# ANNUAL REPORT ON ECRI'S ACTIVITIES covering the period from 1 January to 31 December 2019







Photos: Shutterstock



Strasbourg, March 2020

Prefac	е		5
Main t	rend	ds	7
ECRI's	s ac	tivities in 2019	16
	1.	Country-by-country approach	16
	2.	Work on general themes	18
	3.	Relations with civil society	18
	4.	ECRI's 25th Anniversary High-level Conference	e.20
	5. and	Cooperation with equality bodies to combat rac racial discrimination	
	6.	Other activities	22
	7.	Communication strategy	23
		ion with relevant bodies of the Council of nd other international organisations	25
Appen	ndix	I – Membership of ECRI	31
Appen	ndix	II – Secretariat of ECRI	39
Appen	ndix	III - Meetings held by ECRI in 2019	41
Appen	ndix	IV - List of publications	43

# **Preface**

The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) is a mechanism which was established by the first Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe member states. The decision to establish ECRI is contained in the Vienna Declaration adopted by the first Summit on 9 October 1993. On 13 June 2002, the Committee of Ministers adopted an autonomous Statute for ECRI and thus consolidated its role as an independent human rights monitoring mechanism specialised in questions relating to racism and intolerance.

ECRI's task is to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at the level of greater Europe and from the perspective of the protection of human rights. ECRI's action covers all necessary measures to combat violence, discrimination and prejudice faced by persons or groups of persons, on grounds of "race", colour, language, religion, citizenship, national or ethnic origin, sexual orientation and gender identity.

ECRI's members are appointed on the basis of their in-depth knowledge in the field of combating intolerance. They should have high moral authority and recognised expertise in dealing with racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. They serve in their individual capacity, are independent and impartial in fulfilling their mandate, and do not receive any instructions from their government.

ECRI's statutory activities are: country monitoring; work on general themes; and relations with civil society. ECRI's strategy for constantly enhancing its activities is to take a step-by-step approach, building on the work it has already accomplished by evaluating, consolidating and extending its action.

# Main trends

### Introduction

- 1. ECRI has been working to combat racism and intolerance for 25 years. In September 2019, ECRI celebrated this milestone anniversary with an international high-level conference "On the Road to Effective Equality" in Paris under the French Presidency of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe. While much progress has been achieved over the past two and a half decades to reduce racism in Europe and build inclusive and tolerant societies. ECRI and its partners are fully aware of the many tasks and challenges that still lie ahead and demonstrated their renewed resolve to continue their joint efforts to promote tolerance, equality and a Europe free of racism. To this end, ECRI published its Roadmap to Effective Equality that contains ECRI's work programme for the years to come and called on states to intensify their efforts to implement its member recommendations.
- 2. Each year, as an introduction to its annual report, ECRI outlines the main trends in the fields of racism<sup>1</sup>, racial discrimination<sup>2</sup>, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance in Europe. The purpose of this exercise is to show the context in which ECRI must continue its efforts and step up its action in the future. The precise characteristics and extent of these trends, observed in the course of ECRI's various activities, vary from region to region and country to country. They are, however, sufficiently widespread to justify a special mention.

# Xenophobic populism

3. During 2019, heterogeneous political trends with regard to issues of concern to ECRI became visible across the continent. The elections to the European Union Parliament, for example, saw a further rise of ultra-nationalistic parties in some countries, while in others their expected electoral gains did not materialise or they even

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racism is the belief that a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin justifies contempt for a person or a group of persons, or the notion of superiority of a person or a group of persons.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racial discrimination is any differential treatment based on a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin, which has no objective and reasonable justification.

faced a substantial decline in their share of votes. Similar developments also occurred at national level in a number of countries. At the same time, it was noticeable that a growing number of mainstream political parties adopted restrictive policies with regard to migration and integration that were hitherto associated with right-wing ultra-nationalist parties. Hence, merely looking at the number of seats gained in parliamentary elections does not adequately reflect the increasing influence of ultra-nationalistic and xenophobic politics across Europe.

- The various election campaigns in 2019 also showed that 4. ultra-nationalistic, xenophobic, racist and homo-/transphobic hate speech was once again on the rise and increasingly permeates, and in many cases even sets the tone in, social media networks. Insulting and degrading remarks about members of minority groups that in the past would have been deemed unacceptable can now frequently be encountered on the Internet. Online content that challenges and threatens the overall principle of human dignity and equality also has a negative impact on discourse and behaviour outside the digital sphere and in day-to-day life in general. Furthermore, the simplistic, confrontational and often non-factual style of debate in online fora and social media leads to increased polarisation and inability to have a nuanced exchange of views in which different opinions are expressed in a respectful manner. This is especially problematic when it comes to certain contentious issues, such as migration, but also undermines the overall foundation of democratic discourse in society. In this respect, ECRI has continued calling on member states to draw inspiration from its General Policy Recommendation No. 15 on combating hate speech.
- 5. In addition to uncertainties and insecurities resulting from increased globalisation, growing interconnectedness at economic levels and a widely perceived loss of state control over many aspects of economic and social life, the persisting trend of cut-backs in the provision of social services and welfare support contributes to a growing sense of insecurity in certain parts of the population. Moves to achieve effective equality are also to be viewed in the context of material distribution. A growing feeling among the general public of being left behind by an economic and social "squeeze" also increases the number of people who consider equality for all as a threat to their already shrinking resources and who would perceive the inclusion of marginalised groups, such as migrants or Roma, to constitute further

unwanted competition in what is already seen as a highly competitive society. Similarly, even if there is no evidence that the arrival and integration of migrants into domestic labour markets result in a reduction of social rights, xenophobic nationalists continue to put forward the opposite argument. Successful inclusion of socially excluded groups cannot be achieved by playing one group against another. In contrast, achieving a distribution that is considered fair and equitable by a substantial majority of people concerned is generally seen as the way forward. A more pro-active approach to and support for inclusive education, in line with ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 10, would also help member states to tackle the issue.

## Racism in sports

6. In the realm of sport manifestations, racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and homophobia are prevalent. For example, in a number of countries monitored by ECRI, there have been instances of football matches having been suspended, individual supporters having been banned from games and sanctions having been applied to clubs because of racist expression at sporting events. However, there is an urgent necessity to take effective and firm measures as recommended in ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 12 on combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport.

