Guidance Document 2

CDC and Pedagogy

Who is this document for?

This guidance document is intended for all education professionals, and more specifically practitioners in classrooms, teachers and student teachers of all subject matters, teacher educators, curriculum developers, policy makers, school leaders, in practice in the primary, lower and upper secondary levels as well as professionals teaching in higher education institutions.

Purpose and overview

The guidance document aims to support and empower teachers who wish to integrate CDC into their practice. It draws attention to a range of methods and pedagogical approaches that can be used for the development of CDC based on general guidelines and principles outlined in Volume 1 of the Reference Framework of Competences for Democratic Culture.

The CDC model can contribute to the development of innovative and creative potential, as the competences taught within school-subject structures may be complemented by competences developing the ability to act democratically.

The success of the inclusion of learning/teaching activities that seek to consider values and develop attitudes, skills and knowledge and critical understanding for a democratic culture in teaching will depend on how well teachers can plan and develop such educational activities and adapt them to their needs and their students' needs.

Competences for democratic culture can be developed as part of the main school activities and within all subject matters. There is no need for teachers to abandon what they are doing, but they are invited to consider enriching their current practice by including CDC in their teaching. Therefore, the chapter:

➢ explains different specific pedagogical principles and choices for teaching and developing the competences, as well as the underpinning rationale for these choices;
➢ outlines recommended pedagogical methods and approaches for teaching and developing the competences;
➢ offers resources for teachers as well as suggesting learning/teaching activities for a variety of teaching styles.

Content and key concepts

The term "pedagogy" is used here in its wide sense, referring to the organisation of a learning process. Pedagogy thus focuses on how to organise teaching, learning and assessment in relation to a curriculum. This document will not touch on assessment or whole-school approaches, since they are dealt with in other guidance documents. This document is about how the teacher and the learner engage together and with the curriculum.

The development of CDC can be understood both explicitly, as a topic, and implicitly, as a transversal concern integrated into the overall teaching and learning processes taking place in schools within a framework of shared responsibility. This shared responsibility for education determines what is important for children to learn and it is possible to involve many stakeholders in working towards common goals: parents, education institutions, civil society and young people themselves co-operate and participate in deciding what values, attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understandings are relevant and important to introduce to children and young people in a given society and at a particular point in time.

The pedagogical approaches outlined below are not only apt for the development of CDC but they also help create more enjoyable and safe learning environments and find ways to address violent, discriminatory and anti-democratic structures within settings. Teachers may easily connect with CDC, and by doing so better connect their practices and values and avoid perpetuating possible discriminatory practices. They may even increase their awareness of any prejudices and biases they might have and gain a different, more nuanced outlook on learners. Teachers and other relevant stakeholders can use these pedagogical approaches to check what they are doing in their daily practice:

- ➤ evaluate to which level they are doing things;
- ➤ identify what they thought they were doing but are actually not doing;
- ➤ reflect on what they could be doing instead;
- ➤ focus on what they could be doing better.

The following questions can guide reflection on how to organise the learning processes.

- ➤ To what extent would you say your teaching contributes towards learners becoming active citizens/respecting human rights?
- ➤ How often do your students have an opportunity to express their own ideas/ listen to different views, discuss their differences in class?
- ➤ How often are questions relevant to human rights, democratic citizenship, justice, equality or the rule of law raised in the classes you teach?
- ➤ How is your current practice facilitating the development of intellectual, personal and social resources that will enable learners to participate as active citizens?
- ➤ How are you providing time for learners to work with each other to strengthen their understanding, as well as practice social skills, thus fostering both individual and social processes and outcomes?
- ➤ How often are you including practical activities and experiential approaches?
- ➤ Do you effectively bring learners' previous experience into your teaching?

The pedagogical approaches and methods for CDC encourage learners to become actively involved in experience, discovery, challenge, analysis, comparison, reflection and co-operation. They address learners as whole persons and engage them cognitively, emotionally and in their experience (with

their head, heart and hands). The methods employed, the communication style and the strategies themselves carry enormous potential to develop democratic competences. Nonetheless, there are many ways teachers can take part in the development of CDC. Teachers and teacher educators might use CDC actively in planning and evaluating their teaching; they may focus on the content of teaching using curricular approaches where they can tackle the dimensions of intercultural understanding, human rights, justice, etc. throughout the content of the existing curriculum by modifying it within a course, or collaboratively through a combination of subject areas. All school subjects lend themselves to the inclusion of CDC.

Competences for democratic citizenship can be developed through approaches centred on the learning process as well as through approaches focused on the content of teaching. Often an educational activity develops CDC through a combination of elements related to both content and process. Planning and pursuing the development of CDC among learners is therefore important for all facilitators of learning. In most cases there are some planning principles. Teachers, as facilitators of learning, will plan their educational activities in such a way as to include opportunities for:

- ➢ **Experience.** A fitting way of developing attitudes of respect and openness, as well as empathy, is by providing opportunities for learning through experience, which can be either real or imagined; learners are able to experience these attitudes through, for example, games, activities, traditional media and social media, face-to-face interaction with others or through correspondence. Teachers may select books for their students or arrange for them to come into contact with the wider community, other neighbourhoods, regions and countries, physically or in online contexts; they may organise events and international meetings for young people; for example, history teachers may plan theatrical reconstructions or activities aiming to develop multiperspectivity. All of these examples can provide opportunities for learning through comparison and analysis.

- ➢ **Comparison**. Learners can benefit from exposure to "difference". Learners often compare what is unfamiliar with what is familiar and evaluate the unfamiliar as "bizarre", as "worse" or even as "uncivilised". Teachers need to be aware of this kind of comparison of value and replace it with comparison for understanding, which involves seeing similarities and differences in a non-judgmental manner and taking the perspective of the other. In other words, learners can be encouraged to develop an understanding of how what is normal for them can be regarded as bizarre from someone else's perspective and vice versa, and that both are simply different in some aspects and alike in other aspects. Learners thus reflect on and are engaged in a conscious comparison of their own values and attitudes with different ones in order to become more aware of how they construct reality.

