SEVENTH EVALUATION REPORT ON CROATIA

Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

Adopted on 6 March 2024

COUNCIL OF EUROPE
CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a state party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the state and, where appropriate, to encourage the party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the state to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the state concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the state in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each state for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the state in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the state concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective state party for possible comments within a given deadline. A confidential dialogue may, at this stage, be requested by this state party. The final evaluation report is made public, together with the comments, if any, which the authorities of the state party may have made. This document is then transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for the adoption of its recommendations to the state party, on the basis of the proposals for recommendations contained in the evaluation report.

MIN-LANG(2024)5

Published on 27 May 2024

Secretariat of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages
Council of Europe
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex
France

www.coe.int/minlang

CONTENTS

Executive Summary **5**

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Croatia – Recent developments and trends **6**

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Croatia **6**

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Croatia **24**

Chapter 2 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations **30**

2.1 Boyash Romanian **30**

2.1.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Boyash Romanian 30

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Boyash Romanian in Croatia 31

2.2 Czech **32**

2.2.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Czech 32

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Czech in Croatia 35

2.3 German **37**

2.3.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German 37

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Croatia 38

2.4 Hungarian **39**

2.4.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian 39

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Croatia 42

2.5 Istro-Romanian **44**

2.5.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Istro-Romanian 44

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Istro-Romanian in Croatia 45

2.6 Italian **46**

2.6.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian 46

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Croatia 49

2.7 Ruthenian **51**

2.7.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ruthenian 51

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ruthenian in Croatia 54

2.8 Serbian....56

2.8.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian....56

2.8.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Croatia 59

2.9 Slovak 61

2.9.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak 61

2.9.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Croatia....64

2.10 Slovenian....66

2.10.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovenian 66

2.10.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovenian in Croatia....67

2.11 Ukrainian 68

2.11.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian....68

2.11.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Croatia 71

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe....73

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification 74

Appendix II: Comments from the Croatian authorities....76

Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Croatia in 1998. Czech, Hungarian, Italian, Ruthenian, Serbian, Slovak and Ukrainian are covered by Part II (Article 7) and Part III (Articles 8-14), while Boyash Romanian, German, Istro-Romanian and Slovenian are covered by Part II (Article 7) only.

Croatia continues to protect and promote the minority languages in the country in the framework of the national legislation for national minorities and enables their use in fields such as education, judicial authorities, administration, media or cultural life.

All minority languages, with the exception of Istro-Romanian, are now present in education in accordance with one of the three applicable models: education in the minority language, bilingual education or teaching of the minority language together with the related history and culture. The situation, however, varies among the minority languages and some still lack continuity between the different levels of education. For most minority languages, teaching of the language together with the related history and culture is the most widespread model and it is important that a sufficient number of hours is dedicated to this subject in practice. Starting to teach Boyash Romanian is a commendable development and it should be further strengthened. More resolute steps are needed to provide for Istro-Romanian, which is severely endangered, in education and to promote it in the other domains of public life.

Minority languages are present only to a limited extent in administration. The one third threshold for them to be in equal and official use is too high, as confirmed by the 2021 census which saw national minorities fall below the threshold in four municipalities and meet it in only one additional municipality. The alternative voluntary introduction by local and regional authorities is not sufficiently promoted and has not been applied in recent years by any new authority. Even when the one third threshold is met, there is no guarantee of an immediate and practical application of the equal and official use of minority languages, nor is there a legal mechanism to enforce it. In practice, with some exceptions for Italian, the minority languages are not sufficiently used by and in relations with authorities, nor for place name signs. In the case of Serbian, the Cyrillic script is rarely used by municipalities and in signage. The authorities should ensure the implementation of the undertakings ratified under the Charter in all areas where the minority language speakers are traditionally present in sufficient numbers for the purpose of the undertakings entered into by Croatia, irrespective of thresholds. Furthermore, measures need to be taken to facilitate the use of minority languages in practice.

As far as media are concerned, content in and about minority languages in the programmes of the public broadcaster is insufficient. While for radio, some branches of the public broadcaster and local or regional stations ensure a presence of minority languages, this is not the case for television. Moreover, some languages are hardly present in the broadcast media. Measures are needed to develop broadcasting in minority languages with a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.

Resolute measures are needed to promote awareness of the Croatian public and tolerance vis-à-vis the minority languages and the cultures they represent, as part of the cultural heritage of the country.

This seventh evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Croatia in October 2023.

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Croatia – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as "the Charter") is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its states parties to protect and promote the country's traditional regional or minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. Croatia signed and ratified the Charter on 5 November 1997. The Charter entered into force in Croatia on 1 March 1998 and applies to the following languages: Boyash Romanian, Czech, German, Hungarian, Istro-Romanian, Italian, Ruthenian, Serbian, Slovak, Slovenian and Ukrainian. The Boyash Romanian, German, Istro-Romanian and Slovenian languages are covered by Part II (Article 7) only, whereas the other languages receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).

2. States Parties are required to submit reports every five years[1] on the implementation of the Charter. The Croatian authorities submitted their seventh periodical report on 22 February 2023. This seventh evaluation report of the Committee of Experts is based on the information contained in the periodical report, additional information received from the authorities and statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (16-20 October 2023) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16 (2) of the Charter.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in Croatia and the situation of these languages. It examines, in particular, the measures taken by the Croatian authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the sixth monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each undertaking of Croatia in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the Croatian authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Croatia, as provided in Article 16.4 of the Charter. The Committee of Experts encourages the Croatian authorities to translate this report into Croatian and the regional or minority languages with a view to supporting the authorities, organisations, advisory bodies and persons concerned in the process of fully implementing the Charter, in accordance with Articles 6 and 7.4.

4. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts' on-the-spot visit to Croatia in October 2023.

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Croatia

5. Croatia continues to protect and promote the country's minority languages mainly in the framework of the 2002 Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities, the 2000 Act on Education in the Language and Script of National Minorities and the 2000 Act on Use of Languages and Scripts of National Minorities.

6. In December 2020, the Croatian Government adopted Operational Programmes for National Minorities for 2021-2024, continuing those in place for 2017-2020. According to the authorities, they contain activities linked to the use of minority languages and script, education and media, in accordance with the provisions of the national legislation. Specific operational programmes were adopted for several national minorities, including individual programmes for the Hungarian, Italian, Roma and Serbian national minorities.

[1] Article 15.1 of the Charter provides that States Parties submit periodical reports every three years. However, following the entry into force of the reform of the monitoring mechanism of the ECRML on 1 July 2019, States Parties are now to submit their reports every five years instead of every three years. See Committee of Ministers Decisions "Strengthening the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages" (CM/Del/Dec(2018)1330/10.4e, para. 1.a.).

7. The Committee of Experts underlines that the Charter requires a proactive and structured approach for its implementation. It has previously recommended the development of strategies for some of the languages covered by the Charter. The Committee of Experts considers that the adoption of strategies for the languages protected by the Charter on the basis of this treaty and the recommendations in the evaluation reports or the inclusion of the provisions and recommendations in existing programmes can help in advancing in application of the treaty at practical level. This is particularly important for Istro-Romanian, whose speakers do not identify with a national minority and therefore do not always benefit of the dedicated mechanisms.

8. In February 2024 a Law on the Croatian Language entered into force.[2] The law contains safeguards concerning the use of minority languages. Nevertheless, bearing in mind the impact which a law on the official language may have on minority languages, the Committee of Experts invites the authorities to provide, in their next periodical report, information on how the Law on the Croatian Language and its application interact with the laws on minority language use, especially in administration and media.

Reservation to Article 7.5

9. When ratifying the Charter in 1997, Croatia made the reservation "that (…) the provisions of Article 7, paragraph 5, of the Charter shall not apply." Article 7.5 covers the promotion of non-territorial languages.[3] Throughout the years, the Committee of Experts and other representatives of the Council of Europe have repeatedly encouraged Croatia to withdraw the reservation.[4] In 2013, the Croatian authorities informed the Council of Europe that they would implement the recommendation to withdraw the reservation and apply the Charter to Romani. Croatia has not yet done so. In the current monitoring cycle, during the on-the-spot visit, the authorities confirmed that the reservation would be withdrawn, without providing a timeline. They also underlined that Romani benefits from measures of protection and promotion under the national legislation, which does not distinguish between "territorial" and "non-territorial" languages. The Committee of Experts welcomes the information and notes with interest that the existing national legislation does not constitute an obstacle to the withdrawal of the reservation. The Committee of Experts maintains its view that withdrawing the reservation would be a very commendable step taken in the spirit of the Charter, allowing for a more structured protection and promotion of the Romani language and calls on the Croatian authorities to complete the respective procedure without further delay.

New census

10. In 2021 a new census was conducted in Croatia and its results were published in September 2022. The numbers of persons belonging to national minorities and of those declaring a minority language as "mother tongue", have decreased in the majority of cases covered by the Charter. Although the census reflects an overall decline of the total population in Croatia (by 9.64%), in the case of national minorities the decrease is more significant (from 328 738 in the 2011 census to 240 079 in the 2021 census, or a decrease by 26,97%). The decrease influences the protection of minority languages.[5] The Committee of Experts recalls that the Charter requires positive action from the authorities to promote minority languages and implies an obligation to take proactive measures in order to ensure that minority languages are systematically used.[6] The fact that each census may lead to a weakening of the position of the minority languages is problematic and measures need to be taken to prevent such situations. This can be done dissociating the application of the Charter of the census-based thresholds (see below).

---

[2] Zakon o hrvatskom jeziku (nn.hr), NN 14/2024.
[3] Croatia refers to several languages as non-territorial. In its previous evaluation reports, the Committee of Experts examined the situation with respect to Boyash Romanian, Istro-Romanian, German and Slovenian and concluded that these are territorial languages. This is not the case for Romani.
[4] Second report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, ECRML(2005)3, para. 14; fourth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, ECRML (2010)9, para. 86; sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 7, fifth Opinion on Croatia of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, adopted on 1 February 2021, para.97, Report by the Commissioner for Human Rights of the Council of Europe, CommDH(2010)20, para. 150.
[5] See seventh periodical report of Croatia, p.6 for the census data; see also Report of the Ombudsperson for 2022, p.105.
[6] See third report on Slovakia, ECRML (2013) 1, para. 38.

Territorial scope of application of the Charter

11. In its declaration contained in the instrument of ratification, Croatia declared "with regard to Article 1, paragraph b., of the Charter, that pursuant to Croatian legislature, the term "territory in which the regional or minority language is used" shall refer to those areas in which the official use of minority language is introduced by the by-laws passed by the local self-government units, pursuant to Article 12 of the Constitution of the Republic of Croatia and Articles 7 and 8 of the Constitutional Law on Human Rights and Freedoms and the Rights of National and Ethnic Communities or Minorities in the Republic of Croatia."

12. Therefore, according to the authorities, Articles 9 and 10 of the Charter would apply only where a minority language is in equal and official use[7] as a result of one of the following situations: persons belonging to a national minority make up at least one third of the population of a local self-government unit, which creates the obligation to introduce the minority language concerned in equal and official use; when the equal and official use is foreseen by international agreements; when the equal and official use is prescribed in the statute of a local self-government unit, even if the share of the national minority is below one third (voluntary introduction of a minority language in equal and official use); when a regional authority on whose territory local self-government units have introduced minority languages in equal and official use prescribes it in its statute.

13. In its previous evaluation reports, the Committee of Experts observed, in line with its standard interpretation[8], that the high threshold of one third of the population was not in conformity with the Charter. The possibility for local self-government units to voluntarily introduce minority languages in equal and official use partly mitigated the problem as it was up to individual local authorities to decide whether they do so or not, but it was not sufficiently monitored by the national authorities. Against this background, the Committee of Experts considered that the declaration and the national legislation did not lead to a valid limitation of Croatia's obligations under the Charter and decided to evaluate the situation in areas where there is a traditional presence and a sufficient number of speakers of minority languages.[9] In the sixth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Croatian authorities "**review the existing threshold and increase efforts to introduce equal and official use of minority languages in those areas where there is a sufficient number of speakers**".

14. The one third threshold has not been reviewed. The Croatian authorities emphasise the possibility for the local or regional self-government units to voluntarily introduce a minority language in equal and official use. They also indicate that local self-government units have done so, as well as regional authorities (one county). [10]

15. The Committee of Experts notes, nevertheless, that during the current monitoring cycle, no additional local self-government units introduced minority languages in equal and official use.[11] On the contrary, in some local self-government units minority languages ceased to be in equal and official use. Information received by the Committee of Experts indicates that this is the case for Donji Kukuruzari/ Доњи

[7] This expression is used in the Law on the Use of Language and Script of the National Minorities in the Republic of Croatia and means "co-official use" of the relevant minority language.
[8] See e.g. seventh report of the Committee of Experts on Switzerland, MIN-LANG(2019)10, para. 29; first report of the Committee of Experts on the Slovak Republic, ECRML(2007)1, para. 592-593; first report of the Committee of Experts on Romania, ECRML(2012)3, para. 35, 37; third report of the Committee of Experts on Montenegro, ECRML(2015)3, para. 21; second report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, ECRML(2015)7, para. 91; third report of the Committee of Experts on Serbia, ECRML(2016)1, para. 15-17; second report of the Committee of Experts on Bosnia and Herzegovina, ECRML(2016)3, para. 24-31; sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Hungary, ECRML(2016)6, para. 21; fourth report of the Committee of Experts on Armenia, CM(2017)49, para. 14-15; third report of the Committee of Experts on Ukraine, CM(2017)97, para. 25.
[9] See, for example, sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para.10, fifth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, ECRML (2015) 2, para.21.
[10] This is in particular the case for Italian, in numerous local self-government units and in the county of Istria. It applies also to Hungarian, Czech, Slovak and Serbian in local self-government units.
[11] In the previous monitoring cycle, three additional local self-government units introduced Serbian and Slovak into equal and official use, namely the town of Vrbovsko (35.22% Serbs), the municipality of Punitovci (36.94% Slovaks) and the municipality of Plaški (45.55% Serbs). However, in all cases, persons belonging to a national minority constituted at least one third of the population in accordance with the 2011 census.

Кукурузари and Vukovar/Вуковар (Serbian), Dežanovac/Dežanovec[12] (Czech) and Bogdanovci/Богдановци (Ruthenian).

16. After the 2021 census, the number of local self-governments where the one third threshold is met is 24 of a total of 556 local self-governments in Croatia, compared to 27 previously. The share of the Serbian national minority fell below one third in three local self-government units, that of the Slovak national minority in one, while the Roma national minority now meets the one third threshold in one local self-government unit. As a consequence, four local self-government units are no longer under an obligation to have minority languages in co-official use. Based on the 2021 census, the Serbian minority meets the one third threshold in 20 local self-governments, while the Czech, Hungarian, Italian and Roma national minority each meet the threshold in one local self-government. The other national minorities whose languages are covered by the Charter do not meet the one third threshold. This is particularly problematic for Ruthenian, Slovak and Ukrainian, which are covered by Part III of the Charter.

17. It should be noted that despite the decrease in the 2021 census, the Serbian minority represents 29.73% in Vukovar/Вуковар, 31.20% in Donji Kukuruzari/Доњи Кукурузари and 32.38% in Vrbovsko/Врбовско, while the Slovak minority represents 33.16% in Punitovci. The Committee of Experts considers, in line with the provisions of Article 10 of the Charter, that these remain sufficient shares to use the minority languages in administration, although there is no longer an obligation under the national legislation to introduce the minority language in co-official use. The Committee of Experts welcomes that some of these municipalities have maintained the minority languages in official use. As far as Orehovica is concerned, where the Roma national minority represents 33.68% of the population according to the 2021 census, at the time of the on-the-spot visit, Boyash Romanian was not yet in co-official use.

18. The results of the 2021 census confirm that there are still a considerable number of local self-government units with a sufficient number of minority language speakers which have not yet introduced the respective minority language in equal and official use. This concerns, in particular, the Serbian language (e.g. 31,34 % in Obrovac, 21,42% in Knin, 20.55% in Glina, 20,13% in Beli Manastir, 20,08% in Darda, 15.04% in Ogulin).[13] Other languages are also concerned in some local self-government units, for example Czech (16.04% in the town of Grubišno Polje), Hungarian (22.17% in the municipality of Draž), Slovak (13.36% in the town of Ilok) and Ruthenian (16.40% in the municipality of Tompojevci). Since Ukrainian is not in equal and official use in any local self-government unit, it is important to note that the highest local share of Ukrainians in Croatia (7.77%) can be found in the municipality of Bogdanovci.

19. As regards Vukovar/Вуковар[14], the decrease of the share of the Serbian minority below one third means in the context of the national legislation that there is no longer an obligation to have Serbian in equal and official use. In December 2022 the local authorities amended the Statute and abolished all provisions related to the use of Serbian in the Statute as well as the Statutory Decision on the equal and official use of the language and script of the Serbian national minority. The Committee of Experts recalls that the one third threshold is in any case too high for the purposes of applying the provisions ratified under Article 10. While being fully aware of the sensitive nature of this matter, the Committee of Experts would like to again remind the Croatian authorities of their obligation under the Charter to use the Cyrillic script in the field of

[12] See Report of the Ombudsperson for 2022, p.110.

