, EPRA, COMMIT, UNESCO partners, etc. At the next meeting the members will analyse the main findings of the survey.

Decisions on timelines and follow-up

9. The MSI-JOQ will hold its next meeting in Strasbourg on 21-22 March 2019.
10. The MSI-JOQ decided that the Secretariat would prepare a draft meeting report to be sent to the Chair and the Vice-Chair for consideration. Thereafter the Secretariat will send the draft report to the MSI-JOQ with a deadline of five full working days allowing for comments. In the absence of comments within the deadline, the report will be deemed adopted by the MSI-JOQ and will be transmitted to the CDMSI.

APPENDIX I

AGENDA OF THE SECOND MEETING

1. Opening of the meeting
2. Adoption of the agenda
3. Information by the Secretariat
4. Presentation and discussion of the Draft recommendation on promoting the favourable environment for quality journalism in the digital age
5. Presentation and discussion of the Draft study on a possible standard-setting instrument on the promotion of media and information literacy in the digital environment
6. Dates of next meetings
7. Other business

APPENDIX II

ANNOTATED AGENDA OF THE SECOND MEETING

1. **Opening of the meeting**
2. **Address by Mr Jan Kleijssen, Director, Information Society - Action against Crime Directorate**
3. **Adoption of the agenda**
4. **Information by the Secretariat**

Information on activities of the Council of Europe relevant to the work of MSI-JOQ, in particular on the 14th meeting of the CDMSI (Steering Committee on Media and Information Society), 19-21 June 2018
5. **Presentation and discussion of the Draft recommendation by the Committee of Ministers to the member states on promoting a favourable environment for quality journalism in the digital age**

[MSI-JOQ [Terms of Reference](#)] *(doc MSI-JOQ(2018)08)*

The members of MSI-JOQ will be invited to examine and discuss the first version of the draft recommendation prepared by the rapporteurs.
6. **Presentation and discussion of the Draft outline and Draft questionnaire for the Study on the promotion of media and information literacy in the digital environment**

[MSI-JOQ [Terms of Reference](#)] *(doc MSI-JOQ(2018)04)*
(doc MSI-JOQ(2018)07)

The members of MSI-JOQ will be invited to examine and discuss the preparatory documents prepared by the rapporteurs.
7. **Presentation and discussion of the Draft declaration on the financial sustainability of quality journalism in the digital age**

[MSI-JOQ [Terms of Reference](#)] *(doc MSI-JOQ(2018)09)*

The members of MSI-JOQ will be invited to examine and discuss the first version of the draft declaration prepared by the secretariat.
8. **Dates of next meetings**

The members of the MSI-JOQ will be invited to agree on a timeframe for the continuation of their work.
9. **Other business**

APPENDIX III

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / LISTE DES PARTICIPANTS

**Committee of experts on quality journalism in the digital age
MSI-JOQ
*Comité d'experts sur le journalisme de qualité dans l'ère du numérique
MSI-JOQ***

2nd meeting, 24-25 September 2018
Council of Europe, Strasbourg

*2^{ème} réunion, 24-25 septembre 2018
Conseil de l'Europe, Strasbourg*

www.coe.int/msi-joq

25/09/2018

COMMITTEE MEMBERS / MEMBRES DU COMITE

Nadia BELLARDI

Project Consultant and Media Expert specialising in Journalism, Community Media, Media Diversity, Transcultural Communication, Migration, Integration, Islam and Gender Issues

Consultante de projet et experte des médias spécialisée en journalisme, médias communautaires, diversité des médias, communication transculturelle, migration, intégration, islam et questions de genre

Zoran BOJAROVSKI

Media Reforms Adviser to the Prime Minister - "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" – Apologised

Conseiller du Premier Ministre en matière de réforme des médias – « L'ex-République yougoslave de Macédoine » - Excusé

Alexandra BORCHARDT, Vice-Chair of MSI-JOQ / Vice-présidente du MSI-JOQ

Director of Strategic Development – Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism
Directrice du développement stratégique - Institut Reuters pour l'étude du journalisme

Martina CHAPMAN

Communications Professional specialising in Media Literacy and Digital Engagement

Professionnelle des communications spécialisée en éducation aux médias et en engagement numérique