- ➢ **Analysis**. Behind similarities and differences there are explanations for practices, thoughts, values and beliefs. Facilitators can support their learners in the analysis of what may lie beneath what they can see others doing and saying. This can be achieved, for example, by careful discussion and analysis, through inquiry-based methods, of written or audio/video sources. The analysis can then be reflected back on the learners so that they may question their own practices, values and beliefs.

- ➢ **Reflection.** Comparison, analysis and experience need to be accompanied by time and space for reflection and the development of critical awareness and understanding. Facilitators, especially in non-formal and formal education, need to ensure that such time and space is provided in a deliberate and planned way. For example, teachers may ask students to discuss their experiences, encourage students to keep a logbook to keep track of their learning, and write, draw, share or otherwise respond to what they have learned. Parents may also sit quietly with their children to talk about an experience.

➢ **Action.** Reflection can and should be the basis for taking action, for engagement with others through dialogue and for becoming involved in co-operative activities with others. Facilitators may take the responsibility of encouraging and even managing co-operative action, for example in making improvements in the social and physical environment through "whole-school" approaches or school partnerships (see Guidance Document 5 on the whole-school approach).

Methods and approaches

This Guidance Document presents eight detailed exemplar areas in which teachers and teacher educators can take action if they wish to apply CDC in their teaching.

> **Process-oriented methods and approaches**
> - Modelling democratic attitudes and behaviours
> - Democratic processes in the classroom
> - Co-operative learning
> - Project-based learning
> - Service learning

> **Content-based methods and approaches**
> - Using the existing curriculum – within subject areas
> - Team teaching and integrated curricular approaches
> - Addressing the "hidden curriculum".

Any teacher can use these eight methods and approaches to develop the learners' competences for democratic culture, without the need for exterior institutional intervention or support. The first five develop CDC mainly through the way the learning process is organised, while the other three relate to specific contents.

Process-oriented methods and approaches

In the course of implementing the CDC Framework, teachers can focus on the structures of the learning process that they lead or propose to students. In order to contribute to the development of CDC, special focus is needed on the effectiveness, efficiency and equity of learning processes.

Modelling democratic attitudes and behaviours

The way teachers communicate and interact with students has a major influence on the values, attitudes and skills acquired by learners. Democratic values, attitudes and skills cannot be acquired through formal teaching about democracy alone but need to be practiced.

Values are implicitly transmitted through the way teachers act and communicate. Educators can develop more awareness of the values they convey and mirror in their day-to-day practice, the values, attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understanding one needs to develop. Choices made by educators can support – or hinder – the development of a democratic ethos with the learners. At classroom level the transmission of the Council of Europe values and principles that support sustainable democratic societies comes more from the relationships with teachers than from the power of the curriculum. Learning-by-doing approaches and experiential learning engage students in a process of experience, challenge and reflection that has important potential for the development of CDC. Through their attitudes, behaviours and practices teachers can create safe learning

environments, address discrimination and support individualised learning of a broad base or core humanistic components.

The planning and negotiating of aims, content, learning materials, assessment and programme evaluation by all participants involved in the learning process creates the conditions for transforming the roles of teachers and learners and transcending what those roles are in traditional classrooms. In this way, learning for and through democracy occurs, with educators demonstrating democratic behaviours and therefore contributing to the development of the CDC of learners.

Teachers might reflect on how all values in the CDC model are upheld in their practice. For example, a teacher who chooses to investigate how his or her value of "fairness" plays out in daily activities with students can try out a new practice based on this value, pilot it and reflect on it. Teachers who wish to go further may gather data through interviewing or surveying students on how a new practice has changed the class setting and analyse these data to pursue a next round of research into his/ her practice. This cycle of action research creates space for teachers to reflect on and act to improve their practice and thus become agents of change towards a democratic school culture that empowers learners to become autonomous democratic citizens.

Learning environments have an influence on student engagement and learning. It is important to foster open safe spaces for inclusive and effective learning and for managing difficult dialogues or emotional exchanges where learners feel confident to voice their thoughts and disagreements. In the whole-school approach student safety and well-being are key (see Guidance Document 5 on the whole-school approach). Teachers will benefit from working together and gradually feel confident enough to tackle controversial issues and take risks, for the advancement of CDC in themselves and in their students (see Guidance Document 4 on teacher education). Classroom management, conflict prevention, shared decision making, shared responsibility for learning, respect in classroom communications, etc. are harnessed to teach the values, attitudes and skills included in the CDC model, in a holistic approach, transcending the function of organising the learning sequence. The holistic perspective is manifest   in the coherence between teaching and assessment procedures.

Thus, "the medium is the message". The chosen medium influences how the receiver perceives the message. Aside from their content and focus, the methods one uses teach certain values and attitudes. When teachers embrace inclusive methods for example, they send a meaningful message to learners: they say, "you are all important and valuable", "we can all learn from each other". This is especially critical in culturally and linguistically diverse classrooms, where pedagogical approaches that value the specific cultural backgrounds of learners are required. On the other hand, when teachers spend most of the time standing in front of the classroom giving a lecture and writing on the board while learners listen and copy, they are also teaching a strong lesson: "I have the knowledge", "you will passively learn and follow"– a message that is ineffective for developing intercultural and democratic values, attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understanding.

It takes curiosity, motivation and capacity to become fully aware of one's own practices. The majority of teachers strongly wish to be inclusive and do their best for their learners. They understand that all learning happens within a relationship, and meaningful learning happens within congruent relationships. Through the development of CDC, educators may feel more ready to negotiate ways in which to interact with students and realign their values with their practice, by getting to know themselves as individuals and teachers, raising their awareness of their professional and personal identities and purpose as teachers and human beings.

When including in their everyday practice the modelling of democratic attitudes and behaviours, teachers will be deploying the CDC values. They will consciously develop awareness of their own values, aligning practices and values, and support the development of the following clusters of competences:

- Valuing human dignity and human rights
- Valuing cultural diversity
- Valuing democracy, justice, fairness, equality and the rule of law
- Empathy, respect and positive regard for other people
- Listening and observing in a non-judgmental way
- Openness to others
- Tolerance for ambiguity.

