

*Building trust
by delivering support,
protection and justice*

Monaco

First thematic
evaluation report

GREVIO

Group of Experts
on Action against Violence
against Women and
Domestic Violence



Council of Europe Convention
on preventing and combating
violence against women
and domestic violence
(Istanbul Convention)

GREVIO(2024)3
published on 12 September 2024

GREVIO's First thematic evaluation report

**Building trust by delivering
support, protection and justice**

MONACO

Group of Experts
on Action against Violence against Women
and Domestic Violence (GREVIO)

GREVIO(2024)3

Adopted by GREVIO on 21 June 2024

Published on 12 September 2024

Secretariat of the monitoring mechanism of the Council of Europe Convention
on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence
Council of Europe
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex
France

www.coe.int/en/web/istanbul-convention

Contents

Executive summary..... 4

Introduction 6

I. Emerging trends in the areas of violence against women and domestic violence..... 8

II. Changes in definitions, comprehensive and co-ordinated policies, funding and data collection in the areas of violence against women and domestic violence 10

A. Definitions (Article 3)..... 10

B. Comprehensive and co-ordinated policies (Article 7) 11

C. Financial resources (Article 8)..... 13

D. Data collection (Article 11) 13

III. Analysis of the implementation of selected provisions in priority areas in the fields of prevention, protection and prosecution 16

A. Prevention 16

1. General obligations (Article 12) 16

2. Education (Article 14) 17

3. Training of professionals (Article 15) 19

4. Preventive intervention and treatment programmes (Article 16) 20

B. Protection and support..... 21

1. General obligations (Article 18) 21

2. General support services (Article 20)..... 23

3. Specialist support services (Article 22) 25

4. Support for victims of sexual violence (Article 25)..... 26

C. Substantive law 27

1. Custody, visitation rights and safety (Article 31) 27

2. Prohibition of mandatory alternative dispute resolution processes or sentencing (Article 48)..... 29

D. Investigation, prosecution, procedural law and protective measures..... 29

1. General obligations (Article 49) and immediate response, prevention and protection (Article 50)..... 29

2. Risk assessment and risk management (Article 51) 33

3. Emergency barring orders (Article 52) 34

4. Restraining or protection orders (Article 53) 35

5. Measures of protection (Article 56) 36

Appendix I List of proposals and suggestions by GREVIO..... 38

Appendix II List of the national authorities, other public bodies, non-governmental organisations and civil society organisations with which GREVIO held consultations 43

Executive summary

This evaluation report addresses progress made in bringing support, protection and justice to victims of violence against women and domestic violence under selected provisions of the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence. It has been drawn up by the Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (GREVIO), an independent human rights monitoring body mandated to monitor the implementation of the convention. GREVIO's findings identify developments that have occurred since the publication, on 27 September 2017, of the baseline evaluation report on Monaco and are based on the information obtained during the various steps of the first thematic evaluation procedure, set out in Article 68 of the convention. These include written reports (a state report submitted by the Monegasque authorities), and a four-day evaluation visit to Monaco. A list of the bodies and entities with which GREVIO had exchanges can be found in Appendix II.

The report assesses the wide variety of measures taken by the Monegasque authorities to prevent violence against women and domestic violence and to deliver protection, support and justice for victims, in line with the overarching theme selected by GREVIO for this first thematic evaluation report. In identifying emerging trends in preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence, GREVIO shines a light on laudable efforts made for the implementation of the convention. It also provides more in-depth information on the implementation of selected provisions in the areas of prevention, protection and prosecution as building blocks for a comprehensive response to the different forms of violence against women that instils trust in victims.

In this regard, GREVIO welcomes the legislative developments that have taken place since its baseline evaluation and which help to better meet the requirements of the Istanbul Convention, in particular the 2021 reform of the Criminal Code which led to amendments to the provisions regarding incrimination for sexual assault and a major law on combating bullying and violence in schools, which was likewise adopted in 2021.

In addition, the Monegasque authorities have stepped up efforts to raise awareness among the general public on the issue of violence against women, through a range of awareness-raising activities and campaigns. Since it was set up in 2018, the Committee to Promote and Safeguard Women's Rights has played an important role in this respect. The formation of the committee has also helped to improve communication between various government sectors, as well as with civil society, along with the co-ordination of action. In addition, the committee has facilitated the implementation of training for various groups of professionals. GREVIO also welcomes the fact that social workers and psychologists are systematically made available to victims of violence in the various services involved.

Beyond the progress made in Monaco to implement the convention, GREVIO has identified areas which require urgent action by the authorities to comply fully with the convention's provisions. In particular, the authorities should develop a long-term comprehensive strategy offering a set of policies to prevent and combat all forms of violence against women and including an intersectional approach. In addition, they should put in place accountability programmes for perpetrators of violence to prevent re-offending. There is also a need to set up a 24/7 national, specialist helpline for women victims and a specialised crisis centre for victims of sexual violence. Lastly, it is essential to take measures to protect the rights and interests of victims during investigations and judicial proceedings.

In addition, GREVIO has identified a number of additional issues that require sustained action in order to effectively build trust by delivering protection, support and justice for acts of violence against women. These relate to the need to:

-
- evaluate, on a regular basis, policies aimed at achieving the comprehensive and co-ordinated policy approach required by the Istanbul Convention and expand measures to include all forms of violence against women;
 - continue to develop the collection of data on all forms of violence against women and take measures so as to have full data on judicial proceedings; produce teaching material on violence against women and the subjects listed in Article 14 of the Istanbul Convention;
 - continue efforts with regard to initial and in-service training for professionals in contact with women victims of violence, including judges and lawyers;
 - ensure that women exposed to intersectional violence have full access to specialist services;
 - ensure that incidents of violence against women are considered a legally binding criterion in decision-making concerning custody and visitation rights;
 - standardise the practice of co-ordinated risk assessment, by extending it to all services in contact with victims, on the basis of a shared system.

GREVIO has identified further areas in which improvements are required in order to comply fully with the obligations under this round's theme. These relate to, among other things, the need to ensure that sufficient resources continue to be allocated to programmes and measures to prevent and combat violence against women and to secure the support provided to non-governmental organisations. The Monegasque authorities are also invited to continue to develop standardised protocols for multi-agency co-operation, to improve the capacity to systematically detect cases of violence against women and to consider the possibility of setting up a system to offer priority access to independent housing for women victims of violence. The measures aimed at improving the law enforcement response to violence against women should likewise be continued, together with efforts to expand the use of emergency barring and protection orders.

Lastly, GREVIO observes that many women, in particular non-Monegasque women, who are victims of violence are highly dependent on their abusive partners and are particularly vulnerable to economic and/or psychological violence, and that this is an emerging trend.

Introduction

The Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (CETS No. 210) (hereafter “the convention”) is the most far-reaching international treaty to tackle violence against women and domestic violence.

It sets up a two-pillar monitoring mechanism to assess the level of implementation by its parties: the Group of Experts on Action against Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (GREVIO), an independent expert body, and the Committee of the Parties, a political body composed of official representatives of the parties to the convention. In line with Article 68 of the convention, GREVIO has been providing country-based monitoring reports under its baseline evaluation procedure since 2017. Its baseline evaluation report on Monaco, offering a comprehensive assessment of the convention’s implementation in its entirety, was published on 27 September 2017, following Monaco’s ratification of the Istanbul Convention on 7 October 2014. Monaco’s original reservation not to apply the provisions under Article 30, paragraph 2; Article 44, paragraphs 1.e, 3 and 4; and Article 59 in its entirety – which was valid for a period of five years from the first day the convention took effect – was renewed by the authorities by declaration dated 30 July 2020. The authorities provided GREVIO with the reasons for maintaining these reservations, which are reviewed in this report.

This report on Monaco was drawn up under GREVIO’s first thematic evaluation round launched in 2023 focusing on the theme of building trust by delivering support, protection and justice. To address this overarching theme, in the first section, it describes emerging trends in the areas of preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence in the country. Section two aims to identify developments in key areas such as comprehensive and co-ordinated policies, funding, and data collection, that have ensued following the completion of the baseline evaluation procedure. Section three presents more in-depth information on the implementation of selected provisions in the areas of prevention, protection and prosecution, in light of significant challenges and the need for further action revealed by the baseline evaluation procedures and the conclusions on the implementation of recommendations from the Committee of the Parties to the Istanbul Convention.

In respect of Monaco, the first thematic evaluation procedure was initiated in accordance with Article 68 of the convention by letter and transmission of GREVIO’s first thematic questionnaire on 16 January 2023. The Monegasque authorities subsequently submitted their state report on 16 June 2023 – the deadline set by GREVIO. Following a preliminary examination of Monaco’s state report, GREVIO carried out an evaluation visit to Monaco, which took place from 2 to 5 October 2023. The delegation was composed of:

- Guillaume Barbe, Member of GREVIO
- Marie-Claude Hofner, Member of GREVIO
- Françoise Kempf, Administrator at the Secretariat of the monitoring mechanism of the Istanbul Convention

During the evaluation visit, the delegation met with a wide range of governmental and non-governmental representatives working in the area of preventing and combating violence against women. GREVIO wishes to highlight its constructive exchanges with the Monegasque authorities, in particular Isabelle Berro-Amadeï, Minister of Foreign Affairs and Co-operation; Isabelle Rosabrunetto, Director General of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Co-operation; Céline Cottalorda, Chief Officer for Women’s Rights on the Committee to Promote and Safeguard Women’s Rights; and Stéphane Palmari, Deputy Director of the Department of Health Affairs. A list of the national authorities, non-governmental organisations and others met is set out in Appendix II of this report. GREVIO is grateful for the valuable information provided by all of them. For the co-operation and support provided throughout the entire evaluation procedure, it wishes

to extend its gratitude to Corinne Bourdas Magail, who was appointed as contact person. The state report is available on the country monitoring website of the Istanbul Convention.¹

The present assessment was drawn up under the exclusive responsibility of GREVIO and is based on the information collected during the various steps of the evaluation procedure. In keeping with the approach adopted in its baseline evaluation reports, the findings reflect different levels of urgency, indicated in order of priority by the following verbs: “urges”, “strongly encourages”, “encourages” and “invites”.

Resulting from a process of confidential dialogue with the aim of offering country-specific proposals and suggestions for improvement within the national context of the party under review, this report describes the situation as observed by GREVIO up until 22 March 2024. Where applicable, relevant developments up until 21 June 2024 have also been taken into account.

According to the convention, national parliaments shall receive this report from the national authorities (Article 70, paragraph 2). GREVIO requests the national authorities to translate this report into their official national language(s) and ensure that it is widely disseminated, not only to the relevant state institutions at all levels, in particular to the government, the ministries and the judiciary, but also to NGOs and other civil society organisations that work in the field of violence against women.

1. See: www.coe.int/en/web/istanbul-convention/monaco.

I. Emerging trends in the areas of violence against women and domestic violence

1. During the period following the adoption of its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO identified several trends with regard to preventing and combating violence against women in Monaco. These trends include a number of legislative developments and progress on primary prevention, as well as a persistent situation, for certain categories of women, of dependence on their abusive partners.

Legislative developments to reinforce the social and legal status of women:

2. Since the baseline evaluation, the Monegasque authorities have taken a number of measures on the legislative front to implement GREVIO's findings. GREVIO notes with interest that several developments have taken place to bring Monegasque law more in line with the requirements of the Istanbul Convention. In 2017, a law on sexual harassment in the workplace was adopted, which prohibits harassment, sexual blackmail and violence in the workplace and requires employers to take measures to prevent these issues.² In 2019 and 2020, amendments were made to the notion of "head of household", expanding the possibility for women to be considered head of household under certain circumstances.³ Furthermore, a law passed in 2019⁴ amending the Criminal Code states that the penalties imposed for a number of offences shall be made stricter if they are committed due to the sex of the victim; this law also introduced new possibilities for protecting victims of violence.⁵ In addition, a 2021 reform of the Criminal Code led to amendments to the provisions regarding incrimination for sexual assault and to the introduction of the offence of sexual harassment.⁶ Also in 2021, a major law on combating bullying and violence at schools was adopted⁷ and in 2022, certain provisions which were obsolete and upheld gender inequality were repealed, including those relating to the legal status of married women in texts on trade union rights. GREVIO also notes with interest the enactment, in December 2023, of a law implementing a system offering compensation for victims of sexual offences, crimes against children and domestic violence.⁸ It hopes that the law – for which the implementing legislation, in particular concerning compensation amounts, has yet to be published – will be fully compliant with the requirements of Article 30 of the Istanbul Convention and that it will also enable the Monegasque authorities to consider lifting their reservation to Article 30, paragraph 2, of the convention.⁹

Reinforcement of primary prevention:

3. Another key feature of the Monegasque authorities' response to GREVIO's 2017 findings is the emphasis placed on primary prevention. Over the past several years, the authorities have stepped up efforts to raise awareness among the general public of the issue of violence against women, through a range of innovative awareness-raising activities and campaigns as well as support for NGOs involved in awareness-raising activities.¹⁰ Since it was set up in 2018, the Committee to Promote and Safeguard Women's Rights (hereinafter the "Committee for Women's Rights") has played an important role in raising awareness and as such has helped

2. Law 1457 of 12 December 2017.

3. Sovereign Order No. 7155 of 10 October 2018 on the granting of dependency allowances to officials and staff of the State and the Municipality, which entered into force on 1 January 2019, and Law No. 1493 of 8 July 2020 setting up a family allowances system for self-employed persons.

