

**Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe  
Evaluation Cycle 2018-2019**

**Expert report**

**LE CORBUSIER DESTINATIONS : ARCHITECTURAL  
PROMENADES**

*Peter TROWLES  
Independent Arts and Heritage Consultant  
mikeymain2@hotmail.co.uk  
+44 7940 542 167*

*\*The opinions expressed in this independent expert report are those of the author, and do not engage the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe*

## **Table of contents**

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	3
2. INTRODUCTION: .....	3
3. MAIN BODY EVALUATION .....	4
3.1 THEME.....	4
3.2 FIELDS OF ACTION.....	6
3.2.1 Co-operation in research and development:.....	6
3.2.2 Enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage .....	8
3.2.3 Cultural and educational exchanges of young Europeans .....	10
3.2.4. Contemporary cultural and artistic practice.....	11
3.2.5. Cultural tourism and sustainable development.....	12
3.3 NETWORK.....	13
4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	15
5. LIST OF REFERENCES.....	17
6. ANNEX 1. FIELD VISIT PROGRAMME.....	19
7. ANNEX 2: CHECKLIST.....	21

## 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Summary of the conclusions table  
According to Annex 2 – Checklist,

	Yes	No
The theme complies with the eligibility criteria for themes, CM/Res(2013)67, I. List of eligibility criteria for themes.	✓	
The Cultural Route complies with the criteria listed in CM/Res(2013)67, II. List of priority fields of action.	✓	
The Cultural Route complies with the criteria for networks, as in CM/Res (2013)67, III. List of criteria for networks.	✓	

**Therefore the certification “Cultural Route of the Council of Europe”**

	Yes	No
<b>Should be awarded</b>	✓	

## 2. INTRODUCTION:

The importance of Le Corbusier in the field of 20th century Western architecture cannot be underestimated. His contribution to architecture and the built environment is the subject of extensive debate across academic circles and in architecture schools throughout Europe and further afield. In addition, it is widely recognised that Le Fondation Corbusier in Paris has worked tirelessly for a little over 50 years to promote and safeguard this architect’s remarkable output.

It is also apparent that since its establishment in 2010, the Association des Sites Le Corbusier has done much to support and complement the work of Le Fondation. The Association has actively engaged with a growing and much wider circle of interested parties at local, national and international levels including many private owners, city councils and larger regional/departmental authorities. All have recognised the value of both maintaining and promoting Le Corbusier’s greatest works. This in turn has already widened the appeal of Le Corbusier’s work beyond primarily the academic world and has instead started to address the growing influence and impact of cultural tourism on the many diverse communities where Le Corbusier’s work is represented.

During my recent visit to partners in both France and Switzerland it was made clear to me that the importance of applying for European Cultural Route status was to ensure that all Le Corbusier sites and organisations (and importantly those not included as part of the

successful UNESCO inscription in 2016) should and would continue to work together for the “common good” of promoting Le Corbusier’s international reputation. Whilst there has already been early success with small inter-partner exhibitions and displays there is clear potential for larger and more targeted cross-border activities where the resources of larger regional and city partners can be encouraged to participate.

The existing, diverse membership of the Association des Sites Le Corbusier is already very substantial but I was particularly impressed by the desire to extend engagement with new individuals/organisations/communities, where possible, thereby extending and advancing the ‘Le Corbusier Family’ still further.

Whilst understandably the proposed Route has its heart in Western Europe it is refreshing to see that there is a desire for inter-continental engagement. In Japan, there has always been considerable interest shown in Le Corbusier’s work from within academic circles in particular. The development of a Le Corbusier Route (spanning three continents) would undoubtedly enhance the experience of all those visiting Le Corbusier sites from within and importantly beyond Europe’s borders. In addition, by improving information and communication across multiple partners there exists opportunities for cross-marketing benefits that should see increased visitor uptake in other tourist/leisure activities unconnected to Le Corbusier. This will be of particular benefit to those organisations located and managed in more isolated or semi-rural communities.

The Association des sites Le Corbusier has already achieved much since its inception in 2010. There is certainly potential for much more to be done, and on a global stage, and I have every confidence that by accepting the Association’s application this valuable work will continue for many years to come.

### **3. MAIN BODY EVALUATION**

#### **3.1 THEME**

Does the theme of the Route:

- Represent a common value – historical, cultural, or heritage – to several European countries?

- The theme and content of the submitted route, “Le Corbusier Destinations: Architectural Promenades” represents a number of common values, shared by all partner (European) countries as outlined in the Treaty of Lisbon which came into force in December 2009. These common values are to support, coordinate or supplement Member States’ actions in areas such as culture, tourism and educational training.

- Offer a solid basis for:

i. Youth cultural and educational exchanges?

- As a proposed European Cultural Route, “Le Corbusier Destinations: Architectural Promenades” provides opportunities to promote, enhance and extend the current levels of youth/educational engagement ranging from primary and secondary school group visits to individual partner-buildings, through to graduate/postgraduate/doctoral collaborations and research with architecture and art history programmes at universities and technical colleges worldwide.

#### ii. Innovative activities?

- “Le Corbusier Destinations: Architectural Promenades” is perhaps somewhat unusual in that it is actively engaging with multiple partners from a very wide cross-section of communities – private individuals (such as home-owners), cultural organisations (including professional associations, museums and galleries) and governmental bodies (ranging from city/town councils to larger departmental and regional agencies). The Route aims to fully unite these diverse partners by means of its proposed new ‘mobile website’, bringing together for the first time information (such as access arrangements) to enhance the visitor experience. This is felt to be particularly important and beneficial when welcoming the growing number of international visitors to the various European sites. Here it is recognised that the large numbers of tourists visiting mainland Europe from the Far East, chiefly Japan, China and South Korea are likely to be the key beneficiaries of an improved and more interactive web provision.