Democratic processes in the classroom

A very effective way of developing a wide range of CDC is by experiencing democratic processes first-hand. The first-hand experience of democratic processes will also empower learners and stimulate them to use these competences in the classroom, in the school and in society. Such experiences of democratic processes, which should be embedded in overall school life (as suggested in Guidance Document 5 on the whole-school approach), can also take place in a classroom setting as part of classroom management and of the teaching process.

There are many everyday situations in which choices need to be made and decisions taken in the classroom. Decisions can be taken in an authoritarian way, by the teacher or by the "strongest" or "best" students, or by following democratic procedures. A conflict or disagreement can be adjudicated by the strongest, or a win-win solution can be sought after and reached through negotiation or mediation. Classroom rules can be imposed by the teacher or adopted democratically through reflection and discussion with the students. Students having specific responsibilities in the class can be appointed by the teacher or elected democratically by their peers. Student voice can be increased through simple means such as a "suggestion box" (which can also be an online tool) set up so that every student can share ideas, perhaps even in an anonymous way. In so doing, teachers contribute effectively to the development of students' CDC by establishing and using – at classroom level – procedures that ensure fairness, equality and non-discrimination, and inclusivity, providing opportunities for all young people.

Democratic processes can also be applied as part of the teaching and learning methods used in a variety of subject matters. Educational activities can include simulations of elections, possibly accompanied by the simulation of a political campaign, mock parliaments, mock trials, defining and using fair procedures for making decisions to choose between various options, role-plays and simulations including testing positions of authority (a day as mayor), the right to free speech (simulation of the work of journalists), etc. All these methods can serve specific learning goals in the curriculum while also developing CDC.

By experiencing democratic processes students will develop the following cluster of competences:

- Valuing democracy, fairness, equality and the rule of law
- Responsibility and civic-mindedness
- Communicative, co-operation and conflict-resolution skills
- Knowledge and critical understanding of democracy and politics.

Co-operative learning

Teachers develop students' co-operation skills, but also openness towards cultural otherness, respect, responsibility, tolerance of ambiguity, as well as listening and observation skills, communication skills and conflict-resolution skills, through learning processes and activities in the classroom based on co-operative learning principles. Single teachers or small teams of teachers can start changing their practice by learning and experimenting through a process of collaboration and experience- sharing in an environment where experimentation is encouraged. The process of collaborating enables the development of openness and the motivation to accept change, an empowering process for teachers.

By applying co-operative learning principles in their work, teachers deconstruct traditional classroom practices and dislodge inherited and deeply rooted ideas and beliefs about learning and learners, removing hierarchical, judgmental and anti-democratic systems and transforming classroom practices. Such structural changes will not only lead to changes in teachers' attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understanding but also to changes in learners' achievements and relationships, which, in turn, will help reach prosocial outcomes. Co-operation is an important component of social cohesion: it develops connections between human beings.

Increasing co-operation will allow personal growth and transformation and promote tolerance and respect for the other.

For this to happen, structures need to be put in place. Working in groups or in pairs in the classroom will be enhanced if attention is paid to the actual interactions taking place within these groups in order to ensure that learners are developing their abilities for co-operation. For effective co-operative learning, the learning process is structured and organised according to specific co-operative principles that may help examine, assess and enhance the learning activities on offer.

Positive interdependence: everyone must contribute

In a classroom without co-operative structures, a teacher may have students working alone on individual worksheets. When working alone, in a competitive setting, students are not engaged in helping their peers do well. In fact, they may secretly hope others do poorly so they look good by comparison. In that situation, the student is struggling alone to learn something or master a skill. Working in isolation the student may feel frustration and lack of peer support. Students working in a classroom using co-operative structures complete work together, each taking turns to solve a problem while their partner serves as coach. They have a common goal of reaching solutions, answers and explanations; they know that what is gained by one is also gained by the other. In that situation, a student who has difficulty learning is more likely to make an effort and is pulled into the achievement cycle.

Individual accountability: no hiding!

In teacher-directed question-answer approaches, the teacher asks a question addressing the whole class as one. Next, a fraction of the students react signaling their hope to be called upon. The teacher calls on just a few students to respond. Although an individual public performance is asked of the students who are called on, not every student has to respond, and some of the other students might feel relief to have someone else answer. In a co-operative structure, when the teacher asks a question or gives a task, each student is given the opportunity to take part in completing the task, hence the individual student's input and effort is valued. This process requires every student to prepare an individual public performance in every round. Any students who may feel reticent are supported and have the

chance to put their heads together with members of their group to improve their answers before being called on. Students who in other settings would not engage become engaged.

Equal access: non-discriminatory participation

A teacher has presented a topic and asks students to "Discuss the issue in teams". The result is predictable: the more articulate, extroverted students, or students who feel strongly about the topic will do most or all of the talking. The less articulate, or introverted students, or students who have no feelings towards the topic will contribute little or nothing to the discussion. In contrast, the teacher who structures the activity co-operatively enables each student to contribute equally, for example by having each student in turn stand for a minute while being interviewed by their teammates. In this manner, students who otherwise would not participate become actively engaged.

Simultaneous interaction: increased per-student participation

When a teacher calls on students one at a time in a class of 30 students, the result is that one, and only one, of the 30 learners in the room offers input and is actively engaged, while the 29 other learners just look on. For example: the teacher wants students to practice reading so, one at a time, each student reads aloud so the teacher can evaluate and coach. In a class of 30 students engaged in a period of 50 minutes, the maximum amount of oral reading per hour for each student is less than two minutes! In a co-operative setting, the teacher pairs students, who take turns reading to each other. The teacher moves around the groups, evaluating and coaching. In this case, each student can read aloud for a substantial amount of time and the teacher has increased the number of opportunities for evaluation and coaching.

