



C U R T H

V A L U A T I O

R O U

Adoption: 6 June 2025 Public Publication: 5 December 2025 GrecoRC4(2025)2

FOURTH EVALUATION ROUND

Corruption prevention in respect of members of parliament, judges and prosecutors

SECOND ADDENDUM TO THE
SECOND COMPLIANCE REPORT
IRELAND

Adopted by GRECO at its 100^h Plenary Meeting (Strasbourg, 3-6 June 2025)

I. INTRODUCTION

- The <u>Fourth Evaluation Round Report on Ireland</u> was adopted by GRECO at its 65th Plenary Meeting (10 October 2014) and made public on 21 November 2014. GRECO's Fourth Evaluation Round deals with "Corruption Prevention in respect of Members of Parliament, Judges and Prosecutors".
- 2. The <u>Compliance Report</u> was adopted by GRECO at its 75th Plenary Meeting (20-24 March 2017) and made public on 29 June 2017, following authorisation by Ireland. It was concluded that Ireland had only implemented satisfactorily or dealt with in a satisfactory manner three out of the 11 recommendations and three partly. As a consequence, the compliance level was considered as "globally unsatisfactory" and GRECO decided to apply its "non-compliance" procedure.
- 3. The Interim Compliance Report was adopted at the 80th Plenary Meeting of GRECO (18-22 June 2018) and made public on 5 July 2018, following authorisation by Ireland. Some minor improvements were recognised, but the level of compliance remained "globally unsatisfactory".
- 4. The <u>Second Interim Compliance Report</u> was adopted by GRECO at its 85th Plenary Meeting (25 September 2020) and made public on 18 November 2020, following authorisation by Ireland. GRECO concluded that five of the 11 recommendations had been implemented satisfactorily or dealt with in a satisfactory manner. As a consequence, the level of compliance with the recommendations at that stage was no longer "globally unsatisfactory" within the meaning of Rule 31 revised, paragraph 8.3 of the Rules of Procedure, and GRECO discontinued its "non-compliance" procedure under Rule 32.
- 5. The <u>Second Compliance Report</u> was adopted by GRECO at its 90th Plenary Meeting (25 March 2022) and made public on 13 July 2022, following authorisation by Ireland.
- 6. The Addendum to the Second Compliance Report was adopted by GRECO at its 95th Plenary Meeting (1 December 2023) and made public on 30 January 2024, following authorisation by Ireland. Ireland was requested to submit additional information regarding the implementation of the outstanding recommendations. This information was received on 2 January 2025 and served as a basis for this Second Addendum.
- 7. The current <u>Second Addendum to the Second Compliance Report</u> evaluates the progress made in implementing the pending recommendations since the Addendum to the Second Compliance Report (i.e. recommendations i, iii vii and viii) and provides an overall appraisal of the level of compliance with these recommendations.
- 8. GRECO selected Estonia and the United Kingdom to appoint rapporteurs for the compliance procedure. The rapporteurs appointed were Ms Kätlin-Chris KRUUSMAA on behalf of Estonia (with respect to parliamentary assemblies), and Ms Fariha KHAN on behalf of the United Kingdom (with respect to judicial institutions). They were assisted by GRECO's Secretariat in drawing up this Second Addendum to the Second Compliance Report.

II. <u>ANALYSIS</u>

9. GRECO, in its Evaluation Report, had addressed 11 recommendations to Ireland. In the Addendum to the Second Compliance Report, GRECO concluded that recommendations ii, iv, v, vi, ix, x and xi had been implemented satisfactorily or dealt with in a satisfactory manner and recommendations i, iii, vii and viii had been partly implemented. Compliance with the four outstanding recommendations is examined below.