#### iii. Cultural Tourism products development?

- One of the key benefits of the proposed Route is that there is already significant engagement with city, departmental and regional partners across the six countries involved. Whilst the individual sites provide a much welcomed and ‘stand-alone’ contribution to cultural tourism in their respected areas, their impact can have an even greater effect when included within a much wider tourist/visitor offer. A good example of this is the current ‘Passeport Tourisme’ programme instigated by the Vosges du Sud department together with their plans to market ‘as one’, the high number of UNESCO inscribed sites (8) found within the immediate area, linking together both cultural and natural sites. This would include Le Corbusier’s Colline Notre-Dame du Haut in Ronchamp.

Has the theme been researched/developed by academics/experts from different regions of Europe?

- Activities undertaken by the Association des Sites Le Corbusier (including its European Cultural Route proposal) have clearly benefited from the established role played by the Fondation Le Corbusier over the last 50 years. In addition, such is the existing level of world-wide research into Le Corbusier’s life and work that identifying and securing the support of respected academics/experts appears to have been relatively easy; the consensus being that the proposed Route would be a welcomed ‘additional resource’ and will aid and support further research into this important and widely-held subject. However, there is potential to widen academic engagement beyond the Network by drawing upon the support of leading writers and academics such as Jean-Louis Cohen, perhaps the most respected Le Corbusier scholar who has excellent connections across Europe and the USA.

## 3.2 FIELDS OF ACTION

### 3.2.1 Co-operation in research and development:

Does the Route:

- Offer a platform for co-operation in research and development of European cultural themes/ values?

- The planned Le Corbusier Route provides an excellent platform for on-going research into the subject. Its existing links with multiple association/friends' groups provides a mostly local but highly specialised range of skills and knowledge. Meanwhile this is very much complemented with the broader, national and international academic perspective of Le Corbusier's status promoted by Le Fondation in Paris. Here Le Fondation continues to support the work of young researchers working in the field of Le Corbusier studies by awarding an annual research prize. Similar new initiatives might also be considered and offered in the future via the Route.

- Play a unifying role around major European themes, enabling dispersed knowledge to be brought together?

- At its core, "Le Corbusier Destinations: Architectural Promenades" seeks to enhance Corbusier's work and reputation across three continents and six countries. Through its existing website and planned (mobile) enhancements, knowledge and research emanating from the lesser known European partners and particularly from those venues located beyond Europe's borders will be easily accessible. Once available, this new information could then support future collaborative initiatives such as exhibitions, publications and conferences.

- Show how these themes are representative of European values shared by several European countries?

- Admiration for Le Corbusier's work is universal and his impact and influence on later building design and urban planning is acknowledged amongst architects and design historians worldwide. He was a true internationalist working freely across multiple borders.

- Illustrate the development of these values and the variety of forms they make take in Europe?

- With the growth of Cultural Tourism worldwide, the importance and value of the built environment to the wider economy has never been greater. New museums dedicated to architecture and design have appeared across Europe in recent years and there is a growing market for bespoke cultural excursions themed around these areas. "Le Corbusier Destinations: Architectural Promenades" has the potential to capitalise on

this through the delivery of further collaborative projects/events including specialist study tours, travelling exhibitions etc.

- Have a network of universities and research centres working on its theme at the European level?

- At present the Route benefits from a long established relationship with Le Fondation in Paris who has an extensive network of academic partner and supporters worldwide, created over the past 50 years. However, the proposed Route has the potential to benefit from, and subsequently promote, additional external research being undertaken by individual properties; for example, following extensive periods of conservation. Restoration of the soon to reopen Pavillion Le Corbusier in Zurich has been overseen by experts from the Museum für Gestaltung Zurich, on behalf of the City of Zurich (one of the Route's partners).

As it becomes more firmly established, opportunities exist to engage with other networks/associations whose rationale and purpose is similar to that of the Association des Sites Le Corbusier. In Barcelona, a recently established network of properties built in the "Rationalist style" and promoted by the City's Municipal Institute of Urban Landscape could be one such future collaborator.

- Have a multidisciplinary scientific committee?

- Although the number of permanent members of the Scientific Committee has been kept deliberately small, they currently reflect a good cross-section of expertise representing the museum sector (Weissenhof Museum), heritage buildings (La Maison Blanche) and the academic community (Le Fondation). Moreover, the Scientific Committee is willing to engage, where necessary, with experts outside of the Association's core membership.

Does the Scientific Committee

- Work on its theme at the European level?

- The Scientific Committee are charged with ensuring that Le Corbusier's cultural heritage located across Europe is valued, protected and where possible accessible for the benefit of all citizens.

- Carry out research and analysis of the issues relevant to its theme and/or activities on both a theoretical and practical level?

- The importance of the Scientific Committee is that it can liaise between the academic and research-driven activities of Le Fondation and the day-to-day activities of the various physical sites and their associated communities. The Scientific Committee is supportive of the need to enhance Le Corbusier's name and cultural reputation across Europe whilst seeking to ensure that his work is merited with the same core values further afield.
- On a practical level, the role of the Route's Scientific Committee is to mostly support the established (research) activities of the Le Fondation but is very well placed to disseminate such analysis through local, departmental and regional communities.

However, Scientific Committee members have a shared responsibility (alongside the larger Steering Committee) in identifying and developing Network activities that embrace communication, public engagement and pedagogy.

### **3.2.2 Enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage**

Do the Route activities (according with the theme)

- Take into account and explain the historical significance of tangible and intangible heritage?

- The promotion and activities of the Route continues to benefit from the attention afforded to the seventeen sites inscribed by UNESCO in 2016. Such status is universally recognised. However, the Route's primary intention remains one of embracing 'all' Network members and early activities such as the "Look(s) on Le Corbusier" photo contest and subsequent touring exhibition highlighted the Route's desire for inclusivity amongst the wider Le Corbusier 'family'. Such activities also deliver a simple and effective means of putting across Le Corbusier's cultural significance (within a European architectural context) to a much wider general public. Planned future activities are also aimed at widening and diversifying Le Corbusier's overall 'public' appeal

- Promote the CoE values?

- Current and future Route activities are supportive of European cultural co-operation and as stated under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe, these are intended to "promote the European identity in its unity and its diversity" and to "encourage intercultural dialogue".

