

APPENDIX

The following appendix does not form part of ECRI's analysis and proposals concerning the situation in “the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”

ECRI wishes to point out that the analysis contained in its third report on “the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”, is dated 25 June 2004, and that any subsequent development is not taken into account.

In accordance with ECRI's country-by-country procedure, ECRI's draft report on “the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia” was subject to a confidential dialogue with the authorities of “the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”. A number of their comments were taken into account by ECRI, and integrated into the report.

However, following this dialogue, the authorities of “the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia” requested that the following viewpoints on their part be reproduced as an appendix to ECRI's report.

“Comments of the Government of the Republic of Macedonia on the ECRI Third Report on the Republic of Macedonia

The Government of the Republic of Macedonia highly values the contribution of ECRI to combating racism and discrimination and attaches great importance to the cooperation with the Commission. The Government will take due account of its recommendations in its ongoing and future policy setting in the spheres of ECRI mandate.

The comments on the specific parts of the report are as follows:

International legal instruments

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs drafted the Law on Ratification of the European Social Charter and the Protocol amending the European Social Charter of 21 October 1991. The Law is in the governmental procedure. Furthermore, the Ministry of Labor and Social Policy is in the process of considering the possibility of signing the European Convention on the Legal Status of Migrant Workers.

On 26 November 2004 the Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Macedonia, following the ratification by Parliament of the amendments to the Law on Citizenship, signed a letter by which the reservation to Chapter III, Article 6, item 3 of the European Convention on Nationality, dealing with the length of residency before an individual may lodge an application for naturalization, was withdrawn.

The Charter for Regional or Minority Languages will be ratified after the Parliament of the Republic of Macedonia adopts the Law on Use of Languages, which is drafted at the Ministry of Justice. Irrespective of the fact that this Convention has still not been ratified, the standards set in the Republic of Macedonia go beyond the standards on the use of minority languages guaranteed under the Charter.

Citizenship Law

The Law amending the Law on Citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia No. 08/2004) entered into force on 2 March 2004. As noted by ECRI, the Ministry of the Interior believes that the consistent implementation of this Law will enable all persons - nationals of other republics of the former SFRY and nationals of the former SFRY, regardless of their ethnic background - who after the state succession continued to reside in the Republic of Macedonia, to regulate their citizenship status in the Republic of Macedonia i.e. will acquire citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia.

The amendments to the Law on Citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia in general, and Article 14 in particular, are compatible with the European Convention on Nationality, which has been confirmed by the expert opinion of the Council of Europe and of the UN High Commissioner for Refugees, whose experts have been directly involved in specific segments of the process of adoption of the amendments to the Law.

Article 14 of the Law amending the Law on Citizenship is in compliance with all provisions of Chapter 6 of the European Convention dealing with issues related to state succession and citizenship and with the Explanatory Report of the Council of Europe on the Convention. In this regard, it incorporates the principles of existence of genuine and effective linkage of the person seeking citizenship with the State which, inter alia, can be confirmed by sufficient Macedonian language knowledge, acceptable even at the level that the applicant can communicate with the society; another aspect in compliance with the Convention is the consideration of the place of residence at the time of the state succession, the will of the concerned person etc. The condition that there are no criminal proceedings against the person instituted in the Republic of Macedonia is not contrary to the Convention, especially in light of the fact that such a condition is limited only to crimes threatening security and defense of the Republic of Macedonia.

As to the application fee, it has been lowered upon the initiative of the Ministry of the Interior, in accordance with the Convention's provisions that State Parties should pay due attention that the citizenship fee is set reasonably high. Furthermore, under the Law on Administrative Fees of the Republic of Macedonia (Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia No. 17/92) citizens with low income, social protection beneficiaries under the Law on Social Protection are exempt from payment of fees, and the Ministry of the Interior applies these provisions consistently.

