

2023/24 ENG

# Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe Certification cycle 2023-2024

Candidate route:

*AROMAS ITINERARIUM SALUTIS – The European Route  
of Historical Pharmacies and Medicinal Gardens*

Independent expert report

Cultural route  
of the Council of Europe  
Itinéraire culturel  
du Conseil de l'Europe





## **Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe Certification Cycle 2023-2024**

### **Independent Expert report**

# **Aromas Itinerarium Salutis - The European Route of Historical Pharmacies and Medicinal Gardens**

Author's information:  
Antonio Vizcaíno Estevan  
University of Valencia

*\*The opinions expressed in this independent expert report are those of the author, and do not engage the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe.*

## Contents

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 1. Executive Summary (1 page) .....   | 5  |
| 2. Introduction (1 page) .....  | 6  |
| 3. Main Body Evaluation (15-20 pages).....  | 7  |
| 3.1 Cultural Route Theme .....  | 7  |
| 3.2 Fields of Action.....   | 10 |
| 3.3 Cultural Route Network .....  | 16 |
| 3.4 Communication tools.....  | 22 |
| 4. Conclusions and recommendations (2-3 pages).....                                   | 24 |
| 5. List of references.....  | 28 |
| 6. Annex 1: Expert field visit and interviews with the network management and members | 29 |
| 7. Annex 2: Expert assessment checklist .....   | 32 |
| 8. Annex 3: List of acronyms, figures and tables .....                                | 39 |

## 1. Executive Summary

This report presents the results of the application for certification of Aromas Itinerarium Salutis - The European Route of Historical Pharmacies and Medicinal Gardens. The report has been carried out through: 1) the analysis of the documentation provided by the technical team in accordance with the parameters established by the EPA; 2) the organization of online interviews conducted with different members of the network (Spain, Italy, Portugal, Croatia and Romania); 3) a three-day field visit to Rome (Italy), in the context of the presentation of the 'Percorso dello Speciale', which integrates several significant destinations of the route.

Aromas is a proposal based on solid conceptual and structural approaches. The theme – Historical Pharmacies and Medicinal Gardens– is relevant not only because it is innovative character within the framework of the Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe programme, but also because it deals with a fragile heritage and memory that have suffered from disintegration and have often been left out of research, conservation and public dissemination. The route includes two main geographical and cultural contexts. On the one hand, the Spain-Portugal-Italy axis, which is common in the Programme and in project leadership; on the other hand, the Balkan area –Croatia, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Romania–, whose presence is not so common and then should be highlighted. In this sense, the project is making a commitment to decentralisation and rotation of responsibilities through an institutional and legal structure that seems more than adequate for its development.

One of the strongest points of the project is the definition and application of rigorous protocols in different areas (physical-chemical analysis, preventive conservation, cataloguing), which will undoubtedly allow the implementation of quality standards for the network.

From a financial point of view, the proposal is working solvently so far, and the technical team shows a clear capacity for planning and future perspectives, as it is applying to different modalities of European project calls and international foundation grants.

One of the main challenges facing the project is to expand the network of visitable destinations and country members. This initial limitation is understandable given the incipient nature of the route and the very nature of the heritage it addresses –fragmented heritage. However, the technical unit is working on expanding its membership both in the European context and other continents.

In short, Aromas Itinerarium Salutis is a well-conceived project, with many possibilities for development and, undoubtedly, relevant for the type of heritage it proposes to recover, study and disseminate.

### Expert summary conclusions

|   | Yes | No |
|---|-----|----|
| The theme complies with the eligibility criteria for themes listed in Resolution CM/Res(2013)67, <b>I. List of eligibility criteria for themes.</b> | X   |    |
| The Cultural Route complies with the criteria for actions listed in Resolution CM/Res(2013)67, <b>II. List of priority fields of action.</b>        | X   |    |
| The Cultural Route complies with the criteria for networks listed in Resolution CM/Res (2013)67, <b>III. List of criteria for networks.</b>         | X   |    |

## 2. Introduction

Aromas Itinerarium Salutis (AIS from now on) is a promising proposal that applies for the certification of the Council of Europe's Cultural Routes.

The project addresses a relevant theme: historical pharmacies and medicinal gardens, a topic that has not been addressed to date within the program's framework. This neglect, in fact, can be extended to a more general context, as the heritage linked to *materia medica* has not been given the consideration it deserves in the European context, and consequently, much of it has either dispersed or disappeared. Therefore, the proposal is very relevant as it aims to work with an extremely fragile heritage that urgently needs preservation.

What is interesting in this regard is that AIS proposes to approach this heritage and associated knowledge through a well-defined scientific, legal and financial assembly. Indeed, one of the most important aspects to highlight is that it starts from a very clear structure of work and management. To achieve this, the network relies particularly on a repertoire of protocols applicable to different areas: the conservation of fragile pharmaceutical heritage, its research and categorization, as well as its management and dissemination. These protocols stem from a consolidated trajectory of the professional teams involved in the project, and allow for the design of a coordinated action and adhere to shared standards among the different members of the network. However, certain areas, such as cultural and educational activities for youth, still require a boost.

Notably, AIS proposal is articulated based on several precedents of research projects and enhancement of heritage sites related to the theme. Building upon these previous experiences, the route project was formalized with the establishment of an association at the end of 2021 and was ratified in May 2022.

At the time of submitting the documentation, the project had 20 members of different nature (museums, universities, local authorities, cultural institutions, research centers, associations) from 7 countries, all of which are members of the Council of Europe: Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Italy, Portugal, Romania, Spain, and Switzerland. However, at the time of writing this report, the number of members and involved countries has increased, and it is expected to continue increasing in the coming months, both within the European framework and on other continents.

In general terms, AIS presents itself as a global route that connects significant spaces linked to the heritage and memory of *materia medica*, but at the same time, it is working to generate specific developments at the local-regional level. That is to say, they are designing different levels of itineraries with the purpose of offering visitors various options: from local to transnational routes.

All of this follows a coherent structure in conceptual and structural terms. In this sense, the project has an appropriate legal and institutional framework to adequately address the objectives set in the statutes: the General Assembly as the representative body of the members and benefactors; the Board of Directors as the governing body; the International Scientific Committee, responsible for ensuring scientific rigor and compliance with the association's principles and values; and the Technical Management Office, responsible for the administrative management of the association. The office is located at the University of Valencia in Valencia, Spain.

In summary, AIS has a solid structure, but it needs time to consolidate the network that is currently in process of development. As of today, the network needs to increase with more members and destinations, but, as mentioned above, the current proposal is promising.

### 3. Main Body Evaluation

#### 3.1 Cultural Route Theme

##### 3.1.1 Definition of the theme of the route

The proposal is clear in its thematic definition: its object of study is historical pharmacies and medicinal gardens, which are emblematic spaces of the European pharmaceutical tradition since the Middle Ages. However, as the technical unit rightly points out, the reality of *materia medica* —the concept that encompasses the heritage and memory associated with the tradition of pharmacopeia— extends beyond these spaces. Indeed, the subject is more complex, and therein lies its interest, as it combines different forms of heritage. That is to say, heritage is conceived from a transversal and integrative perspective.

On one hand, it grants evident prominence to cultural heritage, both immovable (pharmacies and gardens, whether religious —monasteries, convents— or secular —apothecaries) and movable (furniture, containers for products, work tools, production machinery, pharmacological books, registration books, etc.).

On the other hand, it appeals to natural heritage, as pharmacopeial products were largely made with natural ingredients (aromatic plants, spices, etc.), allowing for connections with natural spaces, from medicinal gardens and orchards cultivated in monasteries and convents, passing through scientifically-oriented botanical gardens, to mountainous areas close to production spaces.

Finally, the proposal also brings forth intangible heritage, particularly the knowledge associated with creating remedies to address all kinds of ailments and diseases, both in pre-industrial and industrial stages. This memory, perhaps the most fragile element of this delicate heritage, still remains alive in some places —while in other cases, it can be traced through books and documents— and it is urgent not to let it fade away.

Indeed, as mentioned in the introduction, *materia medica* heritage is particularly sensitive in all its manifestations. It should be noted that, in general terms, there hasn't been a clear interest in its recovery, especially when compared to other more recognized types of heritage. This has led to a significant portion of pharmaceutical heritage being dispersed or even destroyed, especially in the context of updating and modernizing the pharmaceutical industry; not to mention the associated loss of knowledge, i.e., intangible heritage. Additionally, conserving this heritage is complex in itself, as it comprises highly diverse materials that require different conservation conditions and criteria: wood for furniture; glass, ceramics, and metal for containers and work tools; paper for pharmacopeial books and administrative documentation; and especially the organic and inorganic remains of pharmacological products.

Indeed, there are not many places in Europe that fully preserve spaces and collections of this typology. Hence, AIS proposal is highly pertinent: because it aims to identify, recover, research, conserve, and disseminate what still exists. Thus, the network already includes museums, heritage spaces, and reference research centers in the European context, such as the Spezieria de Santa Maria della Scala in Rome, the Health and Pharmacy Museum in Lisbon, the Hispanic Pharmacy Museum in Madrid, the Pharmacy Museums in Sarajevo and Cluj-Napoca, or the Historical Library of Swiss Pharmacy in Bern.

On the other hand, although the project emerges with a European vision —notice that the subtitle accompanying the name is 'The European Route of Historical Pharmacies and Medicinal Gardens'— the chosen theme has universal projection since pharmaceutical traditions exist in every corner of the planet, albeit having developed different structures and processes. Thus, the proposal is flexible enough to incorporate other members and destinations beyond the European context. In fact, and this is something highlighted by the route's managers, this extra-European extension would imply a semantic reinforcement for the route. After all, the European tradition cannot be separated from territories such as the Asian

continent, North Africa, or America, not only because they were the main suppliers of spices and other essential resources for *materia medica*, but also due to the influence and exchange of knowledge with other well-rooted traditions, such as the Islamic one. Therefore, the project opens doors to territorial connections of great interest for a Council of Europe route project. As a matter of fact, negotiations are currently underway for China's incorporation into the route, which, on one hand, would reinforce the proposal's thematic sense but also, on the other hand, would impact the potential of these projects to articulate new cultural—but also diplomatic—relations with countries from other continents.

Finally, it is worth noting that the route's name might not be entirely elucidating, although it is suggestive: Aromas Itinerarium Salutis brings to the fore concepts that, being in Latin, are understandable in most European languages and are related to aroma, health, and, of course, the notion of an itinerary. Although these three concepts might not immediately convey the specific theme—contrary to the subtitle—the choice is not arbitrary: as explained by the project coordinators in one of the interviews, *materia medica* has diverse lexical traditions—such as the Italian 'spezierie', which lacks a literal translation in many languages; or terms such as pharmacies, apothecaries, drugstores, etc.—thus they opted to introduce more general and flexible concepts that would serve as an umbrella for this great diversity of semantic categories.