- Work in conformity with international charters and conventions on cultural heritage preservation?

- The Route has the advantage of already having a large number of UNESCO inscribed buildings within its membership. It is therefore incumbent that all Route activities recognise the exacting guidelines laid down by UNESCO in terms of managing and promoting all inscribed sites. For those member sites not currently inscribed, following UNESCO guidelines (where possible) would emphasise a desire to pursue the highest standards in cultural heritage preservation and promotion.

- Identify, preserve, and develop European heritage sites in rural destinations?

- In 2010 the small commune of Ronchamp, was at the forefront of discussions that ultimately led to the establishment of the Association des Sites Le Corbusier. It is therefore fitting perhaps that the Association and its secretariat is located here. Interestingly, the Colline Notre-Dame du Haut in Ronchamp receives a disproportionate number of visitors per year (almost 70,000) when compared to the size of the commune itself (less than 3000).



In addition, it is clear that the small, mostly semi-rural communes of Firminy, Éveux and Saint Dié des Vosges, amongst others, already benefit considerably from their Le Corbusier connections, aided in part by the success of the UNESCO listing. Enhanced marketing and promotion of the Route will benefit the wider cultural and leisure profile of these individual destinations and their immediate surroundings. This should see an increase in overall tourist numbers; time spent visiting the area and will be a boost to the local economy.

- Identify, preserve, and develop European heritage sites in industrial areas in the process of economic restructuring?

- Whilst there is seemingly little evidence of the preservation and promotion of Le Corbusier sites having a direct effect on the economic restructuring of industrial sites the location of a number of his 'Unité d'Habitations' has focussed attention on suburban/residential neighbourhoods which might not otherwise benefit from having a tourist or cultural profile. Here there can be a very direct and positive involvement with local communities.

- Contribute to a better understanding of the concept of cultural heritage, the importance of its preservation and sustainable development?

- The activities of the proposed Cultural Route support and complement the role played by Le Fondation in Paris which has spent over 50 years promoting, preserving and permitting sustainable access to the Le Corbusier legacy and whose activities are internationally respected.

- Enhance physical and intangible heritage, explain its historical significance and highlight its similarities in the different regions of Europe?

- Collaboration between the multi-various partners remains critical to the overall justification of the Route. The success of the "Look(s) on Le Corbusier travelling exhibition was that it involved 22 individual Network members and was distributed to separate 8 locations. More importantly it was seen to engage not only with UNESCO inscribed sites but also to partners who had been excluded from the listing process. This provides evidence that the value and importance of Le Corbusier's contribution to architecture and urban planning lies in his complete oeuvre rather than just highlighting choice examples.

- Take into account of and promote the charters, conventions, recommendations and work of the Council of Europe, UNESCO and ICOMOS relating to heritage restoration, protection and enhancement, landscape and spatial planning (European Cultural Convention, Faro convention, European Landscape convention, World Heritage convention,...)?

- The Association des Sites Le Corbusier actively assisted the Fondation Le Corbusier in its successful submission to UNESCO in 2016 and remains well versed in its responsibilities to the 17 inscribed sites as well as to those additional sites that were excluded from the original inscription process.

### 3.2.3 Cultural and educational exchanges of young Europeans

Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to:

- Develop a better understanding of the concept of European citizenship?
  - At a number of locations (including Colline Notre-Dame du Haut, Ronchamp and Villa Savoye, Poissy) there is a long established tradition of welcoming chiefly European student groups studying architecture, urban planning and art history. From these visits, students are encouraged to value Le Corbusier's worldwide reputation but also to recognise the rich, varied and accessible heritage, that as European citizens, they have at their disposal..
  
- Emphasize the value of new personal experiences through visiting diverse places?
  - During my field visit I witnessed groups of primary-aged school children being taken to the Villa Savoye. Here the children were encouraged to consider how their own lives and experiences were so markedly different to that of the Villa's original owners' a century earlier.
  
- Encourage social integration and exchanges of young people from different social backgrounds and regions of Europe?
  - Social integration and exchanges of young people is already taking place in locations where group access is permissible. From what I briefly experienced this can range from very young groups of ethnically diverse school children (from the local neighbourhood) to individual college students studying at universities worldwide.
  
- Offer collaborative opportunities for educational institutions at various levels?
  - As a member of Route, the Fondation Le Corbusier in Paris is proactive in this field, providing an annual prize to a young researcher working on an aspect of Le Corbusier's artistic output. Future Route activities such as conferences, seminars and workshops will undoubtedly appeal to a wide range of college/university programmes.
  
- Place the emphasis on personal and real experiences through the use of places and contacts?
  - Physical access to buildings and sites is an essential component to truly understanding Le Corbusier's contribution to world architecture. Whilst the majority of his most important works are already open to the public, the Association has been proactive in trying to secure access to buildings that are substantially private or difficult to access. The Association's willingness to engage partners with programmes such as 'European Heritage Days' and 'European Night of Museums' is advantageous to all.
  
- Set up pilot schemes with several participating countries?
  - The "Look(s) on Le Corbusier" photographic exhibition succeeded in engaging with almost 100 individual members of the public from five countries and importantly

proved an excellent opportunity to work with participants from outside of Europe. Projects of this type have the ability to generate considerable public engagement and promotion for a disproportionately small level of investment.

- Give rise to co-operation activities which involve educational institutions at various levels?
  - The role played by Le Fondation in Paris in awarding the annual Le Corbusier prize is one such activity. However, there is considerable opportunity for Le Fondation to increase their liaison between architecture and planning schools/universities with Association members currently engaged in more cultural leisure/tourism pursuits who might otherwise lack the rigours of academia and research.