In the course of the several month application of Article 14, the Ministry of the Interior has acted consistently and has applied this Article in a generous manner. After the entry into force of the Law amending the Law on Citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia and following the provisions set forth in the said Law, all procedures instituted prior to the adoption of the amendments and in cases in respect of which appropriate requirements were met, have been transferred for processing under Article 14. In the above stated period of application of the provisions contained in Article 14, 580 persons acquired citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia on the grounds set forth in Article 14, while the procedure for 800 person is still pending. In the same period, it has been established that 41 persons do not fulfill the conditions for acquisition of citizenship on the Article 145 grounds since most of them do not habitually reside on the territory of the Republic of Macedonia, while only in 8 cases the concerned persons did not have sufficient Macedonian language knowledge. According to the applicable legislation in the Republic of Macedonia, dissatisfied applicants can complain with the Second Instance Commission and subsequently can initiate a lawsuit before the Supreme Court of the Republic of Macedonia.

In respect of the principle of avoiding statelessness, it is necessary to refer to the legislation regulating citizenship of the former SFRY, i.e. regulations that had been applicable prior to the state succession. Namely, in accordance with the then applicable regulations, in addition to the federal citizenship, each citizen of the former SFRY obligatorily possessed citizenship of a one of the federal republics, and vice versa each citizen of a one of the federal republics obligatorily possessed federal citizenship as well. The republic citizenship was not connected to the residence of the citizen which specifically implies that a citizen of any of the republics of the former SFRY could have registered residence i.e. posses an ID issued in another republic. This is stated in order to clarify that no citizen of the former SFRY, such as the case of the persons who after the succession remained to reside on the territory of the Republic of Macedonia, are stateless persons, but after the break up of former SFRY and following the principle of legal continuity incorporated in the legislations of the new states established after the brake up, are in fact citizens of one of the republics. In light of the above stated, even in exceptional cases, when the person that applies under Article 14 of the Law amending the Law on Citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia does not fulfill the conditions envisaged in this Article i.e. cannot acquire citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia on any of the grounds set forth in the Law and originates from the former SFRY, the person is not a stateless person.

It is again underlined as in the previous replies to the ECRI reports, i.e. that the Law on Citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia or the amendments to the said Law have no discriminating effect on any grounds - the Law does not discriminate against Albanians and Roma, or against any other ethnic group. The in-depth analysis of the Law and its long year application will show that the non-discrimination principle is integrated in the provisions regulating the conditions and in the position towards the applicants applying for citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia.

The Ministry of the Interior in cooperation with the UNHCR, the Council of Europe, the OSCE and the non-governmental organizations working on issues related to the citizenship will continue informing the public about the amendments to the Law on Citizenship in order that the transitional provisions are brought as close as possible to these that they are intended for. Therefore, there are brochures prepared, and there is relevant information at the Ministry's website, while representatives of the Ministry participate in meetings and debates organized by the NGO sector, political parties, the media etc.

In conclusion as it has already been stated, the non-discrimination principle is fully incorporated in the Law. Hence, the non-discrimination principle is also applied to the provisions for re-acquisition of citizenship of the Republic of Macedonia by emigrants and their descendants, up to the first line of descent. The amendments to the Law regarding these specific provisions are aimed at defining the term “emigrant”, to be previously determined (whether the applicant is an emigrant or not) in each case individually, whereby “emigrant” as defined by this Law is a citizen of the Republic of Macedonia who has moved out of the Republic of Macedonia into another state, except to the country of origin, regardless of the gender, race, color of skin, nationality or social origin, political or religious belief, property of special status. Hence, the Law is equal for all, and it is considered, on case-by-case basis, whether the person is an emigrant as defined in the Law, and whether the person has moved to a country of origin. This provisions are not contrary to the European Convention on Nationality which sets forth that each country in cases and under conditions prescribed by law, will enable re-acquisition of nationality by former nationals who legally or habitually reside on their territories.

Criminal Law Provisions

As to the recommendations contained in paragraphs 27 and 29 of the report recommending to the authorities to explicitly provide in law that racist motivation constitutes a specific aggravating circumstance for all offences, it must be noted that the Criminal Code of the Republic of Macedonia has implicitly provided legal grounds for their application. Namely, paragraph 2, Article 39 –General rules on determination of the punishment - envisage the following: The Court shall take into consideration all circumstances that affect the punishment (facilitating or aggravating circumstances) and especially the degree of criminal liability, the motives of the offense, the intensity of the threat or violation of the protected property, the circumstances under which the offense has been perpetrated, the earlier life of the perpetrator, his/her personal circumstances, and his/her behavior after the perpetrated offense and other circumstances related to the personality of the perpetrator.