A teacher will not be able to have students get along with one another just by telling them that "prejudice and discrimination are bad things". Studies have demonstrated how using co-operative principles for educational activities, for example the "Jigsaw Classroom" described in the appendices to this chapter, for at least two hours a day at school will decrease the tensions and aggression between students and prevent violence, successfully reducing conflict and increasing positive outcomes. Educators adopting this approach claim that they not only help students to better master the academic content of the class, but also note that the method greatly attenuates hostile and intolerant attitudes in the classroom.

Co-operative principles also contribute to improving learning in heterogeneous classrooms. When students work in small groups, they interact and serve as resources for one another. Students who may not read at the expected level and/or who are not proficient in the language of instruction may gain greater access to understanding and completing assignments and therefore may have more opportunities to participate in the group work. However, co-operative learning may produce situations in which students who are academically low achieving and/or who are socially isolated are excluded from the interactions in the group. Therefore, in such cases, co-operative learning needs to be consciously supported by the teacher in order to ensure equity and avoid the pitfall of reinforcing existing educational and social inequalities.

How can a teacher know if a learning activity follows these principles of learner engagement? Some of the following questions correspond to a set of criteria by which learning and teaching activities can be assessed and can help teachers in their planning:

➢ Is it impossible for learners to accomplish their task and reach their goal without co-operating with each other?
- Can the participants and the different micro-groups build on each other's work, ideas?
- Is this interdependence achieved through goal setting, task, role, resource or other means?

➢ Are the learning activities meeting the needs and wishes of the learners?
- Is the individual task of every learner clear to all, and can the teacher/facilitator follow clearly what each learner will do/has done in the learning process?
- Are there complementary and partner-based co-operative roles planned in the learning process?

➢ Is the learning process structured in a way that promotes equal participation for each learner?
- Can every learner join in smoothly and participate in an active way in the activities?
- Is the nature of the activities and resources diverse enough to facilitate equal access?

➢ Can every learner participate/achieve their individual learning goals?
- Do several parallel interactions run during the planned learning activities?
- Can the number of interactions be increased?
- Are all of the learners involved personally in all steps of the learning process?

By engaging in these processes, learners develop clusters of competences:

- Openness to others' beliefs and thoughts
- Responsibility for one's own actions
- Autonomous learning skills
- Empathy and relating to others' thoughts, beliefs and feelings
- Flexibility and adaptability
- Co-operation skills
- Conflict-resolution skills
- Critical understanding of the self.

Project-based learning

Project work, or learning through projects, is a pedagogical approach particularly appropriate for the development of CDC because it contributes to acquiring a combination of attitudes, skills, knowledge and critical understanding, as well as to developing values. It can be used within a specific subject area but it is also very appropriate for a cross-curricular approach and for addressing cross-cutting issues.

Project-based learning offers its best potential when conducted in small groups and/or by a whole class. It is usually structured in a sequence of steps spread over several weeks:

➢ choice of a topic of study or of an open question and planning of the work;
➢ collection of information, organisation of the information collected and decision making (implying both individual responsibility, co-operation in a group and managing potential differences of views or disagreements);
➢ preparation of the product (which can take various forms, such as a poster, video, podcast, publication, website, portfolio, text, performance or event);
➢ presentation of the product;
➢ reflection on the learning experience.

Depending on the topic selected, the elements of knowledge and critical under- standing of the world in the CDC model can also be developed. When the topic involves linguistic and cultural diversity, the process can also stimulate valuing diversity and openness to difference and otherness.

The role of the teacher in a project-based learning process is that of a facilitator of the learning process. Students follow the instructions given by the teacher concerning the steps to go through, but, in terms of content, the decision should remain largely with the students. The teacher's main instrument is the question, not the answer. The principles described above still apply and the teacher monitors how collaboration in the groups is taking place. The teacher should encourage students to co-operate, support each other, give each other feedback and reflect on what they discover as well as on their interactions.

By engaging in this process, regardless of the topic chosen and besides acquiring knowledge and skills about the topic, learners develop clusters of competences:

- autonomous learning skills and self-efficacy: the learners set out to identify sources of information, check their reliability and organise the data collection process and the design of the product themselves;
- analytical and critical thinking skills: related to understanding, processing and organising information, but also to reflection on the learning experience;
- listening and observing skills, particularly in the phase of information gathering;
- empathy, flexibility and adaptability, co-operation skills and conflict-resolution skills, as well as respect, responsibility and tolerance of ambiguity;
- communication skills: oral, written, public speaking, plurilingualism;
- knowledge and critical understanding of the self, of language and communication, particularly during the phase of reflection on the learning experience.

Service learning

Service learning is also an effective way to develop the full range of CDC because it gives learners opportunities to connect the knowledge and critical understanding and skills acquired in a classroom setting with meaningful action targeting a real-world issue. Through this connection, not only knowledge, critical understanding and skills are consolidated and further developed, but processes are put in place which stimulate the development and critical awareness of attitudes and values.

Service learning is more than community service. It implies providing a community service in the context of a structured set of steps, in which the teacher plays an important role as organiser and facilitator, while keeping a strong learner-centred approach and empowering learners to make decisions and act on their own will in co-operation with peers.

As service learning is a form of project-based learning, a similar sequence of steps will serve as a reference for the process:

➢ Assessment of community needs and identification of the improvement or change to be envisaged;
➢ Preparation of the task to be undertaken by collecting information, identifying and contacting key community stakeholders, analysing options to address the issue and planning the intervention;

➢ Taking action by engaging in a community service activity which is meaningful for the learners and enhances learning and the development of values, attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understanding. The action can be of several types, including:
- direct support provided to a group of beneficiaries in need (for example, visiting a centre for senior citizens, organising educational activities for smaller children in a disadvantaged area, giving gifts to citizens providing volunteer work);
- indirect support or change in the community (for example, collecting toys for an NGO supporting disadvantaged children, painting a wall near a play- ground to make it more child-friendly, setting up a web platform or application enabling senior citizens of the community to ask for support from volunteers, fundraising to support a local initiative);
- advocacy for change (for example, advocating for public policies to be adopted by local authorities, warning local citizens of certain risks or advocating for change in certain behaviours of citizens);
➢ Presentation of the work and its outcomes to the community and celebration of the achievements;
➢ Reflection on the learning experience, preferably throughout the whole process, and evaluation of the work done leading to conclusions and recommendations for improving the effectiveness of future similar activities.