# Equality bodies and civil society

Equality Bodies, which now exist in nearly all member states, 7. are an effective tool to promote equality and ensure that existing antidiscrimination legislation is fully applied at national level. ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 2 on Equality Bodies to combat racism and intolerance at national level, as revised in 2017, continues provide guidelines for strengthening and improving the independence and effectiveness of such institutions. A crucial role in this process is, however, the importance and standing that national governments attribute to the recommendations made by the equality bodies where these do not have the power to take binding decisions and impose sanctions. In many countries, the follow-up given by governments and public administrations to these recommendations remains grossly insufficient. This shortcoming has been pointed out in a number of ECRI country reports and has recently also been recognised by the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers as an

ongoing problem in its Recommendation CM/Rec(2019)6 on the development of the Ombudsman institution, which points to the need for reporting mechanisms for failure to accept or implement recommendations.

- 8. If equality bodies' findings and recommendations with regard to discrimination are not acted upon in a suitable manner, their credibility in the eyes of victims becomes seriously compromised. People experiencing discrimination in the future will be less likely to bring their case to Equality Bodies, potentially resulting in the erosion of their raison d'être.
- 9. Besides equality bodies, civil society organisations are the second column of advocacy for vulnerable groups of concern to ECRI. They have the advantage of often being in much closer and more direct contact with the public, in particular the communities most exposed to discrimination. Indeed, community-based NGOs have a much lower threshold for establishing contact. Furthermore, the individuals concerned would often trust NGOs associated with their community to a higher degree than an institution they might consider to be too distant.
- 10. This points to a two-fold need. On the one hand, Equality Bodies must be better enabled, including through financial and staffing resources, to conduct the substantial outreach work that is required in order to become a trusted intermediary and advocate for potential and actual victims. On the other hand, the important role of community-based organisations and civil society in general should be fully acknowledged and supported by governments at all levels.
- 11. In this context, a growing concern for ECRI is the increasingly hostile legal, verbal and sometimes even physical environment in which civil society organisations and human rights defenders operate in a number of member states. Portraying these organisations as threats to national interests and security is sometimes also followed by threats of violence aimed at intimidating and silencing those who work for and on behalf of vulnerable groups. Members of national, regional or local governments, parliamentarians and political leaders who openly support marginalised groups, such as migrants or LGBTI persons, are frequently subjected to hate speech or hate-motivated violence. It is self-evident that such developments are not only a threat to the human rights of the individuals concerned, but also strike at the very heart of democratic societies.

<u>.....</u>

### Anti-Black racism

In the context of xenophobic rhetoric and resentment, persons who are visibly different from the majority population are particularly affected. Members of Europe's Black communities, for example, not only face long-standing prejudice and discrimination, but they are also subjected to hatred and even hate-motivated violence which is fed by a growing rejection of current migration from Africa to Europe. Old stereotypes, often rooted in colonial legacies, are mixed with recurrent anti-immigration sentiments and result in an environment that in many member states makes effective equality for Black persons unlikely. As already mentioned in previous annual reports, the UN-initiated international Decade for People of African Descent (2015-2024) is still insufficiently used by governments as a positive tool to address this problem and reach out to the general public in order to overcome existing anti-Black stereotypes and prejudices. NGOs working to achieve equality for persons of African descent have often limited access to relevant funding from their governments.

## Islamophobia

13. Xenophobic nationalism continues to be expressed in various forms of Islamophobia, frequently portraying Islam as a religion alien to the national culture and identity of many member states. Such rhetoric is often only the first step towards exclusion of and discrimination against Muslims, which stands in sharp contrast to the universality of human rights. It also contributes to making Muslims wearing visible signs of their religion particularly vulnerable to intolerance, hate speech and even hate-motivated violence. In many cases, intersectional discrimination further worsens the situation, for example for Black Muslims or Muslim women. Against this background, ECRI's 2019 Roadmap envisages initiating a process leading to a revision of General Policy Recommendation No. 5 on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims.

### **Antisemitism**

Previous years had already seen a marked increase in antisemitic hatred. This dangerous trend continued in several member states during 2019. Violence, including extreme forms, against Jews and Jewish institutions is still a shocking reality. As already described in previous annual reports, violence is often triggered by a poisonous rhetoric spread by neo-Nazis and other political and religious extremists. When it comes to the Middle East conflict specifically, ECRI has repeatedly underlined that criticism of Israel cannot be considered per se antisemitic, as long as it is expressed in the same way as criticism against other states. It is, however, unacceptable when criticism of the Israeli government is used to stir up hatred against all Jewish people in Israel and elsewhere, including by allegations of a "Jewish conspiracy" at a global level. This image, which builds on century-old stereotypes, fuels resentment against all Jewish persons. In this context, ECRI is planning to initiate a revision of its General Policy Recommendation No. 9 on the fight against antisemitism.

### Roma and Travellers

15 High levels of anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma continue to be experienced in many member states. The perpetuation of negative stereotypes and prejudice, often resulting in open hatred and discrimination, continues to pose a serious obstacle to better social integration of Roma and Travellers and to building inclusive societies. In spite of a large number of national strategies and action plans, support programmes and project activities, the situation for many of Europe's Roma and Travellers has not substantially improved. While in some countries sector-specific progress has been achieved, for example with regard to enrolment rates of Roma children in pre-school or primary school education, a turning point towards effectively ending the social marginalisation of Roma and Travellers remains elusive. In many countries, ECRI observes that the elaborate development of strategies and extensive central-level consultations have not always been translated into tangible results on the ground. Current actions appear to be insufficient and unable to overcome the multi-lavered and interlinked root causes of social exclusion which are most visible in the areas of education, employment, housing and health. The vicious circle of inter-generational poverty, marginalisation and discrimination has still not often enough been broken, with women and girls being particularly affected, especially in the areas of

.....

education and employment. Governments of Council of Europe member states should therefore redouble their efforts to address these issues and make the best use of ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No. 13 on Combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma.