The conclusion drawn that persons working within the criminal justice system lack knowledge of the relevant provisions of the Criminal Code presented in paragraph 28 of the draft-report has no grounds.

In addition to the amendments to the Criminal Code of the Republic of Macedonia of March 2004, advancing the criminal law protection against discrimination, mentioned in ECRI's report, paragraph 26, a reference should also be made to Article 138-criminal liability for legal entities for violation of the right to use the language and alphabets.

In respect of the crimes sanctioned in Article 144- endangering the safety, a new paragraph 4 is introduced which reads as follows: The person that by using a computer system will threaten to perpetrate a crime for which five year prison sentence or more is prescribed, against a person on grounds of his/her affiliation to a national, ethnic, or racial group or on grounds of his/her religion, shall be punished from one to up to five year imprisonment.

c) A new Article 403-a has been introduced in respect of the crimes against humanity which reads as follows: The person that with the intention of systematic destruction of civilian population, shall order murders, grievous bodily injuries, physical extermination, enslaving, deportation or forced displacement of population, imprisonment or other type of deprivation of freedom contrary to international law, torture, rape, sexual exploitation or slavery, forced prostitution, forced pregnancy, forced sterilization or another other type of grievous sexual violation, persecution of any group or community on grounds of political, racial, national, ethnic cultural, religious affiliation or on grounds of gender discrimination, forced apprehension and disappearance of persons, discrimination and division on racial, national, ethnic, political, cultural or any other grounds and other inhuman procedures by which physical or psychological suffering is intentionally caused, or the person who with the same intentions shall perpetrate some of the above referred to crimes, shall be punished from one year up to life imprisonment.

d) A new Article 407-a has been introduced in respect of the crime –approving or justifying genocide, crimes against humanity or war crimes which reads as follows: 1. The person who by use of an IT system will publicly deny, grossly minimize, approve or justify the crime sanctioned in Articles 403 to 407 shall be punished from one to five year imprisonment. 2. If the denial, minimization, approval or justification has been perpetrated with the intention of inciting hatred, discrimination or violence against certain person or group of persons on grounds of their national, ethnic or racial affiliation or religion, the perpetrator shall be punished with at least four year imprisonment.

Civil and administrative law provisions

In respect of the conclusion presented in paragraph 33 that the legislative framework for combating discrimination through civil and administrative law has not been strengthened despite reports of continuing discrimination, direct and indirect in a number of fields of life, the following should be taken into consideration:

In 2002 the amendments to the Civil Procedure Code and the Administrative Procedure Law were adopted aimed at implementing the Framework Agreement in line with the amended Constitution of the Republic of Macedonia.

Namely, Amendment V to the Constitution of the Republic of Macedonia replacing Article 7 of the Constitution envisages that the official language on entire territory of the Republic of Macedonia and the official language in international relations is the Macedonian language and its Cyrillic alphabet. Paragraph 2 stipulates that the language used by at least 20% of the citizens is also an official language and paragraph 5 sets forth that other than the Macedonian language, another official language may be used in the state authority organs in the Republic of Macedonia, in accordance with the Law.

In addition, pursuant to paragraph 6.7. of the Framework Agreement, in criminal and civil law procedures at any level, the defendant and other participants in the proceedings shall have the right to interpretation of the entire proceedings and of the documents the costs for which shall be covered by the state, in accordance with the relevant Council of Europe document.

The adopted amendments to the Civil Procedure Code and the Administrative Procedure Law which regulate the use of the language, operationalise the above stated provisions, under which the right to use of the languages of the communities in civil and administrative law procedures is advanced.

Administration of justice

Judges are fully aware of the provisions on the use of languages in the court proceedings and further measures are being taken for the employment, education and training of court typists and translators in the languages of the communities.

Specialized bodies and other institutions

The ECRI Report was forwarded to the Office of the Ombudsman of the Republic of Macedonia.

According to the Law (Official Gazette No. 60/2003) bodies and organization are obliged to inform the Ombudsman on the measures adopted based on his/her recommendations or opinions within 30 days at the latest. If the body or organization do not inform the Ombudsman or partially accept the recommendations then the Ombudsman can inform the immediately higher instance body, competent ministry at the Government of the Republic of Macedonia and he/she can also inform the Parliament of the Republic of Macedonia in a separate report or he /she can publicize the case.