[13] According to the 2021 census data made available by the authorities, in addition to the 20 local self-government units where the Serbian minority represents one third of the local population and to Vukovar/Вуковар, Donji Kukuruzari/Доњи Кукурузари and Vrbovsko/Врбовско, there are seven local self-governments where they represent over 20%, 11 where they represent between 15% and 20% and 12 where they represent between 10% and 15%.

[14] In 2015 Vukovar/ Вуковар, where at the time the Serbian national minority represented 34.87% of the local population, amended its statute to the effect that Serbian was no longer in equal and official use. A new Article 61 provided for a gradual expansion of the linguistic rights of the Serbian speakers, making it dependent on the assessment of the overall level of "understanding, solidarity, tolerance and dialogue" in the city among the Croatian majority and the Serbian national minority. At the same time a Statutory Decision on the equal and official use of the language and script of the Serbian national minority in the City of Vukovar was adopted, which provided for some use of Serbian (e.g. use by its speakers "in social and public life and in official communication" with the authorities, as well as by councillors from the Serbian national minority in official communication). Proceedings were instituted before the Constitutional Court, which in 2019 annulled some provisions of the Statutory Decision, which were considered as making the use of Serbian too difficult. Otherwise, the Statute and the Statutory Decision remained intact. The City Council assessed the level of "understanding, solidarity, tolerance and dialogue" in 2019, 2020 and 2021, without making any changes related to the use of Serbian.

administration. Moreover, Cyrillic is not only the script of the Serbian language, but also of the Ruthenian and Ukrainian languages which are used in this area.[15]

20. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the threshold of "at least one third" is too high and does not ensure that the relevant local self-government units implement the Charter. The possibility of voluntary introduction by municipalities of minority languages in equal and official use is not sufficient, since it is not adequately promoted and, in practice, in the current monitoring cycle there has been no new municipality applying this procedure. Even when the one third threshold is met, there is no guarantee of an immediate and practical application of the provisions concerning the equal and official use of minority languages, nor is there a legal mechanism to enforce it. The Committee of Experts reiterates therefore that the Charter also applies to those local and regional authorities where the minority language speakers do not make up at least one third of the population but represent nevertheless a sufficient number for the purpose of the Charter undertakings. Furthermore, the absolute number of persons belonging to national minorities in local self-government units should also be taken into account, with a view to extend the application of the Charter.[16]

21. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the Croatian authorities should revise the threshold to comply with their undertaking under the Charter. In addition, they should determine, in co-operation with the regional or minority language speakers, in which areas these are traditionally present in sufficient numbers for the purpose of the undertakings entered into by Croatia and apply Article 10 regarding the local and regional authorities concerned, irrespective of thresholds. Each minority language protected by Part III of the Charter should be introduced into equal and official use in those local self-government units where it is used by a number of speakers which is sufficient to apply the Charter. This measure should cover at least the municipality where the speakers have their highest (relative or absolute) concentration. To this end, the Croatian authorities should address the local self-government units concerned and encourage them, including by means of financial assistance, to introduce the equal and official use of the relevant minority language through their statutes.[17]

Discrimination based on language

22. Language is a separate ground of discrimination in the Croatian Anti-Discrimination Act of 2008 (Article 1). However, complaints based on language as a ground of discrimination are rare, both according to the information received during the on-the-spot visit from the Ombudsperson and to the data provided by the national authorities. Rather, the grounds invoked are national origin, "race" or ethnicity. According to court data, in 2022, there were two unsolved cases of discrimination on the ground of language. The Committee of Experts commends the fact that the reports of the Ombudsperson refer to the international obligations under the Charter and the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, are made public and translated into English. It encourages the authorities to use the recommendations contained therein in their practice.

Awareness-raising

23. In the sixth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Croatian authorities "**continue efforts to promote awareness and tolerance vis-à-vis the minority languages and the cultures they represent as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, in the general curriculum at all stages of education, in the media and through the use of minority languages and their scripts in administrative, traffic and heritage signage**".

24. During the period under review, the Twentieth Anniversary of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities (1-2 December 2022) was organised in Zagreb, at the initiative of the Faculties of Law of the Universities of Zagreb, Rijeka, Split and Osijek, with the participation of the Secretary General

[15] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 13.
[16] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 14, 16, fifth report of the Committee of Experts on Armenia, MIN-LANG (2020) 3, para.11, eight evaluation report on Switzerland, MIN-LANG (2022) 8, para. 47.
[17] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 16.

of the Council of Europe, the Prime Minister of Croatia, the President of the Committee for Human Rights and Rights of National Minorities of the Croatian Parliament, the President of the Council for National Minorities of the Government of Croatia, as well as the chair of the Committee of Experts of the Charter and the President of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. Other events contributing to a general awareness raising about national minority rights in Croatia are the seminars on the role and work of the national minority councils (organised in October 2019 in Osijek and in October 2021 in Split), which also discussed the co-official use of minority languages or the representation of national minorities in the media. Two other seminars (organised in June 2019 in Opatija and Osijek in July 2021) addressed the representation of national minorities, the minority languages programmes, as well as elimination of stereotypes and combating hate speech in the media.

25. As far as education is concerned, the 2019 curricula for Civic Education[18] foresees as an educational goal for the 4th cycle of education (secondary education) that pupils "promote the rights of national minorities"; consequently they should be aware of the constitutional and legal rights of national minorities, be able to investigate problems national minorities face, respect their rights, promote integration and equal treatment. "Rights of national minorities, cultural pluralism" are mandatory content. Teaching should be in conjunction with the subjects of history, geography, religion, ethics and personal and social development. However, it is unclear to what extent this is done in practice. During the on-the-spot visit, representatives of the minority language speakers indicated that the information provided about history, language and culture of national minorities throughout education is insufficient or even non-existent. In general, textbooks rarely contain such information and it depends on the teacher whether they address these topics or not, when teaching different subjects. If they choose to do so, they would need to develop their own teaching materials. In particular, according to the speakers, it appears that no information is provided in textbooks about Boyash Romanian, Czech, Istro-Romanian, Ruthenian, Slovak, Slovenian, Ukrainian. There is little information about Italian, German, Hungarian or Serbian.

26. According to the information provided by the authorities, an analysis of the representation of national minorities in education as a basis for future improvements was foreseen as part of Operational Programs of National Minorities for 2021-2024. In 2021, a working group was set up and in 2022 an independent researcher mandated by it carried out an analysis. The authorities indicate that this research examined the quantitative and qualitative representation of national minorities in primary and secondary school textbooks, in particular for those for Croatian language, music culture, musical art, fine culture, fine arts, nature and society, history, geography, ethics, politics and economy. It focused primarily on the Hungarian, Italian, Roma and Serbian minorities. The analysis[19] notes that the curriculum for history refers explicitly to teaching about national minorities, as separate topic or part of other themes, when discussing contemporary Croatian and European history. The music culture curriculum includes music from minorities' cultures into the traditional music of Croatia with which pupils should acquaint themselves. When it comes to textbooks, the analysis shows that reference to national minorities tend to be collective, rather than referring to individuals from the respective minority and that negative representations are present and often associated with actions of the "kin-state" throughout history. However, it notes an overall progress in the representation of national minorities in textbooks, and issues several recommendations, including an increased reference to individuals, selected in consultation with national minorities, following a gender-balanced approach, avoiding collective approaches and identification of a minority with a particular regime, presenting positive contributions of minorities in the local community. The study also recommends the organisation of workshops to raise awareness among textbook authors about the need to highlight the contributions of national minorities to Croatian society.

27. The Committee of Experts welcomes the analysis commissioned by the Croatian authorities as a positive step and urges them to take further steps on its basis. In this context, the Committee of Experts draws the attention of the authorities to the recommendation of the Committee of Ministers CM/Rec(2020)2

[18] Odluka o donošenju kurikuluma za međupredmetnu temu Građanski odgoj i obrazovanje za osnovne i srednje škole u Republici Hrvatskoj (nn.hr), NN 10/2019.
[19] Ministarstvo znanosti i obrazovanja - Analiza predstavljanja nacionalnih manjina u udžbenicima i kurikularnim dokumentima Republike Hrvatske (gov.hr)

on the inclusion of the history of Roma and/or Travellers in school curricula[20]. It also invites the Croatian authorities to consider the possibility of joining the Observatory on History Teaching in Europe of the Council of Europe.[21]

28. As far as the media are concerned, the public broadcaster *Hrvatska radio-televizija* (HRT) broadcasts programmes about national minorities (see below), but this remains insufficient.[22] Serbian speakers underlined that they are often presented in a negative manner in the media, against the background of the 1991-1995 armed conflict.

29. Overall, the minority language speakers perceive that at local and regional level, in the areas where they live, the awareness about their presence, language or culture is rather high, also due to the activities of the minority associations. This is less the case at national level or in other regions, where they tend to be perceived only as tourists.

30. The use of Serbian and the Cyrillic script, which was identified as a particular problem in the previous monitoring cycles[23], remains highly controversial in certain areas of Croatia. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the Serbian speakers referred to a perceived "invisible pressure" and misperceptions circulating about them. To some extent this affects also the Ruthenian and Ukrainian minorities, which also use the Cyrillic script. The Committee of Experts was informed about place name signs in Cyrillic being vandalised (Biskupija/Бискупија in April 2021, immediately after being installed) and of a certain hesitance of local authorities of displaying such signs. The Committee of Experts notes that the recent reports of the Ombudsperson confirm that "the Cyrillic script continues to be stigmatised".[24]

31. The Committee of Experts is concerned about the incident in Vrsi in October 2023, where the local public service company in charge of the cemetery asked a family to remove the inscription in Cyrillic from a grave, allegedly since the Serbian minority does not meet the one third threshold for the language to be in equal and official use in the municipality and the regulations forbid "offensive" inscriptions. The Croatian national authorities reacted immediately and explained that the use of the Cyrillic script in this context is in conformity with the law, is not "offensive" and not linked to a language being in co-official use. The Ombudsperson has also opened a case concerning Vrsi. Another worrying incident took place in January 2024, when two teenagers were attacked by hooligans reportedly because these assumed the teenagers spoke Serbian.[25]

32. The Committee of Experts regrets that despite the fact that the Roma minority reaches the one third threshold, Boyash Romanian has not yet been introduced in co-official use in Orehovica, including on bilingual signs. It notes the debates about using Romani instead of Boyash Romanian, which triggered the opposition of the local community, as well as the doubts of some authorities towards this step[26]. Equally worrying is the hesitance of some speakers, out of concern it would create problems in the relations with the Croatian population and stigmatise the community. The Committee of Experts recalls that topographical indications in minority languages increase the visibility and prestige of a language, raise awareness of local national minorities and contribute to the maintenance of the local linguistic and cultural heritage, while conveying the message that a given territory is shared in harmony by different ethnic groups.[27]

33. Against this background, the Committee of Experts recalls that the UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination has recently expressed concerns, among other issues, about reports of racial discrimination against members of the Roma and the Serbian national minorities, particularly in employment

[20] https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016809ee48c
[21] The Observatory on History Teaching in Europe - Observatory on History Teaching in Europe (coe.int)
[22] See also Report of the Ombudsperson for 2021, p.99.
[23] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 68.
[24] See Report of the Ombudsperson for 2022, p 109.
[25] https://www.24sata.hr/news/otac-dvojice-pretucenih-djecaka-u-vukovaru-pitali-su-ih-jesu-li-delije-ili-grobari-pa-ih-napali-957428
[26] https://n1info.hr/english/news/do-roma-in-northern-croatia-want-bilingual-signs/
[27] See, for example, seventh report of the Committee of Experts on Germany, MIN-LANG (2022) 7, para.30; fifth opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities on Czechia, ACFC/OP/V(2021)3, para.120.

and education, as well as about reports on the prevalence of hate crime and racist hate speech and of the dissemination of negative stereotypes against the Roma and the Serbian national minorities, including in the media, on the Internet and in social media. [28] The Committee of Experts notes that recently the Council for Electronic Media issued a sanction against two television channels for breaching the provisions of Article 14.2 of the Law on Electronic Media[29], which prohibits the "incitement and spreading of hatred or discrimination" for various grounds, as well as "anti-Semitism and xenophobia, ideas of fascist, Nazi, communist and other totalitarian regimes."

34. The Committee of Experts recalls that in 2022 the Committee of Ministers recommended Croatia to "develop a comprehensive strategy to promote inter-ethnic dialogue and an inclusive society, as well as to monitor and evaluate its impact support periodic assessment of attitudes towards national minorities and perception of inequality and discrimination in society", as well as "to promote and implement measures to combat and sanction any form of discrimination, including intersectional discrimination, whilst paying particular attention to groups at risk such as Roma and Serb national minorities and returnees".[30]

35. The Committee of Experts urges the Croatian authorities to take resolute measures to promote awareness of the Croatian public and tolerance vis-à-vis the minority languages and the cultures they represent as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, both in the general curriculum at all stages of education and in the media (Article 7.3). As already recommended by the Ombudsperson, a campaign aimed at the raising awareness of the general public about the value of minority languages and scripts and their use in the public sphere should be organised.[31]

Consultation

36. The national minorities are represented in the Council for National Minorities which also comprises eight members of the Croatian Parliament representing them. The Council for National Minorities is the body which distributes the funds allocated to the national minorities in the national budget. It is entitled, *inter alia*, to propose to the legislative and executive authorities debates on issues relevant to national minorities, in particular in relation to the implementation of the national legislation, to propose measures to improve the position of national minorities, provide opinions and make proposals concerning public broadcasting media (see also paragraph 86). There is also a wide network of councils representing national minorities at the level of counties and municipalities.[32] In addition, depending on the percentages in local population, several national minorities are represented by deputy prefects and deputy mayors at these levels.

37. The Committee of Experts notes that this system does not apply to the Istro-Romanian speakers, which do not identify themselves with a national minority. Their representatives indicated during the on-the-spot visit that they are consulted by the local authorities when language issues are concerned.

Use of the regional or minority languages in education

38. In the sixth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Croatian authorities **"take proactive measures encouraging the minority language speakers to make use of minority language education**".

39. According to the authorities and the information received from the speakers, Czech, German, Hungarian, Italian and Serbian are present in pre-school education. Pre-school education follows two

[28] Concluding observations on the combined ninth to fourteenth periodic reports of Croatia, August 2023; see also fifth opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities on Croatia, ACFC/OP/V(2021)2, paras. 4, 115.
[29] See report of the meeting of 18 January 2024, available at Agencija za elektroničke medije (aem.hr); in a programme, the phrase "Za dom spremni" was used and the host did not react or did not object.
[30] Resolution CM/ResCMN(2022)2 on the implementation of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities by Croatia.
[31] See also Report of the Ombudsperson for 2021, p.97.
[32] See Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities, Ustavni zakon o pravima nacionalnih manjina (nn.hr), NN 155/2002.

models: education in the minority language (Czech, Hungarian, Serbian, Italian) with at least 10 hours in Croatian per week and bilingual education (German), with Croatian and the minority language in equal shares. Slovak has also been introduced at pre-school level, but it is used only for 30 minutes twice per week. Boyash Romanian, Istro-Romanian, Ruthenian, Slovenian and Ukrainian are not used in pre-school education. The Committee of Experts regrets that very few minority languages are used at pre-school level and underlines the importance of early childhood education for developing language competence.[33]

40. Three models of minority language education at primary, secondary and technical/ vocational levels continue to be provided: education in the minority language (Model A), bilingual education (Model B) and teaching of the minority language and culture (literature, history, geography music and fine arts), in one subject (Model C). The share of Croatian and minority language under Model B depends on the share of natural sciences subjects and of social sciences subjects, the latter being taught in the minority languages. According to information received from the authorities, this is 9 hours(lessons) out of 23 hours per week in lower primary school grades, 10 hours out of 30 hours per week in the upper primary school grades and 14 hours out of 37 hours in the first grade of general secondary. Under Model C, although teaching of the minority languages and culture could cover up to five hours, in some cases it is only two hours per week.

41. The Committee of Experts recalls that, in accordance with its practice, in order to comply with the requirements of the Charter, regional or minority languages should be taught at least three hours per week in primary, secondary education, as well as technical and vocational education, in particular if the language is not a well-established language with a strong speaker community. Regional or minority languages should also be taught as an integral part of the curriculum. According to the same interpretation, as far as bilingual education is concerned, in order to correspond to the "provision of a substantial part of […] education", under the Charter, at least 50% of the school hours per week should be in the minority language. At kindergarten level, this implies that it has to be used for at least half of the activities that the children carry out at kindergarten.[34]

42. In light of this, the Committee of Experts notes that teaching Slovak only 30 minutes twice per week at kindergarten level does not correspond to the requirements of the Charter. Teaching in minority languages under Model B should be strengthened to reach an equal share with teaching in Croatian. As far as Model C is concerned, teaching of the minority language should be extended to at least three hours per week. In this context the Committee of Experts notes that during the on-the-spot visit, several representatives of the minority language speakers expressed concern about the low level of language competence of pupils, in particular when languages are taught under Model C. The organisation of Model C teaching and its quality are reportedly affected by its scheduling at the end of the school hours, leading to concentration problems for pupils, but also to transportation problems, as well as by withdrawals, if pupils do not receive high grades. This is a clear indication that additional measures need to be taken to strengthen minority language education by extending the number of hours in practice under Model C and by promoting models A and B.