### LGBTI persons

The situation for LGBTI persons varies considerably across 16. the continent. While, for example, in many countries not only registered same-sex partnerships exist but also same-sex marriage has been introduced, a number of other countries have moved in the opposite direction and have included provisions in their constitutions defining marriage expressly as a union between a woman and a man. A growing number of countries have also adopted legislation that grants legal gender recognition to transgender persons and some countries have introduced legislation to protect the rights of intersex persons. However, LGBTI persons in some countries also continue to face harassment, threats and even violence, especially if they are promoting LGBTI rights in public. In many such cases, the response given by law enforcement agencies is weak. This may be the result of a lack of will or a lack of awareness of the situations which make members of LGBTI communities particularly vulnerable. The resulting impunity often creates an environment of fear in which effective equality and access to rights are not a reality for LGBTI persons. The state's obligation to protect everyone's human rights irrespective of sexual orientation or gender identity therefore remains unfulfilled. In this connection, ECRI is planning to develop a new General Policy Recommendation on combating discrimination and intolerance against LGBTI persons in the coming years.

## Artificial Intelligence

- 17. There have also been growing concerns about the impact of Artificial Intelligence (AI) on societies in general, and with regard to discrimination in particular. With the rapid inroads AI is currently making into all aspects of human life, these questions can and should not be ignored. ECRI held an exchange of views with an expert researcher on this topic in June 2019 and subsequently highlighted various AI-related issues at its 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary conference.
- 18. It appears so far that cases of deliberate discrimination through AI are rare. However, examples of unintended and/or indirect discrimination multiply. The latter are usually due to an unrecognised

bias among the designers of AI systems themselves, lack of transparency in AI processes, biased and limited training data (which does not sufficiently include members of minority groups), or lack of mechanisms to detect and prevent discrimination. ECRI has emphasised in its Roadmap the need to raise awareness among all relevant stakeholders, including AI-industries, independent bodies tasked with ensuring non-discrimination or data protection, governments and civil society. In this context, ECRI is ready to contribute to the work of the newly established Council of Europe Ad Hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAHAI).

## Looking forward

- 19. Encouraged by the overwhelming support it received during its 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary conference, including for the future implementation of its Roadmap, ECRI will continue to work closely with all member states, other Council of Europe bodies, its external partners and relevant stakeholders to address existing problems with regard to racism and intolerance in Europe.
- In October 2019, ECRI's Chair, Jean-Paul Lehners, held a 20. meeting with the President of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE), Liliane Maury Pasquier, to discuss possible parliamentary follow-up to ECRI's 25th anniversary conference. This concerned in particular the need for parliamentarians enhance their role in improving follow-up to ECRI's recommendations and to any future contribution from ECRI to the process leading to the revision of the Charter for European Political Parties for a Non-Racist Society on the basis of its General Policy Recommendation No. 15 on Combating Hate Speech. On the latter issue, it should be recalled that, in its Resolution 2275 (2019), the Parliamentary Assembly considered that ECRI's anniversary provided a good opportunity to update the Charter and to relaunch it. In its Roadmap to Effective Equality, ECRI expressed readiness to contribute to this process.
- 21. A few weeks after ECRI's anniversary conference, the Committee of Ministers showed its support for ECRI and its work. It encouraged member states to take further action in the light of ECRI's Roadmap and to introduce an effective system to ensure the implementation of ECRI's recommendations. In this context, the setting-up of an intergovernmental structure in the field of anti-discrimination was considered by the Council of Europe's Secretary

.....

General, Maria Pejčinović Burić, to be highly complementary by guiding and supporting the efforts of member states, reinforcing thematic exchanges, enabling peer review of experience and good practices and ensuring an effective implementation of ECRI recommendations. ECRI stands ready to participate in this important work.

# ECRI's activities in 2019

# 1. Country-by-country approach

- 22. ECRI's statutory activities comprise firstly country monitoring work. ECRI closely examines the situation in each of the member states of the Council of Europe and draws up suggestions and proposals as to how the problems it has identified might be overcome. The aim is to formulate helpful and well-founded recommendations, which may assist governments in taking concrete and practical steps to counter racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance.
- 23. ECRI's reports are first sent in draft form to the member states concerned for confidential dialogue. Their contents are reviewed in light of the national authorities' comments. They are then finally adopted and transmitted to the governments of the member states concerned, through the intermediary of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.
- 24. ECRI's country-by-country approach concerns all Council of Europe member states on an equal footing. The reports for the first round were completed in late 1998. From January 1999 to the end of December 2002, ECRI worked on the second round of its country-by-country approach. From January 2003 to the end of December 2007, ECRI worked on the third round of its country-by-country approach. From January 2008 until September 2017, ECRI worked on its fourth round of country monitoring. This round differed from the previous ones in that it introduced the interim follow-up mechanism: ECRI requested implementation for up to three specific recommendations and asked the member state concerned to provide information in this connection within two years from the publication of the report.
- 25. ECRI began its fifth round of country monitoring in 2013. This focuses on certain topics for in-depth analysis in all member states: legislative issues, hate speech, racist and homo/transphobic violence and integration policies. In addition, each report deals with a number of topics specific to each country. These address any other major "racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism or intolerance" issues in the country concerned. Interim follow-up recommendations not implemented or only partially implemented

during the fourth cycle are followed up as well. Finally, under its mandate to monitor intolerance against vulnerable groups, ECRI addresses discrimination against LGBT communities in the section on country-specific issues. In 2019, ECRI published conclusions on the implementation of the interim follow-up recommendations it had made in its fifth round reports, published in 2016, namely on Armenia, Azerbaijan, Cyprus, France, Georgia, Italy, Lithuania, Monaco, North Macedonia, Turkey and the United Kingdom.

