

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 8 October 2020

MIN-LANG (2020) 14

EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES

**Evaluation by the Committee of Experts
of the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action
contained in the Committee of Experts' seventh evaluation report on
HUNGARY**

Introduction

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its States Parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. The Charter was ratified by Hungary on 26 April 1995, entered into force on 1 March 1998 and applies to the following languages: Armenian (covered by Part II), Boyash (Parts II and III), Bulgarian (Part II), Croatian (Parts II and III), German (Parts II and III), Greek (Part II), Polish (Part II), Romani (Parts II and III), Romanian (Parts II and III), Ruthenian (Part II), Serbian (Parts II and III), Slovakian (Parts II and III), Slovenian (Parts II and III) and Ukrainian (Part II).

2. The Committee of Experts monitors the implementation of the Charter. On the basis of periodical reports presented by each State Party, the Committee of Experts adopts evaluation reports in which it makes “**recommendations for immediate action**” and “further recommendations” on how to improve the protection and promotion of the regional or minority languages in the state concerned. Based on the evaluation report, the Committee of Ministers addresses additional recommendations to the State Party.

3. The State Party must present information only on the implementation of the **recommendations for immediate action** two and a half years after the due date of its periodical report.¹ The Committee of Experts then adopts an evaluation of the implementation of these recommendations. Two and a half years after the due date of the information, the State Party has to present its next periodical report which shall contain comprehensive information about the implementation of all Charter undertakings and all recommendations.

4. Hungary was expected to present **information on the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action** contained in the Committee of Experts’ seventh evaluation report² adopted on 21 November 2018 by 1 March 2020; this information was submitted on 28 February 2020. This **evaluation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action** is based on the information received from Hungary as well as the replies by the Hungarian authorities to a questionnaire.³ In addition, the Committee of Experts has consulted the representatives of the minority language speakers. As far as the compliance of Hungary with all its undertakings under the Charter is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its seventh evaluation report. The Committee of Experts will examine the implementation of all of the recommendations concerning all of the minority languages in the next evaluation report.

5. This evaluation was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 8 October 2020.

¹ In accordance with Committee of Ministers Decisions “Strengthening the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages” (CM/Del/Dec(2018)1330/10.4e), para. 1.a

² CM(2019)86, https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectID=0900001680948778

³ In accordance with the Rules of Procedure of the Committee of Experts (MIN-LANG(2019)7), Rule 17, paras. 1-6

Examination of the implementation by Hungary of the recommendations for immediate action

General issues

Implementation of recommendations in co-operation with minority language speakers

6. Since the adoption of the seventh evaluation report, the Hungarian authorities have not specifically consulted the individual national minorities (nationalities⁴) about the implementation of the recommendations contained therein. Furthermore, there has been no consultation in the context of the preparation of the Information on the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action. Nevertheless, the authorities have indicated that a detailed presentation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action will be on the agenda of the next meeting of the Thematic Working Group for Nationality Affairs (sub-group of the Human Rights Working Group) in the second half of 2020. This working group comprises representatives of the national minorities. However, the Committee of Experts considers that, in conformity with Articles 6 and 7.4 of the Charter, it is necessary to have the views of the national minorities included in the Information on the Implementation of the Recommendations for Immediate Action.

7. The Committee of Experts reiterates that recommendations made in the monitoring procedure aim to support and accelerate the full implementation of the Charter. Therefore, the Committee of Experts invites the Hungarian authorities, upon publication of an evaluation report or an evaluation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action, to draw up language-specific action plans based on the recommendations by the Committee of Ministers and the Committee of Experts and to implement these recommendations in co-operation with the representatives of the minority language speakers.

Promotion of minority language education

8. In the seventh evaluation report, the Committee of Experts made recommendations to promote education in Croatian, German, Romanian, Serbian, Slovakian and Slovenian, or bilingual education in these languages alongside Hungarian at different levels of education. Furthermore, the Committee of Experts recommended to promote pre-school education in Boyash, Greek and Polish as well as the teaching of Armenian, Boyash, Greek, Romani and Ukrainian. These recommendations covered, *inter alia*, two aspects: measures to increase the number of teachers able to teach subjects in these languages or to teach them as a subject, and the active encouragement from parents to enrol their children in schools providing such education. As far as the basic training of teachers was concerned, the Committee of Experts specified that incentives (e.g. guaranteed employment, salary bonus) should be introduced at primary and secondary levels with a view to encouraging students to become minority language teachers.

9. In response to the recommendation, the Hungarian authorities have taken measures to increase the attractiveness of a teaching career in minority language education (e.g. cost of living allowance for teacher candidates, Klebelsberg Training Scholarship for participants of primary school teacher training, Nationality Kindergarten Teacher Study Scholarship Programme). In 2018, a development programme for primary and secondary school teachers started. Its goal is to increase the number of young people choosing a minority language teaching career, to make language training more effective and to improve the esteem of their profession. This programme includes a significant increase in the “nationality allowance” (bonus) to retain and motivate teachers working in this field: the amount of the allowance has increased gradually from 10% to 40% of the basic salary in 2020. Furthermore, the programme includes support based on tenders that aim at the improvement of the quality of minority language teacher training. The authorities have also provided financial support to higher education institutions providing teacher training for kindergartens, primary and secondary schools using minority languages. The Committee of Experts welcomes these important structural measures and considers them good practice.

⁴ “Nationality” in Hungarian constitutional terminology refers to “national minority”.

10. The number of teachers able to teach subjects in minority languages has increased from 959 in 2017 to 971 in 2019. However, the authorities could not specify which languages have benefitted from this increase and by how much.

11. As far as measures to promote education in Croatian, German, Romanian, Serbian, Slovakian and Slovenian or bilingual education in these languages alongside Hungarian are concerned, the authorities again stress that participation in minority language education is voluntary and that the choice among the three educational models (teaching in the minority language; bilingual education; teaching of the minority language) depends on the parents' decision, thus limiting the state's role to "ensuring the conditions" of minority language education. The authorities further state that, in accordance with the 2011 Act CXC on National Public Education (Section 83.7), the demand for minority language education is assessed at the time of enrolment of children in kindergarten or school. The assessment is carried out by the institution in charge of maintaining the school with the involvement of the relevant local nationality self-government.⁵ Before enrolment, the institutions in charge of maintaining the schools also publish information related to the enrolment, including minority language education.

12. The Committee of Experts regrets that the Hungarian authorities limit themselves to repeating factual information from previous monitoring cycles and do not respond to the actual content of the Committee of Experts' recommendations. The Committee of Experts is aware and does not question that enrolment in minority language education and the choice of the educational model are voluntary. However, during the last monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Hungarian authorities *promote* teaching in Croatian, German, Romanian, Serbian, Slovakian and Slovenian or bilingual education in these languages alongside Hungarian.⁶ The recommendations aimed at a shift from teaching these languages primarily as subjects to using them as a medium of instruction as this corresponds better to the situation of these languages and the wishes of the speakers. In order to achieve this objective, the authorities, in co-operation with the national and local nationality self-governments, should actively inform parents of the advantages of education in minority languages or of bilingual education and encourage them to choose one of these two educational models. The information measures carried out at the moment are not sufficient to achieve this shift. The authorities and the nationality self-governments are encouraged to develop and implement a joint information and promotion campaign.

⁵ Nationality self-governments operating at local, regional (i.e. county/metropolitan) and national levels represent the nationalities. They have the right to self-management and co-decision in education, culture, media and language use and can set up and maintain institutions (e.g. schools).

⁶ See for example 1st evaluation report by the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter in Hungary, ECRML(2001)4 and RecChL(2001)4

1. Armenian

Recommendation for immediate action

Identify and develop appropriate forms and means for the teaching and study of Armenian

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

13. Representatives of the Armenian minority consulted the Hungarian authorities about the organisation of Armenian language education and were informed about the procedure for the establishment of a public education institution. No additional step has been taken since.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

14. The information provided to the Committee of Experts indicates that only representatives of the Armenian minority have taken an initiative in the sense of the recommendation and that the authorities have remained passive. The Committee of Experts underlines that Article 7.1.f places an obligation on the authorities to provide for the teaching of Armenian, which requires that the authorities approach the representatives of the Armenian minority and accompany them in the procedure of establishing minority language education. The very difficult sociolinguistic situation of Armenian in Hungary also requires the authorities and the Armenian minority to *identify and develop appropriate* forms and means for the teaching and study of Armenian, as recommended by the Committee of Experts.

2. Boyash

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Provide pre-school education in Boyash

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

15. At present, 79 children take part in bilingual kindergarten education in Hungarian/Boyash in Alsószentmárton (Baranya).

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

16. Given that Boyash was not used in kindergarten in the previous monitoring cycle, the Committee of Experts is pleased to note the current offer in Alsószentmárton. In order to fully comply with Article 8.1.a.iv, the Hungarian authorities should also make bilingual pre-school education in Hungarian/Boyash available in other places where Boyash speakers live in sufficient numbers. This requires measures to train the teachers needed as well as to actively inform Roma parents of the advantages of learning Boyash and encourage them to enrol their children in bilingual kindergartens.

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Promote the teaching of Boyash in primary, secondary, technical and vocational education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

17. No special promotional measures actively encouraging parents to enrol their children in schools teaching Boyash were carried out by the authorities during the reporting period.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

18. The Committee of Experts is aware that many Roma parents are of the view that speaking Boyash with family is sufficient to master it and prefer their children to prioritise learning Hungarian at school. Nevertheless, if the teaching of Boyash were to actually be offered in relevant municipalities and parents' awareness raised as to the strong advantages for children in acquiring full literacy in their mother tongue, this attitude could change. Consequently, the Committee of Experts considers that the Hungarian authorities should intensify their dialogue with representatives of the Boyash speakers with a view to developing a strategy on extending teaching Boyash especially in primary education but also in secondary, technical and vocational education. When it comes to promoting the teaching of Boyash in general, the Committee of Experts notes that new social media in Boyash could contribute to raising the popularity of this language among younger people and increasing their interest in Boyash language education.

Recommendation for immediate action

c. Extend the duration of the public television and radio programmes in Boyash and improve the time slot of the television programme

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

19. In light of the information received, neither the duration of the programmes nor the time slots have changed. The authorities state that the public media have to take into consideration all thirteen national minorities in Hungary and that changes to the airtime distribution to the benefit of one minority would lead to "protest" by the minority losing airtime. In addition, more airtime would currently not be justified due to a lack of journalists. The authorities also point out that all programmes in minority languages can be re-watched and re-listened to on the websites of the Media Services and Support Trust Fund and the National Audio-visual Archive, which would solve the issue of broadcast time.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

20. The Committee of Experts regrets that no measures have been taken to improve the presence of Boyash in public broadcasting. It is not convinced of the argument that extending the broadcast duration for Boyash would automatically result in cuts for other minorities. The internet and new media offer not only the possibility to re-watch and re-listen to existing broadcasts, but also to make new audiovisual content available at more regular intervals. The Committee of Experts refers to Hungary's obligations to facilitate private radio and television programmes in Boyash (Articles 11.1.bii, cii), which constitute an additional way of making a comprehensive broadcast media offer in Boyash available. As far as the lack of journalists is concerned, the Committee of Experts notes that Hungary has ratified Article 11.1.g pursuant to which it must support the training of journalists using Boyash. In general, the Committee of Experts considers that the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with representatives of the Boyash speakers, develop a strategy on extending the use of Boyash in the broadcast media.

3. Croatian

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote education in Croatian or bilingual Croatian-Hungarian education in primary, secondary, technical and vocational education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

21. The authorities have not carried out specific promotional measures actively encouraging parents to enrol their children in schools providing education in Croatian or bilingual Croatian-Hungarian education.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

22. In order to implement this recommendation, the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Croatian national and local self-governments, carry out a joint promotion campaign with a view to actively informing parents of the advantages of education in Croatian or bilingual Croatian-Hungarian education and encouraging them to choose one of these two educational models for their children.

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Take resolute steps with a view to increasing the number of teachers able to teach subjects in Croatian

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

23. The authorities have taken measures to increase the number of young people choosing a minority language teaching career (e.g. through financial incentives), to improve the quality of minority language teacher training and to financially support higher education institutions providing teacher training for kindergartens, primary and secondary schools using minority languages. The number of teachers able to teach subjects in minority languages has slightly increased since 2017. However, the Hungarian authorities were not able to specify whether Croatian has benefitted from this increase.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

24. In light of the information provided, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the implementation of the recommendation. The Committee of Experts considers that the Hungarian authorities, in co-operation with the Croatian national and local self-governments, should assess the need for teachers able to teach subjects in Croatian when carrying out the aforementioned joint promotion campaign for Croatian medium education. The Committee of Experts asks the Hungarian authorities to report on this issue in the next periodical report.

4. German

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote education in German or bilingual German-Hungarian education in pre-school, secondary, technical and vocational education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

25. The authorities have not carried out specific promotional measures actively encouraging parents to enrol their children in schools providing education in German or bilingual German-Hungarian education.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

26. In order to implement this recommendation, the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the German national and local self-governments, carry out a joint promotion campaign with a view to actively informing parents of the advantages of education in German or bilingual German-Hungarian education and encouraging them to choose one of these two educational models for their children.

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Extend the duration and improve the time slot of the public television programmes in German

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

27. The duration of the public television programme in German (“Unser Bildschirm”) has not changed (26 minutes per week). According to the authorities, more airtime could be justified if an adequate number of staff were available.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

28. As the Committee of Experts pointed out in its previous evaluation report, the duration of the television programme “Unser Bildschirm” is too short to make a substantial contribution to the promotion of German and should be increased. In addition, the programme’s time slot should be changed so as to enable a higher number of people to watch it. As far as the availability of a sufficient number of German-speaking media staff is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to the recommendation made by the Committee of Ministers in the seventh monitoring cycle that Hungary should **“further improve the offer of minority language programmes on television and develop a comprehensive scheme for the training of journalists and other media staff using minority languages”**.⁷

5. Greek

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Provide pre-school education in Greek and extend the use of this language in primary and secondary education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

29. The Greek minority has initiated the launch of a kindergarten group. At present, the legal basis for this group is being prepared. At primary level, Greek is taught at the *Nikos Beloyannis Primary School and Kindergarten* in Beloianisz and the *Manolis Glezos 12-Year Supplementary Greek Language Teaching School*, both of which are maintained by the National Self-Government of Greeks in Hungary. In the school year 2019/2020, 92 pupils benefitted from Greek language education. In addition, the national self-government has decided to establish a secondary school, although this has not yet been implemented.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

30. The Committee of Experts welcomes the initiative by the Greek minority to establish a kindergarten group and a secondary school. It invites the Hungarian authorities to actively accompany this process with a view to ensuring that it is successfully completed and that Greek is taught at both levels of education. Moreover, the authorities should, in co-operation with the Greek national and local self-governments, actively inform the parents concerned of the advantages of language learning at an early age and encourage them to enrol their children in this kindergarten. As far as primary education is concerned, the Committee of Experts notes that, compared to the school year 2016/2017⁸, the number of pupils learning Greek in primary education has decreased.

⁷ CM/RecChL(2019)4

⁸ See 7th periodical report by Hungary, MIN-LANG (2018) PR 4, p. 114

6. Polish

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote pre-school education in Polish

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

31. The Polish minority has initiated the launch of a kindergarten group whose legal basis is currently being prepared.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

32. The Committee of Experts is pleased to learn about the initiative of the Polish minority to establish a kindergarten group. It invites the Hungarian authorities to actively support the Polish minority in completing the procedure and to see to it that the Polish language is used in the kindergarten. Considering the relatively weak sociolinguistic situation of Polish in Hungary (low number of speakers and limited degree of local concentration), the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Polish national and local self-governments, actively inform the parents concerned of the advantages of language learning at an early age and encourage them to enrol their children in this kindergarten group.

7. Romani

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote teaching of Romani at all levels of education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

33. Romani language education is organised in one kindergarten (121 children), twelve primary schools (746 pupils) and one secondary school (86 pupils). The situation in technical and vocational education is unclear. In addition to the University of Pécs, the University of Debrecen announced in 2019 that it would be running a bachelor's degree in Romology for which 31 students were enrolled.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

34. The Committee of Experts notes that, compared to the school year 2016/2017⁹, the number of children enrolled in kindergartens using Romani has significantly decreased (from 218 to 121 children) while the number of pupils learning Romani in primary education (407 > 746 pupils) and secondary education (74 > 86 pupils) as well as the offer in higher education (University of Debrecen) have increased. The situation in technical and vocational education is unclear. Considering the decrease at kindergarten level, the Committee of Experts considers that the authorities should, in co-operation with the Roma national and local self-governments, actively inform the parents concerned of the advantages of language learning at an early age and encourage them to enrol their children in kindergartens using Romani. When it comes to promoting the teaching of Romani in general, the Committee of Experts notes that new social media in Romani could contribute to raising the popularity of this language among younger people and to increasing their interest in Romani language education.

⁹ See 7th periodical report by Hungary, MIN-LANG (2018) PR 4, p. 112

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Take resolute steps with a view to increasing the number of teachers able to teach Romani

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

35. The number of teachers teaching Romani has slightly decreased from 23 (school year 2018/2019) to 21 (school year 2019/2020).

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

36. The Committee of Experts notes that the total number of teachers of Romani remains low in light of the number of speakers of this language in Hungary. At the same time, the Committee of Experts reiterates that the measures taken by the Hungarian authorities to increase the number of teachers of minority languages (through financial incentives, improved quality of teacher training, financial support for higher education institutions) are positive and have the potential to improve the situation in the short and medium term. As far as teachers of Romani are concerned, the Committee of Experts suggests that the Hungarian authorities closely monitor whether the incentives are effective and, if not, adjust them to the particular situation of teachers of this language. This task could be assigned to the supervisory body for Romani language education which Hungary still needs to set up in accordance with Article 8.1.i (see also the related “further recommendation” by the Committee of Experts in the previous evaluation report).

8. Romanian

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote education in Romanian or bilingual Romanian-Hungarian education at all levels

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

37. The authorities have not carried out specific promotional measures actively encouraging parents to enrol their children in schools providing education in Romanian or bilingual Romanian-Hungarian education.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

38. In order to implement this recommendation, the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Romanian national and local self-governments, carry out a joint promotion campaign with a view to actively informing parents of the advantages of education in Romanian or bilingual Romanian-Hungarian education and encouraging them to choose one of these two educational models for their children.

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Take resolute steps with a view to increasing the number of teachers able to teach subjects in Romanian

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

39. The Hungarian authorities have taken measures to increase the number of young people choosing a minority language teaching career (e.g. through financial incentives), to improve the quality of minority language teacher training and to financially support higher education institutions providing teacher training for kindergartens, primary and secondary schools using minority languages. The number of teachers able to teach subjects in minority languages has slightly increased since 2017. However, the Hungarian authorities were not able to specify whether Romanian has benefitted from this increase.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

40. In light of the information provided, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the implementation of the recommendation. The Committee of Experts considers that the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Romanian national and local self-governments, assess the need for teachers able to teach subjects in Romanian when carrying out the aforementioned joint promotion campaign for Romanian medium education. The Committee of Experts asks the Hungarian authorities to report on this issue in the next periodical report.

9. Serbian

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote education in Serbian or bilingual Serbian-Hungarian education at all levels of education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

41. The authorities have not carried out specific promotional measures actively encouraging parents to enrol their children in schools providing education in Serbian or bilingual Serbian-Hungarian education.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

42. In order to implement this recommendation, the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Serbian national and local self-governments, carry out a joint promotion campaign with a view to actively informing parents of the advantages of education in Serbian or bilingual Serbian-Hungarian education and encouraging them to choose one of these two educational models for their children.

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Establish a comprehensive scheme for the training of journalists and other media staff using Serbian

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

43. Serbian-speaking media staff will participate at Serbian radio and grammar training sessions in 2020.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

44. The Committee of Experts notes that the aforementioned training sessions constitute only a part of the “comprehensive scheme for the training of journalists and other media staff using Serbian” referred to in the recommendation. The establishment of a comprehensive scheme was among the main priorities of the representatives of the Serbian minority in the seventh monitoring cycle. Therefore, the Committee of Experts invites the Hungarian authorities to consult the Serbian national self-government about the establishment of a dedicated training scheme for the broadcast and print media in Serbian. The Committee of Experts also refers to the recommendation made by the Committee of Ministers in the seventh monitoring cycle to “**develop a comprehensive scheme for the training of journalists and other media staff using minority languages.**”¹⁰

¹⁰ CM/RecChL(2019)4

10. Slovakian

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote education in Slovakian or bilingual Slovakian-Hungarian education in primary, secondary, technical and vocational education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

45. The authorities have not carried out specific promotional measures actively encouraging parents to enrol their children in schools providing education in Slovakian or bilingual Slovakian-Hungarian education.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

46. In order to implement this recommendation, the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Slovakian national and local self-governments, carry out a joint promotion campaign with a view to actively informing parents of the advantages of education in Slovakian or bilingual Slovakian-Hungarian education and encouraging them to choose one of these two educational models for their children.

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Take resolute steps with a view to increasing the number of teachers able to teach subjects in Slovakian

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

47. The Hungarian authorities have taken measures to increase the number of young people choosing a minority language teaching career (e.g. through financial incentives), to improve the quality of minority language teacher training and to financially support higher education institutions providing teacher training for kindergartens, primary and secondary schools using minority languages. The number of teachers able to teach subjects in minority languages has slightly increased since 2017. However, the Hungarian authorities were not able to specify whether Slovakian has benefitted from this increase.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

48. In light of the information provided, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the implementation of the recommendation. The Committee of Experts considers that the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Slovakian national and local self-governments, assess the need for teachers able to teach subjects in Slovakian when carrying out the aforementioned joint promotion campaign for Slovakian medium education. The Committee of Experts asks the Hungarian authorities to report on this issue in the next periodical report.

11. Slovenian

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote education in Slovenian or bilingual Slovenian-Hungarian education in secondary and technical and vocational education

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

49. The authorities have not carried out specific promotional measures actively encouraging parents to enrol their children in schools providing education in Slovenian or bilingual Slovenian-Hungarian education.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

50. In order to implement this recommendation, the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Slovenian national and local self-governments, carry out a joint promotion campaign with a view to actively informing parents of the advantages of education in Slovenian or bilingual Slovenian-Hungarian education and encouraging them to choose one of these two educational models for their children.

Recommendation for immediate action

b. Take resolute steps with a view to increasing the number of teachers able to teach subjects in Slovenian

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

51. The Hungarian authorities have taken measures to increase the number of young people choosing a minority language teaching career (e.g. through financial incentives), to improve the quality of minority language teacher training and to financially support higher education institutions providing teacher training for kindergartens, primary and secondary schools using minority languages. The number of teachers able to teach subjects in minority languages has slightly increased since 2017. However, the Hungarian authorities were not able to specify whether Slovenian has benefitted from this increase.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

52. In light of the information provided, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the implementation of the recommendation. The Committee of Experts considers that the Hungarian authorities should, in co-operation with the Slovenian national and local self-governments, assess the need for teachers able to teach subjects in Slovenian when carrying out the aforementioned joint promotion campaign for Slovenian medium education. The Committee of Experts asks the Hungarian authorities to report on this issue in the next periodical report.

12. Ukrainian

Recommendation for immediate action

a. Promote the teaching of Ukrainian in the framework of regular minority language education at all appropriate stages

Implementation measures taken by the Hungarian authorities

53. The Ukrainian nationality advocate (national minority representative) in the National Assembly (parliament) has indicated the minority's intention to organise Ukrainian language education by September 2021 at the latest. The assessment of parental needs and the preparation of the framework curricula for Ukrainian language learning and ethnography are currently in progress.

Evaluation by the Committee of Experts and further action needed

54. The Committee of Experts welcomes the initiative by the Ukrainian minority to set up schools. It invites the Hungarian authorities to actively accompany this process with a view to ensuring that Ukrainian will be taught at all appropriate levels of education. Considering the dispersal of the Ukrainian speakers in Hungary, the authorities need, in co-operation with the Ukrainian national and local self-governments, to take specific information and encouragement measures to support the enrolment of pupils in the new schools.

Communication to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, while acknowledging the efforts of the Hungarian authorities to comply with their undertakings under the Charter, has in its seventh evaluation report (CM(2019)86) made “recommendations for immediate action” and “further recommendations” on how to improve the protection and promotion of the regional or minority languages in Hungary.

In accordance with the Committee of Ministers Decisions of 28 November 2018 (CM/Del/Dec(2018)1330/10.4e), Hungary had to present information on the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action, which contain the priority measures that should be taken by the State Party. Hungary presented this information on 28 February 2020. In the present evaluation, the Committee of Experts has examined the implementation of these recommendations.

In accordance with its Rules of Procedure, the Committee of Experts invites the Committee of Ministers to:

1. take note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action by Hungary and invite the Hungarian authorities to disseminate it to the competent national authorities and relevant stakeholders;
2. reiterate its Recommendation CM/RecChL(2019)4 and invite the Hungarian authorities to present their next periodical report by 1 March 2023 in the required format.