



MINISTERS' DEPUTIES Decisions CM/Del/Dec(2025)1521-app1 6 March 2025

## 1521st meeting, 4-6 March 2025 (DH)

Consolidated list of cases for the 1531st meeting (June 2025) (DH) adopted at the 1521st meeting

Appendix 1

Website: www.coe.int/cm

## C. Examination of cases at the 1531st meeting

	Case	State	Application	Judgment final on	Violation	Link to the last decision
1	DURDAJ AND OTHERS NIKA	ALBANIA	63543/09+ 1049/17	07/02/2024 14/02/2024	Lack of effective investigation and criminal trial concerning an explosion at Gërdec weapon decommissioning facility (Durdaj and others) and on the use of lethal force by State agents during a political protest (Nika).	First examination
2	CHIRAGOV AND OTHERS	ARMENIA	13216/05	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the active military phase (1992-1994) of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1514/H46-3 December 2024
3	MUSHEGH SAGHATELYAN GROUP	ARMENIA	23086/08	20/12/2018	Ill-treatment by the police and absence of any official investigation; unlawful arrest and detention; disproportionate and unnecessary dispersal of protests.	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1475/H46-3 September 2023
4	GAFGAZ MAMMADOV GROUP	AZERBAIJAN	60259/11	14/03/2016	Dispersals of demonstrations and arrests of demonstrators.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1492/H46-2 March 2024
5	MAKUCHYAN AND MINASYAN <sup>1</sup>	AZERBAIJAN	17247/13	12/10/2020	Failure to continue to enforce prison sentence for ethnic hate crime committed abroad, after transfer to Azerbaijan.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1514/H46-6 December 2024
6	MAMMADLI GROUP	AZERBAIJAN	47145/14	19/07/2018	Arrest and pre-trial detention to punish the applicants for his activities in the area of electoral monitoring or for their active social and political engagement in breach of Article 18 taken in conjunction with Article 5.	CM/Del/Dec(2025)1521/H46-4 March 2025
7	NAMAZOV GROUP	AZERBAIJAN	74354/13	30/05/2020	Lack of procedural safeguards in disciplinary proceedings, having led to the applicants' disbarment for breach of professional ethics following verbal altercations with a judge.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-5 June 2024
8	SARGSYAN	AZERBAIJAN	40167/06	16/06/2015	Impossibility for persons displaced during the active military phase (1992-1994) of the Nagorno-Karabakh conflict to gain access to their homes and properties in the region; lack of effective remedies.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1514/H46-10 December 2024
9	MUQISHTA	BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	27994/19	31/08/2021	Arbitrariness of administrative decisions; excessive length of administrative proceedings.	First examination Standard procedure
10	DIMITROV AND OTHERS GROUP	BULGARIA	77938/11	17/11/2014	Excessive use of force by law enforcement agents; ineffective investigations.	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1483/H46-11 December 2023

<sup>1</sup> Case against Azerbaijan and Hungary but the Court found no violation in respect of Hungary.

	Case	State	Application	Judgment final on	Violation	Link to the last decision
11	KOILOVA AND BABULKOVA	BULGARIA	40209/20	05/12/2023	Lack of a specific legal framework providing for the recognition and protection of the applicants' union as persons of the same sex.	First examination
12	MIROSLAVA TODOROVA	BULGARIA	40072/13	19/01/2022	Disciplinary proceedings and sanctions against the President of the judges' association in retaliation against her criticism of the Supreme Judicial Council and the executive.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-9 June 2024
13	S.Z GROUP KOLEVI	BULGARIA	29263/12 1108/02	03/06/2015 05/02/2010	Systemic problem of ineffective criminal investigations with regard to shortcomings which affect investigations concerning both private individuals and law enforcement agents and lack of guarantees for the independence of criminal investigations against the Chief Prosecutor.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-10 June 2024
14	M.H. AND OTHERS	CROATIA	15670/18+	04/04/2022	Lack of effective investigation into the death of the applicants' daughter at the Croatian border; inadequate conditions of detention of migrant children; lack of administrative and court diligence and expedition concerning asylum seeking applicants' detention and asylum proceedings; collective expulsion; violation of the right of individual application.	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1475/H46-14 September 2023
15	K.K. AND OTHERS	DENMARK	25212/21	06/03/2023	Disproportionate interference in children's' right to private life following refusal to allow their adoption after being born abroad through surrogacy.	First examination
16	J.M.B. AND OTHERS	FRANCE	9671/15+	30/05/2020	Poor conditions of detention (overcrowding) and lack of an effective preventive remedy.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1492/H46-13 March 2024
17	MOUSTAHI	FRANCE	9347/14	25/09/2020	Detention and expeditive return of two foreign unaccompanied minors from Mayotte to the Comoros, without an examination of their individual situation and without an effective remedy.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-12 June 2024
18	TSINTSABADZE GROUP	GEORGIA	35403/06	18/03/2011	Lack of effective investigations into allegations of ill-treatment or violations of the right to life; excessive use of force by the police in the course of arrest and/or while detaining suspects.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1492/H46-14 March 2024
19	BEKIR-OUSTA AND OTHERS GROUP	GREECE	35151/05	11/01/2008	Refusal of domestic courts to register associations or dissolution of the applicants' associations.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1514/H46-17 December 2024
20	M.S.S. GROUP	GREECE	30696/09	21/01/2011	Conditions of detention of asylum seekers and irregular migrants and lack of an effective remedy to challenge conditions of detention; living	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1475/H46-15 September 2023
	H.A. AND OTHERS GROUP		4892/18+	13/06/2023	conditions of asylum seekers; ineffective remedies against expulsion due to shortcomings in asylum procedure.	First examination

	Case	State	Application	Judgment final on	Violation	Link to the last decision
21	LÁSZLÓ MAGYAR GROUP	HUNGARY	73593/10	13/10/2014	Life sentence without parole in combination with the lack of an adequate review mechanism, life sentence with parole after 40 years.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1507/H46-12 September 2024
22	SZABÓ AND VISSY GROUP	HUNGARY	37138/14	06/06/2016	Absence of sufficient guarantees against abuse in legislation on secret surveillance.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-17 June 2024
23	TALPIS GROUP	ITALY	41237/14	18/09/2017	Failure to comply with the positive obligation to properly assess the risk to life in domestic	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1475/H46-19 September 2023
	J.L.		5671/16	27/08/2021	violence cases and to secure a timely and adequate response. Sexism in the perception of	
	M.S.		32715/19	07/10/2022	the phenomenon of violence against women, including in court decisions, leading to secondary victimisation. Impunity for domestic violence acts due to a combination of judicial passivity and intervening changes to the prescription regime.	
24	D	LATVIA	76680/17	11/04/2024	Inhuman and degrading treatment inflicted on the applicant due to his position at the lowest level of an informal prisoner hierarchy in prisons between 2008 and 2017.	First examination
25	MACATĖ	LITHUANIA	61435/19	23/01/2023	No legitimate aim for temporary suspension of children's fairy tale book depicting same-sex relationships and its subsequent labelling as harmful to children under the age of 14.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1507/H46-16 September 2024
26	G.M. AND OTHERS	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	44394/15	22/02/2023	Forced abortions and birth-control measures imposed on persons with intellectual disabilities; failure to carry out an effective investigation.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-21 June 2024
27	DEDIĆ AND OTHERS GROUP	MONTENEGRO	4847/20	11/04/2024	Non-enforcement of final domestic decisions against socially/State-owned company.	First examination
28	CORALLO	NETHERLANDS	29593/17	09/10/2018	Poor conditions of detention on remand in Sint Maarten (Caribbean part of the Kingdom of the Netherlands) pending extradition proceedings.	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1483/H46-21 December 2023
29	PRZYBYSZEWSKA AND OTHERS	POLAND	11454/17+	12/03/2024	Absence of any form of legal recognition and protection for the same-sex couples.	First examination
30	MIRANDA MAGRO	PORTUGAL	30138/21	09/04/2024	Inadequate conditions of detention and medical care of a mentally ill person, at a prison hospital's psychiatric unit, pending placement in an appropriate mental health facility.	First examination
31	CENTRE FOR LEGAL RESOURCES ON BEHALF OF VALENTIN CÂMPEANU	ROMANIA	47848/08	17/07/2014	Deficiencies in the legal protection and medical and social care afforded to vulnerable persons.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-25 June 2024
	N. (No. 2)		38048/18	16/02/2022		

	Case	State	Application	Judgment final on	Violation	Link to the last decision
32	PARASCINETI CRISTIAN TEODORESCU GROUP	ROMANIA	32060/05 22883/05	13/06/2012 19/09/2012	Overcrowding and inadequate living conditions, treatment and care afforded to patients in psychiatric establishments; unlawful or arbitrary involuntary psychiatric placements and	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-26 June 2024
	N.		59152/08	28/02/2018	insufficient safeguards against such deprivations of liberty; systematic failure to seek consent to	
	R.D. AND I.M.D.		35402/14	12/10/2021	psychiatric treatment and absence of minimum legal safeguards attending the forcible administration of psychiatric treatment to involuntary patients.	
33	STRĂIN AND OTHERS GROUP MARIA ATANASIU AND OTHERS	ROMANIA	57001/00 30767/05	30/11/2005 12/01/2011	Ineffectiveness of the mechanism put in place to allow the restitution of or compensation for nationalised property.	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1501/H46-27 June 2024
	VĂLEANU AND OTHERS		30707/03	12/01/2011		
			59012/17	03/04/2023	Continuing ineffectiveness of this restitution mechanism.	
34	ROMAN ZAKHAROV GROUP	RUSSIAN FEDERATION	47143/06	04/12/2015	Operative search activities groups	CM/Del/Dec(2018)1324/H46-19 September 2018
	BYKOV GROUP	125210111011	4378/02	10/03/2009		First examination
	PODCHASOV		33696/19	13/05/2024		First examination
	KUZMINA AND OTHERS GROUP VANYAN GROUP		66152/14+	20/07/2021		First examination
	AVANESYAN GROUP		53203/99	15/03/2006		First examination
	SMIRNOV GROUP		41152/06	18/12/2014		First examination
	URUKOV GROUP		71362/01	12/11/2007		First examination
35	R. KAČAPOR AND OTHERS	SERBIA	20489/07 2269/06	06/06/2017 07/07/2008	Non-enforcement of domestic final decisions	First examination
35	GROUP	SERBIA	2269/06	07/07/2008	against socially-owned companies.	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1483/H46-35 December 2023
36	CENTRUM FÖR RÄTTVISA	SWEDEN	35252/08	25/05/2021	Insufficient safeguards in bulk signals-intelligence gathering.	First examination
37	CYPRUS v. TURKEY	TÜRKİYE	25781/94	10/05/2001	14 violations in relation to the situation in the	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1507/H46-34
				12/05/2014	northern part of Cyprus (Property rights of the displaced persons).	September 2024
38	KAVALA	TÜRKİYE	28749/18	12/05/2020	Unjustified and extended detention of the applicant without reasonable suspicion and with	CM/Del/Dec(2025)1521/H46-32 March 2025
				11/07/2022	the ulterior purpose of reducing him to silence	IVIGIOTI ZUZU
20	OVA ATAMANI ODGUD	TÜDKİVE	74550/04	(Article 46§4)	(individual measures).	CM/Dal/Daa/2022\4450/1140.20
39	OYA ATAMAN GROUP	TÜRKİYE	74552/01	05/03/2007	Violation of the right to freedom of assembly, ill treatment of applicants as a result of excessive force used during demonstrations.	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1459/H46-29 March 2023
	GEYLANİ AND OTHERS		10443/12	12/12/2023	10.00 add daming domentiations.	First examination

	Case	State	Application	Judgment final on	Violation	Link to the last decision
40	SELAHATTIN DEMIRTAS (No. 2) GROUP	TÜRKİYE	14305/17	22/12/2020	Unjustified detention of the applicants without reasonable suspicion that they had committed an offence, with the ulterior purpose of stifling pluralism and limiting freedom of political debate. Unforeseeable lifting of the parliamentary immunity and subsequent criminal proceedings to penalise the applicants for their political speeches. (Individual measures)	CM/Del/Dec(2025)1521/H46-33 March 2025
41	YÜKSEL YALÇINKAYA	TÜRKİYE	15669/20	26/09/2023	Conviction for membership of an armed terrorist organisation, without establishing offence's constituent material and mental elements in an individualised manner.	First examination
42	XENIDES-ARESTIS GROUP	TÜRKİYE	46347/99	22/03/2006 23/05/2007	Continuous denial of access to property in the northern part of Cyprus (individual measures and just satisfaction).	CM/Del/Dec(2024)1507/H46-38 September 2024
43	YURIY ILLARIONOVICH SHCHOKIN GROUP MATUSHEVSKYY AND MATUSHEVSKA	UKRAINE	4299/03 59461/08	03/01/2014 23/09/2011	Violations of right to life and lack of effective investigation.	First examination
44	YURIY NIKOLAYEVICH IVANOV ZHOVNER GROUP BURMYCH AND OTHERS	UKRAINE	40450/04 56848/00 46852/13+	15/01/2010 29/09/2004 Grand Chamber (Striking out)	Non-enforcement of domestic court decisions against the State or state-owned enterprises.	CM/Del/Dec(2023)1475/H46-41 September 2023 CM/Del/Dec(2024)1507/A1 September 2024