

CDADI(2021)7 prov4

Strasbourg, 17 June 2021

STEERING COMMITTEE ON ANTI-DISCRIMINATION, DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION (CDADI)

Consolidated draft Recommendation on multi-level policies and governance for intercultural integration (provisional title)

**Recommendation CM/Rec XXX
of the Committee of Ministers to member States
on multi-level policies and governance for intercultural integration
(Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on XXX
at the XXX meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)**

1. The Committee of Ministers, under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe,
2. Considering that the aim of the Council of Europe is to achieve greater unity between its members and that, in the face of growing diversity in societies, this aim may be pursued, in particular, through common action in the fields of equality, societal integration, and positive diversity management;
3. Acknowledging that the successful and effective inclusion of migrants and realising the potential of diversity and human mobility for societies' development and prosperity are common challenges for member States, and conscious of the high cost of non-integration for both societies and individuals;
4. Recognising the important contribution of migrants to societal development and prosperity, and the need to enable them to develop and make full use of their potential, knowledge and skills for the benefit of themselves and the societies in which they live;
5. Considering the relevance of integration and diversity management policies for fulfilling the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals, in particular Goal 10 on reducing inequalities and Goal 11 on sustainable cities and human settlements;
6. Emphasising that integration policies should comply with the European Convention of Human Rights by which the States Party have undertaken to secure to everyone within their jurisdictions the rights and freedoms enshrined in it, including the prohibition of discrimination in enjoyment of these rights and freedoms;

7. Underlining that the Revised European Social Charter (CETS No. 163) and its interpretation by the European Committee of Social Rights contribute to safeguarding the social rights of migrants and thus promote their integration and inclusion in the societies of the States Parties;
8. Acknowledging that Recommendation CM/Rec(2018)4 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the participation of citizens in local public life¹ defines citizens as “any person (including, where appropriate, foreign residents²) belonging to a local community”;
9. Emphasising that Recommendation CM/Rec(2011)1 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on interaction between migrants and receiving societies considers that the development of policies to improve the interaction between migrants and receiving societies and the participation of migrants and persons of immigrant background in civil society is critical to successful integration;
10. Having regard to Council of Europe standards³ which remind that gender equality is central to the protection of human rights, the functioning of democracy and good governance, respect for the rule of law and the promotion of well-being for all;
11. Mindful of Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, according to which asylum seekers should be protected from any discriminatory policies or practices on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, and that measures be taken to prevent risks of violence and abuse⁴;
12. Taking into account Recommendation CM/Rec(2019)4 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on supporting young refugees in transition to adulthood and the Guidelines of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the protection and promotion of Human rights in culturally diverse societies adopted on 2 March 2016;
13. Recalling that Recommendation CM/Rec (2015)1 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on intercultural integration calls to take the urban model of intercultural integration into account when revising and further developing national migrant integration policies or policies for intercultural dialogue and management of populations’ diversity;
14. Noting with satisfaction the positive results of the implementation of Recommendation CM/Rec (2015)1 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on intercultural integration at the local level on community cohesion, democratic stability and citizen well-being, as showed by the Review report on the implementation of the aforementioned Recommendation (document CDADI(2021)5);

¹ The Russian Federation expressed its position on this Recommendation in its corresponding interpretative statement made at the time of adoption of the Recommendation.

² where “[i]n accordance with the Convention on the Participation of Foreigners in Public Life at Local Level [...] the term “foreign residents” means persons who are not nationals of the State and who are lawfully resident on its territory”.

³ See also the Gender Equality Strategy 2018-2023 adopted on 7 March 2018.

⁴ Several delegations made declarations upon adoption of this Recommendation at the Deputies’ 1081st meeting (31 March 2010); the Russian Federation expressed its position on this Recommendation in its corresponding interpretative statement made at the time of adoption of the Recommendation. .

15. Emphasising that according to the monitoring reports and other work of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) persistent lack of integration leads to social fragmentation, diminishing community cohesion and the development of parallel societies, which contribute to racism and racial discrimination.

16. Aware of the need for a strategic and coherent approach across all levels of government to ensure policy effectiveness and sustainability in the field of migrant integration and inclusion,

Recommends that the governments of member states:

a) Take legislative and other measures to apply and implement the intercultural integration approach, as outlined in the Appendix to multi-level policies for integrating diverse societies in the context of cross-border migration as well as to preclude discrimination with regard to lawful residents who are not able to acquire nationality of the country of residence.

b) Ensure that this Recommendation and the Model Framework for an Intercultural Integration Strategy at the National level⁵ ([link](#)) are translated and that they are brought to the attention of all relevant institutions at the national, regional and local levels;

c) Build capacity to support institutions and civil society organisations in developing, implementing, and assessing the impact of, the intercultural integration approach described in the Appendix;

d) Set up a solid governance framework for intercultural integration based on partnership between all relevant levels of government and other stakeholders, using where possible, participatory and deliberative mechanisms to enable the general public to take part in policy- and decision-making;

e) Share experience internationally and assess systematically the experience of public authorities and institutions in other countries in order to effectively and efficiently advance their own practice;

f) Review progress in the implementation of this Recommendation and keep the Committee of Ministers regularly informed of the progress in this field.