- 26. In order to obtain as full a picture as possible, a contact visit is organised before the drafting of each new report. The visits provide an opportunity for ECRI Rapporteurs to meet officials from the various ministries and public authorities dealing with issues within ECRI's remit. They also allow Rapporteurs to meet representatives of NGOs working in the field, as well as independent experts and other persons concerned by the fight against racism and intolerance.
- 27. In 2019, ECRI published seven fifth-round country monitoring reports on Finland, Ireland, Latvia, the Netherlands, Romania, the Russian Federation and Slovenia.
- 28. All reports published in 2019 have been translated into the national language(s) of the country concerned and steps have been taken to ensure that they are circulated as widely as possible among stakeholders at domestic level.
- 29. ECRI's reports received considerable media coverage. Reactions to these reports show how topical the issues discussed therein are and how urgent it is to ensure follow-up to the recommendations contained in them.
- 30. In 2019, ECRI started work on its sixth cycle of country monitoring. This cycle focuses on three main themes: effective equality and access to rights; hate speech and hate-motivated violence; and integration and inclusion. The reports also deal with topics specific to each country, including action taken to implement the interim follow-up recommendations adopted in the context of the fifth monitoring cycle.
- 31. In 2019, ECRI carried out seven contact visits for the preparation of its sixth cycle country monitoring reports, in Albania, Austria, Belgium, the Czech Republic, Germany, Slovakia and Switzerland.

32. To be able to maintain this rhythm of visits and the quality of the work that is expected of it under its Statute, ECRI needs a Secretariat with sufficient resources and expertise. This is an important condition for the effective implementation of ECRI's Roadmap.

# 2. Work on general themes

General Policy Recommendations

- 33. ECRI's General Policy Recommendations, the second part of its statutory activities, are addressed to the governments of all member states; they cover important areas of current concern in the fight against racism and intolerance. They are intended to serve as guidelines for policy-makers when drawing up national strategies, programmes and projects.
- 34. ECRI has adopted 16 General Policy Recommendations on very important themes, which have been published in several languages.
- 35. During the year, ECRI continued to translate some of the abridged versions of its General Policy Recommendations (containing the key points and presented in an attractive format for use by the general public) into various national languages for specific events. In 2019, these abridged versions continued to be widely distributed for use at both internal and external events.
- 36. At its 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Conference, ECRI announced that it was necessary to update its general policy recommendations on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims and on the fight against antisemitism and to prepare a new general policy recommendation to combat intolerance and discrimination against LGBTI persons.

# 3. Relations with civil society

- 37. Combating racism and intolerance can only be effective if the message filters down to society in general. Awareness-raising and a communication strategy are, therefore, essential. ECRI attaches great importance to this third part of its statutory activities.
- 38. In 2019, ECRI participated in events organised by several civil society organisations on various themes.

- 39. On 4-5 February, ECRI participated in a master class and a conference on "How can we protect the rule of law in Europe", held by the research consortium ALL-YOUTH, in co-operation with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland, organised by Tampere University within the framework of the Finnish Presidency of the Council of Europe Committee of Ministers.
- 40. At its 79<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting (Strasbourg, 18-21 June 2019), ECRI held an exchange of views with Mr Frederik Zuiderveen Borgesius on his study on "Discrimination, artificial intelligence and algorithmic decision-making".
- 41. ECRI participated in an international conference on "LGBTI People and violence in Europe: studying attitudes, changing minds", which took place in Budapest (Hungary) on 26-27 September. The conference was organised by the University of Brescia (Italy), Warsaw (Poland), Háttér Society (Hungary), in co-operation with the National University of Public Service (Hungary), within the framework of the EU-funded project Call It Hate.
- 42. ECRI took part in a conference entitled "The rise of online hate speech as a new alarming global social phenomenon: reasons and remedies", organised by the Arci association, coordinator of the project "REACT Respect and Equality: Acting and Communicating Together", on 15 October in Brussels. ECRI's Chair participated in the International Meeting of Special Envoys and Coordinators Combating Antisemitism, organised by the World Jewish Congress on 28-29 October in Munich (Germany). He also took part in the plenary meeting of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) that took place in Luxembourg city from 2 to 5 December.

Organisation of national round tables and other events in member states

43. As an important tool to facilitate dialogue between state and non-state actors on issues related to the fight against racism and intolerance, ECRI organises national round tables following the publication of its country-specific monitoring reports. These events are addressed to various actors in civil society as well as to government officials in order to discuss jointly how best to promote the implementation of ECRI's recommendations.

- 44. ECRI jointly organised with the Council of Europe's Antidiscrimination Department and in co-operation with the Serbian Government and the Commissioner for the protection of equality, under the auspices of the French Presidency of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, a conference entitled "Combating Intolerance and Promoting Equality", which was held in Belgrade (Serbia) on 17 September 2019. The participants discussed national minority protection; the promotion and protection of LGBTI rights and combating hate speech.
- 45. ECRI organised a round table on "Combating racial discrimination and intolerance in North Macedonia" in Skopje on 14 November 2019, in co-operation with the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of North Macedonia and the European Union. This event brought together representatives of the government, the European Union, the Council of Europe, the Ombudsman's office, NGOs and the media. Participants discussed measures taken to follow up on the recommendations of ECRI's report on North Macedonia (7 June 2016) and standards and good practices in combating hate speech.
- 46. This round table brought more visibility to ECRI's work and ensured greater impact for its recommendations in North Macedonia.

# 4. ECRI's 25th Anniversary High-level Conference

- 47. To celebrate its 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary, ECRI held a high-level Conference entitled "On the Road to Effective Equality New responses to racism and intolerance needed?" The Conference was organised by ECRI under the French Presidency of the Council of Europe Committee of Ministers and took place in Paris (France) on 26-27 September 2019.
- 48. The Conference brought together members 10 governments, including three Ministers and three Deputy Ministers/State Secretaries, high representatives of the Council of Europe, international organisations, equality bodies, stakeholders and persons who had experienced racism such as former international footballer and promoter of diversity and inclusion Mr Clarence Seedorf. More than 300 participants contributed to this conference and to advancing on the road to effective equality in the 47 member states of the Council of Europe.