### 3.1.2 Historical and cultural context

As specified in the report, the project pays particular attention to pharmacies and medicinal gardens in Europe from the 15th century onwards. In other words, its temporal framework is primarily limited to the period from the end of the medieval era to the beginning of the 21st century. Nearly six centuries of history where continuities can be traced, but also ruptures and transformations.

The delimitation of this broad period seems scientifically coherent as it relates to two significant events of great importance for Europe's social, economic, political, cultural, and artistic history: the opening of new trade routes with the East and the conquest of America. Rather than isolated events, these were prolonged processes. However, their impact on *materia medica* was substantial, as they brought new knowledge, materials, and products. The association with recognizable historical events favors the route, making it easy to place it in chronological and cultural terms. At the same time, it is important to clarify that this isn't a route based solely on historical events, but on much more everyday and universal aspects such as care, health, or well-being.

However, the proposal is not closed to including other historical periods preceding the 15th century. In this regard, one of the destinations incorporated into the local route of the city of Rome is the Parco Colosseo, the archaeological site encompassing the Colosseum, the Imperial Forums, and the Palatine Hill. The reason for this inclusion is the identification in this area of the so-called *horrea pipetaria*, the spice warehouses of the forum. It is a space of great symbolic value as it articulates a tradition of trade and manipulation of spices since ancient times. It is not coincidental, in this sense, that the Nobile Collegio Chimico Farmaceutico, also part of the network, is located a few meters from this place. Similarly, there's a possibility of including Israel in the route as a historical connection point between the Mediterranean and Asia.

This relative temporal flexibility is opportune as it allows for a better understanding of the European tradition of *materia medica*. After all, this tradition cannot be comprehended without the substrate of Antiquity or the contributions from Islamic and Jewish traditions.

In summary, the route proposes a specific and coherent framework to frame the heritage and memory of its subject of study; but at the same time, it allows for some temporal incursions into more distant pasts to strengthen the historical narrative and incorporate new typologies of spaces and heritage elements.



### 3.1.3 Council of Europe values represented by the theme

The report provided by the technical unit highlights a clear vision regarding the framework of the Council of Europe's values, as well as conventions and agreements expressed by other international organizations. The text reveals an effort to connect these values with the conceptual foundations of the project and its medium to long-term objectives. These connections are directed towards three main areas.

The first relates to social and cultural rights, namely, the right to participation in culture and the defense, through culture, of different forms of exclusion —based on gender, race, age, social status, educational level, etc.— and how, through access to culture, one can contribute to building processes of empathy, peace, and security. These principles are applicable to virtually any project of this nature, and are more about the project's management than its specific theme. In other words, the project's theme itself doesn't address issues related to inequality, discrimination, conflict prevention, or reconciliation strictly, but there is a conceptual connection with great potential from a discursive standpoint. AIS focuses attention on a heritage that speaks to a fundamental aspect of human history, one that has been —and is— crucial for survival: care, health, and the pursuit of well-being. It then appeals to a very human and universally relevant issue. In addition, this *materia medica*, within the European context, results from the amalgamation of many traditions (Mediterranean area, Balkan zone, Northern Europe, Northern Africa, Middle East, Asia, America), and therefore, from many cultural encounters, allowing connections between different territories. Thus, the theme and the way it is approached demonstrate that AIS has the potential to become an inclusive project connected with values shared both in the European context and in other territories. This is important because it involves understanding heritage as a meeting place, as a space for dialogue.

The second area where the project's connections with the Council of Europe's value framework are evident is more specifically linked to its theme: environmental sustainability. One of the project's purposes is to promote the recovery of medicinal gardens and activate or reactivate local economic developments through sustainable production of medicines, cosmetics, and food. This directly appeals to some of the principles and international regulations on the environment, such as the DNSH, the SDG of the 2030 Agenda, the European Green Pact, the EU strategy on biodiversity for 2030, the Habitat III Agenda, or the Circular Economy Strategy. These principles also connect to economic rights associated with the development of sustainable cultural tourism.

The third area, which inherently exists —or should exist— in any project applying for Council of Europe certification, concerns compliance with international conventions on heritage. In this particular case, it appeals to the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of UNESCO (2003).

In summary, AIS is built from a position clearly connected to the principles and values of the Council of Europe and other international bodies. The link with these principles is established in some cases through the theme of the route, and in others through the conceptual and ethical approach of the project. There is, therefore, a solid starting point, but it will be important to evaluate in the future, as the project continues implementation, whether this position is truly carried out or remains merely a statement of intentions. For now, some of the initiatives being undertaken (green space recovery, agreements with companies and foundations that adhere to ethical sustainability principles, etc.) seem to be heading in that direction.

## 3.2 Fields of Action

### 3.2.1 Co-operation in research and development

The analysis of the documentation provided, coupled with interviews conducted both during fieldwork and online sessions, highlights AIS main strength, which is, precisely, cooperation. The project has designed a robust framework to ensure that all members of the route adhere to the same standards when approaching the object of study from its various facets. Of particular note is the effort made in devising a series of mandatory protocols within the network. These protocols specify scientific-technical criteria and good practices, resulting from the previous experiences of some of the entities comprising the network, and are applied in different areas:

1. Physical-chemical studies: Drawing from the experience of a research project in Santa Maria della Scala (Rome), standards of analysis were designed, now being applied to sites preserving pharmaceutical collections.
2. Preventive conservation: The project is developing an Artificial Intelligence software for the preventive conservation of this heritage, in collaboration with the Pablo Olavide University of Seville. The aim is to anticipate the deterioration of collections, which, as mentioned earlier, are particularly fragile due to the diverse range of materials.
3. Cataloguing: One significant contribution of the project is the creation (in process) of an international thesaurus on *materia medica*, aiming to converge scattered materials and knowledge, unify concepts, cataloguing methods, and, above all, facilitate access to information.
4. Dissemination: Implementing virtual reality is planned as a highly potent educational resource for the network. The choice of this format is tied to the numerous absences and losses suffered by this heritage, along with the possibilities of restoration offered by virtuality.

Protocols are essential for a transnational project, balancing inequalities among different territories. Given that not all members start from the same developmental point, providing a common roadmap enables those with less experience to rely on solid standards, thanks to the prior experience of others. Moreover, the project requires diverse expertise (research, conservation, dissemination), allowing all members to excel in something, thereby contributing their knowledge. Thus, the deficiencies of some are supplemented by the experiences of others, and vice versa. This exchange isn't merely in terms of experience, but also infrastructure. For instance, research centers with laboratories are analyzing samples from institutions unable to afford physical-chemical analyses on their own —such as convents lacking resources or infrastructure for research— while these entities provide heritage collections lacking in research centers, thereby broadening their scientific studies. Additionally, as the technical unit points out, exchanges of plant species between entities are occurring —for instance, between the Santa Cecilia convent in Rome and the Botanical Garden of the Universitat de València.

This points toward a genuine networked work logic; indeed, all individuals interviewed emphasized that point as one of the project's significant achievements —sharing experiences and ways of working is fundamental in a type of heritage as *materia medica*, due to the significant lack of information at various levels. Similarly, the project is serving as a meeting point for individuals and institutions working on the same topic, but not connected until now. The challenge for the future is to maintain a balance between the capabilities and contributions of each stakeholder, thus distributing responsibilities.

Also noteworthy, in line with cooperation, is that the technical unit is developing a cross-border pilot route between Portugal, Spain, Andorra, and France —titled 'Living Pharmacies: The cross-border route of medicinal gardens'—, applying to the Interreg SUDOE 2024 call of the European Commission. The project aims to foster transnational cooperation for the recovery

of historical pharmacies and medicinal gardens, advocating their potential to address some of the main challenges faced by rural areas.

Additionally, it must be noted that AIS is establishing relationships with itineraries already certified by the Council of Europe Cultural Routes Programme. This includes Iter Vitis, dedicated to the culture of vine, winemaking, and viticultural landscapes —Parco Colosseo, which is in the process of joining the AIS network, has been part of the Iter Vitis route since 2022— along with the European Route of Jewish Heritage and the Phoenician's route. It would be advisable to expand these connections to other initiatives like the Routes of El Legado Andalusi, concerning the Islamic cultural universe of Al-Andalus (Spain). These connections hold significant potential, thematically and in terms of cooperation between projects within the same institutional framework.

The development of work standards is particularly driven in the scientific domain. Indeed, AIS genesis lies in a research project that used Santa Maria della Scala in Rome as a case study, conducting physical-chemical studies to analyze the materials preserved in some containers. The goal was to create a scientific protocol. From that study emerged the idea of developing a European project that would connect European pharmaceutical heritage. As a result, it can be said that AIS is based on a solid scientific foundation; it is no coincidence that the project's headquarters are located at the University of Valencia (Spain), the driving force behind the initial research project on physical-chemical analysis and the creation of a thesaurus.

As indicated in the report, the project's innovative character involves approaching *materia medica* from a multidisciplinary perspective. Until now, research primarily involved specialists in chemistry, pharmacy, and botany. They now propose a multifaceted view, incorporating the approaches and methodologies of specialists in history, art history, geography, architecture, landscape studies, biology, ethnology, etc., and most importantly, understanding *materia medica* from a heritage perspective, as the absence of this viewpoint has facilitated the loss of a considerable part of material culture and the associated memory.

This multidisciplinary is reflected in the composition of the Scientific Committee. The body comprises 7 members, and it is important to highlight several aspects: 1) multidisciplinary (specialists in art history, pharmacy, medicine, museums, heritage, conservation); 2) geographical diversity (each member is from a different country: Italy, Switzerland, Spain, Portugal, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Romania, Croatia); 3) gender parity (consisting of 4 women and 3 men). As gathered from interviews, the Scientific Committee meets as a standard twice a year —every 6 months—, in addition to specific actions that they may develop in other ways. It also operates under a set of operating regulations (see document 'Annex 2.2.5. Scientific Committee Regulation') available in 7 languages.

Committee members belong to various universities and research centers, some of them renowned in the field of study. It is the case of HERCULES – Laboratory and Institute for Advanced Studies and Research at the University of Évora (Portugal). Additionally, the technical unit plans to establish a network of the universities linked to the project, operating separately from the Scientific Committee. The aim of this network is to explore funding for research projects in the scientific-academic field. Undoubtedly, this is an intriguing initiative, although care must be taken to prevent duplications between the functions of the Scientific Committee and this new network.