In connection with the ECRI recommendations on the Committee for Inter Community Relations, the Committee believes that the concerns of minority communities represented

with only one member are consistently heard. The most recent example was their discussion on the situation in elementary and secondary schools in the Republic of Macedonia, with a special emphasis on the education in languages of smaller communities. The Committee adopted the opinion and proposed adequate measures, which were supported by the Assembly. The Committee believes that it is ever more fulfilling its role as provided for by the Constitution of the Republic of Macedonia.

Education and awareness raising

As noted in paragraph 56 of the ECRI's report, the contents relating to human rights and democratic values are a regular part of primary school and secondary schools curricula. A large number of projects have already been implemented, some still pending, all aimed at training the teachers in the subject matter.

The remaining concerns will be addressed with the development of a National Action Plan on Human Rights Education. Namely, national consultations on human rights education were carried out 2003/2004 under the auspices of the OHCHR-Government technical cooperation program in the field of human rights, led by the strategic partnership group, involving government, international organizations and civil society sector. Recommendation to which they came out was to develop a National Action Plan on Human Rights Education, which has been supported by the Ministry of Education.

As noted in the report, upon the request of the Ministry of Science and Education, an expert analysis has been made of the textbooks on civil culture for primary education in which there have been examples noticed of negative stereotypes regarding persons belonging to ethnic communities in the Republic of Macedonia, especially regarding the Roma community. The negative stereotypes have been eliminated from the textbooks and afterwards they have been redistributed to the pupils of primary schools.

Regarding the revision of text books and history teaching manuals, the Bureau for Development of Education has established respective Committees for preparation of the history curricula and for drafting history text books in primary education, general secondary education and vocational secondary schools. Experts belonging to all communities in Macedonia (Macedonians, Albanians and Turks) are obligatory members of the Committees. In preparation of the history curricula, the Committees engage experts in the field of history, and teachers from primary and secondary schools are also involved.

In drafting the new curricula and the text books and manuals, great attention is paid to apply European standards and that all stereotypes are eliminated, i.e. that positive historic development, personalities and cultural achievements of importance for the country's history are integrated in the curricula in respect of all ethnic communities of the Republic of Macedonia.

Reception and status of non-citizens

In respect of paragraph 62 it should be noted that the level of protection of applicants is determined based on merits of every individual case and in accordance with the Law on Asylum and Temporary Protection. There is no ground for concern expressed by ECRI regarding the determination of status.

The recommendations contained in paragraphs 64 and 65 have already been implemented in practice and in the legislation.

Trafficking in human beings

The Republic of Macedonia has made great progress in this field, which has also been recognized at the international level.

The recommendation to extend assistance programs also to victims that do not cooperate with the police will be taken into consideration in the drafting of new legislation in this field.

Internally displaced persons

The return of the displaced persons to their homes in safety has been one of the priorities of the Government of the Republic of Macedonia.

The Ministry of the Interior undertakes continuous activities to improve the overall security situation in the former crisis regions and to create conditions for the return of internally displaced persons. In this context, and aimed at creating conditions for more efficient police work, there are especially intensive activities for the reconstruction and construction of police stations. In this respect, in some of the regions there are already regular police stations being constructed, and in the other regions the police stations will be constructed following the planned dynamic, i.e. when the necessary funding shall have been secured.

Furthermore, for the purpose of successful cooperation between the police and the local population there have been advisory groups established in these regions, which encompass representatives of the local self-government, local population, police and other relevant ministries and state institutions. These advisory groups review the security problems and agree on measures for their overcoming.

As a result of the comprehensive activities, there has been improvement of the security situation in the former crisis regions, which can be illustrated with the evident decrease of serious form of crimes against the security, life and body of citizens from these regions, as well as by the fact that most of the internally displaced persons have already returned to their homes.

Access to education

With the aim to address the drop-out rate of ethnic Albanian and ethnic Turkish pupils in the education system, the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Macedonia has undertaken a set of measures aimed at reducing and eventually eliminating this phenomenon and facilitating conditions for the reintegration of the pupils in the education system. Seminars were organized for the school principals, teachers and representatives of the expert services at schools (pedagogues, sociologists, psychologists) who are trained for undertaking concrete measures to decrease the dropout rate. Expert and information materials have been distributed and surveys of the school teams made in order to detect the reasons for the dropout. There has been also a strategy prepared defining future activities to prevent dropout of children from the education process. The project activities are realized in cooperation with the Skopje UNICEF Office, which financially supports the "Education for All" project.