Pierre-François DOCQUIR

Senior Legal Officer – ARTICLE 19 - Apologised

Juriste principal - ARTICLE 19 – Excusé

Olha HERASYMIUK

First Deputy Chair, National Council of Television and Broadcasting of Ukraine - Apologised

Première vice-président, Conseil national de la télévision et de la radiodiffusion de l'Ukraine – Excusée

Tom LAW

Gender Equality rapporteur of MSI-JOQ, Director of Campaigns and Communications – Ethical Journalism Network

Rapporteur sur l'égalité de genre du MSI-JOQ, Directeur des campagnes et des communications Ethical Journalism Network

Helena MANDIĆ

Director of Broadcasting, Communications Regulatory Agency - Bosnia and Herzegovina

Directrice de la radiodiffusion, Agence de régulation des communications - Bosnie-Herzégovine

Tarlach McGONAGLE

Senior researcher/lecturer, Institute for Information Law, Amsterdam – Ireland

Chercheur principal /chargé de cours, Institut de droit de l'information, Amsterdam – Irlande

Markus OERMANN

Policy Consultant, German Federal Commissioner for Culture and the Media, Department for general issues of the media and media competency – Germany

Conseiller politique, Commissaire fédéral allemand à la Culture et aux Médias, Département des questions générales de la compétence médias et médias – Allemagne

Darian PAVLI

Expert on Media and Human Rights Policy

Expert sur les médias et la politique des droits de l'homme

Katharine SARIKAKIS *Chair of MSI-JOQ / Présidente du MSI-JOQ*

Professor of Communication Science (Media Industries, Media Organisation, Media Governance), Jean Monnet Chair of European Media Governance and Integration; Director at Media Governance and Industries Research Lab, Department of Communication, Vienna - Greece

Professeur en Sciences de la communication (industries des médias, organisation des médias, gouvernance des médias), Chaire Jean Monnet de gouvernance et d'intégration des médias européens; Directeur du laboratoire de recherche sur les industries et la gouvernance des médias, Département de Communication, Vienne - Grèce

Inge WELBERGEN

Senior Legal Officer Media, Ministry of Education, Culture and Science – The Netherlands

Juriste principal Médias, Ministère de l'Education, de la Culture et de la Science - Pays-Bas

**OTHER PARTICIPANTS COUNCIL OF EUROPE MEMBERS &
NON MEMBER STATES**
**AUTRES PARTICIPANTS ETATS MEMBRES &
NON MEMBRES DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE**

ITALY / ITALIE

Rosa CAVALLARO

Italian Communications Authority, Audiovisual Content Directorate – Media Pluralism Unit – Apologised

Autorité italienne des communications, Direction du contenu audiovisuel - Unité du pluralisme des médias - Excusée

GEORGIA / GEORGIE

Ivane MAKHARADZE

Head of Broadcasting Regulation Department, National Communications Commission

Chef du Service de régulation de l'Audiovisuel, Commission Nationale des Communications

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA / REPUBLIQUE DE MOLDOVA

Tatiana BURAGA

Member of the Audiovisual Coordination Council

Membre du Conseil de coordination de l'audiovisuel

ROMANIA / ROUMANIE

Valentina MIU

Counselor for European Affairs, Ministry of Culture and National Identity
Romania, Bucharest

*Conseillère aux affaires européennes, Ministère de la Culture et de l'identité
nationale, Bucarest*

SWITZERLAND / SUISSE

Samuel STUDER

Media specialist and deputy research delegate, Division Media / Section Media
Services, International affairs, Federal Department of the Environment,
Transport, Energy and Communications DETEC, Federal Office of
Communications (OFCOM), Biel

*Spécialiste des médias et délégué de recherche adjoint, Division Médias / Section
Services de médias, Affaires internationales, Département fédéral de
l'environnement, des transports, de l'énergie et de la communication DETEC,
Office fédéral de la communication (OFCOM), Bienne*

TURKEY / TURQUIE

Esat ÇİPLAK

Acting President, Radio Television Supreme Council

Acting President, Radio Television Supreme Council

Irfan ERENTURK

Expert, Radio Television Supreme Council

Expert, Radio Television Supreme Council

UNITED KINGDOM / ROYAUME-UNI

Maria DONDE

Head of International Content Policy, Office of Communication (OFCOM)