⁵ Adopted by the Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI) at its 3rd meeting.

Appendix to Recommendation CM Rec (XXX)

Definition

1. Intercultural integration is a holistic approach which can guide coordinated and long-term policies in all fields and levels of governance in order to promote and achieve equality for all members of society, foster a pluralist common sense of belonging through valuing diversity, and build social trust and community cohesion via positive interaction between people with different social and national backgrounds, facilitating their participation in and contribution to society **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: with the aim of achieving the goals of Member States in socio-economic and demographic development, increasing the quality of life of their populations, ensuring security, protecting national labour markets, maintaining inter-ethnic and inter-religious peace, protecting and preserving the cultures, languages and historical heritage of the peoples of Europe]**.
2. While the Intercultural integration approach is considered as a way of making policies for the integration of migrants and of people of migrant origin more effective, it may prove equally relevant for the integration of other people with different backgrounds.
 - 2.b No provision of this Recommendation is intended to affect the legal status of migrants residing on a territory of a member state or the conditions for legal entry into that territory.
3. Member states should ensure that intercultural integration policies do not result in direct or indirect discrimination on any ground, including multiple discrimination, and that they consider individuals' diverse characteristics in an intersectional way.

Goals of Intercultural Integration

4. When designing intercultural integration policies, member states should keep in mind that the goal of such policies is to enable **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: active citizenship of and participation for all adaptation to legal, socioeconomic, cultural and other conditions of life in Member States for those persons experiencing difficulties of such adaptation due to the specificities of their culture and customs (as well as other factors)]**, in particular for people of migrant origin, and ensure respect for their fundamental rights.
5. Intercultural Integration policies should ensure equality for and dignity of all members of society, and help build societies which are more inclusive, cohesive, **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: secure]** and prosperous thanks to the benefits of diversity.
6. Intercultural Integration policies should foster mutual respect, dialogue and trust between all members of society, and nurture a sense of belonging and shared undertaking.
7. Intercultural integration policies should target societies as a whole and not specific diverse groups. They should encourage institutions at all levels of governance **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: to embrace diversity,]** and act and deliver services in an interculturally competent way so to promote **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: adaptation with the aim of achieving and achieve]** real

equality, facilitate participation, and foster meaningful interaction across cultural and other diversities.

A comprehensive approach

8. Member states should adopt a holistic approach to integration by ensuring that public policies in all fields and at all levels, as well as civil society stakeholders, contribute to the goal of building inclusive societies. This would foster substantial equality and benefit from the positive potential of the diversity of their populations.
9. There should be consultation between key actors of migration and integration policies so to ensure coherence of those policies across levels of government in terms of goals, means and public messages, and a clear articulation with policies for external and internal security.
10. The above policies should be based on an understanding of human mobility as a feature of life in society and a factor of co-development at a global scale.
11. Intercultural Integration policies should not be limited to a specific policy sector, but they should transcend all policy areas. All public policies should contribute to the integration of people of different social and national backgrounds.
12. A whole-society approach for the inclusion of newcomers should be adopted through partnerships between public authorities at all levels of government, and local institutions, civil society organisations and groups, and the private sector.

Principles of intercultural integration

13. The underlying principles of intercultural integration are **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: promoting adaptation,]** ensuring equality, **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: maintaining rule of law and]** valuing **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: cultural]** diversity, support for positive interaction and active citizenship and participation.

[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: Promoting adaptation

13bis. Integration policies should establish pathways for social and cultural adaptation of migrants and other persons experiencing difficulties with such adaptation, while taking into account their age, professional, national, ethnic, cultural and other specificities, as well as the national, ethnic and cultural customs of the local population.

13ter. Integration policies should aim at preventing the emergence of spatial segregation, formation of ethnic enclaves and marginalisation of persons in the process of adaptation.

13quater. Integration policies should provide persons in the process of adaptation, regardless of their migration status, income level or other circumstances, equal opportunities for receiving migration-related governmental services.]

Ensuring Equality

14. Integration policies should result in the equality of treatment and of opportunity for all members of society, including through an intersectional and gender-sensitive approach, taking into account all forms of discrimination.
15. **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: ~~Early access to local voting rights and~~ Clear and simple rules for obtaining permanent residence and/or** naturalisation for foreign residents should be encouraged as catalysts of faster and sustainable integration.
16. Direct or indirect discrimination in the functioning of public administration and in public service delivery should be identified and eliminated in a systematic way, including by carrying out anti-discrimination audits and reviews, and anti-discrimination and intercultural training, adopting anti-discrimination charters and action plans to favour integration and, where possible, by participatory service design involving diverse users.