43. Minority language education under any of these models is open to all pupils, whether they belong to a national minority or not. According to the authorities, there is an increased interest from pupils with Croatian as first language, in particular for Model C. Participation of all pupils in any form of minority language education, is to be welcomed and encouraged, since, as the Committee of Experts already emphasised, knowledge of regional or minority languages by people living in a certain area irrespective of their background contributes to language maintenance and revitalisation, as well as understanding and social cohesion of the local community.[35]

---

[33] See fifth report of the Committee of Experts on Austria, MIN-LANG(2023)2, para.14.
[34] See fifth report of the Committee of Experts on Austria, MIN-LANG(2023)2, para. 11, seventh report of the Committee of Experts on Germany, MIN-LANG(2022)7, para.14, fifth report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, MIN-LANG (2019) 17final, para. 49, fifth report of the Committee of Experts on the Slovak Republic, CM(2019)126, para. 57. Fourth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts concerning Serbia, CM(2018)144, para. 8, second evaluation report of the Committee of Experts concerning Switzerland (ECRML(2004)6), para. 44.
[35] See fourth report of the Committee of Experts on Poland, MIN-LANG (2023)11, para. 42.

44. Education according to one of the models A, B and C is organised for all languages, except Istro-Romanian. According to the information from the authorities, Model A applies to Hungarian, Italian and Serbian in primary and secondary education and to Czech at primary level; Model B applies to Hungarian and Serbian in primary schools and to Czech in secondary schools; Model C applies in primary schools to Boyash Romanian, Czech, German, Hungarian, Italian, Ruthenian, Serbian, Slovak, Slovenian and Ukrainian, as well as in secondary schools to Czech, Hungarian, Italian, Serbian, Slovak and Slovenian. Czech, Hungarian, Italian, Serbian and Slovak are used in technical and vocational education.

45. In general, the situation of Hungarian, Italian and Serbian remains good in education and education in minority languages is available from pre-school to secondary education. Teaching in or of Czech is also available at these levels. For other minority languages, there is no continuity of education from pre-school to secondary education. According to the speakers, there is a clear interest to further develop teaching in/or Italian, German or Slovenian.

46. A development to be commended is teaching of Boyash Romanian in accordance with Model C in the primary schools in Orehovica, Podturen and Kuršanec, starting with the 2022/2023 school year. This follows the adoption in April 2020 by the Ministry of Science and Education of the curriculum for the subject "Language and Culture of the Roma National Minority" in primary and secondary school (Model C), which includes modules for both Romani and for Boyash Romanian. There is a strong interest in teaching Boyash Romanian (Model C) also in Jagodnjak (county of Osijek-Baranja).[36] However, this is not currently possible due to the lack of teachers. According to the information available to the Committee of Experts, only one person in Croatia is qualified to teach Boyash Romanian at primary level (and already does), and another one at pre-school level. The authorities have adapted the conditions and allow those with a university degree/four-year education and trained as primary school teachers or as teachers of Croatian, history and geography to teach Boyash Romanian. Those without a university degree may only be hired as "non-qualified" staff, on renewable temporary contracts. This form of employment is unattractive and the school in Jagodnjak could not secure a teacher. Another issue to be addressed in order to allow Boyash Romanian teaching to develop are the teaching materials. The existing materials have been developed by the school in Orehovica, with support from the University of Zagreb. The Committee of Experts recalls its previous recommendations[37] that teaching should combine standard Romanian and the local varieties of Boyash Romanian. Bearing in mind that Boyash Romanian is predominantly used orally, written standard Romanian could reinforce Boyash Romanian.

47. Teaching of Istro-Romanian under Model C has not yet been established. The Committee of Experts has been informed that discussions to this end have taken place at local level, but solutions have not been found, due to lack of teachers speaking Istro-Romanian. It continues to be offered as extracurricular activity in the primary school in Čepic (main school) and the branch primary school in Šušnjevica. The Committee of Experts reiterates that Istro-Romanian is severely endangered and immediate resolute action is needed to safeguard it. The current activities (playgroups), which are commendable, need to be complemented as soon as possible by pre-school education in Istro-Romanian (immersion) and teaching of Istro-Romanian in primary school in accordance with Model C. The Croatian authorities have shown flexibility with respect to the qualifications for teachers. Underlining the very fragile situation of the language, the Committee of Experts again urges the Croatian authorities to find flexible solutions for existing obstacles, for example, the lack of teachers.[38]

48. The Committee of Experts notes that in general the authorities react to requests or initiatives of the minority language speakers and are generally supportive, in particular at national level. It has, however, also been informed of cases where minority language speakers have tried to set up minority language education, but this was not successful (see below). The Committee of Experts does not have any information about promotional activities aiming at establishing continuity between the different levels of education for each minority language. It reiterates that continued awareness raising about the benefits of,

[36] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 16.
[37] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para 27, Evaluation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action contained in the sixth evaluation report, MIN-LANG (2022)3, para.36.
[38] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 28, Evaluation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action contained in the sixth evaluation report, MIN-LANG (2022)3, para.40.

and opportunities for, minority language education could make it possible to introduce teaching of these languages at all levels.[39]

49. As part of its continued work on minority languages, the Ministry of Science and Education adopted new curricula for the Czech and Serbian languages for primary and secondary schools (Model A) and for Czech and Serbian languages and cultures for primary and secondary schools (Model C), in 2019; the same year, curricula for Italian language for primary school and Italian language and literature for secondary schools (Model A) were adopted. In 2020 curricula for Hungarian language for primary school and Hungarian language and literature for secondary schools (Model A), and for Slovak language and culture for primary and secondary schools (Model C) were adopted. The Ministry of Science and Education also continued to co-finance special programmes of the national minorities (e.g. training for teachers, competitions, commemoration of significant dates, extracurricular activities, printing of magazines, brochures and books) as well as special forms of education, such as summer schools in Croatia or in the "kin-state". All these are organised in co-operation with the respective national minorities' associations. Special forms of education (summer schools) and programmes have been financed for Czech, Hungarian, Ruthenian, Ukrainian and Serbian, while special programmes have been financed for German, Slovak, Slovenian and Italian. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed of a one-week summer school organised by the Ruthenian national minority, comprising lectures and cultural activities, which is open to everyone and where participants receive certificates from the schools where they are enrolled.

Teaching of history and culture

50. The curriculum for education in the language and script of a national minority must be comprised of a general part and a part related to the specificities of the national minority (language, literature, history, geography and cultural production of the national minority/visual arts and music). Therefore, the history and culture of those national minorities which benefit from models A, B and C at primary and/or secondary levels are taught to pupils attending the relevant schools.

51. As regards mainstream education, provisions are contained in the 2019 curricula for Civic Education (see paragraph 25).

52. The Committee of Experts welcomes these provisions, which contribute to the objectives of Article 7.3. However, it is unclear to which extent this is done in practice. In addition, it remains unclear to which extent they ensure the teaching of the "history and culture reflected by minority languages", to all pupils living in the area where a minority language is traditionally spoken, as requested by Article 8.1.g. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit from the minority language speakers, teaching about the respective history and culture is insufficient or even non-existent (see paragraph 25).

Teacher training

53. The basic training of the teachers teaching in Italian, as well as of those teaching Czech, German, Hungarian, Italian, Slovak, Slovenian, Serbian and Ukrainian is organised in Croatia. For Ruthenian teacher training activities take place every two years, in co-operation with specialists from Serbia. According to representatives of the speakers, there is a lack of teachers of Slovenian. There is also a shortage of teachers of Serbian, especially under Model C, which is accentuated by the retirement of current teachers.[40]

54. The Education and Teacher Training Agency has organised further training for teachers teaching (in) Czech, Hungarian, Italian and Serbian, including for the pre-school level. Further training is also organised in "kin-states".

55. The Education and Teacher Training Agency employs senior advisers for education in minority languages. Such advisers exist for Czech, Hungarian, Serbian, Italian.

[39] See sixth report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 26.
[40] See Report of the Ombudsperson for 2021, p.98.

Study of and research on minority languages at university

56. Several minority languages can be studied at universities in Croatia: Czech, German, Hungarian, Italian, Serbian, Slovak, Slovenian and Ukrainian. Furthermore, at the University of Zagreb, at the Chair of Romanian language, courses on Istro-Romanian and on Boyash Romanian are offered and research is carried out. However, no facilities exist for the study of Ruthenian at universities or equivalent institutions in Croatia, but there are plans to set up a chair at the University of Zagreb.

57. The Institute for Croatian Language and Linguistics and the Institute for Migration and Nationalities carry out jointly the RENA project (Repository of National Minority Languages in Croatia)[41], which includes the languages of all national minorities in Croatia. It aims at presenting the languages, with a focus on education, but also historical data and current demographic status of the national minorities.

Textbooks for minority language education

58. According to the periodical report, in line with the Act on Education in the Languages and Scripts of National Minorities (Article 15), schools can use textbooks from the "kin-state" of a national minority, subject to approval by the Ministry of Science and Education, primarily for teaching the minority language. The Ministry of Science and Education also co-finances the development of textbooks for education in minority languages.

59. The periodical report indicates that during the period 2019-2021 the Ministry of Science and Education funded the printing and the development of new textbooks and other teaching materials for primary and secondary education in Czech, Hungarian, Italian and Serbian.

60. According to the Italian-speakers, despite the funding available, the translation of textbooks remains a complex and slow process, influenced by the availability of human resources. There are still delays in the translation of textbooks. The delays have an impact on the quality of education (different terms translated differently by teachers may impact exam results).

Adult education and language courses

61. As far as language courses (including for adults, Article 7.1.g) and adult and continuing education (Article 8.1.fii) are concerned, the authorities inform that the Ministry of Science and Education does not organise the teaching of minority languages to adults. The Committee of Experts reiterates[42] that efforts to maintain or revitalise minority languages do not only concern young people, but are also important for adults who do not benefit from minority language education in school. Consequently, the implementation of Articles 7.1.g and 8.1. fii deserves particular attention by the authorities. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities to provide detailed information on how they provide or support facilities providing certified courses of minority languages, including as part of adult and continuing education.

62. As far as the Committee of Experts has been informed during the on-the-spot visit, there are no courses of Boyash Romanian for adults or for non-speakers. In the case of Istro-Romanian, adults participate occasionally in the extracurricular activities (playgroups), but there are no courses organised for them. Hungarian courses for adults are organised, for example, by the Osijek Hungarian Center, but they are not free of charge. In the case of Italian, language courses for adults are organised by private language schools and by the Italian associations. These associations receive financial support from the Croatian authorities and their courses are free of charge or for a small fee. The Slovak national minority council in Osijek used to organise courses of Slovak, but it is unclear if this is still the case. In the case of Slovenian, courses for adults are organised by the "Slovenian clubs" and online, but they are financed by Slovenia. The Ukrainian minority associations organised language courses.

[41] RENA – Repozitorij nacionalnomanjinskih jezika u Hrvatskoj
[42] See sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, paragraph 37.

Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities

63. According to the Act on the Use of the Languages and Scripts of National Minorities (Article 12), first instance judicial authorities and state attorney's offices with jurisdiction in a territory in which both Croatian and the language and script of a national minority are in equal and official use are obliged to inform the party from a municipality or city in which the minority language is in equal and official use on the right to use it during the proceedings and register the statement on the choice of language. If a party invokes the right to use the minority language, the authority must ensure that the party can participate in the proceedings using the minority language (Article 14). Documents are sent to the party in both Croatian and the minority language, and the party may submit documents in Croatian or the minority language (Article 14, Article 16). The Croatian authorities informed the Committee of Experts that the costs related to proceedings being conducted in a minority language are covered from the state budget.

64. As the Committee of Experts has already indicated, Article 9 also applies to those judicial districts where persons belonging to a national minority do not make up more than one third of the population, but represent nevertheless a sufficient number for the purpose of the respective undertakings.[43]

65. As far as the practice is concerned, the information provided by the authorities for 2019 - 2022 indicates a rather low number of cases in which minority languages have been used before courts and a decreasing trend in this respect. Italian and Serbian have been more often used with judicial authorities. There has been an occasional use of Hungarian, Ruthenian and Ukrainian, which have each been used more than once during this period. Czech has been used only once during the same period and Slovak has not been used at all in courts. Italian is the only language which has been used every year in judicial proceedings.

66. During the on-the-spot visit, the minority language speakers confirmed that minority languages are rarely used in courts. Using a minority language reportedly causes delays in the proceedings and this is one of the reasons for which persons belonging to national minorities use Croatian. The occasional use of minority languages before courts is largely attributed to tourists.

67. This points to the need of a proactive approach in order to facilitate the use of minority languages before courts in practice. Such an approach includes additional measures to inform and encourage minority language speakers to use minority languages in court proceedings, for example through using minority languages in bi- or multilingual notices and signs in and on court buildings, and through information in public announcements or court forms. At the same time, in order to facilitate their use in practice, measures should be taken to adapt legal terminology in minority languages, as well as to ensure that legal professionals acquire or develop their language competences in minority languages and that a sufficient number of qualified translators and interpreters are available.[44]

Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities

68. In the sixth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Croatian authorities "**ensure that speakers of languages covered by Part III of the Charter can use their languages in relations with State, county and local authorities in practice, and that these authorities use these languages within the framework of their work**".

69. As far as the local branches of the state authorities are concerned, according to the periodical report, no "administrative proceedings" were conducted in minority languages by police departments and police stations (Article 10.1.a iii). The Committee of Experts underlines that the undertaking requires the authorities to *ensure* that minority language speakers may submit oral or written applications and receive replies in minority languages, which entails legal and practical measures, such as a structured human resources policy, trainings or incentives in order to make sure that minority languages can be used in

[43] See sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, paragraph 39.
[44] See fifth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Austria, MIN-LANG (2023)2 para 31, See fifth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Hungary, ECRML (2013) 6, para.242.

relations with the authorities. As far as Articles 10.1.b and 10.1.c (administrative texts, forms, documents) are concerned, the periodical report informs that the Ministry of the Interior issued bilingual identity cards in Croatian and Czech, Hungarian, Italian, Ruthenian, Serbian and Slovak, but not in Ukrainian. Bilingual identity cards may be issued even in places where the minority language is not in equal and official use. Furthermore, bilingual certificates have been issued in Croatian and Italian, by the Police Directorate in Istria. The forms for the 2021 census were also made available in minority languages. As a rule, local branches of state authorities also display the names of institutions in minority languages.

70. The Committee of Experts underlines that Article 10.1.a (iii) concerns all existing local branches of state authorities, not only the Ministry of the Interior. Similarly, the scope of Articles 10.1 b and c goes beyond identity cards, and a wider range of official documents and administrative texts should be made available in the minority languages. [45] The Committee of Experts has been informed that as of 1 January 2020, as a result of a reform of the administration, competences of the state administration have been transferred to counties. Nevertheless, there are still state authorities which have local branches, in addition to the Ministry of the Interior. The periodical report refers, for example, to the Croatian Pension Insurance Institute, within the competence of the Ministry of Labour, Pension System, Family and Social Policy, but without providing concrete examples of how it uses minority languages. Tax offices and the Health Insurance Institute are also examples of authorities which remain local branches of state authorities. Therefore, the Committee of Experts invites the authorities to present, in the next periodical report, information on how local branches of all state authorities provide for the use of minority languages, in accordance with the undertakings ratified.

71. As far as county authorities are concerned, only the county of Istria uses Italian, which it voluntarily introduced in equal and official use. Italian is used, for example, in the bilingual name *Istarska županija - Regione Istriana,* on bilingual letterheads, for publishing official documents (such as the official journal of the county or various reports), application forms, as well as on websites and social media. The Italian speakers may also address the county authorities in Italian, although they rarely do so. Italian has been used in one administrative procedure with the county of Istria.

72. In towns and municipalities where minority languages are in equal and official use, the situation varies to a large degree. Italian is used in practice to a wide extent, for oral and written communication, on websites and social media, although it varies depending on the municipality and whether Italian-speaking staff is available. According to the information received from the authorities, Italian has been used in proceedings with city of Rovinj-Rovigno in 1800 cases and in Buje-Buie in three cases. Some municipalities also publish their official documents in Italian. The city of Rijeka, where Italian is not in co-official use, provides an Italian version of its website, where it also uses its Italian name, Fiume. Other languages are used mainly orally and only to a limited extent in writing (Czech, Hungarian, Serbian, Slovak). Some have not been used at all (Ukrainian, Ruthenian). Serbian has been used in 102 proceedings in the city of Negoslavci/ Негославци.

73. With the exception of Italian, public service providers located in municipalities where minority languages are in equal and official use do not use these languages as required by Article 10.3.