The preliminary information point to the conclusion that the basic reasons for the dropout of pupils of the Albanian ethnic communities (as well as of the Roma community) are to be found in the tradition, lifestyle, religion, habits, the change of which require longer period. It is hoped that with the completion of the project by the end of 2005, the situation will be positively changed and that the dropout rate will be reduced.

It is worth mentioning that Governmental efforts have been focused on the alleviation of the problem of the Turkish ethnic community, especially in the East and in the Southeastern parts of Macedonia where this problem is evident due to the configuration of the terrain, i.e. the classes in the mountainous areas are distant from the central primary schools. In the attempt to secure larger coverage of pupils from these schools, the Ministry of Education opened classes from the V to VIII grade in the Turkish language of instruction.

In the last several years the Ministry of Education and Science and the Bureau for Development of Education have undertaken concrete steps to improve the situation of the Turkish ethnic minority in Macedonia in terms of education. Numerous efforts have been made to open new classes of Turkish language of instruction, and to finance printing of textbooks and reference literature in the Turkish language. Furthermore, the Bureau for Development of Education has included teachers belonging to the Turkish ethnic community

in the preparation of the new curricula in Turkish language of instruction, including them in the preparation of the history curricula and textbooks as well. A special attention has been paid to the upgrading of the teachers professionals' skills, through the organization of different seminars.

Teaching staff is still a problem for the Turkish ethnic community. Recognizing this fact, the Ministry of Education and Science makes serious efforts to resolve this problem. With the opening of the new Universities in the country, as well as through studies in Turkey, the situation with respect to the necessary teaching staff regarding some of the subjects has been significantly improved lately.

Conduct of certain institutions

The Government of the Republic of Macedonia closely cooperates with the European Committee against Torture. In February 2003 the Government adopted a number of conclusions in which it reaffirmed its commitment to overcoming the identified problems what is in full compliance with its lasting commitment to the functioning of the rule of law in the Republic of Macedonia. The Government of the Republic of Macedonia underscored that ill-treatment of detained persons by law enforcement officers is an affront to the values which constitute the foundations of a democratic state, respect for human rights and the rule of law, and that such acts shall not be tolerated, as well as that the perpetrators shall be severely sanctioned, as prescribed by law. The Ministry of Internal Affairs was tasked to investigate all cases of ill-treatment or inappropriate conducts by officers of the Ministry of Internal Affairs identified in the CPT reports and to act accordingly.

One of the priorities of the Government included in the Action Plan for European Partnership is full implementation of the CPT recommendations, in particular regarding combating impunity and safeguards against ill-treatment.

Human rights education is an important segment of the professional training in the Ministry of the Interior. During 2003, in cooperation with the OSCE the total of 2953 police officers were trained in human rights, and 182 in arrest and detention. There is also a wide cooperation on this issue with the civil society sector in the country.

In January 2004 the Minister of the Interior endorsed the Code of Ethics as part of the overall police reform.

One of the strategic goals of the Ministry of the Interior is to continue to build confidence between the police and the population. The concept of community policing serves this end. The Citizen's Advisory Groups, the aim of which is to openly discuss and resolve local problems in the sphere of policing, which were first established in the former crisis regions proceed to be established throughout the country.

Specific issues

Situation of the Roma in various fields of life

The National Strategy for Advancement of the Status of Roma is being prepared and the Government is to adopt the document by the end 2004.

Furthermore, under the international initiative entitled "Decade for integration of Roma 2005-2015" the activities for improvement of the economic and social status of Roma will be strengthened, by creating a framework of action setting clear and measurable national goals.

The Action plans referred to in paragraph 98 of ECRI's report will also include the reforms and programs necessary to attain the goals of the Decade until 2015 in the four priority areas.

Roma children's access to education

Primary education is obligatory in the Republic of Macedonia. Secondary education is not obligatory, but it is free of charge and accessible for all under equal conditions. However, the state has not fulfilled its obligation to secure education for all children primarily in respect of certain vulnerable groups. Therefore, the Bureau for Development of Education, starting this 2003/2004 academic year has commenced with the implementation of the already mentioned Project "Education for All". This project is aimed at increasing the coverage of children from vulnerable groups in primary and secondary education, then at decreasing the drop-out rate, improving the conditions for education of the Roma with a special emphasis on the female population, securing and improving the conditions for education of children from rural areas etc.

The goal of decreasing the dropout rate and increasing the coverage of Roma children in the education system of the Republic of Macedonia will be accomplished through a set of measures. Namely, by improving the teaching environment in schools with large number of Roma children, focusing on the female population; by securing conditions for education of the community; by raising the awareness for responsibility of the community, of parents and other social factors; by increasing the coverage of children that continue formal education, focusing on classes with the highest dropout rate and on continuing with secondary education.

The subproject is carried out in schools and municipalities where there is high concentration of Roma population, high unemployment rate and low level of education. Large number of non-governmental and civil associations, as well as relevant institutions and stakeholders at the local level participate and contribute to the successful realization of this subproject.

Implementation of the Ohrid Framework Agreement

The implementation of the Ohrid Framework Agreement concerns all communities who are not in majority in the Republic of Macedonia. The Government of the Republic of Macedonia takes due account that the implementation is all inclusive of all ethnic communities. One of the examples was training of new police officers, conducted in cooperation with the OSCE, where strict attention was paid to equitable representation of all communities.

With a Government decision, a sector for the implementation of the Framework Agreement was established in the General Secretariat of the Government. The sector consists of five units in which members of smaller minorities are also employed. The main motivation for establishment of this sector was to support the Government in policy setting and to coordinate the implementation of the Framework Agreement.

Public opinion leaders and the media

Although there are cases of individuals supporting further ethnic division, the wording used in the ECRI report - many political leaders, intellectuals, religious figures - is too strong and without sufficient arguments and concrete indications. Thus, an impression is prompted that the majority of public opinion creators in the Republic of Macedonia hold positions favoring further deepening of the differences along ethnic lines, what is not the case. On the contrary, the situation has significantly improved.

The project "Pages for mutual understanding" is published each Thursday and it contains already published texts elaborating inter-ethnic relations in the Republic of Macedonia. The Macedonian Information Agency, and the dailies Vecer, Dnevnik, Lobi, Utrinski vesnik and Fakti participate with their articles.

As regards the ECRI concerns about the ethnic divide of the media and hate speech, the Agency for Information proposed and the Government of the Republic of Macedonia approved the Information on the need for harmonization of the national legislation with the European media standards. In the concluding part of the this Information, there is a stress on the need for informative regulation of the issue of hate speech, culture of tolerance, protection of journalists in situations of conflicts and tensions. This is also part of the

commitment to consistent implementation of the recommendations of the Council of Europe regarding the media in the Republic of Macedonia.

Equitable representation and language use

According to the Ministry of Finance data of July 2004, the number of ethnic communities members employed in the public administration (budgetary users) is as follows:

	Employees		Percentage %
Macedonians	70254	or	81,4%
Albanians	9448		13,4%
Serbs	1172		1,7%
Turks	890		1,3%
Roma	357		0,5%
Vlachs	332		0,5%
Boshnjaks	180		0,3%
Other	667		0,9%

In the period January-August 2004, 152 new job opportunities have opened up for ethnic communities' members.

In 2004, most state institution adopted annual plans for appropriate and equitable representation of communities' members. The aim of these plans is to set out a long-term implementation policy for equitable representation. These plans incorporate: the actual structure of communities members, the data on the effects of the measures taken previously, the data on new employment and the measures for education and advanced training, related to the implementation of the provision. The application of this provision at the municipal level will be monitored closely in the forthcoming period.

As regards recommendation 152, one should take into account that the Macedonian language proficiency is obligatory and that policies should be aimed at developing staff that in addition to the Macedonian language speak other official languages of communication with a public institution.

As far as Recommendation 153 is concerned, one should take into account that the rationalization of the public administration and decrease in the number of employees is not owed to the equitable representation. However, retraining is indeed necessary for people who lose their job due the rationalization of the public administration.

As far as recommendation 154 is concerned, constitutional and legal provisions will be strictly implemented when it comes to the use of languages.”