4. Law 1478 of 12 November 2019.

5. See Articles 49 and 50, General obligations, immediate response, prevention and protection.

6. See Article 53, Restraining or protection orders. See also Monaco's response to the form in the report on the implementation of recommendations of the Committee of the Parties to the Istanbul Convention addressed to the Parties, 20 January 2021.

7. See Article 14, Education.

8. Law No. 1555 of 14 December 2023 on compensation for victims of sexual offences, crimes against children, domestic violence and other offences against the person.

9. See in particular the Mid-term Horizontal Review of GREVIO baseline evaluation reports, 2022, Article 30 (pp. 102-104).

10. See Article 12, General obligations.

highlight the issue of violence against women within Monegasque society. Up until now, these prevention measures have mainly focused on domestic violence and do not cover the other forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, in particular sexual violence and other forms of violence of which the general public is less aware, such as forced marriage and female genital mutilation. The fact that such cases are not reported does not mean that they are not actually taking place, and providing information on the remedies and types of support available can greatly contribute to bringing to light cases of violence that had previously remained invisible.

Lack of economic independence of women victims of violence:

4. GREVIO notes with concern that many women victims of violence are highly dependent on their abusive partners, in particular with regard to their proof of accommodation, which is generally provided by the partner, whose financial situation is more favourable, and can be terminated without notice.¹¹ In addition, non-Monegasque women victims of violence and partners of Monegasque nationals cannot receive an autonomous residence permit in such cases of violence.¹² The conditions for obtaining a residence permit may place them in a vulnerable situation in the event of a separation due to their economic dependence on their partner.¹³ In addition, GREVIO was also informed that following a divorce or separation, partners frequently avoid paying financial maintenance by leaving Monaco to reside in France, and that it is difficult for certain women to defend themselves in the event of a divorce due to their lack of resources compared with those at their partner's disposal. Women in this type of economically dependent situation are particularly vulnerable to economic and/or psychological violence, as highlighted in GREVIO's baseline evaluation report. Furthermore, women working in Monaco without a work permit – domestic workers in particular – are also extremely vulnerable to gender-based violence due to the difficulty for them to report any violence. The same is true for women working in Monaco and residing in France, who may decide not to report violence in order to avoid risking the loss of their work permit.

11. See Sovereign Order No. 3153 of 19 March 1964 on the conditions of entry and residence of non-Monegasque individuals in the Principality. The Monegasque authorities have indicated that, in a situation of violence, the proof of accommodation can be temporarily prolonged.

12. Monaco has made a reservation to Article 59 of the Istanbul Convention.

13. Non-Monegasque individuals are eligible for a renewable one-year residence permit if they have sufficient income or a job and housing, and in specific circumstances, for a three, five or ten year residence permit. See Sovereign Order No. 3153 of 19 March 1964, *ibid*.

II. Changes in definitions, comprehensive and co-ordinated policies, funding and data collection in the areas of violence against women and domestic violence

5. Chapter I of the Istanbul Convention sets out general principles that apply to all the substantive articles contained in Chapters II to VII and therefore lay the foundation for a comprehensive and adequate response that ensures the delivery of support, protection and justice for all women and girls at risk of or who have experienced gender-based violence. These include, among other things, that it is a fundamental human right for everyone, particularly women, to live a life free from violence in both the public and the private sphere, that the convention must be implemented without discrimination on any ground, and that the potential for, and effects of, multiple forms of discrimination should be borne in mind. They also spell out that a gender perspective must be integrated into the implementation of the convention and the evaluation of its impact. Chapter II of the Istanbul Convention sets out the core requirement for a holistic response to violence against women: the need for state-wide effective, comprehensive and co-ordinated policies, sustained by the necessary institutional, financial and organisational structures.

A. Definitions (Article 3)

6. Article 3 of the Istanbul Convention sets out key definitions of concepts that are fundamental to its implementation. “Violence against women” refers to “all acts of gender-based violence that result in, or are likely to result in, physical, sexual, psychological or economic harm or suffering to women including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private life”, whereas the expression ‘domestic violence’ is to be understood as referring to “all acts of physical, sexual, psychological or economic violence that occur within the family or domestic unit or between former or current spouses or partners, whether or not the perpetrator shares or has shared the same residence with the victim”. The definition of “gender-based violence against women” provided in paragraph d of Article 3 seeks to ensure more clarity about the nature of the violence covered, by explaining that this is “violence that is directed against a woman because she is a woman or that affects women disproportionately”.

7. In its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO observed that the definition of domestic violence contained in Law No. 1382 of 20 July 2011 introduced a condition of living together under the same roof on a long-term basis,¹⁴ which could exclude certain types of non-cohabiting couple relationships and was therefore not fully in line with the definition of violence provided in Article 3, paragraph b, of the Istanbul Convention. GREVIO regrets that, following this 2017 finding, the possibility of changing the definition of domestic violence does not seem to have been discussed. Since there is no information on the application of this provision by the Monegasque courts, GREVIO is not able to judge whether the requirement of living together under the same roof on a long-term basis has had an impact in practice. It takes note of the information provided by the authorities indicating that this requirement is not a criterion that is used when assessing the needs for support of women victims of violence. However, it wishes to reiterate that this requirement may lead, in practice, to the exclusion of certain victims of violence from access to violence protection and prevention measures, in particular victims in shorter-term non-cohabiting relationships, which are especially frequent among young people.

8. GREVIO strongly encourages the authorities to adopt a definition of domestic violence that is fully in accordance with the definition given in Article 3.b of the Istanbul Convention.

14. See Article 238-1, paragraph 1, of the Criminal Code.

B. Comprehensive and co-ordinated policies (Article 7)

9. Article 7 of the Istanbul Convention requires parties to take co-ordinated and comprehensive measures to prevent and combat all forms of violence against women. Policies must ensure effective co-operation and place the rights of victims at their centre. This includes taking into account and addressing the specific circumstances and barriers experienced by women exposed to or at risk of multiple forms of discrimination,¹⁵ in line with Article 4, paragraph 3, of the convention. Ensuring service delivery, effective protection and justice with a comprehensive understanding of intersecting forms of discrimination is a fundamental element in building trust among all women and girls.

10. GREVIO regrets that, since its baseline evaluation report, which pointed out the absence of a national action plan on preventing and combating violence against women and of a body capable of driving policy in this area, no comprehensive strategy setting out specific objectives, based on shared definitions and lines of action to prevent and combat all forms of violence against women, has been adopted. Although GREVIO is aware that the proximity of stakeholders in Monaco enables rapid responses to the needs expressed by government and civil society stakeholders, it stresses that the absence of such a plan limits the possibilities of exhaustively implementing all the provisions of the convention, particularly those covering forms of violence other than domestic violence, as set out in Chapter III below. It also limits the possibility of carrying out impact assessments on the policies implemented.

11. In 2018, the Monegasque authorities set up the Committee to Promote and Safeguard Women's Rights (hereinafter the "Committee for Women's Rights").¹⁶ The committee includes all the government bodies involved in preventing and combating violence against women and promoting gender equality, as well as 12 civil society organisations, the High Commissioner, and representatives from the Monegasque parliament (the National Council) and the Economic, Social and Environmental Council. The committee's work is co-ordinated and led by the Chief Officer for Women's Rights. The committee meets once a year in plenary session and more frequently in thematic working groups. The committee's mission is to co-ordinate, implement and evaluate public policy on gender equality as well as on preventing and combating all forms of violence and discrimination against women. It is also tasked with implementing specific training and awareness-raising initiatives and co-ordinating the collection of relevant data, in conjunction with the Monegasque Institute of Statistics and Economic Studies (IMSEE). The committee's duties also include responding to the recommendations addressed to the Monegasque authorities by international human rights bodies, such as GREVIO.

12. GREVIO welcomes the establishment of the committee, which, in the view of many stakeholders, has been a driving force in preventing and combating violence against women since 2019. According to the information provided to GREVIO, the formation of this committee has helped to substantially improve communication and networking between various government sectors, as well as with civil society, along with the co-ordination of action.¹⁷ According to the people that GREVIO interviewed, the committee has also facilitated the development and implementation of training for various groups of professionals¹⁸ and helped highlight the issue of violence against women in Monaco. However, GREVIO believes that the mission and work accomplished by the committee is not enough to make up for the lack of a national action plan on preventing and combating all forms of violence against women.

13. The Monegasque authorities informed GREVIO that the co-ordinating body under Article 10 of the convention is the Department of Social Welfare and Social Services (DASO), even though the Committee for Women's Rights performs a number of duties which in principle fall within the remit of the co-ordinating body, such as co-ordinating the various stakeholders

15. These include, but are not limited to, women from national and/or ethnic minorities, Roma women, migrant, asylum-seeking and refugee women, women with disabilities, women without a residence permit, LGBTI women, women from rural areas, women in prostitution and women with addiction issues.

16. The committee was established by the Sovereign Order of 25 October 2018.

17. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

18. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

involved, collecting data and evaluating policies. GREVIO understands that the DASO is mainly in charge of providing co-ordinated support to women victims of violence and that its role does not involve developing and monitoring policies to combat violence against women. As a result, it would be useful to clarify the respective roles of the Committee for Women's Rights and the DASO with regard to the functions of the co-ordinating body,¹⁹ which include, as set out in Article 10 of the convention, the co-ordination, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and measures aimed at preventing and combating violence against women. A national action plan would help clarify this division of roles.

14. GREVIO further notes that few measures have been taken to assess the impact of the policies implemented and action taken over the past several years. While the development of data collection on violence against women constitutes a first step towards establishing an evaluation policy, GREVIO considers it necessary to conduct regular evaluations, run by independent bodies, on the impact of campaigns, training programmes and other measures implemented, based on data and specific indicators, some of which may be based on objectives set out in a national action plan. Such studies would help better evaluate the appropriateness of the authorities' response to objectives for preventing and combating violence against women and to the needs of women victims of violence, and to correct any shortcomings in the choice of messages, target audiences or media. Against this background, GREVIO notes with interest that since 2024, the IMSEE has also started collecting data on the impact of awareness-raising campaigns and it hopes that this development will make it possible to evaluate the impact of such measures.²⁰

15. As mentioned above, GREVIO notes that, while the Committee for Women's Rights is open to working on all forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, the action taken up until now has mainly focused on domestic violence. In particular, there is no specific policy in place aimed at taking a co-ordinated approach to preventing and combating sexual violence. In addition, the measures seem to take little account of the situation of women victims of violence exposed to intersectional discrimination, such as non-Monegasque women, women with disabilities, women in prostitution, LGBTI women and women with addiction issues, and the need for the authorities to adjust their response to the needs of these women. GREVIO believes that an intersectional approach would help reinforce the measures already in place and better detect situations of violence against women, particularly among non-Monegasque women, of whom there are very many in Monaco.²¹

16. GREVIO therefore considers that the adoption of an action plan or a comprehensive strategy could help provide a more solid foundation for policies and action over the long term, respond more effectively to the multifaceted challenges posed by violence against women, address all forms of violence against women and make it easier to assess the implementation of policies and measures.

17. GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to develop a long-term overarching strategy, featuring a comprehensive and co-ordinated range of policies to prevent and combat all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention. In doing so, they must develop an intersectional approach and ensure that policies include specific measures to prevent violence against specific categories of women, such as women with disabilities, non-Monegasque working women and women in prostitution.

19. GREVIO points out that Article 10 of the convention states that the authorities shall designate one or more official bodies in charge of co-ordinating, implementing, monitoring and evaluating policies aimed at combating violence against women.

20. Information provided by the Monegasque authorities.

21. Non-Monegasque nationals make up 77.5% of the resident population (IMSEE: Monaco in Figures, 2023). Residents are made up of 139 different nationalities.