- 49. Participants examined both the progress and lacunae in achieving equality in Europe over the past 25 years, highlighting good practices. They also focused on the present and future challenges, such as achieving the sustainable inclusion of groups exposed to racism and intolerance and using the opportunities and controlling the risks posed by new technologies and the Internet.
- 50. At the end of its 25th Anniversary Conference, ECRI published its Roadmap to Effective Equality. In this strategic document, it defines its work priorities for the years to come and calls on the member states to intensify implementation of its recommendations, to rebut divisive discourse and to refrain from scapegoating specific sections of the population.
- 51. ECRI has given itself a number of priorities, including strengthening equality and access to rights, in particular through promoting the independence and effectiveness of equality bodies, inclusive education, access to rights of irregularly present migrants and LGBTI equality; combating hate speech and hate-motivated violence and promoting inclusive integration, particularly for migrants and Roma, and more specifically for children; highlighting and promoting good practices in the fight against racism and intolerance; taking account of cross-cutting issues where the intersection of national or ethnic origin, religion, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity and other grounds can lead to further discrimination and including a gender perspective in all its future work; updating its general policy recommendations on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims and on the fight against antisemitism; preparing a new recommendation to combat discrimination and intolerance against LGBTI persons; contributing to a review of the Charter of European Political Parties for a Non-Racist Society; highlighting the potential danger of racial profiling and discrimination that may arise as a result of the increasing use of new technologies such as artificial intelligence but also recommending ways to take advantage of the opportunities they bring in the fight against racism and intolerance.
- 52. ECRI's Roadmap calls on member states to implement ECRI's recommendations expeditiously and effectively, with the help of equality bodies for instance, and to promote equality and inclusiveness in the light of the increase in hate speech and intolerance in political discourse.

# 5. Cooperation with equality bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination

53. Equality bodies are strategic partners for ECRI. Representatives of nearly all Council of Europe member states' equality bodies, including national Ombudspersons and national human rights institutions participated in ECRI's 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Highlevel Conference held in Paris on 26-27 September 2019

### 6. Other activities

- 54. In 2019, ECRI actively participated in events organised by national and local authorities.
- 55. ECRI's Second Vice-Chair took part in the United States Helsinki Commission hearing, which took place in Washington D.C. (U.S.) on 10-15 September 2019, where she presented ECRI's work, specifically on General Policy Recommendation No. 15 on combating hate speech. She also took part in the Congressional Black Caucus Foundation's Annual Legislative Conference and gave a lecture on ECRI's work at Howard University.
- 56. At its 78th plenary meeting (Strasbourg, 2-4 April), ECRI held elections to a position of member of the Bureau. Mr Volodymyr Kulyk (member in respect of Ukraine) was elected for two years. ECRI also held elections for three members of the Working Group on relations with Civil Society and Equality Bodies. The following persons were elected for three years: Ms Sara Giménez Gímenez (member in respect of Spain); Ms Anhelita Kamenska (member in respect of Latvia); Mr Michael Whine (member in respect of the United Kingdom). Their terms of office began on 3 April 2019.
- 57. At its 80<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting (Strasbourg, 10-13 December), ECRI held elections to the positions of Chair, Vice-Chairs and two Bureau members. Ms Maria Daniella Marouda (member in respect of Greece) was elected Chair for two years. Mr Michael Farrell (member in respect of Ireland) was elected 1<sup>st</sup> Vice-Chair for one year. Ms Domenica Ghidei Biidu (member in respect of the Netherlands) was elected 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair for one year. Ms Tena Šimonović Einwalter (ECRI member in respect of Croatia) and Mr Michael Whine (ECRI member in respect of the United Kingdom) were elected Bureau members for two years. During this plenary meeting, in the context of its Roadmap to Effective Equality, ECRI also established a Working

Group on the fight against antisemitism and a Working Group on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims.

# 7. Communication strategy

58. Activities such as the publication of ECRI's country reports and interim follow-up conclusions, its 25th Anniversary Conference, round tables and country visits attracted considerable media attention. More than 350 press articles covering ECRI's work were identified over the year. ECRI will continue to take further steps to strengthen its communication strategy. At its 79th plenary meeting (Strasbourg, 18-21 June 2019), ECRI held an exchange of views with Mr Nigel Smith, from the Council of Europe's Directorate of Communications, on 18 June on the use of social media by ECRI members. In November, ECRI's Secretariat took part in a training given by the Directorate of Communications in order to explore ways and means of drawing up a new communication strategy for ECRI.

# Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations

59. ECRI participated in and contributed to many events as part of its co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations.

# **Council of Europe**

- 60. On 26-27 February 2019, ECRI took part in a High-Level Conference co-organised by the Finnish Presidency of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers and the Council of Europe entitled "Governing the Game Changer Impacts of artificial intelligence development on human rights, democracy and the rule of law".
- 61. On 19 September 2019, ECRI took part in an expert seminar on strengthening social rights in Europe, organised by the Department of the European Social Charter, under the auspices of the French Presidency of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.
- 62. In 2019, ECRI continued its co-operation with other Council of Europe monitoring bodies. On 4 February, ECRI's Chair attended the 7th annual meeting of Presidents of the Council of Europe's Monitoring and Advisory Bodies.
- 63. ECRI continued co-operation with the European Court of Human Rights in 2019. On 25 January, ECRI's Chair attended the European Court of Human Rights' Judicial Seminar 2019 on Strengthening Confidence in the Judiciary, following by a Solemn Hearing of the Court. On 10 December, ECRI held an exchange of views with the President and other representatives of the European Court of Human Rights, on the themes of addressing discrimination on grounds of religion, sexual orientation or gender identity and combating antisemitic and anti-Muslim hatred, including hate speech.
- 64. Ms Dunja Mijatović, the Commissioner for Human Rights, took part as a key-note speaker in ECRI's 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Conference.
- 65. ECRI's Chair attended the Commemorative ceremony for the 70th anniversary of the Council of Europe, held at the Strasbourg Opera House on 1 October 2019, with the participation of H.E. Mr Emmanuel Macron. President of the French Republic.

25

high representatives of the Council of Europe and of other international organisations, and members of the diplomatic corps, the Parliamentary Assembly, the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities and the European Court of Human Rights.