### **3.2.4. Contemporary cultural and artistic practice**

Does the Route's cultural activities (contemporary cultural and artistic practice related)

- Promote intercultural dialogue and multidisciplinary exchange between artistic expressions in European countries?
- Encourage innovative cultural and contemporary art practices connecting them with the history of skills development?
  - The "Look(s) on Le Corbusier" photographic exhibition provided evidence that these types of intercultural and multidisciplinary projects are eminently achievable and provided excellent opportunities to engage with art forms beyond that of design and architecture.
  - Likewise, engagement with the travelling choir at Festyvocal (in Firminy in 2016) and the writing contest (in 2017) provided opportunities for new and targeted literary and musical works not otherwise directed associated with the built environment.
- Encourage debate and exchange – in a multidisciplinary and intercultural perspective – between various cultural and artistic expressions in different countries of Europe?
- Encourage activities and artistic projects which explore the links between heritage and contemporary culture?
- Highlight the most innovative and creative practices?
- Link these innovative and creative practices with the history of skills development?
  - There is growing evidence, worldwide, of successful interventions between the built environment and the visual and performing arts and it is in this area that there is considerable scope for further collaborative activities. Florence Cosnefroy's exhibition "Composition Chromatique" (the result of an interesting debate between artist and residents of Le Corbusier's most significant urban housing developments) and Cristian Chironi's "My House is a Le Corbusier" although relatively small in scale, highlights the potential that exists by encouraging contemporary practitioners to explore the built environment.

In respect of this, an open call was made in 2018 for a collaborative artistic project that would take place in association with the Unité d'Habitations de Firminy. This is scheduled to take place during the European Heritage Days programme in September 2019.

### 3.2.5. Cultural tourism and sustainable development

Do the Route's activities (relevant to sustainable cultural tourism development

- Assist in local, regional, national and/or European identity?

- In the Bourgogne-Franche-Comté region, the Colline Notre-dame du Haut's UNESCO inscription in 2016 has been broadly welcomed as a 20<sup>th</sup> century addition to an already very strong list of seven other UNESCO listings and it is proposed that in time all eight locations will be marketed and promoted together based on their combined World Heritage listing.

- Actively involve 3 major means to raise awareness of their cultural projects; print, broadcast and social media?

- Le Corbusier's life and works have long been the subject of an extensive number of publications and film and television documentaries worldwide and this will undoubtedly continue in the future. The Association and future activities of the Route will however benefit from the exponential growth in social media. The Route's proposed 'mobile website', in tandem with the Association's existing website, will continue to support the Le Corbusier legacy and help promote the wider cultural/leisure sector as a whole.

- Promote dialogue between:

Urban and rural communities and culture / Developed and disadvantaged / Different parts (south, north east, west) of Europe / Majority and minority (or native and immigrant) cultures?

- One of the most significant advantages of the Route, as it is today, is the diversity of its membership; from those representing urban to rural/semi-rural locations, across a large geographical area of Western Europe, through to partners on different continents working in different languages. All have a shared responsibility of promoting and preserving Le Corbusier's internationalist legacy.

- Open possibilities or cooperation between Europe and other continents.

- Given that Le Corbusier sites in India, Japan and Argentina were amongst the 17 properties inscribed by UNESCO in 2016 there is every opportunity for the Association (and the Route) to collaborate on future projects beyond Europe. Of the non-European destinations, engagement with Japanese colleagues (and particularly those at the National Museum of Western Art in Tokyo), probably offer the greatest potential.

- Draw decision makers' attention to the necessity of protecting heritage as part of sustainable development of the territory.

- The subject of cultural protection is very much inscribed within the UNESCO process and as such is an approach shared by all those (including the Association) involved in the original World Heritage application.

- Aim to diversify cultural product, service and activity offers?

- Develop and offer quality cultural tourism products, services and activities transitionally?

- Develop partnerships with public and private organisations active in the field of tourism?

- In it is in this area that the activities of the Route and wider Association have the greatest potential impact. Whereas Le Fondation in Paris will continue to dominate educational and research activities (supported by smaller Friends' groups linked to individual buildings) the Route, with its connections to local, departmental and regional agencies is best placed complement this academic work by promoting and marketing the overall Le Corbusier cultural experience.

- Did the network prepare and use tools all along the route to raise the number of visitors and the economic impacts of the route on the territories crossed.

- At the request of Le Fondation in Paris in 2017, all publically accessible members sites of the Association (listed and non-listed) have been tasked with collating visitor numbers. In addition, a visitor survey form (in French and English) is now available and feedback from this will be essential as the role of the Route develops over time.

### **3.3 NETWORK**

Does the Route represent a network involving at least three Council of Europe's member states?

- Following the recommendation to postpone the original application in 2015, the Association reviewed its membership, structures and proposed activities. Three years on, the submitted application is now more substantial in terms of European and non-European members, cites an active Scientific Committee to support the principle Steering Committee and reflects new communication and pedagogical activities.

Was the theme of the Network chosen and accepted by its members?

- Following the successful inscription of the 17 sites under the UNESCO programme in 2016 there was a clear desire from the Association and its members to establish a new platform of interdisciplinary collaboration amongst all Le Corbusier sites and organisations and not just those successfully inscribed.

Was the conceptual framework for this network on a scientific basis?

- The proposed activities of the Route seeks to complement and support the current actions of both Le Fondation and the Association in a way that will promote Le Corbusier's life and work to newly identified, more general audiences.

Does the network involve several Council of Europe member states in all or part of its projects?

- Early completed activities such as the "Look(s) on Le Corbusier" photographic competition and travelling exhibition have provided evidence as to how future collaborative projects (including those that engage with partners beyond Europe) can be delivered easily and within a reasonable, realistic budget.

Is the network financially sustainable?

- The level of (annual) investment from each partner is currently sustainable, helped by a broad-base of members and a graded system of fees. However, it should be noted that there is an almost total reliance on public funds and in the budget for 2018, 10% of income is generated from the two non-European partners. Given the pressures on public finances worldwide, long-term financial planning might prove increasingly difficult so consideration as to other sources of external future funding might be worth considering?

Does the network have a legal status (association, federation of associations, EEIG,) and does it operate democratically?

- The Association was established in 2010 and its current Statues were modified following the Extraordinary General Meeting in June 2016. Monthly newsletters and committee papers (relating to the Route's application) are available on Association's website.