*Chef de la politique de contenu international, Bureau de la Communication
(OFCOM)*

OTHER INSTITUTIONS / AUTRES INSTITUTIONS

COMMUNITY MEDIA INSTITUTE FOR TRAINING, RESEARCH AND ADVICE /
*INSTITUTS COMMUNAUTAIRES POUR LA FORMATION, LA RECHERCHE ET LES
CONSEILS (COMMIT)*

Helmut PEISSL, Chair / Président

EUROPEAN AUDIOVISUAL OBSERVATORY / *OBSERVATOIRE EUROPEEN DE L'AUDIOVISUEL*

Emmanuelle MACHET

Coordinator of EPRA Office
Coordinatrice du Bureau de l'EPRA

EUROPEAN BROADCASTING UNION (EBU) / *UNION EUROPEENNE DE RADIO-TELEVISION (UER)*

Michael WAGNER

Head of Media Law and Communications, Legal Department
Chef du droit des médias et de la communication, Service des Affaires Juridiques

EUROPEAN COMMISSION / COMMISSION EUROPEENNE

David FRIGGIERI

Legal and Policy Officer, Audiovisual and Media Services Policy Unit, DG CNECT
Responsable des questions juridiques et politiques, Unité politique services audiovisuels et médias, DG CNECT

EUROPEAN FEDERATION OF JOURNALISTS / *FEDERATION EUROPEENNE DES JOURNALISTES*

Renate SCHROEDER

Director / Directrice

Marc GRUBER

Independent media consultant
Consultant européen indépendant dans le domaine des médias

OSCE

Andrey RIKHTER

Senior Adviser, Office of the OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media, Vienna,
Conseiller principal, Bureau du représentant de l'OSCE pour la liberté des médias, Vienne

REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS / *REPORTERS SANS FRONTIÈRES*

Olaf STEENFADT

Project Director - Journalism Trust Initiative
Directeur de projet - Journalism Trust Initiative

UNESCO

Adeline HULIN

Project Officer, Freedom of Expression and Media Development
Chargée de projet, Liberté d'expression et développement des médias

NON-MEMBER STATES / ETATS NON MEMBRES

MOROCCO / MAROC

Khatouri MERIEM

Director of Studies and Media Development, Ministry of Culture and Communication, Department of Communication
Directrice des Etudes et du Développement des Médias, Ministère de la culture et de la communication, Département de la Communication

Jamal Eddine NAJI

Director General for Audiovisual Communication - Apologised
Directeur général de la communication audiovisuelle - Excusé

El Mahdi AROUSSI IDRISSE

Director of Legal Studies, High Authority for Audiovisual Communication
Directeur des études juridiques, Haute autorité de la communication audiovisuelle

Chanaz EL AKRICH

Head of Division of Cooperation, Ministry of Culture and Communication, Department of Communication
Cheffe de Division de la Coopération, Ministère de la Culture et de la Communication, Département de la Communication

COUNCIL OF EUROPE SECRETARIAT
SECRETARIAT DU CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Jan KLEIJSSSEN

Director of Information Society - Action against Crime
Directeur de la société de l'information - lutte contre la criminalité
Twitter: @JKleijssen @CoE_HRightsRLaw

Patrick PENNINGCKX

Head of Information Society Department
Chef du Service de la société de l'information

Silvia GRUNDMANN

Head of Media and Internet Division, Information Society Department
Chef de la Division médias et internet, Service de la société de l'information

Urška UMEK

Secretary to MSI-JOQ Committee, Head of Media Unit, Media and Internet Division, Information Society Department
Secrétaire du Comité MSI-JOQ, Chef de l'unité médias, Division médias et internet, Service de la société de l'information

Francesca MONTAGNA

Administrator, Media and Internet Division, Information Society Department
Administratrice, Division médias et internet, Service de la société de l'information

Dominique WULFRAN

Assistant, Media and Internet Division, Information Society Department
Assistante, Division médias et internet, Service de la société de l'information

INTERPRETERS / INTERPRETES

Didier JUNGLING

Rebecca BOWEN

Martine CARALY