74. The Croatian authorities acknowledge that some challenges remain for the use of minority languages in self-government units. According to the Council for National Minorities, as far as 2022 is concerned, there was no progress regarding equal and official use of minority languages.[46] The Committee of Experts also notes that even in places where the minority languages are in equal and official use, they are not sufficiently used in practice. There is a tendency of speakers to use Croatian in relation with the authorities in particular in order to speed the proceedings, although they are aware they may use minority languages. One seminar for civil servants is organised annually on the implementation of the Constitutional

[45] See sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 39.
[46] See Report on the Implementation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National minorities and the Expenditure of the Insured Funds in the State Budget of the Republic of Croatia for 2022 for the needs of national minorities, available at Izvješće o provođenju Ustavnog zakona o pravima nacionalnih manjina i o utrošku sredstava osiguranih u Državnom proračunu Republike Hrvatske za 2022. godinu za potrebe nacionalnih manjina - podnositeljica: Vlada Republike Hrvatske | Hrvatski sabor

Act on the Rights of National Minorities, which addresses also the equal and official use of minority languages, but this is not sufficient and the efforts need to be intensified.[47]

75. The Committee of Experts underlines that minority languages need to be used in practice in the domains covered by the treaty, as a way to ensure that they remain fully functional languages and continue to be present in public life in the areas where they are spoken. The implementation of the undertakings under Article 10 requires practical measures at organisational level, in order to facilitate the use of minority languages within the administration (e.g. recruitment of officials who can speak the relevant minority language, training of existing staff, translation) as well as steps to encourage the minority language speakers to avail themselves of the possibility to use their language in contacts with the authorities, without the impression of being perceived as "trouble-makers" or disadvantaged in any way.[48]

Place names

76. In municipalities where Italian is in equal and official use, place names in this language are co-official and used on traffic and administrative signs and in other domains (e.g. public announcements, documents, websites). Bilingual Croatian – Italian names continue to be used in Croatian documents (e.g. Rovinj-Rovigno, Buje-Buie), such as publications on census results. Municipality place names are also used in Czech, Hungarian, Slovak, and Serbian. However, the use of Serbian and the Cyrillic script in some municipalities remains problematic. Bilingual place name signs using the Cyrillic script remain very rare.[49] Ruthenian and Ukrainian place names do not seem to be used at all. The Committee of Experts recalls that topographical indications in minority languages increase the visibility and prestige of a language and contribute to the maintenance of the local linguistic and cultural heritage (see also above). It encourages the authorities to consistently use minority language on place name signs. The Committee of Experts refers in this context to the recommendation of the Ombudsperson that an action plan for the installation of bilingual traffic signs should be adopted and implemented.[50]

Use of the regional or minority languages in the media

77. In the sixth monitoring cycle, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Croatian authorities "**increase the broadcasting duration and the regularity of radio and television programmes in minority languages within the Croatian Radio Television HRT by allocating time slots to each minority language**".

78. According to the periodical report, the public broadcaster HRT *(Hrvatska radio-televizija)* continues to offer two television programmes related to national minorities: *Prizma* and *Manjinski mozaik*. *Prizma* is a 45-minute weekly programme broadcast all year, about various topics related to national minorities, in which minority languages are also used by the speakers. *Manjinski mozaik* is a 15-minute weekly programme (except during summer), consisting in documentary stories, dedicated each time to an individual national minority and broadcast in the given minority language. The presence of national minorities in the programmes is linked to the share in the population and the activities carried out. The programmes are subtitled in Croatian. In addition, documentaries in minority languages are occasionally produced and broadcast by HRT. On radio, the first channel HRT-HR 1 (*Hrvatska radio-televizija – Hrvatski radio*) broadcasts *Multikultura*, a magazine about national minorities, in Croatian. Programmes about national minorities are also broadcast by the HRT-HR regional stations and some are in minority languages. The HRT broadcasts these programmes pursuant to the national legislation, which obliges it to broadcast programmes "aimed at informing national minorities, partly in the languages of the national minorities" and the contracts with the government, which contain a similar obligation.

[47] See Evaluation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action contained in the sixth evaluation report, MIN-LANG (2022)3RIA, para. 14.
[48] See Evaluation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action contained in the sixth evaluation report, MIN-LANG (2022)3RIA, para 15, sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para 48.
[49] See Report of the Ombudsperson for 2021, p.96, Report of the Ombudsperson for 2022, p.109.
[50] See Report of the Ombudsperson for 2021, p.96, Report of the Ombudsperson for 2022, p.109.

79. The periodical report also points to the lack of journalists who speak minority languages and, more generally, of journalists who can follow minority topics as a reason for the "insufficient and inconsistent" use of minority languages in *Prizma.* Training of journalists speaking minority languages has been funded by the Council for National Minorities and some were employed by the HRT as external associates. However, it is not clear how the impact of such measures has been assessed and whether further steps are planned. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was also informed about the lack of human resources which negatively affects the possibility to further develop TV programmes about national minorities. As far as the minority languages speakers are concerned, the insufficient presence of minority languages in the media remains one of the main concerns. There is a continuing decreasing trend in respect of programmes for national minorities. If these represented 1,045% in the overall programme of HRT in 2020, they reached only 0,99% in 2021.[51]

80. The Committee of Experts regrets to note that no developments have taken place with respect to the use of minority languages in public media. As the Committee of Experts indicated in its previous evaluation reports[52], *Prizma* and *Manjinski Mozaik* have a very short broadcasting duration which does not meet the requirements of the Charter. Furthermore, there is no regularity and sufficient frequency in the use of the various minority languages. Bearing this in mind, these programmes are unlikely to make an impact on the situation of the minority languages, although they remain a way to raise awareness of the existence of minority languages (Article 7.3). Furthermore, the link between the share of the national minority in the population and their presence in public broadcasting media is unlikely to lead to an adequate and sufficient amount of programmes in minority languages. In order to fulfil Article 11.1.aiii, it is important to ensure adequate broadcasting duration, regularity, sufficient frequency, as well as accessibility which can be facilitated by the internet. In addition, the Committee of Experts underlines the importance of television programmes in increasing the level of exposure to the language and the need for the broadcasts to cover content from various genres such as local and national news, entertainment and culture, and address different generations, including children and young people to support language transmission.[53]

81. There is still no adequate provision for public radio programmes for all minority languages, for example for German, Ruthenian, Slovenian and Ukrainian. Overall, Boyash Romanian, Istro-Romanian, German, Ruthenian and Ukrainian have hardly any presence in the broadcast media of Croatia.

82. The Committee of Experts reiterates[54] that the Croatian authorities need to change the current system of minority language broadcasting and to allocate to each minority language time slots for a television programme and a radio programme to be broadcast at regular intervals and of a sufficient duration. In this context, the Committee of Experts refers to the practice in other countries with a public television channel and a public radio station broadcasting in different minority languages.

83. The Agency for Electronic Media, through the Fund for Promotion of Pluralism and Diversity of Electronic Media, provides financial support to the production of local and regional radio and television programmes, including in minority languages, as well as electronic publications. In accordance with the Law on Electronic Media[55], the Fund encourages the production of audiovisual and radio projects, programs and content which are "of public interest and aimed at", *inter alia,* national minorities in Croatia. 3% of the funding is earmarked for national minorities. The Law on Electronic Media qualifies as "public interest" the programmes related to the rights of national minorities. In addition, the Agency for Electronic Media has drawn the attention of the applicants to the Fund to the recommendations for immediate action contained in the previous evaluation report, as indication to which minority languages need content production and

[51] See Report on the Implementation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National minorities and the Expenditure of the Insured Funds in the State Budget of the Republic of Croatia for 2022 for the needs of national minorities, available at Izvješće o provođenju Ustavnog zakona o pravima nacionalnih manjina i o utrošku sredstava osiguranih u Državnom proračunu Republike Hrvatske za 2022. godinu za potrebe nacionalnih manjina - podnositeljica: Vlada Republike Hrvatske | Hrvatski sabor
[52] Sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 48.
[53] See Evaluation of the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action contained in the 6th evaluation report, MIN-LANG (2022)3RIA, para.19.
[54] See sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 48.
[55] Zakon o elektroničkim medijima (nn.hr), NN111/2021

broadcasting.[56] Such steps are commendable. However, the Committee of Experts notes that these programmes are dependent on the interest of the local broadcasters (see below, under Slovak) or the capacity of national minorities.

84. As far as audiovisual works in general are concerned, short documentaries in several minority languages have been produced by the HRT. The Council for National Minorities has also financed some audiovisual productions.

85. Newspapers continue to be published in Czech (weekly), Hungarian (weekly), Italian (daily) and Serbian (weekly). The Committee of Experts commends this offer, which exceeds Croatia's undertaking to promote the publication of only newspaper *articles* in these languages (Article 11.1.eii). However, Ruthenian, Slovak and Ukrainian are not used in newspapers. In this context, the Committee of Experts reiterates that, in conformity with its regular interpretation, a "newspaper" in the sense of this undertaking has to be published at least weekly. It may also be published online. This applies also to *newspaper articles* in minority languages. In order to implement the undertaking for the aforementioned languages, the Croatian authorities should finance, at least, the weekly publication of articles in Ruthenian, Slovak and Ukrainian in mainstream (commercial) newspapers published in the areas where these languages are used or support the creation of weekly or daily newspapers of the national minorities concerned. [57]

86. With regard to Article 11.3, the Committee of Experts notes that Council for Electronic Media of the Agency for Electronic Media is the regulatory body for this domain. The representation of national minorities in this body is not ensured. However, the Council of National Minorities is, according to the Croatian legislation, the body established with a view to ensure participation of national minorities and it may co-operate with various state authorities and propose measures aimed at improving the situation of national minorities. In addition, the Council of National Minorities may provide opinions and make proposals concerning public broadcasting media. The HRT also submits an annual report to the Council for National Minorities. However, the Committee of Experts notes that the proposal of the Council for National Minorities to establish a distinct Department for National Minorities within the HRT, presented as a priority during the preparation of the agreement for 2023-2027 between the government and HRT, has not been taken into account.[58] The Committee of Experts asks the Croatian authorities to provide in the next periodical report precise information on how they ensure that the interests of national minorities, for example, as expressed by the Council for National Minorities in relation to various bodies, are taken into account.

Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

87. The Croatian authorities have supported cultural activities using minority languages (e.g. folklore festivals, concerts, literary events, theatre festivals, publishing activities, etc.). Furthermore, they have continued to provide financial support to central libraries of national minorities, including for staff and purchase of books. These are public libraries which have sections for minority languages (Czech, German, Hungarian, Italian, Ruthenian, Serbian, Slovak, Slovenian and Ukrainian) or libraries run by associations (for the Serbian and Roma national minority).

Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges

88. Croatia has bilateral agreements on national minority protection with Hungary, Italy and Serbia. Steps have been taken in order to conclude a similar agreement with Czechia. Agreements on cooperation in the field of culture, education and science are in force between Croatia and, *inter alia*, Czechia, Italy, Slovakia and Ukraine.

---

[56] https://www.aem.hr/blog/2021/06/24/preporuke-za-hitno-djelovanje-iz-izvjesca-odbora-strucnjaka-europske-povelje-o-regionalnim-ili-manjinskim-jezicima/

[57] See sixth evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, MIN-LANG (2019) 18, para. 56, seventh evaluation report of the Committee of Experts on Germany, MIN-LANG (2022) 7, para.36.

[58] See Report on the Implementation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National minorities and the Expenditure of the Insured Funds in the State Budget of the Republic of Croatia for 2022 for the needs of national minorities, available at Izvješće o provođenju Ustavnog zakona o pravima nacionalnih manjina i o utrošku sredstava osiguranih u Državnom proračunu Republike Hrvatske za 2022. godinu za potrebe nacionalnih manjina - podnositeljica: Vlada Republike Hrvatske | Hrvatski saborr

89. As far as co-operation with Italy is concerned, a mid-term review of the implementation of the agreement on national minority protection was carried out in 2021. The executive programme of co-operation in the field of culture and education between the Government of Croatia and the Government of Italy for 2022-2026[59] was also signed. As regards co-operation with Hungary, the Intergovernmental Mixed Committee for the protection of the rights of national minorities held its 16th meeting in 2022.[60]

90. As regards other countries, programmes of cooperation in the field of education for 2018-2022 and in the field of culture for 2019-2023 have been concluded with Slovakia[61]. A programme of co-operation in the field of culture has been concluded with Czechia in 2022. Moreover, the periodical report indicates that the Ministry of Culture and Media provided co-funding in the framework of the cultural cooperation programmes with Italy, Serbia and Slovenia, some of which have an impact on the promotion of the respective minority languages.

91. For some languages, there is also co-operation at local or regional level. Relevant activities are also carried out by associations of the national minorities. The Committee of Experts reiterates that the Croatian authorities should develop and implement strategies for the promotion of each minority language in the framework of co-operation with relevant countries, regions and municipalities. It invites them to provide detailed information in this respect in the next periodical report.

[59] https://www.beniculturali.it/comunicato/22725
[60] Budapesten ülésezett a magyar-horvát kisebbségi vegyes bizottság - Képes Újság (kepesujsag.com)
[61] Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Croatia - Overview of Bilateral Treaties of the Republic of Croatia by Country (gov.hr)

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Croatia

Boyash Romanian – Part II language

92. The speakers of Boyash Romanian live traditionally mainly in the counties of Međimurje and Osijek-Baranja. Most of the Roma in Croatia speak Boyash Romanian. Starting with the 2022/2023 school year, Boyash Romanian is taught at primary level under Model C, for three hours per week, at the schools of Orehovica, Kuršanec and Podturen (Article 7.1.f). A total of approximately 40 pupils from the 1st-8th grades attend the classes. There is a strong interest in teaching Boyash Romanian under Model C also at the school in Jagodnjak (county of Osijek-Baranja), but this is not yet possible due to a lack of teachers. During the on-the-spot visit, the argument was put forward in favour of an exception allowing graduates of three-years secondary education to teach Boyash Romanian, in order to overcome the obstacles linked to the lack of staff. The Committee of Experts invites the authorities to consider this option as a temporary measure, allowing a quick response to the interest for Boyash Romanian education and an opportunity for it to further develop. Boyash Romanian is not used at pre-school level, nor in secondary education. At the Chair of Romanian Philology at the University of Zagreb, language courses on Boyash Romanian continue to be offered and research is carried out. The presence of Boyash Romanian in public life (Article 7.1.d) remains limited. According to the periodical report, Boyash Romanian is present on the public television (*Prizma* and *Manjinski Mozaik)* when the stories cover Boyash Romanian speaking Roma; the speakers translate themselves the statements into Croatian. There is, however, no information about how often this is the case. In addition, in co-operation with UNICEF, some episodes of TV programmes and animated series for children (*Juhuhu*) have been translated into Boyash Romanian and made available on HRT-HTV 2 *,* on applications and on the HRTi online platform. The authorities also indicate that the online *Radio Kali Sara* (run by the "Kali Sara" Roma Association) broadcasts parts of its programme in Boyash Romanian, but there is no indication on the actual duration and frequency. Boyash Romanian is used online on *Phralipen.hr* and, to a very limited extent, in the printed version of the quarterly. During the Covid-19 pandemic, in the county of Međimurje, information material was translated into Boyash Romanian and distributed. After the 2021 census, the Roma minority reached the one third threshold in Orehovica (county of Međimurje), which means that Boyash Romanian should be introduced in equal and official use pursuant to the national legislation. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts has been informed about co-operation at non-governmental level with organisations from Romania (Article 7.1.i). The Committee of Experts is pleased to notice progress with respect to Boyash Romanian, in particular in education. It notes, nevertheless, that the speakers are concerned about the degree of protection and promotion of Boyash Romanian. This could be clearly noticed in the debate around the language to be introduced in equal and official use in Orehovica. They also feel that Boyash Romanian is not sufficiently integrated in the projects run by the Roma organisations and have indicated that they have not been consulted in the preparation of the periodical report by the authorities. The Committee of Experts also notes that the periodical report does not provide data on the number of Boyash Romanian speakers, although it states that most members of the Roma national minority speak Boyash Romanian.

Czech – Part II language and Part III language

93. Czech is in equal and official use in the municipality of Končanica/ Končenice (one third threshold) and in the town of Daruvar. It is not clear whether this status has been maintained in Dežanovac/Dežanovec, after the amendment of the statute in December 2021. Education in Czech is organised at pre-school level. In primary education Model A and Model C (two hours/week) are applied, while at secondary level education is organised according to Model B and Model C (two hours/week). According to the speakers, there is an increase in the number of pupils both at primary and at secondary level. Czech can be studied at the University of Zagreb. From 2019 – 2022, Czech has been used before courts once, in 2021, in criminal proceedings. As far as administrative authorities are concerned, bilingual Croatian-Czech identity cards have been issued. Otherwise, it is used mainly orally in contacts with the local authorities. There are no documents published in Czech, nor do the authorities provide written replies in Czech. In written correspondence, the Czech speakers address authorities bilingually, in Croatian and Czech, and wish that the replies are also in Czech. Some place names and names of institutions are signposted in Czech. As regards media, Czech has been used on public television (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, there have been 60 feature stories of a total of seven hours on *Prizma* and four 15 minutes episodes of *Manjinski mozaik* in Czech, rebroadcast 18 times). The public broadcaster HRT also produced and broadcast two short documentaries in Czech (15 minutes each). The

local radio stations *Radio Grubišno Polje* and *Radio Daruvar* broadcast programmes in Czech (of 30 minutes/month and 30 minutes/day, respectively), which are produced with the financial support of the Agency for Electronic Media. A weekly magazine is published in Czech (*Jednota*), with support from the Croatian authorities. The Croatian authorities provide financial support to cultural activities using Czech, such as music festivals, theatre festivals, as well as to books and other publications (including a monthly for children and two annual publications). Furthermore, they provide funding to the Community Library Daruvar/Central Library of Czechs in Croatia, through the Ministry of Culture and Media. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts was informed that Czech minority associations co-operate with Czech associations from other countries, as well as with local authorities in Czechia. Co-operation is in place also between local and regional authorities from Croatia and Czechia.