Does the network

- Specify its objectives and working methods / the regions concerned by the project / its partners and participating countries / the fields of action involved / the overall strategy of the network in the short and long term / identifies potential participants and partners in CoE member states and/or other world countries?

- The Association maintains a clear and easily navigable bi-lingual website in French and English. The Cultural Route project is, as of February 2019, well represented providing details of its mission, meetings and activities and partners involved. Plans for a new so-called 'mobile' website providing the user with details of access arrangements (public transport information etc) are well underway and this content will eventually be directly accessible through the Association's existing web portal.

- Provide details of its financing (financial reports and/or activity budgets / provide details of its operational plan / append the basic text(s) confirming its legal status?

- The Associations' current website provides an overview of objectives/goals but does not currently include a detailed operational plan or specific financial information, budgets etc. It does however list membership of the Association's Board and contact details for the Permanent Secretary. Links are also provided giving direct access to the web details of all individual partner members.

## 4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The work of the Association des Sites Le Corbusier clearly benefits from its close relationship with the long established Fondation Le Corbusier. However, the primary activities of both organisations are very much complimentary; Le Fondation, a private organisation with a mission to support the conservation, knowledge and dissemination of Le Corbusier's work in a chiefly professional capacity; the Association (a membership network) supporting the management of all individual Le Corbusier organisations and sites who liaise in a more 'public-facing' capacity. Of these 3<sup>rd</sup> party organisations at local, departmental and regional levels, most if not all, are now increasingly aware that by promoting Le Corbusier's architectural legacy this will have a wider public cultural benefit. And with this wider cultural benefit, there is potential for an enhanced economic return.

The proposed Route gives a clear mandate for the Association to focus on developing and extending public engagement across multiple locations in Europe and beyond. Given the cultural and tourism profile now afforded to the likes of Antoni Gaudi, Victor Horta and Charles Rennie Mackintosh, amongst others, there is every potential for Le Corbusier's name and reputation to be more widely shared.

Based on the evidence presented to me, as of January and February 2019, I have a firm belief that "Le Corbusier Destinations: Architectural Promenades" will be a welcome addition to Europe's list of Cultural Routes. Importantly, I believe that this Route has a valuable role to play in emphasising and expanding on the importance of modern European architecture and urban planning, something not currently featured as a recognised 'route'.

My conclusions and recommendations (set against the eligibility criteria) are noted below:

### Criteria part I. Eligibility

The proposed Cultural Route:

- Is "representative of European values and common to at least three countries of Europe"
  - Expert's recommendation: that consideration is given to how partners in Japan and Argentina (in particular) can be better integrated into future

projects/activities ensuring that the Route continues to have a valuable impact beyond Europe's own borders

- 2. Is “researched and developed by groups of multidisciplinary experts from different regions of Europe”
  - Expert’s recommendation: that permanent membership of the Scientific Committee be expanded; this to include at least one qualified professional (from a modern architectural history and/or urban planning background), and not someone directly linked to the Le Corbusier legacy.
  
- 3. Is “illustrative of European memory, history and heritage”
  - Expert’s recommendation: that one or more future projects/activities should attempt to contextualise Le Corbusier’s work, set against his immediate European contemporaries, whilst also addressing the impact and influence his work has had on subsequent generations of Western architects and urban planners.
  
- 4. Does “lend itself to cultural and educational exchanges for young people”.
  - Expert’s recommendation: that the Association considers futures activities that encourage engagement with staff/students of architectural universities at local, regional and/or international levels. This could take the form of contemporary architectural competitions or historically-based research projects such as exhibitions, doctoral theses etc.
  
- 5. Supports the “development of initiatives and exemplary and innovative projects in the field of cultural tourism...”
  - Expert’s recommendation: that the Association continues to examine ways in which the geographically diverse locations of Le Corbusier sites can be brought together (either physically or remotely) for the benefit of all visitors but particularly for those who currently start their journey outside of Europe.
  
- 6. Must “lend itself to the development of tourist products in partnership with tourist agencies and operators”
  - Expert’s recommendation: that the Association takes evidence from other destinations where the promotion of a specific, built heritage has been successful to a city’s/country’s cultural and tourist profile. This might include Antoni Gaudi (Barcelona), Victor Horta (Brussels), Charles Rennie Mackintosh (Glasgow) and even Frank Lloyd Wright (Chicago). In addition, recent developments in Barcelona with the promotion of their new Rationalist Route, together with activities surrounding the Centenary year of the Bauhaus (2019) provide other excellent opportunities for future marketing and collaboration.



### Criteria part III. Networks

The proposed Cultural Route:

- Plans to involve as large a number as possible of States Parties to the European Cultural Convention... as well as, where appropriate, other States
  - Expert's recommendation: that the Association continues to seek possible engagement with one or more relevant and supportive parties in India, focusing on Le Corbusier's work in Chandigarh. This would add another valuable international dimension to Le Corbusier's work.

## 5. LIST OF REFERENCES

I can confirm that I received all the required 'formal' documents for a successful evaluation and was presented with a number of additional (printed) resources during my various field visits. These are all listed below:

### 1/ Working documents

- Destinations Le Corbusier: Promenades Architecturales (CR application document), 2018
- Le Corbusier UNESCO World Heritage List, application document, 2015

### 2a/ Promotional Literature (general)

- Les Biens Français: Inscrits au Patrimoine Mondial, (leaflet in French), 2017/18
- Passeport Tourisme / Vivre Les Vosges du Sud / Entre Ciel et Terre – all published by Vosges du Sud/ Destination 70 (Département de la Haute-Saône); 2018/2019
- Museums-Pass – collaborative tourist leaflet (FR/CH/DE), 2019

### 2b/ Promotional Literature (building specific)

- Cultural/events programme brochure, Colline Notre-Dame du Haut, Ronchamp, 2018/19
- La Filature – Ecoparc Rahin et Chérimont, Ronchamp (Dossier de Presse), 2018
- Multi-lingual tourist leaflet (4 x languages); La Maison Blanche, La Chaux-de-Fonds, 2018/19
- Cultural/events programme brochure, Museum-Gestaltung, Zurich, 2019
- La Roche House – educational guide (in English), Fondation Le Corbusier, 2018/19
- La Roche House – visitor leaflet/plan (in English), Fondation Le Corbusier, 2018/19