18. **GREVIO also strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to evaluate, on a regular basis, such policies aiming to achieve the comprehensive and co-ordinated policy approach required by the Istanbul Convention. Such evaluations should be carried out on the basis of pre-defined indicators in order to assess their impact and ensure that policymaking is based on reliable data.**

C. Financial resources (Article 8)

19. Article 8 of the convention aims to ensure the allocation of appropriate financial and human resources for activities carried out both by public authorities and also by relevant non-governmental and civil society organisations.²²

20. As already noted in GREVIO's baseline evaluation report, it is difficult to obtain an overview of the resources allocated to combating violence against women because the Monegasque state budget is not broken down by topic. However, GREVIO welcomes the fact that the amount of financial resources allocated specifically to combating violence against women has substantially increased. The Committee for Women's Rights has an operating budget as well as funding to carry out awareness-raising campaigns and training. The financial and human resources allocated to the services in contact with victims of violence against women appear sufficient to meet needs in this area. In particular, GREVIO welcomes the fact that social workers and psychologists are systematically made available to victims of violence in the various services involved, such as the police, the DASO and the justice system, which plays a vital part in building victims' trust in the system.²³

21. Since 2020, NGOs have been able to apply, through calls for projects, for funding covering 80% of a project's budget, for a total of up to €5 000, a development that was welcomed by the Committee of the Parties to the Istanbul Convention.²⁴ In 2023, 11 projects were supported in this context.²⁵ Information brought to GREVIO's attention shows that these amounts appear to be sufficient to enable organisations to successfully run initiatives to prevent violence against women. With regard to the Monegasque Association for Assistance to Victims of Crime (AVIP), GREVIO welcomes the fact that, since 2017, the resources allocated to its funding have substantially increased, with a budget of €165 000 per year currently allocated to it, which, according to the information provided to GREVIO, covers the organisation's running costs.²⁶ The Monegasque Red Cross, which also plays a major role in helping women victims of violence, also receives long-term funding.

22. **GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to ensure that sufficient resources continue to be allocated to programmes and measures to prevent and combat violence against women and domestic violence. It also encourages them to continue and secure the support provided to organisations involved in combating violence against women and domestic violence, and supporting victims.**

D. Data collection (Article 11)

23. Preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence requires evidence-based policy making. The collection of systematic and comparable data from all relevant administrative sources is crucial in this regard, as is information on the prevalence of all forms of violence against women.

22. Explanatory Report to the Istanbul Convention, paragraph 66.

23. See Article 20, General support services, and Articles 49 and 50, General obligations, immediate response, prevention and protection.

24. Conclusions on the implementation of recommendations in respect of Monaco adopted by the Committee of the Parties to the Istanbul Convention, IC-CP/Inf(2021)7, adopted on 7 December 2021.

25. See 2022 Annual Activity Report, Women's Rights Committee, pp. 38-50.

26. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

24. In its 2017 evaluation report, GREVIO observed that it was necessary to further systematise and streamline the collection of data relating to violence against women and to publish these data. As a result, GREVIO welcomes the fact that one of the first tasks assigned to the Committee for Women's Rights was to co-ordinate the collection of data on violence against women, in conjunction with the IMSEE, thereby responding to the recommendations of the Committee of the Parties to the Istanbul Convention addressed to the Monegasque authorities.²⁷ Every year since 2020, IMSEE has published a study on violence against women, highlighting the data collected from police authorities, the justice system, the Princess Grace Hospital Centre (CHPG), AVIP and the DASO.²⁸ GREVIO notes in particular the development of the collection of data from the healthcare sector on the number of women admitted to hospital who said they had been subject to violence.²⁹

25. With respect to law enforcement and the justice system, while information on the number of convictions and cases closed without further action in 2021 and 2022 was provided to GREVIO, it does not specify the relationship between the perpetrator and the victim or the type of offence concerned. GREVIO does not have data on any gender-based murders or attempted murders, either. According to the information at its disposal, the data collected also does not include the number of judicial decisions having led to the withdrawal of parental authority or a limitation of custody and visitation rights in the presence of domestic violence. In addition, while information was provided to it on the number of protection orders issued,³⁰ these data do not include the number of emergency barring orders and do not appear to have been collected in a systematic way. Lastly, no data is available concerning breaches of protection orders or the sanctions imposed as a result of such breaches.

26. Furthermore, GREVIO notes with interest that the assignment of a common case number enables law enforcement agencies and judicial authorities to track a case of violence against women from reporting to indictment.³¹

27. Since January 2023, IMSEE has provided data-collecting entities with a statistical tool on violence against women, enabling them to collect relevant data in real time and on a regular basis. GREVIO is pleased to note that the database covers, inter alia, all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention, the sex of the perpetrators and victims of violence, the relationship between the perpetrator and the victim of violence, the presence of children and any subsequent legal action. GREVIO welcomes the efforts made to implement this new system for regular, standardised data collection on violence against women. It hopes that this new tool will help close the gaps observed by collecting and making public a wider range of data, broken down according to the criteria required by the Istanbul Convention,³² on violence against women. It also stresses that these data are essential to the allocation of resources to the different services involved and, therefore, to public policy management, and that their publication could play a key role in raising awareness in society as a whole about the extent of violence against women.

27. Recommendation on the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence by Monaco, IC-CP/Inf(2018)2, 30 January 2018.

28. See: www.monacostatistics.mc/Publications/Violence-against-women-in-Monaco.

29. Between 113 in 2020 and 56 in 2022; see IMSEE's annual reports on violence against women in Monaco.

30. Information provided by the authorities during the evaluation visit.

31. Information provided by the authorities during the evaluation visit. See also Article 50, Immediate response, prevention and protection.

32. See Explanatory Report to the Istanbul Convention, paragraph 76.

28. GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to:

- a. continue to develop the collection of data on all forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, broken down according to the sex and age of the victim and the perpetrator, their relationship and geographic location, in order to better assess the scope of violence against women and the authorities' response to this phenomenon. In doing so, they should ensure that data collection, storage and processing comply with the data protection standards set out in the Council of Europe's Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data;**
- b. take measures to have full data as soon as possible on judicial proceedings and the number of protection orders issued, compliance with these orders and the sanctions imposed in the event of non-compliance.**

III. Analysis of the implementation of selected provisions in priority areas in the fields of prevention, protection and prosecution

A. Prevention

29. Chapter III of the Istanbul Convention contains a number of general and more specific obligations in the area of prevention. This section analyses the progress made, since the baseline evaluation monitoring procedure, towards the implementation of early preventive measures. It also analyses progress made towards adopting more specific preventive measures provided under Chapter III of the convention, which concerns education, training of all relevant professionals, and perpetrator programmes, as well as preventing re-victimisation. Ensuring the effective prevention of all forms of violence against women and domestic violence is an important step in rendering it unacceptable and reducing levels of perpetration.³³ In turn, effective prevention empowers women and girls to speak out about their experiences and seek support and protection.

1. General obligations (Article 12)

30. Article 12 sets out a number of general preventive measures that represent the overarching principles of the parties' duty to prevent violence against women. These include the requirement to promote changes in the social and cultural patterns of behaviour of women and men, with a view to eradicating prejudices, customs, traditions and all other practices based on the idea of the inferiority of women or on stereotyped roles for women and men. A positive contribution to achieving such change can be made by men and boys acting as role models and advocating equality between women and men and mutual respect, including by speaking out against violence, engaging other men in ending violence against women, or actively taking on caring responsibilities. Moreover, flowing from the premise that violence against women is a cause as much as a consequence of gender inequality, Article 12 further requires that parties adopt specific measures to empower women in order to enable them to recognise and reject discrimination, unequal power relations and, ultimately, reduce women's vulnerability to violence and achieve greater gender equality.

31. Since 2017, various measures have been taken to prevent violence against women, under the aegis of the Committee for Women's Rights. In particular, violence awareness-raising campaigns are run each year as part of the International Day for the Elimination of Violence Against Women (25 November), in co-operation with civil society organisations, and shared on social media. GREVIO notes with interest that the main topic of the campaign launched on 25 November 2022 was the role that men can play in combating violence against women.³⁴ A campaign aimed at men and boys to combat violence was also run in 2021 by two NGOs for 25 November.³⁵ Likewise, the "Ambassadors" programme features famous men who promote gender equality and efforts to combat violence against women.³⁶ GREVIO welcomes this emphasis on the involvement of men and boys in combating violence against women. It also wishes to draw the attention of the Monegasque authorities to Recommendation (2019)1 of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on preventing and combating sexism, which may help complement the awareness-raising activities on gender stereotypes and prejudice.³⁷

33. The importance of this endeavour has been reiterated and strengthened through the Dublin Declaration on the Prevention of Domestic, Sexual and Gender-Based Violence, adopted in Dublin, Ireland by 38 member States of the Council of Europe.

34. Campaign entitled "You can change the story": www.dfm.mc/evenement/campagne-vous-pouvez-changer-lhistoire-pour-la-journee-du-25-novembre-2022/. The 2021 campaign to mark 25 November was about raising awareness of domestic violence among the victim's friends and family, while the 2023 campaign aimed to combat cyberviolence (November 2023/update).

35. See: www.dfm.mc/actions-partenaires/projet-non-a-la-violence-2/.

36. See: www.dfm.mc/ambassadeurs/.

37. Recommendation CM/Rec(2019)1 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on preventing and combating sexism.

32. Other examples of awareness-raising activities include a 2021 campaign to raise awareness of domestic violence, with messages printed on bread bags from bakeries. In addition, GREVIO welcomes the fact that the awareness-raising campaign launched on 25 November 2023 was about preventing violence against women online, a topic that had previously received little coverage, aimed at young people in particular.³⁸ Other awareness-raising activities aimed at young people are described under Article 14 below.

33. Gender equality awareness-raising activities are also carried out by the Committee for Women's Rights, with the involvement of civil society organisations, aimed in particular at promoting gender equality in the workplace. These activities were accompanied by a 2023 IMSEE publication on the gender pay gap, as well as a study on the position of women in corporate governance.³⁹ Campaigns have also been run to deconstruct certain stereotypes regarding gender roles.⁴⁰

34. Since the 2017 enactment of a law on harassment in the workplace,⁴¹ awareness-raising campaigns on harassment and violence in the workplace have been run, in particular by trade unions.⁴² GREVIO is also pleased to note the existence of training for staff of public services on sexism in the workplace and the distribution of a legal and practical guide against harassment and violence in the workplace.⁴³

35. Despite these activities aimed at combating harassment and sexism, GREVIO notes that until now, the emphasis has mainly been placed on preventing domestic violence and that few measures have targeted other forms of violence against women. GREVIO was also informed of a lack of measures aimed at preventing violence against non-Monegasque women, women with disabilities, women in prostitution and women with addiction issues, and at informing such women of their rights and the types of support available to them.

36. Lastly, GREVIO thinks it would be useful to assess the impact of the various awareness-raising campaigns on the population's perception and ideas of the roles of women and men in society, masculinity and gender stereotypes. This type of assessment helps to ensure that awareness-raising activities meet their objectives and, where necessary, to adjust them accordingly.

37. GREVIO welcomes the efforts made since its baseline evaluation report with regard to preventing domestic violence. However, it strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to expand these measures to include other forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention.

38. In addition, GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to regularly conduct impact assessments on campaigns and other measures to prevent violence against women.

2. Education (Article 14)

39. The drafters of the convention recognised the important role that formal and informal educational settings play in addressing the root causes of violence against women and girls. Article 14 therefore requires the design of teaching material that promotes equality between women and men, non-stereotyped gender roles, mutual respect, non-violent conflict resolution in interpersonal relationships, the right to personal integrity and informs learners of the different

38. See: www.dfm.mc/evenement/manga-blitz-edition-speciale-25-novembre-2023/.

39. A comprehensive study measuring the gender pay gap will be carried out again in 2025. Information provided by the Monegasque authorities.

40. See for example the "All types of Christmas presents belong under the tree" campaign, www.dfm.mc/evenement/la-campagne-de-communication-2021-du-comite/.

41. Law No. 1457 of 12 December 2017 on harassment and violence in the workplace.

42. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

43. See Article 15, Training of professionals.

forms of gender-based violence against women, adapted to the age and capacity of learners and where parties deem appropriate. The obligation to promote these principles extends to informal educational facilities as well as any sports, cultural and leisure facilities.

40. Since 2017, the Monegasque authorities have continued and expanded their measures to promote gender equality, prevent bullying at school and raise awareness of gender stereotypes and cybersexism at school, measures which were already noted by GREVIO in its baseline evaluation report. The 2021 enactment of a law on bullying at school⁴⁴ represents a major milestone. This law made the non-consensual sharing of sexual images, as well as the threat of sharing such images a criminal offence.⁴⁵ In addition, it provides for measures to raise pupils' awareness of bullying and violence, including online, systematic training for all staff working at schools on preventing and addressing situations of bullying and violence, the implementation of plans to prevent and combat bullying and violence at all schools and "bullying/violence" officers, who are available to pupils who are victims or witnesses of bullying or violence as well as head teachers. A person responsible for preventing and combating bullying and violence in schools has also been appointed at the Department of Education, Youth and Sport. The information received by GREVIO shows there was a 35% increase in the number of incidents of bullying/harassment and violence reported between 2022 and 2023.⁴⁶

41. GREVIO regrets, however, the persistent lack – already highlighted in its 2017 report – of specific teaching material on violence against women and the other topics covered in Article 14 of the convention. Information brought to GREVIO's attention also shows that topics related to sex education are rarely covered in school curricula. GREVIO was informed that the police and AVIP visit schools every year to inform pupils about violence against women, and that a number of NGOs carry out measures to raise pupils' awareness of online violence and bullying, gender stereotypes and prejudices, and certain sexual and reproductive health issues.⁴⁷ However, it considers that these types of measures should be reinforced by the use of specific teaching material at all levels of schooling in order to take effective action, from a very early age, against the attitudes, beliefs and patterns of behaviour that contribute to perpetuating violence against women.