German – Part II language

94. German is used mainly in counties of Osijek-Baranja, Vukovar-Sirmium and in Zagreb. According to the information from the German speakers, bilingual (Croatian/German in approximately equal shares) pre-school education is available in Osijek. Teaching of German (Model C) in primary education is available in one school in Osijek; the number of hours reaches, according to the speakers, four hours per week including the hours of German as a foreign language. According to the authorities, Model C is available in two additional schools, in Josipovac and Beli Manastir. Model C is not applied to German in secondary education. One of the reasons is that after the end of primary school, pupils choose between different secondary schools, which makes the continuation of Model C difficult, due to the low number of pupils in each school. The number of pupils at pre-school and primary level has increased and, according to the German speakers, the interest is further growing. However, in Osijek, some requests to introduce German (Model C) have been refused. In 2022, the representatives of the German minority discussed with the authorities in Vukovar the possibility of teaching German (Model C) at primary level, but to date this has not been the case. Interest in German at pre-school and primary level continues to exist also in Đakovo, Sirač and Zagreb. German can be studied at universities of Osijek, Rijeka, Split, Zadar and Zagreb. The University of Osijek organises also studies of medicine in German, while the University of Zagreb offers a postgraduate degree programme on intercultural Croatian-German business communication. German is rarely used in the public television programmes (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021 there have been 29 features of a total of three hours on *Prizma* and one episode on *Manjinski mozaik*). The quarterly *Deutsches Wort* continues to be published with financial support from the Croatian authorities. The representatives of the German minority indicated their intention in developing a monthly magazine. German is also used in cultural activities.

Hungarian – Part II language and Part III language

95. Hungarian is in equal and official use in the municipalities of Kneževi Vinogradi/Hercegszöllős (one third threshold), Ernestinovo, Bilje/Bellye and Tordinci/Valkótard. Pre-school education is available in Hungarian. Furthermore, Hungarian is a medium of instruction in primary and secondary education (Model A). Teaching in/of Hungarian is also organised in accordance with Models B and C. Hungarian is used in technical and vocational education. Hungarian can be studied at the Universities of Osijek and Zagreb. In 2019 – 2022, Hungarian has been used before courts three times, in criminal and misdemeanour proceedings. As far as administrative authorities are concerned, bilingual Croatian-Hungarian identity cards have been issued. In local administration, Hungarian is used in particular when Hungarian-speaking staff is available. As far as the use by the authorities is concerned, the situation varies depending on the municipality. According to information received during the on-the-spot visit, one municipality (Kneževi Vinogradi/Hercegszöllős) is using Hungarian on its website and publishing documents in Hungarian. As far as media is concerned, Hungarian is used in programmes on public television (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, 66 feature stories of a total of six hours on *Prizma*, and six episodes of *Manjinski mozaik*, rebroadcast 24 times) and public radio (25 minutes/day on HRT Osijek). The local radio station *Radio Pitomača* broadcasts a programme in Hungarian, which is produced with the financial support of the Agency for Electronic Media. Programmes in Hungarian (30 minutes twice per week), which are produced with support from the Croatian authorities, are broadcast by a local TV. A weekly newspaper (*Új Magyar Kèpes Ùjság*) is published in Hungarian (print and online version), also with support from the Croatian authorities. The Croatian authorities provide financial support to cultural activities using Hungarian, such as folklore festivals, theatre festivals, exhibitions, as well as to the publication of books and magazines, including a quarterly for children. In addition, they provide funding to the Town Library Beli Manastir/Central

Library of Hungarians in Croatia. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit, there is close co-operation between the Hungarian associations from Croatia, and those of Hungarians in other countries. However, as far as local authorities from the two countries are concerned there is a low level of co-operation to the benefit of Hungarian.

Istro-Romanian – Part II language

96. Istro-Romanian is used in several settlements in the municipalities of Kršan (county of Istria) and in Žejane (municipality of Matulji, county of Primorje-Gorski Kotar). Istro-Romanian is still not taught under one of the minority language education models and remains only an extracurricular activity (language playgroups) at primary school level. Currently, 13 pupils in the first years of primary school participate. Playgroups sometimes involve pre-school children or adults, but there is no targeted policy of teaching Istro-Romanian at these levels. According to the speakers, although discussions have taken place about introducing teaching of Istro-Romanian as Model C, this has not yet been possible due to a lack of teachers. The playgroups are funded through public calls, at county level and by the Ministry of Culture and Media. As of 2021/2022, under a new project, once per week children learn Istro-Romanian at the "Vlaski puti" Interpretation Centre (part of the museum in Šušnjevica), as well as on the ground, talking to native speakers. The playgroups and all activities are mainly possible due to an association promoting Istro-Romanian, with the involvement of the museum in Šušnjevica, and the support from local authorities, the county of Istria and the Ministry of Culture and Media. As far as public life is concerned, the museum in Šušnjevica, co-funded by the local authorities, presents information in Istro-Romanian. According to the periodical report, Istro-Romanian was present on the public television (three contributions of a total of 15 minutes on *Prizma* and two episodes of *Manjinski Mozaik,* rebroadcast eight times). The association promoting Istro-Romanian also prepared short, animated films for children (available on Youtube) as well as video recordings where Istro-Romanian is used.[62] One project dedicated to Istro-Romanian stopped, but its resources remain available.[63] A language day is organised annually, where Istro-Romanian speakers from abroad also participate. The Committee of Experts notes that the promotion of Istro-Romanian is largely dependent on the commendable work of an association. However, the funding through the Council for National Minorities is not applicable, since Istro-Romanian speakers do not identify as a national minority. There is a clear need for structural support for the activities promoting Istro-Romanian. The Committee of Experts also reiterates the particular importance of a strategy for safeguarding Istro-Romanian as a living language. Such a strategy should comprise the promotional measures foreseen by Part II of the Charter, clarify for each measure the responsibilities of the authorities and foresee sufficient funding. The measures planned by the speakers in the areas of documentation, education and media could be part of a comprehensive strategy.[64]

Italian – Part II language and Part III language

97. Italian is in equal and official use in over 15 local self-government units in the county of Istria, including in the municipality of Grožnjan-Grisignana (one third threshold), in the towns of Poreč-Parenzo, Pula-Pola, Buje-Buie, Novigrad-Cittanova, Rovinj-Rovigno, Umag-Umago, Vodnjan-Dignano and in additional municipalities.[65] Furthermore, Italian is in equal and official use in the county of Istria. Teaching in Italian (Model A) is available at pre-school, primary, secondary and technical/vocational levels in Istria. Italian is taught under Model C outside Istria at primary level in Zadar, Pakrac and Lipik. In Zadar, there is a private Italian-language kindergarten, co-funded by the Italian association Unione Italiana/Talijanska Unija. Model C is also applied to Italian in secondary schools. Italian can be studied at the Universities of Pula-Pola, Rijeka, Split, Zadar and Zagreb. The University of Pula-Pola organises teacher training, including for pre-school level. It also offers a post-graduate programme in translation in the context of Croatian-Italian bilingualism and undergraduate programmes on culture, tourism and Italian language and culture. The University of Rijeka (the Faculty of Law) has a long-term co-operation with the Italian minority association, organising courses of legal terminology in Italian. In 2019 – 2022, Italian has been used to a limited extent before courts and the number of cases has been decreasing (three civil proceedings and 12 misdemeanour

[62] Udruga Spod Učke (krsan.hr)
[63] https://www.vlaski-zejanski.com/en
[64] See Evaluation of the Committee of Experts on the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action, MIN-LANG (2022)3, para.42.
[65] Such as Bale-Valle, Brtonigla-Verteneglio, Funtana-Fontane, Fažana-Fasana, Kaštelir-Labinci-Castelliere-S.Domenica, Motovun-Montona, Tar Vabriga-Torre Abrega, Vižinada-Visinada, Vrsar-Orsera.

proceedings in 2019, two criminal proceedings and one misdemeanour proceeding in 2020, one criminal proceeding in 2021, while in six cases the right to use Italian was waived, one criminal and two civil proceedings in 2022, while in nine misdemeanour proceedings the right was waived). As far as administrative authorities are concerned, bilingual Croatian-Italian identity cards have been issued. Italian is to a larger extent used by local authorities both internally and in relations with the speakers. The use of Italian place names is widespread. As regards media, Italian is used in public television programmes (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, 51 feature stories of a total of 5 hours on *Prizma*, 12 episodes of *Manjinski Mozaik*, with 49 rebroadcasts) and radio programmes (HRT Radio Pula/Pola, with daily short news, a daily 25-minute programme, as well as two weekly 10 and 20 minutes programmes; HRT Radio Rijeka, with two daily programmes of five and ten minutes). Several short documentary films were also produced and broadcast by HRT. Italian speakers highlighted that increased co-operation between the Croatian and Slovenian public TV could improve the presence of Italian in public media. The local TV Nova also broadcasts a 25-minute weekly programme in Italian. Local radio stations broadcast programmes in Italian (*Radio Istra* 15 minutes/week, *Radio Labin*, 29 minutes/week). A daily newspaper (*La voce del popolo*) on paper and online is published in Italian. There is also a monthly publication for children. The Croatian authorities provide financial support to cultural activities using Italian, such as song festivals, theatre, concerts and literary events, as well as to the publication of books and magazines, including a bilingual weekly publication and a monthly for children. In addition, they provide funding to the Town Library Pula-Pola/Central Library of Italians in Croatia. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit, there is close co-operation across borders at the level of associations and local authorities between Croatia and Slovenia, as well as between associations from Croatia and local authorities in Italy.

Ruthenian – Part II language and Part III language

98. Ruthenian is not in equal and official use in any local self-government unit. Ruthenian is present in education only at primary level, where it is taught according to Model C (four primary schools). No facilities exist for the study of Ruthenian at universities or equivalent institutions in Croatia, although discussions are ongoing between the University of Zagreb and the representatives of the Ruthenian national minority, facilitated by the Ministry of Science and Education. Teacher training activities are organised every two years, with specialists from Serbia. According to the information received from the Ruthenian speakers, work is on-going on the curriculum for teaching Ruthenian. Once adopted, it will allow for development of textbooks, which are to be adapted after those in Serbia, with support of Ministry of Science and Education. In 2019 – 2022, Ruthenian has been occasionally used in courts (in eight criminal proceedings). Except bilingual Croatian-Ruthenian identity cards being issued, there is no other use of Ruthenian in administration. Ruthenian is present on public television (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, 15 feature stories of a total of one hour and a half on *Prizma* and 3 episodes of *Manjinski mozaik*), but not on radio. Ruthenian is not used in newspapers. The Croatian authorities provided financial support to cultural activities promoting Ruthenian, such as a festival, as well as to the publication of books and magazines in Ruthenian, including a bi-monthly (*Nova Dumka*) and a semi-annual publication for children (*Vjenčić*). In addition, they provide funding for the Central Library of Ruthenians and Ukrainians in Croatia within the Zagreb City Libraries. Ruthenian minority associations from Croatia and Serbia co-operate.

Serbian – Part II language and Part III language

99. Serbian is in equal and official use in more than 20 local self-government units, but in no county.[66] Teaching in Serbian (Model A) is available at pre-school, primary, secondary and technical/vocational levels. Model C is also applied to Serbian. Serbian can be studied at the University of Zagreb (South Slavic languages and literature). Serbian can be used in judicial proceedings particularly thanks to mutual intercomprehension with Croatian. As far as administrative authorities are concerned, bilingual identity cards have been issued. Otherwise, the use of Serbian is limited to local self-government units where Serbs form a significant majority of the population, such as in the municipalities which are part of the Joint Council of Municipalities. In these places, Serbian and the Cyrillic script are used by local councils, in the publication

[66] Biskupija/Бискупија, Borovo/Борово, Civljane/Цивљане, Donji Lapac/Доњи Лапац, Dvor/Двор, Erdut/Ердут, Ervenik/Ервеник, Gračac/Грачац Gvozd/Гвозд, Jagodnjak/Јагодњак, Kneževi Vinogradi-Hercegszöllős/Кнежеви Виногради, Kistanje/Кистање, Krnjak/Крњак, Markušica/Маркушица, Negoslavci/Негославци, Plaški/Плашки, Šodolovci/Шодоловци; Trpinja/Трпиња, Udbina/Удбина, Vojnić/Војнић, Vrbovsko/Врбовско, Vrhovine/Врховине.

of documents, as well as in providing written replies. The use of place names in Serbian (Cyrillic script) is very limited, including in the municipalities mentioned above. Among the local branches of state authorities, the name board of the police station in Vrbovsko/Врбовско uses Serbian and Cyrillic script. As regards media, Serbian is present on public television (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, 121 feature stories of a total of 21 hours on *Prizma* and 19 episodes of *Manjinski Mozaik,* 93 rebroadcasts). Several documentary films have also been produced and broadcast by HRT. The public radio station HRT Radio Knin broadcast a weekly religious programme in Serbian (50 minutes). In 2022 the Serbian National Council launched *Vida TV*, an online TV channel (broadcasting content on Youtube, Facebook and via the portal *vidatv.hr*), which is supported financially by the Croatian authorities. The Joint Council of Municipalities also broadcasts video content via Youtube. Local radio stations also broadcast programmes in Serbian, with financial support from the Croatian authorities: *Radio Dunav* (30 minutes/month), *Radio Banska Kosa* (25 minutes/week), *Radio Borovo* (30 minutes biweekly). A weekly (*Novosti*) is published in Serbian and it has also an online portal. The Croatian authorities have provided financial support to the publication of books and magazines in Serbian, including a monthly for children, to cultural activities, conferences, as well as to the Central Library of Serbs in Croatia. They have also allocated funding for the purchase, (re)construction and equipment acquisition of the Serbian cultural centres in Knin, Osijek, Vukovar and Zagreb. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit, there is cross-border co-operation between local authorities in Croatia and Serbia or Bosnia and Herzegovina.

Slovak – Part II language and Part III language

100. Slovak is in equal and official use in one local self-government unit (municipality of Punitovci, county of Osijek-Baranja). Slovak is taught according to Model C in primary and secondary schools. According to the information from the authorities, one secondary school provides technical and vocational education. As of 2023, Slovak has also been used at pre-school level, in Jelisavac/Jelisavec (municipality of Našice), and there are plans to offer it in Punitovci as well. The teaching time at pre-school, however, of only 30 minutes twice per week, is too low and does not meet the requirements of the Charter. Slovak can be studied at the University of Zagreb. In 2019 -2022, Slovak has not been used before courts. As far as the administrative authorities are concerned, bilingual identity cards have been issued. There is no use of Slovak in communication with the authorities. Some place names in Slovak are signposted alongside the Croatian name. Slovak is rarely used in the public television programmes (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, 20 features of a total of two hours on Prizma and one episode of *Manjinski mozaik*, with 6 rebroadcasts). The public radio HRT Osijek broadcasts a programme in Slovak (25 minutes/week). Programmes in Slovak have been broadcast also on local radio stations: *Radio Ilok* (60 minutes/week), *Radio Đakovo* (30 minutes/week). *Radio Slatina* (45 minutes/week) and *Radio Našice*, with support from the Agency for Electronic Media. During the on-the-spot visit, the Committee of Experts has been informed that the ownership of Radio Ilok changed and the continuation of the programme in Slovak is not certain. There are no newspaper articles in Slovak. The Croatian authorities have provided financial support to cultural activities promoting Slovak, to the publication of books and magazines (including the monthly *Pramen*), as well as the Central Library of the Slovaks in the Croatian National Library in Našice. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit, Slovak minority associations from Croatia co-operate with those in other countries, as well as with local authorities from Slovakia. Co-operation is in place also between local authorities from Croatia and Slovakia.

Slovenian – Part II language

101. Slovenian is not used in pre-school education, but it is taught in primary and secondary education in accordance with Model C. Speakers reported difficulties in relations with primary schools, which refuse to organise teaching, even if there is interest by parents. According to the representatives of the speakers, there is a lack of teaching materials and of teachers. As far as the teaching materials are concerned, the Ministry of Science and Education promised support. Slovenian can be studied at the University of Zagreb. There is a joint doctoral study programme in Slovenian on governance and economics in the public sector at the University of Rijeka. Language courses for children and adults are organised by the Slovenian minority associations, with support from Slovenia. As far as public life is concerned, Slovenian was used in the public television programmes (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, 27 features of a total of two hours and a half on *Prizma*, and six episodes of *Manjinski mozaik*), but not on radio. Two short documentary films (of 14 minutes each) were also produced and broadcast by HRT. The Croatian authorities have provided financial support to the publication of magazines (several quarterlies, one

yearbook) and books, as well as for the organisation of cultural activities, such as concerts, exhibitions, cultural events. They also provide support to the Ivan Goran Kovačić Library/Central Library of Slovenes in Croatia, in Karlovac. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit, Slovenian minority associations from Croatia co-operate with similar organisations in Italy.