Effective service learning has several characteristics which contribute to the development of the full range of values, attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understanding included in the CDC model:

- civic-mindedness but also responsibility, openness, empathy, observation skills, as well as knowledge and critical understanding of the world through the focus on meaningful issues, responding to real community needs;

- self-efficacy, analytical and critical thinking skills: through actions and decisions it empowers learners to plan and organise the various elements of the process;

- tolerance of ambiguity, autonomous learning skills and critical thinking: allowing learners to explore and experience different options, learn from their mistakes and strive to find the best solution;

- co-operation and conflict-resolution skills, together with flexibility and adapt- ability, and communication skills: it requires learners to work together, support each other and overcome their disagreements;

- knowledge and critical understanding of world: it makes explicit the connection between the concepts, the knowledge and skills developed in classroom learning with the needs of the community intervention;

- openness to cultural otherness, listening skills, linguistic and communicative skills: it provides opportunities to communicate with various local stakeholders and includes public presentation of achievements;

- reflection on values, and knowledge and critical understanding of the self: making sure that all learners are supported in reflecting on what the process brought to them, their motivation and the way they can transfer learning into future experiences.

Content-based methods and approaches

The development of CDC need not be perceived as being in competition with teaching the basic skills of language, mathematics, science and all the other school subjects such as history, geography, physical education and modern languages, to name but a few. It is vital to give the children and young people of Europe today the values, attitudes, skills, knowledge and critical understanding essential for steering their lives both individually and collectively in the generations to come and to avoid repeating the mistakes and disasters of history. Teachers can use a wide range of opportunities to include the topics important to developing CDC. The manner in which the examples below are to be implemented may vary depending on the age, grade/class level and preferences of students, as well as on the classroom context.

Using the existing curriculum – within subject areas

Taught in a conscious and purposeful way, all subjects, within their existing curriculum, can harbour learning activities that teach the values, attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understanding that learners need to be able to contribute to a democratic culture. The temptation to "sprinkle" teaching for CDC here and there, with a few hours a year devoted to topics such as intercultural competence or democratic citizenship, can have the negative consequence of an inevitable superficiality that both obscures and scatters the fundamentally important messages. Team teaching and developing processes to cover the CDC model throughout the curriculum and at the intersection of the subject-specific curricula is a foreseeable approach.

To begin with, all school subjects can make good use of short icebreakers, grouping techniques and other team-building and evaluation activities to ensure that the classroom becomes a supportive community of learners who are increasingly motivated to learn together and contribute, and who trust each other and wish to co-operate.

Teachers can acquire methods for finding opportunities in the existing curriculum. Intercultural education, education for democratic citizenship and human rights education, for example, can be approached within certain subjects such as history, social studies and civics, but all school subjects can support the development of CDC, including language and literature, mathematics, science, history, geography, art, drama, modern languages, physical education, music, or information and communication technology.

Concrete examples from the subject areas of language and literature, mathematics, geography and sciences are offered below.

Language and literature
Language and literature teachers may opt to select texts that deal with societal issues such as discrimination, race, gender and violence, looking at the ways writers and poets approach social and political issues and thus set in motion social and moral inquiry. Reading comprehension exercises can be based on texts that support the examination of issues from multiple perspectives. Other texts may help learners gain awareness of psychological phenomena that they may be enacting unknowingly, for example, helping them reflect on their relationship to (and blind observance of?) authority, group or mob behaviour, or peer pressure. Written assignments and debates can also focus on social issues.

Mathematics

Mathematics teachers may convey the historical significance of contributions from different civilisations. Or, they may base the practice of mathematical calculations on examples taken from current demographic data. They may want to include exercises where classification serves to raise learners' awareness of cognitive reflexes such as stereotypes, and activities that support learners' understanding that an individual as complex as a human being cannot be reduced to a single dimension such as gender, ethnicity, financial status, sexual orientation, religion or occupation.

> I gave my students a table where each row had a different function. Each column had a trait by which the function could be classified as having (or not), such as whether the function was even, odd, increasing, decreasing, continuous, 1-to-1, going through the origin, or satisfied:
> $f(a+b) = f(a)+f(b)$.
>
> After filling in the table with "yes" or "no", students noted how difficult it is to find a single simple property shared by all, or to find a single row that is uniquely defined by any one of its traits. And yet does not most intolerance stem from assumptions in the form of "all people in Group Y have trait X"?

Maths equations add up to help teach tolerance. This activity can be easily adapted in other maths classes by changing the row and column headings in the table. Students in younger grades can be given a version using simple whole numbers (i.e.1 to 10) instead of functions. Possible "traits" of numbers include whether a number is even, prime, composite, square, perfect, triangular, Fibonacci or factorial.

Geography

Geography teachers may address the topic of tolerance vis-à-vis immigration by innovative methods: for example, taking the journey of a person leaving his/her country for a better life, students can study the person's homeland (economy, topography, demographics), trace their voyage, study the maps and topography of countries he/she travels through, and so on. These activities can encourage learners to appraise how their own country was formed by the struggles of many peoples. Without knowledge of geography, we naturally tend to perceive ourselves as being the centre, thus putting the rest of the world at the periphery. Looking at old maps in which the mapmakers of the Middle Ages embellished the vast lands unknown to them with what they imagined to be there can raise awareness of issues such as stereotyping and insight on decentring our perspectives. Follow-up activities can suggest that students investigate their towns and neighborhoods to identify and understand their ethnic and socio-economic divides, invisible borders as well as the history of their making.

Science

Science teachers may integrate various areas of the curriculum in order to approach topics and issues relating to discrimination and social justice. Environmental issues tend to lend themselves well to such reflection. For example, a teaching unit on air quality might allow learners to compare and analyse differences and inequalities in air pollution-related morbidity and mortality, based on factors such as class and race that determine where we live, work and go to school. Students can study scientific concepts such as the Air Quality Index (AQI), conduct research on the AQI of different cities, relate it to temperature, reflect on whether there is a cause-and-effect relation- ship or a correlation and so on – all methods of comparison and analysis that learners will be able to transpose to the social issues of justice and equity.