- On 16 October 2019, ECRI's Chair held an exchange of views 66. with the Committee of Ministers' Deputies on the basis of ECRI's annual report for 2018 and of its Roadmap to Effective Equality, published during the Conference organised in Paris on 26-27 September 2019 under the French Presidency of the Committee of Ministers on the occasion of ECRI's 25th anniversary. Following this exchange of views, ECRI's Chair held a meeting with Ms Marija Peičinović Burić, the Council of Europe's Secretary General. to discuss the implementation of ECRI's Roadmap to Effective Equality, including its intention to revise its General Policy Recommendations No. 9 on the fight against antisemitism and No. 5 on combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims. On 5 November 2019, ECRI participated in an informal exchange of views with the Committee of Ministers' Deputies on the protection of LGBTI persons from discrimination, hate speech and hate-motivated violence.
- 67. The Parliamentary Assembly and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities are represented at ECRI's plenary meetings and contribute to its work.
- 68. ECRI took part in a hearing on "Ethnic profiling in Europe: a matter of high concern", organised by the Parliamentary Assembly's Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination, which took place on 10 April 2019. On 14 October 2019, ECRI participated in a Parliamentary Conference entitled "Counter-strategies against hate speech where are we now and what is our goal?". The Conference was organised in Berlin by the No Hate Parliamentary Alliance of the Parliamentary Assembly's Committee on Equality and Non-Discrimination. ECRI's Chair took part in a conference organised by the French delegation of the Parliamentary Assembly in the French Senate in Paris on 14 November 2019, on the theme of "Human rights and democracy in the digital age: protecting personal data and responding to hate speech and misinformation on Internet".
- 69. ECRI also took part in the first meeting of the Ad hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence (CAHAI), held in Strasbourg on 18-20 November 2019.

- 70. On 2 April 2019, ECRI held an exchange of views with Mr Tomáš Boček, Special Representative of the Secretary General on migration and refugees on his Issue Paper on human rights aspects of immigrant and refugee integration policies.
- 71. In general, ECRI is regularly updated on the work of other Council of Europe bodies dealing with issues related to racism and intolerance. ECRI's Secretariat provides these bodies with information on ECRI's activities.

### **United Nations**

Universal Periodic Review (UPR)

72. In 2019, ECRI contributed to the 34<sup>th</sup> and 35<sup>th</sup> sessions of the Universal Periodical Review with its country reports and interim follow up conclusions.

### **UN Conventions**

73. ECRI reports make regular reference to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD). ECRI also calls upon states that have not yet made a declaration under Article 14 of ICERD, enabling individuals and groups of individuals to file petitions before the UN Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), to do so.

Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)

- 74. ECRI is regularly invited to participate in various meetings organised by the OHCHR and to submit contributions based on its monitoring and thematic work. Similarly, OHCHR staff members are regularly invited to ECRI's events.
- 75. The UN Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and the Chair of the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination both participated as key-note speakers in ECRI's 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Conference held in Paris on 26-27 September 2019.
- 76. ECRI took part in a workshop on the role of regional arrangements in combatting racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance and in the implementation of the Durban Declaration and Plan of Action, held in Geneva on 21-22 October 2019.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO)

77. UNESCO's Assistant Director-General for Social and Human Sciences participated as a key-note speaker in ECRI's 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Conference held in Paris on 26-27 September 2019.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)

78. ECRI has a close working relationship with UNHCR, facilitated by the UNHCR Representation to the European Institutions in Strasbourg. ECRI regularly receives input from UNHCR concerning its country visits, round tables and various legal issues.

# Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)

- 79. ECRI and the OSCE continue to involve each other in their conferences and meetings. The OSCE's Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) is systematically invited to and attends ECRI's national round tables and ECRI contributes regularly to OSCE/ODIHR meetings.
- 80. The Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination also Focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions participated in ECRI's 25th Anniversary Conference held in Paris on 26-27 September 2019.
- 81. ECRI participated in a workshop entitled "Never again: how to address hate crimes as early indicators of mass atrocities", organised by the OSCE/ODIHR in Geneva on 21 February 2019.
- 82. ECRI also participated in an expert meeting on addressing violations of rights at the border, racism, xenophobia and hate crime in the context of migration in South-Eastern Europe, organised by the OSCE in Zagreb on 16-17 April 2019.
- 83. ECRI and ODIHR continue to work closely on improving state and civil society responses to hate crime, an area of common interest also in the context of ECRI's sixth monitoring cycle, which focuses inter alia on hate speech and hate-motivated violence. The two bodies co-operate and benefit from each other's expertise and initiatives in this area. ODIHR systematically refers to ECRI's country-by-country

reports and General Policy Recommendations. ECRI uses ODIHR's hate crime data in all its country monitoring reports.

# **European Union**

### European Commission

- 84. The Directorate for Fundamental Rights and Rule of Law of the Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers of the European Commission and ECRI's Secretariat keep each other informed of important developments in their work and exchange information on subjects of common interest.
- 85. Emmanuel Crabit, Director, Fundamental Rights and Rule of Law, European Commission, participated in ECRI's 25th Anniversary Conference held in Paris on 26-27 September 2019.

### European Committee of the Regions

86. ECRI took part in a debate held during the European Committee of the Regions Plenary Session on "Europe is the place: promoting fundamental rights in cities and reasons for building an open society in 2019 and beyond", held in Brussels on 11 April 2019.

### Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA)

- 87. Cooperation between ECRI and FRA continued in 2019. ECRI's reports make regular reference to FRA's work. ECRI continued to provide inputs to the preparation of FRA's annual report and FRA provided inputs to the preparation of ECRI's country reports.
- 88. On 21 November 2019, ECRI participated in the first meeting of the Working Group on hate crime recording, data collection and encouraging reporting, coordinated by the FRA and co-hosted by the Dutch National Police in the Hague (Netherlands).

## European Ombudsman

89. During its 78<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting (Strasbourg, 2-4 April 2019), ECRI held an exchange of views with Ms Emily O'Reilly, European Ombudsman.

### Joint statement

90. ECRI, FRA and the OSCE/ODIHR issued a joint statement on 21 March 2019 to mark the international day for the elimination of racial discrimination. This statement called for renewed efforts to eliminate racial discrimination, especially in the workplace, because too many people with a particular ethnic or migrant background are still being held back in the job market, despite laws against racial discrimination and for equal opportunities in employment that have been in place for decades.

# Appendix I – Membership of ECRI<sup>3</sup>

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Arzu AGHDASI-SISAN	Azerbaijan	31 December 2022
Mr Christian ÅHLUND	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Sinisa BJEKOVIC	Montenegro	9 December 2023
Mr Bertil COTTIER	Switzerland	31 December 2023
Mr Patrice DAVOST	Monaco	6 December 2020
Mr Régis de GOUTTES	France	16 September 2024
Mr Vitaliano ESPOSITO	Italy	31 December 2022
Mr Michael FARRELL	Ireland	29 November 2021
Ms Inês FERREIRA LEITE	Portugal	25 September 2023
Mr Saša GAJIN	Serbia	6 November 2022
Ms Domenica GHIDEI BIIDU	Netherlands	7 October 2020
Ms Sara GIMÉNEZ GÍMENEZ	Spain	31 December 2022

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> All tables in this appendix reflect the situation on 31 December 2019.

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Marin GURIN	Republic of Moldova	26 March 2024
Ms Helena HOFMANNOVÁ	Czech Republic	31 December 2022
Ms Vasilika HYSI	Albania	31 December 2022
Ms Irena IVIEVA	Bulgaria	31 December 2022
Ms Barbara JOHN	Germany	31 December 2022
Mr Ögmundur JONASSON	Iceland	31 December 2022
Mr Imre JUHÁSZ	Hungary	31 December 2022
Mr Cristian JURA	Romania	31 December 2022
Ms Anhelita KAMENSKA	Latvia	25 October 2021
Ms Elżbieta KARSKA	Poland	2 May 2022
Ms Els KEYTSMAN	Belgium	31 December 2022
Ms Neža KOGOVŠEK ŠALAMON	Slovenia	31 December 2022
Mr Volodymyr KULYK	Ukraine	10 December 2023

------

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Renee LAIVIERA	Malta	17 November 2024
Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS	Luxembourg	8 February 2021
Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS	Lithuania	31 December 2022
Ms Ülle MADISE	Estonia	31 December 2022
Ms Maria Daniella MAROUDA	Greece	4 November 2020
Ms Elena MIHAJLOVA STRATILATI	North Macedonia	9 May 2024
Ms Kristina PARDALOS	San Marino	11 December 2023
Mr Andreas PASCHALIDES	Cyprus	31 December 2022
Ms Karin QUADERER	Liechtenstein	28 May 2024
Mr Jacint RIBERAYGUA CAELLES	Andorra	26 September 2021
Ms Elene RUSETSKAIA	Georgia	31 December 2022
Mr Gerald SCHÖPFER	Austria	27 February 2020
Ms Tena ŠIMONOVIĆ EINWALTER	Croatia	1 July 2024

Name	Member in respect of	Term of office expires
Mr Sergey SOKOLOVSKIY	Russian Federation	31 December 2022
Mr Aslak SYSE	Norway	31 December 2022
Mr Kadri Ecved TEZCAN	Turkey	31 December 2022
Ms Reetta TOIVANEN	Finland	1 July 2024
Mr Michal VAŠEČKA	Slovakia	31 December 2022
Mr Jens VEDSTED- HANSEN	Denmark	31 December 2022
Mr Michael WHINE	United Kingdom	25 September 2023
Vacant seat	Armenia	
Vacant seat	Bosnia and Herzegovina	

# **Deputies to ECRI members**

Name	Deputy in respect of	Term of office expires
Ms Costanza HERMANIN	Italy	31 December 2022
Ms Ketevan KHUTSISHVILI	Georgia	31 December 2022
Mr Paul Aarre LAPPALAINEN	Sweden	24 May 2020
Mr Alexis MARQUET	Monaco	6 December 2020
Ms Aránzazu MORETÓN TOQUERO	Spain	31 December 2022
Ms Fabienne ROSSLER	Luxembourg	8 February 2021
Mr François SANT'ANGELO	Belgium	31 December 2022
Mr Gjergj SINANI	Albania	31 December 2022

35

### **Observers to ECRI**

# Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe

Mr Titus CORLĂŢEAN Mr David DAVIES Mr Constantinos EFSTATHIOU

# Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe

Mr Varinder Singh BOLA

## **Holy See**

Mr Jean-Pierre MACHELON

## European Commission (European Union)

Madame Barbara NOLAN Monsieur Szabolcs SCHMIDT

### Mexico

Ms Alexandra HAAS PACIUC

#### ECRI's Bureau

Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS Chair member in respect of Luxembourg

Ms Maria Daniella MAROUDA Vice-Chair member in respect of Greece

Ms Domenica GHIDEI BIIDU Vice-Chair member in respect of the Netherlands

Mr Christian AHLUND Bureau member member in respect of Sweden

Mr Michael FARRELL Bureau member member in respect of Ireland

Mr Cristian JURA Bureau member member in respect of Romania

Mr Volodymyr KULYK Bureau member member in respect of Ukraine

## Appendix II – Secretariat of ECRI4

Mr Johan FRIESTEDT, Executive Secretary to ECRI

Ms Camilla TESSENYI, Administrator

Mr Thobias BERGMANN, Administrator

Mr Wolfram BECHTEL, Administrator

Ms Zeynep USAL KANZLER, Administrator

Ms Sophie KURT, Researcher/Project Officer

Ms Paula ECK-WALTERS, Administrative Assistant

Ms Sylvia LEHMANN, Assistant

Ms Maya RASMUSSEN, Assistant

External Relations (European Union and OSCE): Mr Stefano VALENTI, Administrator

#### Secretariat's address

Directorate General II - Democracy Directorate of Anti-discrimination Council of Europe 67075 STRASBOURG CEDEX France

Tel.: +33 (0) 3 90 21 46 62

E-mail Secretariat: ecri@coe.int

<sup>4</sup> This appendix reflects the situation on 31 December 2019.