Ukrainian – Part II language and Part III language

102. Ukrainian is mainly used in Bogdanovci municipality (county of Vukovar-Sirmium), but has still not been introduced into equal and official use. Ukrainian is present in education only at primary level and it is taught according to Model C, for two or for five hours per week (in five schools). There is an increasing interest in teaching Ukrainian under Model C, bearing in mind the arrival of refugees from Ukraine; however, according to the speakers, the model might not be appropriate, since it implies knowledge of Croatian. Ukrainian may be studied at the University of Zagreb. Ukrainian is not used in administration. In 2019 – 2022, Ukrainian has been occasionally used with judicial authorities (four criminal proceedings in 2020, three in 2021 and one in 2022). Ukrainian is rarely used on public television (according to the periodical report, covering 2019 – 2021, nine contributions of one hour in total on *Prizma,* two episodes of *Manjinski mozaik*) and not at all on radio. The production of two films received financial support from the authorities. This language is not used in newspapers. The Croatian authorities provide financial support to cultural activities, such as festivals, literary events, to the publication of books and of a bilingual magazine (published every two months), as well as to the Central Library of Ruthenians and Ukrainians in Croatia within the Zagreb City Libraries. During the on-the-spot visit, the representatives of the Ukrainian minority indicated their interest in publishing a monthly magazine in Ukrainian. According to the information received during the visit, the Ukrainian House built through the efforts of associations and with support from authorities opened in Vukovar. [67]As far as co-operation across borders is concerned, during the on-the-spot visit the Committee of Experts was informed that Ukrainian associations in Croatia and in other countries co-operate.

[67] Otvoren Ukrajinski Dom u Vukovaru – Savjet za nacionalne manjine (nacionalne-manjine.info)

Chapter 2 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Boyash Romanian

2.1.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Boyash Romanian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Boyash Romanian[68]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Boyash Romanian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Boyash Romanian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Boyash Romanian				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Boyash Romanian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Boyash Romanian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Boyash Romanian at all appropriate stages		↗			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Boyash Romanian to learn it				↙	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Boyash Romanian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Boyash Romanian				↙	
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Boyash Romanian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Boyash Romanian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Boyash Romanian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Boyash Romanian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Boyash Romanian		=			

[68] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

103. Teaching of Boyash Romanian as Model C at primary level started in 2022/2023 at three schools. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.f partly fulfilled. There are no facilities enabling non-speakers of Boyash Romanian, including adults, to learn it. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.g not fulfilled. While there is some co-operation at the level of individual associations with organisations in Romania, this is not promoted by the authorities. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.i not fulfilled.

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Boyash Romanian in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[69] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Extend Boyash Romanian education in pre-school and primary education (Model C) in the counties of Međimurje and Osijek-Baranja, also by ensuring a sufficient number of teachers and teaching materials.**
b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme and a radio programme in Boyash Romanian of a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency in the areas where Boyash Romanian is traditionally used.**
c. **Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the speakers, a strategy on the promotion of the use of Boyash Romanian.**

II. Further recommendations

d. Promote awareness of the Boyash Romanian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
e. Support the provision of Boyash Romanian language courses, including for adults.
f. Increase the visibility of Boyash Romanian in public life, including in signage, in close consultation with the speakers.

[69] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8, CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

2.2 Czech

2.2.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Czech

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Czech**[70]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Czech as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Czech	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Czech		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Czech, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Czech • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Czech at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Czech to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Czech at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Czech	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Czech	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Czech among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Czech among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Czech • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Czech	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Czech or a substantial part of pre-school education in Czech at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Czech, a substantial part of primary education in Czech or teaching of Czech as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				

[70] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Czech[70]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Czech, a substantial part of secondary education in Czech or teaching of Czech as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Czech, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Czech or teaching of Czech as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Czech as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Czech as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Czech		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Czech	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Czech in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Czech, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Czech in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Czech in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Czech in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Czech in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Czech and the related use of documents and evidence in Czech, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Czech	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Czech may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Czech				↙	
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Czech may submit oral or written applications in Czech to local branches of the national authorities[71]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Czech or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Czech		=			
10.2.a	use of Czech within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Czech to submit oral or written applications in Czech to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Czech				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Czech				=	
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Czech		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Czech is used in the provision of public services				=	

[71] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.1.aiv which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.aiv.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Czech**[70]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
10.3.b	allow users of Czech to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Czech[72]					
10.3.c	allow users of Czech to submit a request in Czech to public service providers					
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Czech	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Czech	=[73]			=[74]	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Czech		↗			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Czech	=				
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Czech • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Czech • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Czech	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Czech are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Czech	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Czech in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Czech	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Czech in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Czech	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Czech in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Czech is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Czech in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				

[72] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.3.a, 10.3.b and 10.3.c which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Articles 10.3.b and 10.3.c.
[73] Public radio
[74] Public television

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Czech**[70]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.b	for the benefit of Czech, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Czech is used in identical or similar form		↗			

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

104. According to the Czech speakers the minority associations from Croatia, which receive support from the Croatian authorities, co-operate with similar organisation from other countries, as well as with local authorities in Czechia. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.i fulfilled. According to the information in the periodical report and during the on-the-spot visit, Czech is not used in relations with local branches of state authorities. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 10.1.aiii not fulfilled. The public broadcaster HRT produced two short audiovisual documentaries in Czech. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.d partly fulfilled. In light of the role of the Council for National Minorities (see paragraph 86) the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.3 partly fulfilled. According to information received during the on-the-spot visit, local and regional authorities from Czechia and Croatia co-operate. The Committee of Experts understands that Czech is promoted to some extent in the framework of such co-operation. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 14.b partly fulfilled.

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Czech in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[75] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Strengthen the use of Czech at the level of local branches of state authorities, regional and local authorities and extend its equal and official use to additional municipalities.**
b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme in Czech of a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**

[75] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

II. Further recommendations

c. Use Czech in public services provided by administrative authorities.
d. Promote the further use or adoption of place names in Czech.
e. Promote awareness of the Czech language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
f. Take measures to encourage and facilitate the use of Czech with judicial authorities.

2.3 German

2.3.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning German**[76]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of German as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of German	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote German		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of German, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using German • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of German at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of German to learn it		↗			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on German at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of German		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of German	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses German • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to German		=			

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

[76] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

105. **Courses of German for adults are available, but according to the information available to the Committee of Experts, authorities do not provide support to such courses. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.g partly fulfilled.**

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[77] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Extend the provision of German language education at pre-school and primary levels (Model C), including to additional municipalities, e.g. Đakovo, Sirač, Vukovar and Zagreb, as well as to the secondary level.**
b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme and a radio programme in German of a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**

II. Further recommendations

c. Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the German speakers, a strategy on the promotion of the use of German in different fields of public life covered by the Charter.
d. Promote awareness of the German language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.

[77] CM/RecChL(2001)2 CM/RecChL(2005)2 CM/RecChL(2008)1 CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

2.4 Hungarian

2.4.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Hungarian**[78]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Hungarian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Hungarian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Hungarian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Hungarian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Hungarian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Hungarian at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Hungarian to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Hungarian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Hungarian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Hungarian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Hungarian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Hungarian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Hungarian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Hungarian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Hungarian, a substantial part of primary education in Hungarian or teaching of Hungarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				

[78] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Hungarian**[78]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Hungarian, a substantial part of secondary education in Hungarian or teaching of Hungarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Hungarian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Hungarian or teaching of Hungarian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Hungarian as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Hungarian as a subject of adult and continuing education		↗			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Hungarian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Hungarian	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Hungarian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↙		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			↙		
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Hungarian and the related use of documents and evidence in Hungarian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Hungarian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Hungarian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Hungarian				↙	
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Hungarian may submit oral or written applications in Hungarian to local branches of the national authorities[79]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Hungarian or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Hungarian		=			
10.2.a	use of Hungarian within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Hungarian to submit oral or written applications in Hungarian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian		↗			

[79] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.1.aiv which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.aiv.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Hungarian**[78]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Hungarian		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Hungarian is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Hungarian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Hungarian					
10.3.c	allow users of Hungarian to submit a request in Hungarian to public service providers					
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Hungarian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Hungarian	= [80]	↗ [81]			
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Hungarian		↗			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Hungarian	=				
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Hungarian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Hungarian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Hungarian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Hungarian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Hungarian	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Hungarian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Hungarian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Hungarian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Hungarian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Hungarian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				

[80] Public radio
[81] Public television

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Hungarian**[78]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.b	for the benefit of Hungarian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Hungarian is used in identical or similar form				↙	

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

106. The Hungarian Centre in Osijek organises Hungarian language courses for adults, against a fee. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 8.1.fii partly fulfilled. Hungarian has not been used in civil proceedings. Therefore, the Committee of Experts considers the undertakings in Articles 9.1.bii and 9.1.biii formally fulfilled. According to the information in the periodical report and during the on-the-spot visit, Hungarian is not used in relations with local branches of state authorities. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 10.1.aiii not fulfilled. One local authority is publishing documents also in Hungarian. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article10.2.d partly fulfilled. The Croatian authorities provided support to production programmes in Hungarian, which are broadcast by a local TV (30 minutes twice per week). The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.aiii partly fulfilled for television. The production of radio programmes broadcast by a local radio received support from the Croatian authorities. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.d partly fulfilled. In light of the role of the Council for National Minorities (see paragraph 86) the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.3 partly fulfilled. The Committee of Experts has not received examples of activities promoting Hungarian in the framework of cross-border co-operation at regional and local levels and therefore concludes that the undertaking in Article 14 b is not fulfilled.

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[82] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

[82] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Strengthen the use of Hungarian at the level of local branches of state authorities, regional and local authorities and extend its equal and official use to additional municipalities.**
b. **Extend the broadcasting of television programmes in Hungarian with a view to reach a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**

II. Further recommendations

c. Use Hungarian in public services provided by administrative authorities.
d. Promote the further use or adoption of place names in Hungarian.
e. Promote awareness of the Hungarian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
f. Take measures to encourage and facilitate the further use of Hungarian with judicial authorities.
g. Promote co-operation across borders between local and regional authorities, for the benefit of Hungarian.

2.5 Istro-Romanian

2.5.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Istro-Romanian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration **=** no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Istro-Romanian**[83]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Istro-Romanian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Istro-Romanian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Istro-Romanian				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Istro-Romanian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Istro-Romanian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Istro-Romanian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Istro-Romanian to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Istro-Romanian at universities or equivalent institutions	↗				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Istro-Romanian		↗			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Istro-Romanian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Istro-Romanian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Istro-Romanian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Istro-Romanian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Istro-Romanian		=			

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

[83] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

107. Courses and research on Istro-Romanian are carried out at the Chair of Romanian at the University of Zagreb. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.h fulfilled. An Istro-Romanian language day is organised annually, with financial support from the authorities, and speakers living abroad participate. Bearing in mind that Istro-Romanian is traditionally spoken only in Croatia, by a low number of speakers, that there is a significant number of speakers having emigrated and living abroad, the Committee of Experts has decided to take into consideration the exchanges with these speakers in the context of Article 7.1.i. However, it underlines that the undertaking refers to "transnational exchanges […] for regional or minority languages used in an identical or similar form in two or more states". Therefore, exchanges could be further encouraged, for example with Romania. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.i partly fulfilled.

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Istro-Romanian in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[84] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Introduce Istro-Romanian in pre-school and primary education (Model C) in the municipalities of Kršan and Matulji and provide for a sufficient number of teachers and teaching materials.**
b. **Provide long-term sustainable funding to the activities and facilities promoting Istro-Romanian.**

II. Further recommendations

c. Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the speakers, a strategy on the safeguarding of Istro-Romanian as a living language.
d. Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme and a radio programme in Istro-Romanian of a sufficient duration and frequency in the areas where Istro-Romanian is traditionally used.
e. Strengthen support to the production of audio and audiovisual works in Istro-Romanian, including on the internet.
f. Support the provision of Istro-Romanian language courses for adults.
g. Promote awareness of the Istro-Romanian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.

[84] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

2.6 Italian

2.6.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Italian**[85]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Italian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Italian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Italian	=				
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Italian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Italian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Italian at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Italian to learn it		↗			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Italian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Italian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Italian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Italian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Italian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Italian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Italian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Italian, a substantial part of primary education in Italian or teaching of Italian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				

[85] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Italian[85]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Italian, a substantial part of secondary education in Italian or teaching of Italian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Italian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Italian or teaching of Italian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Italian as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Italian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Italian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Italian	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Italian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Italian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Italian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Italian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Italian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Italian and the related use of documents and evidence in Italian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Italian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Italian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Italian		=			
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Italian may submit oral or written applications in Italian to local branches of the national authorities[86]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Italian or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Italian		=			
10.2.a	use of Italian within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Italian to submit oral or written applications in Italian to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Italian		=			
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Italian		=			

[86] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.1.aiv which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.aiv.

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Italian[85]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Italian	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Italian is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.3.b	allow users of Italian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Italian[87]					
10.3.c	allow users of Italian to submit a request in Italian to public service providers					
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Italian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Italian	= [88]	↗ [89]			
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Italian		↗			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Italian	=				
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Italian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Italian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Italian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Italian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Italian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Italian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Italian	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Italian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Italian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Italian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Italian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Italian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				

[87] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.3.a, 10.3.b and 10.3.c which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Articles 10.3.b and 10.3.c.
[88] Public radio
[89] Public television

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Italian**[85]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.b	for the benefit of Italian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Italian is used in identical or similar form		↗			

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

108. Language courses for adults are organised by private language schools and by the Italian associations. These associations receive financial support from the Croatian authorities. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.g partly fulfilled. A local TV channel broadcasts programmes in Italian, which are produced with support from the Agency for Electronic Media. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.aiii partly fulfilled for television. Several audiovisual documentaries in Italian have been produced by HRT. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.d partly fulfilled. In light of the role of the Council for National Minorities (see paragraph 86) the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.3 partly fulfilled. According to information from the Italian speakers, there is co-operation between local authorities from Croatia and Slovenia, where Italian-speakers live. The Committee of Experts understands that Italian is promoted to some extent in the framework of such co-operation. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 14.b partly fulfilled.

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[90] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

[90] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Extend Italian language education to additional municipalities where Italian is used.**
b. **Extend the broadcasting of television programmes in Italian with a view to reaching a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**

II. Further recommendations

c. Take additional measures to facilitate the production and the timely translation of textbooks in Italian.
d. Promote awareness of the Italian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
e. Strengthen the use of Italian in practice at the level of local branches of state authorities.
f. Take measures to encourage and facilitate the further use of Italian with judicial authorities.

2.7 Ruthenian

2.7.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ruthenian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ruthenian[91]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Ruthenian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ruthenian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ruthenian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ruthenian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Ruthenian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ruthenian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ruthenian to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ruthenian at universities or equivalent institutions		↗			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ruthenian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ruthenian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ruthenian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ruthenian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ruthenian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ruthenian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Ruthenian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Ruthenian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				=	
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Ruthenian, a substantial part of primary education in Ruthenian or teaching of Ruthenian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

[91] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ruthenian[91]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Ruthenian, a substantial part of secondary education in Ruthenian or teaching of Ruthenian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Ruthenian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Ruthenian or teaching of Ruthenian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Ruthenian as a university and higher education subject				=	
8.1.fii	offer Ruthenian as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Ruthenian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Ruthenian		=			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Ruthenian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Ruthenian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Ruthenian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Ruthenian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Ruthenian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Ruthenian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				↙	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Ruthenian and the related use of documents and evidence in Ruthenian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Ruthenian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Ruthenian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Ruthenian				↙	
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Ruthenian may submit oral or written applications in Ruthenian to local branches of the national authorities[92]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Ruthenian or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Ruthenian		=			
10.2.a	use of Ruthenian within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Ruthenian to submit oral or written applications in Ruthenian to the regional or local authority				↙	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Ruthenian				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Ruthenian				=	

[92] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.1.aiv which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.aiv.