42. GREVIO welcomes the measures that have led to improved detection of situations of domestic violence in schools. The distribution, since September 2022, among educational professionals of a "guide to alerts and reporting of minors in danger or at risk of being so" seems to have played an important role in this regard.⁴⁸ All educational professionals, including those working at children's activity centres, are required to comply with it. In addition, 65 educational professionals have also completed the training programme launched by the Committee for Women's Rights on receiving, and providing care for, victims of domestic violence. Information brought to GREVIO's attention by the authorities shows that these measures have led to a substantial increase in reporting, including for violence within the family, making it easier to detect situations of violence and providing a specific reporting protocol.

43. In addition, GREVIO is pleased to note that in 2021, 40 teachers completed training on gender equality in pupils' educational guidance, which included deconstructing gender stereotypes. A new training session is planned for 2023-2024.

44. Lastly, GREVIO notes with interest the work being done to draft a law on sport. It considers that such a law could help further prevent and combat violence against women and girls in sport, in particular by providing for measures to raise awareness among sports coaches, as well as effective, independent remedies for women and girls who are victims of harassment and violence in sport.

44. Law No. 1 513 of 3 December 2021 on bullying and violence at school.

45. Articles 308-4-1 to 308-4-3 of the Criminal Code.

46. Information provided by the Department of Education, Youth and Sport.

47. See for example Action Innocence: www.actioninnocencemonaco.com/en/activities/prevention/school/ and SheCanHeCan: www.redboxproject.org/2019/10/29/the-red-box-project-monaco/.

48. Guide initially created by the DASO. See Article 18, General obligations.

45. **GREVIO welcomes the substantial measures taken since its baseline evaluation report and strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to produce teaching material on violence against women and girls and the subjects listed in Article 14 of the Istanbul Convention, and to pursue measures to raise pupils' awareness of these issues, on a regular basis and at all levels of schooling.**

3. Training of professionals (Article 15)

46. Building society's trust by delivering support, protection and justice to women and girls with experiences of gender-based violence requires well-trained professionals across a wide spectrum of fields. The standard set by the convention in its Article 15 is that of systematic initial and in-service training of all those who deal with victims or perpetrators of all acts of violence. The training that is required must cover the prevention and detection of such violence, equality between women and men, the needs and rights of victims, and the prevention of secondary victimisation.

47. GREVIO is pleased to note that, since its baseline evaluation report, substantial measures have been taken to improve awareness and training of staff of the State in preventing and combating violence against women, which is key to building greater trust among women victims of violence in the institutions responsible for helping them.

48. The Committee for Women's Rights has played an important role in spearheading and organising such training. In addition to educational staff, social workers, psychologists, police officers and CHPG staff completed two mandatory training modules on initial reception and care provision for women victims of violence. Training was provided by specialists from a neighbouring country. According to the information supplied to GREVIO, this training helped raise awareness among professionals of various aspects of domestic violence (including control and the cycles of domestic violence), as well as its impact on victims, including children exposed to it. In addition, a one-day training session on sexism in the workplace has also been provided to all officials and staff of the State since the end of 2023, which includes work on deconstructing gender stereotypes and prejudice.

49. GREVIO hopes that this training will continue on a regular basis and that it will be expanded to include other forms of violence, including sexual violence and rape, stalking/harassment, forced marriage and female genital mutilation, as well as the digital dimension of violence against women. In addition, training should cover the higher risks of violence run by women exposed to intersectional discrimination, such as non-Monegasque women, LGBTI women, women with disabilities, women in prostitution and women with addiction issues, as well as their specific needs in terms of reception and support. These topics do not appear to be covered by the training currently offered. GREVIO emphasises that these women will more readily contact the relevant institutions for help and support if they are able to offer them targeted assistance and meet their needs. Lastly, it could be useful to involve Monegasque NGOs working with women victims of violence more extensively in training, due to their specific expertise and close contact with women victims of violence. Including NGO representatives in teaching teams could also strengthen the networking approach and mutual trust between the various entities.

50. As part of their initial training, all police officers in Monaco undergo training on violence within the family, as well as sexual violence. The members of the specialised unit for minors and welfare protection have completed specialist training, including abroad, on violence against women. The information brought to GREVIO's attention shows that these measures have brought about substantial improvements in terms of receiving, and providing care for, women victims of violence and have increased their trust in the police.⁴⁹ Two police officers have been specifically trained in taking testimony from children and two others in cyberviolence. GREVIO was told,

49. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

however, that police officers outside the specialised unit are still not sufficiently trained to ensure the adequate reception of and support for victims of sexual violence.⁵⁰

51. Judges have access, on a voluntary basis, to training offered by the French National School for the Judiciary (ENM). The people that GREVIO interviewed from the judiciary had indeed completed several training sessions on violence against women. However, they did not have access to the more advanced courses offered by the ENM. GREVIO notes with interest the 2021 establishment of the Monegasque Institute for Training in the Legal Professions, which is in charge of initial training for judges and lawyers as well as in-service training for all judicial professionals. It notes the Institute's desire to organise events aimed at raising awareness among judicial professionals, in particular on issues related to gender equality and violence against women. GREVIO was also informed of the absence of training on violence against women for lawyers, who were not included in the training provided by the authorities, and of a lack of lawyers specialising in violence against women.⁵¹ GREVIO considers it urgent and imperative for lawyers to have access to training on violence against women, including, where applicable, through training also open to other judicial professionals, to ensure that women victims of violence are assisted in judicial proceedings by suitably informed professionals able to meet their specific needs.

52. GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue and expand their efforts with regard to initial and in-service training for professionals in contact with women victims of violence. To do so, GREVIO encourages them to:

- a. ensure that training is provided on a regular, mandatory basis to all professionals concerned, including judges;**
- b. ensure that training includes all forms of gender-based violence covered by the Istanbul Convention, as well as modules on detecting and providing care for women victims of violence exposed to intersectional discrimination;**
- c. ensure that lawyers have access to training on violence against women;**
- d. involve Monegasque NGOs active in supporting and assisting women victims of violence in the training teams.**

4. Preventive intervention and treatment programmes (Article 16)

53. Perpetrator programmes are important elements of an integrated and comprehensive approach to preventing and combating violence against women. Under Article 16 of the Istanbul Convention, parties are required to set up or support programmes that prevent perpetrators of domestic violence and of sexual violence from re-offending and support them in adopting non-violent behavioural strategies. Making the safety of, support for and the human rights of, victims a primary concern, these programmes are key elements in ensuring women's safety from known perpetrators. The convention requires their close co-ordination with specialist support services for victims.

a. Programmes for perpetrators of domestic violence

54. GREVIO finds it regrettable that, since its baseline evaluation report, no measures have been taken to allow perpetrators of violence to access accountability programmes, even for those who are subject to treatment orders or referred by the public prosecutor to "an accountability course to prevent and combat gender-based and domestic violence [or a] course to combat sexism and raise awareness of gender equality".⁵² GREVIO stresses how important such programmes are in promoting a change in behaviour among perpetrators and greater awareness of their responsibility, as well as in preventing re-offending and ensuring victims' safety. Having

50. Information provided during the evaluation visit. See Articles 49 and 50, General obligations, immediate response, prevention and protection.

51. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

52. Article 34-1, 5 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

perpetrators of violence participate in such programmes may also help women victims of violence feel safe again and help them through the process of recovery and empowerment, which is one of the objectives of the convention. GREVIO understands that discussions have been underway for several months on the possibility of having perpetrators of violence participate in courses offered in the neighbouring French *département* of Alpes-Maritimes. However, it considers that the authorities should take measures to ensure that programmes focused on the accountability of perpetrators of violence and questioning their attitudes and beliefs about women, which help ensure victims' safety, are available in Monaco. To do so, it invites the authorities to draw on international best practice.⁵³

b. Programmes for perpetrators of sexual violence

55. According to the information at GREVIO's disposal, it appears that Monaco does not have any specific programmes for perpetrators of sexual violence, even for those who are subject to treatment orders. GREVIO stresses how important it is for perpetrators of sexual violence to have access to specific programmes in order to limit the risk of re-offending.

56. Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to set up, as soon as possible, accountability programmes for perpetrators of violence, aimed at preventing them from re-offending and holding them accountable for their actions, including sexual violence.

B. Protection and support

57. Chapter IV of the Istanbul Convention requires a multifaceted, professional and victim-oriented support structure for any woman or girl who has experienced any of the forms of violence covered by the convention. General and specialist support services that are victim-oriented, accessible to all and adequate in numbers greatly facilitate recovery by offering support, protection and assistance in overcoming the multiple consequences of such violence. As such, they play a key role in offering a comprehensive and adequate response to the different forms of violence covered by the convention.

1. General obligations (Article 18)

58. Article 18 of the Istanbul Convention sets out a number of general principles to be respected in the provision of both general and specialist protective and supportive services for women victims of violence. One of these principles is the need for services to act in a concerted and co-ordinated manner, with the involvement of all the agencies concerned. More specifically, Article 18, paragraph 2, of the convention requires parties to put in place appropriate co-ordination mechanisms that can ensure effective co-operation among, *inter alia*: the judiciary, public prosecutors, law enforcement agencies, local and regional authorities, NGOs and other relevant entities and organisations. In this regard, women's NGOs and specialist women's support services play an important role in guaranteeing that the rights of victims are safeguarded in multi-agency co-operation. Other general principles established under this article include the need for measures of protection and support to be based on a gendered understanding of violence against women, and to focus on women's safety and human rights, taking into account the relationship between victims, perpetrators, children, and their wider environment, and addressing their needs holistically. Specialist support services must aim to ensure the empowerment and economic independence of women victims of violence and avoid their secondary victimisation. This provision also stresses the importance of ensuring that access to services is not subject to the victim's willingness to press charges or testify against the perpetrator.

⁵³ See Guidance for safe and effective perpetrator programmes: Article 16 of the Istanbul Convention, A comparative study and recommendations on programmes for perpetrators of domestic and sexual violence, Council of Europe, May 2024.

59. GREVIO understands that communication and co-operation between professionals working in contact with victims of violence, including those from civil society, are greatly facilitated by the small size of the country and the proximity of stakeholders. Furthermore, it notes that, since its baseline evaluation report, certain agreements have been implemented, in particular between AVIP and the DASO with respect to the emergency accommodation of victims of domestic violence that may be offered by AVIP to victims who contact it outside of the DASO's opening hours. AVIP also provides the DASO with information forms concerning victims of domestic violence, with their permission. The DASO and AVIP hold joint meetings on a quarterly basis. In addition, an agreement enables information to be rapidly shared between AVIP and the public prosecutor. The services of the Monegasque Red Cross may also be involved, in particular where victims do not meet the conditions regarding accommodation in Monaco. GREVIO was also informed of regular information sharing between the DASO, public prosecutors and judges. The authorities also indicated that any co-ordination issues can be discussed at the meetings of the Committee for Women's Rights. GREVIO welcomes this effective co-operation among institutions, as well as between institutions and civil society organisations.

60. The DASO has drawn up a protocol for care provision for victims of domestic violence, used by various professionals since 2022, which GREVIO welcomes. The document lists the responsibilities of each institutional stakeholder as well as the services provided, offering an overview of the possibilities for care provision for victims of domestic violence.⁵⁴ GREVIO takes the view that this document should be supplemented by a protocol defining the steps to be followed, from detection to protection, clearly assigning the steps that each stakeholder must take when faced with a case of domestic violence. Furthermore, some of the people that GREVIO interviewed emphasised the absence of a legislative basis regarding the sharing of confidential information. GREVIO considers that the establishment of clear rules on information sharing between relevant professionals would help further improve the co-ordinated response offered to women victims of violence, especially in high-risk situations with respect to the safety of the victim and children exposed to violence.

61. GREVIO also notes that the co-operation mechanisms in place only cover situations of domestic violence. It regrets that there are no protocols for multi-agency co-operation, and no culture of networking, for care provision for victims of other forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention.

62. Generally, GREVIO welcomes the good co-operation and proximity between most stakeholders, which help ensure that the needs of women victims of violence are swiftly met, offering them a range of services to help them escape situations of violence. In addition, this proximity, and the fact that most services for victims of domestic violence are provided via the DASO, help make up for the absence in Monaco of "one-stop-shop" services. However, GREVIO takes the view that it would be useful to institutionalise existing practices in order to formalise and secure co-operation and best practice, extend them to cover all forms of violence against women, and thereby ensure that women victims have access, at all times, to a response suited to their needs and to the best possible support and protection. Such formalisation would also help ensure the lasting use of current best practice and make sure that such practices are not discontinued in the event of changes in the teams involved.