Regarding scientific production, it is important to take into account that AIS official formation took place towards the end of 2021, and ratified in May 2022. This means the official scientific output of the route is necessarily limited, having barely two years of existence. Nonetheless, the project already has some publications directly linked to AIS (2 publications in proceedings and 1 book, see p. 59 of the report), as well as a research projects with regional funding (Generalitat Valenciana, Spain, see p. 25 of the report). Despite this understandable limitation, the guarantee for the future seems to be assured by the experience of some of the members of the network. As can be seen in the documentation provided (p. 26 ff.), the institution hosting the route's headquarters (University of Valencia) has developed or collaborated in several publicly-funded research projects in the last 3 years directly linked to the subject of study.

Moreover, within the framework of AIS, significant scientific gatherings focused on the discussed theme are being solidified, particularly the International Seminar "The Hygeia Legacy: Pharmacy Museums and Collections in Europe: Heritage, Identity, and Memory" and the 1st European Symposium "Drugs and Colors in History: from the Past to the Present."

### 3.2.2 Enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage

AIS aims to undertake a task that deserves recognition: articulating and creating a common framework for the study, preservation, cataloguing, and dissemination of heritage and memory linked to *materia medica*.

As mentioned, this work is relevant because pharmaceutical heritage suffers from significant fragility, with many collections dispersed and lost. It is urgent, therefore, to establish shared criteria to prevent their loss. AIS proposal could signify a significant step in this direction, by articulating a transnational network of territories, institutions, and professionals equipped with collections, infrastructure, resources, and knowledge appropriate to achieve this.

The great challenge, which simultaneously presents an opportunity, lies in how to showcase a heritage that is greatly unknown. Indeed, besides the significant loss of historical pharmacy collections or the abandonment of medicinal gardens, there is a clear lack of societal awareness regarding this type of heritage. In general terms, there are no internationally recognized destinations or collections linked to pharmaceutical heritage beyond specialized circles, unlike other heritage typologies—consider, for instance, the popularity of themes such as Art Nouveau architecture, rock art, wine culture, or the Viking world within the Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe Program. This implies difficulties from the outset, as there is no pre-existing social awareness to ensure initial attraction. However, this lack of awareness can become an incentive, especially considering that pharmaceutical heritage holds immense experiential and sensory potential. Indeed, this type of heritage appeals not only to sight but also to smell, touch, and taste, dealing with substances (herbs, spices, minerals, etc.) historically used for therapeutic, ritual, and culinary purposes. Additionally, there's an aesthetic component, as a significant portion of pharmaceutical collections comprises beautifully crafted decorative elements (bottles, containers, furniture), not to mention the spaces housing these collections (historical pharmacies, convents, etc.) and the associated iconography.

Moreover, it is essential to consider that although the route includes destinations both in rural and urban settings, the nature of this heritage gives significant prominence to rural areas. Notably, essential spaces in pharmaceutical tradition, such as convents, are situated in rural settings. This means that some destinations lie outside the more common tourist circuits, which, again, presents both a challenge and an opportunity—an opportunity to experiment with more sustainable tourism models, as explained in the corresponding section. However, it is crucial to note that other destinations of the network are integrated into internationally recognized locations facing extreme tourist pressure, such as the city of Rome.

Undoubtedly, establishing connections among these heritage sites and fostering their knowledge represents a stimulus for the recovery of European memory and history. *Materia medica* forms a common European heritage, yet it is also compelling to acknowledge different geo-cultural traditions. Until now, within AIS, due to the network's composition, the traditions of Southern Europe (Spain, Portugal, Italy) and the Balkan region (Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Romania) are being highlighted. In the near future, it would be advisable to diversify representation to include territories from Northern Europe and ideally countries from other continents with historical connections, such as North Africa, the Middle East, China, or Latin America.

The work of recovering and systematizing *materia medica* is being accompanied by several initiatives for education and awareness across different fields: research and conservation, with events like the 1st International course "Art and Senses in Ancient Cultures" and the International Seminar "The Hygeia Legacy: Pharmacy Museums and Collections in Europe:

Heritage, Identity, and Memory"; the recovery of intangible heritage, with proposals like the International Seminar "Biodiversity, Cultural Cosmology, and Traditional Medicine"; and musealization and dissemination, through the 1st European Symposium on "Drugs and Colors in History: from the Past to the Present," the online event "Aroma and Museum: Science and Sensory Experience", the meeting "Study and Musealization of European Historical Apothecaries in the Era of Digital Humanities", the inauguration of "Il percorso dello speziale in Roma" (Rome's local itinerary within the AIS project), or the two editions of "Discover Pharmacy Museum" —a joint action on social media by various museums within the network, in the context of the International Museum Day.

In this same line, the project endorses the approaches of significant conventions, especially UNESCO's Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003), through the pioneering proposal to create an international thesaurus on *materia medica*. What is perhaps missing in the project's structural approach is a stronger connection to international conventions that call for the involvement of local communities in heritage recovery and management, as well as the role of heritage in improving people's lives beyond the issue of sustainable tourism development. For example, there is no reference in the report to the Faro Convention (2005), a reference document to underpin the social value of heritage.

On the other hand, it is worth noting that the technical unit is participating, following its constitution as an association and its intention to apply to the Cultural Routes Program, in training events by the Enlarged Partial Agreement on Cultural Routes and the European Institute of Cultural Routes. Specifically, the Training Seminar for candidates applying for the Cultural Route of the Council of Europe certification (Luxembourg, June 2023) and the Council of Europe Annual Advisory Forum (Łódź, September 2023).

### 3.2.3 Cultural and educational exchanges for young Europeans

AIS programming of cultural and educational exchanges for young people is likely an aspect that remains underdeveloped. It is true that the project's official trajectory is still limited — almost 2 years—, but while in other matters a clear and mature projection can be glimpsed, in the educational field it seems that the foundations have not yet been laid, beyond the individual initiatives that some members —especially museums— may carry out.

There is a specific initiative, the I Round Table "Dialogue between Young People and Languages in the Mediterranean," which brought together AIS and the Phoenicians' Route, focusing on cultural exchange between young people from Sicily and Valencia. Activities of this nature can serve as pilot experience to implement coordinated efforts in the near future, aiming to foster such intercultural dialogues. Nevertheless, it would be beneficial for the network to start defining clear lines of work in this regard, right from the beginning, emphasizing cooperation, just as they have approached other areas like research or heritage conservation. In this respect, the document "Action Plan 2023-2026" encompasses various aspects in this field (p. 5):

1. Initiate cooperation with educational institutions at regional and international level and consolidate the network;
2. Define heritage pedagogy programs;
3. Promote cultural and educational exchanges for young Europeans, both travel experiences and virtual meetings;
4. Municipalities and stakeholders staff training. Training and capacity building activities for operators.

### 3.2.4 Contemporary cultural and artistic practice

Similarly to the previous section, the project has yet to develop a clear proposal regarding the connection between the proposed theme and contemporary cultural and artistic practices. In the project's documentation, this section is defined as 'forthcoming' and refers to the Forecast 3-year Programme of Activities.

It should be noted, despite this initial shortcoming, that the theme selected by AIS can open the doors to interesting proposals in the artistic field, as two aspects already mentioned come into play: the multiplicity of the senses (sight, smell, touch, taste) and the inherent beauty of a large part of this heritage.

In this context, it is interesting to highlight a powerful initiative held in Rome in September 2023, in which AIS participated, attended during the fieldwork for this evaluation report. This initiative, called 'Nutrire l'Incontro,' was an event on art and gastronomy held at the Spanish Royal Academy in Rome—which is in the process of joining the AIS network. Over several days, there were conferences, visits, and culinary experiences exploring the relationships between art and gastronomy. Within this program, the technical unit of AIS conducted the 'Itinerario dello speciale,' that is to say, the itinerary connecting the various destinations in Rome integrated into the network of historical pharmacies and medicinal gardens. The proposal was well-received, and it would be interesting for AIS to continue collaborating in the future on similar initiatives where the recovery of *materia medica* engages directly with artistic practice and gastronomy.

During these sessions, some specific initiatives were also presented, developed by spaces linked to the network or in the process of joining. For instance, the Hospitale della Santissima Trinità dei Pelegrini in Rome, a former hospital, is nowadays headquarters of an art school where people with functional diversity develop their artistic skills; in fact, some of their works have been brought to the Biennale di Venezia. This proposal brings to the table the importance of occupational therapy and outlines an interesting avenue of work to be implemented jointly in the AIS network. Additionally, at the Santa Cecilia convent in the Trastevere district, training in music and botanical-related painting is offered, and a programming of concerts and olfactory memory is being designed. However, once again, these are individual initiatives developed independently. Undoubtedly, they have the potential to serve as pilot projects, but there is still a need to design an articulated program in which the entire network can participate.

### 3.2.5 Cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development

The destinations that make up the AIS network are situated in diverse contexts. On one hand, there are museums and visitable sites in urban settings, some in major capitals highly positioned in the international tourism sphere, such as Rome, Madrid, or Lisbon. On the other hand, there are destinations integrated into mid-sized cities—ranging between 100,000 and 400,000 inhabitants—like Rijeka, Cluj-Napoca, Bern, or Sarajevo. Finally, there are visitable places in small municipalities—around 1,000 inhabitants—like Roccavaldina (Italy), Llívia, and Palmera (Spain).

Each of these realities, determined by the urban/rural context and population size, is influenced by other fundamental factors like geographical, cultural, political, and social realities. Consequently, within the network, there exist widely disparate realities: just as there are destinations like Rome, with a clear positioning as one of the most recognized and heavily touristic international destinations—the challenge here is how to position the route in the face of so much tourism on offer—there are also others like Cluj-Napoca or Sarajevo in the Balkan context, undoubtedly inserted into a very different cultural and touristic realities. Hence, fostering cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development should be approached with attention to these contexts.

From the report presented by the technical unit, a specific intention to promote sustainable tourism development, diverging from mass tourism circuits, is evident. Indeed, emphasis is placed on working within rural environments, where material culture and memory associated with pharmaceutical tradition are often preserved, whether in religious spaces (monasteries) or secular ones (community gardens). However, to date, the number of destinations integrated into rural or small municipal areas proposed by AIS as visitable (see the project's official website) is limited (3/14). This imbalance between rural and urban destinations, when a predominance of rural settings is presupposed in this type of heritage, should be understood considering the incipient state of the proposal. In effect, it is logical to have initially incorporated destinations consolidated in this heritage domain, particularly museums with recognized trajectories or historically significant visitable pharmacies. It is a way to create a solid foundation with established infrastructure. Based on this, there is an assumed willingness — according to discussions with project leaders and various network members— to progressively include new rural destinations, as is already happening in places like Galicia (Spain).