Team teaching and integrated curricular approaches

Besides what each teacher can do in the context of a specific subject, co-operation between teachers of several subjects can lead to valuable and effective additional outcomes for the development of CDC. This co-operation can be between several teachers working with the same class, who co-ordinate their intervention to enhance CDC, but it can also be between teachers working with different classes, which are supported to engage in a partnership and co-operate in learning activities resulting in the development of CDC.

Teachers working with the same class can plan their teaching together in order to ensure that they complement each other in covering all the elements of CDC, leading to a gradual progress of the class in all aspects, so as to avoid overlapping and overlooking elements of CDC. They can also plan together larger project-based learning activities or cover, from the perspective of different disciplines over a longer period of time, transversal topics particularly relevant for CDC, such as human rights, gender equality, sustainable development, sociocultural and linguistic diversity, the prevention of discrimination and violence, etc.

This co-ordination should ideally take place within a broader plan of the school, and the ways in which this could be organised to maximise its effects on the development of CDC are described in Guidance Document 5 on the whole-school approach.

Addressing the "hidden curriculum"

The hidden curriculum is very often an unquestioned status quo. Because the Framework is based on the three principles of transparency, coherence and comprehensiveness, and takes a holistic perspective on democratic learning processes, it is important that schools look at their hidden practices and messages and align the ethos of the school with the CDC values and attitudes.

Nothing one teaches is free of social connotation. Gender bias, ethnic and racial bias, and cultural dominance are the most commonly found ills in the curriculum and in its use in schools.

Teachers should become aware and take an active approach in spotting the unintentional lessons that are taught in their setting. Educators may tend to select resources from a restricted body of sources, thus reinforcing social inequalities or cultural domination as well as stereotypes and discrimination.

Many mathematics and science teachers, for example, insist that what they teach is free of social connotations. Students are given mathematical "problems" to solve which rarely relate to anything from real life. The result of such hidden or implicit, and probably unintentional messages, is that a number of students end up thinking that the content is irrelevant to their lives. They may lose interest not only in the work but also in mathematics as a whole as it appears to have no connection to our reality. Many studies argue that putting maths back into a social context is one way to counter this type of "hidden curriculum".

Another way of controlling the implicit messages of the hidden curriculum is to pay close attention to what resources and illustrations are used in the materials. For example, if literature classes never include authors from different walks of life and geographical places, or if language course books only contain pictures and stories of white middle-class families visiting tourist sights, then one may

consider whether students are being subjected to a hidden curriculum, and if through the power structures of knowledge and culture, teachers are made to continue discriminatory practices.

Using competence descriptors

In designing lessons or activities that focus on both process and content, teachers have at their disposal a set of validated and scaled competence descriptors. The ways of using the descriptors and the potential misuses to avoid are described in the main document of the Framework and more details and the list of descriptors are presented in Volume 2. These are particularly relevant for the pedagogy of CDC because descriptors are formulated by using the language of learning outcomes and can be taken as a reference in defining learning outcomes of various learning activities. Special attention should be given to the fact that in most cases descriptors corresponding to a cluster of competences need to be combined in the development of a learning activity. Examples of how descriptors can be connected to various types of teaching practices and learning activities are provided in the appendices.

Forward-looking conclusion

Teachers can organise a wide variety of pedagogical approaches that are suitable for the development of CDC and thus help create more enjoyable and safe learning environments while addressing violent, discriminatory and anti-democratic structures within classroom settings. Through planning, pursuing the development of CDC among learners and evaluating their activities, teachers as facilitators of learning will focus on the principles of the Framework and enact pedagogical approaches and methods that encourage learners to become actively involved in experience, discovery, challenge, analysis, comparison, reflection and co-operation. They reconsider their role in the classroom to better address learners as whole persons and engage children with their head, heart and hands and develop practices which are best suited to developing learners' autonomy and responsibility in the matter of competence for a democratic culture.

References

Aronson E. (2000), Nobody left to hate: teaching compassion after Columbine, W. H. Freeman, New York.

Aronson E. et al. (1978), The jigsaw classroom, Sage, Beverly Hills, CA.

Brett P., Mompoint-Gaillard P. and Salema M. H. (2009), How all teachers can support citizenship and human rights education: a framework for the development of competences, Council of Europe Publishing, Strasbourg, available at https://rm.coe. int/16802f726a, accessed 19 December 2017.

Cohen E. G. (1994), Designing groupwork: strategies for heterogeneous class- rooms, Teachers College Press, New York.

Cohen E. G. et al. (1999), "Complex instruction: equity in cooperative learning class- rooms", Theory into Practice, Vol. 38, No. 2, pp. 80-86.

Council of Europe (2010), White Paper on intercultural dialogue "Living together as equals in dignity", Council of Europe Publishing, available at www.coe.int/t/dg4/intercultural/source/white%20paper_final_revised_en.pdf,

accessed 19 December 2017.

Kagan S. and Kagan M. (2009), Cooperative learning, Kagan Publishing, San Clemente, CA.

Lesser L. M. (2007), "Critical values and transforming data: teaching statistics with social justice", Journal of Statistics Education Vol. 15, No. 1, pp. 1-21.

McLuhan M. and Lapham L. H. (1994), Understanding media: the extensions of man, MIT Press, Cambridge, MA.

McNiff J. (2013), Action research: principles and practice, Routledge, London.

Rogers C. (1969), Freedom to learn: a view of what education might become (1st edn), Charles Merrill, Columbus, OH.

Teaching Tolerance (ND), "Using 'objects' to object to objectification", available at www.tolerance.org/exchange/using-objects-object-objectification, accessed 19, December 2017.

Resources

Council of Europe

EDC/HRE pack

Democratic governance of schools (2007):
https://rm.coe.int/democratic-governance-of-schools/16804915a4.

How all teachers can support citizenship and human rights education: a framework for the development of competences (2009): https://rm.coe.int/16802f726a.