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ruthenian[91]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Ruthenian				=	
10.3.a	ensure that Ruthenian is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Ruthenian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Ruthenian[93]					
10.3.c	allow users of Ruthenian to submit a request in Ruthenian to public service providers					
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Ruthenian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Ruthenian				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Ruthenian			↗		
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Ruthenian				=	
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ruthenian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ruthenian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Ruthenian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Ruthenian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Ruthenian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Ruthenian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Ruthenian	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Ruthenian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Ruthenian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Ruthenian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Ruthenian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Ruthenian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				

[93] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.3.a, 10.3.b and 10.3.c which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Articles 10.3.b and 10.3.c.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ruthenian**[91]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.b	for the benefit of Ruthenian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Ruthenian is used in identical or similar form				↙	

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

109. Research on Ruthenian is carried out at the University of Zagreb. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking 7.1.h partly fulfilled. Ruthenian is not in equal and official use in any municipality. Therefore the undertakings in Articles 9.1.bii, biii, cii, ciii are not fulfilled. According to the information in the periodical report and during the on-the-spot visit, Ruthenian is not used in relations with the local branches with of the state authorities, nor with local and regional authorities. Ruthenian is also not in equal and official use in any municipality. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertakings in Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.2.b not fulfilled. The Fund for the Promotion of Pluralism and Diversity of Electronic Media encourages the production of audiovisual and radio projects, programs and content for national minorities in Croatia. 3% of the funding is earmarked for national minorities. However, there have been no audiovisual works produced in Ruthenian. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.d formally fulfilled. In light of the role of the Council for National Minorities (see paragraph 86) the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.3 partly fulfilled. Based on the available information, there is no cross-border co-operation between local authorities for the benefit of Ruthenian. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 14 b not fulfilled.

2.7.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ruthenian in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.7.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[94] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

[94] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Introduce Ruthenian in equal and official use in at least one municipality and use it in practice at the level of local and regional authorities.**
b. **Make pre-school education available in Ruthenian and teach this language in secondary education.**
c. **Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme and a radio programme in Ruthenian of a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**

II. Further recommendations

d. Provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Ruthenian.
e. Promote awareness of the Ruthenian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
f. Strengthen the use of Ruthenian in practice at the level of local branches of state authorities.
g. Use Ruthenian in public services provided by administrative authorities.
h. Promote the use or adoption of place names in Ruthenian.
i. Facilitate the publication of newspaper articles in Ruthenian on a regular basis, including online.
j. Facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Ruthenian, including on the internet.
k. Take measures to encourage and facilitate the further use of Ruthenian with judicial authorities.

2.8 Serbian

2.8.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

		The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Serbian**[95]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Serbian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Serbian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Serbian				↙	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Serbian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Serbian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Serbian at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Serbian to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Serbian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Serbian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Serbian		=			
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Serbian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Serbian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Serbian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Serbian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Serbian, a substantial part of primary education in Serbian or teaching of Serbian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient	=				

[95] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Serbian[95]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Serbian, a substantial part of secondary education in Serbian or teaching of Serbian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Serbian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Serbian or teaching of Serbian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient	=				
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Serbian as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Serbian as a subject of adult and continuing education		↗			
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Serbian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Serbian	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Serbian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Serbian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Serbian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Serbian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Serbian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Serbian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Serbian and the related use of documents and evidence in Serbian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Serbian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Serbian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Serbian				↙	
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Serbian may submit oral or written applications in Serbian to local branches of the national authorities[96]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Serbian or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Serbian		=			
10.2.a	use of Serbian within the framework of the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.b	possibility for users of Serbian to submit oral or written applications in Serbian to the regional or local authority		=			
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Serbian				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Serbian		=			

[96] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.1.aiv which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.aiv.

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Serbian[95]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Serbian		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Serbian is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Serbian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Serbian[97]					
10.3.c	allow users of Serbian to submit a request in Serbian to public service providers					
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Serbian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Serbian	= [98]	= [99]			
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Serbian		↗			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Serbian	=				
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Serbian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Serbian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Serbian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Serbian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Serbian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Serbian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Serbian	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Serbian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Serbian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Serbian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Serbian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Serbian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				

[97] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.3.a, 10.3.b and 10.3.c which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Articles 10.3.b and 10.3.c.
[98] Public radio
[99] Public television

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Serbian**[95]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.b	for the benefit of Serbian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Serbian is used in identical or similar form		↗			

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

110. After the new census and the decrease of the number of speakers, the position of Serbian language has weakened. It is no longer in equal and official use in Donji Kukuruzari/ Доњи Кукурузари and Vukovar/ Вуковар has abolished all provisions related to the use of Serbian. The Committee of Experts recalls that the Charter requires positive action from the authorities to promote minority languages and implies an obligation to take proactive measures in order to ensure systematically their use. Based on the available information, this is not the case for Serbian. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.c not fulfilled. According to the information received during the on-the-spot visit, there are courses for adults, but a limited interest in taking such courses. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 8.1.fii partly fulfilled. According to the information in the periodical report and during the on-the-spot visit, Serbian is not used in relations with local branches of state authorities. The Committee of Experts is aware that due to the close proximity for everyday spoken Croatian and Serbian (as used in Croatia) oral applications could be submitted in Serbian, but bearing in mind that the undertaking requires the authorities to "ensure" that speakers may submit oral and written requests and receive a reply in Serbian, the undertaking in Article 10.1.aiii is considered not fulfilled. Audiovisual documentaries in Serbian were produced by HRT. The Committee of Expert therefore considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.d partly fulfilled. In light of the role of the Council for National Minorities (see paragraph 86) the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.3 partly fulfilled. According to information received during the on-the-spot visit, there is co-operation across border between local authorities. The Committee of Experts understands that Serbian is promoted to some extent in the framework of such co-operation. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 14.b partly fulfilled.

2.8.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.8.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[100] remain valid in their own

[100] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Promote awareness of the Serbian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia including in mainstream education and in the media.**
b. **Take resolute steps to promote in the society as a whole respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian in Croatia.**
c. **Strengthen the use of Serbian and its script at the level of local branches of state authorities, regional and local authorities and extend its equal and official use to additional municipalities.**

II. Further recommendations

d. Use Serbian (Cyrillic script) in public services provided by administrative authorities.
e. Promote the use or adoption of place names in Serbian (Cyrillic script).
f. Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme in Serbian on a regular basis and of a sufficiently long duration.

2.9 Slovak

2.9.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovak

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

		The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:				
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Slovak**[101]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Slovak as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Slovak	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Slovak		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Slovak, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Slovak • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Slovak at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Slovak to learn it					=
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Slovak at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Slovak		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Slovak	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovak among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Slovak • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Slovak	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Slovak or a substantial part of pre-school education in Slovak at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				=	
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Slovak, a substantial part of primary education in Slovak or teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

[101] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Slovak**[101]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Slovak, a substantial part of secondary education in Slovak or teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		=			
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Slovak, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Slovak or teaching of Slovak as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient		↗			
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Slovak as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Slovak as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Slovak		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Slovak		=			
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Slovak in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Slovak, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned			=		
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Slovak in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Slovak in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Slovak in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Slovak in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations			=		
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Slovak and the related use of documents and evidence in Slovak, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Slovak	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Slovak may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Slovak				↙	
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Slovak may submit oral or written applications in Slovak to local branches of the national authorities[102]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Slovak or in bilingual versions		=			
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Slovak		=			
10.2.a	use of Slovak within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Slovak to submit oral or written applications in Slovak to the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Slovak				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Slovak				=	

[102] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.1.aiv which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.aiv.

Article	Undertakings of Croatia concerning Slovak[101]	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*: fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Slovak		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Slovak is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Slovak to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Slovak[103]					
10.3.c	allow users of Slovak to submit a request in Slovak to public service providers					
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Slovak	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Slovak	=[104]			=[105]	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Slovak		↗			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Slovak				=	
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Slovak • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Slovak	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Slovak are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Slovak	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Slovak in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Slovak	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Slovak in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Slovak	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Slovak in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Slovak is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Slovak	=				

[103] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.3.a, 10.3.b and 10.3.c which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Articles 10.3.b and 10.3.c.
[104] Public radio
[105] Public television

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Slovak**[101]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
	in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education					
14.b	for the benefit of Slovak, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Slovak is used in identical or similar form		↗			

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

111. Slovak is taught in technical education in one school. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 8.1.div partly fulfilled. According to the available information, Slovak is not used in relations with local branches of state authorities. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 10.1.aiii not fulfilled. The production of radio programmes broadcast by several local radio stations received support from the Croatian authorities. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.d partly fulfilled. In light of the role of the Council for National Minorities (see paragraph 86) the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.3 partly fulfilled. According to information received during the on-the-spot visit, local authorities from Croatia and Slovakia co-operate. The Committee of Experts understands that Slovak is promoted to some extent in the framework of such co-operation. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 14.b partly fulfilled.

2.9.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovak in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.9.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[106] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

[106] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Use Slovak at the level of regional and local authorities and extend its equal and official use to additional municipalities.**
b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme in Slovak with a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**
c. **Strengthen the use of Slovak in pre-school education.**

II. Further recommendations

d. Promote awareness of the Slovak language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
e. Strengthen the use of Slovak at the level of local branches of the national authorities.
f. Use Slovak in public services provided by administrative authorities.
g. Promote the use or adoption of place names in Slovak.
h. Facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Slovak, including on the internet.
i. Take measures to encourage and facilitate the use of Slovak with judicial authorities.

2.10 Slovenian

2.10.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Slovenian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration **=** no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Slovenian**[107]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Slovenian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Slovenian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Slovenian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Slovenian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Slovenian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Slovenian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Slovenian to learn it				↙	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Slovenian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Slovenian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Slovenian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovenian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Slovenian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Slovenian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Slovenian		=			

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

[107] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

112. Language courses for children and adults are organised by Slovenian associations, but with financial support from Slovenia. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.g not fulfilled.

2.10.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Slovenian in Croatia

The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered "fulfilled" (see under 2.10.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[108] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Make pre-school education available in Slovenian.**
b. **Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme and a radio programme in Slovenian with a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**

II. Further recommendations

c. Promote awareness of the Slovenian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
d. Take measures to increase the training of teachers of Slovenian for all levels of education.
e. Support the provision of Slovenian language courses, including for adults.
f. Develop and implement, in co-operation with representatives of the Slovenian speakers, a strategy on the promotion of the use of Slovenian in different fields of public life covered by the Charter.

[108] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

2.11 Ukrainian

2.11.1 Compliance of Croatia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Ukrainian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↙ deterioration = no change

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ukrainian**[109]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
Part II of the Charter ***(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)***						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Ukrainian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Ukrainian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Ukrainian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Ukrainian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	• maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the state using Ukrainian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups	=				
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Ukrainian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Ukrainian to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Ukrainian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Ukrainian	↗				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Ukrainian	=				
7.3	• promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Ukrainian among their objectives		=			
7.4	• take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Ukrainian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Ukrainian	=				
Part III of the Charter ***(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)***						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.aiii	make available pre-school education in Ukrainian or a substantial part of pre-school education in Ukrainian at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient				=	
8.1.biv	make available primary education in Ukrainian, a substantial part of primary education in Ukrainian or teaching of Ukrainian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils whose families so request and whose number is considered sufficient		=			

[109] In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ (treaty No. 148).

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ukrainian**[109]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
8.1.civ	make available secondary education in Ukrainian, a substantial part of secondary education in Ukrainian or teaching of Ukrainian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.div	make available technical and vocational education in Ukrainian, a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Ukrainian or teaching of Ukrainian as an integral part of the curriculum at least to those pupils who so wish in a number considered sufficient				=	
8.1.eii	provide facilities for the study of Ukrainian as a university and higher education subject	=				
8.1.fii	offer Ukrainian as a subject of adult and continuing education				=	
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Ukrainian		=			
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Ukrainian	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.aii	guarantee the accused the right to use Ukrainian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.aiv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Ukrainian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned		=			
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Ukrainian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.biii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Ukrainian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Ukrainian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Ukrainian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations				=	
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Ukrainian and the related use of documents and evidence in Ukrainian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned				=	
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Ukrainian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.aiii	ensure that users of Ukrainian may submit oral or written applications to local branches of the national authorities and receive a reply in Ukrainian				↙	
10.1.aiv	ensure that users of Ukrainian may submit oral or written applications in Ukrainian to local branches of the national authorities[110]					
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Ukrainian or in bilingual versions				=	
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Ukrainian			↗		
10.2.a	use of Ukrainian within the framework of the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.b	possibility for users of Ukrainian to submit oral or written applications in Ukrainian to the regional or local authority				=	
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Ukrainian				=	
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Ukrainian				=	

[110] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.1.aiii and 10.1.aiv which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Article 10.1.aiv.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ukrainian**[109]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Ukrainian				=	
10.3.a	ensure that Ukrainian is used in the provision of public services				=	
10.3.b	allow users of Ukrainian to submit a request to and receive a reply from public service providers in Ukrainian[111]					
10.3.c	allow users of Ukrainian to submit a request in Ukrainian to public service providers					
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Ukrainian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.aiii	make provision so that public broadcasters offer radio and television programmes in Ukrainian				=	
11.1.d	encourage and/or facilitate the production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in Ukrainian		↗			
11.1.eii	encourage and/or facilitate the weekly or daily publication of newspaper articles in Ukrainian				=	
11.2	• guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ukrainian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Ukrainian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Ukrainian	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Ukrainian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media		↗			
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Ukrainian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Ukrainian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.1.g	encourage and/or facilitate the creation of a body responsible for collecting, keeping a copy of and presenting or publishing works produced in Ukrainian	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Ukrainian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Ukrainian	=				
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Ukrainian in connection with economic or social activities	=				
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the states in which Ukrainian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Ukrainian in the states concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				

[111] Croatia has ratified Articles 10.3.a, 10.3.b and 10.3.c which constitute alternative options. Consequently, the Committee of Experts will not evaluate the implementation of Articles 10.3.b and 10.3.c.

	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	**Undertakings of Croatia concerning Ukrainian**[109]	**fulfilled**	**partly fulfilled**	**formally fulfilled**	**not fulfilled**	**no conclusion**
14.b	for the benefit of Ukrainian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Ukrainian is used in identical or similar form					=

*** The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of states parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:**

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.
Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.
Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.
Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.
No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

113. Ukrainian minority associations from Croatia co-operate with similar associations in other countries and participate in the Ukrainian international non-governmental organisations. The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 7.1.i fulfilled. Ukrainian is not in equal and official use in any municipality. According to the information available, it is not used in relation with local branches of state authorities. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 10.1.aiii not fulfilled. The authorities may issue bilingual identity cards irrespective of a language being in official use or not. The undertaking in Article 10.1.c is therefore formally fulfilled. The production of two films in Ukrainian has been financially supported by the Council for National Minorities. The Committee of Experts therefore considers the undertaking in Article 11.1.d partly fulfilled. In light of the role of the Council for National Minorities (see paragraph 86) the Committee of Experts considers the undertaking in Article 11.3 partly fulfilled.

2.11.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Ukrainian in Croatia

113. The Committee of Experts recommends the Croatian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.11.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Croatia[112] remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

[112] CM/RecChL(2001)2; CM/RecChL(2005)2; CM/RecChL(2008)1; CM/RecChL(2010)8; CM/RecChL(2015)2; CM/RecChL(2020)7

I. Recommendations for immediate action

a. **Introduce Ukrainian in equal and official use in at least one municipality and use it in practice at the level of local branches of national authorities, local and regional authorities.**
b. **Make pre-school education available in Ukrainian and teach this language in secondary education.**
c. **Introduce the broadcasting of a television programme and a radio programme in Ukrainian with a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.**

II. Further recommendations

d. Promote awareness of the Ukrainian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, including in mainstream education and in the media.
e. Use Ukrainian in public services provided by administrative authorities.
f. Promote the use or adoption of place names in Ukrainian.
g. Facilitate the publication of newspaper articles in Ukrainian on a regular basis, including online.
h. Take measures to encourage and facilitate the further use of Ukrainian with judicial authorities.

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Croatian authorities have undertaken to protect the regional or minority languages spoken in their country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Croatia.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Having regard to the instrument of ratification deposited by Croatia on 5 November 1997;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Croatia;

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Croatia in its seventh periodical report, supplementary information given by the Croatian authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Croatia and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Croatian authorities on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;

Recommends that the Croatian authorities take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. take resolute steps to promote awareness and tolerance vis-à-vis the minority languages and the cultures they represent as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Croatia, both in the general curriculum at all stages of education and in the media, as well as by increasing their visibility in the public space;

2. take the necessary measures to introduce minority languages in equal and official use, irrespective of the threshold and ensure that each minority language covered by Part III is in equal and official use in at least one local self-government unit;

3. ensure the use of minority languages in practice at the level of the local branches of state authorities, and of county and local authorities;

4. extend the use of minority languages in education in order to ensure continuity from pre-school to secondary education for each language;

5. provide for each minority language public radio and television programmes with a sufficient duration, regularity and frequency.

The Committee of Ministers invites the Croatian authorities to submit information on the recommendations for immediate action by 1 September 2025 and the next periodical report by 1 March 2028.

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification

 **Croatia**

Reservation contained in the instrument of ratification, deposited on 5 November 1997 - Or. Cro./Engl.

The Republic of Croatia declares, in pursuance of Article 21 of the European Charter for Regional of Minority Languages, that in respect of the Republic of Croatia the provisions of Article 7, paragraph 5, of the Charter shall not apply.
Period covered: 01/03/1998 -
Articles concerned: 7

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification, deposited on 5 November 1997 - Or. Cro./Engl.