Nevertheless, it is significant that before formally incorporating these rural destinations, the project has defined a clear policy of sustainable tourism development. Planning is crucial before generating transformations in the territory, and in the AIS report there is an evident understanding of the international regulatory framework in this matter (see p. 41 ff.).

Regarding specific sustainable development policies, the project proposes that the recovery and valorization of spaces and their heritage can be a catalyst for the development of rural territories, many of which have experienced deep depopulation and crises in recent decades. It is worth noting that the proposal goes beyond the usual economic developments that the recovery of this heritage could generate, such as cultural employment (museums, interpretation centers, guided tour services, etc.), new professional niches (virtual reality, genesis of itineraries, etc.), or hospitality and associated services (restaurants, shops, etc.). AIS proposes the recovery of traditional productive spaces (medicinal gardens, workshops) to reactivate them following principles of environmentally respectful production.

The purpose is, through this reactivation, to recover traditional productions linked to the knowledge of medicinal materials, such as pharmaceutical products, cosmetics, perfumes, etc., always from a sustainability standpoint. That is, through the knowledge generated by research (recovering traditional processes) and the reactivation of disused productive spaces (medicinal gardens), collaborations are proposed with companies that advocate for productions following sustainability criteria and respect for the environment. In fact, the technical unit informs that there are already ongoing collaborations.

This mutual exchange between the network and other entities linked to the territory could be an interesting line of work to ensure the consolidation and rootedness of AIS. Moreover, currently, the technical unit is developing the 'Living Pharmacies: The cross-border route of medicinal gardens' project, in process of application to the European Commission's Interreg SUDOE 2024 call. With this proposal, they aim to strengthen transnational collaborations between France, Andorra, Spain, and Portugal, through cultural and natural heritage; particularly, through historical pharmacies and medicinal gardens. The purpose, as they indicate, is to counter depopulation and activate the local economy through sustainable tourism. Accessing this grant would undoubtedly be an interesting initiative to test sustainable tourism formulas that can later be exported to the rest of the network.

This approach connects with an important aspect, which is the alliances that can be woven with economic agents. Given that it is a project addressing the history of pharmacy and focusing on medicinal heritage, it is not implausible to think that there might be entities within the pharmaceutical sector interested in collaborating or sponsoring the project. Not only institutions like professional colleges —indeed, the network already includes the professional colleges of pharmacists in Rome and Valencia— but also pharmaceutical companies. While acknowledging the potential interest in finding support that guarantees the economic sustainability of the proposal, it is also important to note that the commitment to environmental sustainability and social responsibility certainly limits the range of potential collaborators, given

the impact of some major pharmaceutical companies. However, the project leaders are aware of this issue, and in fact, their fundamental selection criterion is the alignment with the project's philosophy. In this regard, they are already collaborating with the Fondazione Sebastiano Crimi per lo studio, la ricerca e la storia della farmacia in Sicilia ETS.

Perhaps what is missing in the proposal, at least in its current developmental state, is the presence of more local agents linked to rural territories. The network has 2 local authorities (municipalities, both in the Spanish context), 1 tourist stakeholder (a company in Sicily), and 1 association ("friends of" type, in the Spanish case). Implementing genuinely sustainable tourism development policies should not occur without the complicity of local agents, who inhabit the territory, live with the heritage, and have often ensured its survival, as highlighted by international normative frameworks (see, in this regard, the Faro Convention).

Ultimately, the project is clear about the international normative framework (conventions, recommendations) and has a clear willingness to promote models of interaction with the territory and sustainable tourism, in coherence with the project's philosophy. What remains pending is to ensure that these theoretical approaches are effectively put into practice. Again, it is advisable to allow time to assess this dimension, but the initiatives being activated seem to align with this goal—alliances with companies and foundations that share sustainability criteria, recovery of traditional productive spaces, as well as more environmentally respectful local productions.

Finally, within the framework of cultural tourism, the AIS project aims to make a determined commitment to virtual reality to complement the access and enjoyment of this heritage. Virtuality, in this case, is required for two reasons. Firstly, for conservation, since certain spaces or collections are not capable of withstanding a massive presence of people, where virtual reality can contribute to their preservation. Secondly, for the irreparable loss of heritage resulting from lack of attention. Here, virtuality can help fill gaps, and therefore can be considered as a complementary resource. Virtuality can be, indeed, a double-edged sword; it cannot end up replacing materiality, as otherwise, the territorial network would lose its meaning. However, it does have the potential to contextualize specific sites. For example, in the convent of Santa Cecilia in Rome, the original 'spezieria' was transferred to the Vatican just before World War II. The 'spezieria' is currently preserved in the Vatican Museums, while Santa Cecilia maintains its medicinal garden. Although these are two spaces that can dialogue within the context of the route, virtual recreation can help to better understand the case of Santa Cecilia by linking the 'spezieria' with the garden that supplied it.

In connection with all this, the technical unit is currently collaborating with 'Smart Guide: global digital guide platform' to create guides, including virtual reality for non-visitable locations; moreover, they are conducting specific training for the museums within the network.

Here, the proposal for an international thesaurus to facilitate access to all information related to *materia medica* makes sense, which is being developed based on the European-funded project 'Digital Alliances in the Era of Smart Cultural Tourism: Safeguarding and Immersive Multi-sensorial Storytelling in the (In) material Cultural Heritage of HYGEIA- Hispanic Rome' (Hygeia-CHRH).

### 3.3 Cultural Route Network

#### 3.3.1 Overview of institutional /legal structure of the network

The AIS route is managed, as required by Resolution (98) 4 on the Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe (see 'III. List of criteria for networks'), by an association: Aromas Itinerarium Salutis Association. The association was registered in Spain, and operates under its national legislation, which recognizes its legal status and its non-profit nature.



The association was officially registered in Valencia (Spain) on May 30, 2022, and its operations are governed by statutes that clearly and directly define the objectives, the nature of the association members, the organizational structure, and the financial regime. However, the signing of the founding act, the body, and the statutes occurred earlier, in December 2021, with the founding partners from Valencia. It is important to note, as pointed out by the technical unit, that the exclusive involvement of partners from Valencia was due to the context of restrictions caused by COVID-19, which limited the possibilities of travel and contact.

The objectives proposed in the statutes are in line with the proposal presented by AIS. Thus, not only does it highlight the scientific, conservation, and dissemination mission regarding the *materia medica* under responsible and sustainable criteria, but it also specifies as one of the objectives to articulate an international network for the creation of itineraries connecting the different territories of continental Europe and the Mediterranean —although the definition does not close the doors to countries from other territories related to the subject under study, which demonstrates a future provision— as well as leading competitive scientific research projects (see ‘Title II. General Objectives’).

Regarding the organizational structure, the association has 4 main bodies (see ‘Title IV. Organizational Structure’): 1) the General Assembly, where all members, both ordinary and benefactor members, are represented; 2) the Board of Directors, which constitutes the governing body and is composed of the institutional president, the executive president, a director, and the advisors; 3) the Technical Management Office, responsible for the administrative management of the Association; 4) and the International Scientific Committee, which is the body that controls and verifies compliance with the principles and values of the association and the itinerary.

Regarding this structure, a couple of points should be noted. Regarding the General Assembly, it meets at least once a year and as many times as necessary in an extraordinary convocation. It is made up of different types of members, also defined in the statutes: Ordinary Members, Benefactor Members, Honorary Members, Founding Members; excluded from it are the Friends of the Aromas Itinerarium Salutis Network, a specific category that is interesting because it is open to public and private entities and individuals who want to support the association demonstratively. Currently, the network consists of 20 members from 7 countries of the Council of Europe: Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Italy, Portugal, Romania, Spain, and Switzerland.

On the other hand, the existence of a Technical Management Office is of crucial importance for the proper functioning of the project. In this case, the office is located at the University of Valencia (Spain), and it consists of 4 people: Ester Alba Pagán, institutional president; Maria Luisa Vázquez de Ágredos Pascual, director; Simona Tardi, executive secretary; and Cristina Expósito de Vicente, secretary of the association. There are three aspects to highlight about this technical office: 1) it is entirely composed of women, which not only complies with parity standards but also represents a clear commitment to showcasing women in positions of responsibility —it should also be noted that the presence of women is equal in the other association bodies, with the exception of the Presidency Office; 2) one of the members (Simona Tardi) is directly employed by the association with a part-time contract to carry out her work, which is supported by the rest of the team; this system guarantees the proper functioning of the network; and 3) the fact that the association and the technical unit have their headquarters at a university, in this case, the University of Valencia (Spain), represents a guarantee of continuity since it is a prestigious institution with appropriate resources and infrastructure to host and facilitate the development of an ambitious project like AIS. In fact, the president of the association is currently the Vice Chancellor of Culture and Society of this university, and the director has recently taken up the position of Cultural Heritage Conservator at the same institution.

From the interviews conducted with members of the network from different countries, it is evident that the technical unit is truly taking the lead in the development of the route. According to testimonies, the majority of proposals originate from this office and are then subjected to

discussion and assessment by both the General Assembly and the Scientific Committee, where their suitability and implementation possibilities are evaluated.

In summary, everything indicates that the legal and institutional structure of the AIS association is correct and suitable for the development of its functions, in line with the mission and objectives defined in its statutes. Likewise, the technical unit is fulfilling its responsibilities, and has the added value of having experience in designing projects for calls from public and private institutions at regional, national, and international levels, as will be seen in the following section.

### 3.3.2 Overview of the financial situation of the network

The statutes of the AIS association define the four main sources of funding for its proper functioning (see 'Title VI. Economic Regime'): ordinary annual contributions, extraordinary contributions, grants or donations, and incomes from its assets and derived from its activities and publications.

Regarding the first source, the annual quotes are not predefined in the statutes but are approved annually by the General Assembly. This allows greater flexibility to adapt the quotes to the needs of each moment. These quotes range from €500 to €5,000 (see document 'Annual registration fee table - Ordinary members,' available on the project's website), depending on variables such as the number of inhabitants—in the case of municipalities—the number of employees—in the case of entities—or the type of entity—companies, museums, heritage sites, cultural institutions, NGOs, foundations, associations. It is noteworthy to recognize the effort to establish this gradation in quotes, with the purpose of facilitating participation according to the reality of each member. In 2023, the quotes allowed a total amount of €22,057.68.

As for the second source, there seems to have been no need to make extraordinary contributions to date, which, as indicated in the statutes, should always be ratified by the General Assembly.

