



FACTSHEET – BULGARIA

Lanzarote Committee's Implementation Report on:

"The protection of children against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse facilitated by information and communication technologies (ICTs): addressing the challenges raised by child self-generated sexual images and/or videos (CSGSIV)"

Last update: 25.05.2023

Table of Contents

I.	Introduction	3
	Legal framework	
III.	Investigations and prosecution	
IV.	Jurisdiction rules	10
V.	International cooperation	12
VI.	Assistance to victims	14
VII.	Civil society involvement and cooperation	16
	Promoting awareness of the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children erating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves	18
IX.	Education for children	21
X.	Higher education curriculum and continuous training	23
XI.	Research	25

I. Introduction

Protecting children from sexual exploitation and sexual abuse facilitated by information and communication technologies (ICTs) is a common challenge faced by all States. The often transnational nature of these offences makes international cooperation of the utmost importance especially to identify and protect victims as well as to identify and prosecute perpetrators.

The Council of Europe <u>Convention on the Protection of Children against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse</u> ("Lanzarote Convention") is a comprehensive instrument that sets out the applicable standards necessary to:

- Prevent child sexual exploitation and abuse, including where this is facilitated by ICTs;
- Protect victims;
- Prosecute perpetrators; and
- Promote national and international co-operation to strengthen these actions.

The <u>Committee of the Parties to the Lanzarote Convention</u> ("the Lanzarote Committee") monitors the implementation of the Convention in thematic monitoring rounds. This allows for all Parties to be monitored simultaneously on the same theme.

Particularly concerned by the exponential increase in offences committed using child self-generated sexual images and/or videos (CSGSIV), the Lanzarote Committee decided to dedicate its second monitoring round to this topic. The 43 States that were Party to the Convention at the time the monitoring round was launched took part, including Bulgaria.

The <u>implementation report</u> adopted by the Lanzarote Committee in the context of this monitoring round is based on information provided by <u>State Parties</u> and <u>other stakeholders</u> in response to a questionnaire. The implementation report also contains information received from 306 <u>children</u> in 10 Parties who chose to participate.

The Lanzarote Committee's recommendations to improve or reinforce the protection of children against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse can be found in boxes in each of the 10 thematic chapters. The key messages resulting from the children's participation are also reflected throughout the whole report. Each chapter also includes examples of promising practices.

The Lanzarote Committee indicates the different levels of urgency applicable to the recommendations made by using the following terms:

- "Require": when the steps recommended correspond to obligations arising from the Lanzarote Convention, as clarified by its Explanatory report;
- "Request": when the steps recommended correspond to obligations arising from the Lanzarote Convention, as clarified by documents adopted by the Committee (e.g. previous monitoring round findings, opinions, other)¹;
- "Invite": when the steps recommended correspond to promising practices or other measures to enhance protection of children against sexual violence even beyond specific requirements of the Lanzarote Convention.

This factsheet is based on the implementation report and has been prepared by the Lanzarote Committee Secretariat as a practical tool to be used by Bulgaria to clearly identify the relevant recommendations and actions addressed by the Lanzarote Committee to it. Therefore, it does not include updated information on measures implemented by the Parties since the adoption of the report in March 2022. Parties are

¹ See Rule 30 (General comments, proposals and opinions) of the Lanzarote Committee's Rules of Procedure.

encouraged to inform the secretariat of any relevant measures implemented after that date, which may have an impact on the Committee's analysis and recommendations by completing this <u>online form</u> or by email to <u>lanzarote.committee@coe.int</u>.

Key findings of the implementation report as to all Parties

The Committee raised particular concerns that in the vast majority of State Parties, children are at risk of criminal liability in relation to their own self-generated materials, and that many Parties do not provide for the specific offence where a child is a victim of extortion involving the use of its CSGSIV.

Strengthening international cooperation was identified as of particular importance in this context, given that these offences often contain a transnational element. The Lanzarote Committee also called on Parties to establish jurisdiction where any constituent element of an offence takes place within their territory.

Many Parties were found to provide mechanisms to facilitate reporting of these crimes but without providing specific services to support and assist children who have been victims of online sexual abuse to recover. Lack of public awareness and education, including among children, about the specific risks associated with ICT facilitated sexual abuse and self-generated content was also identified as a common challenge.

II. Legal framework

Interpreting the Convention, in conjunction with its <u>Opinion on child sexually suggestive or explicit images and/or videos generated, shared and received by children</u> (6 June 2019), the Committee identifies what Parties ought to have in place as well as what they are encouraged to do to better protect children against the exploitation of their self-generated sexual images and/or videos (CSGSIV).

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on the legal frameworks specific to Bulgaria

The Committee observes that to demonstrate compatibility with the exclusion of criminal liability for the production and possession of CSGSIV, Bulgaria pointed at the age of criminal responsibility below which children cannot be held criminally liable for acts they commit, which is 14 in Bulgaria. ² Bulgaria also informed that production and possession of CSGSIV were not criminalised when the child(ren) in question have reached the legal age for sexual activities.3 The Committee however highlights that reliance upon the age of criminal responsibility and the legal age for sexual activities alone to exclude criminal responsibility does not correspond to a situation of full compliance with paragraphs 3-6 of the 2019 Opinion, since children above the age of criminal responsibility and below the legal age for sexual activities cannot avail themselves of this exemption.4

The Committee finally notes that Bulgaria has rules that lead to the criminalisation of the distribution by children of CSGSIV of other children.⁵

The Committee therefore **requests** Bulgaria:

- to ensure in its legal framework that a child will not be prosecuted when he/she possess:
- their own self-generated sexually suggestive or explicit images and/or videos;
- self-generated sexually suggestive or explicit images and/or videos of another child with the informed consent of the child depicted on them;
- the self-generated sexually suggestive or

- explicit images and/or videos of another child as a result of receiving them passively without actively asking for them.⁶
- to ensure in its legal framework⁷ that a child will not be prosecuted for sharing his/her sexual images and/or videos with another child when such sharing is voluntary, consensual and intended solely for their own private use.⁸
- to ensure that the distribution or transmission by children of self-generated sexually explicit images and/or videos of other children is prosecuted as a last resort when such images and/or videos qualify as "child pornography" in accordance with Article 20(2) of the Convention.⁹

On the "sexual extortion of children":

The Committee observes that, in cases where the sexual extorsion is intended to procure other sexual favours from the child depicted in the images/videos or from another child, Bulgaria would prosecute for sexual abuse of a child in accordance with Article 18. In Bulgaria, the use of force or threats is an aggravating circumstance to the offence of persuading a child of 14 years old or less to "take part in or to observe actual, virtual or simulated sexual intercourse between persons of the same or different sex or lascivious exhibition of human sexual organs, sodomy, masturbation, sexual sadism or masochism" and a material element of the offence regarding children over 14 years old.¹⁰

It also notes that Bulgaria did not submit information regarding its prosecution of cases where the sexual extorsion was intended to

legislation but should be understood in a broader way, e.g., through prosecutorial guidance or practice.

² Para.71.

³ Para.73.

⁴ Paras. 72, 73

⁵ Para.82.

⁶ Recommendation II-6.

⁷ The expression "legal framework" is not limited to

⁸ Recommendation II-8.

⁹ Recommendation II-9.

¹⁰ Para.102.

procure a financial gain or other property from the child, additional sexual images or videos, or any other gain (e.g. contacts of peers for their sexual solicitation).

The Committee therefore invites Bulgaria:

 when dealing with sexual extortion cases involving children, to take into account the situation where CSGSIV are used to force, coerce or threaten the child to give additional CSGSIV, other sexual favours, a financial gain or other gain to the offenders by:

- either creating a specific incrimination to address this situation,
- or prosecuting both the initial detention of CSGSIV and the act of extortion. ¹¹
- to ensure that sexual extortion of children involving CSGSIV is investigated and prosecuted.¹²

Generic recommendations of the Committee on legal frameworks

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- acknowledging that the term "child pornography" can be misleading and undermine the gravity of the crimes it refers to, to rather use the term "child sexual abuse material" (CSAM) for material depicting acts of sexual abuse of children and/or focusing on the genitalia of the child following the guidance set out in the "Terminology Guidelines for the Protection of Children from Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse" in the development of future national, regional and international legal instruments and policies addressing the prevention of and protection from sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children. 14
- to strengthen the protection of children by introducing explicit references in their respective legal frameworks to conduct concerning child self-generated sexual images and/or videos, identifying the circumstances

when children should not be held criminally liable and when they should be prosecuted only as a last resort.¹⁵

- to introduce a definition of "child sexual abuse material" (CSAM) in its legislative framework in line with its Recommendation II-1 above.
- to contemplate appropriate legal responses to conduct involving non-visual CSGSIV produced by children in the context of offences covered by the Convention.¹⁶
- to adopt legislative or other measures which promote as a priority educational and other measures that will aim to support children in safely exploring their sexual development while understanding and avoiding risks deriving from the production and possession of CSGSIV.¹⁷
- to consider criminalising the offence of "grooming" (solicitation of children for sexual purposes), even when it does not lead to a faceto-face meeting or producing CSAM.¹⁸

¹¹ Recommendation II-11.

¹² Recommendation II-12.

¹³ The Terminology Guidelines also refer to the term "child sexual exploitation material", indicating that this term can be used in a broader sense, see "Luxembourg Terminology Guidelines", pages 38-40 in particular.

¹⁴ Recommendation II-1.

¹⁵ Recommendation II-2.

¹⁶ Recommendation II-4.

¹⁷ Recommendation II-7.

¹⁸ Recommendation II-10.

III. Investigations and prosecution

In its Interpretative Opinion on the applicability of the Lanzarote Convention to sexual offences against children facilitated through the use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) (12 May 2017), the Committee called on Parties to ensure effective investigation and prosecution of ICT facilitated sexual exploitation and sexual abuse by providing resources and training to responsible authorities.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on investigations and prosecution specific to Bulgaria

The Committee observes that Bulgaria has specialised units dealing with ICT facilitated offences against children within law enforcement, which are dedicated exclusively to cyber or sexual crimes against children. ¹⁹ Indeed, the Cyber Crime Sector, which is part of the Ministry of Interior, has a functional competence to prevent, intercept and reveal instances of online child sexual exploitation. ²⁰

Bulgaria did not provide information on the specialisation of prosecution and court staff in ICT facilitated sexual offences against children.

However, the Committee notes that Bulgaria has training modules in place for law enforcement agents²¹ and prosecutors²² related to aspects of child sexual exploitation and sexual abuse. Prosecutors have access to training on children's rights in general, sexual violence against children, online child sexual abuse and sexual exploitation, and international collaboration.²³

• The Committee **requests** Bulgaria to ensure that training on ICT facilitated sexual offences against children is available for judges who are or will be working on these issues.²⁴

The Committee invites Bulgaria:

• to establish, where appropriate, specialised units, services or persons within

the courts in charge of dealing with ICT facilitated sexual offences against children.²⁵

• to ensure that training on the challenges raised by child self-generated sexual images and/or videos and ICT facilitated coercion or extortion of children is available to prosecutors.²⁶ ²⁷

The Committee observes that Bulgaria has victim identification units within law enforcement for cases of ICT facilitated sexual offences against children, located within cybercrime units or high-tech crime departments.²⁸ It also makes an active contribution to the INTERPOL's International Child Sexual Exploitation (ICSE) image and video database, through the same specialised units.²⁹

Bulgaria reported that the tracking of Internet connections, especially when connections have been made through servers from different countries including through hidden IP addresses, as well as the use of encrypted messages, may be a challenge for the identification of perpetrators.³⁰

The Committee notes that in Bulgaria, undercover operations can be permitted by a court, and special intelligence means can be used when necessary for the investigation of the crime whereby a child under the age of 18,

¹⁹ Para.116.

²⁰ Para.118.

²¹ Para.145.

²¹ Para.145. ²² Para.156.

²³ Para.164.

²⁴ Recommendation III-18.

²⁵ Recommendation III-8.

²⁶ Such trainings can also be part of broader training programmes.

²⁷ Recommendation III-17.

²⁸ Para.180.

²⁹ Para.186.

³⁰ Para.194.

or a person who looks like they are under 18 years old, are used for the purpose of the creation of pornographic material.³¹

Finally, the Committee notes that in Bulgaria, the legal framework on telecommunication

data storage is a problem in the prosecution phase, particularly insofar as providing a unified and reasonable time-limits for the storage of data by telecommunications service providers.³²

Generic recommendations of the Committee on investigation and prosecution

On the specialisation and training of authorities:

• Mindful of the different contexts in the Parties as recalled in para 235 of the Explanatory Report, the Committee **requests** those Parties that are not already doing so to ensure that law enforcement and prosecution units, services or persons specialised in ICT facilitated sexual offences against children are adequately financed to ensure sufficient resources, including staff, equipment and training.³³

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to ensure that the capacities of any investigative unit specialised in ICT facilitated sexual offences against children take into account evolving technologies and online behaviours and reflect current practices used by perpetrators.³⁴
- to ensure that law enforcement units, services or persons specialised in ICT facilitated sexual offences against children adequately cover and/or are specialised in offences against children involving CSGSIV.³⁵
- to ensure that units, services or persons within courts responsible for ICT facilitated sexual offences against children have the necessary specialisation in the intersecting areas of children's rights, sexual abuse and sexual exploitation of children, and ICT technical knowledge.³⁶
- To ensure that units, services or persons within courts responsible for ICT facilitated sexual offences against children

have sufficient specialisation in offences involving CSGSIV.³⁷

- to have units, sections or persons specialised in ICT facilitated sexual offences committed by children against other children for authorities responsible for investigation and for authorities responsible for prosecution.³⁸
- to provide specific training on ICT facilitated sexual offences against children, including when such offences involve CSGSIV, and ICT facilitated coercion or extortion to law enforcement agents who are likely to come into contact with such cases.^{39 40}
- to ensure that training on the challenges raised by child self-generated sexual images and/or videos and ICT facilitated coercion or extortion of children is available to judges. 41 42
- to offer joint (or "joined-up") training for professionals, and particularly law enforcement, prosecutors and judges, involved in legal proceedings involving ICT facilitated child sexual exploitation and sexual abuse, in order to ensure consistency at all stages. 43
- to ensure that training on ICT facilitated sexual offences against children for law-enforcement, prosecutors and judges contains a practical element, involving simulated or real cases.⁴⁴

On measures to ensure the effective investigation and prosecution of offenders:

• The Committee **requires** all Parties to ensure that investigations and criminal

³² Para.198.

³¹ Para.197.

³³ Recommendation III-3 and III-7.

³⁴ Recommendation III-4.

³⁵ Recommendation III-5.

³⁶ Recommendation III-9.

³⁷ Recommendation III-10. ³⁸ Recommendation III-11.

³⁹ Such trainings can also be part of broader training programmes.

⁴⁰ Recommendations III-14.

 $^{^{\}rm 41}\,{\rm Such}$ trainings can also be part of broader training programmes.

⁴² Recommendation III-19.

⁴³ Recommendation III-20.

⁴⁴ Recommendation III-21.

proceedings in ICT facilitated sexual offences against children are treated as priority and carried out without any unjustified delay.⁴⁵

It also invites all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to ensure that measures, services and technology available to those in charge of identifying child victims of ICT facilitated sexual offences are up to date, reflect current practices across Parties, including establishing and using national child abuse material databases, and that resources are sufficiently allocated.⁴⁶
- to engage in and strengthen inter-Party cooperation for the purpose of identifying child victims and perpetrators of ICT facilitated sexual offences, including, where appropriate, by providing access to each other's databases or shared databases,

including those containing information on such perpetrators.⁴⁷

- to take the necessary legislative or other measures to ensure that preservation of specified stored computer data in connection with a specific criminal investigation or proceedings is made possible, fully upholding the rights of the parties involved.⁴⁸
- to take the necessary legislative or other measures to ensure that the investment in human, financial and physical resources is sufficient to have data generated by ICTs analysed in a timely manner so that investigations are carried out without any unjustified delay.⁴⁹

⁴⁵ Recommendation III-30.

⁴⁶ Recommendation III-24.

⁴⁷ Recommendation III-25, III-29.

⁴⁸ Recommendation III-31.

⁴⁹ Recommendation III-32.

IV. Jurisdiction rules

Due to their online component, offences related to conducts involving CSGSIV have an inherently international aspect. As the prosecution of offences related to this material may involve more than one jurisdiction, the report analyses the jurisdictional rules in place in the Parties, enabling the determination of which Party may prosecute a particular case and under what conditions.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on jurisdiction rules specific to Bulgaria

Jurisdiction in cases of child sexual exploitation and abuse facilitated by ICTs committed on the territory of a Party: the territoriality principle (Article 25(1) (a-c))

The Committee notes that Bulgaria has established laws clarifying the circumstances in which its national criminal law will apply to a transnational situation following the territoriality principle. Accordingly, Articles 3 to 6 of the Criminal Code provide, inter alia, that the criminal legislation applies to Bulgarian citizens who have committed crimes abroad, and to foreigners who have committed a crime of a general nature abroad which affects the interests of the Republic of Bulgaria or of a Bulgarian citizen. ⁵⁰

• The Committee **requests** Bulgaria to take the necessary legislative or other measures to establish jurisdiction over transnational cases of child sexual exploitation and abuse facilitated by ICTs, when one of the constituent elements of the offence has taken place in their territory.⁵¹

<u>Jurisdiction based on nationality and residency</u> (Article 25(1)(d), (e))

The Committee notes that almost all Parties, including Bulgaria, have jurisdiction in cases where the offence covered by the Convention is committed by one of their nationals, even if the offence occurs abroad.⁵² It also observes that Bulgaria has jurisdiction over offences committed by persons who have their habitual residence in its territory.