The Republic of Croatia declares that, in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, and Article 3, paragraph 1, of the European Charter for Regional of Minority Languages, it shall apply to Italian, Serbian, Hungarian, Czech, Slovak, Ruthenian and Ukrainian languages the following paragraphs of the Charter:

- In Article 8:
paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), b (iv), c (iv), d (iv), e (ii), f (ii), g, h;

- In Article 9:
paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (ii), a (iv), b (ii), b (iii), c (ii), c (iii), d;
paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a;

- In Article 10:
paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), a (iv) b, c;
paragraph 2, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d, g;
paragraph 3, sub-paragraphs a, b, c;
paragraph 5;

- In Article 11:
paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (iii), d, e (ii);
paragraph 2;
paragraph 3;

- In Article 12:
paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, f, g;

- In Article 13:
paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c;

- Article 14.

Period covered: 01/03/1998 -

Articles concerned: 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 2, 3, 8, 9

Declaration contained in the instrument of ratification, deposited on 5 November 1997 - Or. Cro./Engl.

The Republic of Croatia declares, with regard to Article 1, paragraph b., of the Charter, that pursuant to Croatian legislature, the term "territory in which the regional or minority languages is used" shall refer to those areas in which the official use of minority language is introduced by the by-laws passed by the local self-government units, pursuant to Article 12 of the Constitution of the Republic of Croatia and Articles 7 and 8 of the Constitutional Law on Human Rights and Freedoms and the Rights of National and Ethnic Communities or Minorities on the Republic of Croatia.

Period covered: 01/03/1998 -

Articles concerned: 1

Appendix II: Comments from the Croatian authorities

RESPONSE OF THE REPUBLIC OF CROATIA TO THE SEVENTH REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE OF EXPERTS ON THE APPLICATION OF THE EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES IN THE REPUBLIC OF CROATIA

The Government of the Republic of Croatia welcomes the adoption of the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages in the Republic of Croatia (hereinafter: Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts) and endorses all constructive assessments, comments and proposals from the Committee of Experts with a view to further progress in the application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereinafter: the Charter).

The Government of the Republic of Croatia is firmly committed to continuing to fulfil the obligations undertaken by ratifying the Charter, as demonstrated in the Seventh Report of the Republic of Croatia on the Application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. In order to further clarify certain questions and comments by the Committee of Experts and the Proposals for Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, the Government of the Republic of Croatia submits the following response to the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts:

Paragraph 6

With regard to the opinion of the Committee of Experts, the Government of the Republic of Croatia indicates that the precise title of the document mentioned in paragraph 6 is “Operational Programmes of National Minorities 2021-2024”, whereas the earlier version was called Operational Programmes for National Minorities 2017-2020. The latest Operational Programmes of National Minorities 2021-2024 are also part of the Government Programme 2020-2024.

Furthermore, regarding paragraph 6, it is important to emphasise that the Operational Programmes of National Minorities were adopted in close cooperation with minority representatives and associations, which gives them added value, and they contain priority activities as perceived by minority representatives themselves.

Operational Programmes of National Minorities consist of activities related to the protection and improvement of the existing level of rights of all national minorities recognised under the Constitution of the Republic of Croatia, including operational programmes which contain activities related to individual national minorities considering their specificities and the need to improve the existing level of their protection. Special operational programmes were thus developed for Serbian, Italian, Czech, Slovak, Hungarian, Albanian, Bosniak, Montenegrin, Macedonian, Slovenian, Roma, Austrian, German, Polish, Ruthenian, Russian, Turkish, Ukrainian and Jewish national minorities.

Paragraphs 13-21

With regard to the opinion of the Committee of Experts that the legal threshold i.e. the requirement that members of a national minority make up a third of the population of a local or regional self-government unit in order to introduce the minority language and script into co-official use is too high, and that the alternative of voluntary introduction of languages into co-official use by local and regional self-government units is not adequately promoted and has not been applied by any unit in recent years, we would like to emphasise the following:

As mentioned above, in accordance with Article 12 of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities (*Narodne novine* Nos 155/02, 47/10, 80/10 and 93/11), equal official use of the language and script used by members of a national minority is realised on the territory of a local self-government unit when members of the national minority constitute at least one third of the population of the unit, when this is envisaged by international treaties or by the statute of a local or regional self-government unit. In view of the above, the data for the preparation of the 2023 Report on the Implementation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities, obtained from local and regional self-government units, show that equal official use of the languages and scripts of national minorities was also introduced pursuant to the statutes in units where the legal precondition of at least one third of minority members in the population, has not been met, either on the territory of the entire unit or in individual settlements, as follows: Istria County (Italian) and Bjelovar-Bilogora County (Albanian, Czech, Hungarian and Serbian); cities: Poreč-Parenzo, Pula-Pola, Buje-Buie, Novigrad-Cittanova, Rovinj-Rovigno, Umag-Umago, Vodnjan-Dignano (Italian) and Vrbovsko (Serbian), Daruvar (Czech), Našice (Slovak), and municipalities: Bale-Valle, Brtonigla-Verteneglio, Funtana-Fontane, Fažana-Fasana, Kaštelir-Labinci-Castelliere-S.Domenica, Motovun-Montona, Raša, Tar Vabriga-Torre Abrega, Vižinada-Visinada, Vrsar-Orser (Italian), Ernestinovo and Tordinci (Hungarian), Kneževi Vinogradi (Serbian), Dežanovac (Czech) and Punitovci (Slovak).

In this regard, it should also be noted that, on 21 July 2023, the City of Našice adopted a Statutory Decision on Amendments to the Našice City Statute, by which members of the Slovak national minority were granted the right to the official use of the Slovak language in the settlement of Jelisavac. Equal use of the language and script of the Slovak national minority is realised in the bilingual name of the settlement, streets, public institutions, local community centres, schools and other institutions, and natural persons performing public activities as well as legal persons can use their names in both Croatian and Slovak.

With regard to statements from paragraphs 16-19 of the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts on a decrease in the share of members of national minorities in the 2021 Census, as a consequence of which some local self-government units are no longer under an obligation to have minority languages in co-official use, we would like to point out the following:

Following the publication of the 2021 Census results, it was established that, in relation to the results of the 2011 Census, the share of national minority members fell below one third of the population in 4 local self-government units – the cities of Vukovar and Vrbovsko (Serbian national minority) and the municipalities of Punitovci (Slovak national minority) and Donji Kukuruzari (Serbian national minority) –, so the legal requirement of one third of members of a national minority for the introduction of bilingualism no longer exists in those units. However, co-official use of the languages and scripts of the national minorities may be introduced through the statutes of those units. In that regard, it should be noted that the City of Vukovar and the municipality of Donji Kukuruzari have amended their statutes in relation to the 2021 Census results, whereas the City of Vrbovsko and the Municipality of Punitovci have not amended the statutes, and therefore the statutory provisions on equal official use of the languages and scripts of the national minorities in question have remained in force after the 2021 Census.

In addition, in paragraph 16 of the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts, the technical data on the number of local and regional self-government units in the Republic of Croatia should be corrected, as the exact number of local self-government units is 555, instead of 556.

In relation to the statements in paragraph 21 of the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts that Croatian authorities should encourage local self-government units to introduce equal official use of minority languages and Recommendation 2 from Chapter 3 of the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts that the Republic of Croatia takes the necessary measures to introduce minority languages in equal and official

use, irrespective of the threshold and ensure that each minority language covered by Part III is in equal and official use in at least one local self-government unit, we state the following:

For the purposes of drafting a report on the implementation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities, the Ministry of Justice and Public Administration regularly monitors and analyses the state of provisions in local statutes in relation to the co-official use of languages and scripts of national minorities and encourages units to apply the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities, the Act on the Use of Languages and Scripts of National Minorities in the Republic of Croatia (*Narodne novine* Nos 51/00 and 56/00 – corrigendum) and the Charter.

Analysing by individual languages covered by Part II (Article 7 of the Charter) and Part III (Articles 8-14 of the Charter) – Czech, Hungarian, Italian, Russian, Serbian, Slovak and Ukrainian – , according to the 2023 Report on the Implementation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities, all the languages except Ruthenian and Ukrainian are in equal official use in at least two units of local self-government.

Units with the largest share of members of the Ruthenian national minority according to the 2021 Census are the Municipality of Bogdanovci (19.48 %) and the Municipality of Tompojevci (16.40 %).

The unit with the largest share of members of the Ukrainian national minority is the Municipality of Bogdanovci (7.77 %).

These units have not provided for the equal official use of the language and script of the Ruthenian or Ukrainian national minority in their statutes, but have envisaged other rights of members of national minorities, such as the right to use and display the symbols and flags of national minorities, to perform the anthem and/or festive song of the national minority on occasions important to the national minority, councils and representatives of national minorities may also use other symbols and insignia of their national minority for official purposes, and other rights.

Paragraph 62

With regard to the statement in the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts that there are no courses in Boyash Romanian for adults or for non-speakers, we would point out that such courses are available: since 2012, Prof. Dr. Petar Radosavljević has held the elective course “Language of Roma Boyash in Croatia - Boyash Romanian Dialects” at the Romanian Language Department of the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences of the University of Zagreb. Furthermore, since 2014, Prof. Radosavljević has also taught an elective course at the Faculty of Teacher Education in Čakovec, entitled “Elementary Boyash Romanian for Primary School and Preschool Teachers”.

Moreover, the Roma Association Step by Step (part of the REYN network) was organising a beginners’ course in Boyash Romanian and several workshops in the period 2018-2022, mainly for persons in the field of education and social welfare. There is also an accompanying textbook, and apart from Prof. Dr. Radosavljević, two native speakers have taught the course.

Paragraph 70

With regard to the use of minority languages in the local branches of state authorities, we would like to state that, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph (4) of the Constitution of the Republic of Croatia (*Narodne novine* No 85/10 – consolidated text and 5/14 – Decision of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Croatia), the Croatian Pension Insurance Institute (hereinafter: the Institute), which is under the competence

of the Ministry of Labour, Pension System, Family and Social Policy, treats all regional or minority languages in the same way, and the use of regional or minority languages is not an obstacle to proper communication.

In addition to its in-house translators/interpreters, the Institute regularly concludes contracts for translation/interpretation services for its own needs. This includes simultaneous and consecutive interpretation as well as the translation of various letters, requests, submissions and other documents received from both foreign social security administrations and from insured persons and pension beneficiaries, from and into Croatian. Therefore, any member of a national minority may at any time address and communicate with the Institute in writing using a regional or minority language.

It should be noted that the Institute, within its scope of competence and action, has so far not encountered a legal situation that could not be resolved due to the use of a minority or regional language, and has in fact contributed to the realisation of the principle of equality in society and promoted the spirit of tolerance and dialogue.

Furthermore, the Institute has so far not received any complaints about limitations in the use of regional or minority languages.

Paragraph 74

With regard to the indication in the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts that one seminar for civil servants organised annually on the implementation of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities is not sufficient and that the efforts need to be intensified, please note that in 2023, for example, one seminar was held and another one was planned, but was cancelled due to an insufficient number of applicants (minimum of 10). In other words, the number of seminars per year depends on the interest of participants i.e. state and local civil servants who perform tasks related to the application of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities.

Paragraphs 77 - 82

With regard to the statements in the above paragraphs of the Report of the Committee of Experts, we must point out that the Croatian Radiotelevision produces TV programmes for and about national minorities that are of high professional quality and public value, and the duration and weekly rhythm of broadcasting are in line with the requirements of television media. Members of minorities who appear in the programmes are always encouraged to speak in their native minority language, and the content is subtitled in Croatian in order to increase the reach and impact of the programmes.

In a daily and/or weekly rhythm, the Croatian Radiotelevision produces and broadcasts radio programmes in Italian, Hungarian and Slovak, produced by journalists who are speakers of minority languages.

Making the quality of the programme and high creative and editorial standards a priority even in a financially challenging time, the Croatian Radiotelevision has not given up on the production of programmes characterised by authenticity and constructive journalism – key media contributions to the creation of an inclusive society.

Given that 22 national minorities live in the Republic of Croatia, and each of them has its own specificities and language, it is difficult for the Croatian Radiotelevision as a public broadcasting service to ensure equal representation for each of them and to ensure that each minority language gets a programme of sufficient duration and frequency, but we have been making efforts to increase the share of programmes on national minorities on all our stations. In 2022, the share of programmes on national minorities was increased by

7.6 % compared to 2021. Specifically, the Croatian Radiotelevision broadcasted 42,584 minutes of content on national minorities in 2021 and 45,818 minutes in 2022.

Additionally, the Republic of Croatia is a party to a number of international treaties and recommendations of both the European Union and the Council of Europe concerning freedom of expression and media freedom, and it ensures proper and full implementation of existing media law, in order to ensure the highest standards for all media in Croatia. Equally, the protection of minority languages is taken into account in all legislation in the field of culture and media, and cultural activities of minorities in the Republic of Croatia are financed through public calls.

Paragraph 92

With regard to the indication in the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts that the authorities did not consult Roma organisations when preparing the periodical report, we would like to inform you that the Proposal for the Seventh Report of the Republic of Croatia on the Application of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages was submitted for feedback to certain associations dealing with the rights of national minorities, including the Union of Roma in the Republic of Croatia “Kali Sara”.

Paragraph 93

In relation to the question from paragraph 93 of the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts on whether the equal official use of the language and script of the Czech national minority has been maintained in the Municipality of Dežanovac after the amendments to the Statute in December 2021, the Statute of the Municipality of Dežanovac of 10 December 2021 only provides for the right of legal and natural persons performing public activities to display bilingual/multilingual names.

Paragraph 103

With regard to the statement in the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts that there are no facilities enabling non-speakers of Boyash Romanian, including adults, to learn it, please see the comment on paragraph 62.

Paragraph 113

Regarding the statements from the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts regarding bilingual identity cards, we would point out that identity cards in the Republic of Croatia can only be issued in accordance with the provisions of the Identity Card Act (*Narodne novine* Nos 62/15, 42/20, 144/20 and 18/24) and other relevant laws.

Specifically, Article 7, paragraph (1) of the Identity Card Act stipulates that the identity card form is printed in Croatian and English and Latin script, and is to be filled out only in the Croatian language and Latin script, while paragraph 2 stipulates that, where provided for by a special law or international treaties, the identity card form for a person who is a member of a national minority is also printed and filled out in the language and script of the national minority.

Furthermore, Article 12 of the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities stipulates that equal official use of the language and script used by members of a national minority is to be realised on the territory of a local regional self-government unit when members of the national minority constitute at least one third of the population of such a unit, when this is provided for in international treaties or prescribed by the statute of a local self-government unit or by the statute of a regional self-government unit, in accordance

with the provisions of the special law on the use of the languages and scripts of national minorities in the Republic of Croatia.

In this regard, Article 18, paragraph (1) of the Act on the Use of Languages and Scripts of National Minorities in the Republic of Croatia (*Narodne novine* Nos 51/00 and 56/00) stipulates that state administration bodies of first instance, organisational units of central state administration bodies acting in first instance, judicial bodies of first instance, state attorney's offices and state advocate's offices of first instance, notaries public and legal persons vested with public powers which have their offices and branches in municipalities, cities and counties in which the language and script of a national minority is in co-official use are obliged, at the request of citizens, to issue public documents and print forms used for official purposes bilingually or multilingually.

The Instructions for Consistent Application of the Act on the Use of Languages and Scripts of National Minorities in the Republic of Croatia stipulate that the duty to act in accordance with the above provisions also lies with state bodies of first instance and legal persons vested with public powers which have offices outside the territories of self-government units in which the languages and scripts of a national minority are in co-official use if they have territorial and/or subject-matter competence on the territories of the self-government units that have provided for or introduced equal official use of minority languages and scripts by their statutes.

Consequently, we would point out that the Ministry of the Interior issues identity cards in accordance with the prescribed procedures and exclusively in accordance with the provisions of the Identity Card Act, the Constitutional Act on the Rights of National Minorities and the Act on the Use of Languages and Scripts of National Minorities in the Republic of Croatia, and must not issue identity cards in a manner that would deviate from these regulations without a relevant legal basis. Accordingly, please review the claims from Chapter 2, Part 2.11(1), paragraph 113 of the Seventh Report of the Committee of Experts.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages is an independent body that evaluates the compliance of the States Parties with their undertakings and, where appropriate, encourages them to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on 25 June 1992 and entered into force on 1 March 1998, is the European convention for the protection and promotion of regional and minority languages. It is designed to enable speakers to use them both in private and public life and obliges the States Parties to actively promote the use of these languages in education, courts, administration, media, culture, economic and social life, and cross- border co-operation.

Regional or minority languages are part of Europe's cultural heritage and their protection and promotion contribute to the building of a Europe based on democracy and cultural diversity.

The text of the Charter is available in over 50 languages.

www.coe.int/minlang

www.coe.int

The Council of Europe is the continent's leading human rights organisation. It comprises 46 member states, including all members of the European Union.All Council of Europe member tates have signed up to the European Convention on Human Rights,a treaty designed to protect human rights, democracy and the rule of law. The European Court of Human Rights oversees the implementation of the Convention in the member states.

COUNCIL OF EUROPE

CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE