

## Management Response and Action Plan

<b>Name of Evaluation Report:</b>	<b>External Evaluation of the Council of Europe Project: Protection of Human Rights in Biomedicine-PMM 3383</b>		
<b>Date of Evaluation Report:</b>	<b>5 November 2024</b>	<b>Date of Action Plan:</b>	<b>20 November 2024</b>

### Overall management response to the evaluation:

Overall, the recommendations of the External Evaluation have been received positively. The report provides clear suggestions for follow-up which have already been addressed in the preparation of the new project proposal and/or can be integrated in the upcoming implementation cycle. There are, however, also constraints to be acknowledged, such as resource limitations both for human and financial resources, but also the evolving national context in Armenia, and the continuous commitments of counterparts which will be needed to successfully implement on all recommendations.

**[FOR DECENTRALISED EVALUATIONS] Dissemination plan for the evaluation:** please briefly explain how the report will be shared (internally, other CoE entities, donors, beneficiaries etc.), methods (email, events, website etc.), resources, timeframe and person responsible.

The Evaluation Report will be distributed within the Council of Europe Human Rights and Biomedicine Division as well as responsible entities in Strasbourg and will be shared with beneficiaries in Armenia (members of the Steering Committee) through email once internal procedures at the CoE is completed and the report is available on the DIO site.

Additionally, the report will be made publicly accessible on the project webpage, and a presentation of its findings will be conducted during the first steering committee meeting for the new project "Protection of Human Rights in Biomedicine" which builds on this completed and evaluated project.

Management Decision <sup>1</sup>	Entity in Charge	Planned Actions <sup>2</sup> (determined by Entity)	Justification <sup>3</sup> for Non-Acceptance	Target Date for Action	Person Responsible for Action
<b>Recommendation 1:</b>					
<b>The CoE should consider how to support Armenia in its move from signature to ratification of the Oviedo Convention. This could include continued support for legislators and policymakers to help build the political case for ratification and continued expert support for the drafting of legislative revisions.</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoE Office in Yerevan	Technical expertise and expert opinions will be provided during the whole process of the ratification of the Oviedo Convention, including recommendations for draft legislation to align the national legal framework with the European standards enshrined by the Convention.	-	Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<b>Recommendation 2:</b>					
<b>The CoE should consider how best to support national authorities to move towards repeal of the fourth child provision.</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	The recommendations based on the European best practices will be provided to national authorities for possible changes of the provision.	-	Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff

<sup>1</sup> The management decision is in relation to the Recommendation (Accepted, Partially accepted, Rejected).

<sup>2</sup> For implementing accepted recommendations.

<sup>3</sup> For recommendations that are partially accepted or rejected.

Management Decision <sup>1</sup>	Entity in Charge	Planned Actions <sup>2</sup> (determined by Entity)	Justification <sup>3</sup> for Non-Acceptance	Target Date for Action	Person Responsible for Action
<b>Recommendation 3:</b> <b>The CoE should encourage national authorities to consider if/what further legislative revisions are required to fully address all provisions of the Oviedo Convention. This should take into account any recommendations from the legal analysis that have not yet been addressed.</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The report on the analysis of national legislation vis a vis Oviedo Convention is provided to the national authorities with recommendations on further improvements.</li> <li>- High-level, expert discussions, workshops will be continuously organised with national authorities to discuss the further harmonisations of the legislation.</li> </ul>	-	Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<b>Recommendation 4:</b> <b>It is recommended to undertake further research into the alignment of national legislation with broader human rights standards in biomedicine, i.e. going beyond the specific provisions of the Convention.</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	In fact, the recommendations 3 and 4 are the same. In this context, the Project will support national authorities to develop a detailed roadmap on the further alignment of national legal framework with the provisions of the Oviedo Convention once a Convention ratified.	-	Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<b>Recommendation 5:</b>					

Management Decision <sup>1</sup>	Entity in Charge	Planned Actions <sup>2</sup> (determined by Entity)	Justification <sup>3</sup> for Non-Acceptance	Target Date for Action	Person Responsible for Action
<p><b>It is recommended to undertake further research into extent to which medical practice is compliant with the Convention in practice. This would best be undertaken once the necessary legislative revisions have been made and would identify any additional steps necessary to raise standards.</b></p>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	Project will further support the effective functioning of the Ethics Committee for healthcare professionals to review the provision of medical practice in line with the European human rights and ethical framework enshrined by the Oviedo Convention.	-	Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<p><b>Recommendation 6:</b></p> <p><b>The CoE should encourage national authorities to consider providing administrative and financial resource to the Ethics Committee. This would address the high an increasing workload (currently fulfilled on a voluntary basis) and the need to build trust amongst professionals and the public. Support could consist of a budget for support staff and administrative costs and payment of members. However, care should be taken to ensure that the payment of members does not affect perceptions of their independence.</b></p>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	Once political decision is made to change legal and regulative framework of the functioning of the Ethics Committee for healthcare professionals, the Project is ready to provide recommendations on the best practices of the Ethics Committees considering the recommendations of the evaluation.	-	Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff.
<p><b>Recommendation 7:</b></p>					

Management Decision <sup>1</sup>	Entity in Charge	Planned Actions <sup>2</sup> (determined by Entity)	Justification <sup>3</sup> for Non-Acceptance	Target Date for Action	Person Responsible for Action
<p><b>The CoE should encourage national authorities to consider how to promote the availability of the online HELP course beyond the life of the project and if/how to provide further tutored iterations of the course.</b></p>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	The Human Rights and Biomedicine Division with the HELP secretariat and the Project team has managed to have the core HELP course on Human Rights in Mental Health services is available. The tutored roll-outs will be conducted in the next phase of the Project starting from January 2025.		Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<p><b>Recommendation 8:</b></p> <p><b>The CoE should encourage national authorities to consider if/how to provide relevant training or capacity-building for judicial authorities to support the enforcement of legislation related to the Oviedo Convention, as and when such legislation comes into force.</b></p>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	This is ongoing effort/activities of the Project. Specific training sessions for law-enforcement bodies will be considered in the next phase of the Project starting from January 2025.		Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<p><b>Recommendation 9:</b></p> <p><b>The CoE should encourage national authorities to consider how to support the integration of the principles of the Oviedo Convention and the relevant legislation into curricula of university degrees in medicine and/or law.</b></p>					

Management Decision <sup>1</sup>	Entity in Charge	Planned Actions <sup>2</sup> (determined by Entity)	Justification <sup>3</sup> for Non-Acceptance	Target Date for Action	Person Responsible for Action
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	This is also ongoing effort of the Project and will be continued to provide support to national authorities to integrate the principles of the Convention into curricula of university degrees by helping them to develop a specific modules and training programmes.		Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<b>Recommendation 10:</b> <b>The CoE should encourage national authorities to consider a public information campaign to raise awareness of the new obligations placed on medical professionals and the new rights available to patients resulting from legislative revisions. Such a campaign would be best timed to take place once all the relevant revisions come into force.</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	As raising awareness on the principles of the Oviedo Convention is one of the main directions of the activities of the Project, the activities with involvement of CSOs and media is planned for the next phase of the Project.		Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff
<b>Recommendation 11:</b> <b>The CoE should consider sharing the lessons from this project with other countries that may be interested in technical co-operation in the area of biomedicine and human rights.</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Partially accepted <input type="checkbox"/> Rejected	Human Rights and Biomedicine Division, DGI; CoeE Office in Yerevan	The implementation and outcomes of the Project will be presented and shared during CDBIO meetings with representatives from all member states. The materials produced as part of the Project emphasize European standards, are available in English, and can be used		Council of Europe Action Plan for Armenia 2023-2026; The period of the implementation of the next phase of the Project: 2025-2026	Meri Katvalyan; Laurence Lwoff

Management Decision <sup>1</sup>	Entity in Charge	Planned Actions <sup>2</sup> (determined by Entity)	Justification <sup>3</sup> for Non-Acceptance	Target Date for Action	Person Responsible for Action
		in other member states. A notable example of success is the newly developed HELP course on Human Rights in Mental Health Services for which launching in other countries is already foreseen.			