

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 31 July 2017

DH-SYSC-II(2017)001

STEERING COMMITTEE FOR HUMAN RIGHTS
(CDDH)

COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON THE SYSTEM OF THE EUROPEAN
CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS
(DH-SYSC)

DRAFTING GROUP II ON THE FOLLOW-UP TO THE CDDH REPORT
ON THE LONGER-TERM FUTURE OF THE CONVENTION
(DH-SYSC-II)

[DRAFT]
OUTLINE OF THE FUTURE REPORT OF THE CDDH ON THE PLACE OF THE
CONVENTION IN THE EUROPEAN AND INTERNATIONAL LEGAL ORDER

General introduction

1. **Background**
2. **Mandate of the Drafting Group**
3. **Methodology of the report**
4. **Purpose of the report**
5. **Outline of the report**

I. Challenge of the interaction between the Convention and other branches of international law, including international customary law (Group 1)

1. **Methodology of interpretation by the European Court of Human Rights: The Court's inclusive approach to international law**
 - a) Observations
 - b) Analysis of the challenges
 - c) Possible responses
2. **State responsibility and extraterritorial application of the Convention**
 - a) Observations
 - i. State responsibility in international law
 - ii. Notion of jurisdiction in the sense of Article 1 of the Convention and the notions of territorial control and effective control
 - iii. Case-law of the European Court of Human Rights
 - b) Analysis of the challenges
 - c) Possible responses
3. **Interaction between the resolutions of the Security Council and the European Convention on Human Rights**
 - a) Observations
 - i. The primacy of the Charter of the United Nations
 - ii. Case-law of the European Court of Human Rights
 - b) Analysis of the challenges
 - c) Possible responses
4. **Interaction between international humanitarian law and the European Convention on Human Rights**

- a) Observations
 - i. Relevant case-law of the European Court of Human Rights
- b) Analysis of the challenges
- c) Possible responses

5. Conclusions and propositions

II. Challenge of the interaction between the Convention and other international human rights instruments to which the Council of Europe member States are parties (Group 2)

1. Observations

- a) Analysis of case-law of the European Court of Human Rights and decisions by United Nations Committees
 - i. Diverging interpretations on admissibility: Issue exemplified by María Cruz Achabal Puertas v. Spain (HRC communication No. 1945/2010, CCPR/C/107/D/1945/2010)
 - ii. Diverging interpretations in substance

2. Analysis of the challenges

3. Possible responses

4. Conclusions and propositions

III. Challenge of the interaction between the Convention and the EU legal order and other regional organisations (Group 3)

1. Interaction between the Convention and the EU legal order

a) Observations

i. Method of interpretation

a. Court of Justice of the European Union

- *Article 6 of the Treaty on European Union*
- *Principle of equality of member States, principle of mutual recognition and principle of mutual trust*
- *Article 52(3) of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union*
- *Article 53 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union*

b. European Court of Human Rights

- *Principle of subsidiarity and margin of appreciation*
- *Article 53 of the Convention*

ii. Relevant case-law

a. Court of Justice of the European Union

b. European Court of Human Rights

iii. Case Opinion 2/13 and the consequences of the delay in the EU's accession to the Convention

b) Analysis of the challenges

c) Possible responses

2. Interaction between the Convention and the Court of Justice of the Eurasian Economic Union

a) Observations

i. Interpretation method of the Court of the Eurasian Economic Union

b) Analysis of the challenges

c) Possible responses

3. Conclusions and propositions

IV. Final conclusions of the report