School–community–university partnerships for a sustainable democracy: education for democratic citizenship in Europe and the United States of America (2010): https://rm.coe. int/16802f7271.

Living Democracy manuals, EDC/HRE Vols. 1-6 (2007-11):
www.coe.int/en/web/edc/ living-democracy-manuals.

Youth sector

All equal all different, Education pack: www.eycb.coe.int/edupack/.

Bookmarks: a manual for combating hate speech online through human rights education (2014): https://rm.coe.int/168065dac7.

Compasito: manual on human rights education for children: www.eycb.coe.int/ compasito/.

Compass: manual for human rights education with young people: www.coe. int/compass.

T-kits, series of training handbooks: http://pjp-eu.coe.int/en/web/youth -partnership/t-kits.

Pestalozzi Programme

A selection of training units from the Pestalozzi Programme trainer training modules for education professionals: www.coe.int/en/web/pestalozzi/training-resources.

Creating an online community of action researchers (Pestalozzi series No. 5) (2017): https://book.coe.int/eur/en/pestalozzi-series/7244-creating-an-online-community-of-action-researchers-pestalozzi-series-no-5.html.

Developing intercultural competence through education (Pestalozzi series No. 3) (2014): https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/education/pestalozzi/Source/Documentation/Pestalozzi3. pdf.

Education for change – Change for education: teacher manifesto for the 21st Century of the conference The Professional Image and Ethos of Teachers (2015):

https://edoc. coe.int/en/index.php?controller=get-file&freeid=6733.

TASKs for democracy: 60 activities to learn and assess transversal attitudes, skills and knowledge (Pestalozzi series No. 4) (2015):

www.coe.int/t/dg4/education/pestalozzi/ Source/Documentation/Pestalozzi4_EN.pdf.

Other useful links

http://teach4diversity.ca/multicultural-childrens-literature/

http://wegrowteachers.com

https://euroclio.eu/resource-centre/educational-resources/

www.edutopia.org

www.learntochange.eu/blog/

www.salto-youth.net

www.teachthought.com

www.tolerance.org

Appendices

Examples of practice

This section highlights resources and offers a number of learning/teaching activities that aim to teach and develop attitudes, skills, and knowledge and critical understanding, and evaluate learning sequences to appraise the effectiveness of the activities with a view to improving their structure, content or delivery for future use, within each of the approaches contained in this document.

  ➢ Example of co-operative learning: the Jigsaw Classroom
  ➢ Example of project-based learning: Project Citizen

➢ Example for developing critical thinking skills

The Jigsaw Classroom: an example of a co-operative learning structure

The Jigsaw Classroom is a co-operative learning technique with a four-decade track record of successfully reducing racial and ethnic conflict in schools and increasing positive outcomes. The example here is for groups of four students but it can be adapted to groups of three or pairs. Teachers should avoid too large groups that do not allow for equal engagement and participation of learners. In preparation for the process, teachers will divide the content of the lesson into a number of segments equal to the number of groups envisaged (four in this example).

Step 1 (10 to 15 minutes)
➢ Divide the class into "home groups": these are groups of three or four students maximum. In this example, there will be four groups of four members: group A, group B, group C, group D. Assign roles within each group as indicated in the section below and instruct learners that they need to focus on the task but also on their role, whenever working in a group.
➢ Distribute the task sheets with the desired content of learning: members of one "home group" each get a different segment of the assignment.
➢ Assign each student to learn their segment: students first read their own task sheet individually.

Step 2 (20 minutes)

Form temporary "specialist groups": these are new groups of students (four in this example) made up of one member of each "home group". In this example, the groups are as follows:
➢ Specialist group 1 is made up of members A1, B1, C1, D1, who have studied segment 1
➢ Specialist group 2 is made up of members A2, B2, C2, D2, who have studied segment 2
➢ Specialist group 3 is made up of members A3, B3, C3, D3, who have studied segment 3
➢ Specialist group 4 is composed of members A4, B4, C4, D4, who have studied segment 4

Step 3 (15 minutes)

➢ Bring the students back to their "home groups" A, B, C, and D. The teacher invites each "specialist" (a member of the group who has worked on a specific piece of content) to present their work and findings from the "specialist group" experience to the other members of the home group. This way all members of the home group gain deeper knowledge of the content. This phase of the work provides all group members with an understanding of their own material, as well as the findings that have emerged from the "specialists group" discussion.
➢ Monitor the groups closely and observe interactions: the teacher encourages autonomous work and intervenes only when necessary. She/he facilitates the work process as well as the inclusion and engagement of all students only when a difficulty is observed.

Step 4 (20 minutes)

Debriefing: each group gives their feedback. The groups may have a delegate or do it together. Discuss with a set of questions. Perhaps give a quick quiz.

Assigning roles in groups

In small groups, the instructor will often merely tell class participants to form groups to complete a class assignment. There is no structured interdependence, no individual accountability and communication skills are either assumed or ignored. Sometimes the group or the instructor may appoint a single leader. The emphasis is on the task, not the learner and the social process, and therefore has less potential for developing CDC than with co-operatively structured group work.

To set up roles, one possible procedure is to:

a. Prepare for each group a set of different coloured markers, equal to the number of group members (in the example above, for instance, red, blue, green and black). Ask participants to choose one of the markers.

b. Ask participants who have chosen a certain colour to raise their hand: they will be assigned roles/tasks. Assign to each colour group, in turn, one of the following roles. Ask them to repeat their task in front of the whole group to make sure the task is understood by all. Go through the same process for each of the following colour/roles/tasks:

Examples of possible roles for each group member:

Tracers: their task is to facilitate the group process, to keep the group on the given task. The Tracer, for example, can regularly make sure that the work results are summarised to help move on with the task.

Encouragers: their task is to ensure equal access and participation for all of the group members. The Encourager, for example, may encourage silent members to express themselves and talkative members to rest in silence if needed.

Timers: their task is to help the micro-group to be on time by finding common solutions, help the group find efficient ways of carrying out the task and finish on time. The Timer, for example, helps micro-group members to create quicker ways of completing the activity.

Writers: their task is to ensure that every group member's voice is taken into account and recorded.

Regardless of the topic studied and besides the additional knowledge gained about the topic, this process contributes to developing a variety of competences.

Competence	Descriptors
Responsibility	Submits required work on time Meets deadlines
Self-efficacy	Expresses a belief in his/her own ability to understand issues Expresses the belief that he/she can carry out activities that he/she has planned

Competence	Descriptors

Tolerance of ambiguity	Is comfortable in novel situations
	Expresses a willingness to consider contradictory or incomplete information without automatically rejecting it or jumping to a premature conclusion
Autonomous learning skills	Accomplishes learning tasks independently
	Seeks clarification of new information from other people when needed
Analytical and critical thinking skills	Can identify logical relationships in materials being analysed
	Can draw conclusions from the analysis of an argument
Skills of listening and observing	Actively listens to others
	Listens attentively to other people
Flexibility and adaptability	If something isn't going according to plan, he/she changes his/her actions to try and reach the goal
	Adjusts interaction style to interact more effectively with other people, when this is required
	Changes the way that he/she explains an idea if the situation requires this
Linguistic, communicative and plurilingual skills	Can get his/her point across
	Asks speakers to repeat what they have said if it wasn't clear to him/her
Co-operation skills	Builds positive relationships with other people in a group
	When working as a member of a group, does his/her share of the group's work
Conflict-resolution skills	Can assist others to resolve conflicts by enhancing their understanding of the available options
Knowledge and critical understanding of language and communication	Can describe some effects which different styles of language use can have in social and working situations
	Can describe the social impact and effects on others of different communication styles
	Can explain how tone of voice, eye contact and body language can aid communication

Project-based learning example: Project Citizen

Project Citizen is a project-based method used in many countries in the context of civic education and which contributes to the development of a large number of elements of CDC.

A class or group of learners will engage over a period of 10-12 weeks in a process consisting of the following steps and focusing on addressing a local community issue which can be solved by a public policy adopted at local level:

► Understanding the concept of public policy and making a list of issues affecting the local community.

► Selecting one community issue which can be solved by a local public policy to be studied in depth. The choice is made by the learners using democratic decision-making procedures.

► Collecting information about the selected issue from various sources, including the local authorities with relevant responsibilities, citizens affected by the issue, experts, civil society stakeholders, internet, etc. The information is organised in order to make an analysis of possible solutions, decide on a proposed public policy to address the issue and design an advocacy plan to promote the chosen solution.

► Production of a portfolio and a presentation consisting of four parts:

- description of the issue and explanation of why it is important and who is responsible for addressing it;
- analysis of a few possible solutions, pointing out advantages and disadvantages;
- description of the proposed public policy, its expected impact, cost, procedure of adoption and the fact that it is compatible with the principles of human rights, as well as with the national and European legal frameworks;
- outline of an advocacy plan explaining what citizens can do to persuade the responsible authorities to adopt the public policy proposed.

► Presentation of the result in a local meeting organised by the learners and possibly in larger public events.

► Reflection on the values, attitudes, skills, knowledge and critical understanding that have been developed through the whole process.

In various stages learners have to work together in small groups, interact in different ways with various community stakeholders, communicate and explain to the others their findings and proposals, and manage the process together.

This process develops all the elements of CDC mentioned for project-based learning. In addition, it cultivates the use of democratic decision-making procedures, the focus on public policy and the explicit requirement to comply with constitutional, legal and human rights standards. It stimulates the development of the following competences:

- Valuing human dignity and human rights;

- Valuing democracy, justice, equality, fairness and the rule of law

- Civic-mindedness and knowledge and critical understanding of human rights, democracy, justice and politics

- Knowledge and critical understanding of the world: depending on the topic selected by learners, which may be related to the environment, sustainable development, cultural diversity, migration, media, etc.

Developing analytical and critical thinking skills

Analytical and critical thinking skills are comprised in the high order cognitive domains. Such skills are essential and transversal to all subject matters. Becoming a critical thinker is a personal journey. Each individual will go through his or her own processes. Critical thinking occurs when learners are experiencing, analysing, evaluating, interpreting, synthesising information and applying creative thought to form an argument, solve a problem, or reach a conclusion. The output of this process is variable from learner to learner: "I construct knowledge for myself".

Some pedagogical approaches

Given the characteristics of the analytical and critical thinking skills, namely that the teaching takes into account the individual learner's learning needs, teachers may want to take the following into consideration:

➢ Analytical and critical thinking skills comprise a wide variety of approaches and learning strategies; the aim is to promote learning through the processing of information, or experience, and going beyond the memorisation of information and facts.
   - A simple approach is to identify one's learning outcomes. For this, (i) consult the descriptors and single one out, for example "185 – Prioritises choices before making a decision"; and (ii) break down the outcome in teachable/ learnable operations, for example "listing" ideas, "selecting "ideas, "ordering" the selected ideas, "justifying" the selection and order, relating this to a "decision".
   - A more complex approach is to (i) combine two descriptors. For example, "203 – Can evaluate the preconceptions and assumptions upon which materials are based" combined with "180 – Can evaluate information critically"; (ii) select a variety of written, visual, audio and/or digital materials; and (iii) ask a clear question, raise a doubt or use a prompt. In this approach, learners will focus on a) sorting out the different materials, b) unpacking the meaning of their content and researching the underlying assumptions and c) making judgments of the accuracy of the information conveyed.
➢ Whatever the approach, differentiated instructional strategies are applicable, taking into account individual learners' interests or strengths.
➢ Being aware of their own practice allows teachers to be confident, improve and give useful and meaningful feedback to learners. A key pitfall is the intro- duction of biases in the process of assessing learners' work; own assumptions (presuppositions/beliefs taken for granted) may bias subsequent judgments.

It is important that practitioners cultivate awareness of their implicit biases, work to increase empathy and empathic communication, and not to interact with learners in negative ways. Useful questions to consider are:
   - How can I be more aware of my implicit bias?
   - Am I assuming something I should not?
   - Are my assumptions logical and fair-minded?