- Richard Pare photographic exhibition at La Roche House leaflet (in English), Le Fondation Le Corbusier 2018/19
- Le Corbusier's Studio Apartment – educational guide (in English), Fondation Le Corbusier 2018/19
- Le Corbusier's Studio Apartment – visitor leaflet/plan (in English), Fondation Le Corbusier 2018/19
- Le Corbusier Visits: Paris and Ile-de-France, leaflet (in English), 2014
- The Villa Savoye - visitor leaflet (in English), Centre des Monuments Nationaux, 2018
- Guide to Landmark Houses in Greater Paris Region” – Ministère de la Culture, 2018
- Swiss Pavilion, Architectures of the Cité Internationale Universitaire de Paris (tourist leaflet), 2018/19

### 3/ Commercial Publications

- 'Le Corbusier's Studio Apartment' (guide book in English); Édition Carapace, 2018  
ISBN: 978-2-36860-010-8.
- 'The Villa Savoye' Éditions du Patrimoine, Centre des Monuments Nationaux, 2017  
ISBN 978-2-7577-0140-9
- 'Le Corbusier: Furniture and Interiors 1905-1965', Scheidegger & Spiess, 2012  
ISBN 978-3-85881-728-0
- 'Le Corbusier: The Built Work' Monacelli Press, 2018.  
ISBN 978-1-58093-471-8

### 4/ Web Resources

- Multiple sites, chiefly:
  - [www.sites-le-corbusier.org](http://www.sites-le-corbusier.org)
  - [www.fondationlecorbusier.fr](http://www.fondationlecorbusier.fr)
  - [www.unesco.org](http://www.unesco.org)
  - [www.culture.gouv.fr](http://www.culture.gouv.fr)
  - [www.maisonblanche.ch](http://www.maisonblanche.ch)
  - [www.collinenotredameduhaut.com](http://www.collinenotredameduhaut.com)
  - [www.monuments-nationaux.fr](http://www.monuments-nationaux.fr)

## 6. ANNEX 1. FIELD VISIT PROGRAMME

Monday 21 January: Ronchamp (FR)

Town Hall, Ronchamp:

Introduction to the Le Corbusier network - with Benoît Cornu, 1<sup>st</sup> Deputy, City of Ronchamp and President of the Association des Sites Le Corbusier (ASLC) / Claude Kiener, Deputy Mayor (Culture, Green Spaces and International Relations) and also Assistant-Secretary to the Board of the ASLC / Leslie Mozdzan, Coordinator of the ASLC.

Lunch meeting: Jean-Jacques Sombsthay, Vice-President, Departmental Council for Tourism and President of Destination 70 / Morgane Blant-Boniou, Director of the Porterie, Colline Notre-Dame du Haut, Ronchamp / Benoît Cornu / Claude Kiener / Leslie Mozdzan.

The Porterie, Notre-Dame du Haut, Ronchamp.

Presentation by Morgane Blant-Boniou on the management of the Colline Notre-Dame's public engagement/access programme and their involvement with the Le Corbusier route - with Benoît Cornu / Leslie Mozdzan.

Interview with journalist from L'Est républicain newspaper\*; followed by a guided visit (in English) of the Colline Notre-Dame provided by Naïs Novat, (senior guide) – with Benoît Cornu / Leslie Mozdzan.

Tourist Office, Ronchamp:

Introduction by Charlotte Mosca, in charge of Communication and Tourism - with Benoît Cornu / Leslie Mozdzan

La Filature, Ecoparc Rahin et Chérimont, Ronchamp:

Presentation on the Vosges du Sud Culture 70/Destination 70 programme – with Fabrice Creux, Director, Culture 70 and Destination 70 / Katia Vidberg, Project manager, Department of Development, Planning and Territorial Cooperation Service of Territorial Attractiveness - Roaming Unit, Department of Haute-Saône / Karine François, Delegate counsellor for territorial social dialogue, Regional Council of Bourgogne-Franche-Comté / Agnès Veyssière, Head of Development Centre, Communauté de communes Rahin et Chérimont / Morgane Blant-Boniou / Benoît Cornu / Leslie Mozdzan.

Dinner with Agnès Veyssière / David Tourdot, Director, Communauté de communes Rahin et Chérimont / Leslie Mozdzan.

Tuesday 22 January: Zurich and La Chaux-de-Fonds (CH), Paris (FR)

Pavilion Le Corbusier, Zurich

Private visit in the company of Matthias Wyssmann, Project leader, Cultural services, City of Zurich / Roman Aebersold, Head of Co-operations and Collections, Zurich Design Museum / Simon Marius Zehnder, Head of Pavilion Le Corbusier / Silvio Schmed, Conservation Architect / Leslie Mozdzan.

La Maison Blanche, La Chaux de Fonds:

Guided tour with Edmond Charrière, President, Association Maison Blanche - with Myrienne von Büren, Secretary, Association Maison Blanche / Leslie Mozdzan

Dinner (Paris): With ASLC Steering/Scientific committees members: Bénédicte Gandini, Architect of the Foundation Le Corbusier / Cyril Tissot, Cultural Affairs Delegate, City of La Chaux-de-Fonds / Cyril Zozor, Manager of the Cité Frugès, Pessac / Marcus Nitschke, President, housing unit association, Berlin / Edmond Charrière / Leslie Mozdzan.

Wednesday 23 January: Paris (FR)

Meeting of the ASLC Steering and Scientific Committees held at the Foundation Le Corbusier. Welcome by Brigitte Bouvier, Director, Foundation Le Corbusier.