63. **GREVIO invites the Monegasque authorities to:**

- a. **continue to foster multi-agency co-operation, ensuring that it covers all forms of violence against women and that it is based on a gender-sensitive, rights-based approach and the safety, protection and empowerment of victims;**
- b. **continue to develop standardised protocols for multi-agency co-operation to secure effective support and protection for all women victims of violence.**

54. Protocol for care provision for alleged victims of intimate-partner violence, May 2021.

2. General support services (Article 20)

64. GREVIO notes that, since its baseline evaluation report, the approach under which general services are responsible for addressing all the needs of women victims of violence, including with regard to specialist services, has remained in place, with the DASO still the core stakeholder in the system for supporting women victims of violence.

a. Social services

65. General support services, such as social services, health services and housing or employment services must be equipped to offer support and protection to women victims of gender-based violence of all ages and backgrounds. Article 20 of the convention requires states parties to ensure that these services are adequately resourced and that the staff are adequately trained on the different forms of violence against women, and are able to respond to victims in a supportive manner, in particular those that women and girls turn to first (health and social services).⁵⁵ Their interventions are often decisive for victims' onward journey towards a life free from violence and thus a core element of a trust-based system of protection and support.

66. In the DASO, victims of violence are received and monitored by social workers, who assess their situation and their needs and, where applicable, refer them to other institutions, such as AVIP, the Police Department, the CHPG or the Monegasque Red Cross if they have no income or proof of accommodation in Monaco, according to the protocol mentioned under Article 18 above. According to the needs assessment, the DASO may provide accommodation at one of the existing shelters or in serviced accommodation, financial support to cover expenses, food aid and psychological support.

67. As far as GREVIO is aware, there is no programme to provide priority access to housing to women victims of violence. While such victims may be able to stay at a shelter on a long-term basis,⁵⁶ it can be difficult to access independent housing after leaving a shelter or social accommodation facility, due to the shortage and high cost of housing in Monaco. GREVIO considers that having priority access to independent housing could greatly contribute to ensuring that women victims of domestic violence who are highly economically dependent on their partners have greater trust in the support system and decide to remove themselves from situations of violence.

68. GREVIO welcomes the availability, in all services in charge of supporting women victims of violence, of social workers and psychologists, who can support women victims in their dealings with law enforcement, judicial and healthcare services, as well as in finding employment and/or independent housing. This system offers effective, long-term support and assistance to victims of violence and helps them overcome any reluctance they may have to contact the authorities. However, it notes that this provision of support and assistance is mainly aimed at victims of domestic violence, and that no specific mechanism is in place for victims of other forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention, such as forced marriage, female genital mutilation and sexual violence.

69. Furthermore, GREVIO notes that while all DASO staff members have completed training on the reception of victims of intimate-partner violence and can refer to the DASO's guide to care provision for alleged victims of intimate-partner violence, there is no protocol aimed at improving their capacity to systematically detect cases of violence against women. GREVIO believes that the implementation of such protocols, which may draw on promising practices at the international level, can help shed further light on situations of violence against women.⁵⁷

55. Explanatory Report to the Istanbul Convention, paragraph 127.

56. See Article 22, Specialist support services.

57. Examples of promising practices have been identified by GREVIO; see, for example, information on the DOTIP protocol, baseline evaluation report on Switzerland, 2022, paragraph 91.

b. Healthcare services

70. Since its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO is pleased to note that measures have been taken to expand training for CHPG staff on care for victims of domestic violence, with 51 persons having completed specific training. Seven social workers, three doctors and two nurses and midwives also completed specific in-service training on domestic violence and act as dedicated officers for their colleagues. However, it regrets that no procedure to systematically detect violence against women has been put in place at the emergency department or the maternity ward, for example as part of prenatal check-ups. Information brought to GREVIO's attention also suggests that there is a lack of awareness of violence against women among general medical practitioners.⁵⁸ GREVIO believes that the implementation of protocols for healthcare professionals to systematically detect all forms of violence against women is key to helping expose violence and to supporting, guiding and protecting victims and children exposed to violence.

71. Furthermore, training of professionals mainly covers sexual and domestic violence, and no awareness-raising activities on forms of violence such as female genital mutilation have been carried out to date. As far as GREVIO is aware, there is no specific care provision available for victims of female genital mutilation.

72. Women who report having experienced violence are referred to social services and AVIP during business hours, or to the police. According to information brought to GREVIO's attention by the Monegasque authorities, it is also possible to file a complaint directly at the CHPG, which GREVIO welcomes. In this context, it notes with interest that there are plans to implement an agreement on co-operation between the police, the judiciary and healthcare services, which could help facilitate information exchange and standardise practices.

73. Victims of rape are generally referred to the CHPG. GREVIO is pleased to learn that quick guides to caring for and supporting adult and minor victims of sexual violence are available to hospital staff, which provide the relevant professionals with an overview of the steps to follow with victims of sexual violence, including minors. It also observes that rape kits are available at the CHPG and that emergency contraception can be prescribed, as can preventive treatment for HIV and STDs.

74. GREVIO is also pleased to note that a forensic medical officer is now operating in Monaco, which was not the case when it conducted its baseline evaluation, and that two doctors from the CHPG's emergency department have now been trained in forensic medicine. It also notes that forensic medical reports can be drawn up and evidence collected without being requisitioned by law enforcement agencies or the judiciary, as well as in the absence of a complaint filed by the victim. However, GREVIO was told that, despite notable progress since its first baseline evaluation, the limited number of forensic medical officers is still an obstacle to accessing forensic evidence in cases of rape. In addition, GREVIO was informed that it could sometimes be difficult for women victims of violence to obtain a forensic medical report, in particular for non-Monegasque women without access to regular healthcare visits, which may hinder potential judicial proceedings.⁵⁹ Concerns were also expressed regarding the quality of certain forensic medical reports.⁶⁰

75. Women victims of violence with no legal status in Monaco cannot seek care at the CHPG, except for emergencies, and are referred to services that may be provided to them in France. GREVIO considers it essential for women victims of violence in Monaco, particularly sexual violence, to have access to rapid support and care in Monaco, regardless of their status, in particular to collect evidence and draw up forensic medical reports, which are essential to bringing criminal proceedings.

58. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

59. See Article 50, Immediate response, prevention and protection.

60. Information provided to GREVIO during the evaluation visit.

76. Lastly, according to the information at GREVIO's disposal, no cases were reported of forced sterilisation, abortion or contraception of women with disabilities under guardianship.⁶¹

77. GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue in their efforts to provide women victims of violence with a response that is geared to their needs, in particular by:

- a. putting in place protocols aimed at improving the capacity of professionals to systematically detect cases of violence against women, in particular within healthcare services;**
- b. expanding the care measures provided by the DASO and healthcare services to include all forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, including female genital mutilation;**
- c. considering the possibility of setting up a system to offer priority access to independent housing for women victims of violence.**

3. Specialist support services (Article 22)

78. Specialist support services ensure the complex task of empowering victims through optimal support and assistance catered to their specific needs and are an equally important cornerstone of a trust-based system of protection and support. Much of this is best ensured by women's organisations and by support services provided, for example, by local authorities with specialist and experienced staff with in-depth knowledge of gender-based violence against women. They need to be able to address the different types of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention and to provide support to all groups of victims, including hard-to-reach groups.

79. As already mentioned in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO observes that the Monegasque authorities have chosen not to set up specialist support services, preferring to focus their efforts on networking among professionals in charge of meeting the needs of women victims of violence, as well as the multidisciplinary nature of staff.

80. Victims of domestic violence may be placed in accommodation, with their children, at one of the social housing shelters in Monaco, at a hotel or serviced accommodation in emergency situations or for short stays, or in nearby municipalities, in which case prior filing of a complaint is not necessary. The existing shelters accommodate the majority of women victims of violence and their children, but also homeless families and young adults, based on a six-month agreement that can be renewed for two years. However, persons who need to stay longer at a shelter can remain there for longer periods of time, which GREVIO welcomes. They have access to psychological support and are all monitored by an on-site social worker. Children accommodated in shelters with their mothers are monitored by the DASO's child protection team. In addition, 23 transitional housing units are available for women who have stayed at a shelter but still require support. Victims accommodated in shelters are required to contribute to accommodation costs if they have an income.

81. While the French "App'Elles" app is now available in Monaco,⁶² GREVIO notes that there is still no 24/7 specialist helpline for women victims of all forms of violence.⁶³ Although GREVIO is aware that, in light of the country's small size and the interaction between the relevant authorities, the existing services are able to meet some of the needs of women victims of violence, it points out that if a woman needs to call a specialist counselling and support service in the middle of the night, she will have to fend for herself, as none of the existing specialist services are open then. Yet it is often at night or during the weekend that victims need support and counselling.

61. Information provided to GREVIO during the evaluation visit.

62. See www.dfm.mc/evenement/app-elles-lapplication-pour-lutter-contre-les-violences-faites-aux-femmes.

63. See also the Conclusions on the implementation of recommendations in respect of Monaco adopted on 7 December 2021 by the Committee of the Parties to the Istanbul Convention.

GREVIO stresses that the core purpose of a 24/7 helpline is to offer women in need, at any hour of the day or night, with support and expert counselling, provided by suitably trained professionals, in a language that they are able to understand. Experience shows that this degree of quality cannot be successfully provided by more general victim support services or emergency helplines, which do not usually have the necessary experience or expertise to help women victims efficiently, taking a gender-sensitive approach centred on victims' needs, and do not therefore meet the requirements of Article 24 of the convention.

82. AVIP offers counselling and legal assistance to all victims of crime, many of whom are women victims of intimate-partner violence, sexual assault and harassment.⁶⁴ It can also provide psychological assistance and organise emergency accommodation if the DASO's services are not available, and assists victims in filing complaints and during judicial proceedings.

83. In addition, GREVIO is not aware of any specific measures to detect violence against women at the care home for persons with disabilities run by AMAPEI, nor of measures taken to facilitate access to support services by women with disabilities who are victims of violence.

84. In general, GREVIO is pleased to note that women victims of violence have access to a range of services, including specialist services, and quality support offered by a limited number of stakeholders, which helps make them more accessible. However, it reiterates its concern about the fact that a portion of services are mainly aimed at victims of domestic violence, and that little attention appears to be paid to ensuring access to these services by women exposed to intersectional discrimination, in particular women with disabilities.

85. Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to set up a national, specialist helpline for women victims of violence, run in close co-operation with NGOs specialising in response to violence against women and domestic violence. It is also important to provide multi-lingual assistance and to make arrangements to ensure that women with disabilities and non-Monegasque women have access to the service.

86. GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue to develop specialist services that meet the needs of women victims of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention and to ensure that women exposed to intersectional discrimination have full access to these services.

4. Support for victims of sexual violence (Article 25)

87. Under Article 25 of the Istanbul Convention, parties are required to provide a set of holistic services to victims of sexual violence, including immediate medical care and trauma support, combined with forensic examinations, as well as short- and long-term psychological counselling and therapy to ensure the victim's recovery. Such services should be provided by trained and specialised staff in an appropriate manner to respond to the victims' needs, preferably within rape crisis or sexual violence referral centres established in sufficient number throughout the country to ensure their easy access. The recommendation is to set up one of the above-mentioned centres per every 200 000 inhabitants.⁶⁵

88. While GREVIO welcomes the measures taken since its baseline evaluation by the healthcare services to improve how they care for and support women victims of sexual violence, it notes that there are still no crisis centres for victims of this form of violence. It considers that setting up a crisis centre or a specialised unit for victims of sexual violence, potentially at the CHPG, could help supplement the efforts already made at the CHPG and better meet the short-and long-term needs of such persons and the need to offer them holistic support.

64. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

65. Explanatory Report to the Istanbul Convention, paragraph 142.

89. **Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to consider the possibility of setting up a specialised rape crisis and sexual violence referral centre so that victims have access to short- and long-term psychological counselling and support.**

C. Substantive law

90. Chapter V of the Istanbul Convention covers a range of provisions related to substantive law, in the area of both civil and criminal law, which aim to create the necessary legislative framework to prevent further victimisation of women and girls and to ensure robust intervention and prosecution by law enforcement agencies. This section focuses on progress made with respect to selected provisions of the convention in the area of substantive law, notably, Article 31 on custody, visitation rights and safety and Article 48 on the prohibition of mandatory alternative dispute resolution processes or sentencing in cases of violence against women.

1. Custody, visitation rights and safety (Article 31)

91. Custody and visitation decisions in relation to families with a history of abuse require a careful balancing of the different interests at stake. Article 31 of the convention seeks to ensure that incidents of violence covered by the convention, in particular domestic violence, are taken into account in decisions on custody and visitation rights, to ensure that the exercise of these rights does not harm the rights and safety of the victim or children. This provision contributes directly to their trust in the authorities because it offers essential protection from post-separation abuse.⁶⁶

92. In its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO noted that any violence committed by a parent against children was assessed by the court through the concept of the “child’s best interests”. However, it noted that it was unable to assess how far considerations relating to violence suffered by the non-abusive parent enter into a court’s assessment when custody and visitation rights are being decided.

93. GREVIO notes that in 2017, the principle of shared custody of children became the norm in cases of separation.⁶⁷ However, GREVIO welcomes the fact that the Civil Code still provides for the possibility of withdrawing parental authority from one of the parents in cases of criminal conviction for violence committed against children,⁶⁸ but also in the absence of a criminal conviction if the father or mother poses a risk to “the health, safety, morals or education of one of their children”. Furthermore, the guardianship judge, who rules on the exercise of parental authority, may, at the request of one of the parents, “entrust the exercise of parental authority to one parent alone, the father or the mother, where required by the child’s best interests”⁶⁹ or change the conditions of the exercise of parental authority, once again in the child’s best interests.⁷⁰ As such, they may take into account whether a child is exposed to domestic violence when determining the exercise of custody and visitation rights, even if exposure to domestic violence is not explicitly mentioned among the grounds for suspending or changing the exercise of parental authority. On the other hand, since 2017, domestic violence has

66. It is noteworthy that in the case of *Bîzdîga v. the Republic of Moldova* (Application No. 15646/18, 17 October 2023), the European Court of Human Rights held that in proceedings concerning the custody and visitation rights regarding children in a domestic violence context, the primary focus must be on the best interests of the child, and an assessment of any risks of violence or other forms of ill-treatment therefore has to form an integral part of such proceedings. For this reason, it found that an alleged history of domestic violence was a relevant and even mandatory factor to be considered in the assessment made by the domestic authorities when deciding on contact rights (§ 62). In the recent case of *Luca v. the Republic of Moldova* (Application No. 55351/17, 17 October 2023), the Court found a violation of Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights on account of the failure of the Moldovan authorities to take into account incidents of domestic violence in the determination of child contact rights.

67. Following the enactment of Law No. 1450 of 4 July 2017 on shared custody.

68. Article 323 of the Civil Code.

69. Article 302-1 of the Civil Code.

70. Article 303-1 of the Civil Code.

constituted an explicit ground for prohibiting family mediation in the process of reaching mutual agreement on the exercise of custody and visitation rights, which GREVIO welcomes.⁷¹

94. During its visit, GREVIO was pleased to note that the fact that a parent who is violent towards their partner constitutes a risk for the safety and well-being of the child, and that a child witness of domestic violence is exposed to consequences that are as negative as if the child had been a direct victim of such violence, appears to be recognised by judges as well as other relevant professionals. Consequently, it was informed that, while few requests for conferment of exclusive custody are submitted to the guardianship judge, custody and visitation rights are frequently suspended in cases of domestic violence and replaced by mediated visits. In addition, GREVIO welcomes the fact that, according to the information provided to it, the guardianship judge takes testimony from the child where deemed appropriate and can consult with the mother alone in cases of alleged domestic violence.

95. The guardianship judge is assisted by a social worker in order to assess situations that may go against the child's best interests, including domestic violence. The judge may also ask the DASO to conduct a welfare investigation and make use of psychological assessments. Based on this information, the guardianship judge may order educational support measures, at the request of the public prosecutor, or protective measures, including changes to visitation rights at the mediated space for parent/child visits. Educational support measures are reassessed every six months to one year and may lead to changes to the exercise of parental authority. In this regard, GREVIO would like to highlight the importance for all staff involved in welfare investigations, implementation of educational measures and psychological assessments to have sufficient training on domestic violence and the frequent use by perpetrators of joint parenting to maintain their control and domination over mothers and children.

96. GREVIO is pleased to note that mediated visits take place in a safe space, designed so that the two parents do not encounter one another, under the supervision of two psychologists and on the basis of a charter that must be signed by both parents. The child may also be seen alone by the psychologists assigned to the safe space.

97. GREVIO welcomes the fact that the harm caused to a child by being exposed to domestic violence appears to be recognised and considered as a factor that may warrant changes to custody and visitation rights. It also notes the frequent use of welfare investigations and educational measures, which help identify cases of domestic violence. However, in the absence of data on the number of decisions having led to the withdrawal of parental authority or a limitation of custody and visitation rights in the presence of domestic violence,⁷² it is difficult for it to assess whether, as a general rule, domestic violence is duly taken into account in all decisions concerning the exercise of parental authority. It considers that explicitly including in legislation incidents of violence against women, including those witnessed by children,⁷³ as criteria to be taken into account when determining custody and visitation rights, helps ensure that all judges systematically look for signs that could identify domestic violence, including during divorce proceedings.

98. **GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to take the following priority action in the area of custody and visitation rights to ensure the safety of victims and their children:**

- a. **ensure that the negative impact on children of violence against women is taken into account in legislation and that incidents of violence against women are considered a legally binding criterion in decision-making concerning custody and visitation rights;**

71. Article 303 of the Civil Code. See also Article 48 below.

72. See Article 11, Data collection.

73. Explanatory report to the Istanbul Convention, paragraph 144.

- b. analyse case law on how courts view incidents of violence and what grounds they give for their decision on custody and visitation rights so as to be able to assess developments in this regard.**

99. **GREVIO also invites the Monegasque authorities to continue taking action to alert all the relevant professionals to the harmful effects of violence on children, including child witnesses, and familiarising them with the provisions of the Istanbul Convention on custody and visitation rights.**

2. Prohibition of mandatory alternative dispute resolution processes or sentencing (Article 48)

100. Article 48, paragraph 1, of the Istanbul Convention requires parties to prohibit the mandatory participation in any alternative dispute resolution processes, including mediation and conciliation, in relation to cases of all forms of violence against women covered by the convention. This provision stems from the principle that violence against women is a manifestation of unequal power relations and that victims of such violence can never enter the alternative dispute resolution processes on an equal footing with the perpetrator. To avoid the re-privatisation of such violence and to enable the victim to seek justice, it is the responsibility of the state to provide access to adversarial court proceedings on the basis of robust criminal law provisions.

101. As mentioned in the previous section on Article 31 of the convention, Article 303 of the Civil Code explicitly excludes family mediation in the process of reaching mutual agreement on the exercise of custody and visitation rights in the event of domestic violence. Since 2017, this prohibition of mediation has also applied to divorce and separation proceedings in the presence of violence committed by one of the parents towards the other parent or the child.⁷⁴ GREVIO welcomes this legislative development, which responds to one of the concerns raised in its 2017 report.

102. GREVIO also welcomes the entry into force, in November 2023, of an amendment to the Code of Criminal Procedure prohibiting mediation in the event of domestic violence.⁷⁵ The information provided to GREVIO appears to suggest that in general, mediation is rarely used.⁷⁶ However, it was informed of a project aimed at expanding the use of mediation to resolve conflicts. In this context, GREVIO considers it important that all persons involved in carrying out mediation be trained to be able to detect any signs of violence against women.

D. Investigation, prosecution, procedural law and protective measures

103. Full accountability for all acts of violence against women requires an adequate response from law enforcement agencies and the criminal justice sector. Chapter VI of the Istanbul Convention establishes a set of measures to ensure criminal investigations, prosecutions and convictions in a manner that validates women's and girls' experiences of violence, that avoids their secondary victimisation and that offers protection throughout the different stages of proceedings. The provisions covered in this section are fundamental to the delivery of protection and justice for all women and girls at risk of or who have experienced gender-based violence.

1. General obligations (Article 49) and immediate response, prevention and protection (Article 50)

104. A key principle of an adequate response to violence against women is that of swift and effective investigations and judicial proceedings that are based on a gendered understanding of these types of offences and that take into consideration the rights of the victim during all stages.

74. Article 202-4 of the Civil Code.

75. Article 34-1, 5 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, entered into force on 1 November 2023.

76. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

Those in law enforcement or the judiciary actors often do not prioritise incidents of violence against women and domestic violence, thereby contributing to the impunity of perpetrators and reinforcing the misconception that this type of violence is “acceptable” in society.⁷⁷ A consequence of assigning low priority to incidents of violence against women and domestic violence are delays in initiating investigations and judicial processes, which in turn may lead to the loss of vital evidence and to an increased risk for the victim of repeated violence. For these reasons, Article 49 of the convention requires parties to ensure that investigations and judicial proceedings are conducted without undue delay, while at the same time respecting the rights of victims during each stage of these processes. Article 50 further reinforces these obligations by requiring that law enforcement agencies react promptly and appropriately in cases of violence against women, including by offering victims immediate protection and by engaging in the prevention of violence. GREVIO reports focus on the application of Article 50 at key stages of the criminal justice process, notably, reporting, investigation, prosecution and conviction, all of which are key contributors to victims’ sense of support, protection and justice.

a. Reporting to, immediate response and investigations by, law enforcement agencies

105. Since its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO is pleased to note that additional measures have been taken to improve the law enforcement response to and care provision for victims of domestic violence. A specialised division has been set up, which includes the unit for minors and welfare protection, specialising in domestic violence and violence against minors, as well as the organised crime unit, which deals with cases of sexual violence against adults. Two police social workers are assigned to this division, which can also make use of the services of the technology crime unit. GREVIO once again welcomes the availability of police social workers to support victims during the process, in particular the fact that one of the social workers has been specifically trained in the reception of persons with disabilities.⁷⁸

106. GREVIO notes with interest the office circular issued in 2020, aimed at improving measures to combat domestic violence at every stage in victims’ interactions with law enforcement agencies.⁷⁹ Its aim is to provide victims of domestic violence with swifter, more suitable support at every step of the procedure, which GREVIO welcomes. As such, the circular requires immediate home visits, support for victims at the CHPG if necessary and the systematic drafting of police logs or reports describing the situation, which are passed on to the public prosecutor along with a danger assessment chart. A domestic violence-specific interview template is also available in all call-out vehicles and at police stations. All victims are informed of the services offered by AVIP. Furthermore, following a home visit, law enforcement agencies systematically follow up with victims, even when they do not wish to file a complaint. In addition to the emergency hotlines, an email address can also be used to report violence to the police. The fact that it is possible to file a complaint at the CHPG is also a positive development. The circular also covers measures to be implemented to ensure adequate reception of victims of domestic violence. In this context, GREVIO notes that staff in charge of reception at police stations have also been trained in the reception of victims of violence. It stresses how important it is, in order to build victims’ trust in the system, to provide reception and support that are fully suited to the trauma they have suffered. Furthermore, it is possible for victims to request to be interviewed by a female law enforcement officer. Lastly, the office circular specified the measures to be taken to organise emergency accommodation for a victim of violence requiring immediate protection.⁸⁰ However, GREVIO was told that in the absence of members of the specialised unit, such as during the weekend, victims of domestic violence may be dealt with less appropriately and effectively.

77. Explanatory Report to the Istanbul Convention, paragraph 255.

78. Information provided to GREVIO during the evaluation visit.

79. Office circular of 11 May 2020, provided to GREVIO by the Monegasque authorities.

80. See Article 51, Risk assessment and risk management, Article 52, Emergency barring orders, and Article 53, Restraining or protection orders.

107. Despite the positive developments that have taken place over the past several years, the information provided to GREVIO shows that there are still gaps in care provision and support for victims of other forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention.⁸¹ In particular, it appears that the training of law enforcement professionals could be improved with respect to sexual violence. The resources of the unit in charge of combating cyberviolence should also be increased. Consequently, GREVIO believes that an important step would be to expand the effective system that was put in place to provide care for women victims of domestic violence to include all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention, in particular by expanding the training available to police officers to cover all such forms of violence.

b. Effective investigation and prosecution

108. GREVIO welcomes the fact that prosecuting domestic violence is among the public prosecutor's objectives.⁸² It also takes note of the smooth relations that appear to exist between law enforcement agencies and the public prosecutor, which enables a swift response in the event of danger to the victim, even in the absence of a system for fast-tracking cases of violence against women. The existence of agreements for co-operation between AVIP and the public prosecutor, and between the DASO and the public prosecutor, are useful additions to the system of care provision for victims of domestic violence.

c. Conviction rates

109. GREVIO welcomes the fact that a 2019 legislative reform increased the sentences for certain offences committed as a result of the victim's sex, including the "correctionnalisation" of certain acts of violence, even when they did not lead to illness or total incapacity to work.⁸³ Without any information concerning case law, however, GREVIO is unable to assess the impact of this change on the penalties imposed on perpetrators of gender-based violence.

110. Furthermore, GREVIO notes with interest that the assignment of a common case number enables law enforcement agencies and judicial authorities to track a case of violence against women from reporting to indictment.⁸⁴

111. GREVIO notes, however, that it remains difficult to assess the rate of conviction for acts of violence against women, with respect to the number of cases recorded for which proceedings were initiated, on the basis of the statistics provided by the various institutions (police, judiciary, CHPG, AVIP and DASO).⁸⁵ Bearing in mind this limitation, the figures at GREVIO's disposal show a very limited number of convictions for cases of violence against women with respect to the number of proceedings initiated, with two sentences delivered in 2022 and 2021, one in 2020 and four in 2019.⁸⁶ Furthermore, GREVIO notes that there appears to be a relatively significant number of cases closed without further action. Information brought to GREVIO's attention confirms this low conviction rate as well as the frequent dismissal of cases of violence against women.⁸⁷ GREVIO believes that the system enabling law enforcement agencies and judicial authorities to track a case from reporting to judicial decision⁸⁸ could be used to assess rates of conviction, attrition and re-offending, and to better analyse the effectiveness of the criminal justice response to violence against women.

112. Several reasons may explain this low rate of conviction and the high number of cases closed without further action. The people that GREVIO interviewed emphasised that one frequently cited reason is lack of evidence, which sometimes appears to arise from the difficulty

81. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

82. See for example *Monaco Hebdo*: www.monaco-hebdo.com/actualites/judiciaire/une-rentree-judiciaire-sur-fond-de-moneyval/.

83. Law 1478 of 12 November 2019.

84. Information provided to GREVIO by the authorities.

85. See Article 11, Data collection.

86. *Idem*.

87. Information provided to GREVIO during the evaluation visit.

88. See Article 11, Data collection.

of obtaining medical certificates following acts of violence.⁸⁹ Judges' lack of awareness and training on violence against women, in particular psychological violence, was also cited, as was the lack of lawyers trained in violence against women. Lastly, many victims withdraw their complaints, most likely out of fear of being stigmatised due to Monaco's small size, fear of retaliation or fear of a loss of resources and residence status in Monaco.⁹⁰ GREVIO is not aware of any measures entitling non-Monegasque women victims of violence to a residence permit during judicial proceedings. Inequality in terms of resources can also play a dissuasive role, as women victims of violence can be threatened with costly judicial proceedings by their wealthy spouses or partners.⁹¹ In this context, GREVIO reiterates the importance of disseminating information on the support and legal assistance available to women victims of violence, in particular non-Monegasque women. Achieving greater awareness among all judges and lawyers of all forms of violence against women would also help develop greater trust in the justice system among victims and reduce the number of complaints not followed through. Campaigns aimed at encouraging women victims of violence to report the abuse they have suffered, run in collaboration with women's associations, can also help limit the feeling of guilt felt by many victims, as well as the stigmatisation they may face, which are significant barriers to revealing acts of violence they have experienced.

113. GREVIO welcomes the 2021 amendments to the Criminal Code regarding sexual violence, which redefined rape as any act of non-consensual sexual penetration.⁹² Rape committed by a partner, or an ex-partner, was also made an aggravating circumstance,⁹³ a development that GREVIO also welcomes. These amendments to the Criminal Code also specify that lack of consent may be characterised in particular in cases where the sexual act was imposed "by the use of violence, [physical or moral] coercion, intimidation or surprise".⁹⁴ While lack of consent may now be characterised by circumstances other than violence, coercion, intimidation or surprise, GREVIO considers that this wording could lead to judges being limited in how they assess a victim's consent. Due to the lack of information on case law regarding rape and the fact that the amendments to the Criminal Code were made relatively recently, it is unable to assess how the notion of consent is now interpreted by judges. However, it was informed of the generally low number of judicial decisions concerning rape and other types of sexual assault,⁹⁵ even though the data at its disposal indicate that a number of victims of sexual assault are recorded each year.⁹⁶

114. In this context, GREVIO considers it essential to raise awareness among judges of the recent changes to the Criminal Code as well as the change in approach that is needed for the central role of the victim's wishes to be acknowledged and hence for the criminal law response to the needs of victims of sexual violence to be improved. It would also allow the judiciary to focus, in the context of the surrounding circumstances of the case, on the assessment of the woman's free will and the ability of the perpetrator to take notice of the woman's will, instead of evidence of other constituent elements of the offence. This approach could also help to encourage more victims of sexual violence to develop greater trust in the justice system and lodge complaints.

89. See Article 20, General support services.

90. Information provided to GREVIO during the evaluation visit. See also Chapter I, Emerging trends in violence against women and domestic violence.

91. Information provided to GREVIO during the evaluation visit.

92. Law No. 1517 of 23 December 2021 amending the provisions regarding incrimination for sexual assault. Article 262 of the Criminal Code now states that "rape is defined as the act of compelling another person to perform or undergo, without consent, any act of sexual penetration or any oral sex act, of whatever nature and by whatever means."

93. Article 262-1 of the Criminal Code.

94. Article 261-1 of the Criminal Code.

95. Information provided to GREVIO during the evaluation visit.

96. According to the information provided to GREVIO by AVIP, seven victims of sexual violence were recorded in 2022, two in 2021 (one of whom was filing a complaint regarding events that took place in 2018), and six in 2020. The state report shows that the Police Department carried out six investigations for rape (of adults and minors) in 2021 and four in 2022; see state report, Part IV.

115. **GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue in their efforts to improve the law enforcement response to violence against women, including the digital dimension of such violence, ensuring that police officers are adequately trained on all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention and are able to effectively support women victims of all such forms of violence.**

116. **In addition, GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to make sure that courts' handling of cases of violence against women is firmly anchored in a gender-based understanding of violence against women and to ensure, through training of the relevant professionals, that the perpetrators of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention are held to account, thereby building trust in the justice system among women victims of violence.**

117. **GREVIO also strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to analyse relevant case law so as to be able to assess the effectiveness of the criminal justice response to violence against women, and to amend legislation and practice where necessary.**

2. Risk assessment and risk management (Article 51)

118. Many perpetrators of domestic violence, rape, stalking, sexual harassment, forced marriage and other forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention threaten their victims with serious violence, including death, and have subjected their victims to serious violence in the past, including non-fatal strangulation. The growing digital dimension of such violence further exacerbates women's and girls' sense of fear. Article 51 thus places concern for their safety at the heart of any intervention in such cases by requiring the establishment of a multi-agency network of professionals to protect high-risk victims without aggravating the harm experienced. It sets out the obligation to ensure that all relevant authorities, not just law enforcement authorities, effectively assess and devise a plan to manage the safety risks a victim faces, on a case-by-case basis, according to standardised procedures and in co-operation with each other.

119. GREVIO is pleased to note that, since 2020, the Police Department has used a specific, standardised danger assessment chart in cases of domestic violence, which responds to GREVIO's observation in 2017 regretting the lack of written procedures and common criteria for risk assessment. The assessment chart must be attached to complaints and, in the absence of a complaint, submitted to the public prosecutor along with police reports and logs. It takes into account red flags such as possession of firearms, filing for divorce/breakup of a relationship, potential pregnancy, previous instances of violence, threats of suicide by the perpetrator, threats to the children, and a potential context of psychological or economic violence, which are known to be high-risk factors for the victim.⁹⁷ On the basis of this risk assessment, the police may recommend to the public prosecutor that the victim be placed in emergency accommodation or that a protection order be issued.⁹⁸ In addition, the fact that police officers systematically call back victims of domestic violence to follow up on a home visit also helps monitor the risk assessment and build victims' trust in the protection offered by the police.

120. Furthermore, as already mentioned above, the DASO, public prosecutor and judges frequently make use of welfare investigations and psychological assessments. AVIP, which conducts a danger assessment for victims, provides the DASO and public prosecutor with information on certain situations of violence, particularly in cases where the victim is in danger.⁹⁹ In addition, based on this danger assessment, AVIP may provide urgent accommodation to victims of violence in situations of danger, even in cases where a complaint has not been filed. However, for the other agencies in contact with victims, in particular the DASO and CHPG,

97. See European Court of Human Rights, *Kurt v. Austria*, Application No. 62903, judgment of 15 June 2021, paragraph 140.

98. See comments on Articles 52 (emergency barring orders) and 53 (restraining or protection orders).

99. See also Article 18, General obligations.

GREVIO is not aware of the use of a systematic procedure to assess the lethality risk, the seriousness of the situation and the risk of repeated violence.

121. GREVIO believes that, while the proximity of stakeholders helps to swiftly ensure victims' safety, a shared risk assessment mechanism, rather than mechanisms managed by each stakeholder separately, taking into account information from all relevant sources, including schools, social services, hospital services and non-governmental organisations, could help to better ensure the safety of all victims of violence against women. Furthermore, GREVIO stresses how important it is for a risk assessment to be carried out on forms of violence other than domestic violence, including forced marriage, female genital mutilation, violence committed in the name of "honour" and sexual violence. It also stresses the importance of taking into account, among the risk factors involved, the risk of non-fatal strangulation, a particularly dangerous form of physical violence, which is known to greatly increase the risk of physical escalation and lethal violence.

122. Lastly, as far as GREVIO is aware, there is no retroactive analysis of gender-based murders or attempted murders, or suicides or attempted suicides related to gender-based violence, in order to identify shortcomings that may have led to such situations.

123. GREVIO welcomes the measures taken to enable the police to assess risks for victims of domestic violence and strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue their efforts to standardise the practice of co-ordinated risk assessment to all services in contact with victims and to apply it to all forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, on the basis of a shared system. The Monegasque authorities should also consider the possibility of including non-fatal strangulation as a factor to be considered in risk assessment.

124. GREVIO also encourages the Monegasque authorities to set up a system for the retrospective review of murders, attempted murders, suicides and attempted suicides committed within the context of domestic violence and assess whether gaps in the institutional and/or judicial response contributed to the fatal outcome.

3. Emergency barring orders (Article 52)

125. Under Article 52 of the Istanbul Convention, in situations of immediate danger, the authorities are granted the power to issue an emergency barring order, ordering the perpetrator to leave the residence of the victim or person at risk for a specific period of time, and to prohibit the perpetrator from entering the residence or contacting the victim or person at risk. Emergency barring orders are tools intended to prevent a crime and to put safety first.¹⁰⁰ They should therefore be time-bound and incident-based, with the possibility of renewal in the case of continued danger. Longer-term protection should, however, be granted by a court by means of a protection order, upon application of the victim. An emergency barring order should in principle extend to children in need of protection and should have immediate effect.

126. GREVIO understands that the provisions of Article 24-1 of the Civil Code and Article 37-1 of the Code of Criminal Procedure allow the public prosecutor to bar entry to the matrimonial home by a perpetrator of violence, thereby responding to the requirements of Article 52 of the convention, which provides for such an option in the event of immediate danger. In its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO noted that, while the possibility of rapidly issuing an emergency barring order against a perpetrator of violence existed, in practice this measure was seldom requested and seldom applied. It therefore notes with interest the information according to which this protective measure is now more frequently used,¹⁰¹ despite the fact that it does not have access to specific figures.¹⁰²

100. See GREVIO's baseline evaluation report on Denmark, paragraph 207, and Malta, paragraph 218.

101. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

102. See Article 11, Data collection.

4. Restraining or protection orders (Article 53)

127. Restraining and protection orders are designed to prolong the protection afforded to the victim and her children by emergency barring orders and may be considered complementary to the protection offered by the latter. Under Article 53 of the convention, victims of all forms of violence against women should be able to obtain a protection order available for immediate protection - without undue financial or administrative burden being placed on the victim and irrespective of whether or not they choose to set in motion any other legal proceedings.

128. GREVIO notes with interest that, since its baseline evaluation report, the number of protection orders issued has grown. According to the information at its disposal, 13 protection orders were issued in 2023 and nine in 2022.¹⁰³ Protection orders, provided for in Article 24-1 of the Civil Code, can be issued by the Court of First Instance upon request by the victim, the public prosecutor or a victims' association such as AVIP.¹⁰⁴ They can prohibit a potential perpetrator of violence from "entering into contact with the victim by any means whatsoever, including electronic communication, or appearing or residing in certain places."¹⁰⁵ They may also award occupancy of the dwelling to the victim and rule on the exercise of parental authority. According to the information provided to GREVIO by the authorities, all requests are generally granted within 24 hours. At the end of a two-month period, the order can be extended by the judge for a further two-month period, which can be renewed indefinitely, following a hearing of the parties concerned and a review of the substance of the case.

129. With regard to criminal law, a 2019 legislative amendment also standardised the possibility of urgently prohibiting a perpetrator of violence from "entering into contact with the victim by any means whatsoever, including electronic communication, or appearing or residing in certain places" and of providing the victim and other members of the household with an emergency accommodation solution to ensure their safety.¹⁰⁶ The measure must also be approved by the Court of First Instance within 24 hours.

130. Protection orders may be issued against the potential perpetrator of a crime or an offence that constitutes an offence covered by the forms of violence against women covered by the convention criminalised by Monaco.¹⁰⁷ However, GREVIO has no information indicating that protection orders have been issued for forms of violence against women other than domestic violence.

131. While it welcomes the fact that protection orders are more and more widely used, GREVIO understands that children are not often included in the protection order prior to an application to the guardianship judge in charge of child protection, which can take between two weeks and two months. GREVIO reiterates the importance, in situations where an immediate danger to the mother has been identified, of expanding protection to include children, for example through contact bans or bans on entering the area surrounding the home, in order to limit risks to their safety, as well as the perpetrator of violence's means of putting pressure on the mother.

132. Breach of a protection order is a criminal offence. GREVIO does not have any data on breaches of protection orders. However, the information brought to its attention appears to show that law enforcement agencies and the judiciary have implemented a system to monitor compliance with orders. GREVIO reiterates the importance of having access to data on breaches of such orders and the sanctions imposed as a result of such breaches, in order to be able to monitor and evaluate the implementation of this measure, which is essential to ensuring the safety of women victims of violence and their children.

103. Information provided to GREVIO by the Monegasque authorities.

104. With the victim's consent for requests made by AVIP.

105. Article 24-1 of the Civil Code.

106. Article 37-1 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

107. Domestic violence, bullying and sexual harassment, forced marriage and female genital mutilation.

133. **GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue in their efforts to expand the use of emergency barring and protection orders. In particular, the authorities should:**

- a. **ensure that emergency barring and protection orders are applied to children in order to limit risks to their safety;**
- b. **ensure that protection orders are available and accessible to victims of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention.**

5. Measures of protection (Article 56)

134. Article 56 of the Istanbul Convention is a key provision for building trust at the level of judicial proceedings for women and girls who have experienced or who are witness to any of the forms of violence covered by the convention. It sets forth a non-exhaustive list of procedures designed to protect victims of violence from intimidation, retaliation and secondary victimisation at all stages of proceedings, during investigations and at trial. The drafters intended this list to be indicative, and parties may adopt additional protection measures that are more favourable than those provided in the convention. Moreover, intimidation and secondary victimisation can occur not only at the hands of perpetrators, but also when investigations and judicial proceedings are not based on a gendered understanding of violence against women, which is why the practical application of measures of protection should be firmly anchored in such an understanding.

135. GREVIO notes with regret that, since its 2017 evaluation, few measures have been taken to improve the protection of women victims of violence against retaliation, acts of intimidation or secondary victimisation during proceedings. It is still not possible for the victim to testify in a hearing room without being physically present, such as by video. Furthermore, the authorities are under no legal obligation to inform the victim of the perpetrator's release, or of changes in the enforcement of his sentence. GREVIO stresses how important it is for the victim's safety for them to have access to this type of information.

136. With regard to confrontations with perpetrators of violence, GREVIO is pleased to note that, according to the information provided to it, both law enforcement agencies and examining judges tend to avoid confrontations between perpetrators and victims of domestic violence. It also welcomes the fact that AVIP can support victims at all stages of proceedings, from the police investigation to the court.

137. With regard to hearings of child victims and witnesses, GREVIO notes with interest the information provided to it concerning the upcoming creation of a specific room for police hearings of minors.¹⁰⁸ Hearings are also filmed in order to avoid needing to repeat information. However, GREVIO was informed that only two police officers have been trained to take testimony from children. Furthermore, while a psychologist accompanies children at hearings before the judge, the premises for receiving them are not suited to this situation, and a lack of lawyers specialising in children's rights and child protection has been reported to GREVIO.¹⁰⁹

138. GREVIO would like to highlight the importance of effective measures of protection against intimidation, retaliation and re-victimisation during proceedings in order to build trust among victims of violence in the system for preventing and combating violence against women, and thus to encourage them to file a complaint and request support. GREVIO believes that such measures may prove especially useful in the specific context of Monaco, as the country's small size and resulting lack of anonymity can make it difficult for some women to file a complaint and report acts of violence against them.

108. Information provided by the Monegasque authorities on the upcoming availability at the Police Department's premises of a "Mélanie" room.

109. Information provided during the evaluation visit.

139. Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to take measures to protect the rights and interests of victims during investigations and judicial proceedings, and to ensure that women victims of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention and children exposed to violence are effectively protected against the risks of retaliation, intimidation or secondary victimisation.

Appendix I

List of proposals and suggestions by GREVIO

II. Changes in definitions, comprehensive and co-ordinated policies, funding and data collection in the areas of violence against women and domestic violence

A. Definitions (Article 3)

1. GREVIO strongly encourages the authorities to adopt a definition of domestic violence that is fully in accordance with the definition given in Article 3.b of the Istanbul Convention (paragraph 8).

B. Comprehensive and co-ordinated policies (Article 7)

2. GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to develop a long-term overarching strategy, featuring a comprehensive and co-ordinated range of policies to prevent and combat all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention. In doing so, they must develop an intersectional approach and ensure that policies include specific measures to prevent violence against specific categories of women, such as women with disabilities, non-Monegasque working women and women in prostitution (paragraph 17).

3. GREVIO also strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to evaluate, on a regular basis, such policies aiming to achieve the comprehensive and co-ordinated policy approach required by the Istanbul Convention. Such evaluations should be carried out on the basis of pre-defined indicators in order to assess their impact and ensure that policymaking is based on reliable data (paragraph 18).

C. Financial resources (Article 8)

4. GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to ensure that sufficient resources continue to be allocated to programmes and measures to prevent and combat violence against women and domestic violence. It also encourages them to continue and secure the support provided to organisations involved in combating violence against women and domestic violence, and supporting victims (paragraph 22).

D. Data collection (Article 11)

5. GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to (paragraph 28):

- a. continue to develop the collection of data on all forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, broken down according to the sex and age of the victim and the perpetrator, their relationship and geographic location, in order to better assess the scope of violence against women and the authorities' response to this phenomenon. In doing so, they should ensure that data collection, storage and processing comply with the data protection standards set out in the Council of Europe's Convention for the Protection of Individuals with regard to Automatic Processing of Personal Data;

- b. take measures to have full data as soon as possible on judicial proceedings and the number of protection orders issued, compliance with these orders and the sanctions imposed in the event of non-compliance.

III. Analysis of the implementation of selected provisions in priority areas in the fields of prevention, protection and prosecution

A. Prevention

1. General obligations (Article 12)

6. GREVIO welcomes the efforts made since its baseline evaluation report with regard to preventing domestic violence. However, it strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to expand these measures to include other forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention (paragraph 37).

7. In addition, GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to regularly conduct impact assessments on campaigns and other measures to prevent violence against women (paragraph 38).

2. Education (Article 14)

8. GREVIO welcomes the substantial measures taken since its baseline evaluation report and strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to produce teaching material on violence against women and girls and the subjects listed in Article 14 of the Istanbul Convention, and to pursue measures to raise pupils' awareness of these issues, on a regular basis and at all levels of schooling (paragraph 45).

3. Training of professionals (Article 15)

9. GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue and expand their efforts with regard to initial and in-service training for professionals in contact with women victims of violence. To do so, GREVIO encourages them to (paragraph 52):

- a. ensure that training is provided on a regular, mandatory basis to all professionals concerned, including judges;
- b. ensure that training includes all forms of gender-based violence covered by the Istanbul Convention, as well as modules on detecting and providing care for women victims of violence exposed to intersectional discrimination;
- c. ensure that lawyers have access to training on violence against women;
- d. involve Monegasque NGOs active in supporting and assisting women victims of violence in the training teams.

4. Preventive intervention and treatment programmes (Article 16)

b. Programmes for perpetrators of sexual violence

10. Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to set up, as soon as possible, accountability programmes for perpetrators of violence, aimed at preventing them from re-offending and holding them accountable for their actions, including sexual violence (paragraph 56).

B. Protection and support**1. General obligations (Article 18)**

11. GREVIO invites the Monegasque authorities to (paragraph 63):
- a. continue to foster multi-agency co-operation, ensuring that it covers all forms of violence against women and that it is based on a gender-sensitive, rights-based approach and the safety, protection and empowerment of victims;
 - b. continue to develop standardised protocols for multi-agency co-operation to secure effective support and protection for all women victims of violence.

2. General support services (Article 20)**b. Healthcare services**

12. GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue in their efforts to provide women victims of violence with a response that is geared to their needs, in particular by (paragraph 77):
- a. putting in place protocols aimed at improving the capacity of professionals to systematically detect cases of violence against women, in particular within healthcare services;
 - b. expanding the care measures provided by the DASO and healthcare services to include all forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, including female genital mutilation;
 - c. considering the possibility of setting up a system to offer priority access to independent housing for women victims of violence.

3. Specialist support services (Article 22)

13. Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to set up a national, specialist helpline for women victims of violence, run in close co-operation with NGOs specialising in response to violence against women and domestic violence. It is also important to provide multi-lingual assistance and to make arrangements to ensure that women with disabilities and non-Monegasque women have access to the service (paragraph 85).

14. GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue to develop specialist services that meet the needs of women victims of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention and to ensure that women exposed to intersectional discrimination have full access to these services (paragraph 86).

4. Support for victims of sexual violence (Article 25)

15. Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to consider the possibility of setting up a specialised rape crisis and sexual violence referral centre so that victims have access to short- and long-term psychological counselling and support (paragraph 89).

C. Substantive law**1. Custody, visitation rights and safety (Article 31)**

16. GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to take the following priority action in the area of custody and visitation rights to ensure the safety of victims and their children (paragraph 98):

- a. ensure that the negative impact on children of violence against women is taken into account in legislation and that incidents of violence against women are considered a legally binding criterion in decision-making concerning custody and visitation rights;
- b. analyse case law on how courts view incidents of violence and what grounds they give for their decision on custody and visitation rights so as to be able to assess developments in this regard.

17. GREVIO also invites the Monegasque authorities to continue taking action to alert all the relevant professionals to the harmful effects of violence on children, including child witnesses, and familiarising them with the provisions of the Istanbul Convention on custody and visitation rights (paragraph 99).

D. Investigation, prosecution, procedural law and protective measures

1. General obligations, immediate response, prevention and protection (Articles 49 and 50)

c. Conviction rates

18. GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue in their efforts to improve the law enforcement response to violence against women, including the digital dimension of such violence, ensuring that police officers are adequately trained on all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention and are able to effectively support women victims of all such forms of violence (paragraph 115).

19. In addition, GREVIO strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to make sure that courts' handling of cases of violence against women is firmly anchored in a gender-based understanding of violence against women and to ensure, through training of the relevant professionals, that the perpetrators of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention are held to account, thereby building trust in the justice system among women victims of violence (paragraph 116).

20. GREVIO also strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to analyse relevant case law so as to be able to assess the effectiveness of the criminal justice response to violence against women, and to amend legislation and practice where necessary (paragraph 117).

2. Risk assessment and risk management (Article 51)

21. GREVIO welcomes the measures taken to enable the police to assess risks for victims of domestic violence and strongly encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue their efforts to standardise the practice of co-ordinated risk assessment to all services in contact with victims and to apply it to all forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention, on the basis of a shared system. The Monegasque authorities should also consider the possibility of including non-fatal strangulation as a factor to be considered in risk assessment (paragraph 123).

22. GREVIO also encourages the Monegasque authorities to set up a system for the retrospective review of murders, attempted murders, suicides and attempted suicides committed within the context of domestic violence and assess whether gaps in the institutional and/or judicial response contributed to the fatal outcome (paragraph 124).

4. Restraining or protection orders (Article 53)

23. GREVIO encourages the Monegasque authorities to continue in their efforts to expand the use of emergency barring and protection orders. In particular, the authorities should (paragraph 133):

- a. ensure that emergency barring and protection orders are applied to children in order to limit risks to their safety;
- b. ensure that protection orders are available and accessible to victims of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention.

5. Measures of protection (Article 56)

24. Recalling the findings issued in its baseline evaluation report, GREVIO urges the Monegasque authorities to take measures to protect the rights and interests of victims during investigations and judicial proceedings, and to ensure that women victims of all forms of violence covered by the Istanbul Convention and children exposed to violence are effectively protected against the risks of retaliation, intimidation or secondary victimisation (paragraph 139).

Appendix II
List of the national authorities, other public bodies,
non-governmental organisations and
civil society organisations
with which GREVIO held consultations

National authorities

Committee to Promote and Safeguard Women's Rights
Department of Education, Youth and Sport
Directorate of Justice
Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation
Ministry of Health and Social Affairs
Ministry of State
Police Department

Public institutions

High Commission for the protection of rights, freedoms and for mediation
Princess Grace Hospital (CHPG)
The National Council of Monaco

Non-governmental organisations

Au Cœur des Mots
Association d'Aide aux Victimes d'Infractions Pénales (AVIP, counselling service for victims of crime)
Femmes Leaders Mondiales Monaco
Monaco's bar association
Monaco's trade unions association (USM)
Red Cross of Monaco
SheCanHeCan
Soroptimist Monaco

GREVIO, the Group of Experts on Action against Violence against Women and Domestic Violence, is an independent human rights monitoring body mandated to monitor the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence (Istanbul Convention) by the parties.

Following the comprehensive stocktaking exercise set out in its baseline evaluation reports, GREVIO's first thematic evaluation round identifies progress made in building trust among women and girls by delivering support, protection and justice by any of the forms of violence against women covered by the Istanbul Convention. This report contains an analysis of developments in law and policy in respect of provisions of the convention relating to victim support and protection, criminal investigation and prosecution of acts of violence. It also covers developments in the determination of child custody and visitation rights in cases with a history of violence and wider preventive measures.

www.coe.int/conventionviolence

www.coe.int

The Council of Europe is the continent's leading human rights organisation. It comprises 46 member states, including all members of the European Union.

All Council of Europe member states have signed up to the European Convention on Human Rights, a treaty designed to protect human rights, democracy and the rule of law.

The European Court of Human Rights oversees the implementation of the Convention in the member states.