[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: Maintaining rule of law

16bis. Integration policies should support rule of law, and be conducive, in particular, to combating terrorism, human trafficking, drug trafficking, use of forced labour, organisation of illegal migration and other forms of crime, providing where necessary for international co-operation among Member States. In particular, such policies should aim, where appropriate, to improving migration control mechanisms and precluding violations of migration laws.]

Valuing diversity

17. Public policies at all levels should encourage greater inclusion and diversity in institutions, organisations, living environments and in the public space, and should counter all forms of segregation.
18. Public policies should focus on maximising the value of diversity for society as a whole and minimise the risk of conflicts in all spheres by **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: promoting adaptation]** facilitating intercultural mediation, developing intercultural competence, and promoting multilingualism.
19. Public policies should foster trust, living together and sense of belonging by promoting and enabling meaningful contact and interaction between people with different origins and backgrounds.
20. Public policies should contribute to the building of shared values and a pluralist and open identity within society, notably by means of formal and non-formal education, public debate, support to a plural media landscape and vibrant cultural industries, multilingualism, social media literacy, **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: ~~and the adoption of an intersectional and gender-sensitive approach to policy making~~]** taking into account all forms of discrimination.

21. Measures should be undertaken to prevent and combat prejudice and hate speech **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: while respecting the right to freedom of expression, as well as gender stereotypes and stereotypes about the impact of culture, tradition and religion on people's ideas and behaviour,]** and build resilience to all forms of radicalisation leading to **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: terrorism or]** violent extremism.
22. **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: proposes to delete this paragraph]** Positive political discourse and narratives should accompany intercultural integration policies, celebrating diversity and its benefits, thus encouraging a balanced portrayal of the diversity of the population in media.

Fostering meaningful interaction

23. Public policies at all levels should seek to create spaces and opportunities for meaningful and positive interaction between people of diverse backgrounds as a precondition for building trust and living together, as well as for realising the diversity advantage.
24. Public authorities should systematically apply an 'intercultural lens' to their policies and programmes, as well as to public services, to ensure that they foster intercultural mixing, interaction and mutual trust among people of diverse socio-cultural backgrounds.
25. Educational, cultural, sport, entrepreneurial and other institutions and organisations should develop intercultural competence and attitudes among their staff, encouraging them to acquire the skills to enable constructive exchanges, dialogue and co-design based on shared values and goals in relation to living together and combating all forms of exclusion and marginalisation.
26. Public authorities and other organisations should support intercultural activities and projects which bring individuals of diverse origins together and build social networks and foster reciprocal understanding and recognition among the participants.

Active citizenship and participation

27. Public policies should encourage and facilitate the contribution of people of migrant origin to society by investing in intercultural education, skills development, particularly in relation to learning official country language(s), and valuing the diversity of migrant languages as an asset for the society, and in the recognition of skills, qualifications and competences, including by targeted support for women, children, youth, and individuals with specific needs.
28. Meaningful economic, social, cultural and **[RUSSIAN FEDERATION: where appropriate]** political participation by all members of society, including people of migrant origin, should be encouraged and supported, with a special effort to empower marginalised, socially excluded and vulnerable people, and strive to reduce racism, sexism and structural discrimination, particularly in circumstances of health, environmental and other crises which tend to exacerbate inequality and exclusion.

29. Public authorities at all levels should communicate consistently and transparently to citizens about the rationale, goals, measures and impact of intercultural integration policies, as well as about challenges and methodologies on how they are being addressed.

Multi-level governance of Intercultural integration

30. Member states should adopt a coherent, coordinated and efficient and effective multi-level governance in all stages of the policy process, from the needs assessment to conception, implementation, and evaluation of the impact of relevant policies.
31. Multi-level governance should aim at aligning strategic needs and goals, and ensuring policy consistency, knowledge and resource sharing, good practice exchange and mutual learning across policy areas and levels of government.
32. Governance structures should be developed to facilitate political dialogue and the elaboration of a shared long-term strategy between different levels of administration in intercultural integration matters.
33. Policy co-ordination and consultation instruments and frameworks should be developed to facilitate coherence, collaboration, communication of objectives, and co-operation in specific areas of intercultural integration, and guarantee that the intercultural integration approach is embedded in all public policies.
34. Horizontal networks among states, municipalities and regions should be supported as tools for good practice sharing and policy innovation. Wherever possible, good practice sharing should also involve the private sector and the civil society.
35. Representatives of socially and culturally diverse groups, should be systematically involved as active agents at all levels, including through joint bodies at municipal level to co-design the national, regional and local intercultural strategies.
36. Consultation and exchange spaces in which civil society actors can meet to discuss and identify challenges, successes and needs in relation with the implementation of the intercultural integration model should be promoted.
37. The Model Framework for an Intercultural Integration Strategy at the National Level⁶, may inform practitioners working on intercultural integration strategies, including within regional, local and cross-border authorities. To this end, it would be useful to encourage the development of a policy of continuous training and targeted support for these practitioners, in order to facilitate the appropriation of the fundamental principles and methodologies inherent in intercultural integration.

⁶ Adopted by the Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI) at its 3rd meeting.