Regarding grants and donations, they constitute the main source of funding. For the year 2023, the project has received €8,181.29 in kind contributions and €36,278.59 linked to the granting of a research project promoted by the regional government of Valencia (Spain). However, it should be noted that this grant applies exclusively to the branch of the project developed in the Valencian territory; specifically, the budget is aimed at designing The Route of historic pharmacies and medicinal gardens in the Valencian Region (2022-2023); thus, without denying its importance in fostering specific developments of the route, its application is not generalizable to the entire network.

Finally, concerning the incomes from its assets and derived from its activities and publications, there are no available data.

In general terms, therefore, it is difficult to make an assessment of the economic viability of the project, not because there is no good management, but because the association's official trajectory is still short—almost 2 years—and prevents a long-term analysis. The only fact that can be noted from the analysis of the 2023 budget is that, apparently, there is no money left over, but neither are there any losses. In other words, the total income for 2023 (66,517.56€) has been invested entirely for the purposes of the association, distributed as follows: management (17%), projects (69%), direct material (1%), marketing material (8%) and travel expenses (5%). In any case, it should be noted that this is a considerable amount of money for the first year of the association's existence and the number of members that currently make up the network.

For the immediate future, it would be important for the network to consider two aspects. One is the need to diversify funding sources. Currently, the main contributions come from public institutions linked to the territory where the technical unit and association headquarters are

located; a dynamic that, again, seems logical as it is the beginning of the project's journey, which implies taking on more responsibilities by the founding institution.

The other issue to consider is the importance of aspiring to transnational funds. Indeed, in all international route projects arises the same problem: network members have access to funds of a local, regional, or national nature mainly through public calls; however, these funds cannot be invested outside their territory. It is therefore urgent to access calls of an international nature that facilitate this redistribution of resources; otherwise, the development of the network may end up reproducing the inherent inequalities of territories, due to disparities in access to funds and infrastructures.

However, there are arguments that allow us to see AIS as a structure with great potential to access international funds. Within the frame of the network there are individuals and entities – including the technical unit– with demonstrated experience in applying for and accessing European and other funds for the development of research, conservation, and dissemination projects. Likewise, interviews with the management team show a clear plan to access various international funding calls in the coming years, both from public and private entities. Thus, according to the technical unit's forecast, the budget for the 2023-2026 cycle could reach €2,545,457.68, an ambitious amount conditioned by the obtaining of funds that are being applied for or intended to be applied for, especially European funds (Interreg-SUDOE 2024 - with the intention of generating a pilot test to be implemented in other territories of the route - Advanced Grant - European Commission, Next Generation, Creative Europe); but also from other entities such as the Gerda Henkel Foundation (Germany) —in process— for the European thesaurus (semantic web), or the Dumbarton Oaks Foundation (United States) for the recovery of the garden of the Santa Cecilia convent in Rome. Currently, an amount of €9,000 has been already granted by the University of Valencia for the development of the project "Rediscovering and Safeguarding HYGEIA's (in)Tangible Cultural Heritage at Mare Nostrum. From the INTERNATIONAL THESAURUS of Materia Medica to Immersive Experiences of an Ancient Mediterranean Legacy" (hygeia-chmn).

To these international subsidies should be added the agreements that are already being reached with foundations, professional associations, and companies, of smaller scope than those mentioned above but undoubtedly necessary to facilitate the project's operation.

Overall, although AIS trajectory is still limited, previous experiences and initiatives underway allow for optimism from a financial point of view. It is also clear that the project has made an effort to plan the short and medium-term future in economic terms, and that this planning exists independently of whether or not it achieves the certification of the Cultural Routes of Council of Europe Programme. That is to say, it is not detected that the route's main aspiration is to obtain the Programme's recognition; rather, it is more of an incentive that will allow expanding its possibilities —members interviewed for this report recognise the potential that such recognition would imply in terms of visibility and legitimacy—, but does not completely condition its immediate future.

### 3.3.3 Current composition of the network by country and type of member

To date, the AIS network comprises 20 members of different nature and origin. Regarding their nature, despite the limited number, a coherent diversity seems to be inferred. There is representation from:

1. Cultural institutions (25%), a general concept that includes foundations (Mediterranean Citizen's Assembly Foundation, Foundation Historical Library of Swiss Pharmacy, Todolí Citrus Foundation - Citrus Garden), professional associations (Very Illustrious Official College of Pharmacists of Valencia), and other entities (Association of Young Researchers in Religious Sciences) related to the pharmaceutical field.
2. Museums specialized in the subject under study (20%), such as the JGL Pharmacy Museum in Rijeka (Croatia), the Health and Pharmacy Museum in Lisbon (Portugal),

the Pharmacy Collection of The National Museum of Transylvanian History in Cluj-Napoca (Romania), and the Hispanic Pharmacy Museum of the Complutense University of Madrid (Spain).

3. Universities and research centers (15%), some of them with recognized personnel and infrastructure in medicinal studies, such as the "Nicolae Iorga" Institute of History in Bucharest (Romania) or the Universitat de València (Spain), the project's headquarters.
4. Associations (15%) linked to the theme and tourism, such as the Pharmacy Museum – Association for Pharmacy Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina), the Rijeka Tourist Board (Croatia), and the Association of Friends of the Monastery of Santa María de Sobrado (Spain).
5. Local authorities (10%), in this case, town halls —only in the Spanish context.
6. And other entities (tourism agent, monastery, and natural park).

The overall analysis allows to observe a clear predominance of institutional agents, namely museums, universities, town halls, foundations, and other entities. Their presence is essential to provide solidity to the network's structure and the development of scientific and educational activities, especially in the case of museums and universities. However, it would be interesting to enhance the presence of associative networks, particularly associations linked to the territory, following the model of the already included Association of Friends of the Monastery of Santa María de Sobrado, to promote the social rooting of the proposal. There is also a lack of supra-territorial organizations to be able to articulate specific regional developments, and perhaps a greater presence of touristic stakeholders.

Regarding the geographical distribution of members, there is an evident imbalance in favor of Spain (50%), particularly the Valencia region, which is the project's place of origin. The rest of countries have a more or less balanced representation —between 1 and 3 members— and it is noteworthy the presence of countries that are not so common in the Council of Europe's Cultural Routes programme, such as Bosnia and Herzegovina or Romania. However, although Valencia's centrality as the driving region of the project can be understood due to the project's embryonic phase and the need to provide stability from a central point, in the near future it would be advisable for the association to correct this territorial imbalance to avoid inequalities in representation, access to resources, and rotation of responsibilities. The technical unit is aware of this situation, as inferred from the interviews held; in fact, they already have in mind to start decentralizing some initiatives, such as the international seminar "The Hygeia Legacy," held in 2023 in Valencia and scheduled for 2024 in Rijeka (Croatia) and for 2026 in Sarajevo (Bosnia and Herzegovina); the conference "Drugs and Colors in history: from the past to the present," held in Évora (Portugal) in 2023, which will take place in Rome in 2025; the establishment of the new network of universities linked to AIS, which will take place in Rijeka in 2025; or the new editions of the Round Table "Dialogue between young people in the Mediterranean," which, after Italy, will be held in Israel, Spain, and Portugal.

As for the route itself, the selection of destinations is coherent and diverse. However, there are two limitations to consider. On one hand, it is still limited in number, which is understandable considering its short trajectory and the fragility of pharmaceutical heritage. On the other hand, some destinations included in the route are currently not visitable, either because they are in the process of restoration or adaptation for visits. The positive aspect here is that they will become accessible in the short and medium term, undoubtedly adding value to the route. These include, for example, the *Horrea Piperataria* —ancient spice warehouses— of the Parco Colosseo in Rome —an entity that has already signed up for the network— scheduled to open in 2024; the 'spezieria' of Santa Maria della Scala, starting its restoration now and expected to open to the public in 2025; or the ancient 'spezieria' of Santa Cecilia, preserved in the Vatican Museums.

The inclusion of these kinds of destinations is crucial in the route, as they have the potential to serve as points of attraction. It is important to note that pharmaceutical heritage isn't as socially popular as other types of heritage—think of cave art or castle routes—; however, this doesn't mean it can't be incredibly appealing, particularly considering its sensory nature. Due to the

fact that heritage sites related to *materia medica* are not as recognizable in society, it is interesting to include more popular destinations. Examples such as the archaeological park of the Colosseum or the Vatican Museums can certainly contribute to visibility. Therefore, it is about finding a balance between well-known and lesser-known destinations.

The geographical distribution of the route's destinations also shows some imbalances, although not as pronounced as in the overall composition of members. In this case, there's a clear predominance of Spanish destinations (5) followed by Italian ones (4), while the rest of the countries have only one destination. It is noteworthy that all member countries have at least one destination, but it would be advisable to expand the presence of these countries — within the limits of their conserved heritage— and extend the network to include other countries, in order to establish new connections. For instance, as mentioned by one of the interviewees, Romanian pharmaceutical tradition has stronger links with the Germanic area than with the Mediterranean, so incorporating destinations from that area would strengthen the thematic and semantic proposal.

Finally, it is worth highlighting that the association has a specific document —accessible on the official website— that outlines the criteria for accessing the AIS network (see document 'Annex 2.2.2. Selection Criteria'). It is a comprehensive document available in 7 languages, establishing the premises, general criteria, and specific criteria. On the one hand, it aims to verify that candidates align with the values of the Council of Europe and AIS objectives, and that also have a solid background in at least one of the designated fields (research, heritage management, education, artistic practices, or sustainable tourism). On the other hand, it defines the types of heritage sites to be considered for inclusion as destinations in the route: historic pharmacies (heritage site 1, which also includes museums, monasteries, hospitals, collections, and specialized libraries with this kind of heritage) and medicinal gardens (heritage site 2). Each of these sites has specific requirements in terms of chronology, typology, conservation, and institutional-normative recognition.

As stated in the bylaws (see 'Title III. Members'), accepting new members is subject to the decision of the Board of Directors and the General Assembly, thus ensuring selection processes based on democratic criteria. The commitment to complying with these criteria and, generally, with the principles outlined in the statutes appears to be strong. As acknowledged by the project coordinators, two members have been expelled from the network for not adhering to these principles. Therefore, both the regulatory documents of the network and its philosophy of application seem more than adequate to ensure a coherent expansion process aligned with the project's needs.

#### 3.3.4 Strategy for the network extension in the three years to come

The AIS project faces a significant challenge when it comes to expanding its network: dealing with fragmented and forgotten heritage limits the potential partners more than in other projects with more common or better-recognized heritages. However, this limitation can also be seen as a differentiating factor, since it allows for a much more precise delineation of potential members.

In a way, this uniqueness can also be a guarantee of commitment; as discussed among the interviewed network members, there's a global consideration of the importance of having created a space that unites institutions and professionals who share interests and study subjects but had remained isolated until now. Therefore, AIS has the opportunity to build a network that might not be overly extensive but is solid in thematic and logistical terms —a concept that would be reinforced by the criteria established by the network for accepting new proposals. It is worth noting that despite the fragmented nature of this heritage, the technical unit has considered the diversity of forms in which medicinal and farmaceutical heritage exists today, as specified in the specific documents (see section '3.3.1. Current composition of the network by country and type of member' in this report).

In any case, there's evidence that the technical unit is currently working on expanding the network. At the time of writing this report, there is an ongoing Call for Members—running until January 2024—in which new destinations from both existing member countries of the route and new ones have expressed interest. Italy, Croatia, Portugal, and Bosnia and Herzegovina aim to include new members—including universities, associations, and foundations—and doors are open to new countries like Estonia, Lithuania, and Israel. Furthermore, some discussions are underway with China, whose potential inclusion would represent a qualitative leap for the proposal, both due to the thematic connection (spice route) and the extra-European projection.

### 3.4 Communication tools

#### 3.3.5 Current state of communication tools developed by the network (graphic charter, communication materials, logo, communication channels, signposting, maps, etc.)

The AIS network has its own distinctive logo, specifically designed within the project framework. Among the materials provided, the technical unit provides a specific document (see document '5.1. Visibility charter') detailing the meaning of the logo—reasons behind the color choices and the elements comprising it—as well as the rules and obligations undertaken by the members of the route regarding the official graphics.

The logo is used to identify the visitable destinations of the route as well as activities and initiatives linked to it. Analysis of the dissemination materials provided (brochures, roll-ups) and institutional websites of network members reveal compliance with the Visibility Charter's principles. Additionally, interviews held with the technical unit at the project headquarters confirmed the presence of a plaque with the identifying logo placed visibly at the entrance and a roll-up describing the project inside.

It is also worth noting the intention to create specific logos for local/regional developments within the route. For instance, the Valencian route —currently under construction— already has its own logo. While this dynamic can be interesting for giving these routes a graphical identity, finding an appropriate balance is essential to avoid confusion between the main and secondary logos.

Alongside the graphic image and dissemination materials, AIS has a comprehensive and well-structured website. First and foremost, the website is available in 5 languages (English, Spanish, Italian, Croatian, and Romanian), and part of the publicly accessible documentation —such as the criteria for joining the network or the Visibility Charter— is available in 7 languages, including Portuguese and Bosnian. This gesture should be acknowledged, as it demonstrates the route's willingness to provide project information in all the languages of the involved countries.

The website is organized into different sections, providing useful information about the route. The homepage serves as introduction to the project, already featuring the map and the route destinations. A different section explains the nature of the association, detailing its structure, the constituent bodies, representatives —with photographs and biographies—, as well as the general and specific objectives. This part also includes a section for joining the network, where the membership form and official brochure can be found.

Another section of the website is specifically dedicated to the route itself. This part features an interactive map highlighting the countries comprising the route and the specific destinations. The map offers access to information and links of interest about those destinations (museums, historical pharmacies, convents), as well as more general links about the cities or municipalities

where they are located. Currently, the section related to local/regional routes is under construction.

The website also hosts a news section that is regularly updated with events linked to the development of the route, in the form of a blog. These posts include detailed explanations of the actions, as well as a selection of photographs.

Finally, there is a contact section with the association, listing general communication channels, office location, and specifying contacts for the technical unit representatives.

The website also provides direct links to the project's social media. AIS has profiles on Instagram, Facebook, YouTube, and Twitter, although the latter is not active. Analysis of the posts highlights a well-thought-out communication strategy, regularly updated with various types of information: scientific and educational activities driven by the network (conferences, meetings, etc.); actions related to project management (meetings, presentations, new incorporations, etc.); introduction of destinations within the network (museums, historical pharmacies, medicinal gardens, etc.); historical-cultural information related to the project's theme (traditional and contemporary uses of plants, relationship with art and mythology, significant dates, etc.). The Facebook account has been active since June 2021 but still shows limited engagement: it has barely 94 followers with limited interactions. On the other hand, the association uses the YouTube channel as a repository for videos on conferences, workshops, interviews, and lectures. This channel was created in May 2023, with 35 subscribers, 11 videos, and 528 views. Lastly, the Instagram profile, established in June 2021, shares the same posts (91) as the Facebook profile, and interactions seem modest for now: it has 286 followers and an average of 20-50 likes.

In this regard, while there is a clear communication intent from the project, and efforts are made to showcase its various aspects, it is recommended that the technical team strengthens the communication strategy. As a suggestion, it is encouraged to differentiate the content to be dealt with on each social network: while Facebook is suitable for providing general information, on Instagram it would be interesting to focus on more visually powerful material, at least in its feed. For instance, keeping stories for practical information (conferences, news, etc.) and using the feed to showcase destinations and content related to the theme. Here, the project has great potential, as medicinal heritage is visually powerful and should then be maximized. This clearer communication strategy should also be accompanied by increased user interaction to foster greater engagement.

Ultimately, AIS has a defined foundation in terms of graphical communication, with a distinctive logo and website, but it is recommended to enhance the social media communication strategy to reach a wider audience.

#### 4. Conclusions and recommendations

AIS is a well-articulated proposal that fulfils the criteria of the Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe Programme.

When evaluating the proposal, it is important to consider that the official trajectory of the project is still relatively short, even though its origins can be traced back to a previous scientific research project. What stands out, however, is that despite having just over 2 years of existence, the project has built a very solid foundations in terms of thematic definition, scientific background, network operation, definition of common protocols, and short- to medium-term planning.

Nevertheless, there are areas that require improvement, such as the limited network of members and destinations, or the cultural and educational activities program, which are currently being addressed.

This solidity can be attributed to the existence of a very capable technical unit and the support of specialized institutions and professionals in the field, both nationally and internationally.

In summary, AIS is an ambitious and promising project that now needs some time to further develop its structure, but undoubtedly has the potential to become a model example of a transnational route.

##### I. List of eligibility criteria for themes

#### CONCLUSIONS

From a thematic and heritage perspective, the AIS proposal is courageous and highly relevant for several reasons: 1) it pays attention to a very fragile heritage that has undergone considerable processes of fragmentation and loss due to widespread neglect, which even today remains under threat; 2) the theme appeals to a highly suggestive and universally relevant practice that has been present since the very origins of humanity—the notion of care, health, and well-being; 3) it embraces a complex and diverse heritage, connecting movable, immovable, natural, and intangible cultural heritage, and advocating for the importance of collective memory; 4) it holds great potential from an immersive and experiential perspective, which can be a distinguishing feature compared to other cultural routes.

The proposal specifically focuses on historical pharmacies and European medicinal gardens as representative spaces of *materia medica*. It is a focused theme, yet sufficiently flexible to incorporate different geographic traditions, collectively appealing to European values, heritage, and identity.

Hence, it is a well-argued proposal from a thematic standpoint, with a well-aligned mission and objectives, strengthened by a solid scientific background.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

The thematic axis of the route has significant discursive potential by connecting with two very interesting ideas concerning values and coexistence: on one hand, the practice of caring, and on the other, cultural encounters. The European pharmaceutical tradition, in turn, draws from diverse traditions and has been significantly influenced by other territories. Therefore, the technical unit is encouraged to incorporate non-European countries into the network, regardless of the primary focus remaining on European *materia medica*. Besides enhancing discourse, this dynamic would be highly positive in terms of international cooperation. The team is already working in this direction, considering the possibility of including China and Israel—however, it is advised to carefully consider its incorporation given the current context—and is encouraged to explore other territories, such as North African or Ibero-American connections.

Additionally, the project's documentation emphasizes that AIS is not only working towards the recovery of heritage, but also associated memory. This positioning is crucial as it allows for considering the subject of study from a dynamic and living perspective. Hence, it is suggested



to incorporate professionals, particularly in the Scientific Committee, with profiles related to Anthropology, as they are best equipped to scientifically address collective memory. This would enrich the team's multidisciplinary character.

## II. List of priority fields of action

### CONCLUSIONS

One of AIS main strengths is establishing clear principles and criteria in terms of transnational cooperation. Particularly noteworthy is the development of protocols in various areas: research (physical-chemical analysis), preventive conservation (Artificial Intelligence applied to conservation), cataloguing (creation of an international thesaurus), and dissemination (virtual reality as a potential resource to supplement heritage gaps). In essence, there is a clear commitment to establish a shared roadmap that generates synergies from the experiences of various network agents, aiming to avoid disparities in project implementation. The approach is not a mere sum of territorialized initiatives but a joint action, with pilot projects being defined for implementation.

Furthermore, the proposal is shaping the foundations of a sustainable tourism model, based on the recovery of natural heritage spaces and traditional production methods (medicines, cosmetics, food) in collaboration with foundations and companies sharing similar ethical principles. AIS is seeking a primary focus on rural areas —where this heritage is often preserved— with the intent to address the challenges faced by these territories.

However, other areas of action, such as cultural and educational exchanges or contemporary artistic and cultural practices, still require effort to articulate global actions surpassing individual initiatives. The encouraging point is that certain specific initiatives are already pointing in that direction, and the Action Plan provided by the technical unit for the 2023-2026 cycle addresses most weaknesses highlighted in this report. There's a clear awareness of both the project's shortcomings and its potentialities.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

It is crucial for the network to begin articulating a common strategy concerning cultural and educational activities. Similar to the protocols defined in areas like physical-chemical studies or the international thesaurus, or the clear foundations set in the access criteria to the network, defining an educational action roadmap would be beneficial. Within the framework of the AIS—even in collaboration with other already certified routes— there have already been specific initiatives of great interest (music, art, gastronomy), which can serve as pilot experiments to be expanded to the rest of the member territories. It is recommended, in this sense, to take advantage of the project's internal networks and meeting forums—for example, the museum network— or to create a specific working group on this subject, as is planned for the future network of AIS universities. Here it could be particularly useful, in addition to designing a common programme of activities, to plan an annual training programme to share experiences and standardize criteria in the cultural and educational sphere.

In the same vein, strengthening the communication strategy on social media is recommended to achieve greater digital presence, especially considering the project's interest in virtual reality and Artificial Intelligence.