39

# Appendix III - Meetings held by ECRI in 2019

#### **Plenary sessions**

- 2-4 April 2019
- 18-21 June 2019
- 10-13 December 2019

#### **Bureau meetings**

- 1 April 2019
- 10 May 2019
- 17 June 2019
- 26 September 2019
- 9 December 2019

# Meetings of the Working Group on relations with Civil Society and Equality Bodies

- 1 April 2019
- 17 June 2019
- 9 December 2019

#### Conferences and other events:

- Belgrade, Serbia: 17 September 2019
  Conference on the Fight against Intolerance and the Promotion of Equality
- Paris, France: 26-27 September 2019
  High-level Conference organised on the occasion of ECRI's
  25th Anniversary under the French Presidency of the Council of Europe Committee of Ministers: "On the Road to Effective Equality New responses to racism and intolerance needed?"
- Skopje, North Macedonia: 14 November 2019
  Round Table on combating racial discrimination and intolerance in North Macedonia

### **Meetings of CBC Working Groups**

#### Preparation of contact visits:

· Albania: 4 April 2019 · Austria: 4 April 2019

• Czech Republic: 26 September 2019 9 December 2019 • Estonia: 12 December 2019 Norway: Slovak Republic: 17 June 2019

#### Amendments:

Albania: 10 December 2019 Austria: 10 December 2019 Belgium: 18 June 2019 · Finland: 2 April 2019 Germany: 18 June 2019 Switzerland: 18 June 2019

#### Interim follow-up:

Andorra: 19 June 2019 Armenia: 3 April 2019 · Bosnia and Herzegovina: 19 June 2019 11 December 2019 Denmark: Iceland: 19 June 2019 Luxembourg: 20 June 2019 Montenegro: 11 December 2019 Serbia: 11 December 2019 Ukraine: 11 December 2019

#### **Contact Visits**

Albania: 20-24 May 2019 Austria: 3-7 June 2019 Belgium: 11-15 February 2019

 Czech Republic: 25-29 November 2019 Germany: 28 January-1 February 2019

 Slovak Republic: 18-22 November 2019

11-15 February 2019 Switzerland:

## Appendix IV - List of publications

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.1: Combating racism, xenophobia antisemitism and intolerance (Strasbourg, 4 October 1996)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.2: Equality Bodies to combat racism and intolerance at national level (Strasbourg, 7 December 2017)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.3: combating racism and intolerance against Roma/Gypsies (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.4: National surveys on the experience and perception of discrimination and racism from the point of view of potential victims (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.5: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims (Strasbourg, 27 April 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.6: Combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and antisemitic material via the Internet (Strasbourg, 15 December 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.7: National legislation to combat racism and racial discrimination (Strasbourg, 13 December 2002 and revised on 7 December 2017)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.8: Combating racism while fighting terrorism (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.9: The fight against antisemitism (Strasbourg, 9 September 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.10: Combating racism and racial discrimination in and through school education (Strasbourg, 21 March 2007)

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Publications that are out of date no longer appear on this list.

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.11: Combating racism and racial discrimination in policing (Strasbourg, 4 October 2007)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.12: Combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport (Strasbourg, 19 March 2009)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.13: Combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma (Strasbourg, 19 September 2011)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.14: Combating racism and racial discrimination in employment (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.15: Combating Hate Speech (Strasbourg, 21 March 2016)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.16: Safeguarding irregularly present migrants from discrimination (Strasbourg, 10 May 2016)
- ECRI's country-by-country approach:

## → First round:

- Volume I (Strasbourg, September 1997)
- Volume II (Strasbourg, March 1998)
- Volume III (Strasbourg, 15 June 1998)
- Volume IV (Strasbourg, 26 January 1999)
- Volume V (Strasbourg, 13 March 1999)
- Volume VI (Strasbourg, 24 May 1999)
- Volume VII (Strasbourg, 9 November 1999)

## → Second round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)

- Belgium (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 3 March 2001)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- France (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- The Netherlands (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 4 November 2002)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 4 November 2003)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)

45

 Compilation of second round reports (Strasbourg, February 2004)

## → Third round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Netherland (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)

- San Marino (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)

## → Fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 9 February 2011)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 19 February 2014)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 13 September 2011)

- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 15 October 2014)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 9 July 2014)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)

## → Follow-up recommendations fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016

- France (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 October 2013)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 25 September 2012)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Moldova (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 21 February 2012)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 3 June 2014)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 22 May 2012)
- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 9 July 2013)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 19 February 2013)

### Fifth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)

- Austria (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 13 October 2015)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 10 September 2019)
- France (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 25 February 2014)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 5 March 2019)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Republic of Moldova (Strasbourg, 2 October 2018)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 1 March 2016)
- Montenegro (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- Netherlands (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2015)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 9 June 2015)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 2 October 2018)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 5 March 2019)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 16 September 2014)

- "The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia" (Strasbourg, 7 June 2016)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 19 September 2017)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 4 October 2016)

## → Follow-up recommendations fifth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 10 September 2019)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- France (Strasbourg, 5 March 2019)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 5 March 2019)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 28 February 2017)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 5 March 2019)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 February 2018)
- North Macedonia (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 15 May 2018)
- Slovak Republic (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 16 May 2017)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 6 June 2019)
- Proceedings of the Seminar "Combating racism while respecting freedom of expression", 16 -17 November 2006 (Strasbourg, July 2007)
- "Ethnic" statistics and data protection in the Council of Europe countries, by Patrick Simon, *Institut National d'Etudes* Démographiques (Strasbourg, November 2007)

- "Cooperation for effectiveness: Local authorities and national specialised bodies combating racism and intolerance" ECRI study by Niall Crowley (Strasbourg, May 2015)
- "National Specialised Bodies: Effective implementation of their advisory function" ECRI study by Niall Crowley (Strasbourg, December 2016)
- "25 Years of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance: Impact in the Field of Equality" ECRI study by Timothy Jacob-Owens (Strasbourg, August 2019)
- "Moving Forward: Increasing ECRI's Impact" ECRI study by Nils Muižnieks (Strasbourg, September 2019)

52

**ECRI Secretariat** 

Council of Europe Tel.: +33 (0) 3 90 21 46 62 E-mail: ecri@coe.int

Directorate General of Democracy

www.coe.int/ecri

## www.coe.int

ECRI is a human rights monitoring body of the Council of Europe, composed of independent experts, which specialises in the fight against racism, discrimination (on grounds of "race", ethnic/national origin, colour, citizenship, religion, language, sexual orientation and gender identity), xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance; it prepares reports and issues recommendations to member states.