Corruption prevention in respect of members of parliament

Recommendation i

- 10. GRECO recommended that the existing ethics framework be replaced with a uniform and consolidated values-based normative framework encompassing the ethical conduct of members of parliament including their staff as appropriate covering various situations of conflicts of interest (gifts and other advantages, third party contacts including lobbyists, accessory activities and post-employment situations etc.) with the aim of providing clear rules concerning their expected conduct.
- 11. <u>GRECO assessed</u> this recommendation as having been partly implemented in the Addendum to the Second Compliance Report. Concrete steps had been taken in reviewing the legislation on ethics in public office before bringing new reform proposals to the Government. However, a general scheme for legislative reform was only under preparation by the Department of Public Expenditure NDP Delivery and Reform at the time.
- 12. The authorities report that the Department of Public Expenditure NDP Delivery and Reform has developed a general scheme for legislative reform, using the lapsed 2015 Public Sector Standards Bill as the point of departure. They also reiterate that the aim of the legislative proposal under preparation remains the same i.e. to provide for a uniform and consolidated values-based normative framework covering, *inter alia*, the ethical conduct of members of parliament including their staff as appropriate and addressing various situations of conflicts of interest (gifts and other advantages, accessory activities, and post-employment situations etc.). The authorities add that work on the legislative proposal has significantly advanced but was not yet finalised.
- 13. <u>GRECO</u> takes note of the progress made on the legislative proposal, which aims to provide for a uniform and consolidated values-based normative framework for members of parliament. GRECO strongly encourages the authorities to continue with and finalise the legislative proposal, which intends to address this recommendation.
- 14. GRECO therefore concludes that recommendation i remains partly implemented.

Recommendation iii

- 15. GRECO recommended that the existing regime on asset declarations be enhanced by (i) extending the obligations upon all members of parliament to disclose their interests to include quantitative data on their significant financial and economic involvements as well as in respect of significant liabilities; and (ii) that consideration be given to widening the scope of members' declarations to also include close or connected persons, in line with the existing rules for office holders.
- 16. <u>GRECO assessed</u> this recommendation as having been partly implemented in the Addendum to the Second Compliance Report. The general scheme of an Ethics reform bill was under preparation with the aim of addressing this recommendation.
- 17. The authorities report that the general scheme for legislative reform, as developed by the Department of Public Expenditure NDP Delivery and Reform, will address this recommendation by the introduction of obligations on office holders and senior officials to declare significant assets and liabilities and certain financial information, and on members of parliament to disclose the interests of family members, where those interests could influence the performance of official functions.
- 18. The authorities report that work on the proposal was significantly advanced at the time the legislature was dissolved before the November 2024 General Election.

- 19. <u>GRECO</u> takes note of the progress made on the general scheme for legislative reform, which aims to address this recommendation. GRECO encourages the authorities to continue on the path of legislative reform, which aims to improve the existing regime on asset declarations for members of parliament.
- 20. Consequently, GRECO concludes that recommendation iii remains partly implemented.

Corruption prevention in respect of judges

Recommendation vii

- 21. GRECO recommended that the current system for selection, recruitment, promotion and transfers of judges be reviewed with a view to target the appointments to the most qualified and suitable candidates in a transparent way, without improper influence from the executive/political powers.
- 22. <u>GRECO assessed</u> this recommendation as partly implemented in the previous Compliance Report. Progress had been noted, with amendments underway to the General Scheme of the Judicial Appointments Commission Bill, intended to reduce the Government's discretion in the appointment of judges, although these had yet to be adopted.
- 23. The authorities report that, following the signing into law on 8 December 2023 of the <u>Judicial Appointments Commission Act (2023)</u>, a Commencement Order came into effect on 1 January 2025 for the establishment of a new, independent Commission (known as JAC) to select and recommend persons for all judicial offices in Irish, European and international courts.
- 24. The authorities report, in particular, that the Act provides for the Commission to hold competitions and make recommendations to Government; a reduction in the number of recommendations has been introduced i.e. three candidates are to be recommended by the Commission for vacancy and an additional two recommendations for a second and additional vacancies. This would mean, for example, seven recommendations for three vacancies. Only candidates recommended by the Commission can be nominated by the Government for appointment by the President; all judicial posts (first appointment or promotion from another court) will be governed by the procedure. This limits the Government's choice, as it can only decide whether to advise the President to appoint a Commission-recommended individual. If it decides not to do so, the process must restart (it is recalled that, previously, the Government was not restricted to the nominees recommended by the Judicial Appointments Advisory Board, i.e. the predecessor of the current JAC).
- 25. Another key function of the JAC is to publish a judicial selection statement. The statement is to set out the knowledge, skills and attributes required for judicial office, along with the selection procedures, including the application format. Both the application process and reference process will be fully digitised. A newly launched website (www.judicialappointments.ie) will include information about the new selection process, current vacancies and how online applications can be made. For the first time, all nominees will be interviewed. The Commission will also have the objective that membership of the judiciary reflects the diversity of the population of Ireland and candidates will be required to show that they have undergone judicial training or are subject to continuous professional development.
- 26. The authorities also report that the independent Public Appointments Service has appointed the director of the new Commission and has sanctioned staff. The Commission members have also been selected, including: the Chief Justice (Chairs the

Commission), the President of the Court of Appeal, two judges nominated by the Judicial Council, four lay members selected by the Public Appointments Service and appointed by the Minister of Justice, and the Attorney General, who sits *ex officio* and will not have the right to vote. The first competition for judicial office under the new process was advertised on 13 March 2025 and the first appointments from the process will take place in the second quarter of 2025.

- 27. <u>GRECO</u> welcomes the new system of judicial selection, which marks an important milestone in the Irish judiciary. Following the signing into law of the Judicial Appointments Commission Act (2023), a Judicial Appointment Commission (JAC) was established on 1 January 2025 to make recommendations for the appointment or nomination to judicial office to be based on merit to ensure a system of selection, recommendation and promotion of judges that targets the appointment of the most qualified and suitable candidates in a transparent way. Provision is also made in legislation for the objective of appointing equal numbers of men and women, reflecting the diversity of the population.
- 28. More particularly, the JAC recommends three candidates for a vacancy and an additional two recommendations for a second and additional vacancies. Only candidates recommended by the JAC can be nominated by the Government for appointment by the President. All judicial posts, whether a first appointment or by promotion, will be governed by the procedure. Any person whether new applicants or serving judges seeking promotion to higher courts recommended to the Government for appointment must have been interviewed by the JAC. All in all, GRECO is satisfied with the action taken by the Irish authorities to address the concerns of recommendation vii by enhancing transparency and the merit-based requirements of judicial appointments, thereby limiting the Government's influence over the relevant processes.
- 29. GRECO concludes that recommendation vii has been implemented satisfactorily.

Recommendation viii

- 30. GRECO recommended that an appropriate structure be established within the framework of which questions concerning constitutional safeguards of the judiciary in connection with employment conditions are to be examined in close dialogue with judicial representatives with a view to maintain the high levels of judicial integrity and professional quality in the future.
- 31. <u>GRECO assessed</u> this recommendation as having been partly implemented in the previous Compliance Report. GRECO had previously welcomed the establishment of a Judicial Council in 2019, whose primary functions included, *inter alia*, promoting and maintaining excellence in the exercise of judicial functions by judges and ensuring high standards of conduct among them. In particular, with regard to judicial employment conditions, work was underway, with the Judicial Planning Working Group's report (2022) identifying shortcomings that still needed to be addressed. These included the effective use and management of judicial resources and the development of terms and conditions for judges in line with public service norms. The implementation of the aforementioned report was being monitored by a High-Level Steering Group. Specifically relating to remuneration, the Steering Group recommended the re-establishment of the Review Body on Higher Remuneration, possibly including the judiciary within its scope, which also needed to be addressed.
- 32. <u>The authorities</u> recall that the Minister of the Department of Public Expenditure NDP Delivery and Reform (DPENDR) published an Independent Review Panel Report (*Review of Senior Public Service Recruitment and Pay-Determination Processes*) in June 2023, which was informed by a public consultation process, including a

submission from the Association of Judges of Ireland. One of the key recommendations was to establish a statutory body to provide independent advice to the Minister of the DPENDR on the remuneration of senior (high-level) roles in the public service. The recommendation was that an independent statutory body would advise on remuneration arrangements for senior posts in the public service and CEOs of Commercial State Bodies following an instruction from the Minister of the DPENDR. The posts recommended to be covered by this body include members of the judiciary.

- 33. Following the Government's agreement (in June 2023) to establish this new body to replace the Review Body on Higher Remuneration, the Minister of the DPENDR announced (in March 2024) the establishment of the <u>Senior Posts Remuneration Committee</u> (SPRC), in line with the Independent Review Panel's recommendation. The SPRC will be independent in the performance of its functions i.e. to provide objective and independent advice to the Minister of the DPENDR regarding the remuneration of senior roles in the Public Service, including of members of the judiciary¹. For the moment, the SPRC is operating on an administrative basis and the DPENDR is progressing the necessary legislation to establish the SPRC on a statutory basis and put in place the appropriate structure and functions.
- 34. The authorities report, with respect to the Judicial Planning Working Group, that the Government had decided to proceed with the appointment of the second tranche of 20 additional judges in October 2024 (following the first tranche of 24 judges appointed in 2023). These judges will be appointed over the next two years.
- 35. The authorities also report that a new Judicial Resource Planning Model is to be developed to ensure that Ireland has a sufficient number of judges to meet its current and future requirements.
- 36. <u>GRECO</u> takes due note that a new advisory body (i.e. the Senior Posts Remuneration Committee), soon to be a statutory body, will replace the Review Body on Higher Remuneration. It also notes that this body will advise on remuneration arrangements for senior posts in the public service, CEOs of Commercial State Bodies and members of the judiciary. This will be done through draft amendments to the Civil Service Regulation Act 1956, which establish this new body, but have yet to be adopted. GRECO encourages the authorities to adopt these draft amendments as soon as possible so that this body can start functioning.
- 37. In addition, GRECO takes note that a further 20 judges will be appointed over the next two years and that a new Judicial Resource Planning Model is under preparation to ensure the required number of judges are in place to ensure an efficient judiciary. GRECO encourages the authorities to continue their work on this Model and its future implementation.
- 38. Consequently, <u>GRECO concludes that recommendation viii remains partly</u> implemented.

III. CONCLUSIONS

39. In view of the foregoing, GRECO concludes that I reland has now implemented satisfactorily or dealt with in a satisfactory manner eight out of the 11 recommendations contained in the Fourth Round Evaluation Report. Of the pending recommendations, all three remain partly implemented.

¹ <u>List of Senior Public Service Roles to Fall within Purview of the Senior Post Remuneration Committee</u>: [...] b. The Judiciary [...].

- 40. More specifically, recommendations ii, iv, v, vi, vii, ix, x and xi have been implemented satisfactorily or dealt with in a satisfactory manner, recommendations i, iii and viii remain partly implemented.
- 41. As regards members of parliament, legislative progress has been made with the development of a general scheme for legislative reform that aims to provide for a uniform and consolidated values-based normative framework to cover, among others, the ethical conduct of members of parliament and enhanced financial disclosure requirements. However, legislative amendments have yet to be adopted for the two outstanding recommendations in this area to be effectively addressed.
- 42. As for judges, significant progress has been made with the establishment of the Judicial Appointments Commission in January 2025, whose director, staff as well as its members are all in place. This Commission will make recommendations for the appointment or nomination to judicial office based on merit to ensure a system of selection, recommendation and promotion of judges that targets the appointment of the most qualified and suitable candidates in a transparent way. In addition, a government decision to appoint a further 20 judges over the next two years, has been rendered, which represents the second tranche of additional judges to be appointed following the first tranche of 24 judges appointed in 2023. A new Judicial Resource Planning Model is under preparation to confirm that the required number of judges are in place so as to ensure the judiciary's efficiency. Some progress has been made with the drafting of amendments to the Civil Service Regulation Act that will introduce a new advisory body (i.e. the Senior Posts Remuneration Committee) to replace the Review Body on Higher Remuneration. This new committee will advise on remuneration arrangements for senior posts in the public service, CEOs of Commercial State Bodies and members of the judiciary. However, these draft amendments have not yet been adopted.
- 43. The adoption of this Second Addendum to the Second Compliance Report <u>terminates</u> the Fourth Round compliance procedure in respect of Ireland. The authorities of Ireland may, however, wish to inform GRECO of further developments with regard to the implementation of the outstanding recommendations.
- 44. Finally, GRECO invites the authorities of Ireland to authorise, as soon as possible, the publication of the report and to make it public.