The tourism model outlined by the technical unit holds great promise, constructed from sustainability and territorial awareness criteria. It is encouraged to further foster alliances with foundations and companies having product lines aligned with the project's philosophy. However, enhancing the network presence of agents deeply linked to the territory, including associations, local development agents, or tourism entities advocating for similar principles, should be taken into consideration.

Finally, the project's leaders are encouraged to contemplate the potential of medicinal gardens and orchards as catalysts for participatory processes with local communities, both in rural and

urban contexts. Addressing issues such as the lack of generational succession —considering the case of Santa Cecilia Convent in Rome— could involve local participation, thereby reclaiming heritage spaces and fostering stronger emotional bonds.

Jointly, these approaches would enable the project to align with the principles of reference international documents such as the Faro Convention, advocating for the reinforcement of the social value of heritage.

### III. List of criteria for networks

## CONCLUSIONS

AIS is striving to build a coherent network encompassing diverse pharmaceutical traditions within the European context. So far, priority has been given to the Mediterranean and Balkan regions, where appropriate destinations have been selected to explore this heritage, alongside credible partners in terms of research, conservation, and management (universities, cultural centers, museums, associations, municipalities). Moreover, all of them are part of the Council of Europe. However, there remains a need to expand the network towards Central and Northern Europe to achieve greater territorial representation. In recent months, the technical unit has been working in this direction, and countries from these unrepresented areas have shown interest in joining. Furthermore, efforts are underway to include extra-European territories like Israel or China, which are relevant within the context of historical spice routes, crucial for understanding the *materia medica*.

The network has an appropriate legal structure and adequate governing, management and supervisory bodies for the proper functioning of the route. However, an effort should be made to correct the over-representation of Spain, particularly the Valencian region, and to initiate a process of decentralisation and rotation of responsibilities.

Regarding financial aspects, evaluating the proposal's solvency is complex due to its short trajectory. However, positive indications exist: aside from handling a considerable budget within a single year, the technical unit has drafted an action plan to attract international funds in ongoing or upcoming calls, alongside securing national and regional grants. All of this underscores that AIS is not merely an idea but a project firmly woven together.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

It is important for the network to continue expanding, in order to provide greater structural and discursive solidity to the project. While the project has clear criteria for incorporating new members, subsequent steps should address a significant matter: correcting territorial imbalances and representing territories not yet included.

Although the inclusion of new members is necessary in general terms (universities, associations, cultural centres), it is recommended that the technical unit give priority to destinations that can be visited, in order to broaden the offer of the route. Furthermore, it is suggested that a selective search be made for popular destinations, in order to serve as attraction points, since one of the challenges of the heritage under study is that it is not as popular as other types of heritage.

From a financial point of view, the network is making a very courageous commitment to European funds, which are the ones that truly guarantee the development of transnational implementations. However, it is encouraged to diversify the sources of regional or national funding, as to date they have mainly come from a single territory, the Valencian region.

| <b>CRITERIA</b>                      |   | <b>Fulfilment of certification criteria by the candidate network</b>  |
|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| <b>I. Cultural route theme</b>       |   | The theme is representative of European values and identity, while remaining flexible enough to include other territories. Moreover, it connects discursively with values that appeal to coexistence: care (health and well-being) and cultural encounters (influences between pharmaceutical traditions).  |
| <b>II. Priority fields of action</b> | <b>Cooperation in research and development</b>                | The project is robust in defining protocols for coordinated action in crucial matters such as research, conservation, and cataloguing. Additionally, it stems from a solid scientific foundation built on multidisciplinary approaches.   |
|                                      | <b>Enhancement of memory, history and European heritage</b>   | AIS pays attention to a heritage and memory that have not always been considered. The importance of its proposal lies in the willingness to unite efforts for identification, preservation, research, cataloguing, and dissemination, given that it deals with an extremely fragile heritage.   |
|                                      | <b>Cultural and educational exchanges for young Europeans</b> | The proposed theme holds significant potential not only from a historical-cultural perspective, but also from an experiential standpoint. However, a joint strategy in the cultural and educational realm needs to be defined, as actions have mostly been individualized until now.  |
|                                      | <b>Contemporary cultural and artistic practice</b>            | Various initiatives linking medicinal materials with art, music, or gastronomy are being developed in different territories. Undoubtedly, the nature of this type of heritage allows for it. It is expected that these practices will become widespread throughout the network in the immediate future.   |
|                                      | <b>Cultural Tourism and Sustainable Cultural development</b>  | The proposal is based on a clear idea of the type of tourism it aims to promote, centered on sustainability and territory awareness, particularly in rural areas. Partnerships with public and private entities are being woven to revive productive spaces (gardens and orchards) and to promote sustainable productions for commercialization.  |
| <b>III. Cultural Route Network</b>   |   | The legal and institutional structure of the AIS association is appropriate for achieving the goals outlined in its statutes. There is a certain diversity of represented countries and entity types, but it is advisable to expand and strengthen the network of members and visitable destinations, along with continuing decentralization and rotation of responsibilities.<br>The team has demonstrable experience in securing international, national, and regional funds, suggesting that financial solvency should be ensured. |
| <b>Communication Tools</b>           |   | The project has a defined image and clear criteria for its application. The website and dissemination materials are comprehensive and available in up to 7 languages. However, the communication strategy on social media should be reinforced.   |

## **5. List of references**

The AIS team submitted all documents required for the evaluation. Additional information was received during and after the field visit, requested by the evaluator.

### **1\_APPLICATION FORM**

- AIS\_Certification form\_FINAL AIS
- Annex 2\_Responsible Network
- Annex 3\_Conformity
- Annex 4\_Activities
- Annex 5\_Visibility
- Annex 8\_Communication materials

### **2\_STATUTES**

- a) Statutes\_REGISTRO NACIONAL DE ASOCIACIONES
- b) STATUTES translation signed

### **3\_MEMBERS**

- b) Updated list of Members of de Network

### **4\_GENERAL ASSEMBLIES**

- 20230125\_General assembly
- 20230703\_Extraordinary assembly

### **5\_FINANCIAL INFORMATION**

- a) Current operational budget
- b) 3-year Budget forecast
- c) Extra-budgetary funding received for implementation of specific activities

### **6\_ACTIVITIES (3-year programme of Activities forecast)**

- Activities-AIS

## **6. Annex 1: Expert field visit and interviews with the network management and members**

### FIELD VISIT

Rome. Presentation of the local itinerary 'Percorso dello speziale' in the frame of the congress 'Nutrire l'Incontro', coordinated by Carles Tarrassó for the Royal Spanish Academy in Rome (<https://www.nutrirelincontro.com/>).

Accompanied and facilitated by María Luisa Vázquez de Ágredos Pascual (Director of AIS, [director@aromassalutis.eu](mailto:director@aromassalutis.eu)).

SUNDAY, 24 September 2023

15.45 - Tiber Island

16.30 - Medicinal garden of the Monastery of Santa Cecilia in Trastevere  
(courtesy of Aromas itinerarium Salutis)

17.30 - Ancient spice shop of Santa Maria dell'Orto: flavours, aromas and health care (courtesy of Aromas itinerarium Salutis)

18.30 - Ancient spice shop of Santa Maria della Scala  
(HYGEIA-CHMN project; Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación de España-NextGeneration UE)

19.30 - Closing of Phase I - The Apothecary's Route in Rome

MONDAY, 25 September 2023

9.30 - Ancient apothecary's shop of Santa Cecilia in Trastevere (now in the Vatican Museums)  
(courtesy of Aromas itinerarium Salutis)

11.00 - Nobile Colegio Chimico Farmaceutico di Roma: a window onto the Rome of Galen  
(courtesy of Aromas itinerarium Salutis)

11.45 - We begin a tour of the Royal Academy of Spain in Rome, making a brief 15-minute stop at the Hospitale della Santissima Trinità dei Pellegrini (next to Via Giulia and Ponte Sixto), to discover an unknown place in the Rome of the apothecary, which today promotes art projects with the Venice Biennale (courtesy of Aromas itinerarium Salutis)

13.00 - Royal Spanish Academy in Rome: the last station of the Rome of the apothecary (historical memory recovered)

16:00 - Institutional greeting

16:15 - Round table Biodiversity and sensory perception: a dialogue between gastronomy, culture and conviviality

Nuria Blaya, Mónica Gutiérrez, John Regefalk, and Marisa Vázquez de Ágredos. Moderated by Carles Tarrassó

17:45 - Presentation of Dulcis in Fundo, multisensorial performance around the idea of the filled void

Sonia Andressano, M<sup>a</sup> Ángeles Vila and Carles Tarrassó, presented by Raffaella Perna

18:15 - End of the day

TUESDAY, 26 September 2023

10:00 – Meeting with Maria Concetta Valenziano. Mother Abbess of the Monastery of Santa Cecilia in Trastevere and part of the Board of Directors of AIS.

11:30 - Citrus collections from Italy and Spain: examples of admiration, conservation and exchange.

Vicente Todolí, Alberto Tintori, Mónica Gutiérrez

12:15 - Cooked landscapes: woven links with the local and the wild.

Culinary presentation by Alessandro Miocchi

13:15 - Break

15:15 - Basque Culinary Center's contemporary vegetable cooking workshop

John Regefalk

17:15 - End of the day

## WEDNESDAY, 27 September 2023

11:00 – Meeting with Ángeles Albert. Director of the Royal Spanish Academy in Rome. Future member of the AIS network.

12:00 - Meeting with Roberta Alteri. Funzionario Archeologo (Area III, F1), Parco Colosseo, Ministero dei Beni e delle Attività Culturali. Future member of the AIS network.

## INTERVIEWS

18<sup>th</sup> September 2023

María Luisa Vázquez de Ágredos Pascual (Director of AIS)

[director@aromassalutis.eu](mailto:director@aromassalutis.eu)

Simona Tardi (Executive Secretary of AIS)

[simona.tardi@aromassalutis.eu](mailto:simona.tardi@aromassalutis.eu)

Cristina Expósito de Vicente (Secretary of AIS)

[cristina.exposito@aromassalutis.eu](mailto:cristina.exposito@aromassalutis.eu)

20<sup>th</sup> October 2023 (online)

Alejandra Gómez Martín (AIS member)

Spain / Museo de la Farmacia Hispana

+34 616 37 50 13

[museofar@ucm.es](mailto:museofar@ucm.es)

20<sup>th</sup> October 2023 (online)

Ana-Maria Gruia (Steering Committee)

Romania / National Museum of Transylvanian History, Cluj-Napoca

+40 741 114 389

[ana.gruia@gmail.com](mailto:ana.gruia@gmail.com)

25<sup>th</sup> October 2023 (online)

Miguel Álvarez Soaje (AIS member)

Spain / Asociación de Amigos del Monasterio de Sobrado

+34 626 30 34 80

[malvarezsoaje@gmail.com](mailto:malvarezsoaje@gmail.com)

26<sup>th</sup> October 2023 (online)

Kristina Pandža (Scientific Committee)

Croatia / City Museum of Rijeka

+385 51315710

[kristina.Pandza@muzej-rijeka.hr](mailto:kristina.Pandza@muzej-rijeka.hr)

2<sup>nd</sup> November 2023 (online)  
Catarina Miguel (Scientific Committee)  
Portugal /Universidade Evora  
+351 962 920 567  
[cpm@uevora.pt](mailto:cpm@uevora.pt)

14<sup>th</sup> November 2023  
María Luisa Vázquez de Ágredos Pascual (Director of AIS)  
[director@aromassalutis.eu](mailto:director@aromassalutis.eu)  
Simona Tardi (Executive Secretary of AIS)  
[simona.tardi@aromassalutis.eu](mailto:simona.tardi@aromassalutis.eu)

## **7. Annex 2: Expert assessment checklist**



| EXPERT ASSESSMENT CHECK-LIST |  |   |   |    |                   |
|------------------------------|--|---|---|----|-------------------|
| QUESTIONS                    |  |   | Yes   | No | Comments (if any) |
| 3.1 THEME                    | 1  | Does the theme of the Route represent a common value (historical, cultural, or heritage) to several European countries? | 1   |    |                   |
|                              | 2  | Does the theme of the route offer a solid basis for youth cultural and educational exchanges?                           | 1   |    |                   |
|                              | 3  | Does the theme of the route offer a solid basis for innovative activities?  | 1   |    |                   |
|                              | 4  | Does the theme of the route offer a solid basis for cultural tourism products development?                              | 1   |    |                   |
|                              | 5  | Has the theme been researched/developed by academics/experts from different regions of Europe?                          | 1   |    |                   |
| 3.2 FIELDS OF ACTION         | 3.2.1 Co-operation in research and development | 6   | Does the Route offer a platform for co-operation in research and development of European cultural themes/values?                              | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 7   | Does the Route play a unifying role around major European themes, enabling dispersed knowledge to be brought together?                        | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 8   | Does the Route show how these themes are representative of European values shared by several European countries?                              | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 9   | Does the Route illustrate the development of these values and the variety of forms they may take in Europe?                                   | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 10  | Does the Route have a network of universities and research center working on its theme at the European level?                                 | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 11  | Does the Route have a multidisciplinary Scientific Committee?   | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 12  | Does the Scientific Committee work on its theme at the European level?  | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 13  | Does the Scientific Committee carry out research and analysis of the issues relevant to its theme and/or activities on the theoretical level? | 1  |                   |
|                              |  | 14  | Does the Scientific Committee carry out research and analysis of the issues relevant to its theme and/or activities on the practical level?   | 1  |                   |

|  |    |  |   |   |  |
|--|----|--|---|---|--|
| 3.2.2 Enhancement of the memory, history and European heritage | 15 | Do the Route activities take into account and explain the historical significance of tangible and intangible European heritage ?   | 1 |   |  |
|  | 16 | Do the Route activities promote the values of the Council of Europe?   | 1 |   |  |
|  | 17 | Do the Route activities promote the brand of the Cultural Routes of the Council of Europe?   | 1 |   |  |
|  | 18 | Does the route work in conformity with international charters and conventions on cultural heritage preservation?   | 1 |   |  |
|  | 19 | Do the Route activities identify, preserve and develop European heritage sites in rural destinations?  | 1 |   |  |
|  | 20 | Do the Route activities identify, preserve and develop European heritage sites in industrial areas in the process of economic restructuring?   |   | 0 |  |
|  | 21 | Do the Route activities valorize the heritage of ethnic or social minorities in Europe?  |   | 0 |  |
|  | 22 | Do the Route activities contribute to a better understanding of the concept of cultural heritage, the importance of its preservation and sustainable development?  | 1 |   |  |
|  | 23 | Do the Route activities enhance physical and intangible heritage, explain its historical significance and highlight its similarities in the different regions of Europe?   | 1 |   |  |
|  | 24 | Do the Route activities take account of and promote the charters, conventions, recommendations and work of the Council of Europe, UNESCO and ICOMOS relating to heritage restoration, protection and enhancement, landscape and spatial planning (European Cultural Convention, Faro convention, European Landscape Convention, World Heritage Convention, ...)? | 1 |   |  |
|  | 25 | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to develop a better understanding of the concept of European citizenship?   | 1 |   |  |
| 3.2.3 Cultural and educational exchanges of young Europeans    | 26 | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to emphasize the value of new personal experience through visiting diverse places?  | 1 |   |  |

|  |   |    |   |   |   |  |
|--|---|----|---|---|---|--|
|  |   | 27 | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to encourage social integration and exchanges of young people from different social backgrounds and regions of Europe?                             | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 28 | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to offer collaborative opportunities for educational institutions at various levels?   |   | 0 |  |
|  |   | 29 | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to place the emphasis on personal and real experiences through the use of places and contacts?   |   | 0 |  |
|  |   | 30 | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to set up pilot schemes with several participating countries?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 31 | Are the youth exchanges (cultural and educational) planned to give rise to co-operation activities which involve educational institutions at various levels?  |   | 0 |  |
|  | 3.2.4 Contemporary cultural and artistic practice | 32 | Do the Route's cultural activities promote intercultural dialogue and multidisciplinary exchange between various artistic expressions in European countries?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 33 | Do the Route's cultural activities encourage artistic projects that establish links between cultural heritage and contemporary culture?   | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 34 | Do the Route's cultural activities encourage innovative cultural and contemporary art practices* connecting them with the history of skills development?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 35 | Do the Route's cultural activities encourage collaboration between culture amateurs and professionals via relevant activities and networks creation?**  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 36 | Do the Route's cultural activities encourage debate and exchange - in a multidisciplinary and intercultural perspective - between various cultural and artistic expressions in different countries of Europe? |   | 0 |  |
|  |   | 37 | Do the Route's cultural activities encourage activities and artistic projects which explore the links between heritage and contemporary culture?  | 1 |   |  |

|  |   |    |   |   |   |  |
|--|---|----|---|---|---|--|
|  |   | 38 | Do the Route's cultural activities highlight the most innovative and creative practices?  |   | 0 |  |
|  |   | 39 | Do the Route's cultural activities link these innovative and creative practices with the history of skills development?***  | 1 |   |  |
|  | 3.2.5 Cultural tourism and sustainable cultural development | 40 | Do the Route's activities (relevant to sustainable cultural tourism development) assist in local, regional, national and/ or European identity formation?   | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 41 | Do the Route's activities (relevant to sustainable cultural tourism development) actively involve 3 major means to raise awareness of their cultural projects: print, broadcast and social media? | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 42 | Do the Route's activities promote dialogue between urban and rural communities and cultures?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 43 | Do the Route's activities promote dialogue between developed and disadvantaged regions?   | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 44 | Do the Route's activities promote dialogue between different regions (south, north, east, west) of Europe?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 45 | Do the Route's activities promote dialogue between majority and minority (or native and immigrant) cultures?  |   | 0 |  |
|  |   | 46 | Do the Route's activities open possibilities for co-operation between Europe and other continents?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 47 | Do the Route's activities draw decision makers' attention to the necessity of protecting heritage as part of the sustainable development of the territory?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 48 | Do the Route's activities aim to diversify cultural product, service and activities offers?   | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 49 | Do the Route's activities develop and offer quality cultural tourism products, services or activities transnationally?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 50 | Do the Route's activities develop partnerships with public and private organisations active in the field of tourism?  | 1 |   |  |
|  |   | 51 | Did the network prepare and use tools along the route to raise the number of visitors and the economic impacts of the route on the territories crossed?   |   | 0 |  |

|                   |             |    |  |   |  |  |
|-------------------|-------------|----|--|---|--|--|
| 3.4<br>COMMUNICAT | 3.3 NETWORK | 52 | Does the Route represent a network involving at least three Council of Europe's member states?                                 | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 53 | Was the theme of the route chosen and accepted by the network members?   | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 54 | Was the conceptual framework of the route founded on a scientific basis?   | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 55 | Does the network involve several Council of Europe member states in all or part of its projects?                               | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 56 | Is the network financially sustainable?  | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 57 | Does the network have a legal status (association, federation of associations, EEIG,...)?                                      | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 58 | Does the network operate democratically?   | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 59 | Does the network specify its objectives and working methods?   | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 60 | Does the network specify the regions concerned by the project?   | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 61 | Does the network specify its partners and participating countries?   | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 62 | Does the network specify the fields of action involved?  | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 63 | Does the network specify its overall strategy in the short and long term?  | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 64 | Does the network identify potential participants and partners in Council of Europe member states and/or other world countries? | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 65 | Does the network provide details of its financing (financial reports and/or activity budgets)?                                 | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 66 | Does the network provide details of its operational plan?  | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 67 | Does the network append the basic text(s) confirming its legal status?   | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 68 | Does the Route have its own logo?  | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 69 | Do all partners of the network use the logo on their communication tools?  | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 70 | Does the Route have its own dedicated website ?  | 1 |  |  |
|                   |             | 71 | Is it the website available in English and French?   | 1 |  |  |

|  |   |    |  |    |   |  |
|--|---|----|--|----|---|--|
|  |   | 72 | Is it the website available in other languages?  | 1  |   |  |
|  |   | 73 | Does the network use effectively social networks and web 2.0?  | 1  |   |  |
|  |   | 74 | Does the network publish brochures on the Route?   | 1  |   |  |
|  |   | 75 | If yes, are the brochures available in English?  | 1  |   |  |
|  |   | 76 | If yes, are the brochures available in French?   |    | 0 |  |
|  | For certified Cultural<br>Routes of the Council of<br>Europe only | 77 | Is the title of “Cultural Route of the Council of Europe” present on all communication materials (including press releases, webpages, publications, etc.)? |    |   |  |
|  |   | 78 | Is the certification logo present on all communication materials?  |    |   |  |
|  |   | 79 | Is the certification logo used in accordance to the guidelines for its use (size and position,...)?  |    |   |  |
|  |   | 80 | Are the logos (Cultural Route + certification logo) provided to all the members of the Route?  |    |   |  |
|  |   | 81 | Does the Council of Europe certification logo appear on road signs/ boards indicating the cultural route?  |    |   |  |
|  | SCORE   |    |  | 66 | 0 |  |

## **8. Annex 3: List of acronyms, figures and tables**