Jurisdiction not subordinated to the condition that prosecution can only be initiated following a report from the victim or denunciation from the State where the offence was committed

Bulgaria did not provide information as to whether it subordinates its jurisdiction to the condition that prosecution can only be initiated following a report from the victim or denunciation from the State where the offence was committed.

Therefore, the Committee requires Bulgaria to remove the requirement that prosecution can only be initiated following a report from the victim or a denunciation from the State of the place where the offence was committed for offences of sexual abuse (Article 18), offences concerning prostitution (Article 19), the production of "child pornography" (Article 20(1)(a)) and offences concerning the participation of a child in pornographic performances (Article 21), when committed by one of their nationals or by a person who has his or her habitual residence in its territory.53

Jurisdiction not subordinated to the condition that the acts are criminalised at the place where they were performed: the dual criminality principle (Article 25(4))

For offences committed abroad by one of their nationals, Article 25(4) of the Convention additionally provides that Parties should take the necessary legislative or other measures to ensure that its jurisdiction is not subordinate to the condition that the acts are criminalised at the place where they were performed, i.e. subject to the dual criminality principle. This concerns the following offences: sexual abuse (Articles 18), offences concerning child prostitution (Article 19), the production of child pornography (Article 20(1)(a)), and offences concerning the participation of a child

⁽Article 25(6))

⁵⁰ Para.214.

⁵¹ Recommendation IV-1.

⁵² Para.215.

⁵³ Recommendation IV-5.

in pornographic performances (Article 21(1)(a) and (b)).⁵⁴ The Committee notes that the criminal law of Bulgaria has a clause which provides for the possibility of derogating from the general rules on jurisdiction based on international instruments. However, it is unclear which provisions of the Criminal Code can be adapted or excluded, and whether this allows full compliance with Article 25(1)(d), (e) and 25(4) of the Convention.⁵⁵

• The Committee **requires** Bulgaria to remove the requirement for dual criminality for offences of sexual abuse (Article 18), offences concerning child prostitution (Article 19), the production of child pornography (Article 20(1)(a)) and offences concerning the participation of a child in pornographic performances (Article 21), when committed by one of their nationals.⁵⁶

Jurisdiction in cases of child sexual exploitation and abuse facilitated by ICTs committed against nationals or habitual residents of a Party: the passive personality principle (Art. 25(2))

The Committee notes that in Bulgaria, the passive personality principle is applied in respect of offences committed against a national, only for certain offences punishable by imprisonment of at least 6 years, e.g. sexual offences and incest.⁵⁷

• The Committee **requests** Parties that are not already doing so, including Bulgaria to endeavour necessary legislative or other measures to establish jurisdiction over any offence established in accordance with the Lanzarote Convention where the offence is committed against one of its nationals or a person who has his or her habitual residence in their territory.⁵⁸

Generic recommendations of the Committee on jurisdiction rules

- The Committee **invites** all Parties to remove the requirement for dual criminality when committed by one of their nationals, for offences of:
- possessing, offering, distributing,
- transmitting, procuring child pornography, and the fact of knowingly gaining access to child pornography through ICTs, when CSGSIV are involved,⁵⁹
- solicitation of children for sexual purposes.⁶⁰

⁵⁴ Para.2019.

⁵⁵ Para.227.

⁵⁶ Recommendation IV-6.

⁵⁷ Para.231.

⁵⁸ Recommendation IV-9.

⁵⁹ Recommendation IV-7.

⁶⁰ Recommendation IV-8.

V. International cooperation

The implementation report also analyses cooperation practices and examples of coordinated international responses, not only in the fight against sexual exploitation and abuse of children, but also in areas related to the prevention, protection and assistance of child victims and persons related to them.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on international cooperation specific to Bulgaria

The Committee recalls that, in accordance with Article 41(3)(a) of the Convention, because an important amount of time has passed since the great majority of the ratifications to the Convention, and since national legislation of the Parties concerned evolved since then, it seems appropriate to evaluate the effects of those Parties' reservations with a significant impact on CSGSIV. In particular, the concerned Parties, including Bulgaria, should evaluate the necessity for maintaining reservations made:

- in accordance with Article 20(4) of the Convention, activating the right not to apply, in whole or in part, Article 20(1)(f) of the Convention which implies the criminalisation of knowingly obtaining access, though ICTs, to child pornography, when committed without right;
- in accordance with Article 21(2) of the Convention, activating the right to limit the application of its Article 21(1)(c) to cases where children have been recruited or coerced, in conformity with paragraph 1.a or b.

The Committee therefore invites Bulgaria:

- to withdraw the reservation it made in accordance with Article 20(4) of the Convention, activating the right not to apply, in whole or in part Article 20(1)(f) of the Convention.⁶¹
- to withdraw the reservation it made in accordance with Article 21(2) of the Convention, activating the right to limit the

application of Article 21(1)(c) of the Convention.⁶²

The Committee also notes that INHOPE,63 PROMISE Barnahus Network⁶⁴, WeProtect Global Alliance,⁶⁵ INSAFE and Safer Internet Centres⁶⁶, ECPAT⁶⁷, and EMPACT (European Multidisciplinary Platform Against Criminal Threats) cybercrime CSE/CSA⁶⁸ cooperation projects to prevent and combat sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children in Bulgaria. 69 The Committee further notes that Bulgaria, among other Parties, trainings benefits from for forensic interviewers in the framework of the PROMISE Barnahus Network, the latter having formed an informal network, and is engaged in an exchange and common learning through online training and Avatar practice.70

In addition, law enforcement representatives from Bulgaria attend the Europol's annual training course "Combating the Sexual Exploitation of Children on the Internet" (COSEC), as well as the Europol-Interpol-Cepol co-organised training course on victim identification (VID training course).⁷¹

Finally, Bulgaria mentioned that it cooperates with Interpol regarding the blocking of illegal content through the use of the worst-of list from this institution.⁷²

⁶¹ Recommendation V-1.

⁶² Recommendation V-2.

⁶³ www.inhope.org/

⁶⁴ https://www.barnahus.eu/en/

⁶⁵ https://www.weprotect.org/

⁶⁶ https://www.betterinternetforkids.eu/

⁶⁷ https://ecpat.org/

⁶⁸ https://www.europol.europa.eu/empact

⁶⁹ Para.255.

⁷⁰ Para.266.

⁷¹ Para.259.

⁷² Para.265.

Generic recommendations of the Committee on international cooperation

• On international cooperation, the Committee **requests** all Parties, including Bulgaria to extend their international cooperation with other Parties to improve the effective implementation of the Lanzarote Convention.⁷³

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to assess, strengthen and develop international cooperation with other Parties to prevent and combat sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children and to provide assistance to victims in matters related to CSGSIV.⁷⁴
- to expand international cooperation with countries which are not Parties to the Convention to disseminate the standards of the Convention, including for the purpose of preventing and combating sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, for the purpose of protecting and providing assistance to victims and concerning the offences established in accordance with the Convention, in matters related to CSGSIV.75
- to regularly assess the difficulties that they face when dealing with international cooperation and remedy them.⁷⁶
- to strengthen cooperation with relevant intergovernmental bodies and with transnational networks and other international organisations and initiatives due to their capacity to mobilisation, their worldwide scope, and their flexibility to work, for the purpose of preventing and combating sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of

children as well as for protecting and providing assistance to victims, in matters related to CSGSIV.⁷⁷

- to consider requesting the establishment of cooperation projects managed by the Council of Europe to assist them in their efforts to preventing and combating sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children in matters related to CSGSIV.⁷⁸
- to support regional and international capacity building efforts to improve policy and operational measures including the pooling and sharing of successful education and awareness-raising tools for the purpose of preventing and combating sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children in matters related to CSGSIV.⁷⁹
- to maintain and develop efforts to strengthen international cooperation with other Parties and non-Parties to the Convention, in investigation and proceedings concerning the offences established in accordance with the Lanzarote Convention, in particular in the area of police cooperation, namely ensuring that their law-enforcement agencies can connect and contribute to the Europol and Interpol databases, and develop the areas of data, training, vetting, and selection, in matters related to CSGSIV.⁸⁰
- to integrate, where appropriate, prevention and the fight against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children in matters related to CSGSIV, in assistance programmes for development provided for the benefit of third States.⁸¹

Promising practice:

Romania reported European projects with Bulgaria, Italy and Spain for the development of good practice manuals.

⁷³ Recommendation V-3

⁷⁴ Recommendations V-6, V-11.

⁷⁵ Recommendations V-4, V-7, V-12, V-15.

⁷⁶ Recommendation V-5.

⁷⁷ Recommendation V-8, V-13.

⁷⁸ Recommendation V-9.

⁷⁹ Recommendation V-10.

⁸⁰ Recommendations V-14, V-16.

⁸¹ Recommendation V-19.

VI. Assistance to victims

This chapter provides a comparative study of national mechanisms and measures for assisting child victims of sexual exploitation and abuse, particularly where this results from the CSGSIV.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on assistance to victims specific to Bulgaria

The Committee observes that there are helplines for children that are accessible 24 hours a day, 7 days a week in Bulgaria. ⁸² It also notes that helplines in Bulgaria are run in collaboration between different bodies, including ministries and NGOs, which can be very effective for victims who benefit from this synergy and broader services. ⁸³

The Committee further notes that Bulgaria has legislation containing adequate provisions to assist child victims, although they concern the protection of children in general,⁸⁴ as well as a coordination mechanism which was

established in 2010 to support and accompany child victims of trafficking upon their return, using a multidisciplinary approach.⁸⁵

• The Committee however **requires** Bulgaria to take the necessary legislative or other measures to assist child victims of sexual exploitation and abuse, in the short and long term, in their physical and psycho-social recovery, these measures must take due account of the child's views, needs and concerns.⁸⁶

Generic recommendations of the Committee on assistance to victims

The Committee also **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

• to promote awareness raising or specialised training for professionals who advise children through telephone or internet helplines on ICT facilitated sexual exploitation and abuse of children – including the risks associated with CSGSIV – and how to provide appropriate support to victims and to those

who wish to help them.87

• to assist child victims of sexual exploitation and abuse facilitated by ICTs, including of offences due to the production, possession, distribution or transmission of CSGSIV in the short and long term, in their physical and psycho-social recovery, these measures must take due account of the child's views, needs and concerns.⁸⁸

Example of a promising practice

In Bulgaria, the priority of the Hotline and the Consultative Line for safe Internet is to stop the dissemination of images of child sexual abuse (child pornography) and to combat other forms of sexual abuse of children on the Internet, as well as to remove or restrict Internet content that is inappropriate or harmful to children. Any adult or minor who wants to report online content or behaviour that is illegal under Bulgarian law or may have a traumatic or harmful effect on minors can easily report it to www.safenet.bg. The anonymity of the reporters is guaranteed. In addition, the Bulgarian Safer Internet Centre operates a Hotline receiving and acting upon reports of online child sexual exploitation and abuse material, sexual grooming, cyberbullying and non-illegal but harmful for children online content in close cooperation with national LEA and Interpol. The helpline is addressed to children, young people, parents, teachers and other professionals, and organises awareness-raising events

⁸² Para.280.

⁸³ Para.277.

⁸⁴ Para.288.

⁸⁵ Para.292.

⁸⁶ Recommendation VI-3.

⁸⁷ Recommendation VI-2.

⁸⁸ Recommendation VI-4.

aiming at making Internet a safer place for children. The Centre has also developed in cooperation with national authorities, the "Rules to be safe online". The objective is to guarantee the right of the child to access appropriate information and materials online, to synthesise in one place the information on the dangers on the Internet, to provide specific guidelines for child protection and safe behaviour on the computer networks of schools, and to improve the coordination and responsibilities of all stakeholders.

VII. Civil society involvement and cooperation

Civil society's involvement in protecting children against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse is crucial and acknowledged by the Convention. Projects and programmes carried out by civil society, as well as cooperation between the competent state authorities and civil society, cover a wide range of issues.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on civil society involvement and cooperation specific to Bulgaria

The Committee observes that Bulgaria cooperates with NGOs, the media, and family planning centres.89 Its support for the development of prevention activities by civil society takes the form of financial support and grants, 90 training opportunities for civil society actors on the online environment,⁹¹ cooperation working groups, as well as the organisation of seminars.92 The Committee further notes that Bulgaria is among the Parties that develop and support different activities which are aimed at raising the awareness of not only children but also adults such as parents, educators, doctors and social workers about existing risks and dangers of ICTs for children.93

With regard to civil society involvement in prevention activities, Bulgaria provided information on general prevention projects and programmes on violence against children, as well as activities aimed at minimising the risk of abuse that children face online.⁹⁴ However, the Party used related terms to describe these projects, without mentioning the challenges raised by CSGSIV specifically, which leaves doubt as to the actual content of such projects.⁹⁵

• Therefore, the Committee **invites** Bulgaria to support civil society in carrying out projects and programmes that include the issue of CSGSIV.⁹⁶

With regard to civil society involvement in victim assistance programmes, the Committee welcomes the fact that Bulgaria is among a minority of Partis where programmes are in place to assist victims of violence taking place in the digital environment,⁹⁷ and in particular related to CSGSIV offences.⁹⁸

Generic recommendations of the Committee on civil society involvement and cooperation

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to expand cooperation with civil society to better prevent sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, including when facilitated by ICTs and the challenges raised by the exploitation of CSGSIV.⁹⁹
- to ensure that the forms of cooperation that take place with civil society in the field of prevention and protection of children against sexual exploitation and abuse

are of a sustainable nature. 100

• to encourage the participation of children, according to their evolving capacity, in the development and implementation of state policies, programmes or other initiatives¹⁰¹ and to seek children's views at the stage of drafting new legislation concerning the fight against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, including when facilitated by ICTs and as regards CSGSIV.¹⁰²

⁸⁹ Para.308.

⁹⁰ Para.310.

⁹¹ Para.311.

⁹² Para.312.

⁹³ Para.315.

⁹⁴ Para.320.

⁹⁵ Para.322.

⁹⁶ Recommendation VII-5.

⁹⁷ Para.328.

⁹⁸ Para.327.

⁹⁹ Recommendation VII-3.

¹⁰⁰ Recommendation VII-4.

¹⁰¹ Parties are also invited to provide example(s) of how children's views are taken into account in the context of the participation of children.

¹⁰² Recommendations VII-6, VII-7.

Examples of promising practices

Bulgaria has launched a guidebook "The other dictionary of Internet" explaining the main online risks for adolescents, including provocative selfies, sexting, sextortion and revenge porn; developed interactive games on the topic of child safety online; and made available an interactive Internet safety knowledge test.

VIII. Promoting awareness of the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves

The Articles 5, 6 and 8 of the Convention establish that States Parties should take the necessary measures to prevent all forms of child sexual exploitation and abuse and to protect children from their effects. Awareness-raising is one type of preventive measure.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on promoting awareness of the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves specific to Bulgaria

The Committee notes that in Bulgaria, a public debate "For and against uploading sexy selfies" gathered in 2016 over 30 young people at the IT Step Academy Bulgaria in Sofia. The aim of the debate was to try to oppose views on the widespread phenomenon of uploading provocative photos on the Internet, thus discussing in more depth the consequences of such online behaviour.¹⁰³

It also notes a variety of awareness-raising tools and materials dealing with the general aspect of online safety and staying safe on social media in Bulgaria:¹⁰⁴

- The State Agency for Child Protection (SACP) has prepared a handbook with rules and useful advice for children to surf the internet safely. 105 It includes a glossary with information on uploading and sharing photos, as well as information on cyberbullying. The handbook also includes useful contacts such as the Cybercrime Department of the General Directorate for Combating Organised Crime, the Safer Internet Centre and the 116 111 national children's helpline.
- SCAP developed in October 2020 online safety rules. 106 107 The aim is, among others, to carry out prevention and synthesise information on the dangers of the Internet in

one place and to provide kindergartens and schools with specific guidelines for the protection of children on social networks and the Internet.

- On the occasion of the 2019 Edition of the Safer Internet Day, the SACP organised discussions in kindergartens and schools about the rules developed for a safe Internet. This was an opportunity to present the mobile application of the SACP competition "Safety in the digital environment and in the real world". These competitions provided an opportunity to develop mobile applications to protect children's rights on the Internet and prevent online risks, based on a child participation process. The discussion included the dangers of selfies, fake profiles, and how to protect children from cyberbullying.
- UNICEF Bulgaria and partners developed Guidelines for online safety for children during COVID-19, where materials and resources are regularly uploaded, including advice for children themselves and their parents. ¹⁰⁸

The Committee finally observes that In Bulgaria, the Ministry of Transport, Information Technology and Communications (MTITC) is leading and co-ordinating the national Digital

%D0%B1%D0%B5%D0%B7%D0%BE%D0%BF%D0%B0%D

https://www.unicef.org/bulgaria/media/7181/file

¹⁰³ Para.345.

¹⁰⁴ Para.349.

https://sacp.government.bg/sites/default/files/news/novina-1735.pdf (in Bulgarian)

https://sacp.government.bg/%D0%B7%D0%B0-

[%]D0%B4%D0%B5%D1%86%D0%B0/%D0%BF%D1%80% D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%B8%D0%BB%D0%B0-

[%]D0%B7%D0%B0-%D0%B4%D0%B0-%D1%81%D0%B8-%D0%B2-

^{1%81%}D0%BD%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%82 (in Bulgarian)

¹⁰⁷ The rules have been developed in association with the General Directorate for Combating Organised Crime, the Safer Internet Centre, the Ministry of Education and Science, the Sofia Regional Department of Education, heads of educational institutions in the Bulgarian Union of State Education Employers, and the Secondary School Leaders Association of the Republic of Bulgaria.

¹⁰⁸ The Guidelines can be found at:

Bulgaria 2025 programme, ¹⁰⁹ together with the roadmap adopted by the Council of Ministers on 5 December 2019. The programme lays down priority action areas, objectives, measures and activities for the growth and

widespread use of information and communication technologies. It is being implemented by various institutions in the sectoral policies that they have undertaken to carry out.¹¹⁰

Generic recommendations of the Committee on promoting awareness of the risk of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to ensure that explanations of the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves, with or without coercion, are included in the awareness-raising campaigns that they promote or conduct, whatever the target audience.¹¹¹
- to ensure that awareness-raising for children about the risks that they face when generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves takes place early enough, before they reach their teens, and that it is "adapted to their evolving capacity" or, in other words, their age and degree of maturity. 112
- to use unchanged, wherever possible, the awareness-raising tools, materials and activities mentioned in this report or else to adapt them to their national contexts and their own languages and, if necessary, develop new ones, concentrating on videos and distribution through social media. 113
- to have available awareness-raising

tools, materials, and activities suitable for children with disabilities.¹¹⁴

- to promote themselves and to encourage the information and communication of the technology sector, the media, and other professionals to raise awareness among children, their parents, persons having regular contact with children, and the general public about the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves and about the preventive measures that can be taken. 115
- to step up awareness-raising for parents and persons with parental authority about the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves and about the preventive measures that can be taken. 116
- to take the necessary measures to ensure co-ordination between the agencies responsible for raising awareness of the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse faced by children generating and/or sharing sexual images and/or videos of themselves.¹¹⁷

Example of a promising practice

The Committee highlights a promising practice in Bulgaria related to the peer-to-peer awareness raising method. Indeed, the Children's Council, set up as a government body, seeks to encourage children to become involved in discussing and implementing policies that are of direct relevance to them, including online risks for children in their age group. Similarly, the competition on children's safety in the digital environment organised by the State Agency for Child Protection (SACP) was intended to identify ideas on this subject by and for children in order to anticipate the risks associated

¹¹¹ Recommendation VIII-1.

¹⁰⁹ www.mtitc.government.bg/en/category/85

¹¹⁰ Para.378.

¹¹² Recommendation VIII-2.

¹¹³ Recommendation VIII-3.

¹¹⁴ Recommendation VIII-4.

¹¹⁵ Recommendations VIII-6.

¹¹⁶ Recommendation VIII-7.

¹¹⁷ Recommendation VIII-9.

with being online (and on social media). In addition, local Commissions for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings have been established, as well as a network of young volunteers engaged in the implementation and support of prevention activities among their peers. The network's main focus in 2019 was on the safe use of the Internet in the context of the risk of human trafficking. 118

¹¹⁸ Para.361.

IX. Education for children

While the protection of child victims and the prosecution of offenders are key elements in the fight against the sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, preventing them from occurring in the first place is paramount. Informing children about the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse and how to protect themselves is the cornerstone of prevention.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on education for children specific to Bulgaria

The Committee identifies a difficulty in implementing the Convention in Bulgaria, where it is not clear whether all children benefit from the information on sexual exploitation and sexual abuse and risks related to the self-generation by children of sexual images and/or videos. Indeed, in Bulgaria, information on CSGSIV is not part of the mandatory national curriculum, and the preventive activities on this topic differ from one local authority to another. As such, children living in different regions or cities may not receive the information. The Committee notes that municipalities organise different activities on different subjects related to the safety of children on the Internet, some of these focusing on the abuse of children on the internet, or "child pornography on the internet". Two Child Police Academies organised joint events and lectures focused on "Crime on the Internet" in the city of Vidin, and lectures were delivered to children from 1 to 11 grades on the topic "Safe internet behaviour" in the city of Rousse. 119

The Committee further notes that in Bulgaria, information on CSGSIV is provided to children in the educational context at different levels of education, depending on the regions. ¹²⁰

• Therefore, the Committee **requires** Bulgaria to ensure that all children at primary and secondary education level receive information about the risks of child sexual exploitation and sexual abuse facilitated by ICTs. Organising lectures and/or activities on this topic should not be left to the discretion of schools or teachers.¹²¹

It also **invites** Bulgaria:

• to ensure that information on the risks of child sexual exploitation and sexual abuse facilitated by ICTs, including as regards child self-generated sexual images and/or videos, is provided to children during both primary and secondary education (whether as part of the national curricula or in the context of nonformal education for children at these levels). 122

¹¹⁹ Para.387.

¹²⁰ Para.393.

¹²¹ Recommendation IX-3.

¹²² Recommendation IX-2.

Generic recommendations of the Committee on education for children

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to consistently involve children in the development of internet safety awareness programmes.¹²³
- to ensure that there is a standing national internet safety resource, with an ongoing programme of activities.¹²⁴
- to provide information to children on child sexual exploitation and sexual abuse, facilitated by ICTs, including as regards child self-generated sexual images and/or videos, in their national curriculum or other non-formal educational contexts, in a form which is
- adapted to the evolving capacity of the children and therefore which is appropriate for their age and maturity. 125
- to provide information to children on the risks of child sexual exploitation and abuse facilitated by ICTs, including as regards CSGSIV, within a more general context of sexuality education.¹²⁶
- to ensure that parents, caregivers, and educators are involved, where appropriate, in the provision of information to children on the risks of child sexual exploitation and sexual abuse facilitated by ICTs, in particular as regards CSGSIV.¹²⁷

¹²³ Recommendation IX-4.

¹²⁴ Recommendation IX-5.

¹²⁵ Recommendation IX-6.

¹²⁶ Recommendation IX-7.

¹²⁷ Recommendation IX-8.

X. Higher education curriculum and continuous training

Persons who have regular contact with children in the education, health and social protection sectors and areas related to sport, culture and leisure are at the forefront of the prevention of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, as they have the most interaction with children under their supervision in these different settings. However, they may not be adequately equipped to inform children about their rights, to detect situations where a child is at risk of sexual exploitation or sexual abuse and to respond appropriately. It is therefore of crucial importance that they are well informed about the risks of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, both during their education and continuously during their careers, to enable them to adapt to emerging trends and risks in the fight against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, including when facilitated by ICTs.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on higher education curriculum and continuous training specific to Bulgaria

The Committee observes that a part of the professionals who will or already work with children receive education on the protection of children against sexual exploitation and sexual abuse in Bulgaria. 128

However, the Committee requires Bulgaria:

- to ensure that teaching or training on the rights of children and their protection for persons who have regular contacts with children (i.e. in the education, health and social protection sectors and in areas relating to sport, culture and leisure activities) is not optional.¹²⁹
- to ensure that the persons who have regular contacts with children are equipped to identify any situation of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children and are informed of the possibility for them to report to the services responsible for child protection any situation where they have "reasonable grounds" for believing that a child is a victim of

sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children:

- in the education sector
- in the health sector
- in the social protection sector
- in areas relating to sport, culture and leisure activities. 130

regard to professionals' With general knowledge of the protection of the rights of the child, the Committee welcomes the fact that in Bulgaria, some persons working in contact with children receive awareness of the protection and rights of children, in different frameworks and on different topics. 131 It identifies as a promising practice the fact that the State Agency for Child Protection conducts meetings on the introduction of media and online literacy as a university subject for teachers and students of education-related subjects. This subject is already taught at the University of Sofia, preparing them to convey this knowledge to children in schools.

¹²⁸ Para.275.

¹²⁹ Recommendation X-4.

¹³⁰ Recommendations X-5 and X-6.

¹³¹ Para.432.

Generic recommendations of the Committee on higher education curriculum and continuous training

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to ensure that the persons who have regular contacts with children (i.e. in the education, health and social protection, sectors and in areas relating to sport, culture and leisure activities), have an adequate knowledge of the risks associated with CSGSIV, for example through education or continuous training.¹³²
- to ensure that all the sectors where professionals work in contact with children, including when working on a voluntary basis, have an adequate knowledge of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, including when facilitated by ICTs and with specific reference to the risks associated with CSGSIV, for example through education or continuous training. 133

¹³³ Recommendation X-3.

¹³² Recommendation X-2.

XI. Research

Effective prevention mechanisms and responses to tackle sexual exploitation and abuse of children require an understanding of the issues at stake, as well as knowledge of the prevalence and characteristics of the phenomenon. Accurate and precise information may be necessary to develop quality and targeted policies and measures. The gathering of information and understanding of the phenomenon is particularly important in the context of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse facilitated by ICTs, in light of their rapid development and increased use.

Observations and recommendations of the Committee on research specific to Bulgaria

The Committee notes that Bulgaria provided information on research undertaken on the sexual exploitation and abuse of children online, aggression, cyberbullying, and adolescent's attitudes to healthy behaviours. 134

Bulgaria also informed of its participation for at least one year in the EU Kids Online surveys, which collect data and information on, inter alia, children's practice of sending and receiving sexual messages online.¹³⁵

However, the absence of specific reference to CSGSIV makes it unclear whether research undertaken in Bulgaria specifically addresses this issue, other than in the context of the EU Kids Online research project.¹³⁶

• Therefore, the Committee **invites** Bulgaria to collect data and undertake research at the national and local level, for the purpose of observing and evaluating the phenomenon of CSGSIV.¹³⁷

Generic recommendations of the Committee on research

The Committee **invites** all Parties, including Bulgaria:

- to ensure that data on the phenomenon of CSGSIV and the risks associated with it is regularly collected and research on the issue is regularly undertaken.¹³⁸
- to build on the findings from existing research on CSGSIV, when available, to ensure that policies and measures are best developed and appropriately targeted to tackle the issues

raised by CSGSIV.139

• to take the necessary legislative or other measures to set up or designate mechanisms for data collection or focal points at the national or local levels and in collaboration with civil society to observe and evaluate the phenomenon of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse of children, including on the issues arising from CSGSIV, with due respect for the requirements of personal data protection. 140

¹³⁴ Para.439.

¹³⁵ Para.440.

¹³⁶ Para.444.

¹³⁷ Recommendation XI-1.

¹³⁸ Recommendation XI-2.

¹³⁹ Recommendation XI-3.

¹⁴⁰ Recommendation XI-4.