- Steering committee members present: Isabelle Durand-Meyer, Project manager (Cultural services), Tourist Office of Marseille / Ronan Viaud, (responsible for Heritage and Memory services) City of Rezé / Pierre Mellinger, (town councillor) City of Eveux and Treasurer of ASLC / Cyril Tissot / Marcus Nitschke / Cyril Zozor.
- Scientific committee members present: Bénédicte Gandini / Edmond Charrière
- Others present: Sybil Meunier, responsible for cultural actions, Foundation Le Corbusier / Leslie Mozdzan

Visits (with steering/scientific members) to:

- La Maison Roche, with Sybil Meunier
- L'Apartment-atelier in Boulogne-Billancourt with Claudia Weigert, receptionist, Foundation Le Corbusier
- The Swiss Foundation, Cité Internationale Universitaire, with Monica Corrado, Director, Swiss Foundation

Dinner with the Steering and Scientific Committee members and Monica Corrado

Thursday 24 January: Poissy (FR)

Guided visit, Villa Savoye, Poissy: Meeting Virginie Gadenne, Administrator, Villa Savoye / Florence Xolin, Deputy of the Mayor in charge of Heritage, Tourism and New Twinings (Poissy) and Assistant-Secretary to the Board of the ASLC / Brigitte Bouvier, Director, Foundation Le Corbusier.

Unveiling of Le Corbusier statue in Poissy; meeting with Karl Olive, Mayor of Poissy.

\*Article following interview with journalist from L'Est républicain

[https://www.sites-le-corbusier.org/sites/default/files/images/Association/Venue%20Peter%20Trowles Est republicain 2019 01 21.pdf](https://www.sites-le-corbusier.org/sites/default/files/images/Association/Venue%20Peter%20Trowles%20Est%20republicain%20019%2001%2021.pdf)

## 7. ANNEX 2: CHECKLIST

COE CULTURAL ROUTES EVALUATION CHECK-LIST				
	Yes	No	Note	
3.1 THEME	Does the theme of the Route			
	- represent a common value - historical, cultural, or heritage - to several European countries?	1		Le Corbusier relevant to the heritage of many European countries
	- offer a solid basis for			
	youth cultural and educational exchanges?	1		Le Corbusier an increasingly high-profile cultural figure studied by art history/ architectural students worldwide
	innovative activities?		0	The ASLC continues to work on their 'mobile' website
	cultural tourism products development?	1		Attempting to unify multiple diverse sites for the benefit of visitors
	Has the theme been researched/developed by academics/experts from different regions of Europe?	1		Le Corbusier life and work is studied extensively
3.2 FIELDS OF ACTION	3.2.1 Co-operation in research and development			
	Does the Route			
	- offer a platform for co-operation in research and development of European cultural themes/values?	1		In partnership with Fondation Le Corbusier and other potential external partners
	- play a unifying role around major European themes, enabling dispersed knowledge to be brought together?	1		Already started through collaborative projects such as the touring exhibition
	- show how these themes are representative of European values shared by several European countries?	1		Already started through collaborative projects such as the touring exhibition
	- illustrate the development of these values and the variety of forms they may take in Europe?	1		Through plans for new multi-platform website, publications and exhibitions
	- have a network of universities and research centres working on its theme at the European level?	1		See recommendations. Report item 4
	- have a multidisciplinary scientific committee?	1		See recommendations. Report item 4
	Does the scientific Committee			
	Work on its theme at the European level?	1		See recommendations. Report item 4
	carry out research and analysis of the issues relevant to its theme and/or activities on:			
	- theoretical level?	1		See recommendations. Report item 4
	- practical level?		0	Limited at best. See recommendations. Report item 4
	3.2.2 Enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage			
	Do the Route activities (according with the theme)			
	- take into account and explain the historical significance of tangible and intangible European heritage?	1		Through informative website and early activities
	- promote the CoE values?	1		Through collaborative actions, shared inter-cultural dialogue
- promote the CoE CRs brand?	X	X	Not relevant at this time	
- work in conformity with international charters and conventions on cultural heritage preservation?	1		Network previously involved with successful UNESCO inscription	
- identify, preserve, and develop European heritage sites in rural destinations?	1		Some sites are in semi-rural locations	
- identify, preserve, and develop European heritage sites in industrial areas in the process of economic restructuring?	x	x	Not relevant to this network	

3.2 FIELDS OF ACTION	- valorize the heritage of ethnic or social minorities in Europe?	x	x	Not relevant to this network
	- contribute to a better understanding of the concept of cultural heritage, the importance of its preservation and sustainable development?	1		Supported through the activities/mission of Le Fondation, Paris
	- enhance physical and intangible heritage, explain its historical significance and highlight its similarities in the different regions of Europe?	1		Through existing website provision and early collaborative activities
	- take account of and promote the charters, conventions, recommendations and work of the Council of Europe, UNESCO and ICOMOS relating to heritage restoration, protection and enhancement, landscape and spatial planning (European Cultural Convention, Faro convention, European Landscape Convention, World Heritage Convention, ...)?	1		Network previously involved with successful UNESCO inscription
	<b>3.2.3 Cultural and educational exchanges of young Europeans</b>			
	Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to			
	- develop a better understanding of the concept of European citizenship?	1		Recognising a similar, unified approach to architectural design but migrated to multiple destinations
	- emphasize the value of new personal experience through visiting diverse places?	1		Successful engagement of primary/junior school visits to Villa Savoye for example
	- encourage social integration and exchanges of young people from different social backgrounds and regions of Europe?	1		Difficult to see how different social backgrounds can be readily accommodated
	- offer collaborative opportunities for educational institutions at various levels?	1		Achieved through school/university group visits
	- place the emphasis on personal and real experiences through the use of places and contacts?	1		Achieved through school/university group visits
	- set up pilot schemes with several participating countries?		0	See recommendations. Report item 4
	- give rise to co-operation activities which involve educational institutions at various levels?		0	See recommendations. Report item 4
	<b>3.2.4 Contemporary cultural and artistic practice</b>			
	Do the Route's cultural activities (contemporary cultural and artistic practice related)			
	- promote intercultural dialogue and multidisciplinary exchange between various artistic expressions in European countries?	1		Photographic competition
	- encourage artistic projects that establish the links between cultural heritage and contemporary culture?	1		Artist in Residence program
	- encourage innovative cultural and contemporary art practices* connecting them with the history of skills development?	1		Artist in Residence program/Writing contest
	- encourage collaboration between culture amateurs and professionals via relevant activities and networks creation?*	1		Photographic competition
	-encourage debate and exchange - in a multidisciplinary and intercultural perspective - between various cultural and artistic expressions in different countries of Europe?	1		Through early Network activities but could be enhanced through future conference/seminars themes
	- encourage activities and artistic projects which explore the links between heritage and contemporary culture?	1		Artist in Residence program/Writing contest
	- highlight the most innovative and creative practices?	1		Artist in Residence program/Writing contest
	- link these innovative and creative practices with the history of skills development?***	1		Artist in Residence program/Writing contest
	<b>3.2.5 Cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development</b>			
	Do the Route's activities (relevant to sustainable cultural tourism development)			
	- assist in local, regional, national and/ or European identity formation?	1		Aided by new multi-platform website
- actively involve 3 major means to raise awareness of their cultural projects: print, broadcast and social media?	1		Coverage of past activities in print and in the media. ASLC self-promotion through own website and Facebook site	
- promote dialogue between				
urban and rural communities and cultures?	1		ASLC represents all Le Corbusier sites as equal	
developed and disadvantaged regions?	1		ASLC represents all Le Corbusier sites as equal	

	different parts (south, north, east, west) of Europe?	1		ASLC represents all Le Corbusier sites as equal
	majority and minority (or native and immigrant) cultures?	x	x	Not relevant to this Network
	- open possibilities for co-operation between Europe and other continents?	1		Network is strengthened by appearance of Japan and Argentina. See recommendations Item 4
	- draw decision makers' attention to the necessity of protecting heritage as part of sustainable development of the territory?	1		Engagement with local, departmental and regional public agencies
	- aim to diversify of cultural product, service and activities offers?	1		Engagement with local, departmental and regional public agencies
	- develop and offer quality cultural tourism products, services or activities transnationally?	1		Engagement with local, departmental and regional public agencies
	- develop partnerships with public and private organisations active in the field of tourism?	1		Engagement with local, departmental and regional public agencies
	Did the network prepare and use tools all along the route to raise the number of visitors and the economic impacts of the route on the territories crossed?	1		Implementation of visitor feedback forms
3.3 NETWORK	Does the Route represent a network involving at least three Council of Europe's member states?	1		Acted on recommendation of EPA members and increased participation of Europe member states
	Was the theme of the network chosen and accepted by its members?	1		Route proposal a logical, complementary activity to UNESCO inscription
	Was the conceptual framework for this network founded on a scientific basis?	1		Route proposal a logical, complementary activity to UNESCO inscription
	Does the network involve several Council of Europe member states in all or part of its project(s)?	1		ASLC is a fully collaborative Network
	Is the network financially sustainable?	1		See recommendations Item 4
	Does the network have a legal status (association, federation of associations, EEIG,...)?	1		Legal statues dated June 2016
	Does the network operate democratically?	1		Regular Board meetings and annual General Assembly
	Does the network			
	- specify			
	its objectives and working methods?	1		Details on the ASLC website
	the regions concerned by the project?	1		Details on the ASLC website
	its partners and participating countries?	1		Details on the ASLC website
	the fields of action involved?	1		Details on the ASLC website
	the overall strategy of the network in the short- and long term?	1		Details on the ASLC website but cites only active projects
	- identify potential participants and partners in CoE member states and/or other world countries?	1		Details on the ASLC website
	- provide details of its financing (financial reports and/or activity budgets)?	1		Made available at Board and GA meetings
- provide details of its operational plan?	1		ASLC website cites general objectives/ goals only. Board and GA meetings discuss specific operational activities	
- append the basic text(s) confirming its legal status?	1		Included as part of application but not referenced on ASLC website	
3.4 COMMUNICATION TOOLS	Does the Route have its own logo?	x	x	Only ASLR logo. Not relevant at this stage for a Route specific logo
	Do all partners of the network use the logo on their communication tools?	x	x	Not relevant at this stage
	Does the Route have its own dedicated website?	x	x	Not relevant at this stage
	Is it the website translated into English and French?	x	x	Existing ASLC website is bi-lingual
	Is it the website translated into other languages?	x	x	Not a legal requirement?
	Does the network use effectively social networks and web 2.0?	x	x	Not relevant at this stage

Does the network publish brochures on the Route?	x	x	Not relevant as yet but aims to publish in French and English
if yes, are the brochures translated in English?	x	x	Not relevant as yet but aims to publish in French and English
if yes, are the brochures translated in French?	x	x	Not relevant as yet but aims to publish in French and English
Is the title of "Cultural Route of the Council of Europe" present on all communication materials (including press releases, webpages, publications, etc.)?	x	x	Not relevant as yet
Is the logo of the Council of Europe present on all communication materials?	x	x	Not relevant as yet
Is the CoE logo used in accordance to the guidelines for its use (size and position,...)?	x	x	Not relevant as yet
Are the logos (Cultural Route + CoE) provided for all the members of the Route?	x	x	Not relevant as yet
Does the Council of Europe logo appears on road signs/ boards indicating the cultural route?	x	x	Not relevant as yet
<b>SCORE</b>	<b>59*</b>	<b>4*</b>	

Please insert 1 for every positive answer and 0 for a negative one. See your total score at the bottom of the column.

**Note:** \* E.g. visual arts, the performing arts, creative crafts, architecture, music, literature, poetry or any other form of cultural expression

\*\*Particularly in terms of instruction for young Europeans in the relevant fields

\*\*\*Whether these fields include visual arts, performing arts, creative crafts, architecture, music, literature or any other field

\* Please note that this Checklist, provided to me (as the Expert), has additional questions in Section 4 'Communication Tools' that were not part of the original submission by the ASLC, hence the discrepancy in totalling the final scores – Peter Trowles.